From the Experiences of Women Mathematicians: A Feminist Epistemology for Mathematics

A THESIS PRESENTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY IN MATHEMATICS AND WOMEN'S STUDIES AT MASSEY UNIVERSITY

Mary Carroll Day 1997
Abstract

In this thesis a feminist epistemology for mathematics is developed. The rhetorical space in which this can be achieved and questions about the gendered nature of mathematics, its practices and epistemology can be asked, is created by considering feminist epistemology, the gender, mathematics and education research literature, the feminist science debates, the philosophy and sociology of mathematics and the experiences of women mathematicians.

Eight women research mathematicians were interviewed about their experiences in mathematics communities, the knowing styles they used in their work and the legitimating practices of acknowledgement and validation prevalent in these communities.

This feminist epistemology for mathematics addresses the questions of who knows, how we know and what we know. It includes a commitment to the inclusion of women as knowers, the asking of questions arising from women’s experiences and the exposure of the feminine in mathematics and mathematical practices. It depends on a transformation of the binaries which have informed the definition of the subject of knowledge, the epistemological values of mathematics and the knowing practices of mathematics. The traditional Cartesian subject of knowledge is replaced by a subject who acts within a community of knowers and who is both rational and emotional, subjective and objective and who uses reason and intuition. Defining knowing in mathematics includes accounts of the social and of the defining values and commitments of mathematics. Reflexive processes that account for intuition, creativity, incompleteness, and the social relations and processes in the mathematical community are included, as are the traditional mathematical values of logic, rigour, objectivity and abstraction. These traditional values are identified as having been defined within a social context. Mathematical objects are formed as part of a framework, a language, a conceptualisation of the abstractions made from the regularities of reality and which are in turn imposed upon that reality. They are formed out of the interaction of nature and culture and the changes each imposes upon the other. One is neither privileged over nor prior to the other.
Acknowledgements

Many people have helped and encouraged me in the writing of this thesis. In particular I would like to thank:

My husband, Dr Peter King, who has cooked, cleaned and taken care of the children, provided advice about sociological theory and endless emotional support throughout the ups and downs of this project.

My children, Elizabeth and Jonathan, who have been flexible and accommodating.

My chief supervisor, Dr Gillian Thornley, who always smiles at me when I enter her office. Her unconditional support has sustained me throughout.

Dr Mandy Morgan has also provided essential supervision and feedback. Her questions and comments always go straight to the heart of the matter.

The women mathematicians who participated in my research and so generously shared parts of their lives and experiences with me.

The other post graduate students in the department for their friendship. I am particularly grateful to Mark Johnston for his company through many an evening and weekend, his kindness in helping with the computers and his ability to explain the intricacies of five day cricket tests.

Nicola Armstrong who got me started and Dr Glenda Anthony for her friendship and support.

Prof Graeme Wake for welcoming me into the department and all the mathematicians who allowed me to interrogate them about their work at many tea breaks.
The Federation of University Women, Manawatu Branch, who by giving me the Julia Wallace Research Award made this project financially possible.

And also Dr Judith Clare and Dr Lynne Alice for their assistance with supervision.
# Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS iii  
TABLE OF CONTENTS v  
LIST OF TABLES xi  

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 1  
GENDER AND MATHEMATICS IN EDUCATION ..................................... 2  
GENDER, THE MASCUINE AND FEMININE ............................................. 4  
RHETORICAL SPACES ........................................................................... 6  
FEMINIST SCIENCE DEBATES .............................................................. 7  
MATHEMATICS: PHILOSOPHY AND SOCIOLOGY ................................... 9  
THE EXPERIENCES OF WOMEN MATHEMATICIANS .............................. 11  
METHODOLOGY .................................................................................. 12  
FEMINIST EPISTEMOLOGIES ............................................................... 12  
A FEMINIST EPISTEMOLOGY FOR MATHEMATICS ............................... 16  

CHAPTER 2 FEMINIST EPISTEMOLOGY .............................................. 18  
INTRODUCTION .................................................................................. 18  
HISTORY ............................................................................................. 18  
DEFINITIONS OF EPISTEMOLOGY ....................................................... 19  
FEMINIST CHALLENGES TO THE DEFINITION OF EPISTEMOLOGY .......... 22  
QUESTIONS FOR A FEMINIST EPISTEMOLOGY ................................... 25  
CRITIQUES OF MAINSTREAM EPISTEMOLOGY ................................... 26  
Reason and emotion ............................................................................. 28  
Subjectivity, objectivity and the knowing subject .................................... 33  
Challenges to the notion of the rational subject ....................................... 35  
A FEMINIST SUBJECT OF KNOWLEDGE .......................................... 36  
FEMINIST EPISTEMOLOGIES ............................................................... 40  
Is a feminist epistemology possible? ....................................................... 43  
PROPOSAL FOR A FEMINIST EPISTEMOLOGY .................................... 45  
CONCLUSIONS .................................................................................... 51
CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY .........................................................................................52
INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................52
FEMINIST METHODOLOGIES ..............................................................................53
CHOICE OF METHOD ...............................................................................................60
  Negotiation and reciprocity ..............................................................................61
  Objectivity .........................................................................................................66
  Interpreting the data ..........................................................................................68
  Validity and women’s experience ......................................................................70
APPLICATION OF METHODOLOGY IN THIS PROJECT ...........................................72
  The women I spoke with ....................................................................................73
  Ethical issues .......................................................................................................75
  Approaching the women .....................................................................................76
  The interview questions ......................................................................................77
  One interview ......................................................................................................80
  Data analysis .......................................................................................................81
  Evaluation of the process ....................................................................................83
  Working in a mathematics department ..............................................................83
CONCLUSIONS ........................................................................................................84

CHAPTER 4 GENDER, MATHEMATICS AND EDUCATION .........................................85
INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................85
WHY ASK QUESTIONS ABOUT GENDERED ACHIEVEMENTS AND PARTICIPATION IN
MATHEMATICS? .......................................................................................................86
  Mathematics as a critical filter ...........................................................................87
  Historical perspectives .........................................................................................92
  The development of Elizabeth Fennema’s research ...........................................95
  Curriculum changes ............................................................................................98
SHOULD WE STUDY SEX DIFFERENCES? ..............................................................102
THE RESEARCH LITERATURE ..................................................................................109
  Who do better - boys or girls? ..........................................................................110
  Girls’ attitudes and behaviours .........................................................................112
  Teacher attitudes and behaviours .....................................................................113
  Socialisation processes .......................................................................................113
  School variables ................................................................................................113
  Peer group ..........................................................................................................114
CHAPTER 5 THE FEMINIST SCIENCE DEBATES ................................................................. 125
INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................... 125
Choice of theorists ........................................................................................................ 126
Science and mathematics .............................................................................................. 127
Outline of the chapter .................................................................................................... 128
My vision for this argument .......................................................................................... 129
HOW GENDER ENTERS SCIENCE AND MATHEMATICS ........................................ 131
Individual gender identities .......................................................................................... 131
The gendered division of labour within mathematics ................................................ 134
The symbolic work of gender ....................................................................................... 136
Stories of what mathematics is .................................................................................... 137
Language and metaphor ............................................................................................... 139
SCIENCE, MATHEMATICS AND NATURE ................................................................. 142
OBJECTIVITY ................................................................................................................ 144
Objectivity as a social concept ..................................................................................... 147
Do we need 'objectivity'? ............................................................................................. 151
Objectivity reconfigured ............................................................................................... 152
RELEVANCE TO MATHEMATICS ................................................................................. 157
CONCLUSIONS ............................................................................................................... 158

CHAPTER 6 MATHEMATICS ....................................................................................... 160
INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................ 160
TRADITIONAL PHILOSOPHY ......................................................................................... 162
THE NATURE OF MATHEMATICAL OBJECTS ............................................................ 164
PHILOSOPHY TAKES ACCOUNT OF THE SOCIAL ....................................................... 169
SOCIOLOGY OF MATHEMATICS ............................................................................... 172
PURITY ............................................................................................................................ 175
MATHEMATICS AND MASCU LINITY ........................................................................ 178
VALUES .......................................................................................................................... 179
PRACTICES ...................................................................................................................... 189
CHAPTER 7 THE EXPERIENCES OF WOMEN MATHEMATICIANS
PART ONE: WHO CAN BE A KNOWER? ................................................................. 203
INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................ 203
WHO CAN BE A KNOWER IN MATHEMATICS? ..................................................... 205
Transition from school to university ................................................................. 205
Transition to doctoral study .............................................................................. 207
Difficulties as PhD students .............................................................................. 209
Career issues ...................................................................................................... 216
Family constraints .............................................................................................. 224
Working with other women .............................................................................. 226
Participation in other women's groups ............................................................ 227
Woman, mathematician, is there a contradiction? ............................................ 230
Attraction to mathematics .............................................................................. 233
WHO CAN BE A KNOWER? CONCLUSIONS ........................................................ 239

CHAPTER 8 THE EXPERIENCES OF WOMEN MATHEMATICIANS
PART TWO: WHAT PROCESSES DETERMINE AND LEGITIMATE THE
ACT OF KNOWING IN MATHEMATICS? ................................................................. 241
INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................ 241
SEPARATE AND CONNECTED KNOWING .............................................................. 242
WORK PRACTICES .................................................................................................. 251
LEGGITIMATING PRACTICES ................................................................................... 260
Culture ......................................................................................................................... 260
Seminars ................................................................................................................... 263
Publications ............................................................................................................... 267
Networking .............................................................................................................. 271
Gendered division of labour .............................................................................. 275
Funding .................................................................................................................... 278
CONCLUSIONS ................................................................................................................................. 280

CHAPTER 9 A FEMINIST EPISTEMOLOGY FOR MATHEMATICS ........................................... 282
INTRODUCTION .......................................................................................................................... 282
  Feminist epistemology ................................................................................................................. 283
  The gender mathematics and education debates ......................................................................... 284
  The feminist science debates ........................................................................................................ 284
  The philosophy and sociology of mathematics ............................................................................. 285
  The experiences of women mathematicians ................................................................................ 286
  Rhetorical space ............................................................................................................................ 286
A FEMINIST EPISTEMOLOGY ......................................................................................................... 287
BURTON’S EPISTEMOLOGY ............................................................................................................ 289
WHO CAN BE A KNOWER?............................................................................................................. 290
  Conclusions: In this feminist epistemology who can be a knower? ............................................ 295
WHAT ARE THE PROCESSES THAT DETERMINE AND LEGITIMATE THE PRACTICE AND ACT OF
KNOWING? .................................................................................................................................... 297
  How is mathematical knowledge established in a feminist epistemology?............................... 300
  Topic selection ............................................................................................................................... 301
  Work practices .............................................................................................................................. 304
  Community acceptance of knowledge claims ............................................................................. 305
WHAT CAN BE ‘KNOWN’, THAT IS TO SAY, WHAT FACTORS AFFECT THE ESTABLISHMENT OF
ADEQUATE OBJECTS OF KNOWLEDGE? WHAT KINDS OF THINGS CAN BE KNOWN? .............. 307
FEMINIST PERSPECTIVES ............................................................................................................. 311
SUMMING UP ................................................................................................................................ 313
FURTHER WORK .............................................................................................................................. 314
CONCLUDING THOUGHTS ............................................................................................................. 315

APPENDIX 1 INITIAL LETTER TO PARTICIPANTS ........................................................................ 318
APPENDIX 2 PARTICIPANT INFORMATION SHEET AND CONSENT FORM............................. 319
APPENDIX 3 LETTER TO PARTICIPANTS OUTLINING THE INTERVIEW QUESTIONS ...................... 322
APPENDIX 4 INTERVIEW SCHEDULE ............................................................................................ 324
APPENDIX 5 BIBLIOGRAPHY OF RESEARCH ON GENDER, MATHEMATICS AND EDUCATION .................................................................................................................. 328
List of Tables

3.1 Summary of participant details ......................................................... 74