The Commercial Imperative in Broadcasting News:
TVNZ from 1985 to 1990

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of PhD in Human Resource Management at Massey University

Margaret Ann Comrie

1996
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like first to thank my supervisors. Associate Professor Frank Sligo set me on the path and encouraged me throughout, and Associate Professor Ruth Butterworth's wide knowledge of the field and fresh perspective were extremely valuable.

I am grateful to Professor Philip Dewe, who spent hours helping with the data analysis. Thanks too to Professor Judy McGregor for her support, especially with decisions on the structure of the report and in giving me the final push to finish.

Colleagues throughout the Department of Human Resource Management provided a listening ear and helpful suggestions. Lunchtime sessions with Marianne Tremaine, in particular, helped me keep the study in perspective. Christine Smith's assistance with layout of text and tables is especially appreciated.

Alan Cocker, at Auckland University, shared his knowledge and resources. Also I wish to acknowledge those who talked about their experiences at BCNZ and TVNZ, not all of whom could be named in the report. They gave their time generously, and for some the interview meant coming to terms with painful memories.

I owe a special debt to Arne Evans for insights into the processes of television, for proofreading, and for his constant support. Thanks are due to the rest of my family, especially my daughters, for encouraging me and not allowing me to feel guilty for the hours spent away from them.
ABSTRACT

Between 1985 and 1990, broadcasting services in New Zealand underwent significant restructuring and deregulation. This was part of a global surge of broadcasting deregulation caused by a mix of technological, political and economic factors threatening Western public service broadcasting systems (Willard & Tracey, 1990).

The switch in New Zealand television from public service broadcasting to a commercial approach was both swift and profound, affecting TVNZ and its output at all levels. This study seeks to trace the effects of that transition on a key product, the news.

The research epitomizes the growing tensions between two major models of broadcasting as marketplace ideology gains ascendancy over public service approaches. This tension has its counterpart in journalism, with its on-going conflict between a commercial rationale and an informative purpose based on notions of empowering citizens.

The major study objective was to identify the influence of deregulation and competitive pressure on the nature of TVNZ news from 1985 to 1990. Three methodologies were employed: a historical review, a content analysis and a qualitative news analysis.

The research takes the perspective of a growing number of scholars arguing for the importance of public service broadcasting (Price, 1995; Scannel, 1990; Tracey, 1992) and an informative news industry (Bennett, 1993; Bernstein, 1992) as a basis for a healthy democracy in a world of technological change.

Historical methodologies, especially interviews, were used to identify the roots of the change, key personalities and decision points which resulted in TVNZ’s legislative and internal orientation to profit making. Newsworkers described conflicts over techniques and news values, and losses and gains represented in the new style.
A content analysis of early evening news bulletins between 1985 and 1990 quantified changes in subject matter and the sourcing and attribution of news. Results confirmed a shift towards a more commercial approach. They showed a reduction in time given to the national news, reduced story length and shorter sound bites (on-camera statements by news sources). There was a swing away from serious news subjects (such as politics, economics, diplomacy and foreign affairs) in favour of more entertainment-oriented subjects (crime, accidents and disasters, human interest, and public moral problem stories). TVNZ news continued to rely on official sources, but increased its use of victims and ordinary citizens as news sources. There was a reduction in cited sources.

The qualitative news analysis backed up these findings. It demonstrated how greater pace was introduced into the bulletins and showed growth in emotional, tabloid language in stories and headlines. Analysis of individual news stories used Wyatt & Badger’s (1993) typology to demonstrate a shift of function in news items, from information to vicarious experience. The analysis identified verbal and visual techniques used to heighten emotion and increase audience involvement.

The study shows how commercial pressures and the drive to increase ratings results in a news mix which short-changes citizens. This threatens democratic participation in a world where most people seek their information from television news and where changing technologies threaten to create a new class of the information impoverished (Kellner, 1990). Because the commercial imperatives shaping news are underpinned by legislation, there can be little long-term change without law changes to reinstate the primacy of PSB values into at least one of New Zealand’s publicly-owned television channels, and to target funding for public service news programmes.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgements</th>
<th>i</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Appendices</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter One: Scope of the Research**

1.1 Introduction                                      | 1     |
1.2 The Primacy of Broadcasting News                  | 1     |
1.3 Research Strategy and Choice of Methods           | 3     |
1.4 Research Questions                                 | 4     |
1.5 Research Project Plan                             | 6     |
1.6 Theoretical Frameworks                            | 6     |
1.7 Structure of the Thesis                           | 7     |

**Chapter Two: Public Service Broadcasting**

2.1 Introduction                                      | 9     |
2.2 Regulated Media                                   | 10    |
2.3 The Public Service Model                          | 13    |
2.3.1 Britain and the BBC                             | 14    |
2.3.2 Western Europe                                 | 19    |
2.3.3 The United States                               | 21    |
2.3.4 The Dominions                                   | 22    |
2.3.5 New Zealand Broadcasting                        | 24    |
2.3.6 The Problem of Defining Public Service Broadcasting | 29    |
2.3.7 Threats to Public Service Broadcasting          | 34    |
2.3.7.1 Criticism from the Left                       | 34    |
2.3.7.2 Criticism from the Right                      | 35    |
2.3.7.3 Finance                                      | 36    |
2.3.7.4 Technology and the Growth of Global Communication | 37    |
2.3.7.5 Media Theory                                 | 37    |
2.4 News Theory Related to the Public Service Model   | 38    |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Introduction</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 The Marketplace Model</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Historical Development in the United States</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 How Free is the Free Market?</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Critiques of the Marketplace Model</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 News Theory Associated with the Marketplace Approach</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Deregulation</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.1 Global Technological Change</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.2 Deregulation and Political and Economic Doctrines</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.3 Broadcasting as a Consumer Industry</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.4 Recent Deregulatory Moves in the United States</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.5 The 1990 Broadcasting Act in Britain</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.6 The European Experience</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.6.1 Italy's Deregulation and Re-regulation</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.6.2 Germany's Constitutional Approach</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.6.3 France's Deregulation with Moderation</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.7 Effects of Deregulation: Summary</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.8 New Zealand Literature on Deregulation</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 A Future for Public Service Broadcasting</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8 The Future for Journalism</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9 Summary</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Four: Scope of Methodology</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Methodology for the Historical Narrative</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Content Analysis</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Qualitative News Analysis</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Summary</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Five: Broadcasting Changes 1985-1990 A Historical Overview</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Introduction</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Methodology</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1 Review of Contemporary Press Reports</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2 Review of Official Documents</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2.1 Limitations of Document Analysis</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3 Interviews</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3.1 Limitations of Interviews</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.3 BCNZ and TVNZ: The Organisational Story ........................................ 101
5.3.1 The Outset ..................................................................................... 102
  5.3.1.1 The BCNZ and the New Labour Government ...................... 103
  5.3.1.2 The Frozen Licence Fee and its Consequences ................. 104
  5.3.1.3 Management and Board at the Outset ............................... 106

5.3.2 Changes from 1985 to August 1987: The Groundwork Laid ........... 108
  5.3.2.1 In Pursuit of Higher Licence Fees ....................................... 109
  5.3.2.2 The Royal Commission .......................................................... 110
  5.3.2.3 The Broadcasting Tribunal Third Channel Hearings .......... 112
  5.3.2.4 Deregulation: Hunt and the First Term .............................. 115
  5.3.2.5 Board and Management Changes ........................................ 116
  5.3.2.6 Dick and Mounter: A Clash of Styles .................................. 118
  5.3.2.7 Debates About the Future: Excom & Major Players .......... 120
  5.3.2.8 TVNZ Consolidates in Auckland & Responds to the Financial Squeeze .......................................................... 121
  5.3.2.9 New Look Programming & Advertising Fees .................... 124

5.3.3 August 1987 to December 1988: Restructuring Decisions ............. 125
  5.3.3.1 Third Channel Hearings: Results and Reactions ................ 125
  5.3.3.2 The Prebble Approach ........................................................ 127
  5.3.3.3 The April Announcement ................................................... 129
  5.3.3.4 The Committees ................................................................. 130
  5.3.3.5 Deregulation Legislation .................................................... 133
  5.3.3.6 BCNZ: How Inevitable was the Split? ................................. 135
  5.3.3.7 TVNZ Gears up for Competition ........................................ 136

5.3.4 1989-1990: SOE and Competition .............................................. 138
  5.3.4.1 Government Moves ............................................................ 138
  5.3.4.2 TVNZ: The SOE’s Commercial Orientation ....................... 140
  5.3.4.3 Meeting the Competition ................................................... 143
  5.3.4.4 What Happened to TV3 ...................................................... 146
  5.3.4.5 Slimming the SOE ............................................................. 148

5.3.5 Summary ....................................................................................... 150

5.4 TVNZ: The Newworkers’ Story ..................................................... 152
  5.4.1 Newworkers at the Outset: The Post-Muldoon Malaise .............. 152
    5.4.1.1 Technology and Resource Problems ................................. 157
    5.4.1.2 News Management: Relative Decentralisation and Independence .................................................. 158
    5.4.1.3 Auckland, Wellington and Political Dominance ............ 161
5.4.2 Newsworkers from 1985 to mid 1987: Styles and Divisions 163
   5.4.2.1 News Values: Three Main Groupings 164
   5.4.2.2 The 1987 New Look News 167

5.4.3 Newsworkers August 1987 to December 1988: Commercial Style Dominates 169
   5.4.3.1 Stepping Back from Commitment to the Regions 173

5.4.4 TVNZ Ltd: The New News Hour and the Death of Regional News 175
   5.4.4.1 Newsroom Debates 178

5.4.5 Newsworkers Assess the Changes 185

5.5 Summary 189

Chapter Six: Content Analysis Methodology 191

6.1 Introduction 191
6.2 Defining the Population 192
6.3 Sample 192
6.4 Developing Subject Categories 196
   6.4.1 Key Decisions on Subject Category Boundaries 199
   6.4.2 Developing Subject Categories: Summary 201
6.5 Geographical Source of Stories 202
6.6 Length 202
6.7 Prominence 204
6.8 Sources 204
6.9 Attribution 207
6.10 Sound Bite Length 209
6.11 Intercoder & Intracoder Reliability 209
6.12 Limitations 210
6.13 Summary 211

Chapter Seven: Results of the Content Analysis 213

7.1. Introduction 213
   7.1.1 Some Characteristics of the Sample 213
7.2 Size of the Newshole 214
   7.2.1. The Newshole and Sports 216
   7.2.2. The Effect of Chit Chat on the Newshole 216
   7.2.3. The Effect of Headlines on the Newshole 217
   7.2.4. Newshole Size: Summary 218
7.3. Story Length 219
7.4. Number of Stories 221
   7.4.1 Summary 221
7.5. Subjects Covered by the News ........................................ 222
   7.5.1 Time Spent on News Subjects .................................. 222
   7.5.2 Percentage of Newshole Devoted to News Subjects .......... 225
      7.5.2.1 Overall Results ........................................... 226
      7.5.2.2 Sport ..................................................... 227
      7.5.2.3 Politics .................................................. 227
      7.5.2.4 Diplomacy and Foreign Affairs .......................... 227
      7.5.2.5 Economics ............................................... 228
      7.5.2.6 War and Defence ......................................... 228
      7.5.2.7 Human Interest ........................................... 228
      7.5.2.8 Accidents and Disasters ................................. 229
      7.5.2.9 Crime .................................................... 229
      7.5.2.10 Public Moral Problems .................................. 229
      7.5.2.11 Health and Agriculture/Environmental Stories ....... 230
      7.5.2.12 The Smallest Categories ............................... 230
   7.5.3 Collapsing Categories: Political and Tabloid Groupings .... 231
   7.5.4 Subject Matter of the News: Summary ......................... 233

7.6 Headlines and Other Measures of Prominence .................. 234
   7.6.1 Subject Categories in the Opening Set of Headlines ....... 234
   7.6.2 Subject Categories in All Headlines ........................ 238
   7.6.3 Other Measures of Prominence: Opening & Closing Items .. 240
   7.6.4 Measures of Prominence: Summary ............................ 244

7.7 Geographical Sources of the News ................................. 245
   7.7.1 Overseas Stories ............................................. 247
   7.7.2 Auckland’s Dominance & Wellington’s Fading Influence ..... 247
   7.7.3 Neglect of South Island and Provinces ....................... 247
   7.7.3 Time Spent on Stories from Each Geographical Source ...... 248
   7.7.4 Geographical Sources: Summary ................................ 249

7.8 Changing Characteristics of Sound Bites ....................... 250
   7.8.1 Sound Bites: Summary ......................................... 252

7.9 Changing Characteristics of News Sources ...................... 252
   7.9.1 Sources Cited by Broadcasters ................................ 253
      7.9.1.1 Official Sources ....................................... 255
      7.9.1.2 Victims and Celebrities ................................ 255
      7.9.1.3 Diversity of Sources: Non-elite or "Enterprise" Sources 256
      7.9.1.4 Cited Sources: Summary .................................. 257
   7.9.2 Sound Bites or On-Camera Sources .......................... 257
      7.9.2.1 Number of Sound Bites From Official Sources ........ 259
      7.9.2.2 Number of Sound Bites From Victims and Celebrities ... 259
      7.9.2.3 Number of Sound Bites From Non-Elite Sources .......... 259
7.9.3 On-Camera Speaking Times Given to Different Source Types . . . . 260
  7.9.3.1 On Camera Speaking Time for Official Sources ..... 263
  7.9.3.2 On-Camera Speaking Time for Victims and Celebrities . . 263
  7.9.3.3 On-Camera Speaking Time for Non-Elite Sources ... 264
7.9.4 News Sources: Summary ........................................ 265

Chapter Eight:  Content Analysis Discussion ..................................... 274
  8.1 Introduction ......................................................... 274
  8.2 Newshole Size ...................................................... 274
  8.3 Reduction in Story Length ......................................... 275
  8.4 Changes in News Content .......................................... 277
  8.5 Reduction in Sound Bite Length ................................... 279
  8.6 News Sources ...................................................... 280
  8.7 Attribution .......................................................... 281
  8.8 Summary ........................................................... 282

Chapter Nine:  The Qualitative News Analysis ..................................... 285
  9.1 Introduction ......................................................... 285
  9.2 Methodology ....................................................... 285
    9.2.1 Pace .............................................................. 286
    9.2.2 Chit Chat ....................................................... 286
    9.2.3 Headline Analysis ............................................ 287
    9.2.4 Analysis of Individual Stories ............................. 287
    9.2.5 Analysis of Four Bulletins .................................. 289
    9.2.6 Limitations ..................................................... 290
  9.3 Overall Format of the Bulletins .................................... 290
  9.4 The Pace of News Bulletins ....................................... 291
  9.5 Chit Chat ............................................................ 293
    9.5.1 Chit Chat: Summary .......................................... 299
  9.6 The Language of the Headlines ................................... 300
    9.6.1 Overall Comments on Headlines ............................ 300
    9.6.2 Alliteration ................................................... 303
9.6.3 Puns .................................................. 304
9.6.4 Rhetorical Questions, Rhyme and Repetition .................. 305
9.6.5 Headline Structure, Parallels, Links and Contrasts ......... 305
9.6.6 Metaphor, Cliche and Hyperbole .......................... 307
9.6.7 The Ultimate Headline Set .................................. 308
9.6.8 Emotionally Loaded Words .................................. 309
9.6.9 Headlines: Summary ...................................... 310

9.7 Some Changes in the Treatment of Crime Stories .............. 310
9.7.1 Treatment of Crime Stories in 1985 ....................... 311
9.7.2 Treatment of Crime Stories in 1987 ....................... 312
9.7.3 Treatment of Crime Stories in 1989 ....................... 315
9.7.4 Treatment of Crime Stories in 1990 ....................... 320
9.7.5 Treatment of Crime Stories: Summary ..................... 324

9.8 Changes in the Treatment of Public Moral Problem Stories .... 325
9.8.1 Treatment of Public Moral Stories in 1985 ................ 325
9.8.2 Treatment of Public Moral Problem Stories in 1989 ....... 327
9.8.3 Treatment of Public Moral Problem Stories in 1990 ....... 331
9.8.4 The Treatment of Public Moral Problems Stories: Summary .. 335

9.9 Four News Bulletins Described ................................. 336
9.9.1 Some Overall Features ..................................... 336
9.9.2 The 1985 Bulletin ........................................ 337
9.9.2.1 The 1985 Bulletin: Summary ......................... 345
9.9.3 The 1987 Bulletin ........................................ 346
9.9.3.1 The 1987 Bulletin: Summary ......................... 355
9.9.4 The 1989 Bulletin ........................................ 355
9.9.4.1 The 1989 Bulletin: Summary ......................... 360
9.9.5 The 1990 Bulletin ........................................ 360
9.9.5.1 The 1990 Bulletin: Summary ......................... 370

9.10 Qualitative Analysis: Summary ................................ 371

Chapter Ten: Summary of Findings and Conclusions .......... 373
10.1 Introduction ............................................. 373
10.2 Limitations .............................................. 374
10.3 Summary of Findings ..................................... 376
10.3.1 Findings from the Historical Study ..................... 376
10.3.2 Findings from the Content Analysis ..................... 377
10.3.3 Findings from the Qualitative Analysis of News .......... 378
10.4 Major Implications of the Findings ......................... 379
10.4.1 Gains and Losses in the Newer News Style .............. 382
10.5 From 1990 to the Present .................................. 387
10.6 Some Suggestions for Reform ........................................... 389
10.7 Conclusion ................................................................. 396

References ........................................................................... 399

Appendices ......................................................................... 419
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1</td>
<td>Dates of sample bulletins: TVNZ early evening news</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2</td>
<td>Subject categories used in the study</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3</td>
<td>Source categories used in the study</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4</td>
<td>Attribution categories used in the study</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5</td>
<td>Size of newshole for each study year</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6</td>
<td>Average story length &amp; maximum story length for each study year</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7</td>
<td>Number of news stories, and the average number of stories per news bulletin</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 8</td>
<td>Time spent on subjects, ranking by time spent and numbers of stories in each category</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 9</td>
<td>Percentage of newshole devoted to each subject in rank order</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 10</td>
<td>Percentage of newshole spent on subject groupings (achieved by collapsing categories)</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 11</td>
<td>Subject categories in the opening set of headlines, expressed as a percentage of the number of headlines</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 12</td>
<td>Subject groupings (collapsed categories) of opening headlines</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 13</td>
<td>Subject categories of all headlines, expressed as a percentage of the number of headlines</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 14</td>
<td>Subject groupings (collapsed categories) of all headlines expressed as a percentage</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 15</td>
<td>Subject categories of first three items in the news bulletins expressed as a percentage of total</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 16: Subjects groupings (collapsed categories) of the first three items, expressed as a percentage .......................... 242
Table 17: Subject categories of last item in the news bulletin ................ 243
Table 18: Percentage of stories from each geographical source .............. 246
Table 19: Time spent on items from each geographical source, expressed as a percentage of the newshole .......................... 248
Table 20: Average sound bite length, shortest and longest sound bites and number of sound bites ........................................... 250
Table 21: Number of sources and percentage of sources cited by broadcasters for each source category ........................................... 254
Table 22: Number of sound bites and percentage in each source category .. 258
Table 23: Average length of sound bite, percentage of total sound bite time for each source category in rank order .......................... 261
Table 24: Numbers and percentages of attribution categories used by broadcasters to describe cited sources ............................... 267
Table 25: Attribution of sound bites: numbers and percentages in each attribution category ...................................................... 269

LIST OF FIGURES

Page No.

Figure 1: Research project plan .................................................. 6
Figure 2: Relationship between methods ....................................... 87
Figure 3: Distribution of story lengths ........................................... 220
Figure 4: Distribution of sound bite lengths ................................... 251
## LIST OF APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix A: Glossary</th>
<th>Page No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B: Timeline of significant events</td>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C: Question outline for interviewees</td>
<td>429</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>