Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
MOTIVATION TO LEARN IN ONLINE ENVIRONMENTS: AN EXPLORATION OF TWO TERTIARY EDUCATION CONTEXTS

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy in Education

at Massey University, Manawatu,

New Zealand

Margaret Katherine Hartnett

2010
Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for the thesis to be downloaded or copied by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
ABSTRACT

Research evidence suggests that motivation is an important consideration for online learners. Notably, existing research has frequently focused on the design of motivating online learning environments. Alternatively, motivation has been viewed as a collection of relatively stable personal characteristics of learners. In contrast, a contemporary view that acknowledges the complexity and dynamic interplay of factors underlying and influencing motivation to learn (e.g., Turner & Patrick, 2008) is adopted here. From this ‘person in context’ perspective, this study investigates the nature of motivation to learn in online distance learning environments. The study explores how student motivation relates to online participation in these contexts. In addition, social and contextual factors that foster and undermine motivation are identified.

The research design utilises a case study approach which focuses on learners in two separate online distance courses within the same university programme. The boundary for each case study is defined by one piece of assessed work and the associated activities within each course. Interview and questionnaire data, supported by archived online data and course resources, were collected. Analysis of the data were made using the three conceptual lenses of self-determination theory (Deci & Ryan, 1985) and the continuum of human motivation encompassed within this theoretical framework.

Findings indicate that the motivation of learners in online environments was multidimensional. Intrinsic motivation and various types of extrinsic motivation were shown to co-exist. Complex relationships were also shown to exist between motivation and participation that were sensitive to situational influences. Multiple factors fostered the expression of high quality (i.e. more self-determined) motivation. Most prominent among these were the relevance of the learning activity, the provision of clear guidelines, and ongoing support and feedback from the teacher that was responsive to learners’ needs. Supportive caring relationships were also important. A range of factors also undermined the motivation of learners; most notably high workload, assessment pressure, and the perception that the learning activity lacked relevance.

Student motivation to learn within these contexts was found to be multifaceted, complex and sensitive to situational factors. The use of self-determination theory has confirmed it as a useful analytic tool for exploring the complexity of motivation in online contexts. Implications based on the findings are considered for stakeholders.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to express my gratitude to the students and teaching staff who agreed to take part in this research and share their experiences of online learning and teaching. Without them our understanding of motivation in online contexts would be much poorer.

I also wish to express my sincere appreciation to my research supervisors, Dr. Alison St. George, Dr. Ben Kehrwald and Associate Professor Jon Dron. They have been a constant source of insightful critique and support, patiently answering my questions while offering clear guidance. Without your assistance this research would have been less rich and certainly less enjoyable. A special thank you to my mum who has patiently edited and proof-read various revisions of this thesis. Thank you also to Philippa Butler for casting her expert eye over the final version of this work.

To my husband Steven and daughter Caitlin, I truly appreciate the constant love, support, understanding, time and space you have given me to complete this work.

Finally, I wish to thank the New Zealand Tertiary Education Commission for the award of Top Achievers Doctoral scholarship which enabled me to complete this thesis in a timely fashion as well as attend several conferences.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ............................................................................................................................................. i

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .................................................................................................................... ii

TABLE OF CONTENTS ....................................................................................................................... iii

LIST OF TABLES ............................................................................................................................... v

LIST OF FIGURES ............................................................................................................................ vi

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY ............................................................................. 1

1.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 1

1.2 Research aims of the study ......................................................................................................... 2

1.3 Rationale for the study ............................................................................................................... 2

1.4 Context of the study .................................................................................................................... 5

1.5 The place of the researcher ....................................................................................................... 6

1.6 Thesis overview ........................................................................................................................ 6

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW ......................................................................................... 9

2.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 9

2.2 Online distance learning .......................................................................................................... 9

2.3 Motivation to learn in online distance environments ............................................................... 19

2.4 Self-determination theory as a framework for this study ..................................................... 33

2.5 Chapter summary ..................................................................................................................... 38

CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY ............................................................................................ 41

3.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 41

3.2 Research questions .................................................................................................................... 41

3.3 Research methodology ............................................................................................................. 42

3.4 Case studies ............................................................................................................................... 46

3.5 Context of the study ................................................................................................................... 48

3.6 Research ethics ........................................................................................................................ 50

3.7 Research procedure .................................................................................................................. 53

3.8 Data collection .......................................................................................................................... 57

3.9 Data analysis ............................................................................................................................. 63

3.10 Chapter summary ................................................................................................................... 71

CHAPTER FOUR: CASE STUDY ONE ............................................................................................. 73

4.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................... 73
4.2 Description of Case Study One ................................................................. 73

Part One: Motivation and participation ......................................................... 78
4.3 The nature of motivation ......................................................................... 78
4.4 Online participation .................................................................................. 88

Part Two: Social and contextual influences on motivation .......................... 100
4.5 Perceptions of autonomy ...................................................................... 101
4.6 Perceptions of competence ..................................................................... 126
4.7 Perceptions of relatedness ...................................................................... 148
4.8 Chapter summary .................................................................................... 157

CHAPTER FIVE: CASE STUDY TWO ............................................................ 163
5.1 Introduction ............................................................................................ 163
5.2 Description of Case Study Two .............................................................. 163

Part One: Motivation and participation ......................................................... 166
5.3 The nature of motivation ...................................................................... 166
5.4 Online participation ................................................................................ 173

Part Two: Social and contextual influences on motivation .......................... 179
5.5 Perceptions of autonomy ...................................................................... 179
5.6 Perceptions of competence ..................................................................... 196
5.7 Perceptions of relatedness ...................................................................... 212
5.8 Chapter summary .................................................................................... 217

CHAPTER SIX: DISCUSSION ....................................................................... 223
6.1 Introduction ............................................................................................ 223
6.2 The nature of motivation ...................................................................... 223
6.3 Online participation ................................................................................ 233
6.4 Supportive social and contextual influences .......................................... 239
6.5 Undermining social and contextual influences ....................................... 266
6.6 Chapter summary .................................................................................... 286

CHAPTER SEVEN: CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS .......................... 293
7.1 Introduction ............................................................................................ 293
7.2 Research conclusions ............................................................................ 293
7.3 Contributions to knowledge .................................................................. 300
7.4 Implications for practice ....................................................................... 306
7.5 Future research ...................................................................................... 310
7.6 Final thoughts ......................................................................................... 311
REFERENCES .................................................................................................................. 313
APPENDICES .............................................................................................................. 338

Appendix A – Letter to Head of Department requesting access ...................................... 338
Appendix B – Email to potential lecturer participants ....................................................... 339
Appendix C – Information sheet for potential lecturer participants .................................. 340
Appendix D – Lecturer participant consent form ............................................................... 343
Appendix E – Initial approach to potential student participants ....................................... 344
Appendix F – Email response to potential student participants ....................................... 345
Appendix G – Information sheet for potential student participants ............................... 346
Appendix H – Student participant consent form ............................................................... 349
Appendix I – Potential student participant follow-up letter ......................................... 350
Appendix J – Potential student participant follow-up message ..................................... 351
Appendix K – Email to student participants with questionnaire details ....................... 352
Appendix L – Questionnaire for student participants ..................................................... 353
Appendix M – Email to student participants requesting an interview ............................. 357
Appendix N – Interview schedule for student participants .............................................. 358
Appendix O – Interview schedule for lecturer participants ......................................... 359
Appendix P – Transcriber’s confidentiality agreement ................................................... 360
Appendix Q – Student participant authority for release of transcripts ......................... 361
Appendix R – Lecturer participant authority for release of transcripts .......................... 362
Appendix S – Letter and permission forms requesting aggregated data ....................... 363
Appendix T – Example of NVivo auto coding collating same question responses .. 366
Appendix U – Example of coding of qualitative data using NVivo ............................... 367

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1: Overview of the study .................................................................................. 49
Table 3.2: Summary of the research procedure ............................................................. 56
Table 3.3: Research questions and data collection methods ....................................... 57
Table 3.4: Summary of the data generation methods ..................................................... 65
Table 4.1: Case Study One participants’ demographic details of ................................... 75
Table 4.2: Description of Case Study One participants ............................................... 75
Table 4.3: Case Study One participants’ SIMS and SDI scores ..................................... 79
Table 4.4: Comparison of median SIMS scores for Case Study One participants with positive and negative SDI scores ................................................................. 84
Table 4.5: Case Study One Spearman rho correlation coefficients (rₜ) between SDI and achievement ....................................................................................... 85
Table 4.6: Case Study One Mann-Whitney U results comparing achievement of participants and non-participants ..................................................... 87
Table 4.7: Case Study One Spearman rho correlation coefficients (rₜ) between participation, SDI, and achievement at assignment and course levels .... 89
Table 4.8: Case Study One Mann-Whitney U results comparing online participation of participants and non-participants at assignment and course level ........ 99
Table 5.1: Case Study Two participants’ demographic details of ....................... 165
Table 5.2: Description of Case Study Two participants ..................................... 165
Table 5.3: Case Study Two participants’ SIMS and SDI scores ....................... 168
Table 5.4: Case Study Two Spearman rho correlation coefficients (rₜ) between SDI and achievement ................................................................................. 171
Table 5.5: Case Study Two Mann-Whitney U results comparing achievement for participants and non-participants ..................................................... 172
Table 5.6: Case Study Two Spearman rho correlation coefficients (rₜ) between SDI, achievement and participation .................................................... 174
Table 5.7: Case Study Two Mann-Whitney U results comparing online participation of participants and non-participants at course level ................. 178
Table 6.1: Cross case median and interquartile range for SIMS subscale and SDI data .............................................................................................................. 224
Table 6.2: Mann-Whitney results U comparing SIMS subscale scores across the cases ........................................................................................... 226

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1: Continuum of human motivation (from Ryan & Deci, 2000a, 2002) ........ 34
Figure 3.1: The context of the study ..................................................................... 51
Figure 4.1: Comparison of median number of weekly messages posted by more and less self-determined participants ................................................. 97
Figure 4.2: Case Study One – Social and contextual factors that supported and undermined autonomy needs .............................................................. 125
Figure 4.3: Total number of lecturer postings to groups containing participants with positive and negative SDI scores ................................................................. 139
Figure 4.4: Comparison of number of messages posted by co-located group and lecturers ......................................................................................... 144
Figure 4.5: Case Study One – Social and contextual factors that supported and undermined competence needs ................................................................. 147
Figure 4.6: Case Study One – Social and contextual influences that supported and undermined relatedness needs ......................................................................... 156
Figure 5.1: Case Study Two – Social and contextual factors that supported and undermined autonomy needs ................................................................. 195
Figure 5.2: Case Study Two – Social and contextual factors that supported and undermined competence needs ................................................................. 211
Figure 5.3: Case Study Two – Social and contextual factors that supported and undermined relatedness needs ................................................................. 218
Figure 6.1: Organising framework for discussion of social and contextual influences that supported or undermined self-determined types of motivation ................................................................. 240
Figure 6.2: Teacher influences that supported self-determined types of motivation ....... 250
Figure 6.3: Learning activity influences that supported self-determined types of motivation ................................................................................................. 259
Figure 6.4: Peer influences that supported self-determined types of motivation........ 265
Figure 6.5: Teacher influences that undermined self-determined types of motivation.270
Figure 6.6: Learning activity influences that undermined self-determined types of motivation ................................................................................................. 282
Figure 6.7: Peer influences that undermined self-determined types of motivation ...... 285
Figure 7.1: Summary of social and contextual influences that supported self-determined types of motivation ......................................................................................... 297
Figure 7.2: Summary of social and contextual influences that undermined self-determined types of motivation ......................................................................................... 299