Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
The Past in the Present: A Mixed Methods Evaluation of a Group Intervention for Loneliness and Well-being among Older People

A dissertation presented in partial fulfilment
Of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Clinical Psychology

Massey University
Wellington
New Zealand

Isabelle Miclette
2011
Abstract

Recent research has shown loneliness in old age to be a major risk factor for a variety of deleterious psychological and physiological outcomes, including cognitive decline, progression of Alzheimer’s disease, increased blood pressure, depression, and mortality. However, practical interventions which meet reasonable standards in terms of feasibility and outcome are limited. The main purpose of this study was to develop and evaluate the usefulness of a brief instrumental reminiscence intervention aimed at preventing and alleviating loneliness to increase the well-being of older people.

A mixed methods design allowed the examination of both the impact and process of the intervention, as experienced by four groups of older people living in a retirement facility in New Zealand (N = 17; mean age = 84 years). Loneliness and well-being were assessed over five measurement points with the short form of the Social and Emotional Loneliness Scale for Adults, and Affectometer 2, respectively. Repeated measures analysis of variance, content analysis, and thematic analysis were employed to investigate the participants’ experience of the intervention.

Results showed a high level of satisfaction with the intervention, and provided preliminary evidence for its usefulness over a time period of two months. Loneliness was conceptualised by participants as a normal challenge of life which can be actively addressed by connecting with others in meaningful ways. Learning for participants was located primarily in their experience of the intervention, namely from relationships developed within the groups themselves.

This study offers support for the theory on social and emotional loneliness, substantiates the acceptability and usefulness of practical group interventions to enhance well-being in later life, and highlights the importance of tailoring interventions to the needs and experiences of older people. In light of the emphasis study participants placed on group therapeutic factors as their primary source of learning about coping with loneliness, future interventions could focus on the role of feedback and social comparison in promoting connectedness amongst older people.
Résumé

Des recherches récentes ont démontré que la solitude chez les personnes âgées est un facteur de risque important pour une variété de problèmes psychologiques et physiologiques, y compris le déclin cognitif, la progression de la maladie d’Alzheimer, l’hypertension, la dépression et la mortalité. Cependant, très peu d’interventions concrètes, répondant à des normes raisonnables en termes de faisabilité et d’efficacité, ont été développées. L’objectif principal de cette étude était d’élaborer et d’évaluer l’utilité d’une brève intervention comprenant la rétrospective de vie instrumentale visant à prévenir et à atténuer la solitude en vue d’accroître le bien-être des personnes âgées.

Une conception de méthodes mixtes a permis d’évaluer l’impact et le processus de l’intervention, telle que considérée par quatre groupes de personnes âgées vivant dans une maison de retraite en Nouvelle-Zélande (N = 17, âge moyen = 84 ans). La solitude et le bien-être ont été mesurés sur une échelle de cinq points avec la Social and Emotional Loneliness Scale for Adults (version abrégée), et Affectometer 2, respectivement. Une analyse de la variance à mesures répétées, une analyse de contenu, et une analyse thématique ont été utilisées pour étudier l’expérience de l’intervention par les participants.

Les résultats ont montré un niveau élevé de satisfaction à l’égard de l’intervention, et ont fourni des preuves préliminaires pour son utilité sur une période de deux mois. La solitude a été conceptualisée par les participants comme un défi normal de la vie qui peut être relevé de manière active, en développant des relations interpersonnelles satisfaisantes. L’apprentissage pour les participants était localisé principalement dans leur expérience de l’intervention, à savoir dans les interactions au sein des groupes.

Cette étude supporte la théorie de la solitude sociale et affective, démontre l’utilité des interventions de groupes concrètes en vue d’améliorer le bien-être des personnes âgées, et souligne l’importance d’adapter les interventions psychologiques aux besoins spécifiques des individus et à leurs expériences respectives. L’accent mis par les participants sur les facteurs thérapeutiques de groupe comme source primaire d’apprentissage pour vivre avec la solitude suggère que des futures interventions pourraient porter sur l’importance du feedback et de la comparaison sociale en vue de promouvoir la connexion parmi les personnes âgées.
Dedication

To my father Réjean Miclette,

With love and gratitude for your guidance throughout the duration of this project
Acknowledgements

I attribute the quality of my doctoral thesis to the support and encouragement provided by my three supervisors. First and foremost I offer my sincerest gratitude to my primary supervisor, Professor Janet Leatham, who has guided me throughout my thesis with patience, knowledge, and generosity, whilst giving me freedom to pursue independent work. Thank you for your wisdom, relentless enthusiasm, and for your trust. It has been an honour for me to work under the supervision of Associate Professor Paul Merrick, whose expertise in this area of research proved an invaluable resource for this thesis. Thank you for your generous and judicious advice throughout the research process. Last but not least, I would like to show my gratitude to Dr. Kerry Gibson, who has been a tremendous source of inspiration for both the clinical and qualitative inquiry components of my research. Thank you for your faith in my ability to rise to the occasion and complete the necessary work to move from graduate student to Doctor of Clinical Psychology.

This thesis would not have been possible without the support of a number of colleagues and friends. Special thanks to Louise Woolf for her time and encouraging advice at the outset of this study. I would like to sincerely thank Dr. Beverley Haarhoff for lending me her exemplary thesis, Dr. Richard Fletcher and Dr. Barry McDonald for their statistical advice, Associate Professor Antonia Lyons for useful resources, Professor Ian Evans and Dr. Duncan Babbage for useful comments at my confirmation event, and Professor Stuart Carr for the most inspiring bilingual discussions.

I am indebted to Kirsty Furness, the best friend and co-facilitator I could ever have wished for. I would like to express my gratitude to Mieke Sachsenweger for her friendship and generosity, and to Matt Williams, proof-reader extraordinaire, with whom I look forward to continue working in the future. I would like to acknowledge Sally Gregory, who has been a fantastic research colleague since my undergraduate studies; Kimberly Falconer for her inspirational words; and Helen McMaster for administrative assistance. I also thank Ann Boston, Tony Nicklin, Rachel Hallas, and fellow students in the “Interns Room”, who have been a source of friendship as well as good advice and collaboration.
I gratefully acknowledge the organisations that recognised the importance of this research and provided me with financial support: Massey University for providing me with a Doctoral Scholarship; the HOPE Foundation for Research on Aging for awarding me with a Postgraduate Scholarship; and Massey University Graduate Research School for allowing me to represent Massey University at the 2010 Australasian final of the Three-Minute Thesis Competition.

I owe my deepest gratitude to the seventeen individuals who took part in this study. I will be forever thankful for your kindness, active participation, and for generously sharing some of your life stories with me. Sincere thanks to the management and staff at the Retirement Village, specially Colleen, Debbie, Jo, Chris, and Ernst.

Thank you very much to my examination panel for useful feedback and for making the oral defence a most memorable experience: Associate Professor Fiona Alpass (Massey University), Dr. Nigel George (University of Auckland), and Professor Philippe Cappeliez (University of Ottawa).

Lastly, I would like to thank my family for all their love and encouragement. For my grand-parents Réal and Malvina who taught me the value of family. For my parents, who nurtured and supported me in all my pursuits, including that of moving to the other side of the world to follow my dreams. For my father Réjean, who taught me the value of hard work and attention to detail. For my mother Chantal, who taught me the value of living life with passion. For my sister Josianne and my brother Guillaume who taught me the value of love. For Patrice and Hugo who taught me the value of unconditional friendship. For Margaret, Neville, Aimée and Ben, my New Zealand family. For my cats Luigi and Clémentine whose cuddles and opportunity for nurturance have made this journey ever more enjoyable.

And most of all, for my loving, supportive, flexible, and patient husband Elton. Thank you for your unrelenting love. My study is finished now and I am coming home.
# Table of Contents

ABSTRACT                                                i  
RESUME                                                   ii 
DEDICATION                                                iii 
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS                                         iv 
TABLE OF CONTENTS                                         vi 
LIST OF TABLES                                           x  
LIST OF FIGURES                                          xi  
LIST OF APPENDICES                                      xi  

**Chapter One: Introduction**                               1  
Rationale and Importance of the Current Study            1  
Objectives                                               2  
Organisation of the Thesis                                3  
Terminology                                              4  

**Chapter Two: Review of the Literature**                    5  
Initial Considerations in Understanding Loneliness       5  
Operational Definition of Loneliness                     5  
Theoretical Perspectives on Loneliness                   7  
Psychodynamic Theory                                     7  
Existential Theory                                       8  
Cognitive Theory                                         9  
Interactionist Theory                                    10  
Social and emotional loneliness                          11  
Loneliness in the Current Study                          12  
Who are the Lonely?                                      13  
The Lonely Society                                       13  
Loneliness throughout the Life Course                    15  
Characteristics associated with the Experience of        
Loneliness in Later Life                                 18  
Demographic Factors                                      18  
Age                                                      18  
Gender                                                   19  
Marital status                                           19  
Living situation                                         20  
Socio-economic status                                    20  
Physical and Mental Health                               20  
Loneliness and depression                               22  
Mortality                                                23  
Life Events, Changes, and Losses                         23  
Well-being                                               24  
Well-being in later life                                 25  
Interventions to improve the well-being of older people  27  
Measurement of Loneliness                                29  
Unidimensional Measurement                              29  
Multidimensional Measurement                            29
Interventions aimed at Alleviating Loneliness
Among Older People

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Group Interventions</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaps in Interventions</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Essential elements</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study designs</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcome measurement</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical frameworks</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What Needs to Be Addressed?</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intervention Development and Implementation</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intervention Evaluation</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcome measurement</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study design</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact, process, and outcome</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter Three: The Current Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formulation</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aims</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Questions</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of an Intervention: The Self-Enrichment Course (SEC)</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical Framework</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The contextual adult life span theory for adapting psychotherapy model</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From wisdom to reminiscence</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group Instrumental Reminiscence</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rationale</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanisms of action</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Essential Elements</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main structure</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-help tools and the maintenance of gains</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter Four: Method

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Design</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rationale for Triangulation Mixed Methods Design</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Pragmatic Paradigm</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed Methods</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Researcher and the Audience</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment of Participants</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment Protocol</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial interview</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychological measurement</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final practice exercise</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Summary - The Past in the Present 128

Theme 3: The Meaning of Wisdom 131
  Defining Wisdom 132
  The Age of Experience 134
  Discovering my Wisdom 135
  Summary - The Meaning of Wisdom 137

Theme 4: Managing Loneliness 139
  Coping Strategies 140
  Do Something! 141
  Connecting with Others 143
  Summary - Managing Loneliness 147

Theme 5: Focus on Well-Being 149
  One Day at the Time 150
  Being Able To 151
  A Feeling Inside 153
  Summary - Focus on Well-Being 155

Chapter Seven: Discussion 157

Outline 157
  Summary of Study Aims and Rationale for Interpretation 157
  Summary of Findings 160
    Analysis I 160
      Well-being 160
      Loneliness 161
      Depression 163
      Fluctuations between baselines 163
    Analysis II 166
      Satisfaction and usefulness ratings 166
      Content analysis 167
    Analysis III 172
      Interaction of the main themes 172
  Outcome 173
    How Do the Data Converge? 174
      The notion of time 174
      Coping with loneliness 175
      Group factors 178
      Summary 181
    Contributions to Existing Literature 183
      Theory 183
      Design 184
      Practical considerations for future replication 186

Study Limitations 189
Recommendations for Future Research 190
Conclusion 191

References 193
List of Tables

Table 1 Group Interventions with an Increase in Social Activity or Alleviation of Loneliness among Older People as Primary Objective 33
Table 2 Recent Group Interventions with an Increase in Social Activity or Alleviation of Loneliness among Older People as Primary Objective 37
Table 3 Themes Discussed at Each Session of the Self-Enrichment Course (SEC) and Associated Aims 62
Table 4 Measurement Times, Dates, and Order of Questionnaires 77
Table 5 Cronbach’s Alpha Coefficients for Well-being, Loneliness, and Depression Scores 91
Table 6 Mean Scores and Standard Deviations for Well-being, Loneliness, and Depression 94
Table 7 Pairwise Comparisons of Well-being, Family Loneliness, and Social Loneliness Mean Scores (Contrast of Time 2 with Time 3, 4, and 5) 97
Table 8 Mean Group Ratings of Satisfaction with Each Session and with the Self-Enrichment Course (SEC) Overall 100
Table 9 Primary Coding Scheme for Participants’ Per-Session Feedback (Most Helpful) 101
Table 10 Primary Coding Scheme for Participants’ Per-Session Feedback (Suggestions for Improvement) 102
Table 11 Frequency of Response Types Provided by Participants after Each Session 104
Table 12 Mean Group Ratings on the Usefulness of Specific Aspects of the Self-Enrichment Course (SEC) 105
Table 13 Primary Coding Scheme for Participants’ Overall Feedback on the Self-Enrichment Course (SEC) (Particularly Useful or Interesting) 106
Table 14 Primary Coding Scheme for Participants’ Overall Feedback on the Self-Enrichment Course (SEC) (Suggestions for Improvement) 107
Table 15 Frequency of Response Types Provided by Participants on the Self-Enrichment Course (SEC) Overall 107
List of Figures

**Figure 1** Outline of the current investigation 50

**Figure 2** Model for effects of participating in the Self-Enrichment Course (SEC) 61

**Figure 3** Basic research elements of the current study 69

**Figure 4** Triangulation design: Convergence model used in this study 71

**Figure 5** Number of individuals who expressed their interest at each stage of the recruitment process 74

**Figure 6** Overview of the verbatim schedule at the second individual meeting 79

**Figure 7** Mean scores obtained on the Affectometer 2 (A-2) by all participants over the five measurement points \(N = 17\) 94

**Figure 8** Mean scores obtained on each subscale of the short form of the Social and Emotional Loneliness Scale for Adults (SELSA-S) by all participants over the five measurement points \(N = 17\) 95

**Figure 9** Thematic map showing final five overarching themes and associated sub-themes 110

**Figure 10** Development of the group therapeutic relationship over time in the Self-Enrichment Course (SEC) 179

**Figure 11** Interaction of participants’ experiences of the Self-Enrichment Course (SEC), understandings of loneliness and well-being, and quantitative scores 182

**Figure 12** Summary of the current study in the context of research and practice 191

List of Appendices

Appendix A: The Self-Enrichment Course 213

Appendix B: Advertising Notice 257

Appendix C: Participants Information Sheet 259

Appendix D: Consent Form 261

Appendix E: Montreal Cognitive Assessment (MoCA) 263

Appendix F: Geriatric Depression Scale (GDS) 264

Appendix G: Short Form of the Social and Emotional Loneliness Scale for Adults (SELSA-S) 265

Appendix H: Affectometer 2 (A-2) 266

Appendix I: The Self-Help Booklet (Words of Wisdom) 267

Appendix J: Summary of Findings for Participants 297

Appendix K: Final Thematic Table 299