

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Partnership for Facilitating Sustainable Protected Area
Management:**

**A Case Study of Jiuzhaigou National Park in
South-Western China**

**A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Philosophy in Development Studies**

At

Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand



Qingxia Yang

2011

Abstract

The number of global protected areas is continuously increasing and nearly 13% of the earth's land area is now covered by protected areas. How to manage protected areas — over the long-term and in a sustainable way — has become critical. The protected area management paradigm has shifted, in order to promote inclusive practices, such as the involvement (and thus the participation) of multiple stakeholders within management. This participation is about the local community, tour operators, research agencies, NGOs and government agencies working in partnership. However, what partnership actually means in practice is not so easily understood. Using a case study approach, this thesis examines three different partnerships within a Chinese National Park — Jiuzhaigou National Park — in order to provide a thorough understanding of partnership in practice, within the context of the sustainable management of protected areas.

This thesis concludes that partnership is important for the facilitation of management of protected areas in a sustainable way. However, in practice, partnership does not necessarily have to be strong in all the areas of partnership principles. The partners in this study are not really sharing power in regards to decision-making but, nevertheless, these particular partnerships demonstrate three positive elements: the stakeholders hold a strongly shared goal that is compatible with the management objectives for protected areas; the stakeholders hold different resources that can be pooled to achieve the shared goal; and stakeholders perceive and gain mutual benefits, through working together. It is suggested, however, that an effective protected area partnership should consider the role of mutual transparency, accountability, trust, respect and influence. These key elements would further strengthen harmony within the relationship between the partners and, as a result, it would lead to more desirable long term management and sustainable outcomes for protected areas.

Acknowledgements

I am heartily thankful to my first supervisor, Prof. Regina Scheyvens, for her guidance, solid advice and encouragement, from the initial to the final level, which kept me going, in order to develop a full understanding of the subject. Special thanks also go to my second supervisor, Dr. Rochelle Stewart-Withers, for her constructive feedback on my final draft, which has been very helpful at the completion of this study. My thanks also go to Prof. Steve Harrell and Tom Hinckley, from the University of Washington, for their insightful comments on some parts of the draft.

My heartfelt gratitude goes to my managers and colleagues in the Jiuzhaigou National Park, especially those people in the Science Department, whose generous support and sharing of their knowledge has made an enormous contribution to this study. In addition special gratitude must go to all the participants, without whose time and sharing of valuable insights, this research would not have been made possible.

My thanks go to my fellow postgraduate students-Jacqueline, Kate, Ed, Aaron, Joshua and Bruce. Your friendship has encouraged me to continue travelling on the journey of this thesis writing. To Dr. Maria Borovnik, Dr. Nawal El-Gack, Prof. Glenn Banks and Gerard Prinsen, my thanks for your academic advice during my study at the Institute of Development Studies. My special gratitude also goes to the Massey University NZAID officials, Sylvia Hooker and Olive Pimentel and my friends Andrew Scanlon, Aunt Han and Uncle Wang, for their help and support during my studies in New Zealand.

My immeasurable thanks go to my loving mom, Zezhuzuo, and my family in China, for their support and for taking care of my son, Yongzha, so that I could focus on my studies in New Zealand. To my beloved husband, Zhugang — your trust and encouragement has been a great inspiration in the making of this thesis.

I owe my deepest gratitude to NZAID, who granted this researcher an opportunity to undertake an academic experience in New Zealand. Finally, my thanks go to the Massey University People and the Environment and Planning Graduate Research Fund for their financial contribution to this research.

Dedication

This thesis is dedicated, in loving memory, to my father: Yang • Zerenbuqiu, who passed away on 19 January 2005, when he retired from his beloved job at the Jiuzhaigou National Park. I know how delighted he would have been, if there had been an opportunity for him to have read this thesis.

Table of Contents

ABSTRACT	I
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	II
DEDICATION	III
TABLE OF CONTENTS	IV
LIST OF FIGURES	IX
LIST OF TABLES	X
ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS.....	XI
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 RESEARCH RATIONALE.....	2
1.2 RESEARCH AIM, OBJECTIVES AND QUESTIONS.....	5
1.3 METHODOLOGY.....	6
1.4 OVERVIEW OF THE THESIS.....	7
CHAPTER 2 SHIFTING APPROACHES TO PROTECTED AREAS.....	9
2.1 INTRODUCTION.....	9
2.2 OVERVIEW OF PROTECTED AREAS IN THE WORLD.....	9
2.2.1 <i>History of Protected Areas</i>	10
2.2.2 <i>What Are Protected Areas?</i>	14
2.2.3 <i>Changing View of Protected Areas</i>	19
2.3 OUTLINE OF SHIFT IN PROTECTED AREAS MANAGEMENT APPROACHES.....	23
2.4 CLASSIFYING CURRENT APPROACHES TO PROTECTED AREAS.....	26
2.4.1 <i>Government Managed Protected Areas</i>	27
2.4.2 <i>Co-Managed Protected Areas</i>	29

2.4.3	<i>Private Protected Areas</i>	30
2.4.4	<i>Community Conserved Areas</i>	30
2.5	CHINA'S APPROACH TO PROTECTED AREAS	32
2.5.1	<i>Overview of Protected Areas in China</i>	33
2.5.2	<i>Legislation and Programmes Relating to Protected Areas</i>	35
2.5.3	<i>Defining Protected Areas in China</i>	39
2.5.4	<i>Regulating Protected Areas</i>	40
2.5.5	<i>Funding of Protected Areas</i>	44
2.6	CONCLUSION.....	45
CHAPTER 3 PARTNERSHIP AS A MANAGEMENT APPROACH FOR PROTECTED AREAS		47
3.1	INTRODUCTION.....	47
3.2	UNDERSTANDING PARTNERSHIP FROM DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVES.....	48
3.2.1	<i>Partnership from International Development Perspectives</i>	49
3.2.2	<i>Partnership from Sustainable Tourism Perspectives</i>	50
3.2.3	<i>Partnership from Natural Resource Management Perspectives</i>	52
3.3	APPLICATION OF 'PARTNERSHIP' IN PROTECTED AREAS	55
3.4	FRAMEWORK FOR IDENTIFYING PARTNERSHIPS IN PROTECTED AREAS	59
3.5	CONCLUSION.....	60
CHAPTER 4 METHODOLOGY.....		61
4.1	INTRODUCTION.....	61
4.2	JUSTIFICATION OF MY POSITION WITHIN THE RESEARCH	61
4.3	BACKGROUND OF RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	63
4.4	ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	66
	Formal Ethics Requirements	66
	Conflict of Roles	67
4.5	FIELDWORK METHODS AND EXPERIENCE	67
	Preparing for Data Collection.....	68

Interviews	69
Observation	72
Documents and Secondary Data	73
Capturing the Field	73
4.6 DATA ANALYSIS	75
4.7 PRACTICAL ISSUES	76
4.8 SUMMARY	77
CHAPTER 5 PARTNERSHIP APPROACH IN PRACTICE: CASE STUDY FROM JIUZHAIGOU NATIONAL	
PARK CHINA.....	78
5.1 INTRODUCTION.....	78
5.2 CASE STUDY SITE: JIUZHAIGOU NATIONAL PARK.....	78
5.3 PARTNERSHIP CASES STUDIES	83
5.3.1 <i>Nuorilang Tour Service Centre: A Partnership with the Local Community</i>	85
Background of the Partnership	85
Stakeholders of Nuorilang Tour Service Centre.....	87
The Roles and Relationships of Stakeholders.....	91
Benefits of the Partnership	93
Challenges within the Partnership	95
Summary.....	98
5.3.2 <i>Jiuzhaigou International Laboratory: a Partnership between Universities and National</i>	
<i>Parks.....</i>	<i>99</i>
Overview of the Partnership	99
Stakeholders: Their Roles and Relationships.....	101
Benefits of the Partnership	104
Challenges in Partnership.....	105
Summary.....	108
5.3.3 <i>Jiuzhaigou Green Tour Bus Company: a Tourism Partnership</i>	109

Background of Partnership	109
The Relationship between Stakeholders	110
Benefits of the Partnership	111
Challenges to this Partnership	113
Summary.....	114
5.4 ASSESSING THE KEY ELEMENTS OF PARTNERSHIP IN THE CASE STUDIES	115
CHAPTER 6 DO PARTNERSHIPS FACILITATE THE SUSTAINABLE MANAGEMENT OF A PROTECTED	
AREA?.....	119
6.1 HOW IS SUSTAINABLE MANAGEMENT ARTICULATED IN THE CONTEXT OF PROTECTED AREAS?	120
6.2 HOW IS PARTNERSHIP PRACTICED IN RELATION TO THE SUSTAINABLE MANAGEMENT OF A PROTECTED AREA? ..	123
6.2.1 <i>Nuorilang Tour Service Centre</i>	123
6.2.2 <i>Jiuzhaigou International Laboratory</i>	125
6.2.3 <i>Green Bus Company</i>	127
6.3 WHO HOLDS THE LEADERSHIP OF THE PARTNERSHIP IN RELATION TO THE SUSTAINABLE MANAGEMENT OF A	
PROTECTED AREA?	129
6.4 SUMMARY	132
6.5 RECOMMENDATIONS	133
6.5.1 <i>Recommendations for Jiuzhaigou National Park</i>	133
Recommendations for the Nuorilang Tour Service Centre.....	133
Recommendations for the Green Bus Company	135
Recommendations for the Jiuzhaigou International Laboratory.....	135
6.5.2 <i>Limitations and Recommendations for Further Research</i>	136
APPENDICES	138
APPENDIX ONE: INTERVIEW GUIDING QUESTIONS	138
APPENDIX TWO: INFORMATION SHEET.....	140
APPENDIX THREE: PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM	142

BIBLIOGRAPHY143

List of Figures

Figure 1: Cumulative global growth in the area of nationally designated protected areas (1872-2007).	13
Figure 2: China’s environmental administration system	43
Figure 3: Proportion of PA system in China managed by different agencies (by area, 2002)	44
Figure 4: The locus of control continuum	60
Figure 5: Location of Jiuzhaigou National Park in China	80
Figure 6: Tourist numbers in Jiuzhaigou National Park per year.....	83
Figure 7: Lunchtime tourists flow into the Nuorilang Tour Service Centre	85
Figure 8: 198 souvenir stalls set up in the middle of the Nuorilang Tour Service Centre.....	89
Figure 9: Relationships between stakeholders in the Nuorilang Tour Service Centre	92
Figure 10: Tourists purchase souvenirs inside the Nuorilang Tour Service Centre .	94
Figure 11: A multi-disciplinary research team from the University of Washington, Sichuan University and Jiuzhaigou National Park	99
Figure 12: Jiuzhaigou International Laboratory organised workshop on sustainability of Jiuzhaigou National Park in 2007.....	101
Figure 13: Relationships between Jiuzhaigou International Laboratory stakeholders and geographical scale	104
Figure 14: Green Buses operating inside Jiuzhaigou National Park.....	109
Figure 15: Current relationships between stakeholders in Green Bus Company .	111
Figure 16: Location of partnership cases in the locus of control continuum.....	131

List of Tables

Table 1: IUCN protected area management categories	15
Table 2: Matrix of management objectives and IUCN protected area management categories	18
Table 3: Historic milestones in the development of protected areas	20
Table 4: Comparing the old and new approaches to protected areas	24
Table 5: Different approaches to protected areas management and examples	28
Table 6: Options within the elements of conservation management.....	32
Table 7: Establishment of nature reserves in China	34
Table 8: Some of China's key national policies, regulations and programmes	36
Table 9: Types of nature reserves in China	40
Table 10: Characteristics of partnership cases for this study	66
Table 11: Number of interview participants in the three cases, by occupation	71
Table 12: Key events in the establishment and management history of Jiuzhaigou National Park.....	81
Table 13: Key elements of partnership in the three cases studies.....	116

Acronyms and Abbreviations

CBD	Convention on Biological Diversity
IUCN	International Union for Conservation of Nature
M&B	Man and Biosphere
PA	Protected Area
UNDP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Environmental, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
WDPA	World Database on Protected Areas
WCMC	World Conservation Monitoring Centre
WCPA	World Commission on Protected Areas
WHS	World Heritage Site
WPC	World Parks Congress