SINGING A JOYFUL SONG:
AN EXPLORATORY STUDY OF
PRIMARY SCHOOL MUSIC LEADERS IN
AOTEAROA NEW ZEALAND

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Education

at Massey University, Palmerston North,
New Zealand

Jennifer Elizabeth Boyack

2011
Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for the thesis to be downloaded or copied by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
ABSTRACT

This thesis explores the work of generalist primary school teachers who work in music leadership roles in their schools. There is an absence of research into the work of such teachers who play a key role in children’s formal and informal music learning, and who represent the musical ‘face’ of their primary schools. This study addresses this music research gap by collecting and analysing the stories and observing the work of a sample of teachers for whom music is both a personal and professional passion, and contributes to our general understanding of the work of primary school teachers who love music and share it in their schools and classrooms.

Five men and five women representing a range of personal and teaching experience and demographics participated in the study. All participants were interviewed about their work as primary school music leaders and were also observed undertaking a regular music leadership activity of their choice. Interview transcripts and observation notes were analysed in relation to the three research questions that address who the teachers are and how they came to be music leaders; the work they do and the skills, knowledge and understandings that underpin that work; and the significance of their work.

Key findings related to the interplay of personal and professional factors in the development of these teachers’ identities as primary school music leaders, the complex and multi-faceted nature of the role, and the broad significance of their work to the teachers themselves, the children they teach, and their wider school communities. In addition, themes of identity, emotionality and curriculum context emerged as important frameworks for understanding the data with Wenger’s (1998) ‘communities of practice’ utilised as a unifying theory.

The study contributes to a body of locally-based and international research concerned with music’s place in the primary school curriculum, the role of music teachers and leaders in sustaining music in the curriculum, and the value and benefits associated with music teaching and learning. In addition, it has practical and theoretical implications for teachers, teacher educators, and curriculum leaders at institutional and policy levels.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Doctoral study is often a lonely experience, and I am grateful for the support and encouragement that has sustained me on the journey.

This study could not have been undertaken without the ten teachers who so willingly participated in the research. It has been a privilege to listen to your stories and to observe you working musically in your schools. I hope that I have done justice to the richness of your work, that your stories will have an impact on those who read the thesis, and that you will feel encouraged to continue sharing music with the children in your care. My warmest thanks and appreciation goes to each one of you.

Dr Alison St George, my chief supervisor, and Professor John O’Neill have provided exemplary academic guidance throughout. Thank you Ali for your ongoing care for the academic outcomes of the study and for my personal well-being. I greatly value your wisdom and your friendship. John, your commitment to high quality research is reflected in the honesty and directness of your feedback, and your comments have added humour to an otherwise serious endeavour! Thank you for your teamwork as supervisors, and for the balance of encouragement and challenge that has enabled me to complete this thesis. My sincere thanks to Dr David Lines from Auckland University who has provided a music educator’s perspective on the study at various points along the way. It has meant a great deal to have the support of a valued colleague from the New Zealand music education community. I am also grateful to Massey University for invaluable assistance through the provision of an Advanced Degree Award which enabled me to take some dedicated time for writing in the midst of a busy teaching schedule.

Many friends and colleagues have given support in a range of ways, and helped me keep a perspective on how big (or small) a doctorate should be. In particular, thank you to the BMWs for your friendship and prayers, and for your reminder of the things in life that are really important; to the Wednesday morning breakfast group for being an inspiration, and for reassurance that feelings of doubt and inadequacy are normal for doctoral students; to my arts colleagues for companionship on the long and winding PhD road; to my own teachers, Pamela and John, who first showed me what it means to
be a primary school music leader; and to Rachel Rae for expert assistance with formatting and the production of the final document. Special thanks to dear friends Marie Silverwood for editing help and poetic interludes; and Judith Donaldson, fellow ‘muso’ and PhD pilgrim, for unfailing friendship and support.

My family have encouraged me over the years of study and have also provided much needed and happy distractions – weddings, graduations, babies and puppies! I am looking forward to spending more time with you all. There are no words to adequately express my love and gratitude to my husband John Hornblow. Thank you for all you have contributed in the way of meals and cups of tea, reality checks, encouragement, the odd stern word, and a total commitment to supporting me in my research every step of the way. I could not have done this without you.

This thesis is dedicated to my parents, Molly and Alan Earl, with love and thanks for their gift of music to me.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ......................................................................................................................i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ............................................................................................ii
TABLE OF CONTENTS ................................................................................................v
LIST OF TABLES .........................................................................................................ix
CHAPTER ONE  INTRODUCTION ...........................................................................1
  1.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................1
  1.2 Context for the Study ...................................................................................1
  1.3 Origins of the Study .....................................................................................3
  1.4 The Study .....................................................................................................4
  1.5 My Own Story ..............................................................................................6
  1.6 Outline of the Thesis ....................................................................................8
CHAPTER TWO RESEARCH ON TEACHERS AND TEACHING.....................11
  2.1 Introduction ................................................................................................11
  2.2 An Historical Overview .............................................................................12
  2.3 Contemporary Research on Teachers ........................................................15
    2.3.1 The centrality and complexity of teachers’ work ....................................15
    2.3.2 The personal/professional nature of teachers’ work ...............................18
    2.3.3 The emotional and caring nature of teaching ........................................20
    2.3.4 Accessing teachers’ voices ......................................................................25
  2.4 Teachers’ Work and Curriculum ................................................................27
    2.4.1 Conceptions of curriculum ......................................................................28
  2.5 Chapter Summary ......................................................................................31
CHAPTER THREE RESEARCH ON ARTS AND MUSIC EDUCATION...........33
  3.1 Introduction ................................................................................................33
  3.2 Arts and Music Curricula ...........................................................................33
    3.2.1 Music in the New Zealand curriculum ....................................................34
    3.2.2 Implementing The Arts in the New Zealand Curriculum .......................37
  3.3 The Place of the Arts and Music in the Curriculum ..................................40
  3.4 Teacher Leadership ....................................................................................48
    3.4.1 Subject leadership in schools ....................................................................48
    3.4.2 Music leadership in schools ......................................................................50
CHAPTER FOUR METHODOLOGY

4.1 Introduction................................................................................................69
4.2 Research Approaches.................................................................................69
  4.2.1 Qualitative research................................................................................70
4.3 Research Design.........................................................................................75
  4.3.1 An unfolding research design .................................................................75
  4.3.2 Exploring case study ...............................................................................77
  4.3.3 Exploring narrative inquiry.....................................................................79
  4.3.4 Exploring life history ..............................................................................81
4.4 Data Collection and Analysis.....................................................................84
  4.4.1 Interviews................................................................................................85
  4.4.2 Observations............................................................................................86
  4.4.3 Participant Sample ..................................................................................87
  4.4.4 Researcher Perspective............................................................................90
  4.4.5 Data Analysis ........................................................................................90
  4.4.6 Issues of quality ....................................................................................92
  4.4.7 Ethical Considerations and Principles.....................................................95
4.5 Methodology in Action..............................................................................96
  4.5.1 Ethical Approval .....................................................................................96
  4.5.2 Pilot Interview .........................................................................................98
  4.5.3 Participant Selection and Approach ........................................................99
  4.5.4 Conduct of Interviews ...........................................................................103
  4.5.5 Teacher Observations............................................................................105
  4.5.6 Data Analysis ........................................................................................106
  4.5.7 Data source identifiers...........................................................................111
  4.5.8 Writing the thesis ..................................................................................111
4.6 Summary ..................................................................................................112
CHAPTER FIVE WHO ARE THE TEACHERS WHO LEAD MUSIC IN PRIMARY SCHOOLS? ................................................................. 113

5.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................. 113

5.2 The Participants .......................................................................................................................... 113

5.2.1 Bruce ........................................................................................................................................ 114
5.2.2 David ....................................................................................................................................... 114
5.2.3 Fiona ........................................................................................................................................ 115
5.2.4 Ian .......................................................................................................................................... 115
5.2.5 Leanne ..................................................................................................................................... 115
5.2.6 Madeleine .............................................................................................................................. 116
5.2.7 Rosie ...................................................................................................................................... 116
5.2.8 Sue ......................................................................................................................................... 116
5.2.9 Tom ......................................................................................................................................... 116
5.2.10 Will ....................................................................................................................................... 117

5.3 Life Stories ................................................................................................................................ 120

5.3.1 Childhood ............................................................................................................................... 120
5.3.2 Schooling ............................................................................................................................... 121
5.3.3 Community ............................................................................................................................. 123
5.3.4 Teacher Education .................................................................................................................. 124

5.4 Teaching Career ....................................................................................................................... 127

5.4.1 Beginning teaching ................................................................................................................ 127
5.4.2 Changes over time .................................................................................................................. 130
5.4.3 Consolidation and stability .................................................................................................. 131
5.4.4 Extended practice within the school .................................................................................. 133
5.4.5 Music leadership beyond the school .................................................................................. 134

5.5 Connections Between Teachers ............................................................................................. 135

5.5.1 Connections of place .......................................................................................................... 136
5.5.2 Connections over time ......................................................................................................... 141

5.6 Summary .................................................................................................................................. 143

CHAPTER SIX WHAT DO PRIMARY SCHOOL MUSIC LEADERS DO? ..... 145

6.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................. 145

6.2 Tasks and responsibilities ...................................................................................................... 145

6.2.1 Practical classroom and maintenance tasks .................................................................... 148
6.2.2 Specialised practical tasks ................................................................................................. 152
6.2.3 Broad-based leadership and organisational tasks.................................164
6.3 Teachers’ musical skills, knowledge and understanding............................167
6.4 Patterns in Primary School Music Leaders’ Work....................................170
  6.4.1 Relationships.....................................................................................171
  6.4.2 Congruence of personal and professional roles.................................171
  6.4.3 Care for and stewardship of music....................................................173
6.5 Summary ...............................................................................................174

CHAPTER SEVEN WHAT IS THE SIGNIFICANCE OF PRIMARY SCHOOL
MUSIC LEADERS’ WORK? .............................................................................177
7.1 Introduction............................................................................................177
7.2 The Value and Significance of Music to Participants...............................178
  7.2.1 Direct benefits to participants ............................................................178
  7.2.2 Vicarious benefits to participants.......................................................181
7.3 The Value of Music to Individual Children.............................................183
7.4 The Value of Music to Classes and Groups of Children..........................192
  7.4.1 Musical benefits to groups of children.................................................192
  7.4.2 Additional benefits of music for groups of children............................196
7.5 The Value of Music to Other Teachers....................................................204
7.6 The Value of Music to the School and Wider Community.......................210
7.7 Summary ...............................................................................................219

CHAPTER EIGHT DISCUSSION.....................................................................221
8.1 Introduction............................................................................................221
8.2 Linking Research Questions and Strands...............................................222
  8.2.1 Personal and professional links............................................................222
  8.2.2 The surfaces and depths of primary school music leaders’ work ........224
  8.2.3 Ordinary and profound aspects of music leaders’ work.......................225
8.3 The Dynamic Nature of Primary School Music Leaders’ Work .............226
  8.3.1 Social and musical aspects of primary school music leaders’ work .......226
  8.3.2 Primary school music leaders’ identity...............................................229
  8.3.3 The role of emotion in primary school music leaders’ work ...............233
8.4 The Broad Context of Primary School Music Leaders’ Work .................239
8.5 Primary School Music Leaders’ Work as Community of Practice...........244
  8.5.1 The community of practice framework..............................................245
  8.5.2 Identity and engagement within a community of practice..................247
8.5.3 Renewal within a community of practice..............................................249
8.6 Summary ..................................................................................................250

CHAPTER NINE CONCLUSIONS.................................................................253
9.1 Introduction..............................................................................................253
9.2 Research Findings ..................................................................................253
  9.2.1 Who are the teachers who lead music in their primary schools? .......254
  9.2.2 What do primary school music leaders do? .................................255
  9.2.3 What is the significance of primary school music leaders’ work? ......256
  9.2.4 Limitations of the study ....................................................................257
9.3 Contributions to Knowledge .................................................................259
9.4 Implications for Practice ......................................................................260
9.5 Future Research ....................................................................................262
9.6 Final Thoughts .....................................................................................264

REFERENCES......................................................................................................265
APPENDICES .....................................................................................................283
  Appendix A: Letter to Principal and Board of Trustees requesting access to teacher
  with responsibility for music .............................................................283
  Appendix B: Sample letter granting access .............................................284
  Appendix C: Information sheet for teachers ............................................285
  Appendix D: Consent form for teachers ...................................................288
  Appendix E: Schedule for initial interview with teachers .........................289
  Appendix F: Transcriber confidentiality agreement .................................290
  Appendix G: Authority for the release of tape transcripts .......................291
  Appendix H: Information sheet for parents ............................................292
  Appendix I: Information sheet for students ..........................................294
  Appendix J: Consent form for parents/caregivers and children .................295

LIST OF TABLES
Table 5.1: Summary of participant and school characteristics ....................118
Table 6.1: Summary of primary music leaders’ tasks & responsibilities ........146