THE TRIANGULAR WORKING ARRANGEMENT:

A QUALITATIVE STUDY OF THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN AUCKLAND TEMPORARY STAFFING AGENCIES, THEIR CLIENT ORGANISATIONS AND TEMPORARY CLERICAL WORKERS

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in

Psychology

at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Doreen Davy

2010
ABSTRACT

This research explored the triangular working relationship between employers, temporary staffing agencies and clerical temporary workers. The study used a qualitative approach to investigate the interdependent relationship between these three groups within the context of the buoyant Auckland labour market of 2006 and 2007. Findings are based on in-depth interviews using a grounded theory methodology. Participants comprised ten employer representatives, ten employment agency consultants and twenty female agency clerical workers.

Interviews with the employer representatives revealed that employers expected agencies to facilitate swift and unproblematic access to a reliable, hardworking and disposable workforce. Unfortunately, labour market conditions meant that agencies were increasingly unable to meet this requirement. In consequence, employers developed various strategies designed to limit their dependency on agencies. These tactics helped solve employers’ staffing needs but created problems for agencies.

Agencies function as intermediaries between employers and workers. In order to operate profitably they need to generate a demand for their services and have a reliable supply of good quality workers. According to agent respondents, these conditions existed at the start of the last economic boom but had now changed. An oversupply of agencies, coupled with an undersupply of temporary workers meant that agencies were finding it increasingly difficult to meet their clients’ needs. Agencies used various strategies to try and overcome these problems but were seldom able to meet the needs of both their clients and their workforce.

Although temporary workers were in a more favourable position in the labour market, this did not translate into improved working conditions. Temporary worker respondents described social alienation, poor pay and benefits and monotonous assignments as commonplace. In consequence, most respondents eventually left temporary work for permanent employment.
This research has demonstrated that labour market conditions and the structural conditions of temporary work strongly influenced the activities of each group in the triangular working relationship. The aims, expectations and behaviours of the three sets of participants were often mutually incompatible which limited the manoeuvrability of each group. This created outcomes which were often unintended, and frequently suboptimal, for all three parties.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to take this opportunity to acknowledge the people who provided assistance and support throughout my thesis. I would especially like to express my appreciation for the advice and supervision provided by Drs Jocelyn Handy and Dianne Gardner. I am also grateful to Massey University for awarding the doctoral scholarship that made this research possible, and for the permission to conduct the research granted by the Massey University Human Ethics Committee.

I would also like to thank all the forty participants who were willing to share their personal experiences of the temporary staffing industry that formed the basis of this research.

Finally, I would like to thank my family and friends, particularly my husband for his support and patience over the last five years.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LITERATURE REVIEW</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER TWO: CONTINGENT LABOUR</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Part One: Background Information</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1 Definitions</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2 Types of Contingent Workers in Organisations</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3 The Legal Context</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.4 Economic Climates</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.5 Inconsistent Findings</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.6 Growth of the Contingent Workforce</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Part Two: Advantages and Disadvantages of Contingent Labour</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1 Advantages for Employers</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2 Disadvantages for Employers</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3 Advantages for Contingent Workers</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.4 Disadvantages for Contingent Workers</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Part Three: Societal Consequences of the Increasing Use of Contingent Work</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1 Societal Consequences</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2 Solutions</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Conclusion</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER THREE: THE TRIANGULAR WORKING RELATIONSHIP……..25

3.1 Part One: Temporary Employment Agencies: General Overview………………25
   3.1.1 Growth of Employment Agencies ............................................................. 26
   3.1.2 Services Offered by Agencies ................................................................. 28
   3.1.3 Agencies as Providers of Flexibility .......................................................... 29

3.2 Part Two: Employment Agencies and Temporary Workers ......................... 30
   3.2.1 Sourcing Temporary Workers ................................................................. 30
   3.2.2 The Agency/Temporary Worker Relationship ......................................... 32
   3.2.3 Legislation and the Three-Way Working Relationship ............................ 35

3.3 Part Three: Temporary Workers and Client Organisations ............................ 37
   3.3.1 Commitment to the Client Organisation .................................................. 37
   3.4 Conclusion .................................................................................................... 38

CHAPTER FOUR: AGENCY Clerical WORKERS’ PSYCHOLOGICAL
EXPERIENCES OF WORK .............................................................................................. 40

4.1 Part One: Finance and Flexibility for Clerical Temporary Workers.......... 40
   4.1.1 Financial Issues for Temporary Clerical Workers ................................. 40
   4.1.2 Flexibility Issues ...................................................................................... 41

4.2 Part Two: The Latent Benefits of Work and Clerical Temporary Workers ..... 43
   4.2.1 Structured Time ....................................................................................... 44
   4.2.2 Social Contact ......................................................................................... 44
   4.2.3 Sense of Belonging .................................................................................. 45
   4.2.4 Status ....................................................................................................... 46
   4.2.5 Types of Work Assignments ................................................................. 46
8.2 Part Two: The Recruitment Consultants’ Aims and Expectations ..................... 91
  8.2.1 Providing a Service for Employers .............................................................. 91
  8.2.2 Consultants’ Expectations of Temporary Workers ..................................... 93
  8.2.3 Agencies as Employers of Temporary Workers ....................................... 94

8.3 Part Three: The Temporary Workers’ Aims and Expectations ......................... 95
  8.3.1 Willing Temporary Workers ....................................................................... 95
  8.3.2 Reluctant Temporary Workers ................................................................... 97
  8.4 Conclusion .................................................................................................... 98

CHAPTER NINE: THE FLEXIBLE WORKFORCE .............................................. 100

9.1 Part One: The Employers’ Experience of the Flexible Workforce ................. 101
  9.1.1 Paying for Flexible Staffing ....................................................................... 101
  9.1.2 Loss of Control and Flexibility ................................................................ 103

9.2 Part Two: Recruitment Consultants’ Experience of the Flexible Workforce .. 107
  9.2.1 Supply and Demand Problems in the Auckland Job Market .................... 107
  9.2.2 Attracting and Retaining Temporary Staff .............................................. 111

9.3 Part Three: The Temporary Workers’ Experience of the Flexible Workforce ... 116
  9.3.1 Lack of Flexibility and Control for Temporary Staff at Work .................... 116
  9.3.2 The Assignments ...................................................................................... 120
  9.3.3 Financial Insecurity .................................................................................. 123
  9.3.4 Moving On ............................................................................................... 126
  9.4 Conclusion .................................................................................................. 127

CHAPTER TEN: RELATIONSHIPS .................................................................... 129

10.1 Part One: The Employers and Relationships .............................................. 130
  10.1.1 The Employers’ Relationship with Recruitment Consultants ............... 130
  10.1.2 The Employers’ Relationship with Temporary Staff ............................. 132
12.5 Practical Implications for Employers, Agencies and Temporary Workers……..178
12.6 Recommendations for Future Research.....................................................179

REFERENCES................................................................................................. 182

APPENDICES................................................................................................. 206