Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
The Language of Living:

*Developing Intelligent Novices*

*at The Suter Art Gallery*

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Masters of Philosophy

in

Museum Studies

at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand.

Esther Helen McNaughton

2010
Abstract
This research was founded in Bruer’s (1993, p.15) concept of the intelligent novice, considering students visiting an art gallery could be so described. He defines intelligent novices as “people who learn new fields and solve novel problems more expertly than most, regardless of how much domain-specific knowledge they possess. Among other things, intelligent novices seem to control and monitor their thought processes”. Peckham’s (1965) ‘cognitive dissonance’ is related, describing how some novice learners respond in cognitively threatening situations. These theories are augmented by Efland’s (2002) exploration into art and cognition, in particular, the concepts of ‘ill-structured cognitive domains’ and ‘cognitive flexibility’. Drawing on and reconceptualising these theories, this research addresses how the art gallery environment helps students become intelligent novices.

The case study focuses on the researcher’s education programmes located at The Suter, Te Aratoa a Whakatu, Nelson, New Zealand’s oldest public art gallery, established in 1898. This cross-disciplinary research bridges education and museum studies, and is action-based using mixed-methods. Through a process of journaling, observing, discussing, dialoguing, audio and video recording, as well as collecting and analysing documents including students’ work, the researcher considered how young students develop as intelligent novices. She found that their learning in the art gallery was enhanced by three interrelated factors: the individual’s agency, physical aspects of the art gallery, and the community of practice which developed around class visits, each essential to the development of the intelligent novice. A framework was developed to support art museum educators in facilitating these attributes.

The thesis suggests that:

Intelligent novices independently make effective connections between prior learning and novel situations;

Within the art gallery as an ill-structured domain, the art gallery educator works with communities of practice to support development of intelligent novices;

Repeat gallery visits enable students and communities of practice to practise particular strategies in order to develop as intelligent novices.

Intelligent novices flourish when all members of the communities of practice demonstrate such characteristics.

It concludes that, due to the ‘ill-structured’ nature of the art gallery environment, and its cultural role in society, the role of the intelligent novice is as active cultural transformer.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Lesley Kotua for her huge contribution to this research, generously sharing her perspectives and time. Lesley was always extremely well prepared for sessions and took the project very seriously. Even after a long teaching day followed by staff meetings she would unfailingly greet me with a cheery smile as I arrived with my dictaphone. Lesley’s experience and insight have contributed immensely to this project.

Heartfelt thanks also go to the students and families of Lesley Kotua’s classes in 2008 and 2009. Their willingness to be involved has allowed an insight into a fascinating, under-researched aspect of education, and it was with great pleasure that I was able to explore in detail the process of these particular children and their families learning at The Suter.

Finally I would like to express my gratitude to The Suter, in particular, the director, Julie Catchpole, for their support in this research.

Approval for research has been obtained from the appropriate University Ethics Committee for the experiments described in the thesis. The pilot stage of the research was considered low risk and was recorded on the Low Risk Database which was reported in the Annual Report of the Massey University Human Ethics Committees 2008. The second phase of the research, the video discussions: “The video research, Massey University Human Ethics Committee: Southern B Application 08/47” was granted ethics approval on 10 November 2008.

Readers Notes

The citation within this study follows the convention of giving page numbers for direct quotes, and author followed by date for general references.

All participants’ names, except that of Esther and Lesley, have been changed for the purpose of anonymity.

This study refers to The Suter as an art gallery; theorists cited, however, at times refer to such institutions as art museums, or simply museums. For the purpose of this study art gallery is synonymous with the term art museum.
Contents

Abstract...............................................................................................................................................i
Acknowledgements ..........................................................................................................................ii
Readers Notes..................................................................................................................................ii
Contents ...........................................................................................................................................iii
List of Figures.....................................................................................................................................viii

Chapter One: Introduction ..............................................................................................................1
  General Concept ..............................................................................................................................1
  Setting ...........................................................................................................................................2
  Participants.....................................................................................................................................3
  Ethics .............................................................................................................................................4
  Confidentiality ...............................................................................................................................5
  Storage ..........................................................................................................................................5
  Sharing of Findings .......................................................................................................................5
  Research Biases .............................................................................................................................5
  Limitations of Thesis ...................................................................................................................6
  Summary of Chapters ...................................................................................................................6
    Chapter One: Introduction .........................................................................................................6
    Chapter Two: Research Methodology .......................................................................................7
    Chapter Three: Literature Review............................................................................................7
    Chapter Four: An Exploration through Dialogue .....................................................................7
    Chapter Five: Discussion ..........................................................................................................8
    Chapter Six: Developing Intelligent Novices: A Model for Learning in the Art Gallery ....8
    Chapter Seven: Conclusion.......................................................................................................8

Chapter Two: Research Methodology ...........................................................................................11
  The Case Study .............................................................................................................................11
  Literature Review.........................................................................................................................12
  Action Research ...........................................................................................................................13
Chapter Three: Literature Review

The Art Gallery as a Setting For Learning: Key Concepts

Pluralism

Barriers to Art Gallery Visiting

Literacy

The Viewer and the Artwork

Learning in the Contemporary Art Gallery

Constructivism

Social Aspects of Constructivism

Cognitive Apprenticeship

Communities of Practice

Constructivism in the Art Museum

Cognitive Dissonance

Cognitive Flexibility

Ill-structured Cognitive Domains

Intelligent Novices

Summary of Chapter

Chapter Four: An Exploration through Dialogue

Question One: How do Intelligent Novices in the Art Gallery Make Effective Connections between Prior Learning and Novel Situations?

The Material Nature of the Visit

First Contact

Novices Interacting Intelligently with the Exhibition Environment

The Individual as a Learner

Developmental Level
The Physical Aspects ............................................................................................................113
Together ................................................................................................................................114

Chapter Seven: Conclusion .................................................................................................119
Review ..................................................................................................................................119
Broader Issues ......................................................................................................................120
Scope and Limitations...........................................................................................................122
How Can We Check the Model Presented? .........................................................................123
Possible Future Directions .................................................................................................123

Bibliography .........................................................................................................................125
List of Figures

Figure One: Hooper-Greenhill’s new communication model for museums (Hooper-Greenhill, 1991)........................................................................................................................................... 28

Figure Two: Students learning in White Gold. Credit: Lesley Kotua........................................ 37

Figure Three: Student’s independent use of foreground and background sometime after a Suter visit introducing this concept. Credit: Esther McNaughton.......................................................... 44

Figure Four: Student creating artwork in My Place in Art. Credit: Lesley Kotua.......................... 47

Figure Five: Using a swatch to match colours – a development of a pastel matching activity learnt earlier in the year. Credit: Lesley Kotua.......................................................... 52

Figure Six: Lesley’s students visiting Arum in which they considered memory and loss. Credit: Lesley Kotua.......................................................... 54

Figure Seven: Room 14’s community of practice working together to develop ideas about loss. Credit: Lesley Kotua.......................................................... 58

Figure Eight: Students working on a practical colour theory exercise in The Full Spectrum Credit: Lesley Kotua.......................................................... 65

Figure Nine: Parent supporter in White Gold guiding students through the process of contour drawing. Credit: Lesley Kotua.......................................................... 78

Figure Ten: Lesley’s class and adult supporters after a Suter visit. Credit: Lesley Kotua........ 82

Figure Eleven: Class wall display in response to the IDMe visit. Credit: Esther McNaughton 92

Figures Twelve and Thirteen: Students visiting The Wreck of the Delaware installation using a tonal technique similar to that of the artist. Credit: Lesley Kotua.......................................................... 95

Figure Fourteen: Model of learning in the art gallery ............................................................ 116

Figure Fifteen: Art gallery learning as a dynamic theatre.......................................................... 118