Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Young Women, Power, Intimate Relationships and Wellbeing

The circumstances that enable young women’s resistant subjective desires:
“A Pash and a Dash”

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctorate in Philosophy
at Massey University, Wellington,
New Zealand.

Prudence Fisher
[2010]
Abstract

This research explored gendered power, young women and resistance. I examined Cromby’s (2006) social constructionist theory of ‘embodied knowing’, Davies and colleagues’ (2001; 2002) theory of subjectivity and Braidotti’s (2003) theory of material embodiment to explore the silences present in feminist poststructuralist theory in the area of young women, subjective desire and wellbeing. The primary aim was to identify resistant ways young women could be within and outside of heterosexual relationships that increases, not decreases, their wellbeing. I conducted discussions with 6 friendship groups of 16-18 year old women, and 13 interviews with a subset of these participants. Critical discourse analysis (Parker, 1999) was employed to identify 7 main discourses in the data, namely: security; developmental; balance; risk and pleasure; girlfriends are fun; female friends negotiating ‘abject’ other and being a nomad. I examined the intersection between the corporeal body, discourse and material resources to identify the circumstances that enabled resistance. Access to resistant forms of female subjectivity was also promoted through the use of mimesis and my intentional positive positioning of the participants within research conversations. Cromby’s ideas of referential difference identified that participants desired the positive visibility of early heterosexual relationships but not the critical visibility of dominating and ‘clingy’ boyfriends. Cromby’s (2006) theory of embodied knowing accessed ‘feelings’ and more corporeal sensations and identified that the ideology of ‘might is right’ is still operating in participants’ lives and silences resistance to male dominance. All participants talked about experiences of empathy and pleasure within female friendships which enabled resistance to heterosexual discourses and promoted care for other females in private and public spaces. Braidotti’s notions of women’s pre-linguistic and linguistic drive ‘to be’ enables theorizing that resistant subjective desires are partially co-constituted through reiterative practices. Future research needs to explore: 1) how boys can be raised in the presence of a legitimate authoritative maternal presence in order to establish reiterative practices of an ethics of care for an equal different female others prior to being a boyfriend; 2) how girls can establish reiterative practices of desiring not to be constantly visible to others and to ‘know’ at an embodied location that not to be visible is not not to be.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the participants and school counsellors, school principals who facilitated this project.

Throughout this thesis my supervisors, Antonia Lyons and Leigh Coombes have fought hard to have me follow a consistent line of argument without diverting off into a multitude of other intersecting theoretical worries that forcibly intruded from my health practice. I am very aware of the effort they have given to this project and am very appreciative that they have assisted me to write this research in a form that can be understood by others. I would also like to thank them for their theoretical input and guidance in selecting academic reading within a ‘critical realist’ framework that best fits my understanding of how knowledge is constituted. I thank Mandy Morgan for her initial guidance and help with finding these two supervisors.

I would also like to thank my friend and supporter Margaret Millard and April Trenberth (clinical consultant) who assisted me work safely and effectively when I was juggling maternal and professional care for others while trying to focus on this research.

Finally I would like to thank the multitude of women I have worked with throughout my nursing, Women’s Refuge, psychological practice and fellow parents and friends whose stories have largely constituted my knowledge and professional desires to date.
# Table of Contents

Abstract .................................................................................................................................................. iii
Acknowledgements ................................................................................................................................. v
List of Tables ........................................................................................................................................... xi
Preface ..................................................................................................................................................... 1

Chapter 1 Introduction ........................................................................................................................ 7
  1.2 Conceptualizing sex and gender ...................................................................................................... 9
    1.2.1 Gender normative practices, corporeal pleasure and dissonance ..................................... 12
  1.3 Social constructionism: The desiring subject as co-constituted through discursive and non-discursive sites ................................................................................................. 14
    Introduction ........................................................................................................................................ 14
    1.3.1 Social constructionism and how knowledge is constructed between subjects .... 16
    1.3.2 Cromby’s ideas of embodied knowing and preferentiality ............................................. 18

Chapter 2 Feminism and poststructuralism ....................................................................................... 25
  Introduction ........................................................................................................................................ 25
  2.1 The risk and pleasure of heterosexuality ..................................................................................... 26
  2.2 Resistance: praxis and subjective desire within a discursive and liberatory framework .............. 30
  2.3 Disciplinary power ...................................................................................................................... 35
    2.3.1 Panoptican effect: Technologies of self ............................................................................ 35
    2.3.2 The intersection between sovereign and disciplinary power ........................................... 38

Chapter 3 The intersecting multiple lines of force that co-constitute female subjective desire ........ 43
  Introduction ........................................................................................................................................ 43
  3.1 The discursive production of selves .............................................................................................. 44
  3.2 Davies and Jones debate and competing understandings of agency ........................................... 45
  3.3 Davies and the process of subjective desire through discursive resources and subjectification ................................................................................................................................. 48
  3.5 ‘Abject other’ and dissonance ...................................................................................................... 52
  3.6. Sexual difference theory, alterity and an ethics of care, and the possibilities of being a nomad ............................................................................................................................ 55
    Introduction ........................................................................................................................................ 55
    3.6.1 Irigaray’s sexual difference theory, phallocentric and alterity ........................................ 56
3.6.2 Paternal consumption and restraints to living passionately outside of heterosexuality ................................................................. 59
Maternal morphology and alternative ways of being ........................................ 59
Being a nomad and having access to mimesis ..................................................... 60
3.7 Summary: The lines of power I will attend to during my research conversations and analysis ........................................................................... 64

Chapter 4 The current research ........................................................................ 65
4.1 A critical realist view of wellbeing .................................................................. 70
Concluding comments and research question ...................................................... 72

Chapter 5 Methodology ...................................................................................... 75
Introduction ......................................................................................................... 75
5.1 Feminist research and reflexivity .................................................................... 75
5.2 Research design .............................................................................................. 77
5.2.1 Stage one: friendship group discussions ..................................................... 77
5.2.2 Stage Two: Individual interviews ............................................................... 78
5.3 Procedure ....................................................................................................... 79
5.3.1 Recruitment ............................................................................................... 79
5.3.2 Participant demographics .......................................................................... 81
5.3.3 Friendship group procedure ...................................................................... 83
5.3.4 Individual interview schedule .................................................................... 84
5.3.5 Transcription ............................................................................................. 85
5.3.6 Follow-up .................................................................................................. 85
5.4 Ethical considerations .................................................................................... 85
5.5 Analytical approach ....................................................................................... 87
5.5.1 Critical discourses methodological process ............................................... 88
5.5.2 Identifying contradictions and resistant discourses through reflexivity: discourse reflecting on discourse ............................................. 89

Chapter 6 Results and discussion: “Desiring or not desiring to be a girlfriend” ...... 91
6.1 Introduction .................................................................................................... 91
6.2 Physical and emotional security discourse .................................................... 92
6.2.1 Physical security ....................................................................................... 93
6.2.2 Emotional security ................................................................................... 98
6.2.3 Security, difference and embodied subjective states of comfort and pleasure.. 100
6.2.4 Intimacy in an exclusive heterosexual relationship .................................... 102
6.2.5 Loneliness .................................................................................................................. 104
6.3 Developmental discourse ................................................................................................. 109
  6.3.1 Learning through difference: referentiality and the co-constitution of knowledge .......................................................... 113
  6.3.2 Bad boyfriends should be transitory ........................................................................ 117
  6.3.3 Learning about heterosexual risks through friends .................................................. 119
6.4 Balance and wellbeing discourse ................................................................................... 123
  6.4.1 The battle of achieving balance, emotional workloads and the impact on wellbeing .................................................. 129
  6.4.2 Boyfriends and paedophiles: Why heterosexuality is not a fair exchange ......... 133
  6.4.3 Young women’s vulnerability, personality types and out-of-balance relationships .................................................................................. 135
  6.4.4 Soul mates and out-of-balance relationships ............................................................ 138
  6.4.5 The problem with being a ‘proper girlfriend’ ............................................................ 139
  6.4.6 Being a ‘proper’ women within and outside of heterosexuality ............................. 140
  6.4.7 Summary of the balance discourse ........................................................................... 143
6.5 The Risk and Pleasure discourse .................................................................................... 144
  6.5.1 The risks of having a boyfriend and the pain of ‘cheating’ .................................... 144
  6.5.2 Losing your ‘reputation’ is a heterosexual risk for young women .......................... 147
  6.5.3 Keeping a risky corporeal female body safe and keeping your reputation .......... 151
  6.5.4 Heterosexual pleasure: “Not like chore, more like it just became a bore” ........ 155
  6.5.5 Claire’s story: “Hooking up” pleasure and negating the ‘risks’ of heterosexual relationships .................................................................................. 158
  6.5.6 ‘Hooking up:’ Women’s sexual desire outside of being a girlfriend “a pash and a dash” .......................................................................................... 161
  6.5.7 How to have sex without the burden of a boyfriend ................................................ 165
Conclusion: Risk and Pleasure Discourse ............................................................................. 167
  Reflexivity and the silences still operating that were not more thoroughly explored within this analysis ........................................................................ 168

Chapter 7 Young women positioned as female friends and discourses of resistance172
  7.1 “Female friends are fun” ............................................................................................ 173
  7.1.1 Mimesis through emotional tone: the co-constitution of resistant discourses .. 176
  7.2 Female friends and ‘abject other’ discourse: “The contradictory embodied experience of resistance and compliance” .................................................................................. 178
7.2.1 Participants’ orientation to female friendship where friends are not at risk of losing their reputation as girlfriends of ‘bad’ boyfriends. ............................... 185
7.3 Young women as nomads an alternative subjective desire ............................ 188
  7.3.1 A nomad is the ‘healthiest way of being’ ............................................ 188
  7.3.2 Geographical and symbolic location of being on the outside .................. 189
  7.3.3 Being a nomad and the material, physical and symbolic aspects of being legitimately positioned ................................................................. 190
  7.3.4 An ideal nomadic boyfriend and the dark and dangerous world of heterosexuality .................................................................................... 193
  7.3.5 Taking a different angle in order to step outside of heterosexuality .......... 194
  7.3.6 What emerges from a critical nomadic location ..................................... 195
  7.3.7 Discussion of the nomadic ideal from the standpoint of ‘real’ difference .... 197
  7.3.8 The intersection between what is ideal and a feminist worry about transience 199
  7.3.8 Changing the angle may promote a different view and enable resistance .... 200

Chapter 8 Conclusion and Discussion .................................................................. 203

8:1 Resistance and an active ‘I’ through positive visibility and mimesis as a feminist research tool ................................................................................. 210
  8.1.1 Mimesis, a forceful line of force co-constituting resistant desires .......... 212
8.2 The ‘real’ risk of male bodies to female bodies in public and private spaces ....... 213
  8.2.1 The function and possibilities for challenging ‘might is right’ .................... 214
Possible Implications ....................................................................................... 217
8.3 Sexual pleasure and intimacy inside and outside of being a girlfriend .......... 219
  8.3.1 How difference and interest intersected and co-constituted resistant sexual pleasure and desire ................................................................. 221
Implications, reflexivity and specificity in the area of sexuality and intervention .... 222
8.4 Female disciplinary power ........................................................................... 225
8.5 Subjective embodied desires for freedom and resistance; what ‘feelings enable’ in the co-constitution of knowledge ..................................................... 228
  8.5.1 Implications for wellbeing ....................................................................... 228
  8.5.2 The functions and implications of utilizing the out-of-balance discourse more systematically in health and education settings with young women .......... 230
8.5.1 Silencing ‘abject other’ through feelings of empathy and care of a legitimate other

8.6 Introduction to the silencing of maternal visibility and authority

8.6.1 Implications for incorporating maternal presence and authority into developmental discourses

8.6.2 Developmental psychology and young women’s subjective desire to be visible

8.6.3 Restraints to self-reflection and resistance outside of others’ gaze

8.7 Boys and an authoritative maternal gaze incorporating both positive and critical visibility

8.8 Conclusion

References

Appendix A: Summary of the Conversational themes of Group 2

Appendix B: Questionnaire

Appendix C: Principles Letter

Appendix D: Screening Questionnaire

Appendix E: Resource Information sheet

Appendix F: Information Sheet for discussion participants

Appendix G: Information Sheet for individual interview participants

Appendix H: Participants feedback

Appendix I: Full excerpts from research discourses

Appendix Ji: Transcriber’s Confidentiality Agreement

Appendix Jii: Transcription notation

Appendix Ki: Informed Consent A

Appendix Kii: Informed Consent B

Appendix Kiii: Participants Confidentiality Agreement

List of Tables

Table 1: Summary of participants recruited for the group discussion

Table 2: Summary of the participants demographics for individual interviews used for analysis