

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

The Epidemiology of Rabies in Thailand

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirement for
the degree of
Master of Veterinary Studies

Pranee Panichabhongse
2001

This thesis is inspired by, and dedicated to, rabies victims.

May there be no more.

Abstract

This study was designed to investigate the epidemiology of rabies in Thailand and to evaluate the rabies control programme. The study involved retrospective analysis of seven years data (1993 to 1999), concerning rabies incidence and control activity. Five datasets from four different organisations responsible for rabies control in Thailand were collected between March and June, 2000.

Control activity data were found to be incomplete due mainly to problems associated with the data collection form and with methods of data storage and retrieval in provincial offices. Recommendations are made in this thesis to modify the data collection form and data storage methods to improve data collection and the usefulness of information collected in the future.

The annual cumulative incidence of rabies in both animals and humans has declined considerably between 1993 to 1999 as a result of the control programme implemented under the Rabies Act B.E. 2535 (1992). Rabies in humans is more common in males than females and is more common in young children (less than 10 years of age) than any other age group. Dogs were the most commonly submitted animal for rabies diagnosis as part of the surveillance programme, accounting for 87% of the total of 40,649 submissions. Cows were more likely to return a positive rabies diagnosis than any other animal (57% of a total of 409 animals submitted) while dogs returned more cases than any other animal species (43% of a total of 35,338 animals submitted). Detailed investigations were confined to dogs. Rabies was more common in non-owned dogs, non-vaccinated dogs, dogs showing signs consistent with furious rabies, and dogs with a history of having attacked or bitten either other animals or both animals and people.

The spatio-temporal pattern of rabies in both dogs and people, showed changes in the distribution of rabies cases during the seven year period of the study. Mixed effect Poisson regression models incorporating spatial and non-spatial random effect terms were used to investigate risk factors associated with rabies. Factors associated with increasing risk of rabies in people at the province level included: increasing dog density, increasing incidence of rabies in dogs, and reduction in human population density. In the 1999 dataset, there was evidence of spatial clustering of rabies risk. In addition a cluster of provinces showed an elevation in rabies risk that was unexplained by the explanatory variables included in the model. The reason for this cluster of elevated risk remains to be elucidated.

Factors associated with an increasing risk of rabies in dogs at the province level included increasing dog population density and increasing proportion of dogs vaccinated against rabies. Relative risk estimates were close to one suggesting the strength of the association for both terms was weak. Increased dog vaccination against rabies is likely to occur in provinces with a higher risk of both animal and human rabies.

Acknowledgement

I never expected that without any computer skills and no basic knowledge in epidemiology and statistics, I could become an epidemiologist and create a major piece of work, which will be beneficial to the Rabies Control Programme in Thailand.

I would like to express my thanks to Dr. Suvitthaya Pollarp, the former Director General of the Department of Livestock Development and Dr. Samroeng Vorasri, the former Director of the Division of Disease Control for giving me a chance to further my study and the New Zealand Government for the sponsorship of my degree at Massey University.

I wish to thank Professor Roger Morris, my chief supervisor who gave me the opportunity to be an epidemiologist and participate in the EpiCentre. My special thanks are to Dr. Nigel Perkins for his kind attendance, his smile and great patience as my co-supervisor, and to Dr. Mark Stevenson for sharing his generous knowledge in GIS and spatial analysis experiences, particularly for the best map.

My thanks also go to Professor Hugh Blair and Ms. Allain Scott for their kind advice and suggestions, Dr. Joanna McKenzie for GIS guidance, Dr. Leigh Corner and Dr. Cord Heuer for their advice and suggestion on my thesis, Daniel Russell, Simon Verschaffelt, Dr. Jorg Henning and Solis Norton for solving my on-going computer programme and technical problems. Thanks are due to Dr. Mariuzs Skorupski, Dr. Johanna Olzack and all the EpiCentre staff for their warm hospitality and encouragement during my study.

I am indebted to Fiona Dickinson for her care, company and kindly editing my thesis, Hatsue Kuga, my best friend in New Zealand for her mental support and company. My thanks also to Thai students in Palmerston North for their care and encouragement.

My thesis would not have been successful without the permission to use data for analysis from Dr. Rapeepong Vongdee, the current Director General of the Department of Livestock Development. Many thanks also for help and support in data collection and entry from Dr. Wironrong Hoonsuwann, Dr Apiromp Puanghat, Dr. Chantra Singhchai, Dr. Weerapong Duamtun, Dr Surayuth Songsumuth, Dr. Pornpitak Panlar, Dr. Tippawann Parakamawongsa and the provincial DLD officers.

I am grateful to Dr. Wattana Srisongmuang, the former Director of the Rabies Centre for historic information about rabies, Dr. Pravit Chumkasien, Dr. Plyonk Sgaraseranee, Dr. Michel Lombard, Dr. Darika Kingnate, Dr. Veera Thepsumethanont and Dr. Boonlert Lumlertdecha for their contribution of rabies documents used in this study.

I extend my gratitude to Mr. Charles Chua, Mr. Bruce Graham, Ms. Dianne Reilly and the International Student Office staff for providing advice, warm hospitality and concern and to Dr. Sue Hassall, Ms. Patricia Love, Ms. Joanne Grant and the English Language Centre staff for improving my English.

I gratefully acknowledge Mrs. Gay Eustace, my Kiwi mom, for her love, warmth and maternal care given to me throughout my time with her here, and to Mr. Todd Cochrane for his help, concern and encouragement from the beginning of my study.

My particular thanks go to my brother, Dr. Sambhundh Panichbhongse, and my sister, Dr. Uraiwann Sukuprakarn, for their emotional and financial support. Miss Panitkarn Panichbhongse, my initial inspiration for rabies work, who managed and provided all the material needed from Thailand.

Most of all, I would like to express my thanks and my love to my mother, who is counting down the calendar waiting for me to go back to Thailand and to my father, who could not wait to see my success.

Table Of Contents

	<i>Page</i>
Abstract	i
Acknowledgements	iii
Table of Contents	v
List of Tables	ix
List of Figures	xi
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
Chapter 2 Rabies	5
The disease	5
Aetiology of the disease	5
The virus	6
Characteristics of virus	6
Excretion of virus	7
Survival outside host	7
Routes of transmission	8
Pathogenesis	9
Host range	10
Host range in different environments	10
Maintenance hosts and spillover hosts in different locations	11
Course of the disease	12
Clinical signs	13
Diagnosis	16
Laboratory tests for rabies	16
Human	16
Animal	19
Prognosis	20
Human	20
Animal	20
Treatment	21
Human - post-exposure treatment (PET)	21
Animal	22
Prevention	22
Human	22
Animal	23
Vaccination	23
Control	23
<i>Domestic Animals</i>	23
<i>Livestock</i>	24
<i>Wildlife</i>	24
Rabies control and eradication	24
Successful rabies eradication in Switzerland	24
Successes and failures of rabies eradication in Asia	25
Principles and designs of a National Rabies Control Program in dogs	26
Rabies control in Thailand	29
Development of rabies control in Thailand	29
Current rabies situation	31

	<i>Page</i>
Current rabies control strategies	32
Organisations responsible	36
Problems and constraints in control strategies	39
Criteria for declaration of rabies-free areas	40
Geographic Information System (GSI)	40
What is GIS?	40
Why is GIS used?	40
How is GIS used?	41
GIS and rabies surveillance and control	41
Objectives of this study	42
Chapter 3 Materials and Methods	43
Data quality	43
Sources and types of data	43
Data collection	46
Data quality assessment	47
Assessment of data completeness	48
Descriptive analysis	48
Surveillance data	49
Human rabies case data	49
Human census data	50
Control activity data	50
Comparative analysis	51
Univariate and bivariate analysis	51
Disease measurement	51
GIS and spatial analysis	52
Spatial analysis	52
<i>Human rabies</i>	52
<i>Canine rabies</i>	54
Chapter 4 Results	57
Data quality	57
Data entry error	57
Implausible data	58
Missing data	58
Assessment of data completeness	59
Descriptive analysis	63
Passive surveillance data	63
Positive rabies cases by year	64
Positive rabies cases per month	65
Positive rabies cases by province	65
Positive rabies cases by district	65
Positive rabies cases by animal type	66
Positive rabies cases by animal history	66
Positive rabies cases by range of animal age	67
Positive rabies cases by vaccination history	67
Positive rabies cases by symptoms	68
Positive rabies cases and other animal contact	68
Positive rabies cases by method of death	68
Human rabies deaths	69
Variables	69
<i>Year and month</i>	69

	<i>Page</i>
<i>Province</i>	70
<i>Human age at death</i>	71
<i>Human gender in deaths attributed to rabies</i>	72
<i>Types of animal associated with human rabies cases</i>	72
<i>History of animal ownership of animals associated with human deaths</i>	73
<i>Animal vaccination history for animals associated with human deaths</i>	73
<i>Age of animal for animals associated with human deaths</i>	74
Human population	74
Total human population	74
Population by age	75
Control activity data in 26 provinces	76
Vaccination	77
Hormonal injection	78
Castration	79
Spay	80
Dogs killed or euthanased	81
Control activity in 76 provinces	81
Total dog population	82
Total dogs vaccinated	83
Total dogs hormonal injected	85
Total dogs castrated	86
Total dogs spayed	87
Total dogs euthanased	88
Public Relations activity	89
Disease measurement	91
Human rabies cases	91
Bivariate analyses	93
GIS and spatial analyses	99
<i>Human rabies</i>	109
<i>Canine rabies</i>	114
Chapter 5 Discussion	119
Data quality	119
Descriptive analysis	124
Surveillance data	124
Control activities	130
GIS and spatial analysis	137
New design for data reporting form	140
Draft list of variables for monthly data collection	145
Conclusion	146
Bibliography	149
Appendices	155

List Of Tables

	Page	
Table 3-1	Sources and types of data used in this study	43
Table 4-1	Error rates for each data entry person	57
Table 4-2	Number of variables from Provincial control activity dataset categorised according to the percentage of valid data values.	59
Table 4-3	Number of variables from District control activity dataset categorised according to the percentage of valid data values	60
Table 4-4	Number of records available for analysis in each dataset	62
Table 4-5	Number and percentage of total variables, valid and missing data	63
Table 4-6	Number of districts in each category of percentage-positive cases	65
Table 4-7	Number of districts in each category of percentage-positive cases	65
Table 4-8	Number and percentage of positive cases in each type of animal	66
Table 4-9	Number and percentage of positive cases in each category of animal history from number of submitted cases	66
Table 4-10	Number and percentage of positive cases from cases submitted in each age range	67
Table 4-11	Number and percentage of positive cases from cases submitted in each category of vaccination history	67
Table 4-12	Number and percentage of positive cases from cases submitted in each group of symptoms	68
Table 4-13	Number and percentage of positive cases per each category of contact	68
Table 4-14	Number and percentage of positive cases in each type of animal death	69
Table 4-15	Number of records, number and percentage of valid and missing data in each variable	69
Table 4-16	Number of human deaths in each province (1993-99)	71
Table 4-17	Number and percentage of human deaths in each range of age	71
Table 4-18	Number of human deaths by gender (1993-99)	72
Table 4-19	Numbers of animals of different species associated with human deaths per year	72
Table 4-20	Number of animals by ownership category for animals associated with human deaths in each year	73
Table 4-21	Number of animals by category of vaccination history for animals associated with human deaths (1999)	73
Table 4-22	Number of animals by age category for animals associated with human deaths (1999)	74
Table 4-23	Number of human population in total and by gender in Thailand (1993-99)	74
Table 4-24	Number of provinces in each range of human population (1993-99)	75
Table 4-25	Numbers of people in 7 age categories from 1996 census data	76
Table 4-26	Variables in the data set of rabies control activity	76
Table 4-27	Descriptive statistics of dog population in 10 provinces (reported as a weighted per district average)	77
Table 4-28	Descriptive analysis of total dogs vaccination per district per month in 10 provinces (1993-99)	77
Table 4-29	Descriptive analysis of total dogs hormone injected per district per month in 10 provinces (1993-99)	78
Table 4-30	Descriptive analysis of total dogs castrated per district by month in 10 provinces (1993-99)	79
Table 4-31	Descriptive analysis of total dogs spayed per district per month in 10 provinces (1993-99)	80
Table 4-32	Descriptive analysis of total dogs killed per district per month in 10 provinces (1993-99)	81
Table 4-33	Records of Public Relations activity in 1997	90
Table 4-34	Frequency of province in each type of PR activity in 1997	91
Table 4-35	Human deaths from rabies per 100,000 population per year (CI)	92
Table 4-36	Chi-square analysis of the association between gender and rabies deaths per year (1993-99) (female used a reference in each year)	94
Table 4-37	Effect of age group and rabies deaths in humans stratified by gender	94
Table 4-38	Effect of year and rabies deaths in humans stratified by gender	95
Table 4-39	Effect of part and rabies deaths in humans stratified by gender	95
Table 4-40	Number of dogs rabies-positive per 100,000 dog population per year (1993-99)	96
Table 4-41	Chi-square of dog rabies positive per part of Thailand (1993-99)	96

	Page	
Table 4-42	Chi-square analysis of dog rabies status and history of dog, method of animal death, rabies vaccination history, symptoms and other animal contact	98
Table 4-43	Posterior means and posterior standard deviation (SD) of the regression coefficients in the fixed-effect Poisson model of factors influencing the risk of rabies in humans in Thailand in 1994 and 1999 and in the mixed-effect Poisson model of factors influencing the risk of rabies in humans in Thailand in 1999	112
Table 4-44	Posterior means and posterior standard deviation (SD) of the regression coefficients in the fixed-effect Poisson model of factors influencing the incidence of rabies in dogs in Thailand	117

List Of Figures

	Page
Figure 2-1 Rabies control and eradication co-ordinating system	38
Figure 3-1 Control activity reporting system	44
Figure 4-1 Percentage of missing data in province control activity data	58
Figure 4-2 Percentage of missing data in District control activity data	58
Figure 4-3 Percentage of missing data values in the passive surveillance dataset	61
Figure 4-4 Percentage of missing data in each variable from the human death dataset	62
Figure 4-5 Rabies positive cases as a percentage of total yearly submission (1993-99)	64
Figure 4-6 Percentage of rabies positive cases per month (1993-99)	64
Figure 4-7 Number of human deaths per year (1993-99)	70
Figure 4-8 Number of human deaths per month (1993-99)	70
Figure 4-9 Male and female population in Thailand	75
Figure 4-10 Descriptive analysis of total dog hormone injected per district per month in 10 provinces (1993-99)	78
Figure 4-11 Median of overall total dog hormone injected per month in 10 provinces	79
Figure 4-12 Median number of dogs castrated per month in 10 provinces	80
Figure 4-13 Median number of dogs spayed per month in 10 provinces	81
Figure 4-14 Total dog population per year and number of owned and non-owned dogs (1993-99)	82
Figure 4-15 Frequency histogram of median of dog population in each province in Thailand (1993-99)	83
Figure 4-16 Percentage of total dogs vaccinated for the whole country (1993-99)	84
Figure 4-17 Frequency histogram of provinces for each range of percentage of total dogs vaccinated (1993-99)	84
Figure 4-18 Percentage of dogs injected by hormone for the whole country in each year	85
Figure 4-19 Frequency histogram of percentage of dogs injected by hormone (1993-99)	85
Figure 4-20 Percentage of dogs castrated (1993-99)	86
Figure 4-21 Frequency histogram of percentage of dogs castrated in each province (1993-99)	86
Figure 4-22 Percentage of dogs spayed (1993-99)	87
Figure 4-23 Frequency histogram of percentage of dogs spayed in each province (1993-99)	88
Figure 4-24 Percentage of dogs killed (1993-99)	88
Figure 4-25 Frequency histogram of percentage of total dogs killed (1993-99)	89
Figure 4-26 Human deaths from rabies per 100,000 population by gender per year (1993-99) with 95% confidence intervals added	92
Figure 4-27 Human deaths per 100,000 (CI) population per year for each geographic part of Thailand (1993-99)	92
Figure 4-28 Human rabies positive (CI) in each season (1993-99)	93
Figure 4-29 Cumulative incidence of dog rabies per 100,000 by month	97
Figure 4-30 Association between percent of total dogs vaccinated and CI of human deaths	97
Figure 4-31 Association between percent of total dogs vaccinated and CI of dogs rabies-positive	98
Figure 4-32 Average dog and human density per square kilometre (1993-99)	100
Figure 4-33 Annual cumulative incidence of rabies in dogs and humans per 100,000 population per year by province (1993-99)	101
Figure 4-34 Incidence of rabies in dogs and humans per 100,000 population by province in 1993	102
Figure 4-35 Incidence of rabies in dogs and humans per 100,000 population by province in 1994	102
Figure 4-36 Incidence of rabies in dogs and humans per 100,000 population by province in 1995	103
Figure 4-37 Incidence of rabies in dogs and humans per 100,000 population by province in 1996	103
Figure 4-38 Incidence of rabies in dogs and humans per 100,000 population by province in 1997	104
Figure 4-39 Incidence of rabies in dogs and humans per 100,000 population by province in 1998	104
Figure 4-40 Incidence of rabies in dogs and humans per 100,000 population by province in 1999	105
Figure 4-41 Average dog density and human density per square kilometre by region (1993-99)	106
Figure 4-42 Cumulative incidence of rabies in dogs and humans per 100,000 population (1993-99)	107
Figure 4-43 Average dog density and human density per square kilometre (1993-99)	108
Figure 4-44 Incidence of rabies in dogs and humans per 100,000 population (1993-99)	109
Figure 4-45 Province-level standardised mortality ratio (SMR) for human rabies in 1994	110
Figure 4-46 Province-level standardised mortality ratio (SMR), crude SMR estimate and the standard error of the crude SMR estimate of human rabies in 1999	110
Figure 4-47 Spatial correlograms computed for province-level human rabies risk for 1994 and 1999 data	111

	Page	
Figure 4-48	Relative risk estimates calculated from the posterior estimates of the spatial heterogeneity terms	114
Figure 4-49	Province-level standardised mortality ratio (SMR), crude SMR estimate and the standard error of the crude SMR estimate of canine rabies in 1994	115
Figure 4-50	Province-level standardised mortality ratio (SMR) for canine rabies, crude SMR estimate and the standard error of the crude SMR estimate of canine rabies in 1999	115
Figure 4-51	Spatial correlograms computed for province-level canine rabies risk for the 1994 and 1999 data	117