Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
MAPPING COGNITIVE ARCHITECTURES: AN INFORMATION PROCESSING APPROACH

RICHARD J. PECH
1998
Mapping Cognitive Architectures: An Information Processing Approach

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for

the degree of PhD

at Massey University

Richard Jan Pech

1998
Abstract

This research attempts to answer the following question. How can the critical knowledge and mental processes used by people as they respond to their work demands and interact with their work environment, be identified and portrayed? This study uses an information processing model to focus on cognitively-based management competencies. The MAPA model, describes four crucial and interrelated stages in the recognition of what is thought to occur in human information processing. The resulting cognitive architectures reveal specific organisationally-valued knowledge, providing the basis for work-specific curriculum design. Organisational discrepancies of a cognitively-based nature are also identifiable.

A sample of New Zealand Army officers (N=103), comprising lieutenants, captains, and majors, completed questionnaires about their work-related cognitive processes. The MAPA model has facilitated greater understanding of respondents’ combined work-related knowledge and knowledge structures.

The cognitive architectures identified by this research reveal that New Zealand Army officers have wide patterns of connectivity. This suggests that many theories are too simplistic in their descriptions of managerial and/or leadership behaviour. Prototype architectures devolved from the data illustrate a variety of cognitive activities appearing initially as people-oriented, such as listening, coaching, caring, and guiding, but which are instigated for the purpose of achieving the set task. This suggests that respondents perceive supportive Abilities to provide the most important method for achieving some tasks. This finding creates a theoretical paradox. Using commonly-held views on work orientations, it could be argued that some people have a task orientation while applying supportive behaviours in order to achieve that task. The stereotypical view of the task orientation is also disputed however, as the cognitive architectures resulting from this study indicate that concern with task completion is achieved predominantly through the use of what has been categorised as thinking functions, in that they represent problem solving and assessing Abilities. The findings suggest that army officers predominantly
employ a deliberate information processing strategy of supportive behaviour in order to complete their goals.

In summary, this study explores a scientific approach for the recognition of cognitively-based competencies of managerial-level personnel. The results suggest that twelve Accomplishments describe the cognitively-based managerial-level competencies most valued by the New Zealand Army. In the process of identifying these value-added attributes, some organisational idiosyncrasies have been detected that, it is argued, may ultimately jeopardise the New Zealand Army’s attempts to successfully implement its stated war-fighting and command operating doctrines.
Acknowledgements

Numerous people have contributed in some way to the completion of this thesis. Firstly, I would like to thank my supervisors, Professor Graham Hunt, Emeritus Professor Nan Kinross, and Dr. Lynn Hunt for their encouragement and help, especially during the latter part, when the end appeared tantalisingly close and yet continued to remain elusively distant. I would also like to thank Alex Doyle-Bogicevic who opened the world of macros and formatting for me, and my brother Robert Pech, who critiqued my spelling and grammar. Thanks to Dr. Ted Drawneek for his contribution in the use of discriminant analysis and Dr. John Spicer for his valuable comments on my analytical methods. John Tonken-Covell and Major Rick Odem also deserve a special mention for permitting access to groups of officers attending their army courses.

I would like to thank my parents who were always there for me and who were constant pillars of support. My final thanks go to Sophia, Josiah, Krista, and Uri, who showed such remarkable understanding during the numerous and lengthy periods spent at the computer.
# Contents

Abstract.............................................................................................................................................. iii

Acknowledgements........................................................................................................................................ v

Contents ...................................................................................................................................................... vii

Appendices ................................................................................................................................................... xi

List Of Figures .............................................................................................................................................. xii

List Of Exhibits ........................................................................................................................................... xvi

**SECTION ONE................................................................................................................................. 1**

Chapter One. Rationale................................................................................................................................. 3
  
Introduction .................................................................................................................................................. 3

Background .................................................................................................................................................... 5

The Driving Force Of Competition .............................................................................................................. 7

An Information Processing Approach ......................................................................................................... 9

An Example ................................................................................................................................................... 13

The Research Goal ....................................................................................................................................... 14

This Is Not Just *Another* Piece Of Leadership Research ....................................................................... 15

The Limitations Of A Training Needs Analysis ......................................................................................... 16

Summary ..................................................................................................................................................... 18

Chapter Two. Problems Associated With The Identification Of Competencies ........................................... 19
  
Introduction ................................................................................................................................................ 19

The Problem With Implicit Knowledge ........................................................................................................ 21

Summary ..................................................................................................................................................... 25

Chapter Three. The Importance Of Context, Structure, and Organisation .................................................. 29
  
Introduction ................................................................................................................................................ 29

Knowledge Structures And Processing Ability .......................................................................................... 30

The Knowledge-Process Hierarchy ............................................................................................................... 33

The MAPA Model ....................................................................................................................................... 35

Choosing The Research Instrument ............................................................................................................ 41

Summary ..................................................................................................................................................... 41

Chapter Four. An Information Processing Approach .................................................................................... 43
  
Introduction ................................................................................................................................................ 43

Interrogating The Mind ............................................................................................................................... 44
### SECTION TWO

**Chapter Five. New Zealand Army Doctrine**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The New Zealand Army: Its Operating Philosophy</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manoeuvre Theory</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Push - Complexity</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Push - Speed</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Push - Ambiguity</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Application Of Manoeuvre Theory</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Command Systems</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Command Climate</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter Six. Command, Management, And Leadership**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Command Definitions</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Increasing Emphasis On Conceptual Skills</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structured Decision-Making Versus Intuition</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching For A Transfer Of Learning</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflict Between Managing The Task And Managing The People</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leader Power And Leader Functions</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Over-Controlling Leader</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Command, Management, Leadership - Functions</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide and instil purpose</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Providing direction</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Providing motivation</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustaining continued effectiveness</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Command, Management, Leadership - Characteristics</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Van Fleet and Yukl's Military Leadership Findings</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The New Zealand Situation</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Variables In A Theory Of Military Leadership</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociodemographic variables</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychological dynamics</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Situational variables</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Command And Adding Value</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Command: A New Interface</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary, Synthesis, And Implications</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building A Theoretical Profile</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### SECTION THREE

**Chapter Seven. Methodology: Data Collection, Its Storage, Editing And Coding**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Problem</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Research Goal</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instrument Design</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Pilot Phase</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Sample And Population</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter Nine. Discussion .......................................................... 253
Introduction ............................................................................. 253
The Research Instrument ....................................................... 253
Missions .................................................................................. 254
The Value Being Added .......................................................... 255
Complete Cognitive Architectures And Their Implications ....... 259
Command In A Context Of Conflict .......................................... 262
Supporting Whole-Brain Learning ............................................ 268
Implications For Artificial Intelligence (AI) And Intelligence Augmentation (IA) ....................................................... 269
The Verbal Media .................................................................... 272
Expressive Functions ................................................................ 274
The Absence Of Creativity ....................................................... 275
Leadership Theory Implications And A More Detailed Model Of Command .......................................................... 277

Chapter Ten. Conclusions ....................................................... 285
Introduction ............................................................................. 285
Conclusions ............................................................................ 286
The Research Instrument – Some Limitations ......................... 302
Further Research .................................................................... 303
Summary .................................................................................. 305
References ............................................................................... 307
Magazines And Periodicals ..................................................... 332
Files, Doctrine Publications, And Field Manuals ..................... 332

Glossary ................................................................................... 335
Appendices ...................................................................................................................... 343
Appendix One – The MAPA Research Instrument ................................................................. 344
Appendix Two - Ethics Committee approval................................................................. 369
Appendix Three - Army Approval for research......................................................... 371
Appendices

Appendix 1  MAPA questionnaire, information sheet and consent form......344
Appendix 2  Ethics Committee approval...........................................369
Appendix 3  Research approval from the New Zealand Army................371
List Of Figures

FIGURE 3.1 Knowledge-Process Hierarchy (MAPA - Mission, Accomplishments, Performances, Abilities) from Hunt and Kinross, 1988) .........................................................38

FIGURE 4.1 A Hypothetical Reconstruction Of A Respondent’s Perception Of The Accomplishment Personnel Management .........................................................48

FIGURE 6.1 The Command System ...................................................................87

FIGURE 6.2 Skills Required At Different Levels Of Command ...........................89

FIGURE 6.3 The Climate Of Command - Past And Future ..................................91

FIGURE 6.4 Approximate Correspondence Of Yukl And Van Fleet’s Taxonomy With Mintzberg’s Taxonomy. (From Van Fleet & Yukl, 1986, pp. 37-41) ....127

FIGURE 6.5 A Conceivably Ideal Hierarchical Cognitive Profile And Influences Upon An Officer Displaying The New Command Paradigm ............................143

A reduced copy of page 3 of the MAPA questionnaire relating the New Zealand Army’s mission statement and then asking for the respondent’s mission statement describing his/her current position .................................................................159

A reduced sample copy of the Accomplishments from the MAPA questionnaire asking respondents to rate their perceptions of the given Accomplishments .......................163

A reduced sample copy of Performances from the MAPA questionnaire asking respondents to rate their perceptions of the Performances required to complete the first (most highly ranked) Accomplishment - six duplicate pages allowed respondents to repeat this process for their most highly rated Accomplishments ........................................165

A reduced sample copy of page 7 of the MAPA questionnaire which is duplicated six times to accompany the six Performances pages. These pages are not completed until the respondent has finished rating the pages describing his/her Performances ........166

A reduced sample copy from the MAPA questionnaire displaying a list of possible Abilities for describing Performances. A pullout version of this page was provided with each questionnaire to enable respondents to place this list beside their paired worksheets ........................................................................................................167

FIGURE 8.1 Mission Groups And The Importance Of Accomplishments ........185

FIGURE 8.2 The Basic Components Of The Hybrid Parallel Distributed Processing Analysis To Be Used For Analysing Data From The MAPA Model ..................................208

FIGURE 8.3 Personnel Management ..................................................................237

FIGURE 8.4 Organization Management ..............................................................237

FIGURE 8.5 Military Knowledge .......................................................................237

FIGURE 8.6 Resource Managing .................................................................238

FIGURE 8.7 Professional Knowledge ...............................................................238
FIGURE 8.8  Leadership.................................................................................................................................................. 238
FIGURE 8.9  Operations Management........................................................................................................................................ 239
FIGURE 8.10 Financial Management........................................................................................................................................... 239
FIGURE 8.11 Training Management............................................................................................................................................... 239
FIGURE 8.12 Liaison ........................................................................................................................................................................... 240
FIGURE 8.13 Communication............................................................................................................................................................ 240
FIGURE 8.14 Business Management................................................................................................................................................ 240
FIGURE 9.1 Decision Making Model In Response To Opponent’s Action ............................................................... 266
FIGURE 9.2 Accomplishments And Their Cognitive Functions................................................................................................. 271
FIGURE 9.3 Leadership Portrayed At A Macro Cognitive Level.................................................................................................... 278
FIGURE 9.4 The New Zealand Command System: An Alternative Model Based On The MAPA Findings ................................................................. 283
FIGURE 10.1 The Cognitive Architecture – Pattern Of Activation For Leadership.................................................. 293
FIGURE 10.2 A Cognitive Architecture Of The Accomplishment Leadership: The Complete Pattern Of Connectivity .................................................. 297
Panels

PANEL 4.1 Searle (1995) On The Difficulty Of Understanding The Mind ........................................45
PANEL 5.1 The New Zealand Army Doctrinal Philosophy ...............................................................62
PANEL 5.2 Dixon (1976, pp. 397-398) On The Bay Of Pigs .............................................................74
PANEL 5.3 Janis (1972) On The Central Cause Of Group Think ....................................................75
PANEL 5.4 Harig (1996) On The Potential Dangers Of An Addiction To High Technology ....79
PANEL 6.1 Managerial Leadership Roles And Competencies From Quinn, Faerman, Thompson, And McGrath (1990) .............................................................118
PANEL 6.2 Key Command Personality Traits (Graco, 1988) ...........................................................119
PANEL 6.3 Van Fleet And Yukl's Definition Of Managerial Behaviours (From Van Fleet & Yukl, 1986, pp. 38-39) .............................................................................................123
PANEL 6.4 Content Analysis By Van Fleet And Yukl Of Career Descriptions Of Military Leaders (From Van Fleet & Yukl, 1986, p. 84) .................................................................125
PANEL 6.5 Some Variables Influencing Commanders' Personality And Behaviour (From Rejai & Phillips, 1996) .........................................................................................130
PANEL 9.1 Respondent Perceptions Of Importance Of Accomplishments ................................256
List Of Tables

TABLE 6.1 Factors Appearing In Three Or More Leadership Studies, From Research By Stogdill (1974, p. 93) .............................................................. 115
TABLE 7.1 Sample Size In Relation To The Total Possible Research Population .......... 157
TABLE 8.1 Biographical Data ................................................................................. 178
TABLE 8.2 Employment Type For Respondents ....................................................... 178
TABLE 8.3 Rank And Number Of Respondents ......................................................... 179
TABLE 8.4 Number Of Respondents Deployed Operationally And/Or For Peace Keeping Purposes During The Course Of Their Careers With Army ........................................ 179
TABLE 8.5 Number Of Years Employed By The New Zealand Army .......................... 180
TABLE 8.6 Function In Which The Majority Of Time Was Spent During Career .......... 180
TABLE 8.7 Highest Educational Qualification At Time Of Completing Questionnaire .... 180
TABLE 8.8 Mission Statement Categories .................................................................. 182
TABLE 8.9 Identifying Differences Between Accomplishments Perceived To Be Required For Each Mission Category .................................................. 188
TABLE 8.10 Descriptive Analyses Of Accomplishments ............................................ 191
TABLE 8.11 Frequency Of Ratings Of Importance For Each Accomplishment And The Percentage Represented By 0 – Not Applicable .............................................. 194
TABLE 8.12 Identifying Differences Between Army Rank And Perceived Importance Of Accomplishments ......................................................... 196
TABLE 8.13 Identifying Differences Between Army Work Mission And Perceived Importance Of Performances ...................................................... 198
TABLE 8.14 Identifying Differences Between Army Rank And Perceived Importance Of Performances ............................................................... 201
TABLE 8.15 Analysis Of Performances Appearing In The PAVA Models .................. 224
TABLE 8.16 Cognitive Function Classifications Of Abilities ....................................... 230
TABLE 8.17 Categorising Abilities into Cognitive Functions ....................................... 235
TABLE 8.18 Receptive Cognitive Functions .............................................................. 241
TABLE 8.19 Thinking Cognitive Functions .............................................................. 242
TABLE 8.20 Expressive Cognitive Functions ............................................................ 243
TABLE 8.21 Greatest Challenges As Described By Respondents .................................. 246
TABLE 8.22 Frequency Distributions Of Army Rank And Greatest Challenge .............. 247
### List Of Exhibits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exhibit</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXHIBIT 8.1</td>
<td>PAVA Model Of The Accomplishment Personnel Management</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXHIBIT 8.2</td>
<td>PAVA Model Of The Accomplishment Organisational Management</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXHIBIT 8.3</td>
<td>PAVA Model Of The Accomplishment Military Knowledge</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXHIBIT 8.4</td>
<td>PAVA Model Of The Accomplishment Resource Managing</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXHIBIT 8.5</td>
<td>PAVA Model Of The Accomplishment Professional Knowledge</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXHIBIT 8.6</td>
<td>PAVA Model Of The Accomplishment Leadership</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXHIBIT 8.7</td>
<td>PAVA Model Of The Accomplishment Operations Management</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXHIBIT 8.8</td>
<td>PAVA Model Of The Accomplishment Financial Management</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXHIBIT 8.9</td>
<td>PAVA Model Of The Accomplishment Training Management</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXHIBIT 8.10</td>
<td>PAVA Model Of The Accomplishment Liaison</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXHIBIT 8.11</td>
<td>PAVA Model Of The Accomplishment Communication</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXHIBIT 8.12</td>
<td>PAVA Model Of The Accomplishment Business Management</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>