BEFORE OUR VERY EYES

Miura Baien and the Ten Thousand Things

"The volumes of *Gengo* give an account of just what I see."

*Gengo* Preface, 1775

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Philosophy and East Asian Studies at Massey University

Rosemary Mercer

1994
The first aim of this project is to explore the jōri system of the Japanese scholar, Miura Baien (1723-1789) and to understand it better. Baien himself wished to explore the universe and to understand the universe better. As work on this essay progressed, two features of Baien's project became its focus:

Baien is a "realist" in the sense that for him, the vast intricacies of heaven and earth are already there before us. They are there for all to discover, regardless of what anyone has said or thought.

Baien found that in order to comprehend anything of the complexity of the manifold before his eyes, he needed to design a technical language, ruled by what he discovered there.

A study of these features in the development of Baien's system gives rise to the interesting hypothesis that two theses, which at first glance we often take to be incompatible, might be profitably combined:

1. The distinction between the real and the merely conceptual is clear-cut, already determined and beyond our power to alter.

2. The distinction between the real and the merely conceptual depends on language.

Because Baien's interest in language as a study is confined to what we should nowadays see as a very narrow segment of the field of linguistic phenomena, the hypothesis that these two theses are compatible is not one he would have put forward. But the use to which he puts language in our broader sense of "language" is strong evidence for that compatibility.

In a late chapter of this thesis I have put forward the hypothesis that the distinction between the real and the merely conceptual is both out of our hands, and dependent on language. From this I have drawn the further consequence that reality is not constrained by, nor reducible to, a single set of criteria that distinguishes it from the merely conceptual.

These different sets of criteria are not governed by some master principle behind the distinction. There are "plural realities". Baien's system, too, points this way. His terminological method gives us not a single structure, but constantly shifting views of reality, in such a way that if we take him seriously it is difficult to resist the conclusion that reality itself is aleidoscopic.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

In the writing of this thesis I am deeply indebted to my chief supervisor, Thomas Wheaton Bestor, of the Department of Philosophy, Massey University. His countless comments, suggestions and constant challenging criticisms have influenced the course of my research from start to finish. Above all else I should like to thank him for so enriching these four years of my life with engrossing philosophical discussion.

I should also like to thank my second supervisor, Kakubayashi Fumio of the Department of East Asian Studies at Massey, for his corrections and assistance with the translations in the Appendix, for his help and kindness in obtaining Japanese material for me, and for his friendly support.

I wish to thank Jon Henning for his meticulous reading, checking and helpful comments on an important section of this thesis.

I am very grateful to Massey University for the financial assistance which made this work possible.

I wish to thank the staff of Philosophy Department at Massey University for their encouragement and interest, and also my fellow graduate students for their help and companionship.

I wish to thank my husband, Bruce Mercer, for his constant assistance and support, and the other members of my family also for their tolerance and understanding.
CONTENTS

ABSTRACT .......................................................... i

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS ............................................... ii

REAMEBLE .......................................................... 1

Rules of method .................................................. 5
Conventions ......................................................... 6

PART 1: Jōri

CHAPTER 1 What is Jōri? ........................................... 7
Introduction ......................................................... 7
.1 the term "jōri" ..................................................... 9
.2 the design of Gengo ............................................. 11
.3 jōri as a theory ................................................. 15
"therefore" .......................................................... 15
Summary of Chapter 1 ........................................... 18

CHAPTER 2 Models of Jōri ......................................... 19
Introduction ......................................................... 19
1 the woven brocade .............................................. 21
part and side ....................................................... 22
2 the brush stroke ................................................... 23
3 the river bank gazers ............................................ 24
summary of the three models ................................. 25
4 interpreters' imagery ............................................ 26
sketching the river banks ........................................ 26
tree diagrams ...................................................... 27
triples for pairs ................................................... 28
hierarchies of being .............................................. 29
incomprehensibility and mysticism ......................... 30
5 the brocade robe model in Dōgen, Shundai and Baien .... 31
"bun(mon)"-pattern ................................................. 36
Summary of Chapter 2 ........................................... 38
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th>Subsections</th>
<th>Summary of Chapter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The jōri lexicon</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.1 pairs of jōri terms</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.2 the jōri shift</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>natural shifts</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.3 whole pair shifts from realm to realm</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>realms</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>the whole pair shift</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>pair shift and conventional meaning</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>the irregularity of pair shifts</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.4 Baien's use of of relative terms</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>stipulative definitions</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Summary of Chapter 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Word and subject</td>
<td></td>
<td>4.1 word (sei/shō)</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>sentences</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4.2 subject (shu)</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>other uses of &quot;shu&quot;</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>subject in &quot;word and subject&quot;</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4.3 naming</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>names and truth</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>distinguishing the real</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Summary of Chapter 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Opposites</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.1 jōri opposites</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>comparison</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>polarity and interdependence</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5.2 number</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>oneness</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>one and two</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>three</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>four</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5.3 alien terms</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>dialectic</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>materialism</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>contradiction</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>universals and particulars</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>abstract and concrete</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Summary of Chapter 5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART II: The Physical World

CHAPTER 6 Jōri and science ........................................... 114

Introduction: Edo science ........................................... 114
6.1 historians' neglect of Tokugawa science ................. 115
Western science in Edo Japan ................................ 124
6.2 Baien and science .............................................. 127
    influences ..................................................... 127
    Fang I-chih ................................................... 128
    kiyu and evidence .......................................... 130
    traces .......................................................... 135
    Baien's message concerning science ................. 137
6.3 jōri kinds ...................................................... 140
    biological classification ................................ 143
Summary of Chapter 6 ............................................. 148

CHAPTER 7 Yin and yang ............................................ 149

Introduction: "attributes" in Chinese tradition .......... 149
7.1 old yin-yang theory .......................................... 152
7.2 Baien and yin and yang .................................... 155
    listing pairs ............................................... 157
    dynamic yin and yang .................................... 158
    yin and yang as empty places .......................... 161
7.3 the Five Elements ............................................. 163
    correlative thinking ...................................... 165
Summary of Chapter 7 ............................................. 167

CHAPTER 8 The differentiation of ki.............................. 168

Introduction ......................................................... 168
8.1 the water-pot .................................................. 171
8.2 circle and line ............................................... 175
    the round earth .......................................... 178
    motion, space and time .................................. 178
8.3 "object" and "objects" ....................................... 184
    things and stuff, masses and countables .......... 188
Summary of Chapter 8 ............................................. 199
PART III Realities

CHAPTER 9 The sagely norms

Introduction ........................................... 200
9.1 ancient Chinese naming ........................ 201
9.2 unity and pragmatism .......................... 207
9.3 Baien’s position ................................. 211
    Confucians and nativists ........................ 211
    Baien’s realism .................................. 212
    norms, sages and realism ........................ 214
Summary of Chapter 9 .............................. 216

CHAPTER 10 Realms of reality

Contents of Chapter 10 .............................. 217
Introduction ......................................... 217
Section I:
10.1 reality is normative ............................ 220
10.2 language ......................................... 221
10.3 reality ........................................... 225
    reality and language are interdependent ....... 225
    reality requires language ....................... 226
    language requires reality ....................... 236
    the interdependence is compatible with realism ............................................. 238
    how the real is often misrepresented .......... 240
Section II:
10.4 is reality unique? ............................... 243
10.5 realms ............................................ 247
10.6 shifting realms ................................... 257
    shifts within realms ............................. 258
    shifts from realm to realm ...................... 259
    exercising the idea of shifting realms ........ 260
    looking for realm shifts ....................... 262
Conclusion .......................................... 272

CHAPTER 11 The concealed and the manifest

Introduction ......................................... 273
1.1 <concealed and manifest> as a ḧenti pair ........... 275
1.2 <concealed and manifest> and <invisible and visible> ....... 284
1.3 problems with translating "<concealed and manifest>" .... 287
1.4 concluding remarks: "far-seeing" ............... 294
APPENDIX

TRANSLATIONS

Note on some problematic terms ........................................... 297

Contents: page references to English translation of *Gengo Preface* ................................................................. 299

*Gengo Preface* ......................................................................... 300

Letter to Asada 1763 ............................................................... 331

Letter to Asada 1785 ............................................................... 334

Reply to Kō Takaoki ............................................................... 339

Letter to Yumisaki Yoshitada .................................................. 349

REFERENCES

- Glossary of *jöri* pairs ......................................................... 353

- Supplementary glossary ....................................................... 356

- Bibliography 1: works in English .......................................... 358

- Bibliography 2: works in Japanese or Chinese ....................... 365

- Index of personal names ..................................................... 372