Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Learning about teachers’ resilience: Perceptions, challenges and strategies of policy implementation in two secondary schools in Malaysia

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Education at Massey University, Palmerston North, Manawatu, New Zealand.

AHMAD ZABIDI ABDUL RAZAK
2013
Abstract

Between 1996 and 2010 the Ministry of Education in Malaysia implemented several policies to ensure that the education system in Malaysia was able to fulfill current national and international demands. The Ministry argued that the policies being implemented had many potential benefits. However, changes in education also create new challenges for teachers because, while concentrating on teaching and learning, they are also required to focus on implementing the new policies.

These unavoidable challenges can influence the nature and quality of teachers’ practice. To ensure the success of important policy changes, the Malaysian education system needs resilient teachers, who are able to face all the challenges successfully. In the school context, educational leadership is expected to play a key role in supporting teachers in this challenging situation.

The intent of this study was to explore educators’ and parents’ views and experiences in these areas, including educational leadership practices which aimed to ensure that teachers sustain their resilience in times of facing real pressure. Data was collected through interviews with (i) members of Senior Management Teams (ii) selected teachers and (iii) selected members from committees of Parent and Teachers Associations in two secondary schools in Malaysia. In total 46 participants were involved in this study. Data analysis was carried out through analytic categories based on hermeneutics philosophy. The findings indicated that teachers faced various challenges during the implementation of national education policy, but teachers’ own inner strength, the role of PTA members, colleagues’ collegiality and the location of teachers’ schools in their hometown assisted them to sustain their resilience. All groups of participants claimed that educational leaders, as represented by members of Senior Management Teams at their schools, have played the main role in assisting teachers to face challenges and, indirectly, sustaining their resilience. Five approaches were utilised by the educational leaders: they provided a congenial working environment that did not place undue pressure on teachers, eased the burden for teachers in implementing the policy, provided encouraging monitoring, showed continuing appreciation; and promoted school success.
Acknowledgements

I would like to express my deepest gratitude and appreciation to my supervisors, Dr Marian Court and Professor Dr. John O’Neill for their excellence in supervision and devotion to this study that has inspired my journey. Without their scholarly guidance, support, encouragement, direction, comments and constructive criticism throughout this study, this thesis would have not been completed. They have provided continual invaluable advice, which will extend beyond this study. It has been an honourable journey working with them.

My deep appreciation is extended to the Malaysian Government and my employer, the University of Malaya for the scholarship and study leave, making it possible for me to complete my PhD programme at Massey University.

I would like to express thanks to the Director General, Macro Economic Section, Economic Planning Unit, Prime Minister’s Department and the Director of Education of Kedah for their support during the course of my data collection.

I am grateful to the members of Senior Management Teams, teachers and Parent Teacher Association members from two secondary schools in Malaysia who willingly became the participants in this study and shared their valuable insights in making this study a success. Without their participation, this study would not have been completed. I owe a particular debt to all those who willingly gave up valuable time to be interviewed.

I would like to express my thanks to the Graduate School of Education and the School of Educational Studies for the financial support to employ transcribers. Special thanks to Tracey Pinfold and Sharon Homburg for accommodating the many office requests. Thanks are also due to Harold for his editorial comments, Lorraine Anderson for reading and editing the entire manuscript and the library staff for their friendly services and support.

My deepest appreciation goes to my wife, Noor Shamshinar, and my children, Nurleen Afifah, Najmin Afif, Naim Afiq and Nazif Akhtar for their love, patience and understanding. The constant support, patience and encouragement of my family
have provided me with the enthusiasm to complete my study. My gratitude is also extended to my father, Abdul Razak and my mother, Zainab, my father in-law, Zakaria, my mother in-law, Che Zaharah, my sister Siti Aminah and Fazimah, my brothers, Nazli and Alizan, friends and colleagues, who have assisted me both in my study and my life making all this possible.

Ahmad Zabidi Abdul Razak
2013
List of commonly used acronyms and abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EPU</td>
<td>Economic Planning Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAB</td>
<td>Institute Aminuddin Baki</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPS</td>
<td>Institute of Principalship Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IQ</td>
<td>Intelligence Quotient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEPADC</td>
<td>Malaysian Education Principal and Executive Development Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOE</td>
<td>Ministry of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUHEC</td>
<td>Massey University Human Ethics Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPQH</td>
<td>National Professional Qualification for Headteachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NUTP</td>
<td>National Union of Teaching Profession</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLI</td>
<td>Poverty Line Income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTAs</td>
<td>Parent Teacher Associations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SED</td>
<td>State Education Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMTs</td>
<td>Senior Management Teams</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................... i

Acknowledgements ...................................................................................................................... ii

List of commonly used acronyms and abbreviations............................................................. iv

List of Figures and Tables ....................................................................................................... xvii

Chapter One ............................................................................................................................. 1

INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................ 1

1.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................... 1

1.2 Background and introducing the rationale for the study .................. 1

1.3 A focus for the study ...................................................................................... 5

1.4 Operationalising the research questions ...................................................... 6

1.5 The logic and content of the chapters ......................................................... 7

Chapter Two ............................................................................................................................. 9

THE DEVELOPMENT OF NATIONAL POLICY IN MALAYSIA ............ 9

2.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................... 9

2.2 Geographical Context ................................................................................... 10

2.3 Ethnic Context .............................................................................................. 12

2.4 Political Context ............................................................................................ 15

2.5 Issues Reflecting the Geographical, Ethnic and Political Context in Malaysia ..................................................................................................................... 17

2.5.1 Poverty ...................................................................................................... 17

2.5.2 Multi-ethnicity ......................................................................................... 18

2.5.3 Varying interests among political parties ............................................. 19

2.6 The National Policies ................................................................................... 20
5.4 Identifying and describing adverse conditions that require teacher resilience
5.4.1 Studies in urban and suburban schools
5.5 The relationship between demographic characteristics and teacher resilience
5.6 Protective factors in sustaining teacher resilience
5.6.1 Internal factors
5.6.2 External support factors
5.7 Theories of teacher resilience
5.7.1 Resilience as a psychological construct
5.7.2 Resilience: a multidimensional, socially constructed concept
5.8 Conclusion and implications for my current study

Chapter Six
EDUCATIONAL LEADERSHIP IN THE MALAYSIAN CONTEXT
6.1 Introduction
6.2 Issues of educational leadership and teacher resilience during educational policy changes in Malaysia
6.3 How concepts of educational leadership have been used and adopted by Malaysian scholars
6.4 Educational leadership training in Malaysia
6.4.1 The establishment of the Aminuddin Baki Institute and the formalization of educational leadership training in Malaysia
6.4.1.1 The Diploma in management and leadership
6.4.1.2 The National Professional Qualification for Headteachers (NPQH)
6.4.2 Institute of Principalship Studies in Malaysia
6.4.3 Department of Educational Management, Planning and Policy
6.5 Educational leadership as a source of influence on teachers’ work and students’ achievements ................................................................. 97

6.5.1 The role of educational leadership in providing support for teaching and learning ................................................................. 99

6.5.1.1 Educational Leadership for Change .................................. 100

6.5.1.2 Educational Leadership and Teachers’ Commitment ......... 103

6.5.1.3 Educational Leaders work to raise student outcomes ....... 104

Chapter Seven ................................................................................................. 111

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY ....................................................................... 111

7.1 The refined rationale and purpose of the study ......................... 111

7.2 Selecting a research methodology ..................................................... 113

7.2.1 The discussion of personal ontological and epistemological positioning .............................................................................. 118

7.2.2 Rationale for the case study method ........................................ 120

7.2.3 Types of case studies .................................................................... 123

7.2.4 Some limitations and strengths of the case study approach .... 124

7.3 A careful procedure to understand teacher resilience ............... 125

7.3.1 Ethical and research permission considerations ....................... 125

7.3.2 The researcher’s role in gaining access ........................................ 126

7.3.3 Selecting research sites ................................................................. 127

7.3.3.1 The criteria in selecting research sites ................................. 128

7.3.4 Participating Schools ..................................................................... 129

7.3.5 Negotiating research access and entering the field ................ 131

7.3.5.1 Aman Secondary School ..................................................... 131

7.3.5.2 Bersatu Secondary School ..................................................... 134

7.3.5.3 Summary of the participants ............................................... 137

7.3.6 Interviewing as the data collection method ............................... 137
THE PERCEPTIONS OF TEACHERS IN RELATION TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF NATIONAL EDUCATIONAL POLICIES, THE CHALLENGES THEY FACED AND HOW THEY COPED WITH THESE CHALLENGES

8.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................163
8.2 The perceptions of teachers in relation to the implementation of national educational policies ..................................................................................................164
  8.2.1 Positive implication: increased opportunities for students to improve their English performance ........................................................................................................164
  8.2.2 Negative implications: the neglect of other subjects, the increase in difficulty levels for students and decreased examination results among students ................................................................................................................165
  8.2.3 Factors the Ministry of Education need to consider in implementing the policy: time to implement the policy, school location and teacher preparation ........................................................................................................166
  8.2.4 Reasons for teachers becoming involved ........................................................................................................168
  8.2.5 The need for continuity of policy implementation ........................................................................................................168
8.3 Challenges that teachers had faced in their daily work ...................................169
  8.3.1 Students who were not interested in learning and had low academic performance ................................................................................................................169
  8.3.2 School work environment ..............................................................................170
8.3.3 The attitude of parents toward academic achievement and discipline ................................................................. 172
8.3.4 The Ministry of Education’s (MOE) Actions ........................................ 173
8.3.5 Actions of Senior Management Teams (SMTs) .......................... 174
8.3.6 The personal challenges of teachers ........................................ 175
8.4 How teachers cope with the challenges they face ................ 175
  8.4.1 Internal Factors: Teachers’ personal attributes and qualities ........ 175
  8.4.2 External factors ................................................................................. 178
    8.4.2.1 Senior Management Team Approaches ....................................... 178
    8.4.2.2 Characteristics and Actions of Colleagues .................................. 181
    8.4.2.3 School Location ............................................................................ 182
8.5 Conclusion .......................................................................................... 183

Chapter Nine ........................................................................................................................ 185
THE IMPLEMENTATION OF NATIONAL EDUCATIONAL POLICIES:
THE PERCEPTION OF SENIOR MANAGEMENT TEAMS, CHALLENGES THEY BELIEVED TEACHERS FACED AND ACTIONS TAKEN TO
ASSIST TEACHERS ..................................................................................................... 185

  9.1 Introduction ................................................................................................. 186
  9.2 The perceptions of the Senior Management Teams of the
implementation of national educational policies ................................................. 186
    9.2.1 The implications for teachers, students and schools .............. 187
    9.2.2 Factors the Ministry of Education needed to consider in
implementing the policy ....................................................................................... 188
    9.2.3 Reasons for the involvement of Senior Management Team
members in policy implementation ................................................................. 189
    9.2.4 The need for continuity of policy implementation ........ 190
  9.3 The challenges that Senior Management Teams believed
teachers faced ....................................................................................................... 190
9.3.1 School work environment ................................................................. 190
9.3.2 Student Issues ................................................................................ 192
9.3.3 Teacher Issues ............................................................................... 194
9.3.4 Parent attitudes towards academic achievement and discipline .... 195
9.3.5 Characteristics and Actions of the Principals ................................... 196
9.3.6 Actions taken by the Ministry of Education .................................. 196

9.4 Senior Management Team actions in assisting teachers in facing the
challenges of the implementation of national educational policies .......... 197
9.4.1 Creating a school culture that focuses on the implementation of
educational policy ...................................................................................... 198
9.4.2 A spirit of unity in the planning and implementation of school-
based programs ......................................................................................... 198
9.4.3 Minimising the pressure on teachers as they implemented the new
educational policies ................................................................................... 199
9.4.4 Identifying teacher weaknesses in implementing educational policy
and providing support for improving performance ..................................... 201
9.4.5 Taking pride in the success of the school as a source of motivation
and inspiration ............................................................................................ 202

9.5 Conclusion .......................................................................................... 203

Chapter Ten .............................................................................................. 205

THE IMPLEMENTATION OF NATIONAL EDUCATIONAL POLICIES –
THE PERCEPTIONS OF PTA MEMBERS AND THE CHALLENGES THEY
BELIEVED TEACHERS FACED AND THEIR EFFORTS TO ASSIST BOTH
SCHOOLS AND TEACHERS ................................................................................. 205

10.1 Introduction ........................................................................................ 206

10.2 Perceptions of the PTA in relation to the implementation of national
educational policies .................................................................................... 207
10.2.1 Increased opportunities for students to improve their English... 207
10.2.2 Factors that assisted in the implementation of national educational policies ................................................................. 207
10.2.2.1 The role of Senior Management Teams .............................................. 208
10.2.2.2 The role of teachers ....................................................................... 208

10.3 The challenges and demands that the PTA believed teachers faced as a result of the implementation of educational policies ......................................................... 209
10.3.1 Challenges from Parents ..................................................................... 209
10.3.2 Challenges from Teachers ..................................................................... 211
10.3.3 Challenges from Students .................................................................. 211

10.4 Efforts of the PTAs within schools in fostering the teachers’ ability to confront the changes ................................................................. 212
10.4.1 Introduction ......................................................................................... 212
10.4.2 Working in unison with schools: providing additional funding for schools ................................................................................................. 212
10.4.3 Helping to establish links between parents and the school.............. 213

10.5 Conclusion ............................................................................................... 214

Chapter Eleven ..................................................................................................................... 215

DISCUSSION ................................................................................................................. 215

11.1 Introduction ............................................................................................. 215

11.2 Discussion of the observations from teachers ................................... 216
11.2.1 The perception of teachers ................................................................ 216
11.2.1.1 The limited knowledge of teachers .............................................. 216
11.2.1.2 Outcomes of implementation ...................................................... 219
11.2.1.3 Teacher preparation for implementing new policies ................ 220
11.2.1.4 A requirement for the Ministry of Education to customize the implementation of educational policies tailored to different schools ... 222
11.2.1.5 The provision of economic incentives for teachers to implement national educational policies ................................................................. 223
11.2.2 Challenges facing teachers as a result of the implementation of national educational policies .................................................. 224

11.2.2.1 The attitudes and abilities of students ........................................ 225
11.2.2.2 School work environment .......................................................... 226
11.2.2.3 Parents placing excessive demands on teachers ......................... 229
11.2.2.4 Challenges arising from the Ministry of Education ......................... 230
11.2.2.5 The actions of the Senior Management Teams in imposing additional duties on teachers .................................................. 231

11.2.3 Teachers response to the challenges .......................................... 232

11.2.3.1 Internal factors ........................................................................... 232
11.2.3.2 External factors .......................................................................... 235

11.2.3.2.1 The contribution of SMT members ......................................... 235
11.2.3.2.2 Attitudes of colleagues ........................................................... 237
11.2.3.2.3 The location of the schools ..................................................... 238

11.3 Discussion of the findings from senior management teams (SMTs) .................................................................................. 238

11.3.1 Perceptions of the SMTs ............................................................... 238

11.3.1.1 Senior Management Teams' limited knowledge of national education policies ............................................................. 239
11.3.1.2 Possible negative effects of policy implementation ....................... 240
11.3.1.3 The Ministry of Education’s need to customize the implementation of national education policies with the prevailing situation in each school .................................................. 241

11.3.2 Challenges members of SMTs believed that teachers faced ......... 242

11.3.2.1 Working conditions of teachers ................................................ 242
11.3.2.2 The attitudes and abilities of students ......................................... 245
11.3.2.3 The attitudes and abilities of teachers ......................................... 246
11.3.2.4 The excessive dependence of parents on the schools ................... 247
11.3.2.5 Actions by the Ministry of Education .......................................... 247
11.3.3 SMT assistance to teachers ................................................................. 248

11.3.3.1 Creating a culture that focuses on the implementation of education policy at school ................................................................. 249

11.3.3.2 Encouraging togetherness in the planning and implementing of school-based programmes ................................................................. 250

11.3.3.3 Minimising the pressure on teachers ............................................. 251

11.3.3.4 Identifying teachers’ ‘weaknesses’ in implementing policies and providing support for improving performance ................................. 252

11.3.3.5 Taking pride in the success of their school as a source of motivation and inspiration ................................................................. 253

11.4 Discussion of the findings from members of PTAs ............................... 254

11.4.1 Perceptions of the PTAs ................................................................. 254

11.4.1.1 The limited knowledge of national educational policies on the part of the PTAs ................................................................. 255

11.4.1.2 The role of SMTs and teachers in ensuring successful policy implementation ........................................................................... 255

11.4.2 Challenges members of PTAs believed that teachers faced ............ 256

11.4.2.1 The challenge of informing parents about new educational policies and obtaining their co-operation ................................................................. 256

11.4.2.2 Teacher issues ............................................................................. 258

11.4.2.3 Student issues ............................................................................. 259

11.4.3 The actions of PTA members in assisting teachers to cope with the challenges ........................................................................... 260

11.4.3.1 Providing additional funding for schools ..................................... 260

11.4.3.2 Helping to establish links between parents and the school ......... 261

11.5 Summary and conclusion .................................................................. 262

11.5.1 Issue of changes in educational policy in Malaysia ....................... 269

11.5.2 The Issue of training prior to implementing changes in educational policy ........................................................................... 271
11.5.3 The policy and workplace conditions in which teachers’ work was situated ................................................................. 272

11.5.4 Teachers’ emotional stress in implementing a new change in education ............................................................................. 274

11.5.5 Issues of change leadership .................................................................................................................................................. 276

Chapter Twelve ................................................................................................................................................................................. 278

CONCLUSION .................................................................................................................................................................................. 278

12 ............................................................................................................................................................................................... 278

12.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................................................................................. 278

12.2 Addressing the research questions ..................................................................................................................................... 278

12.3 The main findings related to the issue of change and change leadership ............................................................................. 280

12.3.1 Policy and workplace conditions under which the teachers’ work is situated ................................................................. 281

12.4 Contributions of this study ...................................................................................................................................................... 282

12.5 Implication of the findings of the study .................................................................................................................................. 285

12.6 Limitations of this study ......................................................................................................................................................... 290

12.7 Suggestions for further research ............................................................................................................................................. 292

APPENDIX 1 .................................................................................................................................................................................. 295

APPENDIX 2 .................................................................................................................................................................................. 296

APPENDIX 3 .................................................................................................................................................................................. 298

APPENDIX 4 .................................................................................................................................................................................. 299

APPENDIX 5 .................................................................................................................................................................................. 301

APPENDIX 6 .................................................................................................................................................................................. 305

APPENDIX 7 .................................................................................................................................................................................. 306

APPENDIX 8 .................................................................................................................................................................................. 307
List of Figures and Tables

Figure 2.1: Malaysian Geographical location of the States and Territories .......................11
Figure 3.1: Ministry of Education focused Activities in 2007 .............................................33
Figure 4.1: Monitoring form used in the Buddy Support System...........................................42
Figure 4.2: Meeting record of Critical Friend with Buddy ..................................................43
Figure 7.1: Results of Verbal Counting Survey, With Fitted Regression Lines...........159

Table 2.1: Urbanisation Rate by States and Territories in 2005..........................11
Table 2.2: Racial Composition in Malaysia according to the Census Report 2000 ........13
Table 2.3: Registered Professionals by Each Ethnic Group in 2005 ..............................14
Table 2.4: Poverty Line Incomes (RM* per month per household) 1999-2002 ..........17
Table 4.1: The Number Schools in rural areas with inadequate public and teaching infrastructure...............................................................................................................................40
Table 4.2: The Frequencies and percentage for various training needs of the teachers teaching Science/ Mathematics in English.............................................................................41
Table 7.1: The Participants’ Profile from Aman Secondary School.........................132
Table 7.2: The Profile of the Participants from Bersatu Secondary School..............135