

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Development of a Guidance Model for the Selection of Organisational Improvement Initiatives

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Engineering and Industrial Management
at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Musli Bin Mohammad

2012

Abstract

This research aims to develop a guidance model for selecting organisational improvement initiatives. The final guidance model was developed using the acronym 'GUIDE' which represents the five key steps to select improvement initiatives: (1) Goal setting, (2) Understanding relevant improvement initiatives, (3) Identifying decision criteria, (4) Deciding on the appropriate initiative, and (5) Evaluating the decision. This research used mixed methods approach, whereby qualitative data was used more dominantly than quantitative data. Two research phases were involved: (1) Development, evaluation and refinement of a conceptual model; and (2) Development, evaluation and refinement of a guidance model. This research incorporated multiphase concurrent and sequential data collection, which comprises an extensive literature review, a document review, a global exploratory survey, an evaluation survey and seventeen semi-structured interviews conducted in New Zealand, Singapore and Malaysia. Semi-structured interviews and an evaluation survey were used as primary sources of data. The proposed multilayer guidance model is one of the first to focus on the holistic processes to be used in selecting improvement initiatives whereby its contents are explicitly aligned to the Business Excellence Models (BEMs), such as Baldrige Criteria for Performance Excellence and European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM) Excellence Model. Systems and contingency approaches were incorporated in the development of this model so that multiple perspectives and contexts (e.g. current maturity level of an organisation, benefit of implementing the initiative, ability to gain top management commitment and support) are considered when selecting an initiative. Part of the guidance model also consists of a framework that shows the main improvement initiatives that can be adopted towards business excellence (BE), which can help organisations to choose appropriate improvement initiatives by narrowing down the options according to the areas of implementation and BE maturity. This framework also indicates that the BEM can be used as an overarching framework for selecting and managing multiple improvement initiatives. In addition, this research identified that there were 94 national Quality / BE Awards used in 83 countries in year 2010 and revealed one of the latest and comprehensive list of the Quality / BE Awards worldwide.

Acknowledgements

All the praise to Allah the Al-Mighty for his blessing and benevolence.

I would like to express my sincere gratitude and appreciation to numerous individuals whose have contributed towards the completion of this thesis:

- My supervisors: Dr. Robin Mann and Associate Professor Dr. Nigel Grigg for their constant encouragement, invaluable guidance, precious advice, and continuous support throughout this study;
- Ministry of Higher Education Malaysia and Universiti Tun Hussein Onn Malaysia (UTHM), for providing scholarship covering tuition fees and living allowances;
- Education New Zealand, for granting a New Zealand Postgraduate Study Abroad Award which enable me to collect data in Malaysia and Singapore;
- All interviewees in New Zealand, Singapore and Malaysia, for their willingness to participate in this research and share their knowledge, opinion and experience;
- All respondents of the surveys worldwide, for their cooperation in answering the questionnaires;
- Dr. Jürgen P. Wagner, Ms. Sonya, Ms. Lois, Mrs. Norhayati and Mrs. Aiman for reading my draft thesis and/or research papers and providing valuable feedback to improve my works;
- My dear parents and in-laws, for their affectionate caring; my beloved wife, Diyana for her understanding and encouragement; and my children, Najlaa, Najmi and Nuha who have made my life happier;
- All other individuals who have been involved in this research, directly and indirectly.

Thank you for all your contribution and assistance.

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	i
Acknowledgements	ii
Table of Contents	iii
List of Figures.....	vii
List of Tables.....	xi
Abbreviations	xiii
Chapter 1 : Introduction to the research	1
1.1 Introduction to the chapter	1
1.2 Background to the research.....	1
1.3 Aim and objectives of the research	4
1.4 Scope of the research	4
1.5 Importance of the research.....	5
1.6 Outline of the thesis.....	7
Chapter 2 : Literature Review	11
2.1 Introduction to the chapter	11
2.2 Organisational improvement initiatives	11
2.3 Main concepts and/or theories that can be used for the selection of organisational improvement initiatives	14
2.3.1 Systems approach in selecting and managing organisational improvement initiatives.....	14
2.3.2 Contingency approach in selecting and managing organisational improvement initiatives.....	16
2.3.3 Business Excellence Models (BEMs) as a guiding framework for selecting and managing multiple organisational improvement initiatives.....	18
2.3.4 Rational decision making in selecting appropriate improvement initiatives....	25
2.4 Prior models on the selection of organisational improvement initiatives.....	27
2.5 Conclusion of the chapter	37
Chapter 3 : Research design and methodology.....	39
3.1 Introduction to the chapter	39
3.2 Selection of research design	39
3.3 Research procedures	47
3.4 Data collection methods	47
3.4.1 Literature review	49

3.4.2 Exploratory on-line questionnaire survey	49
3.4.3 Semi-structured interviews	50
3.4.4 Document / record review.....	51
3.4.5 Evaluation survey	51
3.5 Ensuring quality of research	51
3.5.1 Planning quality	52
3.5.2 Design quality.....	53
3.5.3 Data quality	54
3.5.4 Interpretive rigour	56
3.5.5 Inference transferability	57
3.6 Ethical considerations	58
3.7 Conclusion of the chapter.....	58
Chapter 4 : Exploratory Survey – Planning, Implementation and Findings	61
4.1 Introduction to the chapter.....	61
4.2 Planning and implementation of the exploratory survey.....	61
4.3 Profiles of survey respondents	64
4.4 Exploratory survey analysis and findings.....	70
4.5 Conclusion of the chapter.....	76
Chapter 5 : Interviews – Planning, Implementation and Findings	77
5.1 Introduction to the chapter.....	77
5.2 Planning and implementation of semi-structured interviews	77
5.3 Profiles of interviewees	81
5.4 Findings from the interviews.....	86
5.4.1 Reasons for selecting suitable organisational improvement initiatives	87
5.4.2 Current practices of selecting the organisational improvement initiatives.....	87
5.4.3 People who normally involved in the selection of organisational improvement initiatives	88
5.4.4 Critical factors that should be considered when selecting suitable organisational improvement initiatives	88
5.4.5 Key steps in selecting suitable organisational improvement initiatives	89
5.4.6 Main organisational improvement initiatives that should be used according to the areas of implementation and organisational excellence maturity	90
5.4.7 Criteria, guidelines or models that has been used to assist in the selection of organisational improvement initiatives	90
5.4.8 Evaluation of several existing models for selecting organisational improvement initiatives	91

5.4.9 Expectations of a guidance model for selecting organisational improvement initiatives.....	94
5.4.10 Evaluation of the conceptual model	94
5.4.11 Suggestions to improve the conceptual model.....	94
5.4.12 Evaluation of the refined conceptual model.....	95
5.4.13 Suggestions to improve the refined conceptual model	95
5.4.14 Main challenges faced by organisations in selecting suitable organisational improvement initiatives	95
5.4.15 Suggested countermeasures to overcome the challenges	96
5.4.16 Opinion on whether the selection of suitable organisational improvement initiatives is an important area of study	97
5.5 Conclusion of the chapter	97
Chapter 6 : Evaluation Survey – Planning, Implementation and Findings.....	99
6.1 Introduction to the chapter	99
6.2 Planning and implementation of the evaluation survey	99
6.3 Profiles of survey respondents.....	101
6.4 Evaluation survey analysis and findings	106
6.4.1 Levels of importance of each proposed factor that should be considered when selecting improvement initiatives	107
6.4.2 Evaluation of the proposed guidance model	109
6.5 Conclusion of the chapter	109
Chapter 7 : Development, Evaluation and Refinement of a Conceptual Model.....	111
7.1 Introduction to the chapter	111
7.2 Development of a conceptual model.....	111
7.3 Evaluation of the conceptual model and suggestions for improvement.....	118
7.3.1 Evaluation of the conceptual model	118
7.3.2 Suggestions for improvement	120
7.4 Refinement of the conceptual model.....	121
7.5 Evaluation of the refined conceptual model and suggestions for improvement ..	126
7.5.1 Evaluation of the refined conceptual model.....	127
7.5.2 Suggestions for improvement	128
7.6 Conclusion of the chapter	131
Chapter 8 : Development, Evaluation and Refinement of a Guidance Model.....	133
8.1 Introduction to the chapter	133
8.2 Development of a guidance model	133
8.3 Evaluation of the guidance model.....	143

8.3.1 Degree of agreement for each statement / question related to the GUIDE model	144
8.3.2 Strengths, weaknesses and suggestions for improvement	154
8.4 Refinement of the guidance model	159
8.5 Conclusion of the chapter	180
Chapter 9 : Discussion and Conclusion.....	181
9.1 Introduction to the chapter.....	181
9.2 Summary of the main research findings in relation to the research aim and objectives	181
9.2.1 Main organisational improvement initiatives that should be used according to the areas of implementation and organisational maturity	181
9.2.2 Guidance model currently available to assist in the selection of organisational improvement initiatives	188
9.2.3 Main steps to select improvement initiatives	192
9.2.4 Critical contingency factors to be considered in the selection of improvement initiatives	197
9.2.5 Development, evaluation and refinement of an original guidance model for selecting organisational improvement initiatives	200
9.3 Contributions of the research	203
9.3.1 Original contribution to the knowledge	204
9.3.2 Impact on practice	206
9.4 Limitations of the research and suggestions for future research	208
9.5 Conclusion of the chapter	209
References	211
Appendices	
Appendix 1: List of national Quality / BE Awards worldwide and their adopted BEMs and administrative organisations 2010.....	A1.1
Appendix 2: Sample of the on-line exploratory survey.....	A2.1
Appendix 3: Protocol for pilot interviews.....	A3.1
Appendix 4: Protocol for first stage interviews.....	A4.1
Appendix 5: Protocol for second stage interviews.....	A5.1
Appendix 6: Sample of the questionnaire for evaluation survey.....	A6.1
Appendix 7: Proposed guidance model for selecting organisational improvement initiatives.....	A7.1
Appendix 8: Final (refined) guidance model for selecting organisational improvement initiatives.....	A8.1

List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Research focus involving decision making process in selecting improvement initiatives.....	5
Figure 1.2: Outline of the thesis.....	9
Figure 2.1: An improvement initiative selection framework proposed by Thawesaengkulthai (2007).....	30
Figure 2.2: Steps involved in evaluating and selecting the initiative (Thawesaengkulthai, 2007).....	30
Figure 2.3: A consultant-based model indicating the examples of initiatives to be used according to the levels of BE maturity and enablers of Baldrige CPE (Saunders & Mann, 2007)	31
Figure 2.4: A simple consultant-based model indicating the examples of initiatives to be used according to the Baldrige CPE (NZMED, 2006, as cited in NZBEF, 2009). ...	32
Figure 2.5: A consultant-based model indicating the examples of initiatives to be used according to the Baldrige CPE (Brown & Pemberton Planning Group Ltd, 2008)...	32
Figure 2.6: A guiding model indicating the examples of initiatives to be used according to the core values and concepts of SQA model (Rimington, 2007).	33
Figure 2.7: A decision tree for adopting organisational improvement initiatives (Bendell, 2005).....	34
Figure 2.8: A road map for adopting organisational improvement initiatives (Bendell, 2005).....	34
Figure 2.9: A decision tree for adopting organisational improvement initiatives (Radziwill et al., 2008).	36
Figure 3.1: Multiphase research design in developing, evaluating and refining conceptual and guidance model for selecting organisational improvement initiatives	46
Figure 3.2: Linkages between research aim, research design, research objectives, data collection methods and sources of data.....	48
Figure 3.3: Quality domains proposed by O'Cathain (2010) which has been used to ensure the quality of this research	52
Figure 3.4: Iterative processes of developing, evaluating and refining the model for selecting improvement initiatives	54
Figure 3.5: Summary of Chapter 3 and its linkages with other chapters in this thesis	59
Figure 4.1: Response distribution by number of years in which the respondents have been involved in the areas related to quality, productivity and/or sustainability	65

Figure 4.2: Response distribution by country in which the respondents are currently working.....	66
Figure 4.3: Response distribution by major business activity of the respondents' organisation.....	67
Figure 4.4: Response distribution by sector of the respondents' organisation	68
Figure 4.5: Response distribution by approximate number of full-time employees in the respondents' organisation	69
Figure 4.6: Response distribution by whether the respondents' organisation had won any BE /quality award(s)	69
Figure 4.7: Response distribution by whether the respondents' think that selection of suitable organisational improvement initiatives is an important area of study	70
Figure 5.1: Generating and organising nodes in NVivo 9	80
Figure 5.2: Strategic management process framework (based on document provided by Interviewee A2)	91
Figure 6.1: Response distribution by number of years in which the respondents have been involved in the areas related to quality, productivity and/or organisational excellence	103
Figure 6.2: Response distribution by role of the respondents in the organisation	103
Figure 6.3: Response distribution by country in which the respondents are currently based	104
Figure 6.4: Response distribution by major business activity of the respondents' organisation.....	105
Figure 6.5: Response distribution by whether the respondents' organisation had won any BE / quality awards.....	106
Figure 7.1: A conceptual model for selecting organisational improvement initiatives ...	113
Figure 7.2: Overview of the refined conceptual model for selecting organisational improvement initiatives	123
Figure 8.1: Overview of the guidance model for selecting organisational improvement initiatives	135
Figure 8.2: Response distribution by whether the respondents' think that the Introduction Section to the GUIDE Model is written clearly and easy to understand (Total responses = 31)	145
Figure 8.3: Response distribution by whether the respondents' think that the GUIDE model is presented clearly and easy to understand (Total responses = 31).....	146
Figure 8.4: Response distribution by the level of agreement of the respondents with the steps and content of the 'G - Goal Setting' section (Total responses = 31).....	147

Figure 8.5: Response distribution by the level of agreement of the respondents with the steps and content of the ‘U – Understand organisational context’ section (Total responses = 30).....	148
Figure 8.6: Response distribution by the level of agreement of the respondents with the steps and content of the ‘I – Identify relevant organisational improvement initiatives’ section (Total responses = 30)	148
Figure 8.7: Response distribution by the level of agreement of the respondents with the steps and content of the ‘D – Decide appropriate initiative’ section (Total responses = 31).....	149
Figure 8.8: Response distribution by the level of agreement of the respondents with the steps and content of the ‘E – Evaluate the decision’ section (Total responses = 31)	150
Figure 8.9: Response distribution by whether the respondents’ think that the model is useful for quality and/or organisational improvement consultants (Total responses = 31).....	151
Figure 8.10: Response distribution by whether the respondents’ think that the model is useful for quality and/or organisational improvement practitioners (Total responses = 31).....	151
Figure 8.11: Response distribution by whether the respondents’ think that the model is useful for Small and Medium Sized Enterprises (SMEs) (Total responses = 31)..	152
Figure 8.12: Response distribution by whether the respondents’ think that the model is useful for academics (Total responses = 31)	153
Figure 8.13: Response distribution by whether the respondents’ think that the model is useful for organisations in general (Total responses: 31).....	153
Figure 8.14: Interface of the refined (final) guidance model for selecting organisational improvement initiatives	160
Figure 8.15: A framework showing 30 main initiatives that can be implemented to improve organisational performance according to the common enabling criteria of BEMs and levels of BE maturity.....	165
Figure 9.1: Linkages between research problem / issue, aim, objectives, data collection methods and sources of data.....	182
Figure 9.2: The links between sub-section 9.2.1 and other sections in this thesis	183
Figure 9.3: Filtration processes involved in the identification of the main improvement initiatives widely used by organisations.	184
Figure 9.4: Processes involved in the development of a framework that indicates the main organisational improvement initiatives to be used according to the areas of implementation and BE maturity	185

Figure 9.5: The links between the research aim, first research objective and research questions for the first research objective	187
Figure 9.6: The links between Section 9.2.2 and other sections in this thesis	188
Figure 9.7: The links between the research aim, second research objective and research questions for the second research objective	189
Figure 9.8: A business improvement initiative selection model for consulting firms (Wieleman, 2011)	191
Figure 9.9: The links between Section 9.2.3 and other sections in this thesis	193
Figure 9.10: A framework showing several main steps involved in the selection of improvement initiatives	194
Figure 9.11: The links between the research aim, third research objective and research question for the third research objective	194
Figure 9.12: Processes involved in the development of a framework that indicates the main steps to select improvement initiatives	196
Figure 9.13: The links of Section 9.2.4 with other sections in this thesis	197
Figure 9.14: The links between the research aim, fourth research objective and research questions for the fourth research objective	198
Figure 9.15: Processes involved in the development of a final GUIDE model for selecting organisational improvement initiatives	201
Figure 9.16: The links between the research aim, fifth research objective and research questions for the fifth research objective	202

List of Tables

Table 2.1: Definitions and examples of approach, management system, tool and technique for improving organisational performance.....	13
Table 2.2: Common criteria of BEMs based on comparison of major BEMs and previous research	21
Table 2.3: Descriptions of the common enabler criteria of BEM and their core values and concepts.....	22
Table 2.4: Comparison of steps involved in making decision.....	26
Table 2.5: Comparison of seven prior models that can be used to assist in the selection of improvement initiatives	27
Table 3.1: Summary of research questions together with research objectives, data collection methods and types of collected data.....	43
Table 3.2: Classification of mixed methods research designs.....	45
Table 4.1: Degree of suitability in terms of where the improvement initiative should be used according to the implementation areas.....	72
Table 4.2: List of organisational improvement initiatives that have a ‘very high suitability’ (median = 5) to be implemented according to the implementation areas	75
Table 5.1: Breakdown of the interviewees according to country, position, category, type of industry and sector	81
Table 5.2: Profiles of the interviewees.....	82
Table 5.3: Areas of inquiry for each stage of interviews.....	86
Table 5.4: Strengths, limitations and/or improvement suggestions of several existing models for selecting organisational improvement initiatives based on feedback from interviewees	92
Table 6.1: List of potential respondents for evaluation survey	100
Table 6.2: Distribution of the respondents and response rate.....	101
Table 6.3: Survey results on the levels of importance of each proposed factor to be considered when selecting improvement initiatives.....	108
Table 7.1: Descriptions of the BE maturity levels according to the areas of implementation	116
Table 8.1: Proposed Decision / Selection Criteria.....	140
Table 8.2: Brief explanations of the levels of BE maturity	166
Table 8.3: Brief descriptions of the 30 main organisational improvement initiatives widely used by organisations.....	167
Table 8.4: Proposed criteria for the selection of organisational improvement initiatives	171

Table 8.5: Proposed contents of the proposal for selecting organisational improvement initiatives	172
Table 8.6: Proposed decision matrix for selecting appropriate organisational improvement initiatives.....	173
Table 8.7: Example of the completed decision matrix for selecting an appropriate organisational improvement initiative.....	176
Table 8.8: Comparisons of the initial and refined (final) guidance model for selecting organisational improvement initiatives	179
Table 9.1: Methods of disseminating the research findings	207

Abbreviations

AHP	Analytic Hierarchy Process
AIRMIC	Association of Insurance and Risk Managers
ALARM	National Forum for Risk Management in the Public Sector
APO	Asian Productivity Organisation
BE	Business Excellence
BEM	Business Excellence Model
BCM	Business Continuity Management
BI	Business Improvement
BPIR	Business Performance Improvement Resource
BPR	Business Process Reengineering
CEHE	Consortium for Excellence in Higher Education
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
COER	Centre for Organisational Excellence Research
CPE	Criteria for Performance Excellence
EFQM	European Foundation for Quality Management
ERM	Enterprise Risk Management
FMEA	Failure Mode and Effect Analysis
GUIDE	Goal-Understand-Identify-Decide-Evaluate
IRM	Institute of Risk Management
ISO	International Organisation for Standardisation
KM	Knowledge Management
MADM	Multiple Attribute Decision Making
MCDM	Multiple Criteria Decision Making
NIST	National Institute of Standards and Technology
NZAS	New Zealand Aluminium Smelters
NZBEF	New Zealand Business Excellence Foundation
NZMED	New Zealand Ministry of Economic Development
NZOQ	New Zealand Organisation for Quality
PESTLE	Political-Economic-Social-Technological-Legal-Environmental
PDCA	Plan-Do-Check-Act
QC	Quality Control

QFD	Quality Function Deployment
ROI	Return of Investment
SAW	Simple Additive Weighting
SME	Small and Medium Sized Enterprises
SPC	Statistical Process Control
SPRING	Standards, Productivity and Innovation Board Singapore
SQA	Singapore Quality Award
SWOT	Strengths-Weaknesses-Opportunities-Threats
TOPSIS	Technique for Order Preference by Similarity to Ideal Solution
TPM	Total Productive Maintenance
TQM	Total Quality Management
WSM	Weighted Sum Model