Cartoons and the new anti-Semitism

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Design

at Massey University
College of Creative Arts
Wellington
New Zealand

Steven W. Smith
2012
Abstract

This thesis examines how the use of the Star of David symbol in cartoons published in the three months following the May 31, 2010 Gaza flotilla incident reflects a global new anti-Semitism. The objective is to identify and examine how particular signifiers in editorial-style cartoons are used to communicate an anti-Semitic message. Over the three-month period immediately following the flotilla incident the mechanical and automatic retrieval method, Google Alerts captured cartoons published internationally on the Internet each day. Roland Barthes’ theory of systematic semiotic analysis was employed to examine visual aspects of cartoons for signs which connoted anti-Semitic messages against a framework of criteria drawn from a synthesis of recognised definitions of anti-Semitism. The research supports claims that a new anti-Semitism has spread into the consciousness of mainstream culture. The research suggests that criticism of Israel via the medium of cartoons can cross the line from legitimate criticism to established anti-Semitic manifestations.
Acknowledgements

Thank you to:

Massey University’s Associate Professor Claire Robinson and Patricia Thomas for their supervision and guidance throughout this thesis,

my parents for their unfailing support,

my young children who sacrificed time with their father during the course of researching and writing,

my cherished wife, Deborah, whose loving sacrifices made the undertaking of this thesis possible.
# Table of contents

Title page ................................................................................................................................. i  
Abstract ................................................................................................................................ ii  
Acknowledgements .............................................................................................................. iii  
Table of contents ................................................................................................................. iv  
List of tables and figures ....................................................................................................... viii  
Notes on spelling and terminology .................................................................................... xix  

## Introduction .................................... 1

The 2010 Gaza flotilla ............................................................................................................. 1  
Cartoons and visual communication ................................................................................. 5  
Chapter outlines .................................................................................................................. 7  

## Chapter 1. Background ........................................ 9

Anti-Semitic cartoons ......................................................................................................... 9  
Traditional anti-Semitism ................................................................................................. 10  
New anti-Semitism ........................................................................................................... 12  
Zionism and the Jewish state ............................................................................................. 15  
Symbols of Jewishness: The Star of David and the Israeli flag ........................................ 19  

## Chapter 2. Research method and processes .......... 23

Objective ............................................................................................................................. 23  
Data-gathering with Google Alerts .................................................................................. 23  
Programming Google Alert keywords ............................................................................... 24  
Selection and gathering process ....................................................................................... 27
Chapter 3. Findings and data analysis

Analysis of cartoons that evidenced concepts identified in the synthesised definition of anti-Semitism

Cartoons that evidenced the concept: Hostile
Cartoons that evidenced the concept: Discrimination
Cartoons that evidenced the concept: Bloodthirsty
Cartoons that evidenced the concept: Demonic
Cartoons that evidenced the concept: Domination
Cartoons that evidenced the concept: Cunning
Cartoons that evidenced the concept: Zoomorphism
Cartoons that evidenced the concept: Holocaust
Cartoons that evidenced the concept: Incitement
Cartoons that evidenced the concept: Nazi
Cartoons that evidenced the concept: Mendacious claim
Cartoons that evidenced the concept: Money
Cartoons that evidenced the concept: Right to self-determination

Summary of findings on the contextual placement of the Star of David signifier

Findings on geographic regions where cartoons were published (in cartoons evidencing definition criteria)

The cartoonists (in cartoons evidencing definition criteria)

Findings on the incidence of flotilla-specific cartoons (in cartoons evidencing definition criteria)
Table of contents

Findings on publishing dates of flotilla-specific cartoons
    (in cartoons evidencing definition criteria) ........................ 128

Chapter 4. Discussion ............................................................. 130

Chapter 5. Conclusion ............................................................... 136
    Conclusions drawn from the research .................................. 136
    Significance and contribution of the research ...................... 139
    Limitations and recommendations for further research .......... 139

References .................................................................................. 142

Internet references of cited cartoon data ................................. 153

Appendices ................................................................................ 163
    Appendix A. European Union Monitoring Centre on Racism
                and Xenophobia. (2005). Working definition of
                Antisemitism ................................................................ 163
    Appendix B. European Union Monitoring Centre on Racism
                and Xenophobia. (2004). Manifestations of
                Antisemitism in the EU 2002–2003 .............................. 166
    Appendix C. European Commission Against Racism and
                No. 9 on the fight against Antisemitism ......................... 167
    Appendix D. Raw data: All cartoons collected during this
                thesis ........................................................................... 169
List of tables and figures

Tables

Table 1. Synthesised definition of anti-Semitism with corresponding descriptions and potential visual manifestations ................................................................. 33

Table 2. Consolidated definition categories with corresponding evoked concepts (Barthes’ *signified*) ..... 37

Table 3. Overview on findings: Number of cartoons evidencing concepts from the synthesised definition of anti-Semitism ................................................................. 50

Table 4. Findings on the concept: Hostile ............................................ 52

Table 5. Findings on the concept: Discrimination ............................... 61

Table 6. Findings on the concept: Bloodthirsty ................................. 67

Table 7. Findings on the concept: Demonic ........................................ 72

Table 8. Findings on the concept: Domination .................................... 79

Table 9. Findings on the concept: Cunning ......................................... 86

Table 10. Findings on the concept: Zoomorphism ............................... 89

Table 11. Findings on the concept: Holocaust ..................................... 96

Table 12. Findings on the concept: Incitement .................................... 98

Table 13. Findings on the concept: Nazi .............................................. 102
Table 14. Findings on the concept: Mendacious claim .............. 109

Table 15. Findings on the concept: Money ................................. 115

Table 16. Findings on the concept: Right to self-determination ............................................................. 116

Table 17. Geographic region source of cartoons that evidenced definition concepts ......................................... 123

Table 18. The cartoonists who created the cartoons that evidenced definition concepts ......................................... 125

Figures

Figure 1. Arch of Titus, c. 82 AD, Rome. New Vilna Review,
newvilnareview.com .............................................................. 16

Figure 2. State of Israel emblem. Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs, mfa.gov.il ................................................................. 16

Figure 3. Solomon’s Seal on a 4th century synagogue, Galilee, Israel. From Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs,
mfa.gov.il ............................................................................... 20

Figure 4. Five-pointed pentagram known as the Seal of Solomon ............................................................................... 20

Figure 5. Six-pointed hexagram known as the Star of David ...... 20

Figure 6. Zionist flag, adopted in 1897, Basel. Herzl Museum,
herzl.org ............................................................................... 21

Figure 7. State of Israel flag, adopted in 1948 ............................ 21

Figure 8. Jewish prayer shawl (tallit). Galilee Experience,
thegalileeexperience.com ........................................................ 21

Figure 9. Google Alerts setup page showing choice fields ......... 24
Figure 10. *Atilim* newspaper, June 6, 2010, Turkey. Cartoon by Carlos Latuff (Brazil) .......................................................... 25

Figure 11. *Palestine Think Tank* blog, June 1, 2010, Bahrain. Cartoon by Steve Bell (UK) .......................................................... 25

Figure 12. *TIME* magazine, June 19, 2010, USA. Cartoon by Nate Beeler ................................................................. 26

Figure 13. The 25 Google Alerts created for this study ................... 26

Figure 14. Google Alert email featuring 18 URL links, each with potential raw data ..................................................... 28

Figure 15. Roland Barthes’ systematic model of visual semiotic analysis ................................................................................. 30

Figure 16. Example of Barthian application using the definition concept: *Hostile* ................................................................. 38

Figure 17. Total number of cartoons gathered, by Google Alert keywords .............................................................................. 40

Figure 18. Acquired via Google Alert *israel cartoon. Palestine Think Tank* blog, June 1, 2010, Bahrain. By Steve Bell (UK) .............................................................................. 41

Figure 19. Acquired via Google Alert *israel cartoon. Yechiel Offner* website, August 1, 2010, Israel. By Yechiel Offner ................................................................................... 41

Figure 20. Acquired via Google Alert free *gaza flotilla. Karmalised* blog, June 5, 2010, USA. By Mike Keefe ...... 42

Figure 21. Total number of cartoons gathered, by geographic region source ................................................................. 43

Figure 22. Total number of cartoons gathered, by Internet media type .............................................................................. 43
Figure 23. The Star of David .......................................................... 44

Figure 24. The number of cartoons that contained the Star of David .......................................................... 44

Figure 25. The official Israeli flag .......................................................... 45

Figure 26. Israeli flag with a Nazi swastika replacing the Star of David. *Al-Watani al Youm* newspaper, June 15, 2010, Egypt .......................................................... 45

Figure 27. Findings on the Star of David data set .................. 45

Figure 28. Overview on findings: Ratio of Star of David to Israeli flag instances per concept from the synthesised definition of anti-Semitism .......... 51

Figure 29. *Al-Watan* newspaper, June 21, 2010, Qatar. In Arabic: “Gaza” .......................................................... 52

Figure 30. *The Buffalo News* newspaper, June 4, 2010, USA. By Adam Zyglis .......................................................... 53

Figure 31. *Association of American Editorial Cartoonists* website, June 1, 2010, USA. By Deb Milbrath .................. 54

Figure 32. *The Hindu* newspaper, June 2, 2010, India. By Amina Wasif .......................................................... 54

Figure 33. *The Register Mail* newspaper, June 1, 2010, USA. By Dave Granlund .......................................................... 55

Figure 34. *Daily Kos* blog, July 6, 2010, USA. By Stuart Carlson .......................................................... 56

Figure 35. *Al-Watan* newspaper June 1, 2010, Oman. In Arabic on the sign: “Free Gaza”, and on the ship: “Freedom convoy” .......................................................... 56
Figure 36. *Ruz-al-Yusuf* newspaper, June 20, 2010, Egypt. By Mostafa Salem. In Arabic: “Where are all the stones you have, you terrorist?” ................................................... 57

Figure 37. *AfriCartoons* website, June 3, 2010, South Africa. By Brandan Reynolds .............................................................. 58

Figure 38. *The Times* newspaper, June 24, 2010, South Africa. By Jeremy Nell .......................................................................... 59

Figure 39. *Zazzle.com* web banner, June 1, 2010, USA. By Carlos Latuff (Brazil) ...................................................................... 60

Figure 40. *The Palestinian Times* newspaper, July 25, 2010, West Bank ................................................................. 61

Figure 41. Nazi-era Jewish star badges. History in chronology, geschichteinchronologie.ch .................................................. 62

Figure 42. Nazi stereotype of a Jew. *Ministry for Public Enlightenment and Propaganda*, Spring/Summer, 1943. In German: “He bears the guilt for the war!” (Herf, 2006) ................................................................. 62

Figure 43. Nazi-era Jewish star, France. History in chronology, geschichteinchronologie.ch .................................................... 62

Figure 44. Nazi-era Jewish star armband, Warsaw. History in chronology, geschichteinchronologie.ch ...................................... 63

Figure 45. *Dollops of Irony* website, June 4, 2010, Brazil. By Pete Pasho ................................................................. 63

Figure 46. Nazi-era Jewish star armbands. History in chronology, geschichteinchronologie.ch .................................................. 64

Figure 47. *Al-Watan* newspaper, June 21, 2010, Qatar. By Elie Saliba (Lebanon). In Arabic: “The criminal”, and “The judge” ................................................................. 64

Figure 49. *Daryl Cagle Political Cartoons* website, August 27, 2010, USA. By Stéphane Perray (Thailand) ..................... 65

Figure 50. *La Métropole* newspaper, July 10, 2010, Canada. By Serge Métyvié. In French: “A taxi transformed into a ... synagogue?” “David’s taxi www.cheapcheap.com”, “Come in! May God be with you” ............................... 66

Figure 51. Ritual murder by Jews fresco, Sandomierz Cathedral, 1656 AD, Poland (Kotek, 2009) ......................................... 67

Figure 52. Wood engraving depicting Jews sucking blood from a child, 1900 AD, Poland (Kotek, 2009) .................. 67

Figure 53. *BackseatBlogger.com* blog, August 24, 2010, USA. By Omayya Joha (Gaza) ........................................................... 68

Figure 54. *CafePress* website, June 1, 2010, UK. By Carlos Latuff (Brazil) ....................................................................... 68

Figure 55. *Stop de Bezetting* website, July 9, 2010, Belgium. By Ben Heine ............................................................................. 70

Figure 56. *Daily Kos* blog, June 7, 2010, USA. By Emad Hajjaj (Jordan) ................................................................. 71

Figure 57. *NewsReal* blog, July 25, 2010, USA .......................... 72

Figure 58. *Sabbah Report* blog, July 18, 2010, Bahrain. By Matías Tolsà (Spain) ................................................................. 73

Figure 59. *Diario Vea* newspaper, June 8, 2010, Venezuela. In Spanish: “With the Football World Cup, the massacre will be forgotten” ........................................... 74

Figure 60. Illustration on a tax roll, 1233 AD, Norfolk, England. The National Archives, nationalarchives.gov.uk .......... 74
Figure 61. *Ruz-al-Yusuf* newspaper, June 2, 2010, Egypt. By Abdul Rahman. In Arabic: “Israel attacks the Freedom flotilla”, and “I don’t understand why people are concerned, this is what I do, I kill innocents and nobody questions me!” ................................................................. 75

Figure 62. *Girgir* magazine (No. 23), June 2, 2010, Turkey. By Mehmet Ilhan. In Turkish: “What’s onboard?!” “Humanitarian Aid material ...” “I want some rabies medicine!” ................................................................. 76

Figure 63. *Penguem* magazine (No. 402), June 3, 2010, Turkey. In Turkish: “Before humanity attacks!” ........................................ 77

Figure 64. *Albalad* newspaper, June 2, 2010, Lebanon. By Stavro Jabra .................................................................................. 78

Figure 65. A 1898 AD illustration from French magazine, *Le Rire.* (Herf, 2006) ................................................................. 78

Figure 66. *South Lebanon* blog, June 22, 2010, Lebanon .......... 80

Figure 67. *Asterix and The Actress.* (Uderzo, 2002) ................. 80

Figure 68. *Reich Ministry for Propaganda and Public Enlightenment,* Summer, 1941, Germany (Herf, 2006). In German: “Jewish conspiracy against Europe!” (Herf, 2006) ............ 80

Figure 69. *Der Semit* magazine, July 3, 2010, Germany. By Carlos Latuff (Brazil). In German: “The Israel Lobby” ................................................................. 81

Figure 70. *Nazi Ministry for Public Enlightenment and Propaganda,* Spring/Summer, 1943, Germany. In German: “Behind enemy powers: The Jew”. (Herf, 2006) ........... 82

Figure 71. *Al-Ahram* newspaper, August 19, 2010, Egypt. By Gomaah Farahat ................................................................. 82
Figure 72.  *Al-Watan* newspaper, July 1, 2010, Qatar. By Elie Saliba (Lebanon) ........................................................................................................83

Figure 73.  Wikipedia logo, *en.wikipedia.org* .................................................. 83

Figure 74.  *Robert Lindsay* blog, August 27, 2010, USA ................................. 84

Figure 75.  *Pacific Free Press* blog, August 20, 2010, Canada .......................... 84

Figure 76.  CNN logo, *cnn.com* ...................................................................... 84

Figure 77.  Dollops of Irony website, July 11, 2010, Brazil. By Pete Pasho .......................................................... 85

Figure 78.  From Dr Kurt Plischke’s 1935 publication, *The Jew as race defiler: An accusation against Judah and a warning to German women and girls.* (Herf, 2006) ................ 85

Figure 79.  Figure 80.  *Von den Juden und jren lügen “On the Jews and their lies.” Germany, 1543 AD. A pamphlet by Martin Luther. (Herf, 2006) ................................................ 86

Figure 80.  *Al-Ahram* newspaper, July 22, 2010, Egypt. By Fathi Abouelezz .......................................................... 87

Figure 81.  *Uncensored* magazine, June 9, 2010, New Zealand. By Carlos Latuff (Brazil) .......................................................... 87

Figure 82.  *Holocartoons.com* website, June 1, 2010, Iran. By M Bijani and B Bitaraf .......................................................... 88

Figure 83.  *Al-Watani al Youm* newspaper, June 15, 2010, Egypt. By Carlos Latuff (Brazil) .......................................................... 89

Figure 84.  *The Week* newspaper, June 1, 2010, USA. By Emad Hajjaj (Jordan) .......................................................... 90

Figure 85.  *Al-Watan* newspaper, June 2, 2010, Qatar. By Elie Saliba (Lebanon). In Arabic: “The terrorist state” ......................... 91
Figure 86. *Ruz-al-Yusuf* newspaper, June 1, 2010, Egypt. 
In Arabic: “Aid”, and “Gaza” ................................. 91

Figure 87. *Tlaxcala* blog, June 8, 2010, Spain. By Hana Hajjar (Saudi Arabia) ................................................................. 92

Figure 88. *Expresso* newspaper, June 4, 2010, Portugal. By Rodrigo ................................................................. 92

Figure 89. *Suzanne Carter* blog, July 7, 2010, New Zealand .......... 92

Figure 90. *Mail & Guardian* newspaper, June 3, 2010, South Africa. By Jonathan Shapiro .............................................. 93

Figure 91. French caricature of Baron James Rothschild. *Musée des Horreurs* (Freak Show) No. 44 poster, c. 1890s.
By V. Lenepveu. The Alfred Dreyfus Collection, Johns Hopkins University, library.jhu.edu ........................................ 94

Figure 92. *Al-Watan* newspaper, July 2, 2010, Qatar. By Elie Saliba (Lebanon). In Arabic: “Lebanon”, and “Spy” .................. 94

Figure 93. *Arab News* newspaper, July 13, 2010, Saudi Arabia. By Amjed Rasmi ................................................................. 95

Figure 94. *Ruz-al-Yusuf* newspaper, June 15, 2010, Egypt. In Arabic: “Censure, condemnation, deprecation ... I became tired”, and “Israeli piracy” ....................... 95

Figure 95. *Holocartoons.com* website, June 1, 2010, Iran. By Maziar Bijani and Borzo Bitaraf .............................................. 97

Figure 96. *Holocartoons.com* website, June 1, 2010, Iran. By Maziar Bijani and Borzo Bitaraf .............................................. 97

Figure 97. *Twitpic* website, July 29, 2010, USA. By Carlos Latuff (Brazil) ................................................................. 99

Figure 98. *Dollops of Irony* website, June 25, 2010, Brazil. By Pete Pasho ................................................................. 100
Figure 99. *Al-Ahram* newspaper, June 17, 2010, Egypt. By Gomaah Farahat ................................................................. 100

Figure 100. *Al-Ahram* newspaper, June 17, 2010, Egypt. By Osama Qassem ................................................................. 101

Figure 101. *Tlaxcala* blog, July 8, 2010, Spain. By Nedal Hashem (West Bank) ................................................................. 102

Figure 102. *Al-Qassam* blog, August 2, 2010, West Bank ................. 103

Figure 103. Nazi Party and German state flag, 1935. Live Auctioneers, liveauctioneers.com .................................................. 103

Figure 104. *Muslim Public Affairs Committee UK* blog, July 16, 2010, UK ................................................................. 104

Figure 105. *PNGOF* blog, July 9, 2010, West Bank. By Carlos Latuff (Brazil) ................................................................. 105

Figure 106. *Aporrea* newspaper, June 3, 2010, Venezuela. In Spanish: “Israel. Pirate and murderer”, and “Boycott Coca-Cola and any product that has to do with Israel” ................................................... 106

Figure 107. *New Times San Luis Obispo* newspaper, June 10, 2010, USA. By Russell Hodin ................................................ 107

Figure 108. Nazi helmet. German-Helmets online reference guide, german-helmets.com .................................................. 107

Figure 109. Israeli Defense Forces helmet. Israeli Defence Forces combatants gallery, dover.idf.il ........................................ 107

Figure 110. *Tlaxcala* blog, June 8, 2010, Spain. By Abdul Aziz Al Adwan (Saudi Arabia) ................................................... 108

Figure 111. *Info-Wars.org* blog, July 26, 2010, Ireland. By Carlos Latuff (Brazil) ................................................................. 110
Figure 112. *Mail Today* newspaper, June 3, 2010, India. By R. Prasad ................................................................. 111

Figure 113. *Holocartoons.com* website, June 1, 2010, Iran. By Maziar Bijani and Borzo Bitaraf ........................................ 112

Figure 114. The corpses of Holocaust victims at Dachau concentration camp, Germany, May, 1945. United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, ushmm.org ................................. 112

Figure 115. *Shoah The Palestinian Holocaust* blog, August 9, 2010, UK. By Pat Oliphant (American) .............................. 113

Figure 116. *Zazzle.com* web banner, June 1, 2010, USA. By Carlos Latuff (Brazil) ........................................................ 114

Figure 117. *Europa Network* blog, August 18, 2010, Norway ........ 115

Figure 118. *Dollops of Irony* blog, June 2, 2010, Brazil. By Pete Pasho .............................................................................. 117

Figure 119. *Sabbah Report* blog, June 9, 2010, Bahrain. By Ben Heine (Belgium) ............................................................ 117

Figure 120. Contextual placement (form) of the solus Star of David signifier (for cartoons that evidenced definition concepts) ................................................................. 119

Figure 121. Contextual placement (form) of the Israeli flag signifier (for cartoons that evidenced definition concepts) ...................................................................................... 119

Figure 122. Comprehensive findings on the contextual placement (form) of the solus Star of David signifier, in relation to the definition concepts ............................................ 120

Figure 123. Comprehensive findings on the contextual placement (form) of the Israeli flag signifier, in relation to the definition concepts ................................................. 121
Figure 124. How findings on forms, concepts and signifiers were appropriated to the Barthian model ............................... 122

Figure 125. Cartoons containing flotilla-specific content, by geographic region source (for cartoons that evidenced definition concepts) ....................................... 127

Figure 126. Cartoons with and without flotilla-specific content (for cartoons that evidenced definition concepts) ........ 128
Notes on spelling and terminology

Anti-Semitism: The thesis applies the spelling, anti-Semitism or Anti-Semitism where appropriate. Where quotations and titles of works render the term differently, typically without the hyphen (Antisemitism), the quoted text’s spelling is retained.

Cartoon: This term encompasses political cartoons, editorial cartoons and satirical cartoons, in any static form of two-dimensional visual art, photography, illustration or composite.

Gaza Strip: The geographic territory officially known as the Gaza Strip is rendered Gaza, following colloquial usage.

Jews: To limit lengthy descriptors such as “Jewish people”, the term Jew or Jews is generally applied. It is acknowledged that the terms, Jew and Jews may have colloquially derogatory usage. This is not the intention and apologies are offered in advance.