Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

CLOSING THE GAPS?
THE POLITICS OF MĀORI AFFAIRS POLICY

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment
of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
in
Sociology

at Massey University,
Albany, New Zealand.

Louise Virginia Humpage

2002

ABSTRACT

In searching for ways to decolonise, indigenous peoples have promoted indigenous models of self-determination. Governments, in response, have attempted to protect state legitimacy through the depoliticisation of indigenous claims. An analysis of 'Closing the Gaps', a policy strategy introduced by the Labour-Alliance government in June 2000, illustrates that this has certainly been the case in Aotearoa New Zealand.

The policy strategy provides an entry point into exploring the conceptual tensions contained within government policy for Māori, the indigenous peoples of Aotearoa New Zealand. Based on an analysis of government documents and interview data, the thesis focuses on three main initiatives incorporated under the 'Closing the Gaps' umbrella. Each initiative highlights a number of bureaucratic, political and conceptual factors that explain why the strategy failed to match political rhetoric.

The thesis argues that, in its eagerness to demonstrate a 'commitment' to Māori, the Labour-Alliance government neglected to distinguish between two different socio-political projects. The first, 'social inclusion' for all disadvantaged peoples, was framed by a broader 'social development' approach whose ultimate goal was 'national cohesion'. Emphases on 'community empowerment' and 'active citizenship' thus assumed that Māori needs could be met within the universal citizenship rights of the 'nation-state'.

In contrast, the second project was concerned with an acknowledgment of the rights of Māori to self-determination as indigenous peoples and signatories of Aotearoa New Zealand's 'founding' document, the Treaty of Waitangi. Māori self-determination is a multidimensional phenomenon, but includes proposals for political and constitutional reform that are in direct tension with the ideas at the basis of 'social inclusion'. This is because they propose a form of strategic 'exclusion' from the mainstream and from state-framed notions of citizenship that regard 'nation' and 'state' as irrevocably tied. This

tension was not altogether clear, however, because both projects shared the language of 'self-determination' and 'partnership'.

In exploring alternative policy directions, the thesis augments a local literature, which has been critical of government policy for Māori. In addition, it makes a contribution to wider debates concerning the potential of liberal-democratic states to contend with the multinational diversity that indigenous peoples in settler societies represent.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This thesis reflects many debts owed. First and foremost, I would like to acknowledge the twenty-eight participants who kindly took the time to be interviewed, providing rich original data for the thesis, and the government officials involved in compiling my many requests for government documents through the Official Information Act 1982. I am also grateful to Te Puni Kōkiri for permitting me to use material from the ministry's internal files in the thesis.

Acknowledgment must also go to the Massey Human Ethics Committee for assessing and approving the interview component of my research. The Ryiochi Sasakawa Young Leaders' Scholarship and William Georgetti Scholarship committees deserve mention for providing financial resources for the project.

In addition, it is necessary to thank Cluny Macpherson, Cindy Kiro, Iris Turoa and Tania Rangiheua who offered guidance in the early stages of the project, as well as Madelina Sunseri and Jo Cobley who provided comments on drafts of the final thesis. Augie Fleras merits special recognition for acting in both capacities and going beyond the call of duty as an informal supervisor and mentor. Penelope Goode provided guidance with the Māori language used in the thesis, while comments Will Kymlicka made on an article based on the research gave impetus to the development of the conceptual framework it embodies.

The support of my official supervisors, Paul Spoonley and Ann Dupuis is also of note, for they not only provided careful comment and guidance on several versions of this thesis, but continually had more faith in my abilities to complete the research than I ever had!

Finally, thanks must go to my family, particularly Bev, Lee, Eddie, Kitty and Jake, for surviving yet another thesis in which their love and support were invaluable.

CONTENTS

ii Abstract
iv Acknowledgments
v Contents
vii Glossary of Māori Words
x List of Acronyms and Abbreviations

1: INTRODUCTION: A 'NEW ERA OF PARTNERSHIP'?

1 Introductory Comments
4 Māori and the Politics of Indigeneity, Nationalism and Citizenship
11 Research Goals and Rationale
15 Key Thesis Arguments
19 Methods and Methodology
39 Thesis Outline

2: MĀORI AFFAIRS POLICY: STATE-DRIVEN 'SOLUTIONS' FOR A 'MĀORI PROBLEM'

43 Introduction: Contextualising the Closing the Gaps Strategy
45 A Māori Affairs Policy Timeline: 'Solving' the 'Māori Problem'
64 Driving Forces Behind Māori Affairs Policy: State Legitimacy and National Cohesion
81 Conclusion: The 'Double-Edged Sword'

3: MĀORI SELF-DETERMINATION: RESTORING THE BALANCE OF POWER

84 Introduction: The Complexity of Māori Self-Determination
86 A Māori Self-Determination Timeline: Resisting and Challenging State Domination
106 Driving Forces Behind Māori Self-Determination: Autonomy and Control
124 Conclusion: Identifying the Real 'Gaps'

4: THE POLITICS OF POLICY: THE CLOSING THE GAPS POLICY PROCESS

127 Introduction: The Dynamics of Policy
129 Developing a Māori Affairs Policy
138 The Main Elements of Closing the Gaps
141 Marketing the Policy Strategy
152 Closing the Gaps Under the Microscope
162 Implementing Closing the Gaps Without the Name
164 Conclusion: Policy Proliferation and Policy Vacuums

5: IMPROVING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF GOVERNMENT PERFORMANCE FOR MĀORI

167 Introduction: 'Effectively' Improving 'Social Inclusion'
169 The 'Effectiveness' Initiatives
174 Weaknesses in Social Research Capacity
183 Resistance to a Māori Dimension to Policy
189 Poor Capacity for an Outcomes-based Approach
195 Inexperience with Strategic Social Policy
203 Conclusion: Effectiveness for Whom?

6: THE CAPACITY BUILDING PROGRAMME

207 Introduction: 'Empowering' Māori Communities
210 The 'Capacity Building' Initiatives
215 Poor Relationships With Māori Organisations
224 Dominance of 'Market Model' Thinking
231 Difficulty in Reconciling Accountabilities
237 Limited Model of 'Māori Development'
245 Conclusion: Building Whose Capacity?

7: THE NEW ZEALAND PUBLIC HEALTH AND DISABILITY BILL: PROVISIONS FOR MĀORI

248 Introduction: Improving 'Māori Participation in Democracy'
251 The Health Legislation Provisions for Māori
255 Poor Consultation and Communication Processes
264 Inconsistency in Treaty of Waitangi Interpretation
274 Limited Interpretation of 'Partnership'
285 Conclusion: Legislating the Status Quo?

8: LOOKING BACK, LOOKING FORWARD: REVISITING THE RESEARCH GOALS

288 Introduction: The Four Research Goals
290 Looking Back: Continuity in Change
300 Looking Forward: Recommended Policy Directions
314 Conclusion: The Politics of Māori Affairs Policy

318 Appendices
326 References

GLOSSARY OF MĀORI WORDS

All words derived from the Māori language, with the exception of the names of people and places, are defined in English the first time they are used in each chapter. Thereafter refer to this glossary. Please note, for the sake of consistency, macrons are used for all relevant Māori words used in this thesis, even if not included in the original text. Definitions are sourced from: Biggs 1989; Ryan 1994; Cunningham 1998; Durie 1998a; Brookfield 1999:98; Fleras and Spoonley 1999; Havemann 1999.

Aotearoa	New Zealand; literally, long white cloud or long twilight
ariki	paramount chief (of an iwi); aristocracy
hapū	sub-tribe; clan
He Pūtahitanga Hōu	*A New Beginning,* title of a government document; literally, a merging of two pathways into one
hīkoi	walk; march
hui	gathering; assembly; conference
Hui Taumata	Māori Economic Development Summit Conference held in 1984
Hui Ōhanga	Māori Business Development Conference held in 1999
iwi	tribal grouping; confederation
Ka Awatea	*It is Dawn;* title of a government document; literally, it is day or new dawn
Kauhanganui	Great or King's Council, executive of the Kīngitanga movement
kaupapa	function; agenda
Kaupapa Māori framework	Maori-centred research framework; literally, Māori agendas
kāwanatanga	governance; trusteeship; the right to govern and make laws; title given to a proposal for a National Māori Assembly
Kīngitanga	association of independent tribes under the Māori King; literally, kingship or sovereign power
koha	gift; donation; parting message; scar

Kōhanga Reo	Māori language nest; pre-school
kōkiri	to advance; develop
Kōkiri centres/units	community centres, established as part of the Tū Tāngata programme implemented by the Department of Māori Affairs
kotahitanga	unification of tribes; unity through consensus; Māori Parliament
kura kaupapa	Māori language school
Māori	(n) native or descendent of native of New Zealand; (a) ordinary; usual; normal
mana	authority; power; prestige; influence; sovereignty
mana motuhake	self-government; self-determination; name of a political party; proposed model of parallel government
Manatū Māori	Ministry of Māori Affairs
mana whenua	Māori people with customary authority over a particular area, defined as such in the New Zealand Public Health and Disability Bill 2000; literally, title, sovereignty (predicated on land holding) or customary rights over land
Manutukutuku	'Policy projects', theoretical model for Te Puni Kōkiri's work during the 1990s
marae	meeting place/area of whānau and hapū; courtyard in front of ancestral house; central area of village and its buildings
Pākehā	person/people of non-Māori, usually European, descent
Pāremata Māori	Māori Parliament
rangatira	chief (of a hapū)
rangatiratanga	chieftainship; control; authority; autonomy; the power that legitimates the expression of sovereignty
Rātana	name of a religious and political movement established by Tahupotiki Wiremu Rātana in 1918; name of the pā (village) which is the main centre of the movement
rohe	territory
rūnanga	council; local form of tribal government
Rūnanga Iwi Act	Iwi Authority Act
rūnanganui	inter-tribal council; grand council
Tahua Kaihoatu	Māori Provider Development Fund

tangata/tāngata	person/people
tāngata whenua	'people of the land'; local people; indigenous inhabitants
taonga	property; treasure; treasured aspects of Māori society
tapu	sacred; under spiritually-based restriction; inaccessible
Te Kete Hauora	Māori health policy branch of the Ministry of Health
Te Hoe Nuku Roa	name given to a longitudinal study at Massey University whose indicators take into account Māori cultural identity
Te Puni Kōkiri	Ministry of Māori Development
Te Tira Ahu Iwi	Iwi Transition Agency
tikanga	custom; rule; plan; method
Tikanga Rua	bicultural governance or legislatures recognising the customs of both Māori and Pākehā; literally, two customs
tino rangatiratanga	absolute or highest chieftainship; full chiefly authority; sovereignty; the power to be self-determining
tohunga	expert; specialist; priest; artist
Tuku Rangatiratanga	'Devolution'; title of a government policy
tupuna whakapapa	ancestor's genealogy; family tree
Tū Tāngata	'People Stand Tall'; title of a government policy
Wairua Māori	Māori spirit; attitude
whakapapa	genealogy; descent
whānau	extended family
whenua	land; afterbirth

LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

All acronyms and abbreviations are defined the first time they are used in each chapter unless enclosed within an in-text reference. Thereafter refer to this list.

ATSIC	Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission
CBC	Cabinet Business Committee
CCCTG	Cabinet Committee on Closing the Gaps
CTG	Closing the Gaps
CYF	Department of Child, Youth and Family Services
DHB	District Health Board
DIA	Department of Internal Affairs
DMA	Department of Māori Affairs
DPMC	Department of Prime Minister and Cabinet
EPMHRC	Eru Pōmare Māori Health Research Centre
GAP committee	Cabinet Committee of Closing the Gaps
HFA	Health Funding Authority
MAPO	Māori Assisted Provider Organisations
MEDS	Māori Economic Development Summit (Hui Taumata)
MIT	Manakau Institute of Technology
MLT	Medium to Long Term role (of Te Puni Kōkiri)
MMP	Mixed Member Proportional representation
MOH	Ministry of Health
MOSP	Ministry of Social Policy
MP	Member of Parliament
MPG	Ministerial Planning Group
MPIA	Ministry of Pacific Island Affairs

MSD	Ministry of Social Development
NZ	New Zealand
NZGE	New Zealand Government Executive
NZHR	New Zealand House of Representatives
NZHPD Bill/Act	New Zealand Public Health and Disability Bill/Act
NZPA	New Zealand Press Association
OMF	Office of the Minister of Finance
OMH	Office of the Minister of Health
OMMA	Office of the Minister of Māori Affairs
OPM	Office of the Prime Minister
OMSS	Office of the Minister of State Services
RCSP	Royal Commission on Social Policy
SOE	State Owned Enterprise
SSC	State Services Commission
Te TAI	Te Tira Ahu Iwi or Iwi Transition Agency
TPK	Te Puni Kōkiri or Ministry of Māori Development
WINZ	Department of Work and Income New Zealand