Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
TRANSFER OF TRAINING AND THERAPIST FACTORS

IN COGNITIVE BEHAVIOUR THERAPY

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of
the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in Psychology at

Massey University,

Auckland, New Zealand

Robyn A. Gedye

2012
This thesis is dedicated to the late

Professor I. R. H. Falloon (DSc).

He is remembered here for his unwavering commitment to the competent delivery of evidence-based treatments for mental illness
ABSTRACT

There is a call for the training of greater numbers of therapists in the use of Cognitive Behaviour Therapy (CBT) in order to meet the needs of growing populations worldwide. However, issues relating to transfer of training and therapist competence have been noted following the training process (Beidas & Kendall, 2010; Carroll, Martino, & Rounsaville, 2010; Kendall et al., 2004). To date, research investigating the impact that therapist characteristics, or effects, may have on therapist competence has focused on demographic data (McManus, Westbrook, Vasquez-Montez, Fennell, & Kennerley, 2010), with limited attention given to therapist factors that may have a theoretical or empirical association with competence. To date, studies have reported mixed results concerning the relationship between observed competence and therapist self-confidence in using CBT (Brosnan, Reynolds, & Moore, 2006; Beidas & Kendall, 2010), and a positive relationship between observed competence and current practice (Mannix et al., 2006). Studies investigating therapy behaviours have suggested positive relationships between observed competence and career growth (Orlinsky & Rønnestad, 2005), and negative relationships with organisational barriers (Fadden, 1997; Kavanagh et al., 1993).

The present study is an exploratory investigation of therapist competence and therapist factors both during and following postgraduate diploma training in CBT. Therapist factors investigated in the present study were therapist self-confidence in using CBT, current CBT practice, perception of career growth, and perception of organisational barriers.

Two separate studies were conducted. Study One employed a longitudinal design. Competence and therapist factors were assessed for trainees (N=16) at three time points during the diploma practicum. Training transfer was measured at 12 months follow-up. Study Two employed a cross-sectional design to investigate relationships between competence and therapist factors following training. Study Two participants were 20 postgraduate practitioners who had
completed the practicum 1 to 9 years prior to assessment within the present study.

Results showed that 94% ($N=16$) of Study One participants were rated competent at the end of the practicum. Two of the nine participants who completed Study One showed evidence of training transfer at 12 months follow-up. Positive relationships between observed competence, self-confidence, and career growth were consistently found throughout the training. However, at the end of training participants rated as more competent reported practice with fewer clients and a greater perception of organisational barriers. Results for Study Two showed 65% of participants were rated competent 1-9 years following training. All relationships between observed competence and therapist factors were negative 1-9 years following training. Also, more competent participants reported lower self-confidence, less career growth, and practice with fewer clients, while the opposite was found for participants rated as less competent.

These findings suggest that supervised practicum training in CBT increases trainee observed and self-reported competence, although the maintenance of training gains appears problematic. The implications of the findings are discussed and recommendations made for further research.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research would not have been possible without the generous participation of the CBT practitioners who gave their time to complete and submit questionnaires and recordings for this study. To the trainees of the PGDipCBT, in particular, my sincere thanks for agreeing to participate during your practicum year when time was so precious. To the graduates who stepped up and participated 2-9 years after completing the training, I truly appreciated your contribution also.

Many thanks to my supervisors, most especially Mei Williams and Bev Haarhoff who have guided my efforts with good humour and considerable patience. Also to NikKazantzis, who reframed my questions relating to therapist competence and helped me to finally get started.

Belated thanks to Ian Falloon who passed away just as I was beginning this project. It was Ian who first introduced me to the reality that there are effective interventions for many mental illnesses. However, limited access to clinicians who are competent in the delivery of these interventions currently prevents too many individuals from experiencing their benefits. Thus, I must also thank the many clients and their families who welcomed me into their homes over the past twenty years. Their stoic endurance of illnesses that are treatable has continued to provide the motivation to undertake and complete this project. I sincerely hope that the results reported here help facilitate a time when access to effective treatment rapidly and routinely follows the first signs that “something is not quite right”.

Others who have supported my efforts and encouraged me to continue include my friends and colleagues Ann Elborn and Naomi Cowan. Many, many thanks to you both for your forthright opinions and novel yet practical solutions to the myriad of issues I have raised.
And finally I must thank my mother and my children for their forbearance of my absence from their lives at a time when they each required more support than I could give. But mostly, overwhelmingly, I must thank my husband Paul without whom I could not have managed any part of this project. He has provided a listening ear, encouragement, many takeaway dinners and endless cups of tea well into the night. But most importantly he has provided me with the support to continue across the years of this project, and he has done so without complaint. Thank you Paul, you are my partner, my friend, and my companion. And you can book the cruise now.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ......................................................................................................................... v

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ................................................................................................. vii

LIST OF TABLES ........................................................................................................... xiv

LIST OF FIGURES ......................................................................................................... xv

Chapter One .................................................................................................................... 1

INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................. 1

1.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 1

1.2 Thesis Outline and Content ............................................................................... 4

Chapter Two ................................................................................................................... 5

TRANSFER OF TRAINING: AN OVERVIEW OF THE GENERAL
LITERATURE .................................................................................................................. 5

2.1 Transfer of Training: training design, organisational factors and
trainee factors .................................................................................................................. 5

2.2 Factors that Influence Transfer of Training ..................................................... 6

2.3 Models of Training Transfer ............................................................................. 11

2.4 Summary: General Overview ............................................................................ 20

Chapter Three ............................................................................................................... 23

TRANSFER OF TRAINING IN PSYCHOTHERAPY .................................................. 23

3.1 Training Models .................................................................................................... 23

3.2 Training Design .................................................................................................... 34

3.3 Organisational Factors ....................................................................................... 39

3.4 Therapist factors .................................................................................................. 45

3.5 Transfer of Training ............................................................................................. 55

3.6 Overall Summary and Areas for Further Research ........................................... 57

3.7 The Present Study: Transfer of Training and Therapist factors ................. 59
Chapter Four ..................................................................................................... 65

METHODOLOGY .......................................................................................... 65

4.1 Introduction.............................................................................................. 65

4.2 Research Setting: The Post Graduate Diploma in Cognitive Behaviour Therapy (PGDipCBT) ................................................................................. 66

4.3 Study One: Trainee Competence and Therapist Factors During Training ...................................................................................................... 68

4.4 Study Two: Graduate Competence and Therapist Factors Following Training ...................................................................................................... 80

4.5 Taping of work samples.................................................................... 86

4.6 Methods of Data Analysis .................................................................. 87

Chapter Five ..................................................................................................... 89

STUDY RESULTS ......................................................................................... 89

5.1 Introduction.............................................................................................. 89

STUDY ONE: TRAINEE COMPETENCE DURING TRAINING ............. 89

5.2 Chapter Overview ..................................................................................... 89

5.3 Preliminary Data Screening .............................................................. 90

Training Effects: therapist competence during and following training .......... 95

5.4 Observed Training Effects and Transfer of Training ......................... 95

Transfer of training ................................................................................... 102

Trainee factors ............................................................................................. 105

5.5 Current Practice and Self-Confidence .............................................. 105

5.6 Professional development: Currently Experienced Career Growth. 110

5.7 Organisational Barriers ................................................................. 114

5.8 Summary: Trainee factors .............................................................. 117

5.9 Chapter Summary .......................................................................... 118
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter Six  ..................................................................................................... 120  

**STUDY ONE: BIVARIATE ANALYSES** .......................................................... 120  
  6.1  Introduction................................................................................................ 120  
  6.2  The hypotheses ........................................................................................ 120  
  6.3  Study One: Overall Conclusions ............................................................ 123  

Chapter Seven .................................................................................................... 126  

**STUDY TWO: GRADUATE COMPETENCE FOLLOWING TRAINING**.............. 126  
  7.1  Introduction................................................................................................ 126  
  7.2  Preliminary Data Screening: Graduates (N=20) .................................... 126  
  7.3  Univariate analyses .................................................................................. 127  
  7.4  Observed transfer of training ................................................................. 127  
  7.5  Self-reported transfer of training ............................................................. 130  
  7.6  Therapist Development: Currently Experienced Career Growth .......... 131  
  7.7  Organisational Barriers .......................................................................... 131  
  7.8  Summary: univariate analyses for graduates ......................................... 131  

**STUDY TWO: BIVARIATE ANALYSES OF GRADUATE DATA** ....................... 132  
  7.9  Observed and self-reported competence and therapist factors ............ 132  
  7.10 Summary: Bivariate analyses for graduate data .................................... 134  
  7.11 Post Hoc Analyses ................................................................................ 134  
  7.12 Summary: Post hoc visual analyses ...................................................... 138  

Chapter Eight .................................................................................................... 141  

**DISCUSSION** ............................................................................................. 141  
  8.1  Therapist Competence and Training Effects in CBT ......................... 141  
  8.2  Transfer of Training ............................................................................... 143  
  8.3  Therapist factors during Training ........................................................... 149  
  8.4  Therapist factors following Training ..................................................... 156  

xi
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix A:</th>
<th>Massey University Human Ethics Committee Approval</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A-1:</td>
<td>Information sheet and consent form: Trainee and Graduate participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A-2:</td>
<td>Information sheet and consent form: Client participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A-3:</td>
<td>Information sheet and consent form: Workplace consent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A-4:</td>
<td>Information sheet and consent form: Clients under 16 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A-5:</td>
<td>Information sheet and consent form: Parental consent for clients participants under 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B-1:</td>
<td>The Cognitive Therapy Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B-3:</td>
<td>The Professional Development Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C:</td>
<td>Study One: mid-training relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix D:</td>
<td>Confidentiality Agreement with the independent rater</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.1  Investigation of hypotheses: Studies One and Two………………68
Table 4.2  Summary of Study One participant demographics (N=16)……78
Table 4.3  Schedule for submission of data during training (N=16)……79
Table 4.4  Descriptive statistics for Study One completers 
   and Past Trainees 1-9 years following training……………………83
Table 4.5  Summary of Study Two participant demographics (N=20)……84
Table 5.1  Percentage of missing data: Study One (N=16)………………90
Table 5.2  Baseline correlations: all variables (N=16) ……………………94
Table 5.3  Skew and kurtosis for the Cognitive Therapy 
   Scale and subscales at baseline……………………………………95
Table 5.4  Correlations for the Cognitive Therapy Scale 
   and subscales: all assessments………………………………………97
Table 5.5  Means and standard deviations for the 
   Cognitive Therapy Scale and subscales at baseline, mid-training, 
   post-training and follow-up (N=16)…………………………….98
Table 5.6  CTS mean comparisons with CBT therapists 
   from the TDCRP (N=8)……………………………………………99
Table 5.7  Skew and kurtosis for Current Practice and 
   Self-confidence (N=16) …………………………………………...106
Table 5.8  Current Practice and Self-Confidence during training (N=16)…106
Table 5.9  Training effects: Current Practice and Self-confidence during 
   training (N=16)…………………………………………………..107
Table 5.10 Career Growth: skew and kurtosis (N=16) at baseline ……110
Table 5.11  Means and standard deviations for Career Growth during training (N=16) .........................................................111

Table 5.12  Means and standard deviations: Organisational Barriers during training (N=16) ..........................................................114

Table 5.13  Organisational Barriers: item means, standard deviations and rank: during training (N=16) ..............................117

Table 6.1  Post-training relationships between training effects and trainee factors (N=16)...................................................... 121

Table 7.1  Graduate CTS total scale and subscale relationships (N=20).................................................................128

Table 7.2  CTS total scale and subscale means and standard deviations following training (N=20).........................................................128

Table 7.3  Means and standard deviations: Current Practice and Self-Confidence following training (N=20) ......................130

Table 7.4  Relationships between observed and self-reported competence, Organisational Barriers and career growth 1-9 years following training (N=20) .................................................................133

LIST OF FIGURES

xv
Figure 2.1  Anticipated and actual trainee performance before, during and following training…………………………………………………………………………………11
Figure 3.1  Hypothesized relationships between trainee factors and training effects during and following training……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………...xvi