Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
ACCOUNTING IN HOSPITAL ORGANISATIONS
IN NEW ZEALAND: A QUALITATIVE STUDY IN
THE REFORM CONTEXT OF 1984-1994

A thesis presented for the degree of
Ph.D in Management Systems
at Massey University

KEITH DIXON
1994
Most general hospitals in New Zealand operate as part of the public sector. Since 1984, that sector has been the subject of radical, government led reforms. The espoused theory of these reforms has been expounded in terms of improving efficiency and effectiveness, and increasing accountability (Boston, Martin, Pallot & Walsh, 1991; G. Scott & Gorringe, 1989). The outward effects of these reforms on the hospital system consist of organisational changes, including the creation of hospital enterprises; changes to the way organisations are financed, including the use of taxes to purchase hospital products delineated according to diagnosis related groups [DRGs]; and changes to their management structures with a policy of general management replacing triumvirate management.

Inevitably, these official changes have led to social changes to the system in general, and to the situated practice of accounting (Chua, 1988). In this study, an attempt has been made to describe and interpret these changes in the hospital system context, and to shed some light on the way in which accounting has come to be practised within that context. The theoretical posture of the study is a blend of rational, structuralist perspectives, and natural, interactionist ones (Boland & Pondy, 1983; Roberts & Scapens, 1985; Silverman, 1985; Denzin, 1989b). Consistent with this posture, the study strategy of control and design is a version of analytic induction (Denzin, 1989b; Silverman, 1985). The strategy comprised three phases during which a rough notion of accounting in hospital organisations was transformed into a working interpretation; data were gathered and analysed; and a thesis was compiled. The latter comprises thick descriptions and thick interpretations (Denzin, 1989a, 1989b; Patton, 1990) of the hospital system context and the situated practice of accounting; and a theory-in-use (Argyris, 1990; Argyris & Schon, 1974) which provides "explanations in terms of conditions of possibility" (Miller, 1990, p. 329) of what has been occurring in the hospital system, and the role of this situated practice in these occurrences.

Underlying the study methodology was the notion of crafting both the study design and the theory which the study aimed to discover. The data were obtained using methods associated with naturalistic inquiry during time spent in the field. The use of these methods was prompted by a dearth of research published in this area relating to New Zealand, the wide range of perspectives among people participating or interested in the organisations, and the enormity of the changes to the system. The data were
accumulated triangulately (Denzin, 1989b) from among different kinds of participants working on hospital sites (e.g., doctors, charge nurses, other health professionals and hospital staff with managerial responsibilities), from interested parties off-site (e.g., people working in the Department of Health, regional health authorities and organisations outside of the hospital system), and from official documents and published academic literature. The main vehicle used in the field was the *nonschedule standardised interview* (Denzin, 1989b), and inquiries focused, in turn, on practices relating to the budget, cost data reports and the annual report. In addition, interviews of a more general and exploratory nature, and some questionnaires, were used in the preliminary stages of the study.

The picture which emerges from the study comprises four aspects:

(a) a hospital system subjected to macro-level disturbances that have caused a mixture of effects in terms of structures, processes, interactions and outcomes;

(b) an emergence of accounting since the mid-1980s in multiple roles, which are reflective and constitutive of organisational and social practices developing in the system (Ansari & Euske, 1987; Boland & Pondy, 1983; Burchell, Clubb & Hopwood, 1985; Chua, 1995; Kelly & Pratt, 1992; Loft, 1986; Roberts & Scapens, 1985);

(c) qualified success for the situated accounting practice in the role of a political force in converting hospitals to a more effective form of organisation (Mintzberg, 1991); and

(d) accounting practice at a fork in the road ahead, one way leading to its contamination of hospitals by inappropriate forces and forms (Mintzberg, 1991) based on production management; and the other leading to its emergence as an important support in a hospital system founded on a more conjoint organisational configuration (W. R. Scott, 1982) in which professionals and managers apply their craft cooperatively for the joint and several benefit of patients.

These findings have implications which policy makers, health professionals and the public are urged to evaluate.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I should like to acknowledge the many people who have contributed in various ways to my research and allowed and encouraged me to complete it. Professor Nancy Kinross has played an active part in guiding the study design, helping reflect on the analysis and criticising the thesis as it was being written. Professor Michael Pratt encouraged my original participation in the PhD programme, helped identify the study area and carry out the exploratory work, and provided guidance at a distance during the field experience and thesis phases. Dr Becky Emery also had a hand in the early work. The Health Workforce Development Fund of the Department of Health contributed to the costs of data collection, analysis and reporting. About 120 health workers gave their time to be interviewed or to complete questionnaires, and eight more helped me obtain access to these people. They and their organisations are thanked for confiding their experiences, opinions and feelings. During the writing of this thesis Professor Reg Mathews provided useful comments and encouragement. As it came towards completion, Professor Tony Vitalis made several useful suggestions. Miss Ruth Brodie assisted with the word processing, and Mr Andrew Rowatt helped in overcoming some complications with producing the Figures. Mrs Ann Austin provided editorial comments on the manuscript. I should also like to thank Hegnes, Krista and Harry, our friends, and my colleagues at Massey and elsewhere for their assistance, tolerance and understanding.

The permission of Prentice-Hall, publishers, to produce "Figure 4.1. The basic configuration of the professional organisation" from Henry Mintzberg, THE STRUCTURING OF ORGANIZATIONS, Copyright 1979, p. 355, is gratefully acknowledged. So, too, is the permission of Tony Becher and Maurice Kogan to produce "Figure 4.2. A model for higher education" from PROCESS AND STRUCTURE IN HIGHER EDUCATION, Copyright 1980, p. 19.

CONTENTS

Abstract .................................................................................. iii
Acknowledgements .................................................................. v

PART I: GRAND DESIGN OF THE STUDY AND THE THESIS

CHAPTER 1 PANORAMIC VIEW OF THE STUDY ................. 1

Key Aspects and Contributions to Knowledge ................. 1
Organisation of the Thesis .................................................. 4
Relevance of the Study ......................................................... 7
Importance of the Research .................................................. 8
Limitations of the Study ......................................................... 9
Contrast Between Doing the Study and the Way it is Reported .... 10

CHAPTER 2 METHODOLOGY AND DESIGN STRATEGY ......... 11

Introduction ............................................................................ 11
Accounting Research Methodology .................................. 12
The Emergence During the Study of Methodology, Purposes and Aims 13
The Contextual Relevance of the Method and Methodology .... 13
Getting Started ................................................................. 13
Qualitative Methods for Data Collection ......................... 13
Attaining a Theoretical Posture ...................................... 14
Strategy of Design and Control .................................... 15
An Elaboration of the Interplay Between the Study Design and its Setting ......................................................... 15
Interlink Between Issues in the Setting and the Study Aims .... 18
Situated Practice .............................................................. 22
Thick Description ............................................................ 22
Thick Interpretation .......................................................... 23
Reliability and Validity of the Study Methodology ........... 24
Interpretive Frameworks, Eclecticism and Triangulation .... 24
Field Research and Qualitative Inquiry ........................... 29
Validity and Reliability in Fieldwork ......................... 31
Some Prerequisites of Using Qualitative Methods ........... 32
Validity and Reliability in Control, Analysis and Reporting .. 33
Analytic Induction ............................................................ 34
Reporting Issues ............................................................... 35
Personal Values ................................................................. 36
Research Assumptions ......................................................... 40
Theoretical Posture ............................................................. 41
Ontological Assumptions ............................................... 42
Epistemological Assumptions ........................................ 43
Assumptions about Human Nature ................................. 44
Closing Pointers ................................................................. 44
CHAPTER 3 ACCOMPLISHING THE DESIGN AND CONTROL STRATEGY 46

Introduction ................................................. 46
Step 1: Developing a Rough Notion of Accounting in Hospital Organisations ................................................. 47
  First Rough Notion 1987 ................................................. 47
  Inducing the Second Rough Notion 1988 ......................... 47
  Visits to the G Hospital Board ................................................. 49
  Visits to the H Hospital Board ................................................. 51
  Reflection and Revision ................................................. 53
Step 2: Refining the Rough Notion into a Working Interpretation 1989-1991 ................................................. 56
  A Study in the G Area Health Board of Acquiring and Utilising Fixed Assets 1990-1991 ................................................. 57
  A Study of Hospital Organisation Central Finance Departments 1991 ................................................. 60
  Interviews with Commissioners and Senior Managers of Five Area Health Boards 1991 ................................................. 61
  Working Interpretation of Accounting in Relation to Hospital Organisations in New Zealand 1991 ................................................. 62
  Design Choices ................................................. 66
    Application of the Working Interpretation ......................... 68
    Interviews ................................................. 74
    Processing, Analysing and Organising the Data ......................... 78
      Moving from Raw Data to Within-Case Analysis and Case Descriptions ................................................. 79
      Focusing the Analysis ................................................. 82
Step 4: The Thesis ................................................. 87
Closing Pointers ................................................. 88

PART II: MAPPING OF THE HOSPITAL SYSTEM CONTEXT

CHAPTER 4 FUNCTIONS, VALUES, ORGANISATIONAL FORCES AND FORMS IN HOSPITAL ORGANISATIONS AND THE HOSPITAL SYSTEM ................................................. 89

Introduction ................................................. 89
The Configuration of Hospital Organisations ................................................. 90
Variety of Forms of Hospital Organisations ................................................. 93
Forces in Hospital Organisations ................................................. 96
Process and Structure in Social Policy Systems ................................................. 98
The Functions and Values Framework ................................................. 101
The Cast of Characters in the Thick Description ................................................. 105
Closing Pointers ................................................. 109
CHAPTER 5  THE PEOPLE IN THE OPERATING CORE AND SUPPORT SERVICES: THEIR ENVIRONMENT, WORK TASKS AND MOTIVATIONS ................................. 110

A Signpost ........................................ 110
Operating Core and Support Services .................. 110
Hospital Sites and Patients .......................... 111
  Patients .................................. 112
Wards and Charge Nurses ............................ 113
Doctors and Clinical Departments ................. 120
Clinical Support Services ......................... 126
Non-Clinical Support Services ....................... 129
Closing Pointers .................................. 135

CHAPTER 6  THE PEOPLE AT THE INSTITUTION LEVEL: THEIR ENVIRONMENT, WORK TASKS AND MOTIVATIONS .......................... 137

Institution Level Management ....................... 137
Hospital Service Managers and Support Staff .. 138
  The People .................................. 138
  Their Work .................................. 139
    Service and Nurse Managers .................. 139
    Financial Support Staff ...................... 140
  New Hospital Structures ....................... 142
  "Massive Changes" ................................ 145
  Reviews of the Service Management Structure .... 146
  Coordination .................................. 147
  Preparations for Crown Health Enterprises .... 148
Hospital Organisation Managers and Support Staff .. 151
  Changes in Responsibility and Orientation .... 152
    One Person's History ....................... 153
  Aspects of Work ................................ 156
  Financial Management and Systems ............. 158
  Cash, Accruals, Outputs, Balance Sheets and Profitability 160
  Future Prospects ................................ 163
Closing Pointers .................................. 163

CHAPTER 7  PEOPLE AT THE CENTRAL AUTHORITY LEVEL AND IN THE COMMUNITY WITH AN INTEREST IN HOSPITAL ORGANISATIONS ......................... 165

Central Authorities .................................. 165
  The Pre-Reform Period ......................... 166
  A New Period of Central-Local Relations .... 167
  Contract Negotiations and Analysis .......... 168
  Contract Monitoring ............................ 171
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 8</th>
<th>THE CONTEXT IN WHICH ACCOUNTING FUNCTIONS WITHIN HOSPITAL ORGANISATIONS AND THE HOSPITAL SYSTEM</th>
<th>201</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focal Points of the Interpretation</td>
<td></td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Characteristics Within Elements</td>
<td></td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Features Between Elements</td>
<td></td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Longitudinal Considerations</td>
<td></td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Analysis of the Operating Core and Support Service Levels</td>
<td></td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctors and Clinical Departments</td>
<td></td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurses and Wards</td>
<td></td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Health Specialist Staff and Clinical Support Service Departments</td>
<td></td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Clinical Technical and Ancillary Staff and Support Departments</td>
<td></td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prominent Relationships Between Basic Units</td>
<td></td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinical Departments and Wards</td>
<td></td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Clinical Departments (and Wards) and Clinical Support
Service Departments ........................................ 227
Wards and Non-Clinical Support Service Departments ... 230
An Analysis of the Institution Level ........................................ 232
Hospital Service Managers and Support Staff .......... 232
Parallel Hierarchies .................................................. 232
Loosely Coupled Systems ............................................. 233
Hospital Organisation Managers and Support Staff .... 236
The Distinction Between Hospital Organisation Managers and
Service Managers .................................................... 238
Institutions and Basic Units ........................................ 238
An Analysis of the Central Authority Level ......................... 246
Within the Central Authority Level .......................... 246
Central Authorities and Institutions ............................... 249
An Analysis of People in the Community ...................... 254
A Note on the Function and Values Framework ............. 256
Closing Pointers ...................................................... 258

PART III: DESCRIBING AND INTERPRETING THE SITUATED PRACTICE
OF ACCOUNTING WITHIN NEW ZEALAND HOSPITALS

CHAPTER 9 A THICK DESCRIPTION OF THE BUDGET CYCLE AND
PREPARATION OF THE BUDGET ................................. 259

A Signpost .............................................................. 259
The Primacy of Monitoring Spending and Budgeting .... 259
Sequence of Reporting the Situated Practice of Accounting 260
The Budget Cycle and Its Hospital Based Participants .... 260
Service Managers and Support Staff ............................. 261
Doctors Doing Managerial Work ..................................... 262
Charge Nurses .............................................................. 262
Clinical Support Service Managers ............................... 264
Non-clinical Support Service Managers ......................... 265
Budget Preparation: Experience at SITE Q ................... 266
Budget Preparation: Experience at SITE P .................... 268
The 1991-92 Budget ................................................. 270
The 1992-93 Budget ................................................. 271
The Allocation Process and the Role of Financial Services 273
Experiences of Participants ........................................ 277
Nurse Managers ......................................................... 277
A Chairman of a Clinical Department .......................... 282
Charge Nurses ........................................................... 284
Clinical Support Service Managers ......................... 286
Non-clinical Support Service Managers ..................... 290
Coordinating and Synthesising the Completed Discs ........ 293
Progress of the Budget Outside the Hospital ................. 294
"Working in a Sort of Limbo" ....................................... 299
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Importation of Accounting Ideas</td>
<td>387</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Rational Interpretation of the Emergence of Accounting Ideas</td>
<td>389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Micro-Macro Discord: &quot;Bomb Blasts&quot; and &quot;Aggravation&quot;</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduced Spending as an Unpopular Agenda</td>
<td>394</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems of Hierarchy</td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning Lags</td>
<td>396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short Run Spending Horizons</td>
<td>397</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Increased Productivity Increased Spending Paradox</td>
<td>399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verdict of More Good Than Harm</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variability of the Emergence of Loosely Coupled Structures</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor Quality Central Data</td>
<td>402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Data</td>
<td>402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsibility Centre Managers as Symbols of Formal Management Control?</td>
<td>403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power of the Medical Profession</td>
<td>405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard Costing</td>
<td>406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Other Health Professions</td>
<td>407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effects of Accounting on Relations Between Basic Units and Individuals</td>
<td>408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closing Pointers</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PART IV: ARTICULATING A NEW THEORY**

**CHAPTER 12 FROM SITUATED PRACTICE TO A THEORY-IN-USE OF ACCOUNTING IN NEW ZEALAND HOSPITALS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Opening Remarks</td>
<td>410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Theory of Accounting in New Zealand Hospital Organisations</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Rough Outline</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Theory Articulated: 1984 to 1993</td>
<td>413</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflecting on the Roles of Accounting 1984-1993</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future Speculation</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Summing Up</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concluding Remarks</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflections on Methodology</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Situating the Study in the Accounting Literature</td>
<td>458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future Research Topics</td>
<td>459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflections on the Researcher's Personal Journey</td>
<td>460</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**REFERENCES**

**APPENDICES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A</td>
<td>476</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B</td>
<td>483</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C</td>
<td>486</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit 2.1  Steps in the analytic induction control and design strategy of the study. .......................... 16
Exhibit 3.1  First rough notion of accounting in relation to hospital organisations in New Zealand developed from Dixon (1987). . . 47
Exhibit 3.2  Rough notion of accounting in relation to hospital organisations in New Zealand consistent with the researcher’s thinking in 1988. .................................................. 54
Exhibit 3.3  Working interpretation of accounting in relation to hospital organisations in New Zealand consistent with the researcher’s thinking in 1991. .................................................. 62
Exhibit 3.4  Sites on which the data collection for the substantive field experience phase were based. ................................. 70

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1  Composition of theoretical samples in connection with sites. . . 74
Table 4.1  Titles used in the thesis to label interviewees at Site P. ........... 106
Table 4.2  Titles used in the thesis to label interviewees at Site Q. ........... 107
Table 4.3  Titles used in the thesis to label interviewees at Site R. ........... 108
Table 12.1  Sources of contamination to the hospital system c.1988 ...... 416
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1  Sequence of moving from naturalistic inquiry to theory-in-use. . . 25
Figure 3.1  Sequence of moving from interview data to thick descriptions. . . 80
Figure 3.2  Functions and values framework of the hospital system which was used to focus the study analysis. ......................... 84
Figure 4.1  The basic configuration of the professional organisation. ....... 91
Figure 4.2  A model for higher education. ............................... 100
Figure 4.3  Functions and values framework of the New Zealand hospital system. .................................................. 104
Figure 6.1  Diagram of service management structure of a medium sized area health board. (Source: Manawatu-Wanganui Area Health Board, c. 1991). .................................................. 144
Figure 8.1A  Changes in three characteristics of the individual doctors element in the hospital system across three periods. .......... 206
Figure 8.1B  Changes in three characteristics of the clinical departments element in the hospital system across three periods. .......... 208
Figure 8.2  Changes in three features of the relationship between the individual doctors and clinical department elements in the hospital system across three periods. .......... 209
Figure 8.3A  Changes in three characteristics of the individual nurses element in the hospital system across three periods. .......... 212
Figure 8.3B  Changes in three characteristics of the wards element in the hospital system across three periods. .......................... 214
Figure 8.4  Changes in three features of the relationship between the individual nurses and wards elements in the hospital system across three periods. .......... 215
Figure 8.5A  Changes in three characteristics of the other health staff element in the hospital system across three periods. .......... 217
Figure 8.5B  Changes in three characteristics of the clinical support service departments element in the hospital system across three periods. ......................... 220
Figure 8.6 Changes in three features of the relationship between the other health staff and clinical support service departments elements in the hospital system across three periods. 

Figure 8.7A Changes in three characteristics of the non-clinical technical and ancillary workers element in the hospital system across three periods. 

Figure 8.7B Changes in three characteristics of the non-clinical support service departments element in the hospital system across three periods. 

Figure 8.8 Changes in three features of the relationship between the non-clinical technical and ancillary workers and non-clinical support service departments elements in the hospital system across three periods. 

Figure 8.9 Changes in three features of the relationship between the clinical departments and wards elements in the hospital system across three periods. 

Figure 8.10 Changes in three features of the relationship between the clinical departments and clinical support service elements in the hospital system across three periods. 

Figure 8.11 Changes in three features of the relationship between the wards and non-clinical support service departments in the hospital system across three periods. 

Figure 8.12 Changes in three characteristics of the hospital service managers and support staff element in the hospital system across three periods. 

Figure 8.13 Changes in three characteristics of the hospital organisation managers and support staff element in the hospital system across three periods. 

Figure 8.14A Changes in three features of the relationship between the clinical departments element and institution level in the hospital system across three periods. 

Figure 8.14B Changes in three features of the relationship between the wards element and institution level in the hospital system across three periods. 

Figure 8.14C Changes in three features of the relationship between the clinical support service departments element and institution level in the hospital system across three periods.
Figure 8.14D  Changes in three features of the relationship between the non-clinical support service departments element and institution level in the hospital system across three periods. 245

Figure 8.15  Changes in three characteristics of the central authorities level in the hospital system across three periods. 250

Figure 8.16  Changes in three features of the relationship between the central authorities and institution levels in the hospital system across three periods. 255

Figure 8.18  Changes in three characteristics of the people in the hospital system environment across three periods. 257

Figure 11.1  Developments in processes of accounting in the hospital system across three periods. 390