SHIFTING GROUND: THE POSITION OF WOMEN PARENTING ALONE IN AUCKLAND AND THEIR ACCESS TO HOUSING IN A RESTRUCTURED ENVIRONMENT

SHARON MILNE

Abstract

This thesis describes and analyses the housing issues identified and experienced by a group of women parenting alone. It is a qualitative study consisting of a series of interviews carried out over 18 months in order to construct the housing journeys of the women and analyse each woman’s experience of housing. The main issues addressed by the thesis are an exploration of the meaning of home, the opportunities and barriers to accessing housing and the failure of housing policies, and the processes involved in developing and implementing those policies, to meet the needs of this group of women. The key research question has two parts. Firstly, it asks how the restructuring of housing after 1990 has impacted on women parenting alone and subsequently explores the housing market from their perspective. Secondly it reflects on policy processes and how they meet the needs of women as single parents.

It is argued that the market approach to housing, with its highly targeted assistance, has done little to improve equity in housing for these women. This direction has in fact increased the gap, trapping a growing number of women in the rental market. The contrast between home ownership and renting, including Housing New Zealand rentals, is emphasised. A significant level of hidden homelessness is identified and the research indicates that the higher level of mobility experienced by women in rental homes is a result of those women’s efforts to avoid homelessness. Women’s lower levels of income, fewer numbers owning their own home in a housing arena dominated by ownership, limited access to housing finance and their exclusion from the development of policies which directly affect them, is seriously undermining the extent to which the housing issues they identify can be resolved. This thesis supports the notion that the basis on which current housing policy is developed, as well as the policy process, is significantly hindering access to adequate housing for women parenting alone.

A model of housing policy development and implementation drawing on a feminist postmodernist perspective and feminist community development processes is proposed which accounts for issues of power and diversity and includes the marginalised experiences of those usually excluded from the policy process. The
thesis argues for housing policy which expands the choices and opportunities for women and which also enables them to participate more fully as citizens in economic, social and political life so they are better able to determine the direction of their lives and to access the housing of their choice. These processes and theoretical understandings are critical to both the long term well-being and productivity of these women and to addressing the gaps between government’s perspective, the uncertain housing policy environment and women’s experience of accessing housing.
Acknowledgments

A project of this size is never completed on its own and this thesis is no exception. I owe a huge debt of gratitude to all who supported me in many ways both large and small.

Firstly, and most importantly, my special thanks to the women who generously gave their valuable time and ideas to this project. You were all an inspiration to me. Your ongoing support for the research was a humbling experience and the learnings were mine. Go well and may all your many aspirations come to fruition.

A special thanks to Mike O’Brien, my primary supervisor, as a rich source of social policy information, for his generous spirit and thoughtful contributions. Robyn Munford, as my secondary supervisor for her spontaneous responses via email and timely critical input always given within a framework of encouragement and support. As a team they were great for their unflagging confidence in my ability, their prompt responses when required which were provided in a context of warm friendship. My thanks to Jocelyn Quinnell for giving valuable feedback on my first draft, Patricia and the Library staff for their special assistance and Massey University, Albany for the award of a scholarship without which I would not have been able to complete the thesis.

To my family both immediate and extended, my special thanks. To my partner Nick and children Zach, Shanti and Kirstin for their patience and loving support given under duress at times, especially Zach who provided invaluable technical support during the many computer crises I experienced, my father Peter who kept a sharp eye on the media and the project, and my mother Doll for being there always, Lisa and the late Rob Bagnall for their many kindnesses and for the Random House Dictionary.

To the West Auckland Women’s Centre Collective for their constant support, laughs, flexibility and kind enquiries as to how it was going. In particular, my thanks to Verle Cahill for providing valuable, critical insights as part of our ongoing discussions concerning social policy and community development.
processes. Janet Lake and Heather King for their willing support, ongoing interest and input and whose extensive knowledge of housing issues from a community perspective was essential to the research.

My friends - Glenda for her generosity in reading the final draft, Jane for listening and being there, Rukmini for sowing the seed, Carol for giving generously of her time to watch the edges of academia and my processes, Love for his attention to detail and sharing of information, Ksenija for being an attentive listener and room mate and Sally my support person for her commitment to our original idea and subsequent friendship. Jackie Leavitt for her warm encouragement, stimulating discussions and for paving the way. All my friends both academic and personal, always interested and concerned for my well-being and as sources of stimulating ideas and light relief during the inevitable down times.

To you all, love and thanks
Sharon
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract  
Acknowledgments  
Table of Contents  
List of Tables  
List of graphs  
List of figures  
List of photographs  
Table of Abbreviations  
Map  

**CHAPTER ONE: Spinning the thread: introduction**

Introduction  1  
The scope of the thesis  5  
The structure of the thesis  7  

**CHAPTER TWO Setting the framework: feminist theoretical perspectives, methodologies and methods**

Introduction  11  
What is feminist research?  12  
   Positivism: a feminist critique  14  
   Feminist methodological perspectives  15  
   Feminist research  18  
   The research process  20  
Beginnings: developing a framework  23  
   Participants and data sources  24  
   Interview schedule  27  
   The interview process  28  
   Analysis  29  
Ethical perspectives  30  
Reflections on the research process  35
Conclusion

CHAPTER THREE  Women parenting alone: a profile

Introduction 39
Introducing the women 40
Summary 62
The status of women parenting alone 63
Separation and access to housing 66
Matrimonial property and assets 67
The clean break principle 70
Leaving costs and women's post-separation status 72
Housing and caring responsibilities after separation 74
Assets and debts 75
Conclusion 78

CHAPTER FOUR  "The warp and the weft": the meaning of home

Introduction 81
Meanings and experience 82
Conceiving the whole 90
Abode 91
Hearth 98
Privacy 101
Identity 105
Location: a sense of place and belonging 109
Key issues concerning location as identified by the women 113
Homelessness: degrees of homelessness and the importance of enlarging the definition 120
Conclusion 130
## CHAPTER FIVE Between a rock and a hard place: housing provision for women in Aotearoa/New Zealand

**Introduction**

Setting the scene: the flavour of the neo-liberal perspective and its ideological impetus

The national response

What has been lost?

Maori access to housing

Serious housing need

Some local body responses

Conclusion

---

## CHAPTER SIX Living on shaky ground: accessing rental housing in Auckland

**Introduction**

Well, hey it’s ‘fair’ now isn’t it?

Housing journeys

“Dead money”: private rentals

Private rentals and investment

Landlords

Housing New Zealand homes and market rents

Market rents

The sale of state houses, the homebuy scheme and the acquisition of stock

Acquisition of Housing New Zealand stock

Conclusion

---

## CHAPTER SEVEN Ownership: the ideal and the reality

**Introduction**

The ideal and the expectations

Auckland: a special case?
Women and housing statistics 214
Women parenting alone and home ownership in Auckland 217
Problems with access to owner-occupancy 218
  Robyn's story 219
The deposit: “a foot in the door” 221
  Sue's story 223
Low cost housing 224
The gatekeepers: the home lending sector 226
Housing Corporation loans 231
Home ownership in a de-regulated financial market 235
Conclusion 237

CHAPTER EIGHT  Balancing acts: indebtedness, paid and unpaid work

Introduction 239
Making ends meet and indebtedness 242
  Boarders/Flatmates 243
  Credit 245
  Bankcards 247
  Debt 248
  “Sexually transmitted debt” 251
  Income support 253
Women's unpaid work: setting the context 255
Paid work and employment 258
The neo-liberal agenda and social security 267
Income Support and paid work 269
Conclusion 281

CHAPTER NINE  Falling through the safety net: financial issues for women accessing housing

Introduction 283
Housing affordability in the nineties-Auckland 283
Housing New Zealand 286
Income and housing: bridging the gap 290
Entry costs 294
The Accommodation Supplement as a safety net? 296
The impact of the Accommodation Supplement on women parenting alone 305
Conclusion 308

CHAPTER TEN  If you just follow the pattern you will
knit a jersey - won’t you? - reflections on
social policy and policy processes
Introduction 310
Social Policy: what is it and who is it for? 311
Policy positions 313
The State: “them” and “us” 316
Contradictions and accountability for whom? 318
Corporatisation and privatisation: accountability for some but
not for others 322
The contribution of feminist postmodernism to understandings of the
state, social policy and communities 328
Feminist postmodernism and communities 331
How can social policy be constructed in a way which reflects both
unity and diversity and the social reality of people’s lives? 332
Community development processes as a basis for social policy
development: an ideal or a reality? 337
Community and the role of the state 339
Community development processes 340
Feminist process and community development 341
A model of community participation in policy processes 343
Conclusion 347

CHAPTER ELEVEN  Drawing the threads: conclusions

Introduction 349
Contradictions: ideology and realities 352
Integrated versus divisionary concepts of housing 354
The changing role of the state 357
Access to housing 359
Making ends meet and balancing acts 363
Policy development and policy processes 367
Conclusions: “a hand up rather than a hand down” 369

BIBLIOGRAPHY 374

APPENDICES

Appendix One  Flyer  403
Appendix Two  Participant information sheet  404
Appendix Three  Housing history questionnaire  405
Appendix Four  Interview schedule (1)  411
Appendix Five  Interview schedule (2)  415
Appendix Six  Interview schedules: key workers  416
Appendix Seven  List of themes used for second interview  418
## LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Sole parents on Domestic Purposes Benefit</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Estimates of serious housing need in New Zealand</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Housing New Zealand stock in the Greater Auckland Region by type of dwelling, January 1997</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Number of properties acquired by Housing New Zealand in the Auckland Region 1994-1996 by Neighbourhood Unit [both bought and built]</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Mean rentals for all houses for the Auckland region 1997</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Average private rental ($) in the Greater Auckland Region (GAR), Cities within that area and median HNZ rental for 1996</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Total revenue from sales of Housing New Zealand rental properties 1994-96</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Numbers of Housing New Zealand rental properties sold and acquired 1995-96</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Characteristics of lone parents, early 1990s</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Outgoings on owned housing $ June - September 1996</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Income percentages for Auckland region</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Comparing property prices: median price ($) by district of real estate for April and October 1997</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>Mortgages, house prices and house sales 1990-1996</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Employment circumstances of lone and married mothers, 1990s.</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Benefit Duration 30 June 1997</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Foodbank clients whose expenditure on accommodation is over 50% of family income, by type of housing provider 1995.</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Average rents for 3 bedroom HNZ houses 1 July 1991 and 1 July 1997</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>Median rentals in Auckland City by type of dwelling and source of data 1996.</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>Housing costs for women in this study</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>Accommodation Supplement Maxima from July 1997 by Region</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>Estimated costs for increasing the subsidy rate for the Accommodation Supplement</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>Total cost to government of the Accommodation Supplement 1991-1996</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.8</td>
<td>Total number of households receiving Accommodation Supplement</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**LIST OF GRAPHS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Ethnic differences in women’s housing tenure, 1991</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Women in owner-occupied housing, by marital status, 1991</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Proportion of tenants living in Housing Corporation properties, by age, 1991</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Housing tenure by household type, 1991</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>Regional affordability as a percentage of national average, June 1989-June 1997</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Income groups of population over 15 years by percentage and number</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Total ordinary time average weekly earnings, male and female, 1987-1997</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>Annual median income by age and sex, 1991</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>Real disposable income indices of highest and lowest quartiles</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 4.1 The author's memories of her childhood environment 81
Figure 4.2 A woman's memories of a hiding place which was a crucial retreat from painful family stress 88
Figure 4.3 Production of an urban homeless population 123
Figure 7.1 A woman's depiction of her feelings about home 203
Figure 8.1 Balancing 239
Figure 10.1 William’s Model 333
Figure 10.2 Balbo’s Crazy Quilt 335
Figure 10.3 Empowerment 345

LIST OF PHOTOGRAPHS

Photo 5.1 An area of Housing New Zealand houses in Auckland 133

Photo 6.1 Protesters objecting to the sale of Auckland City Council rental housing 179
## Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CAB</td>
<td>Citizen’s Advice Bureau</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEO</td>
<td>Chief Executive Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CYPFS</td>
<td>Children, Young Persons and their Families Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPB</td>
<td>Domestic Purposes Benefit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSW</td>
<td>Department of Social Welfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EEO</td>
<td>Equal Employment Opportunities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFTC</td>
<td>Independent Family Tax Credit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRD</td>
<td>Inland Revenue Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISS</td>
<td>Income Support Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMP</td>
<td>Mixed Member Proportional Representation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTI</td>
<td>Outgoing to income ratio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RI</td>
<td>Residual Income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIA</td>
<td>Training Incentive Allowance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MAP

Territorial Authorities of Auckland Region with area units: Waitakere City (West Auckland), North Shore, Auckland Central, Manukau City (South Auckland)

Source: Statistics New Zealand: 1997d