Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
The Link between Customer Profitability in Business-to-Business Markets and the Nature of Business Relationships

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
in
Marketing

Massey University
Wellington Campus

Ravi Balasubramanian

2012
Abstract

Empirical studies on customer profitability in business markets have reported wide profitability variation and a skewed distribution, typically a small number of very profitable customers and a much larger number that are marginally profitable or unprofitable. While some studies have attempted to investigate the contribution of financial factors to this pattern, the contribution to customer profitability of non-financial factors, such as the nature of business relationships, has received very little attention. This gap exists despite the wide acceptance amongst practitioners of the importance of business relationship development with customers and of business relationships as a field of academic research. Business relationship development efforts are made with an expectation that they will result in improved financial results, but academic research has not established this based on objective financial measures of customer profitability.

To investigate whether a link exists between business relationships and customer profitability, it was hypothesised that multiple facets of the business relationship should be represented and may necessitate adopting constructs from different theoretical frameworks. Thus the proposed theoretical model used behavioural and cognitive constructs based on relationship connectors, environment factors, communication quality, communication quantity, conflict, customer characteristics and commitment. The customer profitability measures were based on traditional financial data but were extended to include imputed costs of other resource usage such as delayed payments, documentation costs and shipment to multiple destinations. Since the research required matching customer profitability measured as a financial outcome with the nature of the business relationship with each customer, data was obtained from a single participating organisation.

Relevance of the proposed theoretical constructs to the context of the participating organisation was checked through a qualitative investigation using in-depth interviews with key informants. The subsequent quantitative
study used an online survey instrument to obtain data from the organisation’s sales persons on the nature of the relationships with customers. Financial data for computing individual customer’s profitability was obtained from relevant company records.

Structural Equation Modelling was used to test and estimate the theorised relationships between constructs. Confirmatory factor analyses revealed the need to make some changes to the original model, but the constructs in the final model demonstrated good discriminant validity. The good fit of the proposed theoretical model to the actual data confirmed the relevance of constructs used in the theoretical model to represent the multifaceted nature of business relationships.

The main finding of this research is that commitment to a business relationship with customers is adversely affected by customer profitability factors. An increase of 1 standard deviation in customer profitability variation factors results in a reduction in commitment levels of 0.28 standard deviation units. In this study, customer profitability factors are represented by four indicators: customer profit value, cost of goods, documentation cost and number of destinations. This construct reflects the relative impact of the revenue and cost indicators on individual customer profitability.

Commitment plays a central role in linking the constructs representing the nature of business relationships and customer profitability factors. The indicators for commitment assessed expectations of continuity in a relationship and whether expected benefits were realised, and these represent the affective and calculative dimensions of commitment described in the literature. The calculative dimension reflects the expectation of economic returns as a result of commitment to a relationship. Reduction in profits from the customer will adversely affect the calculative dimension and may account for the negative value for the link with customer profitability factors. On the other hand, the affective dimension of commitment reflects the attitudes and beliefs and generalised regard about the relationship and can be linked to efforts to build the business relationship. The nature of the business relationship comprises
four constructs; relationship connectors, communication quality, communication quantity and conflict, and represents facets of how a relationship is viewed; this may account for its link with commitment.

Environment factors, which include competition and market price fluctuations for the product categories, represent the main set of factors outside the control of the firm and have an impact on revenue as well as commitment to the relationship with customers. The contribution of price changes to revenue and profitability represents an additional element in determining customer profitability. In this study, substantial price increases from products sold to the top decile customers helped offset cost increases and improved the profitability of these customers.

From a practitioner’s perspective, the main utility of these findings lies in the importance of integrating customer profitability measures in relationship development efforts. For a more accurate assessment of returns, customer profitability measures should go beyond normal accounting data and include estimates of other resource usage such as documentation costs. Such improved customer profitability measures can help in differentiating customers based on objective outcomes and provide a basis for developing customer portfolios with appropriate relationship development strategies. The differentiation would also imply that commitment to a business relationship has to be contingent on obtaining the expected financial return from the business relationship.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Professor Philip Gendall for his invaluable guidance at every stage, starting with my preliminary ideas on possible research topics to completion of this thesis. His support and advice during the rough patches helped me to stay on this long journey.

I would also like to thank Professor Paul Dunmore for his valuable help in facilitating the agreement between Massey University and the participating firm as well as advice on the financial aspects of this study.

My thanks to various persons in the firm that agreed to participate in this study. Their co-operation enabled me to get access to all relevant data. Without this willing participation it would not have been possible to research this topic.

My gratitude to Massey University for the assistance provided through the Advanced Degree Award. The relief from teaching responsibilities were of great assistance in making significant progress.

A special note of appreciation for the support and encouragement received from my family. Jayshree, thanks for your help in formatting the thesis as well drawing some of the diagrams in Visio.
Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................ i
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................... iv
Table of Contents ........................................................................................................................ v
List of Figures .......................................................................................................................... viii
List of Tables ............................................................................................................................ ix

Chapter 1 Introduction .......................................................................................................... 1
  1.1 Background to Research ....................................................................................... 1
  1.2 Research Question ............................................................................................ 4
  1.3 Thesis Structure ............................................................................................... 6
  1.4 Summary ............................................................................................................. 7

Chapter 2 Customer Profitability .......................................................................................... 9
  2.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................... 9
  2.2 Overview - Financial Concepts in Marketing Literature ...................................... 9
  2.3 Customer Profitability – Relevance to Marketing .............................................. 12
  2.4 Customer Profitability - Definition ..................................................................... 14
  2.5 Customer Profitability – Measurement Approaches ........................................... 16
  2.6 Empirical Research - Customer Profitability in Marketing Literature.............. 20
  2.7 Influence of Non-financial Factors on Customer Profitability ......................... 27
  2.8 Conclusions ........................................................................................................ 29

Chapter 3 Theoretical Frameworks for Investigating Business Relationships ............ 30
  3.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................ 30
  3.2 Business Relationships and Marketing ............................................................... 31
  3.3 The Appropriate Theoretical Framework for Business Relationships Research 39
  3.4 Measurement of Relationship Outcomes ............................................................ 44
  3.5 Conclusions ........................................................................................................ 45

Chapter 4 Synthesis - Customer Profitability and Business Relationships Literature .... 46
  4.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................ 46
  4.2 Background ........................................................................................................ 46
  4.3 Relationship Connectors ..................................................................................... 49
  4.4 Communication – Quantity and Quality ............................................................. 53
  4.5 Commitment ....................................................................................................... 57
  4.6 Conflict ............................................................................................................... 59
  4.7 Customer Factors ............................................................................................. 60
  4.8 Environment Factors ......................................................................................... 64
  4.9 Customer Profitability Factors ............................................................................ 67
List of Figures

Figure 3-1: Theoretical Frameworks in Relationship Marketing Research ................................. 32
Figure 4-1: Constructs in Theoretical Model ........................................................................... 49
Figure 4-2: Proposed Links - Business Relationship and Customer Profitability .................... 69
Figure 5-1: Contribution to Profit by Number of Customers ................................................... 88
Figure 5-2: Cumulative Contribution to Gross Sales and Customer Profitability .................... 89
Figure 7-1: Customer Profitability Model ............................................................................. 143
Figure 7-2: Proposed Links - Business Relationship and Customer Profitability ................... 145
Figure 7-3: Constructs and Indicators in the Customer Profitability Model ........................... 156
Figure 7-4: Customer Profitability Model CP2 ...................................................................... 160
Figure 7-5: Model CP3- Two Factor Model for Customer Profitability .................................. 164
Figure 7-6: Model CP4- Pruned Two Factor Customer Profitability Model .......................... 165
Figure 7-7: Main Constructs .............................................................................................. 166
Figure 7-8: Measurement model for business relationships .................................................. 169
Figure 7-9: Updated Theoretical Model ............................................................................... 174
Figure 7-10: Structural Model with Standardised Parameter Estimates ................................. 178
Figure 7-11: α and β Error Probability Distribution ............................................................. 183
Figure 8-1: Structural model with standardised parameter estimates ..................................... 190
Figure P-1: Complete Structural Model ................................................................................ 264
List of Tables

Table 2-1: Main Findings of Empirical Research into Customer Profitability ..................... 21
Table 3-1: Research by Palmatier and others on Various Facets of Business Relationships .... 41
Table 4-1: Summary- Hypothesised Relationship between Constructs ............................... 68
Table 5-1: Customer Profitability Models ........................................................................... 77
Table 5-2: Customer Decile Contribution to Profit .............................................................. 89
Table 5-3: Dispersion in Sales and Customer Profitability in other Studies ....................... 90
Table 5-4: Impact of Sales on Gross Margin and Customer Profitability ............................ 91
Table 5-5: Contribution by Product Group ......................................................................... 92
Table 5-6: Frequency of Number of Product Groups Purchased ....................................... 93
Table 5-7: Gross Sales Share (%) Spread by Product Group .............................................. 94
Table 5-8: Contribution of Price Increase by Customer Deciles ......................................... 94
Table 5-9: Contribution (%) to Overall Gain from Price Increase ..................................... 95
Table 5-10: Contribution of Price Increase by Product Group .......................................... 96
Table 5-11: Increase in COGS by Product Group ............................................................... 98
Table 5-12: Price and Cost Increases by Product Group ..................................................... 98
Table 5-13: Transaction Frequency ................................................................................... 103
Table 5-14: Order Processing Cost as a % of Gross Sales ................................................ 105
Table 5-15: Summary of Key Determinants of Customer Profitability ............................... 107
Table 5-16: Correlations of Selected Financial and Transaction Parameters ..................... 109
Table 5-17: Bivariate Correlations using Actual Dollar Values ......................................... 111
Table 6-1: Theoretical Model Variables and Corresponding Questions in Survey Instrument 124
Table 6-2: Duration of Business Interaction ..................................................................... 130
Table 6-3: Items with Neutral Response ........................................................................... 132
Table 6-4: Commitment to the Relationship ..................................................................... 134
Table 6-5: Benefits Realised from the Business Relationship .......................................... 135
Table 6-6: Cronbach Alpha Values for Scales in the Theoretical Model .............................. 136
Table 6-7: Correlation Matrix of Main Relationship Constructs ....................................... 139
Table 7-1 : Variables in the Customer Profitability Model .................................................. 142
Table 7-2 : Nature of linkages between Constructs ........................................................... 144
Table 7-3: Hypothesised Relationship between Constructs .............................................. 146
Table 7-4: Transformations for Financial Data .................................................................. 153
Table 7-5: Overview- Customer Profitability Measurement Model Modification .............. 158
Table 7-6: AVE and Shared Variances of Model 4 ............................................................ 162
Table 7-7: Model CP3- AVE and Construct Reliability Estimates .................................... 164
Table 7-8: Model 7- AVE and Construct Reliability Estimates .......................................... 165
Table 7-9: Model BR1- Parameter Estimates, AVE and Construct Reliability .................. 170
Table 7-10: Model BR1- AVE and Shared Variances ......................................................... 172
Table 7-11: Updated Hypotheses of Links between Constructs ........................................ 175