Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
The Historical Evolution and Contemporary Status of Montessori Schooling in New Zealand, as an Example of the Adaptation of an Alternative Educational Ideal to a Particular National Context.

Mary Jane Shuker

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Education at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

December 2004
Abstract

There have been two distinct phases of the Montessori method of education in New Zealand. The first began in 1912 and continued into the 1950s. The second phase, starting in 1975, has resulted in over one hundred Montessori early childhood centres being established throughout the country. In this thesis I examined the historical evolution and contemporary status of Montessori schooling in New Zealand, as an adaptation of an alternative educational ideal to a particular national context.

To situate this study, the history of the Montessori movement was investigated, taking into consideration the particular character and personality of its founder, Dr. Maria Montessori (1870-1952). It is argued that the apparent contradictions of Montessori, who claimed to be both a scientific educator and a missionary, help explain the endurance of her method. The thesis further maintains that Montessori became a global educator whose philosophy and pedagogy transcends national boundaries. The middle section of this thesis examines the Montessori movement in New Zealand during the first phase and the second phase, highlighting the key role that individuals played in spreading Montessori’s ideas. The major aim was to examine how Montessori education changes and adapts in different cultures and during different time frames. The thesis concentrates on New Zealand as a culturally specific example of a global phenomenon.

The final section of the thesis is a case study of a Montessori early childhood centre examining the influence of Government policy and how the development of the centre supports the ongoing implementation of Montessori’s ideas. The perceptions of Montessori teachers, former parents and students regarding the nature and value of Montessori education are also considered. Finally, observations carried out as part of the case study are analysed to further demonstrate the ways in which the original ideas of Montessori have been reworked to suit a different historical and societal
context. It is concluded that Montessori is a global educator whose philosophy and pedagogy transcends national boundaries. Nonetheless, the integration of Montessori education within any country, including New Zealand, does result in a culturally specific Montessori education.
Acknowledgements

I acknowledge the following people for the support that I have received from them while undertaking this investigation:

First, I would like to extend my sincere appreciation to all the research participants who gave so willingly of their time and thoughts. A special thanks goes to Binda Goldsbrough who shared so generously with me her memories, opinions and expertise.

I particularly thank my supervisors, Professor Joy Cullen and Professor Roger Openshaw, for their enduring patience and careful scrutiny of various drafts. Your detailed feedback and valued suggestions throughout this prolonged exercise were extremely helpful and much appreciated. I was grateful for your ongoing encouragement and guidance.

Lastly, I want to acknowledge and thank my family, Emma, Cameron and especially my partner, Roy, for his patience and support.
Table Of Contents

Abstract......................................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgements........................................................................................................ iv
Table of Contents........................................................................................................... v

Chapter 1: Introduction and Methodology................................................................. 1
  Research Questions and Method................................................................................. 3
  Research Design........................................................................................................... 5
  A Qualitative Approach.............................................................................................. 6
    Historical Research................................................................................................... 8
    The Case Study........................................................................................................ 13
Sources......................................................................................................................... 15
  Archival Records and Documentation....................................................................... 15
  Interviews.................................................................................................................. 15
  Observation............................................................................................................... 18
  Survey....................................................................................................................... 21
Ethical Considerations.................................................................................................. 22
  Informed Consent...................................................................................................... 22
  Anonymity and Confidentiality................................................................................. 22
  Participant’s Right to Decline to Take Part............................................................... 23
  Interviews............................................................................................................... 23
  Non-Participant Observation of the Administration................................................. 23
  Direct Observation in the Classroom......................................................................... 23
  Conflict of Interest/Conflict of Roles......................................................................... 24
Organisation of Thesis.................................................................................................. 24

Part One: The Historical Background

Chapter 2: Maria Montessori and the Internationalisation of Her Method................. 27
  Introduction............................................................................................................... 27
  Montessori – The Early Years.................................................................................. 29
    Medical Career....................................................................................................... 31
  An Eclectic Borrower............................................................................................... 32
  Special Education...................................................................................................... 36
    Scientist and Mystic............................................................................................... 33
  Change of Direction................................................................................................ 38
  Establishment of the ‘Children’s Houses’................................................................. 41
    Maternal Function................................................................................................... 42
    Parents’ Obligations................................................................................................ 43
  Trialling New Ideas.................................................................................................... 43
  Conceptual Framework of Montessori’s Ideas.......................................................... 45
  Montessori’s Writings............................................................................................... 45
  Fundamental Pedagogical Premises.......................................................................... 50
  The Montessori Method is a Scientific Approach to Education............................... 51
    Spontaneous Activity............................................................................................ 54
  The Four Planes of Development.............................................................................. 55
    First Plane of Development – Birth to Six Years of Age....................................... 56
  The Montessori Programme....................................................................................... 60
The Prepared Environment .................................................. 61
Motor Education .............................................................. 62
Sensory Education ............................................................. 62
Language Education ........................................................... 63
Interpretation of Montessori’s Method: What is Montessori? ......... 64
The Rapid Spread of Montessori’s Educational Ideas .................. 66
   The Promise of the Children’s Houses ............................... 67
   The Montessori Method .................................................. 68
Impact of the Movement ..................................................... 70
   Endorsement of the Montessori System ............................. 71
The Hand of Commerce ....................................................... 72
World-wide Interest ........................................................... 73
   Early Childhood Sector .................................................. 75
Montessori’s Response to Criticism ....................................... 76
Overseeing the Montessori Movement ..................................... 77
   Training Montessori Teachers ........................................... 78
The “Failure” of the Montessori Method ................................... 84
Chapter Summary ................................................................ 87

Part Two: The Growth of Montessori in New Zealand – Past and Present

Chapter 3: The Montessori Movement in New Zealand – The First Phase ...... 90
   Introduction ................................................................. 90
Montessori’s Ideas Reach New Zealand .................................... 91
   Trialling Montessori’s Ideas in Australia .............................. 92
   Travels to Europe and England ........................................... 94
Simpson’s Montessori Experiment at Blackfriars and its Impact on New Zealand ................................................................. 99
   Simpson’s Report on the Montessori Method of Education ......... 100
   Montessori’s Method Suitable for Older Children ................... 103
   Teacher Training ............................................................ 103
   The Notion of Freedom for Children and for Teachers ............ 104
   Distribution of Simpson’s Report ........................................ 105
Implementing Montessori’s Method in New Zealand ..................... 105
   Kelburn Normal School .................................................. 105
   Wellesley Street Normal School, Auckland .......................... 107
   Attaining the Montessori Didactic Materials .......................... 109
The Wanganui Education Board .............................................. 110
   Montessori Model Schools .............................................. 113
Other Education Board Districts ......................................... 122
Catholic Montessori Schools ................................................. 123
   Teacher Training ............................................................ 125
Montessori’s Reception in the Early Childhood Sector ................. 128
The ‘Failure’ of the Montessori Method in New Zealand ............... 129
Chapter Summary ................................................................ 131

Chapter 4: Montessori – The Revival ........................................ 132
   Introduction ................................................................. 132
The North American Revival .................................................. 133
The New Zealand Revival .................................................... 142
Binda Goldsborough and Her Role in Promoting Montessori Education in New Zealand ........................................ 143

Small Beginnings ............................................................ 146
Montessori Association of Christchurch (MAC) ....................... 148

The Montessori Association of New Zealand ......................... 149

Montessori Teacher Training Options .................................. 152
Continued Growth of Montessori Schooling ......................... 157
Situating Montessori Within a Generic Degree Programme ........ 163
Upgrading to a Degree or Diploma ....................................... 164

Implementing Te Whariki .................................................. 165

Chapter Summary .......................................................... 167

Part Three: Montessori in Contemporary New Zealand

Chapter 5: The National and the Local: Government Policy and One Montessori Early Childhood Centre ........................................ 168

Introduction ........................................................................ 168

Education Policy Developments During the 1970s .................... 168

The Establishment and Development of A Montessori Early Childhood Centre .................................................. 172

Early Beginnings ............................................................. 174
Montessori Gaining Momentum in New Zealand ................... 178

‘Playgroup’ ........................................................................ 181

Recruiting a Montessori Teacher .......................................... 183

Purchasing the Montessori Didactic Materials ....................... 188

The Montessori Centre Opens ............................................. 191

Professional Staffing Policies .............................................. 193

Other Concerns ................................................................... 194

Report on Early Childcare and Education ............................. 195

Looking Ahead .................................................................... 196

Major Fundraiser .............................................................. 196

Professional Development for Teachers ............................... 197

Promoting Montessori in the Wider Community ................... 197

Montessori Workshop ....................................................... 198

Finding Qualified Staff ....................................................... 199

New Directions .................................................................... 200

Funding for the New Premise .............................................. 201

Impact of Government Policies ........................................... 201

Montessori Events in the Wider Community ......................... 203

New Premises ..................................................................... 205

More Changes ..................................................................... 207

Writing the Charter ............................................................ 210

Impact of the Charter ........................................................ 212

Another Staff Change ........................................................ 214

Life Member ....................................................................... 215

The National Montessori Association ................................. 216

New Ideas ........................................................................... 216

Second Classroom ............................................................ 217
Chapter 8: Conclusion: Montessori in Change: Towards a Theory of Cultural Adaptation........................................................................................................................................... 297
  Introduction................................................................................................................................................................................................. 297
  Globalising Montessori: The First Phase.......................................................... 298
  The Second Phase: Montessori Revived.......................................................... 302
  New Zealand Montessori Experience.............................................................. 305
    The Role of Key Individuals............................................................................. 306
    Government Policies.......................................................................................... 307
    Programme Success/Appeal............................................................................. 308
    Montessori Teachers.......................................................................................... 309
  Limitation of the Study and Future Directions for Research............................... 310
    Primary and Secondary Montessori Education............................................. 310
    Impact of Situating Montessori in a Generic Degree Programme.............. 311
  General Conclusion.............................................................................................. 311

Bibliography............................................................................................................. 313

Appendices.................................................................................................................. 349
  Appendix A: Interview Schedules (Former Montessori Teachers, Parents and Pupils) – Information Sheet................................................................. 349
  Consent Form (Former Montessori Teachers and Parents)............................. 350
  Consent Form (Former Pupils).............................................................................. 351
  Former Montessori Teachers’ Interview Schedule........................................... 352
  Former Parents’ Interview Schedule................................................................. 354
  Former Pupils’ Interview Schedule................................................................. 355
  Appendix B: Survey of Current Montessori Teachers......................................... 356
  Survey of Current Montessori Teachers............................................................. 357
  Appendix C: Information Letter for Experienced Montessori Teachers.................. 361
  Consent Form for Expert Group........................................................................... 363
  Appendix D: Permission Forms for School Administrators – Information Sheet................................................................. 364
  Consent Form........................................................................................................ 366
  Appendix E: Permission Forms to Observe Children – Information Sheet........... 367
  Consent Form........................................................................................................ 368
  Appendix F: Permission Forms to Observe Teachers – Information Sheet........... 369
  Consent Form........................................................................................................ 371
  Appendix G: Some Highlights in the Life of Dr. Maria Montessori...................... 372
  Appendix H: Rules and Regulations of the “Children’s Houses”......................... 375
  Appendix I: Montessori’s Critics and Advocates............................................... 376
  Appendix J: Montessori Didactic Material............................................................ 378
  Appendix K: Winter Schedule............................................................................. 379
  Appendix L: Montessori Training Institutes – Historical Perspective and Current Status........................................................................................................ 380
  Appendix M: Binda Goldsbrough – A Life in Montessori...................................... 386
  Appendix N: Agenda for National Montessori Meeting 1982............................... 401
  Appendix O: Montessori Schools Established by 1982...................................... 403
  Appendix P: Montessori Topics............................................................................ 405
  Appendix Q: List of Montessori Equipment....................................................... 406