People, Policies and Practice: Social Work Education in Aotearoa/New Zealand from 1949-1995

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Social Policy and Social Work at Massey University

Elizabeth Gillian Mary Amaryllis Nash

1998
Abstract

This thesis is a case study of the history of social work education in Aotearoa/New Zealand between 1949, when the first professional course for social work was established, and 1995, when the social services Industry Training Organisation was formed. It traces influences responsible for shaping social work education. Key questions focus on the nature and provision of education for social workers, how this has changed over time and why. Three organisations (the New Zealand Association of Social Workers, the New Zealand Social Work Training Council and the New Zealand Council for Education and Training in the Social Services) had degrees of authority over policy making, setting standards, accrediting courses, or advising governments in matters relating to social work education. These provide a focal point for the research. Key people in the field of social and community work contributed their personal views and histories, adding depth to this account through their oral data.

This history has been organised into three chronological periods. It is argued that in the earliest period social workers recognised their professional identity in a common pursuit. Later, they claimed professional autonomy, making efforts to consolidate it although state and employer interests were converging and distancing themselves from those of educators and the social work profession. Most recently, social work is diversifying and the fragmentation which is occurring reflects national and international economic and political systems. The reduction in state responsibility for the direct provision of welfare is shaping social service provision and education and national trends reflect the international scene.

It is argued that people, policies and practice have each in their own way influenced the changes that have taken place in the provision and styles of social work education. This study has documented and discussed these influences (covert and overt) and the constraints affecting them. The implications for the future of social work education are inextricably intertwined with the delivery of social work services. Concerns are expressed over the directions currently being taken in both spheres.
Acknowledgements

There are several acknowledgements I wish to make in completing this doctoral thesis. My supervisors, Dr Robyn Munford, Mr Merv Hancock and Dr Wanda Korndörffer have given me their time, wisdom and critical, but constructive, feedback over several years, which I appreciate. Dr Celia Briar and Dr Wendy Craig reviewed drafts of this work, and their feedback enabled me to follow my intuitions and express them more clearly. To my colleagues in the Department of Social Policy and Social Work, whose encouragement has been on-going, thank you. Thanks, too, to Wendy Parker, Christine Cheyne and Elsie Purdue, who helped with proof reading. Those snatched conversations in the photocopying room and the secretarial advice when the computer couldn't understand me, were more valued than you probably realise. Conversations with Dr Catherine Brennan were enlightening at several points in my studies.

Special thanks go to the Department of Social Welfare, Senior Advisor, Archives and Records, Mr Gary Howat, and to the Archives and Records officers, Ms Evelyn Teo and Mr Jalal Mayia. Their knowledgeable and kind assistance was invaluable. The data collection was supported by a grant from the Massey University Research Fund, together with the Academic Women's Study Award. Both gave me time and financial resources which were affirming and invaluable.

The respondents deserve special mention here, for sharing their memories and reflections with such generosity. Thank you, Tania Gilchrist, Heather Hodgetts and Emma Moore for transcribing tapes, Colette Lang and Tracy Corbett for assistance with formatting and Alistair Carr for scanning the photos. My women friends have been unfailingly supportive and my husband has continued to cook the evening meals, for all of which I show my appreciation.

I wish to make a special reference to Hannah and my son-in-law, Alistair, to William and Thomas, my children and fellow students. Thank you, your interest and cheerful support through everything has been magnificently unforgettable.

Finally, mistakes are, of course, my responsibility.
Preface

I was drawn to carry out research in this area for several reasons. In the first instance, I have been involved in social work since 1970, when I was accepted as a graduate student on one of the new, generic social work courses which sprang up in response to recommendations in Scotland, England and Wales, that social workers should operate from one all-encompassing social service agency. I was therefore one of the first of the new, generic social workers. Secondly, I have worked in a number of capacities as a social work educator and practitioner in Aotearoa/New Zealand since 1984. This has sparked my interest in the policies and people which have been influential in shaping the core curriculum and provision of courses. The question of why social work education looks the way it does fascinated me.

Social work as a university subject established its first footing in New Zealand after the Second World War at Victoria University College, Wellington. The university colleges were wary of its academic status and they have displayed a continuum of support ranging from consistent enthusiasm for professional social work education at one end of the spectrum, through moderate interest, to reluctant involvement ending in non-involvement.

Funding for professional education (and the lack of funding) has played a significant part in the development of social work education. Both Parliament and Cabinet were at times inclined to support social work education reluctantly and only under pressure. Government departments with responsibility for social work services, such as the Child Welfare Division and the health sector, stand out as having an interest and input into this area. The Child Welfare Division and its successors, the Department of Social Welfare and the New Zealand Children, Young Persons and their Families Service, dominate the scene as employers. The less-documented and non-governmental contributions of the voluntary sector and professional associations have also been crucial. They have ensured debate and contest between the stakeholders as to what social work is and ought to be about, with consequences for social work education and training.
My Masters thesis used a feminist methodology to study feminist social work as practised by social work students and their supervisors in 1986. I was able to observe a radical approach to social work as it was gaining confidence and challenging the status quo. Since then, I consider feminist social work models of practice have received little encouragement from the establishment, particularly in comparison to indigenous/Maori models. Understanding the history of social work education in Aotearoa/New Zealand requires looking at it from many angles. This I have tried to do. This has meant that, while feminist interests are important and have been acknowledged, the research is not informed by an exclusively feminist perspective.

Other perspectives have played an important part in this history, including those of community workers, Maori, Christians, humanists, anarchists and the social work profession itself. I have tried to depict these often conflicting points of view where they have informed policies, trends and influential people in the history. The changes in social service delivery have brought into being a much tighter system of service delivery, such that, in some agencies, the social worker may be expected to regard whoever purchases that agency's core services to be the client. What has become of the radical, client advocate version of social work? Was it ever realistic? These questions have been raised for me as I have grappled with the data for this study of social work. The social justice element remains a crucial ingredient, in my view, for social work and provides a value-orientation within this thesis. In organising and presenting material for this historical case study of professional social work education, I have tried to let people and facts speak for themselves. I am aware that this process is one in which I will "exhibit and examine my alliances at the same moment" (Viswasweran, 1995: 132, in Wittmann, 1998: 17).

As the historical picture took shape through this thesis, the arguments of community workers and their social work supporters were studied. They presented a strong challenge to the perception held by so many professional social workers of themselves as altruistic champions of social justice. This was a significant challenge, because it questioned the foundations on which social work professionals based their core curriculum, arguing as they did that it was a necessary preparation for their work as advocates for the oppressed. This history looks at what happened when community workers, who regarded social workers as maintainers of the status quo rather than
social activists, began gaining better access to the finite resources available for social/community work students. These historical events modified my personal perception of social work as it is practised in Aotearoa/New Zealand. However, the ideal type remains and is reflected in some of the aspirations for social work held by respondents.

I was employed as a student unit supervisor in a health setting in 1987 and in 1988, I was employed as a full-time member of staff in the Social Policy and Social Work Department at Massey University, with responsibility to co-ordinate the new Certificate in Social and Community Work. In this position, I became aware that I was at an intersection in which several competing interests met. The academic institution employing me had been reluctant to offer this new, part-time and extra-mural\(^1\) programme. The Federation of Voluntary Welfare Organisations was desperate to find an institution to host such a course and my salary was paid for by two large voluntary organisations for three years while the course became established. The Aotearoa Community Workers Association was officially very critical of this new course, regarding it as yet one more example of the universities tying up resources which should be available to community workers. I experienced the full force of this criticism when I went to the Aotearoa Community Workers Conference in Teapot Valley, near Nelson, in 1988 and introduced myself as the co-ordinator of the new Certificate. Despite the negativity, many individual community workers took advantage of the flexibility of the extra-mural, part-time programme and have completed it. Several statutory agencies also supported the new course by encouraging their staff to enrol and helping them to complete their studies.

When visiting a British university in 1992, I was asked to present two workshops on anti-discriminatory social work. I was astonished to find the students carefully segregated into categories on a spectrum from minority and other groupings to mainstream categories. When discussing with these adult students, who were all experienced social workers, the reasons for this segregation and for the introduction of the new module (anti-discriminatory practice) in the curriculum, I found them disturbingly unaware of the philosophies underpinning their new curriculum. This was combined with a lack of a critical appraisal of the curriculum itself. I became more than ever interested in the history of social work education and how important it is for students to be aware of the professional values and

---

\(^1\) An extra-mural programme is taught at a distance.
socialisation embedded in their programmes of study and how these ingredients got to be there.

As someone with a working interest in this area, I have been fortunate in gaining access to people who have been willing to discuss their part in this history of social work education and give their own interpretations and opinions on matters. My personal and continuing involvement will have affected what people have been willing to discuss with me and inevitably this will colour my account.

I have been given access to archival material that would quite possibly not be made available to complete outsiders. The questions I sought to answer have been revised as my understanding of the area broadened and deepened. Finding links and making connections between people working in the social services at every level and over time has been fascinating and revealing, as too, has been the work of interpreting their actions and what they stood for. I have sought to write a balanced account of events and to cover opposing views and opinions of certain events in an inclusive fashion. This approach will be discussed in the Methods Chapter.
CONTENTS

Abstract 1
Acknowledgements ii
Preface iii

Chapter One: Introduction 1
Periods and themes 5
Writing a history of social work education 7
Outline of chapters 10
Explanations 14
To conclude 15

Chapter Two: Methodology 16
Principles informing the approach taken in this research 17
Sources and collection of written data 20
The collection of archival and oral data 22
The New Zealand Association of Social Workers Archives 22
The New Zealand Social Work Training Council Archives 23
The New Zealand Council for Education and Training in
the Social Services Archives 26
The respondents 27
The interviews 29
Interviewing one's peers 30
Data analysis 31
Ethics and supervision 35
List of Respondents 36
Guide to the appendices 41
Referencing 41

Chapter Three: Histories of Social Work Education 43

Introduction 43
International histories 45
Common trends 45
Women in social work education 48
  Mary Richmond and Bertha Reynolds 49
  Eileen Younghusband and social work education in Britain 50
Social work: inherent tensions and contradictions 53
Social work and agency setting 58
Social work and community work 59
Australian and Aotearoa/New Zealand histories 62
Conclusion 72

**Chapter Four: Academic and Agency Issues for Social Work Courses** 74
Social work as an academic discipline 77
Goals in higher education in a plural society 83
Issues for social work education in Aotearoa /New Zealand 90
Economic and political change and traditional social work 93
Post-industrial society and social work 96

**Chapter Five: Merv Hancock, a Personal Account** 103
Education for Social Work 105
The fieldwork practice component 108
Gisborne and the need for social work education 110
Early contribution to NZASW 115
Private practice 126
Head of Social Work Unit, Massey University 129
  The Development of the Bachelor of Social Work degree 131
  Designing the post-graduate curriculum 138
Ministerial Review of the New Zealand Social Work Training Council 141

**Chapter Six: Recruitment and Supply of Qualified Social Workers between 1949-1995** 148
Social workers' qualifications: 1949-72 150
Social workers' qualifications: 1973-86 160
Social workers' qualifications: 1987-95 169
Mechanisms of market control 174
Conclusion 175
Visions 239
Choices 242

Chapter Nine: 1973-1986, Introducing the Second Period 244
Political leadership and changing economic, cultural and social background 245
The social work industry 247
   Attitudes to social work 256
Social and community work professional associations 260
   The New Zealand Association of Social Workers 261
   The Community Work Movement 270
Social and community work educators. 272

Chapter Ten: 1973-1986, Consolidation 280
The New Zealand Social Work Training Council:
   Establishment, Constitution, Terms of Reference and Membership. 281
   Establishment and constitution 281
   Terms of reference and modus operandi 282
   Council membership 283
   The work of the New Zealand Social Work Training Council 286
      Basic minimum standards and accreditation 289
   Community work and the Council 295
   The location debate 300
      Participants in the location debate 301
      The subject matter 301
      Division of opinions 304
   Idealists and Realists 312
   The de-construction of the New Zealand Social Work Training Council: Reviews and oral data 318
   Influences and alliances 323
   People, their views and choices concerning social work education 325

Chapter Eleven: 1987-95, Introducing the Third Period 328
Political leadership and changing economic, cultural and social background 329
| Social work agencies and employers | 341 |
| Philosophical and intellectual positions | 349 |
| Technical approach to social work | 350 |
| Social and community work associations | 352 |
| The New Zealand Association of Social Workers | 352 |
| Aotearoa Community Workers’ Association | 355 |
| Social and community work educators | 357 |
| The mosaic of opportunities | 361 |
| The universities | 365 |
| The Polytechnics | 365 |

**Chapter Twelve:** 1987-95, Diversification and Fragmentation 372

- Establishment 374
- Constitution 376
- Terms of Reference 377
- Membership 378
- Modus Operandi 384
- Networking and the Regional Co-ordinators 389
  - The newsletters 392
- Standards and accreditation 393
- The deconstruction of the New Zealand Council for Education and the Social Services 399
- Alliances and influences 405
- Diversity and fragmentation 407

**Chapter Thirteen:** Conclusions 409

- Professional Social Work in Aotearoa/New Zealand 413
- Social Work Education in Aotearoa/New Zealand 420
- Implications for social work education in Aotearoa/New Zealand 430
- Methodological considerations 432
- Future research 433
- Conclusion 436

**Appendices** 438

- Appendix I Treaty of Waitangi 438
- Appendix II Glossary of Frequently Used Maori Terms 440
- Appendix III (a) Participant information sheet 441
| Appendix III (b) | Consent Forms                   | 443 |
| Appendix III (c) | Guidelines for use of information | 444 |
| Appendix III (d) | Questionnaire and semi-structured interview | 445 |
| Appendix IV      | Five Historical Timelines        | 447 |
| Appendix V       | Pamphlets                        | 458 |
| Appendix VI      | Minimum Standards (1976), NZSWTC  | 460 |
| Appendix VII     | Definitions of social, community and youth work | 464 |

**Charts and Tables**

| Chart 1: 1 | Respondents | 29 |
| Chart 3: 1 | International development of social work education | 47 |
| Chart 3: 2 | Chronology of formation of international and national professional social work associations | 55 |
| Chart 4: 1 | The Biglan-Kolb classification of knowledge | 81 |
| Table 6: 1 | Distribution of qualifications, 1956-1969 | 155 |
| Table 6: 2 | Summary of social workers by grade and qualifications, 1974 | 156 |
| Table 6: 3 | Survey of training needs of government departments and Hospital Boards | 161 |
| Map of social and community work courses in North Island, 1989 | 362 |
| Map of social and community work courses in South Island, 1989 | 363 |
| Chart 13: 1 | Changing identity, issues and ethos in social work in Aotearoa/New Zealand | 414 |
| Chart 13: 2 | Social work education in Aotearoa/New Zealand | 421 |

**Photographs**

| Set One | Between Chapters Five and Six | 147 - 148 |
| Set Two | Between Chapters Seven and Eight | 201 - 205 |
| Set Three | Between Chapters Nine and Ten | 278 - 279 |
| Set Four | Between Chapters Eleven and Twelve | 368 - 371 |

**Sources**

466

**Works Cited and Works Consulted**

| Published | 468 |
| Unpublished | 503 |