Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
UNDERSTANDING THE NATURE AND FUNCTION OF EMPATHY IN SYNCHRONOUS MULTIMEDIA CONFERENCING

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Education

at Massey University, Manawatu,

New Zealand.

Wayne Alan Duncan

2011
ABSTRACT

With the advent of the internet, teachers and learners are reshaping how interaction in distance education occurs. These changes are being further stimulated through the integration of relatively new online collaboration tools such as synchronous multimedia conferencing (SMC). A central and, as yet, not fully explored component of social interaction within this context is the ability to empathise, or interpret the internal frame of another. The importance of the ability to empathise is that it is an essential relational mechanism for effective social interaction and learning. The intent of this research was, therefore, to promote understanding of the nature and function of empathy in synchronous multimedia conferencing (SMC).

The exploratory research undertaken was embedded within a hermeneutic perspective and guided by the hermeneutic lens of Gadamer (1975, 2001). It explored conferencing participants’ heuristic understandings of how they experienced empathy within SMC. Utilising a qualitative case study methodology, participants were engaged within an iterative dialogical research strategy that enabled the development of understandings over time. The purposeful selection of two case studies consisting of two separate distance education classes, were the foci of the investigation. Data were collected from repeated one on one and focus group interviews spread over a six-month period. The strategy enabled participants to reengage with their own and others’ understandings as these developed within a hermeneutic circle approach.

The findings indicated that the participants experienced empathy within SMC and that the salience of those experiences appeared to be related to a number of factors, including respondents’ degree of engagement and the richness of their multimedia conferencing experiences. A wide range of findings related to how participants experienced empathy was presented, representing a range of empathic experiences. The coding of emergent themes that led to the stimulation of participant’s own models of empathy suggested a multifaceted relationship may exist between the participant, the physical environment, and the social environment, bound together through empathic interaction. Several implications were identified from the research and the results were discussed in light of previous research. Future research directions were also discussed along with the contributions to knowledge the research has made.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

To my supervisors, Professor Margaret Walshaw and Dr Ben Kehrwald, I wish to extend my sincere gratitude for their guidance and support. Without your critique, guidance, and support, I am sure the submission of my thesis would not have been possible. A special thank you must also go to Philippa Butler, who provided comprehensive and personalized training in the use of NVivo® software, along with formatting guidance. A significant aspect of my appreciation has been the preparedness of these wonderful people to provide support to me over distance using the technology that I have used for my own investigation.

I wish to thank the participants of this research for their willingness to share their experiences of empathy within SMC. I would also like to acknowledge the additional commitment and challenges they undertook by being prepared to be interviewed via the SMC environment and engaging so actively in the participatory research strategy. Without their contribution to the research over the six-month period our understandings of how conferencing participants experience empathy within SMC would be much poorer. I would also like to thank the Southland Interactive Learning Community (SILC) Principal, participating schools and their staff, and the Massey University Human Ethics Committee for their permission and support in the completion of this research.

To my wife Lynda and children Neryda and Shnece, I love you and thank you for supporting me in the completion of this special dream in my life. Without your constant support and understanding this work would never have been completed.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................... 1

1.1 BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT ......................................................................................................... 1

1.2 SIGNIFICANCE AND RATIONALE FOR THE STUDY ................................................................. 2

1.3 RESEARCH STRATEGY ..................................................................................................................... 4

1.4 DEFINITIONS ...................................................................................................................................... 6
  1.4.1 Distance education ............................................................................................................ 6
  1.4.2 Synchronous multimedia conferencing (SMC) ..................................................................... 6
  1.4.3 Empathy ........................................................................................................................................ 7

1.5 FORESHADOWING THE CONTENTS OF THE THESIS ........................................................................... 8

## CHAPTER 2. LITERATURE REVIEW ........................................................................................... 10

2.1 EMPATHY .......................................................................................................................................... 10

2.2 EMPATHY: A SOCIALLY CONSTRUCTED AND NEGOTIATED PHENOMENON ........................................ 12

2.3 THE NATURE OF EMPATHY AND ITS MANIFESTATIONS ............................................................... 13

2.4 THE FUNCTIONS OF EMPATHY ....................................................................................................... 18

2.5 SIGNIFICANT RESEARCH CONTRIBUTIONS CLOSELY ALIGNED TO THIS THESIS ............................... 23

2.6 EMPATHY IN DISTANCE EDUCATION ............................................................................................. 24
  2.6.1 Transactional distance ....................................................................................................... 25
  2.6.2 Social presence ............................................................................................................... 26
  2.6.3 Cognitive distance ............................................................................................................ 26

2.7 RATIONALE FOR THIS RESEARCH .................................................................................................. 27

2.8 RESEARCH INTENT AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS ............................................................................ 27

2.9 CHAPTER CONCLUSION ................................................................................................................. 28

## CHAPTER 3. METHODOLOGICAL CONSIDERATIONS .......................................................... 30

3.1 ASSUMPTIONS AND RATIONALE FOR THE RESEARCH DESIGN .................................................... 30
  3.1.1 Theoretical underpinnings ................................................................................................. 30

3.2 OUTLINE OF RESEARCH DESIGN .................................................................................................... 33

3.3 RESEARCH METHODS .................................................................................................................... 41
  3.3.1 One on one interview .......................................................................................................... 44
  3.3.2 Focus group interview ........................................................................................................ 46
  3.3.3 Issues relevant to both interview methods .......................................................................... 47

3.4 FIELD NOTES ..................................................................................................................................... 49

3.5 THE ROLE OF THE RESEARCHER .................................................................................................. 49

3.6 SELECTION OF DATA SOURCES ...................................................................................................... 51
  3.6.1 Case study contexts ........................................................................................................... 52
    3.6.1.1 Case Study 1 .............................................................................................................. 52
    3.6.1.2 Case Study 2 .............................................................................................................. 52
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.7 INITIAL SELECTION AND CONTACT PROCEDURE</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8 INTERVIEW PARTICIPATION</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8.1 Research participant involvement in research phases</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9 INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPTIONS</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10 DATA CODING PROCEDURES</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10.1 Phase 1: Auto and manual coding of areas of interest</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10.2 Phase 1: Thematic coding, coding analysis and thematic modelling</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11 DATA ANALYSIS</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.12 QUALITY OF DATA</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.13 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.14 CHAPTER CONCLUSION</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 4. RESULTS</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 HOW DO SYNCHRONOUS MULTIMEDIA CONFERENCING PARTICIPANTS IN THE SECONDARY SECTOR EXPERIENCE THE MANIFESTATIONS OF EMPATHY?</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 Experiencing compassion</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1.1 Phase 1a: Initial one on one interview</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1.2 Phase 1b: Initial focus group interview</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Experiencing encouragement</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.1 Phase 1a: Initial one on one interview</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2.2 Phase 1b: Initial focus group interview</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 Experiencing helping behaviours</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3.1 Phase 1a: Initial one on one interview</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3.2 Phase 1b: Initial focus group interview</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4 Experiencing emotional contagion</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.1 Phase 1a: Initial one on one interview</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4.2 Phase 1b: Initial focus group interview</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5 Technical problems stress and workload</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5.1 Phase 1a: Initial one on one interview</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5.2 Phase 1b: Initial focus group interview</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 HOW DO PARTICIPANTS EXPERIENCE THE FUNCTIONS OF EMPATHY WITHIN SMC?</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 A supportive environment</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1.1 Phase 1a: Initial one on one interview</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1.2 Phase 1b: Initial focus group interview</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 The strengthening of a bond between themselves and others</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.1 Phase 1a: Initial one on one interview</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.2 Phase 1b: Initial focus group interview</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 An ability to predict the behaviours and/or attitudes of others</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.1 Phase 1a: Initial one on one interview</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.2 Phase 1b: Initial focus group interview</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4 A sense of belonging to a group or online community</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.6.8 The synchronous multimedia conferencing model ........................................................... 143
4.6.8.1 Phase 2a: Focus group discussion .................................................................................. 143
4.6.8.2 Phase 2b: One on one respondent validation interviews .................................................. 144
4.6.9 Metaphors for experiencing empathy within SMC ........................................................ 144
4.6.10 Participant models ....................................................................................................... 146
4.6.11 Summary of key findings ............................................................................................. 154
4.7 CHAPTER CONCLUSION ..................................................................................................... 154

CHAPTER 5. DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS ........................................................................... 156
5.1 INTRODUCTION ..................................................................................................................... 156
5.2 HOW DO SYNCHRONOUS MULTIMEDIA CONFERENCING PARTICIPANTS EXPERIENCE THE
MANIFESTATIONS OF EMPATHY? .............................................................................................. 158
5.3 HOW DO PARTICIPANTS EXPERIENCE THE FUNCTIONS OF EMPATHY WITHIN SMC? ............ 161
5.4 EMERGENT THEMES .......................................................................................................... 165
5.5 AN EXPLORATORY MODEL OF EMPATHY WITHIN SMC .................................................... 167
5.6 THE SIGNIFICANCE OF THE HERMENEUTIC CIRCLE TO THE RESEARCH ............................ 171

CHAPTER 6. IMPLICATIONS .................................................................................................... 173
6.1 INTRODUCTION ..................................................................................................................... 173
6.2 IMPLICATIONS FOR CONFERENCING STRATEGIES ............................................................. 174
6.2.1 Implications from Phase 2 ................................................................................................ 180
6.3 IMPLICATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT AND SUPPORT OF EMPATHY ......................... 185
6.4 IMPLICATIONS FOR PROGRAMME DEVELOPERS AND POLICY MAKERS ......................... 187
6.5 RESEARCH IMPLICATIONS SUMMARY ............................................................................. 191
6.6 CONTRIBUTIONS TO KNOWLEDGE ..................................................................................... 193
6.7 STRENGTHS AND LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY ............................................................... 195
6.8 AREAS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH .................................................................................... 197
6.9 CHAPTER SUMMARY ......................................................................................................... 198
6.10 FINAL THOUGHTS .............................................................................................................. 200

REFERENCES .......................................................................................................................... 201

APPENDIX A. SILC PRINCIPAL INFORMATION SHEET .............................................................. 215
APPENDIX B. SILC PRINCIPAL CONSENT FORM ..................................................................... 217
APPENDIX C. INFORMATION SHEET – SCHOOLS ..................................................................... 218
APPENDIX D. TEACHER INFORMATION SHEET ....................................................................... 220
APPENDIX E. TEACHER CONSENT FORM ................................................................................. 223
APPENDIX F. STUDENT INFORMATION SHEET ....................................................................... 224
APPENDIX G. STUDENT CONSENT FORM ............................................................................... 227
APPENDIX H. FOCUS GROUP CONSENT FORM ......................................................................... 228
APPENDIX I. AUTHORITY FOR THE RELEASE OF TRANSCRIPTS ........................................229
APPENDIX J. PRE PHASE 1 – INITIAL SMC CONTACT SCHEDULE .................................230
APPENDIX K. PHASE 1A – ONE ON ONE INTERVIEW SCHEDULE ................................232
APPENDIX L. PHASE 1B – FOCUS GROUP INTERVIEW SCHEDULE ...............................236
APPENDIX M. PHASE 2A – FOCUS GROUP INTERVIEW SCHEDULE ...............................242
APPENDIX N. PHASE 2B – PARTICIPANT VALIDATION INTERVIEW ............................248
APPENDIX O. SCHOOL THANK YOU LETTER ......................................................................257
APPENDIX P. PARTICIPANT THANK YOU LETTER .................................................................258
APPENDIX Q. TRANSCRIPT VOLUMES (WORD COUNT) ..................................................259
APPENDIX R. NVIVO® DATA CODING EXEMPLARS .........................................................260
APPENDIX S. PHASE 1: EMERGENT THEMES: CODING CATEGORIES ............................262
APPENDIX T. PHASE 1: EMERGENT THEME SUMMARIES ............................................263
APPENDIX U. PHASE 2B: RESPONDENT VALIDATION CODING CATEGORIES ................264
APPENDIX V. AUTO CODING VS MANUAL CODING OF AREAS OF INTEREST ............265
APPENDIX W. CODING RELATIONSHIP MODELS (NVIVO®) ............................................266
APPENDIX X. ADOBE CONNECT® SCREEN CAPTURES ....................................................268
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1 Manifestations of empathy ........................................................................................................... 16
Table 2.2 The functions of empathy ............................................................................................................. 22
Table 3.1 Links between the research questions and the research design .................................................. 42
Table 3.2 Overview of the research design .................................................................................................. 43
Table 3.3 Case study participants’ involvement in research phases ........................................................... 56

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1 Overall data gathering approach ................................................................................................. 37
Figure 3.2 Phase 1: Data gathering approach ............................................................................................... 38
Figure 3.3 Phase 2: Data gathering approach ............................................................................................... 39
Figure 4.1 NVivo® emergent theme category modelling for Phase 1 data coding ......................................... 105
Figure 4.2 Emergent themes coded to the participant .................................................................................. 129
Figure 4.3 Emergent themes coded to the physical environment ................................................................. 130
Figure 4.4 Emergent themes coded to the social environment ................................................................. 131
Figure 4.5 The SMC empathy model ........................................................................................................ 132
Figure 4.6 The aeroplane model ................................................................................................................. 148
Figure 4.7 The merry go round ................................................................................................................. 149
Figure 4.8 The keystone ............................................................................................................................. 150
Figure 4.9 The expanding gap .................................................................................................................... 151
Figure 4.10 The venn diagram .................................................................................................................. 152
Figure 4.11 The spider web ........................................................................................................................ 153
Figure 5.1 The synchronous multimedia conferencing empathy model ...................................................... 167