FROM JOB CREATION TO TRAINING, 1840-1990: A DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS OF THE DEVELOPMENT AND DEMISE OF JOB CREATION POLICY AS THE MAINSTAY OF STATE RESPONSES TO UNEMPLOYMENT IN NEW ZEALAND

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Social Policy at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

ANDREW PUNABANTU MULENGU

July 1994
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GLOSSARY OF MAORI AND NEW ZEALAND TERMS</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER ONE: COMPETING PERSPECTIVES ON WORK AND THE CAPITALIST STATE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From Ancient Greece to the Protestant Reformation</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Protestant Reformation And Work</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From the Protestant Work Ethic to Capitalist Work Ethic</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maori Attitudes Towards Work</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utopian Socialists and Marxists and Their Views on Work</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Capitalist State and Unemployment</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British State Responses to Unemployment</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The New Zealand State's Responses to Unemployment</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER TWO: FROM THE NEW ZEALAND COMPANY TO NEW ZEALAND STATEHOOD AND EARLY RESPONSES TO UNEMPLOYMENT, 1840-70</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background to the Colonisation of New Zealand</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Treaty of Waitangi</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The New Zealand Company's 'Employment Policy'</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The New Zealand Company's Settlements</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wellington Settlement</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Plymouth Settlement</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nelson Settlement</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Otago Settlement</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Canterbury Settlement</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Auckland Settlement</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Birth of New Zealand Statehood</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER THREE: THE IMMIGRATION AND PUBLIC WORKS ACT AND THE RISE OF EMPLOYMENT/UNEMPLOYMENT POLICY, 1870-90</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Responses to Unemployment</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment in the 1880s</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Growth of Job Creation</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The 'Right to Work' and State Response</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The 'Deserving' and 'undeserving' Unemployed ........................................ 78
Public Works and Rural Unemployment .................................................. 80
Policy Makers' Conflicting Views Over Relief Works ............................. 82
The Dilemma of the State ........................................................................ 87
Conclusion ............................................................................................... 89

CHAPTER FOUR: THE DEPARTMENT OF LABOUR AND THE
COOPERATIVE WORKS SCHEME AND UNEMPLOYMENT, 1891-1912
Introduction ............................................................................................. 90
The 1890 General Election and its Results ........................................... 91
The Department of Labour and Unemployment Relief ......................... 93
The Cooperative Works Scheme ............................................................... 98
Conditions of Employment ..................................................................... 113
The Parliamentary Opposition's Position on Unemployment Relief .... 114
The Decline of the Liberal Party ............................................................... 116
Conclusion ............................................................................................... 118

CHAPTER FIVE: THE "NO WORK, NO PAY" POLICY, 1926-35
Introduction ............................................................................................. 120
Unemployment Relief Prior to the Unemployment Act 1930 ............... 121
The Unemployment Act 1930 and Unemployment Relief .................... 127
Reaction to the Board's Work Schemes ................................................ 131
The Policy of 'No Work, No Pay' and its Consequences ....................... 142
Conclusion ............................................................................................... 146

CHAPTER SIX: FROM UNEMPLOYMENT RELIEF TO FULL EMPLOYMENT
POLICY, 1935-49
Introduction ............................................................................................. 147
The Labour Party and the 1935 General Election ................................. 148
Labour's Legislative Measures ................................................................. 150
The Social Security Scheme .................................................................. 152
Labour's Responses to Unemployment and Trends up to September
1939 ......................................................................................................... 154
Unemployment and the War .................................................................. 164
The Labour Government and the Immediate Postwar Years ............... 166
Conclusion ............................................................................................... 169

CHAPTER SEVEN: THE RE-EMERGENCE OF UNEMPLOYMENT AND THE
DECLINE OF STATE COMMITMENT TO FULL EMPLOYMENT POLICY,
1977-84
Introduction ............................................................................................. 171
Public Reaction and State Responses to Unemployment .................... 172
Duration of Employment on Job Creation Schemes ............................. 179
Summary of Phase One ......................................................................... 180
Phase Two of State Responses to Unemployment 1981-84 ................. 180
  Blame the System Not the Victim ....................................................... 181
Conflicting Views on Unemployment .................................................... 188
Summary of Phase Two ......................................................................... 194
Conclusion ............................................................................................... 194
CHAPTER EIGHT: THE SHIFT IN STATE POLICY EMPHASIS FROM JOB CREATION TO TRAINING AND UNEMPLOYMENT BENEFITS AS THE MAINSTAY OF STATE RESPONSES TO UNEMPLOYMENT, 1984-90

Introduction.............................................................................................................196
Background to the Fourth Labour Government's Economic and Social Policies ......................................................................................................................... 197
The Social and Economic Policies of the Fourth Labour Government and the Role of Treasury and the Private Sector ................................................................. 198
The Labour Government and its View of Unemployment ........................................... 202
The Economic Summit Conferences 1984 .............................................................. 204
The Employment Promotion Conference ................................................................ 206
From Job Creation to Training .................................................................................. 206
Administration and Implementation of ACCESS Schemes ........................................ 217
The Access Training Scheme and its Results .............................................................. 219
Implications of the Shift in Policy Emphasis .............................................................. 223
Conclusion ............................................................................................................... 226

CONCLUSIONS
Introduction ............................................................................................................. 228
The Influence of Ideas About Work ........................................................................... 232
Continuities, Fluctuation and Change in Job Creation Policy ..................................... 237
Continuities ............................................................................................................. 237
Fluctuations and Changes ......................................................................................... 238
Comparisons and Contrasts ...................................................................................... 239
Conclusion ............................................................................................................... 242

APPENDICES
Appendix I: Unemployment Act 1930 ...................................................................... 245
Appendix II: Social Security Act 1938 ...................................................................... 253
Appendix III: Summary of Job Creation Schemes Initiated by the Unemployment Board (1930-1935) ................................................................. 255
Appendix IV: Summary of the Main Features of Job Creation Schemes in Phase One (1977-1980) ................................................................. 262
Appendix V: Conditions Employment and Training on Schemes for the Unemployed, 1984-1990 ................................................................. 269

TABLES
Table 1: Full-Time Labour Force: Historical Summary ............................................. 272
Table 2A: Number of Unemployed Assisted to Employment by the Labour Department 1892-1930 ................................................................. 274
Table 2B: Numbers in Receipt of Relief From the Employment Promotion Fund 1931-1939 ................................................................. 274
Table 3: Registered Unemployed, Monthly Average 1947-1990 ................................ 275
Table 4: Numbers of Males Registered as Unemployed and Numbers in Receipt of Relief From the Unemployment/Employment Fund, 1931-1938 ................................................................. 276
Table 5: Average Minimum Weekly Adult Wage-Rates Between 1931-1935 ............ 277
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BIBLIOGRAPHY</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Documents of the Crown</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Press Releases</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Act of Parliament</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand Acts of Parliament</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendices to the Journals of the House of Reps.</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous Crown Documents</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newspapers of Magazines</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pamphlets</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand History: A Select Bibliography</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articles</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unpublished Papers</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Books</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
New Zealand, for much of the present century has been regarded by other English speaking nations as boldly experimenting in the development of social policy; but is currently taking the dismantling of the welfare state further than most western countries. This thesis provides a historical analysis of job creation for the unemployed, which was provided by the state on a relatively large scale (relative to the size of the New Zealand population), from the earliest days of colonisation in the 1840s until it was virtually phased out in the mid-1980s.

The thesis examines the competing ideas and interests which conditioned the adoption, growth, fluctuations in the eventual demise of job creation as the mainstay of the New Zealand state's responses to unemployment. In particular, it examines the impact of the various sets of ideas about work and human nature which were brought to New Zealand in the course of colonisation by the British; and the extent to which the colonisers were able to recreate patterns of work and dependency from Britain.

The study of job creation in New Zealand is a history of conflict based on class interests. One task of the thesis is to show how the state has responded in different periods to demands from working men for the 'right to work'. However, it is also a history of the reinforcing of ancient divisions of labour along lines of gender and ethnicity, and of the relative privileging of 'pakeha' (white, European) men in terms of their access to paid work provided by the state.

Job creation for the unemployed has been a site of both conflict and compromise between (mainly male) labour and capital throughout the post-colonisation period in New Zealand. This thesis provides an in-depth study of the ways in which such conflict and compromise contributed to the development, form and eventual demise of job creation in New Zealand.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study has been an extremely rewarding experience, although not without its debts. In particular I am indebted to Massey University Librarian in charge of the Official Publications, Jill Best and to the staff of the Interloan Section for securing data located in various institutions in New Zealand. I would also like to express my indebtedness to the staff of the National Archives and Turnbull Library in Wellington for their assistance in locating and suggesting material to me in the course of this study. Thanks go to my supervisors who have been endlessly patient: Dr Celia Briar as my chief supervisor and to Professor Ian Shirley and Chris Eichbaum for their valuable suggestions. Finally, but in no way the least thanks to Tracy Eagle for professionally setting the final version.

This thesis would not have been possible without the Commonwealth Scholarship awarded to me by the Vice Chancellors' Committee in 1990. I would also like to thank most sincerely Professor Ian Shirley for securing additional funding for me and my daughter Mukabantu after the expiry of the Commonwealth Scholarship to enable me complete my writing up. Finally I would like to express gratitude to Janet Milne for the support and love she gave to my daughter Mukabantu.

This thesis is dedicated to my late wife and best friend, Agness Mubitelela.
GLOSSARY OF MAORI AND NEW ZEALAND TERMS

Aotearoa: The Land of the Long White Cloud (New Zealand)

Mana: Influence, authority, social standing

Iwi: Tribe

Maori: The inhabitants of New Zealand prior to British colonisation in 1840.

Pakeha: White person, European

Tapu: Sacred, prohibited

New Zealand English Terms

Backblocks: Remote rural districts.

'Criminally lazy poor': Workers who were regularly unemployed, many of them casual workers.

'Helpful poor': The unemployed whose unemployment was considered as not of their own making. These were workers who rarely sought state assistance and were prepared to accept whatever work was on offer.

'Red Fed': Member of the New Zealand Federation of Labour.

Non-reproductive work: Public works involving improvement of streets, roads, &c., improvement of domains, parks and reserves, improvement of schools and hospitals.

Reproductive work: Public works involving land-drainage, general land development, erosion protection, improvement of backblocks roads, afforestation, reclamation, &c.

Section: Portion of land.

'Swaggies': Mobile landless labourers who met the seasonal labour requirements of the large pastoral landholdings in the nineteenth-century.
ABBREVIATIONS

AJHR Appendices to the Journals of the House of Representatives
Census New Zealand Population Census
CSE Conference of Socialist Economists
EPC Employment Promotion Conference
ESC Economic Summit Conference
JALC Journal and Appendix of the Legislative Council
JDL Journal of the Department of Labour
MSC Manpower Service Commission (UK)
MMP Mixed Member Proportional Representation
NZC New Zealand Company
NZDL New Zealand Department of Labour
NZIIA New Zealand Institute of International Affairs
NZLP New Zealand Labour Party
NZOYB New Zealand Official Year Book
NZPD New Zealand Parliamentary Debates
NZS New Zealand Statutes
OECD Organisation of Economic Co-operation and Development
PEP Project Employment Programme
PSA Public Service Association
REACs Regional Employment and ACCESS Councils
RCSP Royal Commission on Social Policy
SNZ Statistics of New Zealand