Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
IDENTITY, CULTURE AND POWER:
TOWARDS FRAMEWORKS FOR SELF
DETERMINATION OF COMMUNITIES AT THE
MARGINS

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy at Massey University Albany, New Zealand.

Katharine Anne Lewis Williams

October 2001
Abstract

The thesis inquires into how communities at the economic and cultural margins can become self-determining, increasing control over health and well-being. Community development as a method of agency in Aotearoa/New Zealand and Canada is investigated. The inquiry has been precipitated by a number of factors, all of which remain salient features in shaping contemporary conditions in both countries. Among these are increased inequities in wealth and health status between population groups in both countries that have accompanied globalising processes. The economic and cultural dominance of particular sectors in these societies means that public policies often fail to reflect the needs, aspirations and cultural systems of marginalised communities. In engaging with these issues, public health discourse in both countries proposes community development as a key strategy whereby disadvantaged communities might address their needs, thus realising increased levels of health and well-being. However in both countries community development remains under theorised, and the potentialities of some communities unrealised.

The research is based upon the traditions of participatory and action research methodologies, within which a variety of qualitative methods are drawn on. The fieldwork was conducted with members of marginalised communities (predominantly low-income, migrant women) participating in community development projects and community developers working with these initiatives. The New Zealand component formed the initial and most substantive part of the investigation, after which these findings were tested in Canada.

The results suggest that 'identity' and 'culture' are key elements within agency dynamics, their significance partially associated with and increased by globalising processes. Analysis of the findings reveal 'power-culture' dynamics (the various combinations of power and culture that are operative within any context) to play a central role in constituting agency relations. The critical post-modern conceptualisation of power theorised, views power-culture relations to be unstable and changing at the interpersonal and community levels of relating. Structural forms of power progressively influence power-culture relations as transitions to institutional contexts are made. The research findings have important implications for community development and public health practice within both countries. A 'power-culture' approach to community development is explicated that conceptualises a number of practice frameworks for those
undertaking community development. These are articulated from three perspectives: (1) community development methodology as practiced by communities, (2) organisational capacity to undertake development work with communities, and (3) practice issues for community developers.
The process and nature of this inquiry has been hugely challenging as well as rewarding. I have had the privilege of meeting and experiencing many different people during the course of the research whose contributions have been invaluable, of which I mention a few in particular.

My partner Jade Furness has been very present with me through the entire process from when the idea of the inquiry first seeded itself over five years ago, throughout the many seasons of its development. She has shared the highs and the lows, offered much wise counsel along the way and unfailingly given her love and support.

A special thanks goes to my supervisors. As my primary supervisor, Mike O’Brien enabled me the flexibility to undertake a PhD thesis with some less usual dimensions. His encouragement and facilitative approach assisted me to develop an inquiry that was ‘meaningful’ to me from early on in the research. His thoughtful input and fine-tuning of various arguments along the way is much appreciated. My gratitude also goes to my second supervisor Ron Labonte who has been a rich source of inspiration for my work. Many fruits of a serendipitous meeting in Canada with Ron a few years ago are throughout this thesis. The energy, clarity and depth of insight offered by Ron have made vital contributions. I am also appreciative of the specialist advice and often timely input of my third supervisor, Marilyn Waring.

I am enormously indebted to the participants, without whom, there would be no research. In particular, I would like to thank the members of the Women’s Advocacy Group for believing in the idea of ‘speaking out and taking action’ and for the many ways in which they have enriched my life since. I’m also very appreciative of the generosity extended to me in all sorts of ways by many people in Canada during that phase of the inquiry.

Alison Blaiklock and Sally Abel have made vital contributions to the thesis. For several years, Alison has consistently offered her support, guidance and expertise on a variety of public health issues pertaining to the inquiry. Her encouragement and belief in the topic played an important part in my decision to embark on the research in the first place. Sally’s knowledge of qualitative research proved invaluable during the data analysis and write up phase, as did her listening,
support, thoughtful way of inquiry and enthusiasm for the thesis topic. To you both I extend my heartfelt thanks.

Special thanks go to my family and friends who despite my ‘absence’ have continued to offer their love and support. The active interest taken by both my parents in the work has greatly assisted. In particular, I would like to mention my mother Shirley Williams who throughout my lifetime has valued independence of thought and inquiry.

Finally, I extend my appreciation to the Health Research Council of New Zealand for awarding me a Postgraduate Scholarship, which enabled me to undertake this inquiry and a Public Health Limited Budget Grant to assist with expenses.
# Table of contents

Abstract \( i \)
Acknowledgements \( iii \)
Table of contents \( v \)
List of tables \( xiv \)

## CHAPTER ONE  INTRODUCTION

Introduction \( 1 \)
Background \( 2 \)
Focus of the inquiry \( 6 \)
Structure of the thesis \( 9 \)

## CHAPTER TWO  THEORISING THE AGENCY LANDSCAPE: KEY CONSTRUCTS

Introduction \( 12 \)
Key agency constructs \( 13 \)

- Agency and consciousness \( 13 \)
- Agency and identity \( 14 \)
- Agency and culture \( 15 \)
- Agency and subject position \( 17 \)
- Agency and community \( 17 \)
- Agency and power \( 19 \)
- Agency and spirituality \( 20 \)
- Agency and (social) structure \( 22 \)
- Agency and institution \( 23 \)
- Agency and religion \( 24 \)
- Agency and globalisation \( 25 \)
- Agency and health \( 28 \)

Key agency dynamics \( 29 \)

The agency-structure dialectic \( 29 \)
CHAPTER THREE  AGENCY, GLOBALISATION AND POWER-CULTURE 37

Introduction 37

Economic globalisation 39
The social and economic context of capitalism’s development 39
Market (de)regulation and privatisation 41
Discourses of economic globalisation 43

Cultural globalisation 45
Colonisation 46
Consumer culture 50
Migration 51
Globalisation of ethnicity and agency 54
Globalisation of gender and agency 54
Globalisation of alternative systems of development and agency 55
Globalisation of religion and agency 56

Conclusion 56

CHAPTER FOUR  AOTEAROA: AGENCY RELATIONS IN A LOCALISED CONTEXT 60

Introduction 60

Colonial history in Aotearoa and the citizenship of Pacific peoples 61
Restructuring economic and social policy in Aotearoa 63
The impact of policy reform on Pacific communities 66
Employment 67
Income 68
Housing 69
Health 70
Tongan and Samoan communities in Aotearoa: contemporary demographics and agency landscapes 71

Traditional Samoan and Tongan cultural systems: hierarchy, authority and gender relations 73
  *Implications for the agency of Tongan and Samoan migrants living in Aotearoa* 74
  *Implications for the agency of Samoan and Tongan women migrants living in Aotearoa* 77

Dominant social structures, institutional behaviours and the agency capabilities of Tongan and Samoan peoples 79
  *Ethnicity* 79
  *Class* 81
  *Gender* 82
  *Implications for agency* 84

Intra-cultural issues of transition for Samoan and Tongan communities living in Aotearoa 85

Conclusion 87

**CHAPTER FIVE** THEORISING ANALYSIS AND PRACTICE: CRITICAL POST-MODERNISM AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT 90

Introduction 90

Part one: critical post-modern theorisations of agency relations 91
  *Liberal humanism* 91
  *Post-modernism* 92
  *Post-structuralism* 94
  *Feminist theory* 96

Critical post-modernist explanations of agency relations 98
  *Agency: theorising dynamics that constrain* 101
  *Agency: theorising dynamics that enable* 105

Part two: community development as a method of agency with communities at the margins 108

Introduction 108

Critical post-modern discourses: strategies, practice ethics and agency 109

Community development as a method of agency within the investigation 113

Table of Contents
Story-telling: culture, identity and agency

Story-telling and the analysis of power-relations

Community-community development methodology relations

Community development and cultural change

Developing capacities for individual and community agency

Increasing agency capacities in relationship with community

Community development with diverse communities: conflict and agency

Community-(large) organisational relations

Schisms between discourses of community development and organisational behaviours

The mobilisation of dominant discourses and (professional) institutions by organisational representatives

Issues of conflict and power in community-organisational partnerships

Agentic community-organisational partnerships

Community-community developer relations

Identities, cultures and agency

Issues of professionalism and agency

Between organisation and community: the community developer as translator from multiple and changing locations

Conclusion

CHAPTER SIX METHODOLOGY

Introduction

Research as empowerment

Social constructionism

Participatory action research

Participatory action research and scientific rigour

Validity and generalisability

Researching from culturally dominant locations
Data sources

Women's Advocacy Group
Other participants based in Aotearoa
Participants based in Canada
Locating myself within the research

Overview of the research process

Establishing the fieldwork
Women's Advocacy Group
Housing Advocacy Group
Samoan and Tongan women community workers
Canadian component

Development of the research questions

Research methods and data collection

Women's Advocacy Group
The Housing Advocacy Group
Samoan and Tongan women community development workers
Community development workers in Canada

Management of the data

Data analysis and presentation

Ethical considerations

Conclusion

CHAPTER SEVEN BUILDING COMMUNITY CAPACITY

Introduction

Community development methodology: WAG

Phase one: establishment of the advocacy research project
Phase one: emergent themes
Phase two: story-telling, culture and identity
Phase two: emergent themes
Phase three: skills development 185
Phase three: emergent themes 189
Phase four: housing advocacy 190
Phase four: emergent themes 194
Validity tensions and power-culture dynamics 196
Participation 198
Authority/leadership 199
The tangibility and immediacy of results 200
Research participants and the wider community 202
Building a (cross-cultural) relationship with the research participants 203
Conclusion 205

CHAPTER EIGHT IDENTITIES, CULTURES AND AGENCY 207
Introduction 207
Theoretical question one: dominant (Western) social structures and agency 207
Migration from the economic and cultural peripheries 208
Colonising discourses and subjectivities: the Samoan and Tongan research participants 214
Contemporary dominant social structures and the agency of communities at ‘the margins’ in Aotearoa and Canada 218
Community development processes, dominant discourses and institutional practices 225
Conclusions: theoretical question one 227
Theoretical question two: culture and agency 229
Ethnicity and agency 229
Gender and agency 237
Religious cultures and agency 242
The impact of gender cultures on the development of communities 246
Culture and agency: negotiating cultural change 250
Conclusions: theoretical question two 253

Table of Contents
Theoretical question three: identity and agency

Introduction

Focusing on cultures and identities within story-telling: drawing out threads of agency

Learning to work with power

Conclusions: theoretical question three

Conclusion: identities, cultures and agency

CHAPTER NINE  AGENCY AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

Introduction

Theoretical question four: community – community development methodology relations

Developing capacities for individual and community agency

Processes of becoming: increasing agency capacities in relationship with community

Community development with diverse communities: conflict and agency

Conclusions: theoretical question four

Theoretical question five: community- (large) organisational relations

Schisms between discourses of community development and organisational behaviours

The mobilisation of dominant discourses and (professional) institutions by organisational representatives

Issues of conflict and power in community-organisational partnerships

Agentic community-organisational partnerships

Conclusions: theoretical question five

Theoretical question six: community - community developer relations

Identities, cultures and agency

Issues of professionalism and agency

Between organisation and community: the community developer as translator from multiple and changing locations

Conclusions: theoretical question six

Conclusion: agency and community development

Table of Contents
CHAPTER TEN  SELF-DETERMINATION FOR COMMUNITIES AT THE MARGINS: SOME PRELIMINARY AGENCY FRAMEWORKS  343

Introduction  343

Choice of theoretical framework and generalisability  345

Theorising agency: a critical post-modern perspective  348
  The centrality of identity and culture to agency  348
  The theoretical story of agency relations as they occurred within the inquiry  350
  Power and agency: a critical post-modern conceptualisation  356
  Power-culture and agency  358

Towards the self determination of communities at the margins: agency frameworks  359
  A critical post-modern approach to agency: the necessary conditions  360

Communities, community developers and organisations as partners in change  361

Communities  362
  Work on more agentic identities and subject positions  362
  Cultural change  366

Large organisations  367

Community developers  370

Future research and practice directions  371

So what for public health?  374

APPENDICES  377

Appendix One  377
  Information sheet for community research groups  377

Appendix Two  380
  Consent form for community research group participants  380

Appendix Three  381
  Individual interview schedule for Women’s Advocacy Group members  381

Appendix Four  383
  Final evaluation interview schedule for Women’s Advocacy Group members  383

Table of Contents
Appendix Five
  Information sheet for Community Advisory Group

Appendix Six
  Information sheet for Housing Action and Advocacy Project workers

Appendix Seven
  Interview schedule for Housing Action Group project workers:

Appendix Eight
  Information sheet for Pacific women community workers

Appendix Nine
  Interview schedule for Pacific women community workers

Appendix Ten
  Information sheet for Canadian community development workers

Appendix Eleven
  Interview schedule for Canadian community developers

Bibliography
List of tables

Table one: key elements that comprise the internal and external agency terrains 33
Table two: research questions relating to capacity building 164
Table three: research questions relating to policy and structural changes 164
Table four: purpose of the story-telling 177
Table five: WAGs housing advocacy goals 191
Table six: a critical post-modern approach to increasing agency - the necessary conditions 361
Table seven: ‘tool’ for assessing organisational capacity to undertake community development work 369