SAFE SEXUAL FREEDOMS:
A NEW NARRATIVE FOR AN AGE OF RISK

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment
of the requirements

for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
in Sociology at Massey University

Allanah Marie Ryan

1997
ABSTRACT

'Safe sexual freedoms' is a theoretical and political project of some urgency and this thesis offers a perspective on how best to understand and develop that project. A common political response to the recognition of HIV risk has been to argue that sexual freedom is an inappropriate political and ethical goal. I maintain, on the contrary, that no real change in the sexual practice of individuals is possible outside a radical humanist model of sexual freedom. This perspective is pursued through two interconnected forms of critique. Firstly, I undertake an evaluation of a number of prominent theoretical constructions of sexual freedom in relation to the values which they espouse and the understanding of the self that they promote. In engaging with the meaning of sexual autonomy in the writings of Reich, Foucault, feminists, and gay and queer theorists, I defend a theorisation of the social, sexual self in terms of narrative identity and ethical authenticity. This formulation, I believe, offers a satisfactory synthesis between a previously hegemonic 'leftist' humanist project of the self and the influential postmodernist movement which came to dramatically overturn it. One of the primary consequences of the present analysis is the need to 'roll back' to an extent, the extraordinary - and deserved - place of Michel Foucault's work on issues of safe sex, liberation and human solidarity.

The second moment of the thesis is rather different, though closely linked in conception. Drawing on research material which reveals how sexually active individuals construct their notions of sexual and personal autonomy, I explore the role of narrative identity in the sexual practice of individual gay men and heterosexual women. Through an analysis of eight case studies, I examine how individuals inhabit core sexual narratives that guide HIV risk assessment and sexual practice. These two levels of analysis (critique and lived experience) taken together, provide the means for developing a theoretical and political model of safe sexual freedom.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis would not exist in the form that it does (or indeed at all!) without the help of a number of good friends, supportive colleagues and my supervisors. I am particularly grateful for the advice that I have received from my chief supervisor, Professor Gregor McLennan. While Greg has been a demanding and exacting supervisor and critic, his support for the project, and of me, has been unstinting. Particularly in the final stages of the production of this thesis, Greg has responded to my drafts quickly and with sage advice. I am also grateful for the advice and encouragement I have received from Dr Alison Jones. Alison’s supervision, from a distance, has provided me with much needed and valuable suggestions on the analysis of the interview material included in the thesis.

I am greatly indebted to the twenty-four men and women who generously shared with me aspects of their lives. Thanks must also go to Steve Maharey and Professor Graeme Fraser, who provided support during an early stage of the project. I would also like to thank Ruth Mountain for transcribing the interviews, and Heather Hodgetts for secretarial assistance. I have also benefitted from the New Zealand AIDS Foundation’s library service, in particular Vern Keller who has responded to my many requests quickly. Also from the NZAF, Tony Hughes and Warren Lindberg have been helpful to me at various stages of the research. In addition, I have received valuable information and assistance from Phil Parkinson in his role as curator of the Lesbian and Gay Archives of New Zealand. My heartfelt thanks as well to Lyn James who always helped me find a way through even when it seemed impossible.

On a personal level I am greatly indebted to the love, support and practical assistance of a number of good friends. In particular Avril Bell, Christine Cheyne, Nicola Armstrong, Karen Johnston and Suzanne Battleday have, in different ways, been there for me when I needed them. My deepest thanks go to Marianne Tremaine who has kept on loving me through this process, even when it must have often felt rather unrewarding. My ability to finish the dissertation is in no small measure due to Marianne’s practical and emotional support, given daily. I am also grateful to Marianne for her thorough proofing and editing of my final chapter drafts.
My parents, Colleen and Kevin, my sister Denise and my brother Shaun are also richly deserving of thanks at this time because although they must have wondered, they have never betrayed any sign of doubt that one day my thesis would be finished.

I wish to dedicate this thesis to Ruairidh and Finn Battleday, who at seven and four years of age respectively, still have their sexual future ahead of them. While they already know how to love well, my hope for them is that their future will be one of safe sexual freedoms.
# SAFE SEXUAL FREEDOMS:
# A NEW NARRATIVE FOR AN AGE OF RISK

## SHORT TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contents</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1 AIDS, Safe Sex and Sexual Liberation: Crisis and Critique</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2 Sexual Liberation and its Discontents</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3 Feminism and Sexual Liberation: A Contradiction in Terms?</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4 Saint Foucault Queers the Pitch</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 5 Risk, Safe Sex and the Power of Narrative Research</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 6 Risk and Freedom in Gay Sexual Relationships</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7 Risk and Freedom in Women’s Sexual Relationships</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodological Appendix</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract ii
Acknowledgements iii
Contents v

INTRODUCTION 1
The Thesis Project 1
Sexual Freedom: Values, Identity and Radical Humanism 3
Thesis Outline 7

1 AIDS, SAFE SEX AND SEXUAL LIBERATION: CRISIS AND CRITIQUE 10
AIDS Crisis, AIDS Critique: Is this the End of Sexual Freedom? 11
Of Plagues and Sexual Revolutions 12
‘Postmodern AIDS’:
Sexual Liberation as a Hindrance to Radical Sexual Politics 17
Moral Sources for Radical Sexual Politics: Emancipation and Authenticity 22

The Safe Sex Project: Narratives of Sexual Freedom in an Age of Risk 27
The Gay Safe Sex Project: Troubling Identities 28
Feminism and Safe Sex: Permissive and/or Women-centred? 34
Authenticity, Autonomy and Safe Sex 39

2 SEXUAL LIBERATION AND ITS DISCONTENTS 46
The Role of Narrative in Theories of Sexual Liberation 47
Master Narratives, Difference and Pluralism:
The Aporias of the Postmodern Critique 47
Conceptual Narrativity in Theories ‘of’ and ‘against’ Sexual Liberation 52
Sexuality: Natural or Discursive?
- Reich: Orgasmic Energy, Sexual Repression and Character Structure 55
- Foucault: ‘Sexuality’ vs Bodies/Pleasures 61
- Body-reflexive Practices and Narrative Identity in Sexual Social Relations 67

The Ethics of Sexual Freedom: Mutuality vs Practices of Freedom 71
- Reich: Self-regulation and Mutuality 72
- Foucault: Practices of Freedom and an Aesthetics of Existence 75
- Radical Humanism and Sexual Autonomy:
  - Values, Authenticity and Narrative Identity in Sexual Freedom 81

3 Feminism and Sexual Liberation: A Contradiction in Terms? 88

The Feminist Sex Debates:
- Competing Meanings of Authenticity, Difference and Autonomy 88
  - Pleasure vs Danger, Pluralist vs Radical Feminism 88
  - The Barnard Conference and its Aftermath 92
  - The Heart of the Debates: Authenticity, Recognition and Sexual Autonomy 93

The Politics of Orgasm: Seeking Liberated Sex 96
- A Feminist Sexual Revolution? 96
- The Politics of Orgasm: The Body and its Limits 98
- Sexual Freedom as Equality: Political and Ethical Dimensions 101

Radical Feminism: Critiquing Heterosexuality, Eroticising Equality 103
- Sexual Liberation as Patriarchal Plot 103
- Sex, Power and Subjectivity 105
- ‘The Personal is Political’ and Eroticising Equality 109

Pluralist Feminism: Promoting Pleasures, Critiquing Cultural Feminism 115
- The Precarious Balancing Act Between Pleasure and Danger 115
- Sexuality as Relatively Autonomous and the Inescapability of Power 118
Beyond Permissive Pleasures and Patriarchal Plots:
Women's Sexual Authenticity and Autonomy in an Age of Risk 125

4  SAINT FOUCALUT QUEERS THE PITCH 128
Introduction 128
What is the Queer Critique, and Why Now? 131
The Aporias of a Queer Critique of Heteronormativity 135
   Homophobic Discourses, the Epistemology of the Closet and the Hetero/Homo Binary 136
   The Critique of Halperin's Account of Homophobic Power 140

Queer Politics and the Limits of Identity 146
   The Queer Critique of Identity 147
   The Empowerment of a Marginal Positionality:
      'A Little Manifesto in Defense of Queer Identities' 149
   Narrative Sexual Identities and the Politics of Recognition 151

Queer Ethics: An Aesthetics of Existence 155
   A Queer Ascesis 156
   A Critique of Queer Ethics 159

From Queer to Lived Experience 162

5  RISK, SAFE SEX AND THE POWER OF NARRATIVE RESEARCH 164
Risk and Narrative Identity 165
   Risk, Trust and Reflexivity 166
   Narrative: Identity, Action and Rationality 169
   Emplotment, Authenticity and Sexual Autonomy 173
6 RISK AND FREEDOM IN GAY SEXUAL RELATIONSHIPS 181
Risky and Safe Gay Sex: Questions of Identity and Strategy 181
Vern 183
   Personal and Sexual History 183
   Core Sexual Narrative: A Sexual Libertine Having Fun and Minimising Harm 185
   Risk Assessment: The Powers of Science and Unruly Desires 187
   Limits of the Libertarian Project and Scientific Knowledge 189

Chris 190
   Personal and Sexual History 190
   Core Sexual Narrative: Recovering from Betrayal and Longing for Intimacy 192
   Risk Assessment: Expert and Bodily Knowledge 193
   A Fateful Moment and the Loss of Innocence 194

Graeme 196
   Personal and Sexual History 196
   Core Sexual Narrative: Being Safe, Relaxed and Responsible 198
   Risk Assessment: Relying on Expert Knowledge, Wanting to Trust 199
   Trusting in Experts and Intimate Others 201

Bill 203
   Personal and Sexual History 203
   Core Sexual Narrative: Searching for a Partner and Having Fun 204
   Risk Assessment: Being Educated and Avoiding Non-intimate Sex 206
   Balancing Fun and Responsibility 208

Conclusion: Identity, Safe Sex and Sexual Freedom 20
7 Risk and Freedom in Women’s Sexual Relationships 213

Safe Heterosex? The Body and Trust 213

Odette 217

Personal and Sexual History 217

Core Sexual Narrative:
Being Stuck in ‘Permanent’ Untrustworthy Relationships 219
Risk Assessment: Being Safe in Permanent Relationships 221
The Poverty of ‘Permanence’: Neither Secure Nor Safe 222

Raewynne 223

Personal and Sexual History 223

Core Sexual Narrative: Seeking Reciprocal Sexual Intimacy 225
Risk Assessment: Relying on the Test and a Responsible Partner 227
Sexual Intimacy in the Context of Reciprocity: Rewarding but Risky 228

Irene 228

Personal and Sexual History 228

Core Sexual Narrative: Repositioning Rebelliousness 231
Risk Assessment: Becoming Responsible 233
Responsibilising Rebelliousness: An Uncertain Future 234

Kate 235

Personal and Sexual History 235

Core Sexual Narrative:
An Unassertive Sexual Rebel Seeks a Powerful Sexual Partner 237
Risk Assessment: Being Careless 239
Giving Up Responsibility 240

Conclusion: Permissiveness and Safe Sexual Autonomy 242

Conclusion 247