IS SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT A FACELESS RHETORIC?
AN ASSESSMENT OF EDUCATIONAL SUSTAINABILITY AT
THE PORGERA MINE,

PAPUA NEW GUINEA.

A THESIS PRESENTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT FOR THE
REQUIREMENT FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF PHILOSOPHY
(DEVELOPMENT STUDIES)

AT MASSEY UNIVERSITY, PALMERSTONE NORTH
NEW ZEALAND

BRUCE JAVA LOLUAVE

March 2011
Abstract.

Mining development has no doubt contributed immensely to the local and national economies throughout the world and has transformed many developing countries to be developed. In Melanesia especially Papua New Guinea, a number of large scale world class mines occur in remote, isolated locations where the local communities are often vulnerable, poor, illiterate and do not have access to basic government services (for many years). When mining operations arrive in their locality, local people see and recognize mining as the only development opportunity and hope for improved livelihoods.

However, the social and environmental impacts and disruptions of livelihoods from those large scale mines are often severe and can last a life time. Many local people do not realize these consequences in the first instance. In a bid to help maintain people’s livelihoods, the package of mine benefits for local communities typically includes sustainable development projects and programmes devised by companies. Most of these benefits are corporate gestures colorfully written up in company sponsored reports in contrast to the realities experienced in the communities. There is little literature written on the realties and impacts of mine benefits on the livelihoods of local people and their experiences from their perspectives. This research attempts to address these issues in the context of the education sector and explore experiences and perceptions of locals in view of post mining.

This study looks at the education sector within the Porgera gold mine in Enga Province in PNG. The focus is on landowner communities and stakeholders’ attitudes and commitments towards enhancing the education sector from a sustainable development perspective for the local people. Qualitative research methods were used for this study, mainly semi-structured interviews and obtaining information from the key stakeholders involved within the Porgera community education system. The findings from this study indicate that, although substantial benefits and resources appear to be available, the education sector has not been given adequate support in a systematic and coordinated manner which has led to the future of the education sector being uncertain and unsustainable in light of preparations towards mine closure.
Dedication

This thesis is dedicated to my two girls whom I owe much for being away from them for two long years; Meagan Chachu Java and Nakita Isako Java and to my wife Triphina. Importantly, I salute and dedicate this thesis to a man who always had the strength and faith in the wonders of education and believed that that one day I could pass through that journey and that he could bear witness, which he did. Dad you’re an inspiration all along and I want to say thank you. It was through your faith, perseverance and endless prayer that I obtained the benefits of education. This is for you Mr. Java Loluave. God Bless your heart and I remain thankful in a million ways.

Finally, to those from remote and isolated communities though rich in mineral wealth, yet struggling, education is surely the way forward. Education is really life and so much important as life itself. Education is redemption in all its forms. Embrace it and invest more and continue to invest more. It is not a wasted effort. It pays insurmountable dividends well into the future. It is my prayer that Multi-National Cooperation’s, all levels of governments and Land Owner Associations give landowners educational development a great more development priority, more than any other development programmes for communities around resource development areas especially in Papua New Guinea.
Acknowledgement

This study was made possible with the support of many people, both in New Zealand (NZ) and Papua New Guinea (PNG). Foremost, this reveals another testimony of the fulfillment of God’s own plan for my life and I wholly thank him for his blessings upon my life. In addition, firstly, the staff from the Institute of Development Studies (IDS): my supervisors, Associate Professor Glenn Banks for all your valuable comments and time using your vast knowledge and experience of the mining industry in PNG to assist me greatly and special thanks to Dr. Maria Borovnik for all your critical comments, feedback and support and Professor Regina Scheyvens for all the support over the two years at IDS, Massey. I thank my family for their support, especially my elder brother James Yaru. I wouldn’t have excelled without you. You have been very supportive all alone in my educational journey. I also acknowledge the support of my wife Triphina who has been so good and supportive. Your support has enabled me to complete my studies.

I extend my gratitude to the staff of Porgera Joint Venture Community Planning and Development Section (CPD) who assisted me greatly during my field research: Namely; Ken Egan, Kelly Taila, Timothy Andambo, Yamis Gigimat, Patewane and all other staff whom I have met. Importantly I thank all the research participants (all the key stakeholders (refer to table 4.2) who were directly involved in the research. Thank you for all your time and insights and perceptions about educational issues within Porgera. Thank you so much indeed. Importantly, I acknowledge the support of NZAID for providing me with a graduate development scholarship to come and study at Massey University. Thank you. I also thank IDS Graduate Research Fund for its support for the field research undertaken. My special thanks to Karin Bruckner and Liuvaie Sunlou for support given in editing and proof reading my drafts. Lastly, but not the least, I acknowledge the support given by the PNG Palmerstone North community, Raula Galewa in particular for the support and the IDS class of 2010: Joshua, Jacklyn, Xincha, Aaron, Ed and Kate Abel. It was a fantastic journey made possible by you all. Thank you all.

God Bless you all.

Bruce Java Loluave
# Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. i

Dedication ............................................................................................................................... ii

Acknowledgement .................................................................................................................... iii

LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES ....................................................................................... viii

List of Tables ............................................................................................................................. viii

List of Figures .......................................................................................................................... viii

ACRONYMS ............................................................................................................................. ix

Prologue ...................................................................................................................................... xi

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION AND RESEARCH OUTLINE ........................................... 1

1.1. Introduction and Overview ............................................................................................... 1

1.2. Context of the Study- Papua New Guinea ......................................................................... 2

1.3. Papua New Guineas Development Challenges ................................................................. 3

1.4. Addressing Development Challenges through Mining ............................................... 4

1.5. Research Focus/ Aim ......................................................................................................... 6

1.6. Key Research Questions ..................................................................................................... 7

1.6.1. Research Setting ........................................................................................................... 7

1.7. Significance of the Research ............................................................................................ 8

1.8. Limitations of the Research ............................................................................................ 9

1.9. Chapter Outlines: ............................................................................................................. 9

CHAPTER TWO: MINING AND DEVELOPMENT ................................................................. 12

2.1. Introduction: .................................................................................................................... 12

2.2. Mining and Development ............................................................................................... 12

2.3. Mining in Papua New Guinea ......................................................................................... 15

2.4. Mining Benefits and Community Development .......................................................... 18

2.5. The Porgera Gold Mine .................................................................................................. 21

2.5.1. Porgera Gold Mine: Why Porgera is Different ......................................................... 22
2.5.2. Mining Benefits Privileges or Predicaments? .............................................. 24
2.6. Sustainable Development (SD) In Mining Communities ........................... 28
2.7. Summary ........................................................................................................ 31

CHAPTER THREE: EDUCATIONAL DEVELOPMENT ........................................... 32
3.1. Overview of the Chapter ............................................................................... 32
3.2. Education and Development ........................................................................ 33
3.3. The Significance of Education ...................................................................... 36
3.4. Factors That Contribute to Educational Development ............................... 38
  3.4.1. Factor One - Educational Input ............................................................... 39
  3.4.2. Factor Two - Participation in Education ................................................. 41
  3.4.3. Factor Three - Educational Outcomes ................................................. 43
3.5. The Premise of Education as Sustainable Livelihood .................................. 45
3.6. Educational Development in Papua New Guinea ....................................... 47
3.7. Educational Development in Porgera: Issues and Progress ....................... 52
3.8. Summary ........................................................................................................ 55

CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY .................... 57
4.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................... 57
4.2. Research Approach and Framework ............................................................ 57
4.3. Sustainable Livelihood Approach to Education ......................................... 58
4.4. Research Site and Participants Selection ..................................................... 62
  4.4.1. Research Participants .............................................................................. 63
  4.4.2. Justification For Choosing Research Participants .................................. 65
  4.4.3. Conducting The Field Work ................................................................. 65
4.5. Data Collection Methods: Qualitative Research ......................................... 66
  4.5.1. Semi-Structured Interviews ................................................................. 67
  4.5.2. Participant Observation .................................................................... 68
4.6. Data Analysis Procedures ............................................................................ 69
6.4. Educational Inputs ................................................................. 113
   6.4.1. Institutional Support Systems ........................................ 114
   6.4.2. Plans and Policies ......................................................... 118
   6.4.3. Infrastructure And Facilities ........................................ 120
   6.4.4. Subsidies and Trust Funds ........................................... 122

6.5. Participation and Partnership ............................................. 124
   6.5.1. Attitudes and Commitments ......................................... 127
   6.5.2. Leadership and Direction ............................................. 128
   6.5.3. Ownership And Responsibilities .................................. 130
   6.5.4. Working Relationship and Networking ............................ 133

6.6. Educational Outputs .......................................................... 134
   6.6.1. Past and Current Educational Conditions ....................... 135
   6.6.2. Future Educational Projections ..................................... 136

6.7. Conclusion ........................................................................... 137

CHAPTER SEVEN: Conclusions ................................................... 139
   7.1. Introduction ....................................................................... 139
   7.2. Concluding Summary of the Research Findings .................. 139
   7.3. Options for Further Research .......................................... 144
   7.4. Recommendations and Call for Action ............................... 144
   7.5. Outlook ............................................................................ 145

References .................................................................................. 148

Appendices .................................................................................. 162
   Appendix A ............................................................................. 162
   Appendix B ............................................................................. 163
   Appendix C ............................................................................. 164
   Appendix D ............................................................................. 166
   Appendix E ............................................................................. 167
# LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

## List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 4-1 The Demographic Composition of the Research Participants</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4-1</td>
<td>The livelihood framework developed and used by DFID</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4-2</td>
<td>A Map of Porgera Gold Mine <em>(Refer to detailed map appendix D)</em></td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6-1</td>
<td>Source: (Barrick, n.d.)</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AusAID</td>
<td>Australian Agency for International Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADB</td>
<td>Asian Development Bank</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CODE</td>
<td>College of Distance Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSR</td>
<td>Corporate Social Responsibility</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DODL</td>
<td>Department of Open and Distance Learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>Department for International Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIA</td>
<td>Educational Institutional Administrators</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFA</td>
<td>Education for All</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPG</td>
<td>Enga Provincial Government</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDS</td>
<td>Institute of Development Studies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IHD</td>
<td>Integral Human Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JICA</td>
<td>Japanese International Cooperation Agency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LLG</td>
<td>Local Level Government Council</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LNG</td>
<td>Liquefied Natural Gas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDG</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MNMC</td>
<td>Multi National Mining Corporations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTDS</td>
<td>Medium Term Development Strategy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEP</td>
<td>National Education Plan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDOE</td>
<td>National Department of Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZ</td>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZAID-</td>
<td>New Zealand Agency for International Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDA</td>
<td>Porgera Development Authority</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNG</td>
<td>Papua New Guinea</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PJV</td>
<td>Porgera Joint Venture</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PG</td>
<td>Provincial Government</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institution/Organization</td>
<td>Code</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Institutional Administrators (Includes headmasters, coordinators, principals, managers of key educational institutions within Porgera).</td>
<td>EIA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Mine Stakeholders includes management and key staff from Porgera Joint Venture, Porgera Development Authority, PLA, PDWA, Porgera District Education, Porgera Local Level Government Council, Provincial and National Government.</td>
<td>MKS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Porgera Landowner Youths, Landowner Parents, Landowner Elites</td>
<td>LOY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catholic Church and the Seventh-day Adventist Church clergies</td>
<td>CL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**NB:** *Numbers attached to codes infer more than one institution or individuals. For instance, EIA1, refers to school one, school two has EIA2 and so forth.*
Prologue

I have seen mines around the world. I have seen the effects they have on the lives of people who live in the vicinity of the mine. I have seen the lives of those people after the gold, silver, copper, oil and gas is gone.

A couple of years ago I travelled across the United States by train and by car. That was a long journey. Over 3000 miles and even on good roads that were long and endless. I saw a lot of things on that trip. I met a lot of people. I went to a lot of places, but the one place that impressed me more than any other was a small town in Nevada called Virginia City.

You know back in the 1800s, Virginia City was right at the heart of one of the world’s largest silver mines in the world. At that time Virginia City was really a bursting city. It had at one time in the late 1800s, it had the highest per capita income of any City in the United States, which means it has the highest per capita income of any city in the world. Imagine that!

Virginia City was the richest place in the world. But what is it today? Today it is what Americans called “ghost” town. It is a town full of ghosts of people who were once rich but who died poor and destitute. Today almost no one lives in Virginia City; they just go there to open the shops for the tourists who want to see what a real Wild West boom town looks like. But Virginia City is dead. All millions, the billions of dollars that went through that town made no difference in the long-run.

Source: (Sir Julius Chan (November 2009): Article retrieved from the Sunday Chronicle, Port Moresby).