

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Intervention, Opportunity and Response:
A Clash of Paradigms in
Smallholder Cattle Projects in Samoa**

A thesis presented in fulfilment of

the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in Development Studies at

Massey University

Susan Louise Maiava

1998

Abstract

This thesis examines the notion of development as a process of interaction and negotiation between two cultures: the Western development project subculture and, in this case, Samoan culture. It analyses the origins, issues and implications of misunderstandings and misinterpretations that result from this process.

Specifically this thesis investigates the validity of expressed Western perceptions and interpretations of Samoan cattle-farming behaviours that are characterised as irrational in project literature. This is done by examining the role and incorporation of cattle into Samoan culture, society and livelihoods to determine if there are rational explanations, based in Samoan culture and cultural values, for the ways Samoan farmers utilise cattle, particularly in traditional exchange occasions (*fa'alavelave*). In doing this, efforts are made to provide a perspective from the Samoan viewpoint.

Conventional Western interpretations are found to be grossly misinformed. The origins of misinterpretations between the two cultural perspectives (Western/Samoan) and implications for approaches to development projects and development theory are drawn out. Cultural misinterpretations in projects are seen as consistent with, and a function of, the role ascribed to culture in modernisation and liberal modernisation theory.

On one hand cultural interaction resulted in misinterpretation. On the other hand, it resulted in endogenous development. This thesis finds that cattle have been actively incorporated into Samoan traditional and modern activities and livelihoods by Samoans according to their own culturally determined priorities and criteria. This thesis argues that this may be considered successful development and therefore that the protestations that can be traced to the practice of modernisation theory are an irrelevant non-issue.

The endogenous development that did occur may be seen as a process of cultural interaction and negotiation which can be usefully informed by populism. The tenets that would underpin a new theory of development are suggested as rooted in basic human psychological needs which motivate development activity. This can be combined with the concepts of moral economy and active response to other cultures found in populism and concepts of diversity from post-modernism to form the basis of a new theory of development.

In loving memory of my mother-in-law

Taua Maiava Gaugatao Papali'i

and my grandmother

Hazel May Blake

"Though I am free and belong to no man, I make myself a slave to everyone, to save as many as possible. To the Jews I became like a Jew, to save the Jews. To the Gentiles I became like a Gentile, so as to save the Gentiles. To the weak I became weak, to save the weak. I have become all things to all men so that by all possible means I might save some" (1 Corinthians, 9:19-22)

"Some of the dominant class join the oppressed in their struggle for liberation ... as they move to the side of the exploited they almost always bring with them the marks of their origin. Their prejudices include a lack of confidence in the people's ability to think, to want, and to know ... They talk about the people but they do not trust them; and trusting the people is the indispensable precondition for revolutionary change" (Paulo Freire, 1972:36)

Dedicated to all the smallholder cattle farmers of Samoa

Acknowledgements

Thanks go first to my husband Matai'a Tavale II, my chief advisor on Samoan culture as well as translator and interpreter. He has been extremely supportive and encouraging over the past six years. Thanks also to my parents and my children John and Sarah. *Malo lava le tapua'i.*

I am deeply grateful to Professor John Overton, my Chief Supervisor for overseeing this project to its completion. I am also grateful to Associate Professor Brian Ponter for his penetrating comments. Thanks also to Professor Croz Walsh.

I am indebted for financial support to Massey University for a generous Study Award and both Massey University and MFAT for making significant contributions to the cost of fieldwork, and to Professor Pattie at USP, Alafua Campus for allowing us the use of a house in Samoa.

In Samoa many people were of great assistance in allowing this research to proceed unhindered and in being very willing to discuss issues in the development of the smallholder cattle sector with me. My first thanks go to The Minister of Agriculture, Misa Telefoni Retzlaff and the Director of Agriculture, Tuisuga Sofara Aveau. Thanks also to Deputy Director Seve Imo and Chief Livestock Officer Ken Lameta and all his staff in the Livestock Section at Avele. Very special thanks to two people who were especially helpful: Faleupolu Tevita and Nofoa Tamasese, both in 1987 and 1994. *Fa'afetai tele lava.*

In Samoa my thanks also go to Edwin, my interpreter in 1987, Stephen Lee, a UNV Volunteer, Jaap Meijer from FAO, Professor Bill Pattie and Leilani Petaia from USP, Ieti Tifaga in the EAPU, and Fa'afetai Fata. Thanks also to GRM and AIDAB staff, and Geoff Lawson from MFAT for willing assistance.

My greatest debt is to all the respondents for their patience and willingness to answer all the questions this *palagi* was asking. It is my sincerest wish that their voice is heard through this research and that ultimately some benefit to them may result. I thank in particular the villagers of Sato'alepai for their interest and patience. Thanks especially to Maiava Veni, Savalia and family in Sato'alepai and others with whom I had long conversations in order to be sure my understanding was correct. *Fa'afetai tele lava.*

Thank-you also to the family of Matai'a Tavale I who very graciously let me intrude in their grief. Several other respondents also did this when the death of a loved family member entered the discussion because of the topic of this research. For allowing that intrusion I am very grateful.

I also thank all my colleagues and fellow PhD students at the Institute of Development Studies for their support, encouragement and stimulating discussions.

Lastly, thanks to Kath Lyons and Tanya Sadlier for typing and to Barbara Blake for proof reading and editing.

Table of Contents

Title Page	i
Abstract	ii
Dedication	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Table of Contents	v
List of Tables	ix
List of Figures	x
List of Plates	xi
Acronyms and Abbreviations	xiii
Glossary of Samoan Words and Phrases	xiv
Chapter One	
Introduction: Objectives, Outline of Thesis and Research Design	1
1.1 Introduction and Objectives	1
1.2 Outline of Thesis	4
1.3 Research Design and Methodology	9
1.4 In the Field	16
Chapter Two	
Establishing the Theoretical Context: Culture and Development	26
2.1 Introduction	26
2.2 Modernisation	27
2.3 The Beginning of an Anti-Thesis: Liberal Modernisation	34
2.4 The Third Paradigm	42
2.4.1 People-Centred Development	42
2.4.2 Populism: Spontaneous Development	48
2.4.3 The Third Paradigm: An Appraisal	55
2.4.4 Post-Modernism	58
2.5 A Theory of Development for the Pacific: MIRAB	60
2.6 Development in Practice: Development Projects	67
2.6.1 The Development Project	67
2.6.2 The Project Cycle	69
2.6.3 Planning for People-Centred Development	76
2.7 Development as Cultural Interaction	84

Chapter Three	
Samoa, Cattle and Development: Interpretations of Samoan Culture	92
3.1 Introduction: Samoan Culture: Constraint or Motivation?	92
3.2 Culture as Constraint: Interpretations of the Role of Samoan Culture in Development	93
3.3 Interpretations of the Role of Samoan Culture in Development of the Smallholder Cattle Sector	106
3.4 The Emergence of an Anti-Thesis	112
Chapter Four	
Understanding Samoan Culture	117
4.1 Introduction	117
4.2 The Importance of Family	120
4.3 Rank, Status and Social Change	127
4.4 Competition, Co-operation, Community and Contradictions	136
4.5 Economic Values: Work, Income and Money; Distribution, Exchange and Obligation	138
4.6 <i>Fa'avelave</i>	141
4.7 Conclusion	150
Chapter Five	
Cattle in Samoan Culture: <i>Fa'avelave</i>	154
5.1 Introduction	154
5.2 A Case Study of a Funeral	155
5.3 A Survey of <i>Fa'avelave</i>	180
5.4 Farmers' Thinking About Cattle in <i>Fa'avelave</i>	195
5.4.1 The Importance, Usefulness and Meaning of Contributing Cattle to <i>Fa'avelave</i>	196
5.4.2 The Social Context of Contributing Cattle to <i>Fa'avelave</i> : Obligation, Motivation, Ambivalence and Change	198
5.4.3 Cattle and Pigs in <i>Fa'avelave</i>	205
5.5 Conclusion	207

Chapter Six	
Cattle in the Samoan Village, and Social, Livelihood and Farming Systems: Farmers' Experience with Cattle	211
6.1 Introduction	211
6.2 The Distribution of Cattle in the Villages of Samoa	212
6.3 The Social Impact of Cattle	221
6.4 Cattle, Land Tenure and Social Change	231
6.5 Cattle in the Samoan Farming System	242
6.6 Technical Issues and Farmer Innovation	250
6.7 Conclusion	260
Chapter Seven	
The Success of Cattle Projects and Cattle Farmers in Samoa: A Historical Perspective	262
7.1 Introduction	262
7.2 The History of Cattle and Cattle Projects in Samoa	264
7.2.1 The Pioneer Phase	266
7.2.2 The Rapid Expansion Phase	266
7.2.3 Disillusionment	273
7.3 The Turnaround	283
7.3.1 The National Herd	283
7.3.2 Success in the Smallholder Sector	285
7.3.3 Success Found in This Research	288
7.3.4 Other Measures of Success	293
7.3.5 Explaining the Turnaround	294
7.4 Analysing the Assumptions: Are They Really Myths?	295
7.5 Conclusion	305
Chapter Eight	
Conclusion	308
8.1 Locating this Research in Cattle Projects in Samoa and the Pacific	308
8.2 The Findings of this Study	311
8.3 Accounting for These Observations in Theory	315
8.4 From Theory to Experience: What Really Happened	319
8.5 A New Theory?	320
8.6 Populism	322
8.7 Locating This Research in Development Projects	326

Appendices	330
Contents of Appendices	330
References and Bibliography	412

List of Tables

Table 1.1	Key Questions Raised in this Thesis and the Chapters that Address Them	5
Table 1.2	Stages in the Survey of Smallholder Cattle Farmers	16
Table 5.1	Proportion of Respondents Who Contributed Cattle to <i>Fa'alavelave</i>	181
Table 5.2	Frequency of Contribution of Cattle to <i>Fa'alavelave</i>	181
Table 5.3	Numbers of Cattle Contributed to <i>Fa'alavelave</i> I	183
Table 5.4	Numbers of Cattle Contributed to <i>Fa'alavelave</i> II	183
Table 5.5	Different Types of <i>Fa'alavelave</i> to which Cattle were Contributed	185
Table 5.6	Type of <i>Fa'alavelave</i> from which Beef Most Recently Received (1994)	186
Table 5.7	Numbers of Cattle Contributed to Immediate Family Funerals and Other <i>Fa'alavelave</i> (1987)	188
Table 5.8	Numbers of Cattle Contributed to Immediate Family Funerals and Other <i>Fa'alavelave</i> (1994)	188
Table 5.9	Summary of Contributions of Cattle to <i>Fa'alavelave</i>	189
Table 5.10	Percentage of Herd Slaughtered per <i>Fa'alavelave</i>	191
Table 5.11	The Contribution of Female Breeding Stock to <i>Fa'alavelave</i>	192
Table 5.12	Planning of Contributions of Cattle to <i>Fa'alavelave</i>	194
Table 6.1	Percentage of Households Keeping Cattle in Samoa	213
Table 6.2	Distribution of Herd Sizes in Samoa	214
Table 6.3	The Impact of Major Life Events on Herds 1987-1994	225
Table 7.1	Estimates of Numbers of Cattle in Samoa (The National Herd)	274
Table 7.2	Progress with Project Cattle: Surveys by Parker in 1979 and Maiava in 1987	275
Table 7.3	Indicators of Agricultural Production, 1988-93	284
Table 7.4	Numbers and Percentages of Cattle in the Smallholder and Non-smallholder Sectors	287
Table 7.5	Farmer Progress in 1987 and 1994 I	289
Table 7.6	Farmer Progress in 1987 and 1994 II	290
Table 7.7	Respondents' Valuation of Bulls	296
Table 7.8	The Fate of Project Cattle	300
Table 7.9	Numbers of Cattle (Female and Other) in the Household and Non-household Sectors	303
Table 7.10	Numbers of Cattle in the Household Sector	304

List of Figures

Figure 2.1 The Ideal Project Cycle	69
Figure 2.2 A Decision Paradigm and the Project Cycle	72
Figure 2.3 Interpretations of Participation in the Project Cycle	78
Figure 5.1 Relationships Among Contributors of Fine Mats and Money to the Maiava Family Contribution to the Funeral of Matai'a Tavale I	156
Figure 5.2 Relationships Among Contributors (and Some Receivers) of Cattle by the Matai'a Family to the Funeral of Matai'a Tavale I	161
Figure 6.1 Herd Size Related to Number of Years Cattle Farming for Twenty-two Households in Sato'alepai	218
Figure 7.1 The Movement of Cattle Through Cattle Projects	267
Figure 7.2 Numbers of Cattle in Samoa (The National Herd)	285
Figure 7.3 Percentages of Cattle in the Smallholder and Non-smallholder Sectors over Time	287
Figure 7.4 Representations of the Histories of Three Herds	292

List of Plates

Plate 1.	Off to interview another respondent.	18
Plate 2.	A respondent at home.	18
Plate 3.	Members of a Samoan immediate family.	132
Plate 4.	Two newly conferred <i>matai</i> .	132
Plate 5.	A meeting of the village <i>matai</i> council (<i>fono</i>).	133
Plate 6.	Voting for the first time in 1990.	133
Plate 7.	Weaving fine mats in the Women's Committee <i>fale</i> .	134
Plate 8.	Consumers goods are desired.	134
Plates 9/10.	<i>Fa'alavelave</i> involve formal exchanges.	135
Plate 11.	Taua and her household.	164
Plate 12.	Host family preparations: cartons of tinned fish are stacked up.	164
Plate 13.	The host family records all in-family contributions and preparations for the exchange.	165
Plate 14.	Visitor family preparations.	165
Plate 15.	This barren cow has been selected for slaughter.	166
Plate 16.	A cattle owner prepares to shoot one of his cattle.	166
Plate 17.	Slaughtering and butchering is the job of the untitled men (<i>taulele'a</i>).	167
Plate 18.	Patience is required to shoot the chosen cattle beast in the forehead.	167
Plate 19.	The four limbs are held apart and the skin removed.	168
Plate 20.	The internal cavity is cut open. Useful organs are put into plastic bucket.	168
Plate 21.	The fore limbs are removed.	169
Plate 22.	The hind limbs are removed.	169
Plate 23.	A bed of leaves keeps the meat off the ground. Poles are used to carry the legs of beef.	170
Plate 24.	The ribs are carried away. The gut is discarded.	170
Plate 25.	Transport to the village is on the back of a pick-up.	171
Plate 26.	The beef is piled up ready for the exchange.	171
Plate 27.	Beef is diced for making chop suey.	172
Plate 28.	The big pot on the left is chop suey.	172
Plate 29.	Polystyrene containers have replaced containers woven from coconut fronds.	173
Plate 30.	Everything is ready.	173
Plate 31.	Mourners keep vigil with the coffin.	174

Plate 32.	The visitors present fine mats (<i>'ie toga</i>) and money to the hosts.	174
Plate 33.	In return, the visitors are given fine mats.	175
Plate 34.	On the far side portions of beef are being given.	175
Plate 35.	The woman in the centre is carrying money to the visitor group.	176
Plate 36.	The <i>matai</i> of the village council present <i>'ava</i> roots outside the <i>fale</i> where the caskets rests.	176
Plate 37.	The funeral service.	177
Plate 38.	The casket is carried to the grave.	177
Plate 39.	A quality fine mat is so fine that light passes through it.	178
Plate 40.	The treasurer records the details of each exchange.	178
Plates 41/42.	Returning home with bundles of fine mats.	179
Plate 43.	A cattle farmer (survey respondent).	234
Plate 44.	A cattle farmer beside his parents' graves.	234
Plate 45.	The owner of this abandoned dairy equipment had emigrated to New Zealand.	235
Plate 46.	Farmers sometimes stay in <i>fales</i> deep in the plantations to prevent stealing.	235
Plate 47.	Cyclone damage to a banana crop.	236
Plate 48.	Cattle and pigs are farmed differently	236
Plate 49.	Cattle grazed under coconuts.	237
Plate 50.	Fallen coconuts are easier to find and collect if cattle are grazed beneath the coconut trees.	237
Plate 51.	Cattle grazed on land cleared from the bush.	238
Plate 52.	A pure-bred Brahman bull.	238
Plate 53.	Brafords (Brahman-Hereford cross).	239
Plate 54.	A Droughtmaster bull.	239
Plates 55/56.	Weeds and ideal pasture growing side by side.	240
Plate 57.	Stockyards have seemingly sprung up everywhere.	241
Plate 58.	Farmer initiative: rearing a calf rejected by its mother.	241
Plate 59.	Recently imported cattle in quarantine.	281
Plate 60.	Transport is sometimes difficult for livestock extension officers.	281
Plate 61.	A pasture species demonstration plot.	282
Plate 62.	A pasture improvement workshop.	282

Acronyms and Abbreviations

ADB	Asian Development Bank
AIDAB	Australian International Development Assistance Bureau
DAFF	(WS) Department of Agriculture, Forests and Fisheries
EAPU	(DAFF) Economic Analysis and Planning Unit
FAO	(UN) Food and Agriculture Organisation
GOWS	Government of Western Samoa
GRM	GRM International Pty Ltd
IFAD	(UNDP) International Food and Agricultural Development
MFAT	(NZ) Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade
MIRAB	Migration, Remittances, Aid and Bureaucracy
NZODA	New Zealand Overseas Development Assistance
UNCDF	United Nations Capital Development Fund
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USP	University of the South Pacific
WESTEC	Western Samoa Trust Estates Corporation

Glossary of Samoan Words and Phrases

<i>aiga</i>	family
<i>aiga potopoto</i>	extended family
<i>alofa</i>	love
<i>fa'afafine</i>	a man with feminine characteristics
<i>fa'aipoipoga</i>	wedding
<i>fa'alavelave</i>	1. problem or difficulty 2. traditional ceremonial exchange occasion
<i>fa'anofonofo</i>	conferment of a <i>matai</i> title to a woman
<i>fa'aSamoa</i>	'the Samoan way' (Samoan culture)
<i>fa'aulufalega</i>	church dedication
<i>fale</i>	house or building
<i>faletua</i>	wife of a <i>matai</i> (<i>ali'i</i>)
<i>fesoasoani i le aiga</i>	helping (supporting) the family (both culturally and materially)
<i>fiafia</i>	happy, pleased
<i>fia palagi</i>	wanting to be like a European (and not like a Samoan by implication, meant as a criticism)
<i>fiatagata</i>	being snobby, showing off
<i>fono</i>	village 'council'; meeting of council of <i>matai</i>
<i>fua'ifale</i>	household
<i>'ie toga</i>	fine mats
<i>lafumanu papalagi</i>	cattle herd/ cattle farming (formal usage)
<i>malae</i>	grassed area in centre front of a village
<i>maliu</i>	funeral
<i>manu papalagi</i>	cattle (formal usage), plural
<i>manu palagi</i>	cattle (formal usage), singular
<i>matai</i>	chief/chiefs, either <i>ali'i</i> or <i>failauga</i> (orator)
<i>musu</i>	sulking and unco-operative
<i>nu'u</i>	village
<i>palagi</i>	a non-Samoan, usually a European person
<i>povi</i>	cattle (casual usage), singular or plural
<i>pule</i>	authority
<i>pulenu'u</i>	village 'mayor'; official village representative to government, elected by the village <i>fono</i>
<i>pasese</i>	bus fare

<i>saofa'i</i>	conferment of a <i>matai</i> title (for men)
<i>sua</i>	traditional welcome
<i>su'e tupe</i>	searching for money
<i>supo</i>	vegetables, noodles and meat in a thin soup
<i>tala</i>	Samoan currency, in 1994 \$NZ1 bought about \$1.6 tala
<i>taule'ale'a</i>	untitled man
<i>taulele'a</i>	untitled men
<i>tautua</i>	traditional service of the old by the young
<i>to'ona'i</i>	Sunday mid-day meal
<i>tupe</i>	money
<i>ua lava</i>	enough (to satisfy)