Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Cognitive Structure and Development
in the
Education of Poetic Appreciation:

A Theoretical and Clinical Investigation

A thesis presented in partial
fulfilment of the requirements for the degree
of Doctor of Philosophy
in Education at
Massey University

John Albert Codd
1980
ABSTRACT

The development of poetic appreciation is investigated by combining philosophical analysis with Piagetian-type interviews in order to argue a general case for the fundamental importance of knowledge and the emergence of cognitive abilities in the education of artistic appreciation. Coleridge's poem, "The Rime of the Ancient Mariner" is used as the object of appreciation for a series of clinical interviews involving 30 subjects, 10 at each of three different age-levels: 9½ - 10 year olds; 11½ - 12 year olds; 13½ - 14½ year olds. Illuminative protocols are drawn from these interviews to illustrate various aspects of the educational theory that is advanced. This theory draws upon recent research and writings in the philosophy of art, literary criticism and developmental psychology as these relate to curriculum problems in the appreciation of art and literature. The educational implications of the argument are then synthesized into a tentative theoretical framework for the teaching of poetic appreciation.

The rejection of positivism and recent moves towards epistemological pluralism are used to support the claim that artistic appreciation, no less than science, is a domain of public knowledge characterized by critical enquiry, objective canons, and concepts shared within a socio-cultural tradition. It is contended that because appreciation presupposes an interpretation which entails "seeing" works of art and literature under an appropriate aspect and in correct relationship to their context, artistic appreciation is not the result of merely subjective or idiosyncratic responses to artistic experience but requires an initiation into the understanding of relevant concepts, the knowledge of publicly identifiable criteria, and a gradual induction into the interpretive mode of reasoning.

It is argued, moreover, that emotional responses to art are not "inner" subjective states but are themselves structured by cognitive appraisals of the aesthetic object. Hence, there is an important distinction between an affective response to the experience of art and an appreciation in which emotion is controlled by valid interpretation. Because this control presupposes public norms and the knowledge necessary to apply them, the education of the emotions through the appreciation of art and literature is necessarily cognitive.
Thus, it is argued that the education of poetic appreciation, as with other forms of art, requires the development of interpretive reasoning ability and specific cognitive capacities such as metaphoric competence and perceptual discrimination. The development of these capacities involves the progressive equilibration of cognitive structures exhibiting features of wholeness, transformation and self-regulation.

The task of the teacher in the education of poetic appreciation, therefore, is to provide the experiences of poetry necessary to the understanding of poetic meaning, and to make available the knowledge necessary to an educated and mature appreciation. The key to such appreciation, it is claimed, lies in developing the ability to construct valid, comprehensive and consistent interpretations on the basis of relevant contextual knowledge. Only when this ability has been developed can evaluation, or the critical appreciation of poetry become a central focus for education.
PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It would be an impossible task to acknowledge separately all the formative influences behind a thesis of this nature. Significantly, it is a very personal statement and draws upon many strands of interest and concern which could be traced back to an early stage in my own development. However, during the past five years in which the thesis itself has taken shape, I have had the benefit of support and guidance from a number of mentors, colleagues and friends whose direct influence I have greatly valued. In particular, I wish to acknowledge my special debt to the following:

To my supervisors, Dr D.M. McAlpine, Dr G.R. Bassett and the late Professor C.G.N. Hill, for their scholarly support.

To Mr A.W. Cooper, for many insights and valuable exchanges of ideas.

To Dr T.W. Bestor, for his penetrating and constructive criticism.

To my wife, Zoe, and children, Sarah, Helen, Matthew and Emma, all of whom have enabled me to keep going and who share my satisfaction and relief in seeing the task through to completion.

To Jill Cheer, whose proficiency as a typist and personal interest in my work has made the completion of the task so much easier.

Finally, I owe a very special debt of gratitude to the thirty children who took part in the study, to the teachers who taught me to appreciate poetry and to the students whom I later taught. It is by sharing the experience of reading Coleridge's great poem with so many others that I have gained some insight into the nature of poetic appreciation.

J.A. Codd

July 1980
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ii
PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS
LIST OF FIGURES

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION: THE FOCUS OF THE STUDY
   The aesthetic and the arts 3
   Making and matching 5
   Creativity and aesthetic expression 6
   A cognitive approach to appreciation 8
   Literature as an art form 10
   Education for appreciation 13

CHAPTER 2 THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVE AND CHOICE OF METHOD
   The holistic approach and the pattern model of explanation 21
   The structuralist perspective 24
   Piaget's clinical method 26
   The interpretation of protocols 30

CHAPTER 3 CLINICAL PROCEDURES
   The object of appreciation 33
   The clinical interviews 36
   Interpretation of transcripts 38

CHAPTER 4 APPRECIATION AND KNOWLEDGE
   Art as expression 46
   The problem with "art as expression" 49
   Art as statement 52
   The problem with "art as statement" 56
   Knowledge about art 61
   The legacy of positivism 66
   The rejection of positivism 68
   The fallacy of conceptual relativism 70
   A critical epistemology for science and art 73
   The meaning of art 76
   Summary and conclusion 77

CHAPTER 5 APPRECIATION AND INTERPRETIVE COGNITION
   The act of interpretation 82
   Cognitive appraisals and "seeing as" 85
   Criteria of interpretation and understanding 95
   Interpretive reasoning 99
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FIGURE</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 1</td>
<td>The concept of structure in social science</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 2</td>
<td>Jastrow's duck-rabbit</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 3</td>
<td>Brueghel's &quot;The Fall of Icarus&quot;</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 4</td>
<td>Stages of cognitive growth</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 5</td>
<td>Model of dualist cognition</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 6</td>
<td>Model of active cognition</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 7</td>
<td>The semiotic triangle</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 8</td>
<td>Analysis of &quot;copper sky&quot; metaphor</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 9</td>
<td>Subjectivist account of poetic response</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIGURE 10</td>
<td>The structure of poetic appreciation</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>