

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

He Mahi Whakamanakore:
Destruction of Indigenous
Heritage Sites at Otuparae.
A Case Study of the Otuparae
Headland Development

A thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of

Master of Philosophy
in
Resource and Environmental Planning

Massey University, Manawatu

Hemopereki Hoani Simon

**Ngati Tuwharetoa, Te Arawa Whanui, Ngati Manawa,
Tuhoe, Waikato, Ngati Maru**

2011

Abstract

This thesis examines indigenous cultural heritage site destruction in Aotearoa, New Zealand. In particular, it examines what took place within a planning system to approve the destruction of the heritage site at Otuparae, near Taupo. This thesis seeks to identify what contributed to the decision to grant approval to developers without consultation with the local *hapu*, Ngati Rauhoto. The research is framed in a form of *Kaupapa* Maori Research (KMR) called *whakawhanaungatanga*. Analysis of critical ethnography, key actor interviews, participant observation, field notes in research journals, videos, and documents took place to gather data. A review of the colonial history of Ngati Tuwharetoa revealed that over time the Crown usurped the *mana*, power and sovereignty of Tuwharetoa. In doing so, the Crown left Tuwharetoa politically, socially, economically and culturally weak, forcing Tuwharetoa to enter into Crown-controlled and created legal and political frameworks. Additionally, the Crown instituted a governance model based on colonial thinking. This thesis contributes to the body of knowledge about the need to incorporate different worldviews into planning to achieve sustainable development. It does so by examining how the heritage protection frameworks, in particular the Historic Places Act 1993, the Resource Management Act 1991 (RMA) and the associated Crown agencies failed to meet their obligations, by neglecting to consult with the correct group and to meet their needs in terms of heritage protection. It then moves to provide a development framework for Ngati Tuwharetoa to better contribute to decision-making processes in the future based on the needs of *hapu*.

Dedication

In Loving Memory of a Great Inspiration

Rangiiria Headley

**Moe mai ra e te Mareikura, te uri o Raukatauri.
Whakarongo ki nga Putorino e tangi ana.
Hoki atu ki kui ma, ki koro ma. Moe mai ra!**

Acknowledgements

I te timatanga ko Te Kore
Ko Te Ponui, Poroa
Wehenga Matua, Herenga Tangata
He Toa Rangatahi
He Toa Rangatira
Whakaki ki te maunga
Tae ki te whenua
Hoki atu ki te rangi
Piki ake, Piki ake i te Ara Poutama
Wairua, Hinengaro, Tinana
Ka Puta, Ka Puta ki te whai ao
Ki Te Ao Marama
Haumi e, Ui e, Taiki e!

Kia a koutou kua hinga atu ki te po, moe mai ra.

Kia a koutou i hapai, a, I tautoko ana I tenei kaupapa tino whakahirahira mo tatou no Ngati Tuwharetoa, anei ra aku mihi ki a koutou.

Ka tahuri enei mihi ki toku whanau – koutou I kawē i au I runga tenei haerenga – nga mihi.

He mihi mahana tenei ki toku Amorangi a Christine Cheyne mo o korero, to mahi e arahi I au. *Tena Koe e whaea!*

Mauri Ora!

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	ii
Dedication.....	iii
Acknowledgements.....	iv
Table of Contents.....	v
List of Illustrations.....	ix
List of Abbreviations.....	x
Glossary of Te Reo Maori Words and Terms.....	xi
Chapter 1: Introduction.....	1
1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 Research Context.....	1
1.3 Knowledge Gap and Questions.....	3
1.4 Background.....	3
1.4.1 Heritage Planning and Indigenous People.....	3
1.4.2 <i>Kaitiakitanga</i> and the RMA.....	4
1.4.3 Heritage Theory and Cultural Identity.....	6
1.4.3 Heritage Site.....	6
1.4.4 Tuwharetoa and Heritage Planning.....	8
1.4.5 Decolonisation.....	8
1.4.6 Indigenous Rights.....	9
1.2.8 Destruction.....	10
1.4 Methodology.....	11
1.5 Thesis Outline.....	11
Chapter 2: Literature Review.....	13
2.1 Introduction.....	13
2.2 Heritage as a Field.....	13
2.3 Cultural Identity and Theory.....	16
2.4 Indigenous Knowledge Transfer.....	18
2.5 Sovereignty and Self-Determination.....	18
2.6 Maori Land.....	21
2.7 Maori and the Resource Management Act.....	24
2.8 Maori and Local Government.....	26
2.9 Specific Issues to Maori Heritage Management.....	27
2.10 Conclusion.....	30
Chapter 3: Background.....	32
3.1 Introduction.....	32
3.2 Tuwharetoa and <i>Te Tiriti o Waitangi</i>	32
3.3 The Coming of <i>Pakeha</i> to Tuwharetoa.....	36
3.4 The Bad Deeds of the Government.....	38
3.5 Te Kooti and the Taupo Invasion.....	41
3.6 Incarceration at Heretaunga.....	45
3.7 The ‘Land Taking Court’.....	46
3.8 <i>Rahui Whenua v National Park</i>	48
3.9 Turn of the Century.....	52
3.10 Native Schools for Maori.....	54
3.11 New Wave in Governance.....	55

3.12 The Hand of the Crown and its Board	56
3.13 Conclusions.....	59
Chapter 4: Theory.....	62
4.1 Introduction.....	62
4.2 Cultural Theory and Cultural Memory	62
4.4 Heritage and Sustainable Development	63
4.5 Neoliberalism and Heritage	66
4.6 Constructivism	67
4.7 Conclusion	67
Chapter 5: Methodology	69
5. 1 Introduction.....	69
5.2 The Underlying <i>Tikanga</i> — <i>Tika, Pono</i> , and Maori Research Ethics	69
5.3 Kaupapa Maori Research.....	70
5.4 <i>Whakawhanaungatanga</i> —A Maori Centred Research Method	72
5.5 Nga Hononga—Establishing My <i>Whanau</i> Relationships.....	73
5.5.1 <i>Whakawhanaungatanga</i>	73
5.5.2 <i>Hapu</i> with <i>Mana Whenua</i>	75
5.5.3 Other <i>Iwi</i> with Interests.....	75
5.5.4 Location of ' <i>Whangai</i> ' in This Research—Ngati Whakaue	76
5.5.5 Participant-Driven Approaches to Power and Control	78
5.5.6 Researcher Involvement as Lived Experience	80
5.6 Collecting the Data	82
5.6.1 Participant Observation.....	84
5.6.2 Critical Ethnography.....	85
5.6.3 Analysis of Field Notes in Research Journals.....	87
5.6.4 Key Actor Interviews.....	89
5.6.7 Wananga as a CRFG Focus Group.....	91
What makes using <i>wananga</i> a culturally responsive is that it meets the criteria that the researcher modified from Rodrigues <i>et al.</i> journal article on what at culturally responsive Researcher in that <i>wananga</i> are socially conscious, it operates from an asset-based model seeing the participants' perspectives and stories are opportunities for understanding reality and co-constructing that knowledge, creates comfortable environments that allow authentic sharing of experience, acknowledges the participants' identity, and is reflexive an the experiences that the group has experienced. Therefore, <i>wananga</i> can be considered a kind of natural and culturally appropriate and responsive focus group.	93
5.6.5 Video Analysis.....	95
5.6.6 Document Analysis.....	95
5.7 Ethics.....	96
5.8 Validation.....	96
5.9 Conclusion	97
Chapter 6: Data Analysis	99
6.1 Introduction.....	99
6.2 Historical Information.....	99
6.3 The Sensitive Nature of the Area.....	101
6.4 Treatment of the Site.....	101
6.5 Decision-Making Processes.....	102

6.5.1 Tuwharetoa Maori Trust Board	102
6.5.2 Exclusion from Planning Processes	103
6.6 Quality of Leadership	104
6.7 Role of Cultural Ignorance in Planning	107
6.8 Role of <i>Kaumatua</i>	112
6.9 Ngati Rauhoto's Issues	116
6.10 Closing Remarks	119
7: Conclusions	121
7.1 Good Consultation Processes Needed	121
7.2 Good Information Needed In Planning Decisions	122
7.3 Better Recognition of Maori Cultural Values	122
7.4 Power and Control in the Planning System	123
7.5 Improved Legislation Needed	124
7.6 Traditional Knowledge Transfer and Heritage Planning	125
7.7 Improvement in Governance	126
7.8 The Interface of Planning and Maori Development	127
Chapter 8: Recommendations: <i>Mo Nga Mokopuna</i>	128
8.1 Introduction	128
8.2 Research Culture	129
8.2.1 The Aim	129
8.2.2 Facilities	131
8.2.3 University/ <i>Wananga</i>	131
8.2.4 Suggested <i>Iwi</i> Development Goals	133
8.2.5 <i>Whare Taonga</i>	134
8.2.6 <i>Te Whare Rangahau o Ngati Tuwharetoa</i>	136
8.2.7 <i>Te Putea Rangahau</i>	136
8.2.8 Awards for Research and Educational Achievement	136
8.3 Governance	137
8.3.1 Tuwharetoa Maori Trust Board	137
8.3.2 Tuwharetoa <i>Hapu</i> Forum	138
8.3.3 New Governance Structure: <i>Runanga-a-hapu</i>	139
8.4 Leadership	146
8.5 Economic Development and Investment	149
8.6 Historic Site Protection	150
Appendix 1	151
Appendix 2	154
Appendix 3	159
Appendix 4	169
Appendix 5	170
Appendix 6	177
Appendix 7	180
Appendix 8	183
Bibliography	186

List of Illustrations

Figure 1 Map of Taupo showing Otuparae on the western side of Tapuaeharuru Bay, South of Acacia Bay.....	2
Figure 2: <i>Kaupapa</i> Maori Research Discussion Panel Model for Social Science Research	83
Table 1: Ngati Tuwharetoa’s anticipated need for Post-Graduate Education	130
Figure 3: Centralised Service Agency (CSA) Model	142
Figure 4: The Runanga Owned Enterprises (ROEs) Model	143
Figure 5: THF Governance Model	144
Figure 6: Traditional Leadership Model	146

List of Abbreviations

CSA	Centralised Service Agency
HPA	Historic Places Act 1993
HPT	Historic Places Trust
IWGIA	International Working Group for Indigenous Affairs
KMR	Kaupapa Maori Research
RMA	Resource Management Act 1991
ROE	Runanga Owned Enterprises
TMTB	Tuwharetoa Maori Trust Board
THF	Tuwharetoa hapu Forum
TPK	Te Puni Kokiri
UN	United Nations
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organisation

Glossary of Te Reo Maori Words and Terms¹

Ahi kaa roa	The tikanga principle of keeping a person's, iwi's, or hapu's claim to an area current by constant interaction with the whenua and/or people
Aotearoa	Popularised Maori name for New Zealand
Aroha	Love, Compassion
Awhi	Support, Embracive Actions
Hapu	Sub-Nation, Nation
Hikoi	Pilgrimage, Journey
Hui	Meeting
Iwi	Indigenous Nation
Kainga	Village, Small Settlement
Kaitiaki	Traditional Gaurdian, Custodian
Kaitiakitanga	Traditional Maori principle or ethic of Gaurdianship, Stewardship
Karakia	Incantation, Prayer
Karanga	Traditional female vocal arts of calling
Kaumatua	An elder who gaurds traditional knowledge and tikanga
Kaupapa Maori	The philosophy and practice of being Maori
Koeke	The elderly
Koiwi	Skeletal Remains, Bones
Komiti Whakahaere	Governance Committee, Organising Committee
Korero	Talk, Discuss, Address
Kotahitanga	Togetherness, Unity
Kuia	Elderly Female
Mahinga Kai	Traditional food gathering places
Mamae	Pain, Hurt
Mana	Authority
Mana Whenua	Power and authority associated with the occupation of traditional lands
Manaakitanga	To look after
Marae	Traditional meeting space or courtyard usually surrounded be meeting and eating houses
Matauranga	Knowledge
Maunga	Mountain (usually ancestral)
Mauri	Life Principle, Life Force
Moko	The product of Maori skin art traditions
Mokopuna	Grandchildren, Grandchild
Nga Whakatipuranga	Coming Generations
Pa	Traditional fortified Village

¹ The English translations provided are for the purposes of this thesis and are used in that context. In many cases there

Paewhenua	Traditional Territory
Pakanga	Battle, Warfare
Pakeha	A person (generally) of European descent
Panui	Public Annoucement, Public Notice
Patu	Short handled club
Pono	True, Truth
Pounamu	Greenstone, Nephrite Jade
Poupou	Posts usually carved
Pumanawa	Talents, Skills
Rangatira	Chief
Rohe	Area
Runanga	Governance Council
Ta	The act of giving or receiving Ta Moko
Ta moko uhi	Skin art chisel
Tangata Whenua	Indigenous People of the land
Tangihanga	Funeral Rite
Tamariki	Children
Taonga	Treasures
Taonga Ruku Iho	Treasures passed down from generation to generation
Tapu	Sacred
Te Iwi Patupaiarehe	The fairy-like people
Teina	Person of junior status
Tika	Right, Appropriate
Tikanga	Customs
Tikanga Maori	Maori Customs
Tino Rangatiratanga	Self Determination
Toa	Warrior, Brave
Toa Rangatira	Fighting Chief
Tohunga	Expert, Skilled Person
Tuahu	Sacred place for ritual practices by a tohunga
Tuakana	Person of senior status
Tuku	Act of giving or offering
Tupuna	Ancestor(s)
Uri	Descendant
Wahi tapu	Scared Sites, Sites of Cultural Significance
Waiata	Song(s)
Wairua	Spirituality
Wananga	Traditional School of Higher learning, to discuss, seminar
Whaikorero	Traditional Speechmaking
Whakaaro	Thought, Understanding
Whakapapa	Genealogy
Whakarau	Name given to the followers of Te Kooti, Captive
Whakatauki	Proverb, Proverbial Saying
Whakautu	To Repay

Whakawhanaungatanga	A Kaupapa Maori Research Methodology
Whanau	Family, Extended Family
Whangai	To Adopt, Adoptee, To Feed
Whare	House
Whare Taonga	Archive, Museum, Cultural Storage Facility
Whenua	Land