Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Strategic Information Systems Control Practices in New Zealand

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Management at Massey University

MUSTAFA ISMAIL MUSTAFA EID

2002
Abstract

A very important issue for companies is how well its Information Systems (IS) strategy supports its business strategy and direction. Strategic control of IS strategies is concerned with the monitoring, reviewing and maintenance of IS strategies from a strategic perspective, to ensure that IS strategies are performing well in terms of supporting the business strategy and direction in current and future business and information technology circumstances. The purpose of this study was to investigate strategic IS control practices of New Zealand organizations and to measure their level of effectiveness. A field survey of 123 New Zealand organizations provided the data for the study. The results show about 85% of NZ organizations practising IS planning also practice strategic oriented control over their IS plans, and with varying degrees of effectiveness. Three strategic IS control approaches have been identified: cybernetic, ad hoc, and a combined approach of both cybernetic and ad hoc. The cybernetic and combined approaches were found more than adequate, while the ad hoc is found to be just adequate. Strategic IS control is found to significantly influence the organizational IS plan performance. The study has identified five obstacles that work against the current practice of strategic IS control as follows (in order of significance): (1) lack of time, (2) lack of knowledge and/or expertise, (3) lack of tools, (4) difficulty of the task of strategic IS control, and (5) lack of funding. The variable industry competitiveness is found to be related to organizational intensity of IS use. The study also suggested further research recommendations to improve strategic IS control practice.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisors Professor Antonis Vitalis, Dr Attahir Yusuf, and Dr James Lockhart for their advice and guidance throughout this research. I am very grateful to them for the constant support and valuable feedback they given me on successive drafts of the various chapters of this dissertation.

The research has not been possible without the kind participation and assistance provided by New Zealand organisations. I would like to thank all those individuals involved for their willingness to respond to the study survey questionnaire. It is much appreciated.

I should thank Dr Richard Whiddet (Department of Information Systems at Massey) and Mr Cadeyrn James Gaskin (Department of Management at Massey) for their feedback on the questionnaire design. Thanks to all the secretaries of the Management department for their administrative support. Thank you to Mr Robert Goddard for his technical support. I also like to thank all members of the Massey University Human Ethics Committee, for their approval on the survey questionnaire.

Thanks to all my colleagues and friends for their encouragement. Thanks to my family for being encouraging and supportive and above all millions of thanks to Almighty Allah from whom we get all the support.
CONTENTS

Title page i
Abstract ii
Acknowledgements iii
Table of Contents iv
List of Tables ix
List of Figures xii

Chapter One
Introduction
1.1 Background 1
1.2 Research Problem, Objectives, and Questions 3
1.3 Research Method 6
1.4 Findings of the Study 7
1.5 Organisation of the Report 7

Chapter Two
Literature Review
2.1 Introduction 8
2.2 Management Control 8
   2.2.1 Control Levels 12
2.3 Management Control Approaches 13
   2.3.1 Cybernetic Control 14
   2.3.2 Agency-Based Control 17
   2.3.3 Psychological Control 17
   2.3.4 Structural Control 18
   2.3.5 Sociological Control 19
2.3.6 Implications for the proposed research 19

2.4 Strategic Management and Strategic Control 20
   2.4.1 Strategy 21
   2.4.2 Strategic Management Process 28
      2.4.2.1 Strategic Analysis 30
      2.4.2.2 Strategic Choice 35
      2.4.2.3 Strategic Implementation 39
   2.4.3 Strategic Control 40

2.5 Strategic Information Systems Management Process 49

2.6 Research Issues 62
   2.6.1 Research Problem 62
   2.6.2 Research Objectives 62
   2.6.3 Research Questions 64
   2.6.4 Variables and Hypotheses 65

2.7 Summary 69

Chapter Three
Research Method

3.1 Introduction 71

3.2 Philosophical Basis of the Research Method 72
   3.2.1 Methods and paradigms 76
   3.2.2 Justification of the Survey Method 77

3.3 Operational Definition of Measures 78

3.4 Operational Definition of the Study Variables 84
   3.4.1 Study Variables 85
   3.4.2 Measuring Extent of Strategic IS Control Practice 86
   3.4.3 Identifying Approaches of Strategic IS control Practices 87
   3.4.4 Evaluation of Organisational Effectiveness 90
   3.4.5 Measuring Strategic IS Control Effectiveness 93
   3.4.6 Measuring IS plan Performance 99
Strategic IS Control Practices in New Zealand

3.5 Data Collection

3.5.1 Scope of the Study 104
3.5.1 Questionnaire Design 104
3.5.2 Unit of Analysis 107
3.5.3 Source of Data 107
3.5.4 Protection of Respondents 108
3.5.5 Pilot Testing 108
3.5.6 Survey Administration 109

3.6 Validity and reliability of Measures 111

3.7 Data Analysis 112

3.8 Summary 113

Chapter Four

Data Analysis and Results

4.1 Introduction 115

4.2 Data Analysis 117

4.2.1 Reliability Analysis 118
4.2.1 Validity Analysis 119

4.3 Demographic Findings 133

4.3.1 Respondents Characteristics 134
4.3.2 Organisational Characteristics 135
4.3.3 Information Systems Function’s Characteristics 137
4.3.4 Strategic IS Control Characteristics 139

4.4 Approaches of Strategic IS Control 141

4.5 Effectiveness of Strategic IS Control Approaches 148

4.6 IS Plan Performance and Strategic IS Control Effectiveness 149

4.6.1 Correlation Analysis 149
4.6.2 Regression Analysis 152

4.7 Obstacles Against Current Practice of Strategic IS Control 153

4.8 Cross-tabulation and Correlation Analysis Results 155
4.8.1 Industry Type and Strategic IS Control Approach 155
4.8.2 Organisational Competitiveness and Strategic IS Control Approach 159
4.8.3 Organisational Structure and Strategic IS Control Approach 163
4.8.4 Organisational Size and Strategic IS Control Approach 164
4.8.5 Intensity of IS Use and Strategic IS Control Approach 166
4.8.6 Industry Type and Intensity of IS Use 169
4.8.7 Industry Competitiveness and Intensity of IS Use 172
4.9 Summary 174

Chapter Five

Discussion

5.1 Introduction 176
5.2 Strategic IS control in New Zealand 178
5.3 Strategic IS control Approaches, Effectiveness, and Obstacles 181
5.4 IS Plan Performance and Strategic IS Control Effectiveness 189
5.5 Relationships Between the Secondary Variables and the Strategic IS Control Approaches used 191
5.6 Limitations of the Study 192

Chapter Six

Conclusions and Recommendations for Future Research

6.1 Conclusions 194
6.2 Recommendations for Future Research 204
List of Tables

Table 2.1  Management Control in IS Management 13
Table 3.1  Reasons for Selecting a Paradigm (Cresswell, 1994; p. 6) 77
Table 4.1  Correlation Matrix (Strategic IS control Effectiveness) 122
Table 4.2  Variance calculations (Strategic IS control Effectiveness) 124
Table 4.3  KMO and Bartlett’s Test (Strategic IS Control Effectiveness) 124
Table 4.4  Communalities (Strategic IS Control Effectiveness) 125

Table 4.5  Component Matrix (Factor Matrix for Strategic IS Control Effectiveness) 127
Table 4.6  Rotated Component Matrix for Strategic IS Control Effectiveness 128
Table 4.7  Component Transformation Matrix 129
Table 4.8  Correlation Matrix 131
Table 4.9  Extraction Method: Principal Component Analysis Total Variance Explained 131
Table 4.10  KMO and Bartlett’s Test (IS plan performance) 131
Table 4.11  Extraction Method: Principal Component Analysis (IS plan performance) 132
Table 4.12  Component Matrix (IS plan performance) 132
Table 4.13  Respondents’ Characteristics 134
Table 4.14  Organizational Characteristics 136
Table 4.15  Strategic IS planning in New Zealand 137
Table 4.16  Strategic IS Control in New Zealand 138
Table 4.17  IS Function Characteristics 139
Table 4.18  Characteristics of Strategic IS Control Process 140
Table 4.19  Percentage Distribution of Strategic IS Control Approaches 142
Table 4.20  Strategic IS control Approach and the Use of a Model 143
Table 4.21  Formality level of Strategic IS Control Approach 144
Table 4.22  Use of Time and Human Resources in Strategic IS Control 143
Table 4.23 Type of Strategic IS Control Approach and Staff Responsible for Strategic IS Control process

Table 4.24 Type of Strategic IS Control Approach and Reporting Structure of Staff responsible for Strategic IS Control process

Figure 4.25 Strategic IS Control Approach and Authority Level of Staff Responsible for Strategic IS Control

Table 4.26 Strategic IS Control Approaches and their Level of Effectiveness

Table 4.27 Calculation of Spearman Rank Correlation Between the Strategic IS Plan Performance and Strategic IS control Effectiveness

Table 4.28 Regression Model Summary

Table 4.29 Coefficients of the Regression Model, Dependent Variable: ISPPERF

Table 4.30 Frequency distribution of obstacles against strategic IS control Activities

Table 4.31 Mean and Standard Deviation Values of Obstacles in Strategic IS Control

Table 4.32 Cross-Tabulation Between Industry Type and Strategic IS Control Approach

Table 4.33 Calculation of Correlation Between Industry Type and Type of Strategic IS Control Approach

Table 4.34 Cross-Tabulation Between Industry Competitiveness and Strategic IS Control

Table 4.35 Calculation of Correlation Between Industry Competitiveness and Type of Strategic IS Control Approach

Table 4.36 Strategic IS Control Approaches and Organizational Structure

Table 4.37 Calculation of Correlation Between Organizational Structure and Type of Strategic IS Control Approach

Table 4.38 Strategic IS Control Approaches and Organizational size

Table 4.39 Calculation of Correlation Between Organizational Size and Type of Strategic IS Control Approach
Table 4.40  Cross-tabulation between Information Systems Use and Type of SIS Control Approach  167
Table 4.41  Calculation of Correlation Between Information Systems Use and Type of Strategic IS Control Approach  168
Table 4.42  Cross-Tabulation between Industry type and Information Systems  170
Table 4.43  Calculation of Correlation between Information Systems Use and Industry Type  171
Table 4.44  A Cross-Tabulation Between Industry Competitiveness and Information Systems Use  172
Table 4.45  Non-parametric Spearman Correlations Results Between Industry Competitiveness and Intensity of IS Use  173
List of Figures

Figure 2.1  A Framework for Strategy Implementation (Anthony and Govindarajan, 1995, p. 11)  11
Figure 2.2  Johnson and Scholes’ Model of Strategic Management  30
Figure 2.3  Strategic option Generator proposed by Rackoff, Wisman, and Urlich (1985), copied from (Robson, 1997)  38
Figure 2.4  A Proposed Model for the Strategic Control Process  46
Figure 2.5  Information Systems Planning in Context (Baker, 1995)  51
Figure 2.6  Strategic IS Management Issues Influencing Strategic IS plan Performance  59
Figure 2.7  Organization’s Environment Factors Influencing Strategic IS Plan Performance  59
Figure 2.8  Factors Influencing Strategic IS Plan Performance  60
Figure 3.1  Elements of the Extent of Strategic IS control  87
Figure 3.2  Elements of Strategic IS Practice  89
Figure 3.3  Measuring formality of Strategic IS Control process  90
Figure 3.4  Input-process-output Model for Strategic IS planning, by King (1988)  99
Figure 4.1  Cronbach’s Alpha values for testing the reliability of developed measures of the research variables strategic IS control effectiveness and IS plan performance  119
Figure 4.2  Principle Components Graph (strategic IS control effectiveness)  129
Figure 4.3  Principle Components Graph (IS plan performance)  133
Figure 4.4  Scatter Diagram of IS Plan Performance and Strategic IS Control Effectiveness  151
Figure 4.5  Industry Type and Strategic IS Control Approach  158
Figure 4.6  Competitiveness Level and Strategic IS Control Approach  162
Figure 4.7  IS Use and Strategic IS Control Approach  168
Figure 4.8  Industry Type and IS Use  171
Figure C.1  Percentage Distribution of Gender
Figure C.2  Percentage Distribution of Respondents IS/IT Managerial Experience
Figure C.3  Percentage Distribution of Organizational Size
Figure C.4  Percentage Distribution of Organisation’s Structure
Figure C.5  Percentage Distribution of Organisation’s Authority Level
Figure C.6  Percentage Distribution of Industry Type
Figure C.7  Percentage Distribution of Industry Competitiveness
Figure C.8  Percentage Distribution Information Systems function size
Figure C.9  Percentage Distribution of Information Systems Use
Figure C.10 Percentage Distribution of Strategic IS plan period
Figure C.11 Percentage Distribution of the Use of a Documented Model in Strategic IS Control
Figure C.12 Percentage of Organisations practising Review of SIS plans only and those that Review both SIS plans and SIS management process in Strategic IS Control
Figure C.13 Percentage of organisations having a learning process in Strategic IS control practice
Figure C.14 Type of strategic IS approach and mean of total monthly hours spent on strategic IS control process
Figure C.15 Type of strategic IS approach and mean of total number of staff members used by strategic IS control process