Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
ALTERNATIVE EDUCATION AND COMMUNITY WELLBEING: A CASE STUDY OF TUTU RURAL TRAINING CENTRE IN TAVEUNI, FIJI

A thesis presented
in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
Degree of Master of Philosophy in Development Studies
at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand

Steve Connor
2013
ABSTRACT

Conventional western education has effectively become global education and yet it is largely unchallenged. The few who dare to challenge, what is arguably orthodox development’s main ally, highlight concerns. Education, it is argued, promotes elite capture, homogenises diversity, and disconnects students from their own communities and places that give their lives meaning. Formal education is fundamental to economic growth. It prepares people for work and carries the message of materialism. However, this study argues economic growth brings income disparity creating extremes of wealth and poverty, resource depletion and major environmental issues, further challenging education’s emphasis.

This study sought to find an alternative approach to education. This approach is informed by postdevelopment thinking, indigenous values and indigenous education. Place-based education is an existing education modality which was found to conform to postdevelopment principles. A case study of Tutu Rural Training Centre in Taveuni, Fiji was used to explore if the training provided could be described as place-based education. Wellbeing is investigated and presented as an indicator of education effectiveness. The enhancement of community wellbeing, therefore, is used to assess Tutu RTC in comparison to formal education.

This research found that Tutu RTC was far more effective than formal schooling in enhancing the wellbeing of the Tutu community. It also found Tutu RTC could be described as indigenous education, postdevelopment-informed education, and place-based education. Generalisations were made from these findings that have implications for the policy, practice and philosophy of the global business of formal education.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thank you to my supervisors Dr Rochelle Stewart-Withers, Professor Regina Scheyvens and Dr Maria Borovnik all of whom made profound contributions to turning a naive idea into a Master’s Thesis. A significant step in this process was provided by Christina Reymer of Mahi Tahi who I accompanied to Honiara to visit the people behind rural training centres (RTCs). Geoff Bamford, with over 50 years’ experience in agricultural training in the Pacific, was one of these people. Amongst so much quality direction provided over the course of this thesis journey, his encouragement to seek Tutu RTC in Taveuni as the case study for this research, was the single most important advice received.

I was grateful to Father Michael McVerry, Principal of Tutu RTC, for accepting my request for fieldwork at his centre and all the Tutu staff who welcomed me warmly, showed unerring generosity, and participated in the fieldwork without reservation. In particular I am humbled and indebted to the trainees, the young adults of Tutu who hosted, assisted, participated, and shared what they had to make my time welcomed and fruitful. They are the proof of the success of Tutu and a witness to the ‘goodness’ of Fijian culture.

My inspiration for this study came from my father who embarked on a degree at the age of 75, having left school in the fourth form, confirming the adage ‘it’s never too late’, and from my siblings whose philosophical conversations have provoked much thought and debate for 5 decades. It is easy to underestimate the work required to complete a thesis. If I knew in advance the time required I would not have started. However each of my children Liam, Reilly and Ellen have encouraged me and added their wisdom having had first-hand experience of the discipline needed throughout the journey to their own degrees. Lastly to my wife and soul mate Mary, you have been tested during this process but you have been rock solid and I have benefited from your belief, strength and wise council.

Finally, I dedicate this study to the millions of teachers worldwide who deliver classes every day with a smile in spite of the student disinterest caused by the inherent difficulties of an often unjust, irrelevant, discriminating and disconnecting system of schooling. This is written so that one day you, and those in your charge, may be released from that burden.

Steve Connor
Christchurch, New Zealand
December 2012
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### CONTENTS

**Abstract** ................................................................................................................................. ii  

**Acknowledgements** ................................................................................................................ iii  

**TABLE OF CONTENTS** .............................................................................................................. iv  

**List of tables and figures** .......................................................................................................... viii  

**Abbreviations** ........................................................................................................................... ix  

**Glossary** ....................................................................................................................................... x  

**Chapter 1: Introduction** ............................................................................................................. 1  

1.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................... 1  

1.2 Rationale for this study .............................................................................................................. 2  

1.3 The background of the study ................................................................................................. 3  

   Critiques of orthodox development and conventional education ......................................... 3  

   Postdevelopment principles ....................................................................................................... 4  

   Examining the effectiveness of an alternative approach to education ................................... 4  

1.4 Thesis aim and objectives ....................................................................................................... 5  

1.5 The fieldwork site and approach ........................................................................................... 6  

   Selecting the site ........................................................................................................................ 6  

   Research methodology ............................................................................................................. 6  

1.6 Thesis structure ....................................................................................................................... 6  

**Chapter 2: Approaches to education for development** ............................................................. 10  

2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................ 10  

2.2 Conventional approaches to education for normative development ........................................ 10  

   Truman’s agenda for development ......................................................................................... 11  

   Education and Keynesian Development ............................................................................... 11  

   Education under a neoliberal agenda, 1980s and 1990s ....................................................... 12  

   Education and the MDGs ....................................................................................................... 13  

   Education beyond 2010 ......................................................................................................... 14  

   Summary .................................................................................................................................. 14  

2.3 Contesting this discursive field of education ........................................................................ 15  

   Critique of conventional education ....................................................................................... 15  

2.4 An alternative approach to education for development ......................................................... 20  

   Postdevelopment principles .................................................................................................. 20
LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

List of tables

Table 2.1: Alignment of development critique and education critique .......................... 19
Table 3.1: Alternative development approaches .......................................................... 51
Table 4.1: Participants in the Tutu RTC Interviews ....................................................... 64
Table 5.1: Alignment of Tutu RTC and PBE Principles .............................................. 94
Table 6.1: A comparison of Tutu RTC and formal schooling in relation to promoting
community wellbeing ................................................................................................... 112

List of figures

Figure 5.1: Fiji ............................................................................................................. 70
Figure 5.2: Taveuni .................................................................................................... 70
**ABBREVIATIONS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HDI</td>
<td>Human Development Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCP</td>
<td>Married Couples Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDGs</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoE</td>
<td>Fiji Ministry of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUHEC</td>
<td>Massey University Human Ethics Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCBBF</td>
<td>National Council for Building a Better Fiji</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NFE</td>
<td>Non-formal education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGOs</td>
<td>Non-government organisations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZ</td>
<td>New Zealand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBE</td>
<td>Place-based education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAPs</td>
<td>Structural Adjustment Policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TNCs</td>
<td>Transnational corporations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tutu RTC</td>
<td>Tutu Rural Training Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations International Children’s Education Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USP</td>
<td>University of the South Pacific</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>World Trade Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WWII</td>
<td>World War Two</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YFC</td>
<td>Young Farmer’s Course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SYWC</td>
<td>Single Young Women’s Course</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**GLOSSARY**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Charter Schools</td>
<td>privately run deregulated schools in the US</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>community economy</td>
<td>informal and non-formal community-centred business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dalo</td>
<td>taro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disvalue</td>
<td>diminishes value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>diverse economy</td>
<td>mix of community and formal economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethno-Fijian</td>
<td>Indigenous Fijian, also now used is iTaukei</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>extrinsic wellbeing</td>
<td>'means' to wellbeing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>formal economy</td>
<td>taxable economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>formal education</td>
<td>conventional mainstream education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>global project</td>
<td>the shifting from development through government to development through the global market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>green economy</td>
<td>community economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>grey economy</td>
<td>global capitalist formal economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hegemony</td>
<td>positioning and normalising constructs as superior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hermeneutics</td>
<td>iterative approach to text interpretation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hybrids</td>
<td>a mix of philosophically distinct approaches for mutual benefit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indo-Fijian</td>
<td>Fijians with Indian heritage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>informal economy</td>
<td>exchanges of goods and services that do not involve money</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>informal education</td>
<td>learning that occurs incidentally outside formal systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>intrinsic wellbeing</td>
<td>wellbeing directly resulting from the action, 'ends' wellbeing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kapa Haka</td>
<td>NZ Maori dance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kava</td>
<td>intoxicating drink made from the root of the <em>yaqona</em> plant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>korero</td>
<td>speech in Maori</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kura Kaupapa</td>
<td>a Maori indigenous education alternative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahi Tahi</td>
<td>formerly Catholic Overseas Volunteers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mana</td>
<td>Maori term for having respect and dignity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maori</td>
<td>NZ indigenous peoples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mataqali</td>
<td>clan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>neocolonialism</td>
<td>a new colonialism imposed through the global market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>non-formal economy</td>
<td>exchange of goods and services for money which is not taxed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>non-formal education</td>
<td>organised learning outside the formal education system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pakeha</td>
<td>Maori term for non-Maori</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnership Schools</td>
<td>NZ name for Charter Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>place-based</td>
<td>centred in the locality (place) where people reside</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>reinhabit</td>
<td>reconnecting to all aspects of the place where people reside</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>saatu</td>
<td>Fijian word for wellbeing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tangata Whenua</td>
<td>Maori term for people of the land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the good life</td>
<td>living in a state of wellbeing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>triangulation</td>
<td>collecting data through alternative methods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vakaturaga</td>
<td>chiefly principles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vanua</td>
<td>land, culture, people and their interrelationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>whakapapa</td>
<td>Maori for genealogy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whanau Ora</td>
<td>cultural sovereignty for NZ Maori social services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yaqona</td>
<td>kava in plant or in powered form</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

1.1 INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this study is encapsulated in a quote by education policy researcher Philip Jones. He claimed (2007:xii)

*If ... global influence limits the discretion of peoples to shape their own educational destinies and imposes its own solution to the moral – material dilemma facing education policy, then it [global education] is worthy of investigation.*

In this quote Jones touches on the two issues at the heart of this study. The first issue is what Jones refers to as the moral – material dilemma facing education. He describes this dilemma as deciding on the balance of educating for moral values and educating for economic growth (2007:xii). Jones’s dilemma mirrors Ryan and Deci’s (2000) division of wellbeing into intrinsic and extrinsic wellbeing. The thesis redefines the dilemma by asking ‘what balance of intrinsic and material wellbeing is optimal for education effectiveness?’

The second issue implicit in Jones’s quote is that the decision on the moral – material education balance should not be externally imposed but determined by the peoples affected by that decision. Jones (2007:xii) argued that multilateral institutions, led by the World Bank, control the educational destinies of the world’s peoples. Since the 1990s the World Bank has consistently used education reform loans to promote a neoliberal prescription on education provision (Jones, 2007:xviii). Jones contends that multilateral institutions use their influence to advance education for material wellbeing globally, ignoring countries’ sovereign right to determine their own education approach.

Conventional western education is now global education (Jones, 2007). It is argued however that conventional education promotes western hegemony (Prakash & Esteva, 2008:3; Thaman, 2007:16; Flores, 2003:3), restricts each society’s cultural diversity (Jones, 2007; Gruenewald, 2003; Cateje 1999), and adds to inequity (Esteva & Prakash, 2008; Gatto, 2009; Illich, 1972; Friere, 1972). As Jones pointed out in the opening quote, an alternative is worthy of investigation.

Goldstein (2004:13 cited in Coxon & Munce, 2008:148) in analysing the globalising of education suggested:
... the potential for achieving a quality basic education system for all rests on finding ‘alternative forms of delivery, curriculum design, pedagogy ... [those] ... that work best within a country’.

The study, then, explores an alternative approach to the ubiquitous western education, one which will be informed by critiques of normative development and conventional education. It seeks to articulate an alternative approach that allows the societies directly affected to determine their balance of education for intrinsic and material wellbeing.

The alternative sought will be guided by postdevelopment principles and indigenous values. Postdevelopment is critical of top down development modalities and emphasises grassroots autonomy (McGregor, 2009:12) and cultural diversity (Escobar, 2010:35). Just as postdevelopment is seen by many as a way forward for orthodox development, this study explores an education alternative informed by postdevelopment as a way forward for education.

1.2 RATIONALE FOR THIS STUDY
The process and philosophy of development has interested me since living and teaching in the remote Pacific Island of Niue. Teaching the New Zealand curriculum in Niue in the early 1990s effectively provided a pathway for the most academically motivated Niueans to study, reside and often remain, in New Zealand. This phenomenon led me to the question: “What is the appropriate education for Niue?” The question simmered over the following twenty years of classroom teaching in a variety of countries evolving into: “What is the most appropriate education to support the wellbeing of people?”

More recently I have become interested in global sustainability. Growth-centred economic development is the mainstay of most western countries and yet, it is argued, economic growth is unsustainable (Schor, 2010:96; McGregor, 2004:18; Thaman, 2007:10; Andreotti, 2010:9). Mainstream western-style education is the carrier of the hegemonic economic growth message (Jones, 1995, 2010). So if economic development is unsustainable, and conventional education promotes economic growth, then there is a fundamental flaw in global western education. This education ‘impasse’ has led to calls to de-school society (Illich, 1972; Esteva & Prakash, 2008; Gatto, 2009).

Postgraduate study in Development Studies has provided me with hope for a new development discourse, postdevelopment. Postdevelopment has grown out of the critique
of normative development (Escobar, 1995), it emphasises grassroots autonomy (Esteva, 1992:20) and challenges the hegemony of colonialism and the new colonialism of the global market. It contrasts with development that is dictated from the ‘outside’ (Andreotti, 2010:9, Gibson-Graham, 2010:226). Applying the optimism and principles expressed within the postdevelopment discourse to the education ‘impasse’ has led to this thesis.

1.3 THE BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY
The significance of this study is that it links the criticisms directed at development and conventional education and presents an alternative approach to education to counter those concerns. Some of the development concerns are listed and parallels are drawn with the challenges to education.

CRITIQUES OF ORTHODOX DEVELOPMENT AND CONVENTIONAL EDUCATION
The 1980s saw considerable challenges to international development. These criticisms still apply today and are mirrored in the critique of formal education. One such issue is that development undermines and replaces indigenous culture with the hegemony of western monoculture (Ahorro, 2009:2). Western-style education assists this deculturisation through schooling that elevates western epistemologies at the expense of local ways of knowing (Prakash & Esteva, 2008:7).

Another challenge to development is that it promotes inequality through free market competition and trade which advantages the donor (McEwan, 2009:180). Similarly education creates competition by creating an artificial ‘game of winners and losers’ through tests and qualifications leading to inequality (Gatto, 2009:96). This prospering of the wealthy and struggle for the poor creates a cycle of poverty and an advantaged elite. Esteva and Prakash (2008:2) labelled schooling the worst discrimination of all because school posits success as justly deserved and failure a result of limited intelligence or laziness.

Esteva (1992:18) argues growth-focused development disconnects indigenous peoples from all other forms of human existence. He specifies relationships and traditions and as victims of this disconnect reducing them to resources. Gatto (2009:130) expresses the same concern. “Schools disconnect, they divide and conquer kids from their families, their traditions, their communities, their religions, natural allies, interests and adventure … .”
Formal education is strongly supported by governments and organisations such as the World Bank. They argue education improves the human capital and therefore the wealth of that country (Jones, 1995:118). However the profound critique of education suggests alternative approaches should be investigated and that postdevelopment, a paradigm providing new ways of thinking about development, may also assist education thinking.

**Postdevelopment Principles**

The study required an examination of postdevelopment to guide an alternative educational approach that might provide a counter to these and other concerns with global conventional education. A review of postdevelopment literature revealed five common principles that characterise this paradigm. These are: autonomous and democratic decision making (Ziai, 2007:5); the capacity to challenge unjust systems (McGregor, 2009:3) and to create or recreate new systems of community (Gibson-Graham, 2010:226); a local focus (McGregor, 2009:8); and the freedom to form mutually beneficial partnerships (Escobar, 2007:21).

These principles will be used to inform an alternative approach to education. A review of education literature will be undertaken to identify alternative approaches to education that adhere to all, or some, of these postdevelopment tenets. As part of this search, local understandings of indigenous education will be consulted since, education informed by indigenous values, has a natural affinity with the principles of postdevelopment (Illich, 1971; Penetito, 2004:18). Through this process an alternative education that is informed by postdevelopment will be described.

**Examining the Effectiveness of an Alternative Approach to Education**

Gruenewald (2003:8) asks if education is not about wellbeing then what is it for. Jones (2007) agrees education is concerned with development and wellbeing. It is the nature of that wellbeing that is in question. A review of wellbeing literature is therefore undertaken to obtain an understanding of wellbeing and determine some guiding principles. To remain consistent to the approach taken in the education literature review, the wellbeing literature consulted will reflect normative views as well as reflecting postdevelopment thinking and indigenous values.

Ryan and Deci (2000; 2001) found two categories of wellbeing: intrinsic wellbeing and extrinsic or material wellbeing. These categories will be used to interrogate both the
effectiveness of conventional education and the effectiveness of postdevelopment-informed alternative education.

A case study site was chosen that offered the opportunity to conduct fieldwork on an alternative approach to education. Tutu Rural Training Centre (Tutu RTC) is a training centre in Taveuni, Fiji. It is described by the Principal, Father McVerry, as non-formal education. After a period of investigating rural training centres in Vanuatu, the Solomon Islands and Fiji, it was decided that Tutu RTC would be the most suitable subject for this study’s fieldwork.

The fieldwork will seek to investigate if Tutu RTC could be described as an alternative approach to education that is consistent with postdevelopment. This goal will be achieved by examining if Tutu RTC fits the tenets of the education postdevelopment framework outlined in Chapter 2 of this study. Fieldwork data will be collected to ascertain the features of community wellbeing for those who belong to the Tutu community. Once these features have been described fieldwork data will be analysed to examine to what extent Tutu RTC is promoting community wellbeing. Formal education will be examined in a similar way so a comparison of the effectiveness of the two education paradigms in promoting wellbeing can be ascertained.

The significance of this thesis is that a postdevelopment education alternative provides learning that reconnects people with each other and with their locality. The alternative generates the understanding to challenge the culture of money and consumption.

The primary aim and the corresponding three objectives of the thesis follow.

1.4 THESIS AIM AND OBJECTIVES

**Aim of the research:** To investigate whether an alternative approach to education is more effective than conventional education in enhancing community wellbeing.

To achieve this aim three objectives have been identified and these are as follows:

**Objective 1:** To articulate how indigenous and postdevelopment thinking can inform an alternative approach to education.

**Objective 2:** To define and posit the promotion of community wellbeing as an indication of educational effectiveness.
Objective 3: To examine if Tutu RTC provides an example of an alternative approach to education that enhances community wellbeing.

1.5 THE FIELDWORK SITE AND APPROACH

SELECTING THE SITE

Dr Scheyvens of Massey University suggested I consider rural training centres (RTCs) in Vanuatu for the fieldwork because I was interested in alternative educational approaches. My own investigations resulted in a growing interest in RTCs which led to the opportunity to visit the Solomon Islands with Christina Reymer of Mahi Tahi (formerly Catholic Overseas Volunteers). On that trip I attended a meeting in Honiara to discuss Tutu RTC. At that meeting a selection of RTCs in the Solomon Islands and Vanuatu were invited to pilot the Tutu RTC education model which is proving successful in Fiji.

Geoff Bamford, who arranged and conducted the meeting in Honiara, recommended I conduct my fieldwork at Tutu RTC. From what I had heard at the meeting in Honiara and learnt from reading various reports subsequently, I enthusiastically pursued the opportunity. Father McVerry, the Tutu RTC Principal, generously granted me permission to use Tutu RTC as my case study. He also arranged my dates to coincide with the four day pilot course for the selected rural training centres held at Tutu in Taveuni, Fiji.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The research takes a qualitative approach to data collection. Though not an ethnographic study, I stayed on site for three weeks and endeavoured to participate as a member of the Tutu community whenever possible. Dewalt and Dewalt (2000:266-9) recognise using ethnographic approaches builds trust and acceptance, and rapport which is critical to data quality.

The research methodology used three qualitative methods of data collection. The first was semi-structured interviews of a selection of the Tutu community on local perceptions of wellbeing. Participant observation was used to gain an understanding of Tutu RTC processes and to ensure consistency with the other data forms. Finally document analysis was used to explore the philosophy of Tutu RTC and as a crosscheck on the primary data.

1.6 THESIS STRUCTURE

The literature review for the study is undertaken in Chapters 2 and 3 of the thesis. Each of the literature review chapters corresponds to the first two research objectives. Chapter 2
investigates education within a postdevelopment framework. The chapter begins with an examination of the links between development and formal education. Critiques of normative development and conventional education, both of which are understood to be hegemonic and western constructs, will be presented. In this way literature that provides a rationale for seeking alternatives to mainstream schooling will be reviewed. An examination of the emergence of postdevelopment as a credible discourse (McGregor, 2009:12) is undertaken to synthesise an alternative approach to education that is informed by postdevelopment. The features of a postdevelopment education are identified and defined. The resulting characteristics of an alternative approach to education are used to create a theoretical framework for the investigation of Tutu RTC.

Chapter 3 relates to the second research objective. This objective implicitly links the effectiveness of an education with its capacity to promote community wellbeing. The link was emphasised by educationist David Guenewald (2003:8) through his rhetorical question: “If education is not to promote wellbeing, then what is education for”. The chapter reviews literature on wellbeing to build an understanding of this diverse and contested topic. Two perceptions of wellbeing emerge. The first is wellbeing as the standard of living and presented as material or extrinsic or ‘the means to’ wellbeing. The second is wellbeing as happiness, joy and flourishing. It is presented here as intrinsic or ‘the ends’ wellbeing. The two education modalities are scrutinised to examine the links between them and the two views of wellbeing identified in the literature. The chapter finishes with the presentation of a theoretical wellbeing framework that will be used to assist the assessment of Tutu RTC’s ability to promote wellbeing.

Chapter 4 explains the methodology of the fieldwork. It draws on research literature by ethno-Fiji academic Nabobo-Baba (2006). Nabobo-Baba promoted an indigenous methodology which Aporosa (pending, Ch 6:4) asserts aligns with postdevelopment methodology. Nabobo-Baba (2006) calls her approach Vanua research. Vanua refers to the land, the inhabitants, the ecology and the customs of the land. When conducting Vanua research Nabobo-Baba explains it must be using local customs and traditions. Aporosa designed a methodology which he describes as aligning well with a postdevelopment approach. Both authors argued that research involving ethnic Fijian communities must have, as its core, a belief in self-determination and local processes which challenge hegemonic forces (Escobar, 2001:163 in Aporosa, pending:47). Aporosa and Nabobo-
Baba have used a localised postdevelopment approach to their research methodology and the fieldwork for this study is guided by their work.

The three data collection methods are all qualitative. The semi-structured interviews are used to collect data on the second research question regarding Tutu RTC’s ability to promote wellbeing. Participant observation and a document analysis are used to ascertain, or not, if Tutu RTC can be referred to as a postdevelopment-informed approach to education. The rationale for selecting these methods is explained and an assessment of the quality of the data each provided is given.

The context for the fieldwork is set in Chapter 5. This follows a brief history of Fiji which includes the period of British colonisation and Fiji’s eventual independence in 1970. The political background is discussed with particular reference to the events that influenced the four coups that have occurred since independence (US State Department, 2011). Education in Fiji is traced from the pre-colonial traditional education through to the current system of compulsory formal schooling. Tutu RTC is given some context through a discussion of the contemporary problems confronting education in Fiji, particularly for rural Fijians, along with the approaches being taken to alleviate these problems.

The second half of Chapter 5 concentrates on Tutu RTC. The discussion starts with the beginning of the centre in 1969 and it traces the evolution of the training and philosophical underpinnings through to the current course structure and processes. Those current courses are explored along with the philosophy behind them and an understanding of the catchment area and the student demographic. A summary of the general day to day operation of Tutu completes an understanding of why Tutu RTC exists and the parameters within which it operates.

The Tutu context allows the data collected to be understood in relation to its sociological environment. Chapter 6 is concerned with the analysis and findings of that data. The summarising, tabulation and analysis was not commenced until the collection of the data was completed, thereby avoiding any influence that initial trends might have on the preceding chapters or indeed the data collection itself. The semi-structured interview data is used to gather local understandings of wellbeing. Observation and document analysis will provide the data to enable a match between the Tutu reality and an alternative approach to education. The approach employed in this research is repeated iterations of inspect, analyse and record the data until clear patterns have emerged. The theoretical
frameworks from the literature review chapters and summary tables will guide this process.

The final chapter, Chapter 7 starts with an overview of the arguments and purpose of the study. A view on Tutu RTC as an example of postdevelopment-informed education and if Tutu RTC promotes community wellbeing will be discussed and presided upon. Answering these two questions allows the aim of the thesis, to gauge the effectiveness of an education informed by postdevelopment, to be met. The second section of this chapter is the thesis conclusion. It begins with a discussion of the findings on the three research objectives. This leads to a decision on the main thesis aim regarding the effectiveness of an alternative approach to education. In meeting this aim an attempt will be made to generalise the findings. If the training at Tutu RTC is judged to be more successful than conventional education can this example be applied to other communities, indigenous or western? The last section is saved for the implications of the thesis and suggested areas of further study.
CHAPTER 2: APPROACHES TO EDUCATION FOR DEVELOPMENT

2.1 INTRODUCTION
Through a critical review of the education for development literature the aim of this chapter is to envisage an alternative approach to education. There are growing arguments which problematise conventional education (Gatto, 2009 and Gruenewald & Smith, 2008). The westernising and homogenising effect of conventional education lacking local relevance and stifling motivation (Thaman, 2007:16), and the advantage such education affords the wealthy (Prakash and Esteva, 2008:2) are two such concerns. These concerns will be explored in detail, with the goal of articulating an education alternative that responds to critiques of formal mainstream education. This alternative approach to education will be informed by postdevelopment principles and indigenous values.

Jones (2007:xii) observed mainstream education, as the dominant discourse, is so powerful it has become the education delivered and demanded across the globe. Initially the focus of this chapter is to review the literature on the global education phenomenon. It will trace conventional education from a western construct into a powerful institution. Mainstream education’s evolution will be related to the evolution of the practice and the contesting of normative development to understand the relationship between them. Establishing that link will provide an insight into the development agenda for education and may allow new development initiatives to become new education initiatives.

2.2 CONVENTIONAL APPROACHES TO EDUCATION FOR NORMATIVE DEVELOPMENT
By reviewing literature this section aims to plot the changes to education and development since the Second World War (WWII). As countries emerged from this war sovereignty was returned to them from colonial rulers and new nation-states were drawn up (McMichael, 2008). A new world order had begun. Sovereign governments therefore assumed greater responsibility for the governance and development of their citizens and education received its share of this attention.

Since WWII the relationship between education and development had become more explicit. The World Bank policy documents will be used to reflect development thinking and its interface with education as it is the World Bank’s policy, in particular, that sets the agenda for its borrowers and therefore shapes developing nation’s educational direction.
This section first traces development through a historical perspective to uncover any parallel changes in education.

TRUMAN’S AGENDA FOR DEVELOPMENT

The modern era of development began at the end of WWII launched by United States (US) President Harry Truman in his re-election address in 1949 (Esteva, 1992:6). In this address he not only defined aspirations for developing nations, which he modelled on US western thinking, but he also stated how these were to be achieved. The address instructed poor countries to seek technological advancement and growth. Through investment by wealthy countries in the infrastructure of undeveloped countries it was argued that the poor could expand industrially and economically and achieve a better life (Esteva, 1992:6).

Truman’s address also described how an educated workforce was critical to enabling expansion and growth for poor countries (Bartleby, 1989:para55). Importantly ‘education for all’ had already been promoted by the United Nations (UN) International Children’s Education Fund (UNICEF) one year before the Truman address (Fien & Hughes, 2007:11). In any case Jones observed that, during this period, the lending by the World Bank to education was not solely a ‘bricks and mortar’ concern but “[…] World Bank education staff were overwhelmingly architects by profession” (1995:118).

The World Bank perceived an urgent need for vocational and technical education and an expanded secondary education to provide management for government, industry and commerce (World Bank, 1963:1). Jones believed the World Bank’s approach to education was a celebration of Human Capital Theory which started in the 1960s and continues to the present day (1995:118; 2007:xviii). Human Capital Theory holds that education generates skilled workers who are necessary to drive a modern economy. As a result school numbers increased rapidly from 1950 (Meyer et al, 1992:128). This expansion occurred in western as well as developing countries.

EDUCATION AND KEYNESIAN DEVELOPMENT

Modernisation as the tool for development was dominated by Keynesian economics. Keynes’s theories became the basis for western economic policy until the mid-1970s (Free, 2010:9). This period saw unprecedented government involvement in the economy (Tanzi and Schuknecht, 2000:10). The state owned and controlled health, welfare and education systems as well as essential industries like banks, telecommunications, power generation and transport. This led to western prosperity and a focus on social justice
internally, and poverty in developing countries externally. Tanzi and Schuknecht (2000:13) referred to this involvement as ‘social engineering’ as it was more about control than altruism.

As prosperity increased in the west, the World Bank’s lending across the board to developing countries expanded. Jones (1995:119) maintained the unprecedented levels of World Bank finance for education shaped the borrower country’s policies and priorities to that of the lender. Hence there was an acceleration of the spread of western-style education.

The period from the end of WWII until the end of the 1970s known as the ‘development project’ (McMichael, 2008:45) was characterised by development through state-controlled modernisation. Modernisation required expanded industrialisation which depended on building human capital through education. Through state control and the availability of World Bank finance, education had become a major pillar of development (McMichael, 2008:49).

**EDUCATION UNDER A NEOLIBERAL AGENDA, 1980S AND 1990S**

The 1980s saw the election of Reagan in the US and Thatcher in Britain after the panic of the oil shocks of 1973 and 1979 and a rising debt problem. Governments brought in a system of state deregulation and privatisation. Development, formerly a public project because of the degree of state involvement, was redefined as a private sector project. McMichael (2008:149) refers to this as the global project.

The global project was built on a global free market and a reduced role of the state (Brohman, 1995:134). Wealthy countries followed the policies of the US and UK (Jones, 1995:122) and structural adjustment programmes (SAPs) were used by the World Bank to coerce increasingly indebted third world countries to reduce state spending in areas such as education and enter into the global free market (Jones, 1995:135). When Communism fell in 1989 those countries were encouraged, through conditional loans, to adopt the neoliberal ideology. The global project was propelled by the World Bank and International Monetary Fund (IMF) and policed by the World Trade Organisation (WTO). These institutions together with transnational corporations (TNCs) had effectively taken control of national and international development from the nation states (McMichael, 2008:151).
The World Bank had a strong influence on school structures, processes and curriculum through SAP conditionalities attached to sizeable education loans (Jones, 2007:16). Jones observed that, despite incurring mounting debt, Third world countries were at the bottom of nearly every educational and social indicator (1995:122). Developing countries gained universal western education in return for the burden of large debt repayments at a time when poverty was increasing.

Through the paradigm shift to globalization the western system of conventional education had become ubiquitous. The World Bank played a prominent role in this shift (Jones, 2007:xiv). Like development itself, western-style education had become a global system. However the growing poverty in the Third world and the huge outcry over neoliberal policies resulted in multilateral aid agencies presenting a more human face.

**EDUCATION AND THE MDGS**

In 2000 eight Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) to overcome poverty were agreed to by the international community. The MDGs represented a new global unity in the fight against poverty and gave specific targets to be achieved by 2015 (UN, 2010). Education was a specific goal with corresponding targets.

Education was seen as critical for prosperity. Quantitative analysis by World Bank education researchers King and Hill (1993:1) showing primary education reaps many benefits to developing countries, convinced the multilateral agencies to emphasise education in the MDGs. The second MDG argues for universal primary education and the third MDG looks to eliminate gender disparity at all levels of education (UN, 2010). In fact, for some, education is seen as key to achieving all eight MDG goals (Clarke & Feeny, 2007:vii).

Education as a MDG is well supported. It is claimed universal education can unlock the door for the south to enter the global economy, can achieve gender equality, and can improve health and material wealth reducing poverty leading to wellbeing (Clarke and Feeney, 2007:vii; Abu-Ghaida & Klasen 2004:1077). The prevailing view is that education policy can address poverty, with poverty reduction being explicitly linked to economic growth.

In critique of this idea a number of scholars have found a negative or nil correlation between education level and economic growth in the south (Pritchard, 2001:382; Abu-
Ghaida and Klasen, 2004:1078; Babones, 2009:59). They concluded economies must be reformed to be able to take advantage of developing countries’ newly acquired skills (2001:389). Babones (2009:49) explains countries of the south are now over-educated for the productive needs of their economies, in that there are no jobs following education, and this has created a ‘brain drain’ to wealthier countries.

Hence, despite this strong focus on education made explicit in the MDGs, results have been inconclusive. Not only is the link between education and economic growth weak and a brain drain created, but the education goals are not likely to be met. The 2011 United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) report identified that the MDG of universal primary enrolment by 2015 will not be achieved by most developing countries.

Education beyond 2010
Disappointment with the performance return on the education investment in the south has led the World Bank to launch a new strategy, ‘Learning for All by 2020’ (World Bank, 2011). The World Bank stated that learning delivers wellbeing through economic growth (World Bank, 2010:1), but it recognised years at school as not the same as learning (2011:vi). The World Bank now sees starting education in early childhood and reforming the education system as key to education achievements. This would be achieved through funding that is tied to actual learning and the quality of governance, management and teaching. Benchmarks through international testing on such things as literacy and numeracy, they argued, will add accountability to the strategy (World Bank, 2011:ix). The reforms seek to encourage more involvement in education from the private sector as well as other civil society groups (2011:3). This strategy showed a continuation of the shift in education from state to private provision in line with the globalization project.

Formal education as a right and a necessity has been largely unchallenged. It is presumed to enhance the economy of a nation by applying skills and knowledge acquired at school into the workplace. The assertion by the World Bank is that a high growth economy leads to wellbeing for the individual and the country. This assertion, which is also implicit in the MDGs, will be investigated in Chapter 3.

Summary
This section explored the link between development and education. The literature showed not only is there a clear link between development policy and education policy, but that
development drives the education agenda and education, in turn, is critical to attaining mainstream development goals.

The development goal of modernisation of the third world required an expanded education system to generate a technologically skilled workforce. Just as Keynesian development led to the state controlling much of the production and services of an economy, the government also controlled schools, curriculum, staff, policy and even the student numbers needed at each level of school qualification to ensure a balanced workforce (Jones, 1995:118).

McMichael’s ‘global project’ (2008) currently dominates development. Private ownership of, or partnerships with, publically-owned entities remain the policy and practice across the globe. At the same time the World Bank has called for more involvement in education by the private sector (2011:3) and less spending in the public sector impacting upon education. In addition since 1991 “… the bank has steadily increased its use of education reform program loans to drive neoliberal policies around the world” (Jones, 2007:xii). Not only is the privatisation agenda dictating the ownership and funding of schools but Jones concludes formal education is a ‘means’ to obtaining the ‘end’ of a global free market economy. Development ideology drives education policy and then the education delivered is used as a vehicle to transform that development from ideology to reality.

2.3 CONTESTING THIS DISCURSIVE FIELD OF EDUCATION

So formal education is the default education and reflects international development agenda, both in the way it is governed, and in its goals. Educational historian Phillip Jones argued that this agenda is driven by multilateral institutions particularly the World Bank (1995, 2007). As the control of education is governed by forces external to countries and their peoples, this section asks, is the imposed global education appropriate?

Literature representing the critique of mainstream education is investigated to answer this question. In particular postdevelopment writers, indigenous voices and scholars from the margins are consulted to understand alternative views within the education discourse.

**CRITIQUE OF CONVENTIONAL EDUCATION**

Indigenous scholar Gustavo Esteva (1992) worked among the grassroots groups in the Oaxaca province of Mexico. His defining statement summarised the discontent of the neoliberal ideology of the 1980s. In this statement Esteva used an Illich (1972) term
‘disvalue’. Illich (1992:76) argued the culture-eroding effect of economic or monetary value should be termed ‘disvalue’.

Esteva (1992:18) claimed

Disvalue transmogrifies skills into lacks, commons into resources, men and women into commodified labour, tradition into burden, wisdom into ignorance, and autonomy into dependency. It transmogrifies people’s autonomous activities embodying wants, skills, hopes and interaction with each other and with the environment into needs whose satisfaction requires the mediation of the market.

In effect Esteva claimed the free market has caused societies to exchange their individual and collective identity for the global culture of money and consumption.

Jones offered a similar observation regarding education. He noted (2007:xii)

All around the world the variety and dynamics of local culture have collided with the steady transformation of societies along the lines implied by modernisation. It is when opening the classroom door this is most evident [...].

Jones’s claim suggests school creates an interface between a local community and the market, one where the diversity and culture of the world’s people are homogenised. Given this observation it is concerning that western education has become normalised and globalised and that voices calling for alternatives are seldom heard (Jones, 2007:xv). This section provides the space for the voices critiquing formal education to be heard. Five such areas of critique relating to formal education have been identified in the literature.

The first criticism claims mainstream education is another face of western colonisation (Prakash & Esteva, 2008:3; Thaman, 2007:16; Flores, 2003:3). These writers argue that conventional western-style education affords no relevance to local culture and knowledge, the place where the students inhabit or the community to which they belong. As a result schooling devalues the student’s own culture and epistemology, and replaces it with western monoculture (Prakash & Esteva, 2008:6). Young people subjected to the hegemony of compulsory western schooling lose their cultural identity, sense of belonging and dignity.
The second failing identified is that conventional education creates inequality and poverty (Shor & Freire, 1987:123, Mosley, 2001:24). Shor and Freire (1987) and Mosley (2001) believe it maintains the elite by advantaging students from privileged backgrounds over those who are impoverished. Elite advantage is hidden through the myth of educational equality (Shor & Freire, 1987:39). Unemployment and poverty are sold as the fault of the undereducated even though the educational cards are stacked against them (Shor & Freire, 1987:36, Gatto, 2009:14). Prakash and Esteva (2008:2) add education creates the most vicious discrimination as social standing and wealth are based on educational achievement. The education system blames underachievers labelling them as too dull or lazy to succeed. Education creates elite capture for the few and a poverty trap for the rest.

The third criticism of mainstream education is that it inflicts a money culture on all it encounters (Prakesh & Esteva, 2008:3) and it promotes material consumption through its individualistic qualification game of winners and losers (Gatto, 2009:116). Education success is ultimately measured by money which is the extrinsic reward for the efforts to gain qualifications and resulting employment. This contrasts with the forgotten intrinsic reward of enjoying and valuing the learning activity, knowledge and skill itself. Consequently winners demonstrate their success by conspicuous consumption. Escobar argued the losers become factory fodder and a subordinate class (1997:88) becoming a ready resource for industry (Gatto, 2009:22). This hierarchy has become normalized as students are not equipped to question the ideology of the market economy (Gatto, 2009:41). McInerney (2011:4) sums up this criticism by describing schooling as “learn to earn”.

The fourth body of critique is on the dependency caused by education (Prakash & Esteva, 2008:9). Conventional education’s abstract curriculum often has little meaning for the learner, their community or their way of life (Freire, 1971). Interdependence and self-reliance generated by informal modes of education through parents and community are replaced by hours at school studying abstract curriculum. “These abstractions cause students to be useless to others and useless to themselves” (Gatto, 2009:9). Gatto (2009:70) believes this can result in dependencies on such things as competition, consumption, television, computers, and alcohol and drugs. Prakash and Esteva (2008:9) hold that the curriculum leads the learner to become dependent on the formal market economy. The reliance on income leads to urban drift. In many countries school leavers
either add to the urban unemployed or are exploited in slave-like conditions through factory work (Prakash and Esteva, 2008:68).

The fifth critique is that formal education causes the child to become disconnected from their families, communities and the environment (Prakash & Esteva, 2008:91). Gatto (2009:130) expressed this critique firmly:

*Schools disconnect, they divide and conquer kids from their families, their traditions, their communities, their religions, natural allies, interests and adventure, creating takers not givers and consumers not contributors.*

He believes education harms a child’s connection to family. He explained “family is the engine of education” (2009:62) but western education breaks this bond through the early physical separation of the children from parents and a homogenizing curriculum. Gatto argued the interruption of the natural relationship between a child and their family or with community creates a ‘disconnect’.

Charges that mainstream education is fake, artificial, abstract, not real nor relevant to the learner resulting in alienation and disconnection are made repeatedly (Illich, 1972:44; Freire, 2001:34; Chalmers, 2004:32; Prakash & Esteva, 2008:59; Gatto,2009:81; Gruenewald, 2003:7; Manning, 2003:19; Thaman, 2007:2; Littky, 2004:30). Shor and Freire noted, because the disconnected curriculum is demotivating and diminishes dignity, many students resort to ‘performance strike’ showing aggression or passivity (1987:124-128). Without strong connections a child can lose motivation, identity and belonging.

In summary, the contesting of conventional education has been grouped into five areas of critique. They are that local culture is replaced by western hegemony, formal education exacerbates inequality and poverty, education sustains a money and consumption culture, it causes dependency and lastly education creates a disconnection between the learner and their community and the learner and their locality. The critique of education through formal schooling is sufficiently profound and persistent to suggest alternatives should be explored.

A selection of postdevelopment literature critical of mainstream orthodox development is presented alongside the five critiques of formal education. This is shown in Table 2.1, below, to reveal the alignment and links between the two critiques of education and development.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Critique of formal education</th>
<th>Critique of orthodox development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Colonising/deculturalising/western hegemony</td>
<td>“War brings genocide but education brings culturecide” (Prakash &amp; Esteva, 2008:7).</td>
<td>“The main reason development has failed is it has replicated western rather than indigenous causes” (Brohman, 1995:128).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inequality/poverty</td>
<td>“Refuse the education system that produces inequalities and discrimination” (Prakash &amp; Esteva, 2008:11).</td>
<td>“Material benefits are confined to the few. The rest work in urban margins and exploitative settings” (McMichael, 2008:149).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dependency</td>
<td>“Education destroys communities creating dependency on the global economy” (Prakash &amp; Esteva, 2008:9).</td>
<td>“Development obliges people to find jobs to earn money. This causes dependency” (Goulet, 1992:471).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disconnect</td>
<td>“Schools disconnect, they divide and conquer kids from their families, their traditions, their communities, their religions, natural allies, interests and adventure creating takers not givers and consumers not contributors” (Gatto, 2009:130).</td>
<td>“Development causes the displacement of traditional values and relationships” (Brohman, 1995:133). “In the name of development a justification is given for bartering away ones dignity and self-respect for the privilege of attending to the worlds affluent” (Sardar, 1997:37).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author
The failings of mainstream education presented are a mirror of the failings identified in normative development literature. This correspondence follows logically from the opening section of this chapter which identified the inter-relationship between economic development and education. It also follows from the assertion that education is a carrier for neo-colonial hegemony (Andreotti, 2010:9).

In this section it has been shown that criticisms of formal schooling can be grouped into five categories. Though not mutually exclusive these groups have proved useful for analysis and summarising. Table 1 showed the five categories of critique for formal education neatly aligned with critiques of normative development. Table 1 provides the rationale to argue that just as postdevelopment approaches have assisted in countering the development critique, postdevelopment can assist in exploring an alternative education that counters the parallel education critique. Therefore an investigation of alternative education literature that reflects postdevelopment principles is undertaken in the next section.

2.4 AN ALTERNATIVE APPROACH TO EDUCATION FOR DEVELOPMENT

For an alternative to be informed by postdevelopment, an investigation seeking to identify common principles within postdevelopment literature is required.

**POSTDEVELOPMENT PRINCIPLES**

McGregor says postdevelopment evolved from a theory based on the critique of development to a discourse founded on its own principles (2009:12). Postdevelopment literature will be reviewed to articulate these principles. This will allow postdevelopment to be used as a guide to explore alternative education.

Postdevelopment evolved from the response to neoliberalism and the structural adjustment policies of the 1980s. McGregor (2009:12) described the first wave of postdevelopment as: “An angry and brash critique of all development seeing injustice in all dealings”. Early postdevelopment was itself challenged. It was all critique of development but provided few concrete alternatives (Pieterse, 2000:188; Sidoway, 2008:18). Keily believed it led to a reification of the indigenous culture (1999:33, 50) and a south ‘good’ north ‘bad’ reverse orientalism (1999:18).
In response to this criticism a second wave of postdevelopment followed the first. Where postdevelopment began as a discourse based on the critique of development it then became a theory based on broad principles (McGregor, 2009:12). The proponents of postdevelopment were more hopeful in their views of an alternative to development. Five postdevelopment principles have been identified in the literature and will now be discussed.

The first principle is the need for local autonomy. Sauviat (2007:104) described autonomy in a society as one that makes its own laws and is the source of its own norms. Escobar, arguably the pioneer of postdevelopment, demands the right of indigenous cultures to their own knowledge production (2007:21). Ziai (2009:12) also recognised self-determination is achieved through direct local grassroots democracy. Clearly autonomy is critical to formulating and implementing a locality’s own development needs.

A second principle is the deconstruction of colonial ‘truths’, development ‘absences’, and capitalist ‘norms’ (McGregor, 2009:3-6). This then allows the space for the third postdevelopment principle identified, reconstruction. Where deconstruction decentres the west and modernity, reconstruction re-centres local, regional and indigenous epistemologies (Simon, 2005:4). Gibson and Graham (2010:226) suggested this can be done by a combination of undermining the west’s hierarchy of cultures, rejection of unilinear trajectory through progress, and the unhinging of development from economic growth.

Reconstruction of local epistemologies returns sovereignty to the community and allows the fourth postdevelopment principal of localisation. Localisation, the antithesis to globalisation, “… takes back the economy as a space of decision” (Gibson-Graham, 2005:17). Gibson and Graham believed critical to local sovereignty is building a community economy which they describe as a mix of the non-formal cash economy and the informal subsistence economy. As a result “economy is something we do, not something done to us” (Gibson-Graham & Roelvink, 2009:11). This process of localisation can become the vehicle for emancipation, justice, equity, and new possibilities (McGregor, 2009:8).
The last postdevelopment principal is building partnerships. Communities with their own autonomy, and therefore strong identity, do not reject development but rather use what works and reject what does not (Ahorro, 2009:3). This allows the freedom to operate non-formal economies with traditional and modern enterprises or hybrids of the two (Escobar, 2007:21). Maiava and King (2007:91) call this weaving of the global economy with local and indigenous culture the moral economy. Gibson and Graham (2005:12) use the term diverse economy to describe the partnership of formal and informal economies which they cautioned (2010:234) must be ones that are socially and environmentally responsible.

Five postdevelopment principles or values have been identified within the postdevelopment literature. These are autonomy, deconstruct, reconstruct, localisation and partnerships. The values engendered by these themes are inherently indigenous; indeed, Samoan academics Maiava and King (2007:85) refer to second-wave postdevelopment as indigenous development. By using these values as a framework, an alternative education approach informed by postdevelopment can be explored.

AN ALTERNATIVE APPROACH TO EDUCATION INFORMED BY POSTDEVELOPMENT
Each of the five postdevelopment principles will be used as a lens to highlight education literature consistent with that characteristic. The following section deals with one postdevelopment feature at a time and investigates how it manifests within education. In this way a postdevelopment and an indigenous values-laden alternative education can be articulated.

(i) Local autonomy and self-determination
The term autonomy in this context includes the exercising of community sovereignty over the local language, culture and traditions, indigenous knowledge and the commons. Education literature that refers to these subthemes will be consulted.

Mosley, who studied village schools in Mexico, maintained that decentralising the education system is necessary for communities to obtain control over their education (2001:142). As also noted by Smith (2003:9) this affords genuine grassroots autonomy so every school or community of schools becomes a sustainable republic. Through direct democracy, student, staff, parent and community voices previously silenced by a centralized system are heard.
Furthermore, Thaman, a Fijian academic at the University of the South Pacific (USP) in Fiji, claimed indigenous education must be taught in the local language as it links directly to the culture (2007:1) and there is clear evidence that children have improved education outcomes when learning in their first language (Smith, 2010). She maintained it is not possible to have indigenous education without the medium being their first language (2007:1). Culture cannot exist without the indigenous language (Flores, 2003:7) and that language cannot exist without autonomy.

Cultural practice gives people meaning and identity (Smith, 2003:9, Gegeo, 1998:295). New Zealand indigenous academic, Wally Penetito, argued education should use the local context and culture as the primary lens for the conveyance of all subject matter (2004:13). Indigenous education, which promotes learning through and about its own culture and indigenous knowledge systems, increases success for the learner and the long-term survival of the village (Whitinui, 2008:3, Smith, 2003:8). Education that affirms the local culture affirms the community.

A persistent challenge to autonomy is standardised testing. National qualifications necessitate a centralized curriculum, frequent testing and an infrastructure to govern compliance and accountability. Littky (2004) favours students learning by embarking on projects that explore their own passions. Assessment in his school occurs by students exhibiting their work to peers, teachers, family and interested community members as a way to witness their progress. In this way the learning is celebrated and particular talents, that all students possess, are given expression. An autonomous school chooses the form of assessment that is relevant and hence retains each student’s dignity and mana (respect).

(ii) Deconstruct external epistemologies
Deconstruction requires an ability to think critically to unravel what has become normalized by an external dominant culture (McEwan, 2009:7; Andreotti, 2010:10). Within this postdevelopment principle educational literature that decentres the hegemony of colonial and neo-colonial thinking is reviewed.
Monocultural thinking is created by colonisation and its presumed superiority (Gibson-Graham, 2005:21). Decolonisation refers to the deconstruction of what has been normalized by colonization. It explores systems and practices that have led to power imbalances and oppressions between the colonizing race and indigenous people (McEwan, 2009:27). Andreotti (2010:9) maintained that formal education perpetuates colonial
thinking. She argued through education we are socialised into thinking that modernity with its mono-epistemic practices and unsustainable way of life is normal and there is no other alternative (2010:9). Education, taking on the postdevelopment and postcolonial principle of deconstruction, has a twofold role. First it must recognise and eliminate educational approaches that reinforce colonial thinking and secondly it teaches and utilises critical thinking to expose and question colonial views held by society.

Freire (1972:65) spoke of dialogue, which requires critical thinking, as true education. Critical dialogue can then be used to challenge and transform the dominant and destructive effects of conventional ‘banking’ education. Gruenewald (2003:3) added critical pedagogy raises awareness in a student’s education about inequities of power, myths of opportunity and belief systems that cause people not to question or change\(^1\). Once critical thinking skills are enabled, decolonisation is possible.

Neocolonialism is used to refer to a new form of colonialism brought by neoliberalism (McEwan, 2009:5). Andreotti added through mainstream education people are led to believe there is no other way than market globalization and the exploitation of human relationships and natural resources. Instead education must “decolonize the imagination and pluralise the possibilities towards a non-hegemonic system” (2010:9). Critical thinking empowers the recipients to counter the homogenising effect of television, the media and formal education.

(iii) Reconstruction of local epistemologies

Once the destructive practices of colonization have been deconstructed the space is cleared to reclaim a sense of place and identity. Lost indigenous and marginalised views are afforded voice in the reconstruction of history and knowledge production (McEwan, 2009:26). The following paragraphs reflect the educational literature relating to place, land, and its history as they summarise the essence of the postdevelopment principle of reconstruction.

Knapp describes ‘place’ as a piece of the environment claimed by feelings (2008:5). Place, location and land give us our identity. In many ways place is a lens through which young

---

\(^1\) Andreotti (2010:15-19) listed six steps of critical thinking to deconstruct Eurocentric norms. First, logical contradictions must be identified in peoples’ own thinking and secondly recognise their own lens and how that lens was constructed. The third step is to recognise that multiple epistemologies exist and then accept each perspective will require a different answer. Furthermore, accepting what is right depends on the context, and the final step requires analysing contexts to create provisional meaning with others.
people begin to make sense of themselves and their surroundings. Through place they learn to develop a sense of community and form relationships (McInerney et al., 2011:5). Wally Penetito recognised the need to ground education. He stated: “It must include the soil under our feet and our social history” (2004:4).

Education that focuses on the local environment is called place-based education. It connects place with ‘self’ and community (Gruenewald, 2003:7). This is needed so the education of citizens might have a direct bearing on the places people inhabit (2003:4). The aim is to reinhabit the locality where you live. Gruenewald described reinhabitation as learning to live well together in a place damaged through exploitation (2008:149). He said it is important that young people bond with the natural world, learning to love it before being asked to heal it (2003:7).

Penetito (2004:8) used the Maori terms whakapapa (genealogy) as an illustration of the importance of ancestry and a place’s history to Maori. Being able to trace your whakapapa to the original indigenous settlers of NZ bestows honour because it demonstrates that person’s connection to the original tangata whenua (people of the land). It is customary to give your connection to a location such as a nearby mountain or river when delivering a korero (speech) showing landscape is tied to identity. Manning (2008:54), claimed reconstruction asks us to revisit site by site our history, a history currently under western eyes.

Reconstruction is the process of placing the ‘local’ at the centre.

(iv) Local community (localisation)
Penetito defines a community as a set of human relationships bound by a local culture (2004:13). Guided by Penetito’s definition this section will review literature pertaining to building relationships among family, kin and the people of each locality. Within a postdevelopment framework, community members are interdependent, seeking sustainability, self-resilience and social justice (Raman, 2007:165). The next paragraphs will reflect alternative education literature on these areas of the fourth postdevelopment principle, community.

Alternative education literature supports the family relationship and recognizes its critical role in a child’s identity. Gatto (2009:67) believes family should be the main engine of schooling and at the heart of the good life, but schooling breaks this bond and alternative
education must rebuild it. He observed students who are disconnected from family, community and the everyday world become spectator kids (2009:45). Through this alienation they become addicted to television, computers, education, money and material consumption (2009:82-96). “Put family and the environment as centres of meaning” he directed (2009:40) because when you build meaning out of relationships the notion of happiness through consumption disappears (2009:116).

Education is a community responsibility (Littky, 2004:106; Penetito, 2004:13). Schools must overcome their traditional isolation from the community (Gruenewald & Smith, 2008:xx). Littky (2004:122) demanded: "Break down the walls and let the kids out and the world in.” Littky argues the merging of school and community should be seamless.

One way to achieve seamlessness with the locality is through service-learning. Sorenson observed that by learning how to serve a community, students develop confidence to solve local problems and build good relationships, making the community more sustainable (2008:58).

Gruenewald (2003:6) argued the environmental crisis is a community problem which cannot be solved without social justice. He believes social justice is at the heart of stopping degradation, depletion and pollution. Ecological consciousness and understanding is necessary to maintain sustainable communities and education must play its part. Thaman reminds us that indigenous communities have been in their localities for thousands of years so surely they know about sustainability. That makes indigenous peoples the best teachers of sustainability and, teaching by example is the best pedagogy (2007:8).

Formal education discourages the traditional skills that are needed in the community for self-sufficiency and self-reliance. Instead they gain skills with no currency in the village. Mosley, who conducted fieldwork in Mexico, observed that once young people had completed their formal education there was nowhere to go except to the United States (2001:110). Not only does urban migration rob the village of its youthful contributors but these arriving urban immigrants are socially dislocated and either end up working in a factory under exploitative conditions or unemployed. The problem of urban migration is repeated worldwide. Alternative place-based and non-formal education can contain this
trend by creating a connection with ‘place’ and learning that matches local needs. Relevant and meaningful learning transforms disconnectedness.

**(v) Building partnerships with external enterprises**

Postdevelopment evolved beyond the rejection of orthodox development to be encouraging of partnerships with like-minded development actors. This involves individuals, local community groups, and social movements or grassroots groups forming partnerships with external institutions. Forming hybrids with socially responsible enterprises recognises the diversity of development (McGregor, 2009:7) and dismantles north/south binaries (Ahorro, 1999:4). Education literature on the postdevelopment principle of partnership will now be explored.

An education partnership occurs when an alternative school forms a hybrid with the formal state education system. Postdevelopment-informed education does not mean rejecting all conventional schooling (Gruenewald, 2003:11). Manning (2008) argued working with schools to alter their curriculum and pedagogical approach to become place-based is more realistic.

An example of such a hybrid is Kura Kaupapa, the New Zealand Maori education alternative to mainstream schools. It seeks excellence in Maori and English so Maori graduates have skills to operate in modern *pakeha* (western) society but align with Maori traditional aspirations (Smith, 2003:8). Mosley, in a parallel argument in Mexico, adds that indigenous education needs state support for local projects and not local support for state projects (2001:57). She concluded that a successful partnership with the state still needs to grant autonomy to the local school community.

Colonial culture can be blended with local traditions to create a syncretic system. Catholicism for example has been adopted by many South American indigenous cultures (Mosley, 2001:80) and Christianity has cross-pollinated with Fijian culture (Nabobo-Baba et al., 2012). Mosley observed locals wanted education to be truly bilingual to achieve social and cultural continuity while allowing for an expansion of social and economic opportunity. She noted the greater the affirmation of the student’s local culture, the higher the scholastic achievement (2001:57). Evidence suggests bilingual and bicultural syncretism could be best for individuals as well as the indigenous community (2001:141).
Charter Schools present possibilities for educational partnerships. They were legislated into many states in the US from the mid-1980s and in the United Kingdom, during the same period, under the title of Opt Out Schools (Gannicott, 1997). Charter Schools are governed by interested groups within the community forming a partnership between the locality and the state. Significantly NZ is currently introducing these schools in 2012 and 2013 under the label Partnership Schools. Partnership and Charter Schools are supported by substantial deregulation of public education laws such as government education requirements, teacher qualifications and registration requirements, teacher pay and conditions, and even the curriculum to be taught (Gannicott, 1997:137). They are essentially deregulated private schools with full public funding (Duff, 2012:4). NZ teachers’ union President Robin Duff is scathing of Charter School legislation.

The proposal to fully-fund private, profit-making Charter Schools from taxpayer revenue when public schools are short of funds is revolting. It would be more accurate to describe these as ‘parasitic schools’ (Duff, 2012:4).

However Charter Schools do present opportunities for a postdevelopment approach to education. These schools encourage individual school autonomy and are only accountable to the overall performance of the students. This allows alternative educational approaches such as Big Picture and First Nation schools in the US. These schools are discussed in this chapter. The danger is since Partnership Schools can be run at a profit and their annual accounts and salaries are protected by commercial secrecy (Duff, 2012:4) their educational outcomes are compromised.

**Summary**

This section undertook a review of the education literature that harmonises with the five principles identified as fundamental to postdevelopment. A definitive picture emerged from the body of literature that aligned with these themes. That picture is place-based education and indigenous education aligns with the principles of postdevelopment. Therefore the next section focuses on place-based and indigenous education literature.
2.5 Place-based and Indigenous Education: Examples of Alternative Education That Align with a Postdevelopment Framework

Postdevelopment literature has been comprehensively explored to identify common values. These values formed the principles that were used to articulate an alternative education. Place-based education (PBE) and indigenous education appeared to adhere consistently to these principles and values. These two educational alternatives are interrogated against the five postdevelopment principles.

**Place-based and Indigenous Education Explored within the Postdevelopment Themes**

**(i) Autonomy**

Acunzo (1991:34) quoted in Mosley (2001:62) states: “For schools to be successfully introduced to indigenous communities they must be a medium for the recovery of the linguistic and cultural identity of the group”. Culture cannot exist without the indigenous language (Flores, 2003:7) and that language cannot exist without autonomy. Indigenous education promotes autonomy.

**(ii) Deconstructing**

Gruenewald (2003:3), a prominent PBE academic and practitioner, believes critical pedagogy raises awareness in a student’s education about inequities of power, myths of opportunity and belief systems that cause people not to question or change. Clearly PBE emphasises deconstruction of Eurocentric and western norms.

**(iii) Reconstructing**

Place-based education cultivates a sense of connectedness that underlies forms of caring and guardianship which is essential to maintain relationships between humans and the places where they live (Gruenewald & Smith, 2008:2). Gruenewald urges schools to employ PBE to combat ‘nature deficit disorder’ and ‘the extinction of experience’ (2008:170). This approach is designed to reconstruct indigenous identity and ecological connection.

**(iv) Localising**

Gruenewald says localism is to globalism as place-based education is to formal education (2008:xvi). Indigenous communities have been in their localities for thousands of years so surely they know about local self-resilience. That makes indigenous peoples the best teachers of sustaining the local (Thaman, 2007:8).
(v) Partnership building

*Kura Kaupapa* (an indigenous Maori education alternative) has formed a partnership with central government as discussed in the above section. Partnership is consistent with indigenous education and PBE.

It is clear both PBE and indigenous education are informed by postdevelopment and by each other. Therefore PBE and indigenous education are two examples of an articulated educational alternative informed by postdevelopment discourse, and critiquing these examples is critiquing education aligned to postdevelopment. Moreover indigenous education, as expressed in this study, is a manifestation of place-based education when applied to an indigenous setting.

**CRITIQUES OF PLACE-BASED EDUCATION FOR DEVELOPMENT**

PBE and indigenous education are not prescriptive. They have been shown to operate within a framework defined by postdevelopment principles but local grassroots democracy governs their operational and philosophical direction. Indeed Thaman (2011, personal communication) defines indigenous education as embedded in cultural values, beliefs and practices and is relevant and responsive to local needs. Therefore, since these characteristics vary for each locality, alternative education is not definitive but dynamic and diverse.

However critique is possible. McInerney et al. (2011:8-11) studied three schools in rural Australia who have adopted PBE and they identified two issues. Firstly ‘place’ is romanticised as picturesque and people-friendly but it can be hard to engender the same sense of belonging when it is a poor area suffering from neglect. Secondly concentrating on ‘place’ simplifies the world view needed to understand cause and effect of issues confronting a community. One such example is the reason for pollution in a locality may be that a transnational corporation set up in the area because the country allowed low environmental standards. However critical pedagogy encourages an issues-based approach to assist young people to engage with problems that range from issues of local neglect through to global injustices (McInerney et al., 2011:11). In this way these two issues can be addressed.

The major criticism of PBE approaches is the majority of people, in the economic north and south, want formal education because it provides the chance to achieve wealth and
escape poverty. May and Aikman (2003:143) for example lamented that formal education has contributed significantly to the loss of identity, indigenous knowledge and self-determination but indigenous people still want western-style education. Similarly, when Mosley interviewed parents about their preference for their child’s education some said they wanted Spanish taught as it is a commodity and the local language should be taught at home (2001:61). However a hybrid system of an indigenous education foundation within a wider state curriculum is consistent with PBE. In fact, as discussed previously in this chapter, research shows bilingual and bicultural approaches enhance learning.

Summary
This chapter used postdevelopment theory to explore a hypothetical alternative education. Two alternatives with much in common, place-based and indigenous education, emerged. The existence of examples of postdevelopment-informed alternative education, such as kura kaupapa, Big Picture schools and First Nation, Charter Schools, allowed it to be critiqued. The major challenges identified were able to be countered through PBE and indigenous education and consequently these educational alternatives have proved to be robust, have integrity and are consistent with postdevelopment values.

2.6 Chapter conclusion
This chapter lays the foundation for the thesis. It has presented the rationale for an alternative approach to education. It is the exploration of this alternative which generates the central aim of this thesis.

The chapter begins with an investigation into the link between development theory and education. The literature showed they are closely connected. Education policy since the Second World War reflected the evolution of development thinking throughout that period. Education has been used to generate the human capital to fuel the economy and promote growth (Jones, 1995). A self-reinforcing loop is set up whereby development informs education policy which directs educators to create a ready labour resource to drive development. Critical to this loop is that education normalises the message that economic development is the fundamental role of education (Andreotti, 2010).

In the 1980s normative development was vociferously criticised by academics particularly indigenous writers. Table 1 above showed that the critique directed at development again mirrored the formal education critique. Five criticisms of development were shown to closely align with the limitations of education. Just as postdevelopment theory was
presented as a credible alternative to the development impasse, postdevelopment was explored to inform an alternative education approach.

To achieve this, postdevelopment was interrogated and five principles emerged. Education literature was then explored within the framework of these five postdevelopment values. Two education modalities were identified as consistent with the values of postdevelopment, PBE and indigenous education. The thesis aims to investigate the effectiveness of these education alternatives.

Gruenewald (2003:1) provides a lead to examining the effectiveness of education. He questioned if education is not for creating community wellbeing then what is it for? With this in mind the next chapter seeks to conceptualise wellbeing to allow an investigation of the term education effectiveness.
CHAPTER 3: CONCEPTUALISATIONS OF WELLBEING

3.1 INTRODUCTION

Chapter 2 reviewed the literature of two opposing paradigms on approaches to education. The first paradigm is conventional formal education and how it is linked to development. The second paradigm is alternative education, which aligns with postdevelopment thinking, and its links to development. The review revealed that, similar to normative development thinking and practice, there is a western-centric philosophy guiding conventional education.

By applying postdevelopment principles to education, an alternative approach emerged. This alternative argues for a locally-focused, culturally and environmentally aware education that challenges western-centric thinking. Postdevelopment critique of education fleshes out a model of education which has similarities with indigenous perspectives of education. What is highlighted is the importance of place-based education (PBE). In considering PBE the notion of wellbeing is identified as fundamental. As argued by Gruenewald, education must have a direct bearing on people’s social and ecological wellbeing (2003:3). This study therefore presents wellbeing as an end of education.

The chapter deals with the literature by distinguishing two main areas of wellbeing. The first explores conventional western views of wellbeing which are summed up by ‘standard of living’ or, the term used in this chapter, material wellbeing. The second area explored will be indigenous and alternative perspectives of wellbeing.

For the purposes of this study the second wellbeing area will be referred to as intrinsic wellbeing. Intrinsic wellbeing refers to the wellbeing derived from performing the activity itself as opposed to the extrinsic reward of pay or possessions which are a means to wellbeing. There is a strong connection here with indigenous ideas on wellbeing as many argue indigenous cultures derive joy directly from the cultural practices and sustainable lifestyles (Gegeo, 1998). Indigenous lifestyles therefore engender intrinsic wellbeing. In this thesis extrinsic wellbeing refers to a western monetary culture and intrinsic wellbeing is related to an indigenous self-sufficient culture or as Gegeo argues ‘the good life’ (1998: 299).

The link between the two paradigms of education identified in Chapter 2, conventional and PBE, and wellbeing will be explored. Unpacking indigenous views and values form a
significant part of this exploration so as to understand if and how indigenous needs, intrinsic wellbeing and place-based education are linked.

3.2 UNDERSTANDINGS OF WELLBEING THROUGH NORMATIVE DEVELOPMENT: MATERIAL WELLBEING

Material wellbeing is the first of the two types of wellbeing considered in this chapter. It refers to the quantity and quality of possessions a person has. As stated, terms that are used interchangeably in the literature to represent material wellbeing are standard of living and quality of life. Other terms also evolve the same meaning as ‘deriving wellbeing’. Examples of this are progress, modernisation, prosperity, poverty alleviation, economic growth and even development (McGillivray & Clarke, 2006:3 cited in Conceicao & Bandura, 2009:2). The focus in this section is to explore what material wellbeing consists of, how it is measured and how effective it is in achieving fulfilment.

INDICATORS OF MATERIAL WELLBEING

Traditionally wellbeing was measured by income per capita or Gross Domestic Product (GDP) (Conceicao & Bandura, 2009:3). GDP is the total value of goods, services and investments produced in a country per year. Economic growth is measuring the percent by which GDP increases over a year. Income per capita is the total income derived by a country divided by its population. Another measure, Gross National Income (GNI), is gaining prevalence. GNI differs from GDP in that it adds foreign company earnings to the country of origin rather than the country of operation. The initial weakness of these statistics is that they represent an average and hence do not pick up the distribution of wealth and therefore do not reflect inequality nor an understanding of poverty. According to Conceicao and Bandura (2009:3) these measures do not capture human life. However GDP and GNI data is readily available in most countries and consequently it is convenient for use in cross-country analysis.

When income, GDP and growth are used as proxies for a country’s or an individual’s wellbeing, the measures reflect the ability to consume goods and services and increase material wealth. To investigate the integrity of these measures of wellbeing many studies have been undertaken. For example Commander and Davoodi (1997:35) found that income correlated positively with life expectancy and with improved infant mortality. However, the authors found that improved public health services were generated by rising incomes rather than the income itself being responsible for the improvements.
Easterly (1999) in a cross-country study correlated 81 wellbeing indicators with GDP growth and found only three of the 81 indicators, protein intake, calorie intake and the number of telephones had a positive correlation. Hence Easterly concluded that the average wellbeing of a country has little correlation with a country’s income and GDP.

In 1990, a multidimensional measure of material wellbeing, called the Human Development Index (HDI), was introduced by the United Nation Development Programme (UNDP). A report by the UNDP (2000:1) was conducted using HDI consisting of three indicators: standard of living proxied by per capita income; health indicated by life expectancy at birth and education measured by enrolment ratio and adult literacy. This report revealed two things. Firstly, the indicators of income and education are westentric in that they reflect western economic aspirations of wellbeing. This is illustrated by the fact that HDI is highly correlated with GDP. Caplan (2009) argued it is really a test of how Scandinavian a country is. Secondly, confused results are generated with no apparent pattern indicating that the components of HDI (life expectancy, income and education) have little correlation with negligible causal relationship between them. This is consistent with Chambers’ (1997:1748) assertion that the correlation between wealth and wellbeing is weak or even negative.

Another measure, the UNDP Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), is also essentially used as a multidimensional material wellbeing indicator. Even though the MDGs are designed to eliminate poverty, as stated by McGillivray and Clarke (2006), the words poverty alleviation and wellbeing are used interchangeably. In effect the MDGs have given development actors licence to intervene in ‘impoverished’ countries on the basis of improving wellbeing (McEwan, 2009). The MDGs were agreed to by 189 United Nations (UN) member countries in 2000 and list goals and targets to be achieved by 2015. Progress towards those targets is used as a measure of a country’s wellbeing. The UN and World Bank have assisted countries around the globe on the basis of this imposed global measure (McMichael, 2008:188; McEwan, 2009:180). The use of the MDG progress as an indicator of wellbeing is explored in this chapter.

**Subjective measures**

The literature on wellbeing measures reviewed so far has been on objective measures. Subjective wellbeing (SWB) is where the respondent rates their own wellbeing or

---

2 Caplan observed that Scandinavian countries were prominent in the HDI because Scandinavian attributes were given undue emphasis in the index criteria.
happiness on a scale. Kenny (2005) in seeking to identify the correlation between income and wellbeing showed a positive relationship up until a particular level of income (optimal income) was reached. Beyond this no reported improvement in subjective wellbeing occurred. Furthermore in Kenny’s study of Tanzanian villages he found each village had the same subjective wellbeing profile even though one village had three times the average income of the other (2005:7). The optimal income changed between villages but the average wellbeing rating was constant.

Easterlin (1974) had found similar results in his study of subjective wellbeing and income in the US. There was a clear relationship between income and subjective wellbeing up to what was an above average salary and then there was a levelling off. Moreover after a period of sustained growth and improved income the study showed no change in subjective wellbeing. This phenomenon of subjective wellbeing being relative to others’ incomes rather than a shift in your own income has become known as the Easterlin Paradox (Conceicao & Bandura, 2009:8).

Japan has kept happiness data since 1950. Easterlin (1995:40-41) quoted a study conducted from that data. Since 1950 Japan grew from a poor to a modern economy with a five-fold increase in GDP. Their happiness against income profile remained constant. Their SWB was related to how they perceived their income relative to others and not their absolute income which had substantially increased. These results show average income, GDP and economic growth are not related to SWB. The study suggests it is not wealth that buys happiness but our perception of being better or worse off than those around us. This has serious implications for countries with large internal inequities.

The aforementioned review has given a brief account of studies of the relationship between wealth and wellbeing. The next section reviews the literature that links wealth (material wellbeing) with development.

**DEVELOPMENT FOR MATERIAL WELLBEING**

Human wellbeing must be the prime motivation for development. In fact the terms development and human wellbeing are effectively synonymous (McGillivray and Clarke, 2006). In this study, the distinction is development is taken as the ‘means’ to the wellbeing ‘ends’. In addition, the indicators discussed in the previous section, provide a vehicle to promote development globally.
As discussed above, some major studies have shown development as economic growth is not related to wellbeing, yet GDP is still used as a proxy for wellbeing (McGillivray & Clarke, 2006). GDP as a measure of development began with U.S. President Harry Truman. Truman’s re-election speech changed the political space of colonisation to an economic space Rist (2002:79). In doing this Truman indirectly launched GDP as the number one imperative globally. Economic growth was equated with development and both became synonymous with wellbeing.

As indicators of development, economic growth and GDP have allowed a number of approaches to be employed since WWII. Sovereign nation states, many having recently regained independence, used Keynesian economic policies to develop their counties and gain wellbeing. Since the 1980s, neoliberalism and the rule of the free market has been the tool to create growth and hence enhance wellbeing. However as discussed above much of the literature suggests income, growth and GDP do not correlate with wellbeing.

An important vehicle for development actors to promote wellbeing is through the MDGs. As discussed above progress on the MDGs is a measure of a country’s wellbeing. They serve as the dominant guide to development policy and practice worldwide, particularly for the World Bank and UNDP. A mission statement on the World Bank (2012, homepage) states

*The World Bank is committed to helping achieve the MDGs because, simply put, these goals are our goals.*

However McEwan believes a north dominated UN has set up the MDGs with a Eurocentric lens (2009:181). She argues that by accepting the MDGs, countries are effectively accepting the label desperate, and the development world is given the moral imperative to intervene (2009:181). McEwan appears to suggest the MDGs are a Trojan horse for the free market.

McEwan said concentrating on the symptoms by addressing the goals and not dealing with the causes of global inequity is preventing genuine progress. For example, she claims global trade is neither free nor fair. The north is protected by tariffs and subsidies while these are forbidden in the global south (2009:171). She estimates for every $1 spent on aid there is $14 lost from the aid-recipient countries because of donor country protections.
McEwan has argued that genuine progress on the MDGs is not possible while trade rules advantage the countries of the north.

While undoubtedly the MDG programmes are providing much needed assistance in many areas around the globe it is clear there are double standards. This is illustrated in seeking improved wellbeing for the global south through the global market under Goal 8 of the MDGs. This goal is to develop a global partnership for development using a free trade and free financial system (UNDP, 2012). McEwan notes an imbalance in favour of the global north is created (2009:181). This occurs because the regulators of these markets, the global north-based institutions, World Bank, IMF, WTO and large TNCs, together making up the so called Washington Consensus institutions, are also benefactors of it. McMichael (2008:150) adds two thirds of international trade is controlled by TNCs. He argues through these institutions market power is concentrated in the hands of these TNCs (2008:151). The MDGs perpetuate this global arrangement and therefore acts against the wellbeing it purports to promote.

In the pursuit of material wellbeing, development and its proxies of economic growth and MDGs, the major multilateral development institutions continue to drive market-driven programmes globally. The consequence of such an approach will now be explored.

**THE RESULT OF A MATERIAL WELLBEING FOCUS**

Material wellbeing relies on economic growth built from consumption and the global free market. It comes at a cost. Joseph Stiglitz, a previous chief economist of the World Bank, concedes that the spoils of growth have been concentrated in the wealthiest ten percent while the rest have experienced a rise in poverty (2007:303). Inequality has been exacerbated.

Paid employment in the formal economy, to pay for increasing consumption, has affected people’s quality of life. Freire (2001:6) referred to employment as: “These days of the subsumption of the human spirit under the imperatives of work without end”. Schor (2010:103) observed people in the United States work too much, eat too quickly, socialize too little, sit in traffic too long and are sleep-deprived, and added, a love of people has been replaced by a love of things (2010:140). The pursuit of material wealth has left many socially poor.
Indigenous peoples, both in countries where they are a majority and a minority, have been hardest hit by development’s fixation with growth and its reliance on consumption. The three eras of: colonization; the development project; and the globalization project have progressively transformed local self-sufficient informal economies into formal economies dictated to by the global market (McMichael, 2008:167). The displacement from their land led to a reliance on the market for food and commodities, and hence the need for paid employment to purchase them. This has led to rural poverty for many and an exodus from traditional farming areas to urban slums for many others (McMichael, 2008:149).

Finally continued economic growth is unsustainable. Ever increasing production is derived from using more natural resources causing increasing deforestation, mineral and fossil fuel depletion, water shortages, and global warming (Schor, 2010:18). Material wellbeing is won at the cost of pollution, congestion, waste and ecological viability (Goulet, 1992:469).

Economic growth as a vehicle for wellbeing has created inequality, a reduced quality of life, urban migration and a dependency on income for many of the world’s peoples. The focus of this study is education so the role that it has played in promoting material wellbeing is now examined.

**THE ROLE OF FORMAL EDUCATION IN PROMOTING MATERIAL WELLBEING**

Material wellbeing is reflected in an individual’s income and a nation’s GDP. Education is related to income, in fact McInerney (2011:4) describes mainstream education as “learn to earn”. Freire (1972:45) argued education requires knowledge to be banked for students to gain qualifications. It also delivers students who are unable to critique or transform the world around them which Freire pointed out is precisely what the ruling class desires (1972:47). Those that gain sufficient qualifications gain material wellbeing but, those who do not, become a subordinate class and a ready resource for industry (Escobar, 1997: 88; Gatto, 2009:22).

Education is assumed to build wellbeing through increasing a nation’s wealth. World Bank researchers King and Hill confirmed this by stating if we do not educate our youth we lose the opportunity to raise productivity and income (1993:1). Indeed the World Bank has seen education’s role as one of building the human capital of a country (Jones, 1995). As discussed in this chapter, initiatives such as the MDGs and Education for All are efficient vehicles for building educative capacity in developing countries.
Global formal education is synonymous with western education (Jones, 1995:xii). It homogenises the world’s youth into western money-culture. This creates a dependency on work and income which results in urban migration (Esteva & Prakash, 2008:62). This in turn creates a ready and willing subordinate workforce where it is needed, the city.

Formal education is the vehicle that conveys the message of income, wealth and consumption. Illich (1971:77) argued school education is the reproductive organ of consumerism and Andreotti (2010) adds that fundamental to education is its role of normalising economic development. They argue global education is pivotal in promoting, to the world’s peoples, consumption as a means to wellbeing.

**Summary**

It is clear that conventional western-style education, now the global default (Jones, 1995), promotes material wellbeing. It delivers both the unchallenged message that the global market is in everyone’s best interest (Gruenewald, 2003:3) and produces a ready labour resource for that market (Gatto, 2009:22).

The first section of this chapter discovered GDP growth, income and consumption are posited as synonymous with material wellbeing. However both the Easterlin Paradox and subjective wellbeing illustrate that material increases for a population do not increase its sense of wellbeing. Contrarily the drive for economic growth has led to many ill-effects such as rising inequality, time poverty, wastage and pollution. The literature leads to the conclusion that increasing material wellbeing is ecologically and socially unsustainable (Schor, 2010:18).

This chapter, therefore, considers an alternative understanding of wellbeing, an understanding informed by postdevelopment thinking and indigenous perspectives.

### 3.3 Indigenous and Postdevelopment Perspectives of Wellbeing: Intrinsic Wellbeing

Given the critique of material wellbeing, the emphasis of this section is the exploration of alternative perspectives of wellbeing. Chambers (1997) referred to the ‘means’ and the’ ends’ wellbeing. This study uses the terms extrinsic and intrinsic in place of Chambers means and ends wellbeing. He defined livelihood as means, and sustainability and equity as ends (1997:1748). Chambers’ ‘livelihood’ uses income, economic growth and consumption to promote material wellbeing.
Alternatively intrinsic wellbeing is joy that is directly derived from a person’s action or behaviour. The investigation of alternative wellbeing is guided by postdevelopment and indigenous thinking as each paradigm is open to wellbeing being directly generated by people’s activities as opposed to imposed externally by money and the market. Common themes will become guiding parameters from which to conduct a wider review and create an indigenous-inspired wellbeing framework.

Maiava and King (2007:86-7) list five human needs: identity, community, ability to supports ones family, autonomy and control. Within these needs or aspects of wellbeing they list several further qualities. They are inclusion, culture, kinship, choice, and self-reliance. These all relate to people’s connectedness. Moreover Gibson-Graham (2005:6) explained needs are the linking of identity, territory and culture that brings community-resilience, group identity and wellbeing. Gruenewald holds that if we want people to flourish they must learn to love the world (2003:8). This is the direct result of relationships and care of the everyday people and places we naturally inhabit (2003:10). These authors believe relationships with the people and the ecology indigenous to an area is fundamental to intrinsic wellbeing. These dual connects, specifically between people and between people and their locality, will act as the parameters for an exploration of intrinsic wellbeing.

**HUMAN CONNECTIONS**

Human relationships are fundamental to wellbeing. Gatto argued when you build meaning out of relationships, love, loyalty and frugal self-sufficiency the notion of happiness through consuming disappears (2009:116). NZ Maori have a proverb explaining the most important thing in the world is: “He tangata! He tangata! He tangata!” (It is people! It is people! It is people!) (Korero Maori, 2011). Indian philosopher Mahatma Gandhi insisted people are social animals, independent yet interdependent. He believed people struggle to live in isolation preferring a community bound together in mutual cooperation and respect (1997:155). Woods (2009:247) asserts the life force is love, within and between people (2009:247). He added that the life force is manifest in its connectedness with others and actions such as nurturing one another and contributing to the community.

The literature review identifies four types of people to people connectedness.
(i) Family
Family is argued to be the building block of society. Gatto believes families are at the centre of meaning and wellbeing (2009:5). He suggested that a loving nurturing relationship between parents and children can have benefits for the whole village. Those benefits range from identity and belonging to the imparting of knowledge and skills needed to nourish the community (Esteva & Prakash, 2008:3). The most important input to promote the wellbeing of a society is to thus support the family.

(ii) Social capital
If family is the building block of society, social capital is the collective potential when those blocks are assembled. Social capital is the system of relations that bonds family members, friends, neighbours and communities (Gibson-Graham, 2005). If people to people connections are strong then the village can build a diverse economy which is a mix of formal, non-formal and informal activities. It is the interdependencies of these human relationships that lead to wellbeing directly (Gibson-Graham, 2005:16).

(iii) Community
A combination of non-formal and informal work forms what Gibson and Graham calls the community economy (2005:16). Formal activity is work generating taxable income. Non-formal work includes non-taxable earnings from activities such as growers markets. Informal work includes running a household, self-sufficiency, gifting and reciprocity. Community economies operate in cities and villages globally. In fact, of the urban economic activity worldwide, over 50% occurs in the community economy (Shuaib, 2007:84). Clearly this figure is much higher outside city centres, especially in traditional indigenous settings.

Schor (2010:115) observed the community economy has a twin benefit. It nourishes and sustains the village and it provides the human connections through interdependencies resulting in intrinsic wellbeing. She encourages building social capital by gradually shifting from the formal capitalist, referred to by Schor as grey, into the community (green) economy (2010:102). The shift from the grey to green economy restores the balance to a love of people rather than a love of things (2010:140).

(iv) Culture
Culture is a construct evolved to manage the human interactions that maximise wellbeing. If families are the building blocks of communities then communities are the building blocks of culture. It embodies indigenous epistemologies and values, and the creation of
knowledge based in custom (Gegeo, 1998:295). Cultural practice gives people meaning and identity and epitomises ‘the good life’ (Smith, 2003:9, Gegeo, 1998:295). Approaches that allow culture to flourish encourage the local language. Nabobo-Baba et al. (2012:38) explains language is like a container into which is packed our values and culture encouraging diversity and promoting intrinsic wellbeing.

**Connections with place**
The second area of direct wellbeing is linked to relationships with ‘place’. In this context place has many synonyms in the literature including locality, environment, ecology, nature, land, commons, cosmos and it even takes on a spiritual quality for some cultures. A connection to place is a love of the features which are indigenous or intrinsic to that area. For example First Nation Canadians Haig-Brown and Hobson asserted their spiritual wellbeing is in and of the land (2009:168). A review of the literature on direct wellbeing will now be represented through five of these terms.

(i) **Environment**
The immediate environment is critical to shaping identity. Native American Cajete argued our disconnection with the cosmos, or natural world, destroys identity causing alienation and incompleteness (1994:26). Nabobo-Baba et al. (2012:23) claim the most dominant theme for people of the Pacific in making sense of their existence is *Vanua*. *Vanua* to indigenous Fijians is not only land; it defines their sense of identity, their culture and their spiritual roots. Land-based practices such as subsistence agriculture, hunting and fishing promote sustainability (Schor, 2010) thereby promoting intrinsic wellbeing.

(ii) **Ecology**
Ecology, all life supported by the environment, has been degraded by overproduction and overconsumption (Schor, 2010:179). Schor argued life becomes personally meaningful when striving to make our ecology sustainable (2010:100). Ecologically sustainable living is achieved by shifting our work and consumption balance from the grey, formal economy to the green, informal economy. This shift requires more frugal self-sufficiency instead of consumption. The pro-sustainable activity of the informal economy is positively correlated with wellbeing (Schor, 2010:179).

(iii) **Commons**
The commons is another dimension of place. McInerney, Smyth and Down described the commons as all biotic and human material that is not monetised (2011:5). This includes
air, sea, water, forests, spaces, knowledge, parks and buildings owned and shared by the community. Healthy communities distribute surpluses from the community economy to maintain the commons (Gibson-Graham, 2005:16). The shared benefits concept is used in Mondragon, Spain, at the world’s largest worker-owned co-operative. Here workers deliberately reduce their wages so surpluses can be used in the community and preserve the commons (2005:18) generating intrinsic wellbeing for the contributors and the community who use it.

(iv) History
History is essential to a place as it allows the locality to tell its story. Gruenewald (2003:8) described place as the location of experiences, problems and joys that is our history. That location of experiences shapes the world view and the culture of the region (Nabobo-Baba, 2012:28). Local culture and indigenous epistemology is bound in the history of a region. Solomon Islands writer Gegeo (1998:299) insists only through indigenous knowledge, manifested in living the culture can ‘the good life’ be achieved. Gegeo (1998) describes the good life as ‘living in rootedness’ to their place, culture and custom resulting in a life of plenitude and dignity. He contrasts this with ‘living in imitation of life brought by the ships’ as disconnected actions ‘not born of the land’. Place, then, is a lived history of active engagement with the surrounding environment which is manifested in local culture and customs (Escobar, 2001:146).

(v) Locality
Parnwell (2008:113) believed that development should be localised. To him localisation means it is contextually rooted, democratic and participatory, empowering of the poor and consciousness-raising of injustice. Parnwell implies a relationship with place must have autonomy and sovereignty. Community control can extend to decentralisation of services such as education, justice and health. Gibson and Graham claimed localising also “…gives back the economy as a space of decision” (2005:17). They recognised, from their work in the Philippines, that operating business activity locally, and regaining community control of services, empowers that locality. “The excitement and pleasure generated by the decision space of the community economy is palpable” (Gibson-Graham, 2005:20).

SUMMARY
Indigenous and intrinsic wellbeing are both encapsulated through the twin ‘connects’ of people to people and people to place. By elevating the importance of these connections there are multiple benefits. First there is the intrinsic reward of the activity itself. Gegeo is
clear that ‘the good life’ occurs when useful things are made with your own hands from products born of the land (1998, 306). Additionally, direct wellbeing occurs when relationships with people are nurtured through the labyrinth of interdependencies of community life. As discussed in this section, human qualities and values such as identity, belonging, meaning, dignity, spirituality, resilience, empowerment and autonomy are enhanced from this interaction.

There is also the reward of products produced, traded and consumed locally, creating resilient, sustainable livelihoods. This is the informal and non-formal community economy which Schor (2010) calls the green economy. Her use of the term green economy is specifically to represent the non-taxable activities of local enterprises and people that exchange goods and services locally. Schor’s use of the word green illustrates another benefit. Through a greater emphasis on the green economy products are made locally in environmentally friendly ways arresting the degradation of the immediate surrounds and beyond.

Chambers (1997:1748) believed the ends of wellbeing ought to be sustainable communities and equity. Clearly the intrinsic wellbeing approaches of connecting people together and connecting people to places, as discussed in this section, are a way to achieve those ends. The arguments for intrinsic or indigenous wellbeing are compelling. Education literature that focuses on enhancing intrinsic wellbeing is now discussed.

3.4 EDUCATION’S CONTRIBUTION TO PROMOTING INTRINSIC WELLBEING
In the first section of this chapter material wellbeing literature was reviewed. It was concluded that when wellbeing is linked to economic growth and consumption, that society is socially and ecologically unsustainable. As has been discussed, conventional formal education is the vehicle for growth and material wellbeing. As Native American educator Cajete observed, the looming ecological crisis cannot be solved by the same education system that created it (1999:174). Therefore the rationale for the global western-style education system makes it untenable.

The literature reviewed in the above section on intrinsic wellbeing showed it is sustainable. The education literature reviewed in Chapter 2 identified place-based education (PBE) as education informed by postdevelopment thinking. The following section examines PBE literature against the principles of intrinsic wellbeing identified
above. This exercise will enable a judgment on PBE’s capacity to promote intrinsic or indigenous wellbeing.

The two fundamental relationships of intrinsic wellbeing identified, people to people and people to place are separated into the sub-sections used in the previous section. Human relationships are divided into family, social capital, community and culture. Place relationships are reviewed under the subheadings of environment, ecology, commons, history and locality. The subheadings are not mutually exclusive but the literature review approach will remain consistent with the previous reviews in this study. PBE literature will now be explored through this framework.

**PBE’S PROMOTION OF HUMAN RELATIONSHIPS**

**(i) Family**
Esteva and Prakash (2008:3) claimed mainstream education breaks the critical bond between parents and their children. Dennis Littky, an educator with forty years of experience, set up a group of alternative place-based schools in the US called Big Picture Schools. Littky (2004:137) points out these schools do not just enrol the student, they enrol the whole family returning the power over the child’s schooling to the child and their family. Gruenewald maintained PBE focuses first on the home and school, and then the neighbourhood, the community, and beyond. He added the building block of a healthy society comes from experiencing an empathetic connection to others. PBE ensures that the curriculum fosters empathy to others by involving families (2003:8).

**(ii) Social capital**
Social capital is the collective potential of the people and families that comprise a community (Gibson-Graham, 2005). It relates to the harmony of its members, the inclusiveness of its governance and realizing the potential of its citizens. However formal education can undermine local social capital. “Schools have become the vehicle for educated young people to leave, fulfilling the prophesy that these places are doomed to poverty and decline” (Barsch, 2008:66). School leavers that are left behind in smaller communities become disillusioned with their prospects further weakening social capital.

This scenario led to an outmigration of young people from Skowhegan in the US state of Maine. Employing a PBE approach, the local council involved the school students in investigating the assets of their town and this led to the students becoming a knowledge base, local researchers, tour guides, designers of tourist brochures and keepers of local
history (2008:70-72). The authentic learning experienced by assisting the Skowhegan council connected young people to their community, and demonstrated the intrinsic motivation generated when solving real problems with real consequences. By assisting the community, outmigration was reversed in Skowhegan and PBE actually raised student academic performance in the process. It is this synergy that makes learning compelling (Barsch, 2008:79).

Flores (2003:7) argued that an education system with local autonomy is essential for building community sovereignty. The personal and community sovereignty, which Sorenson claims is vital for a meaningful life, is enhanced from understanding and connecting with the community (2008:60). Service-learning creates this connection which Sorenson calls sovereignty through service. Poet Ralph Waldo Emerson quoted by Sorenson (2008:63) exclaimed (albeit in gendered language): “It is one of the most beautiful compensations of this life that no man can sincerely try to help another without helping himself … serve and you shall be served.” The social capital of a community can be built through the service-learning encouraged by PBE.

(iii) Community
Community is a composite of families and the social capital that binds them. “Place-conscious education can be understood as a community-based effort to reconnect the process of education, enculturation, and human development to the wellbeing of community life.” (Gruenewald and Smith, 2008:xvi).

Littky insisted schools should “… break down the walls and let the kids out and the world in” (2004:122). He stated that schools should be for the building of community (2004:60). At Big Picture Schools students are mentored by locals through internships that involve partnering with community projects, social services, arts, government, industry, business or any other areas students are passionate about (2004:127). This allows people to contribute to community skills, the development of their youth and community relationships.

(iv) Culture
The Whanau Ora document, a NZ initiative to return welfare sovereignty to Maori, concluded that culture is at the centre of wellbeing (2009:16). Kura Kaupapa, Maori immersion schools, claim self-determination, culture and language must form part of the learning for a healthy community (Smith, 2003:9). Sustainable communities are promoted
by PBE and their capacity to teach through and about culture (Penetito, 2004:12; Whitinui, 2008:9-11). Whitinui cites *Kapa Haka* (traditional Maori performing arts) classes as examples of cultural activities generating intrinsic wellbeing. For Maori, wellbeing is linked to the community through its culture.

**PBE’S PROMOTION OF CONNECTIONS WITH ‘PLACE’**

(i) **Environment**
First Nation Americans, Haig-Brown and Hodson (2009: 171) maintain the societal wasteland to which many of their people belong is a direct result of the disconnect they experience with the environment. Gruenewald and Smith (2008:2) claim that PBE cultivates this sense of connectedness. The authors argue that PBE underlies forms of caring and stewardship essential to the maintenance of sustainable relationships between humans and the places where they live.

(ii) **Ecology**
Gruenewald held that formal education creates an obstacle to generating an ecology ethic (2003:8). The disconnect occurs from schools focus on standardised and decontextualised learning with little bearing on lived experience (Gruenewald and Smith, 2008:xvi). McInerney et al. suggested learning should address ecological problems as well as social and economic issues facing a school’s community (2011:5). PBE helps create a love of place and biodiversity in young people (Penetito, 2004:11). This kind of significant life experience helps shape ecologically literate and politically motivated adults (Gruenewald, 2003:7).

(iii) **Commons**
The commons is non-owned ‘place’. McInerney et al. believed an important focus of PBE is on revitalizing the commons (2011:5). In agreeing with McInerney et al., Gruenewald and Smith argue through place-based schools the commons should be identified, conserved and restored. “This leads to kids learning to bond with the natural world developing a strong connection with it before being asked to heal its wounds” (2008:xxi).

A personal experience occurred in Christchurch in the recent earthquakes (2010 and 2011). These two seismic events decimated Christchurch’s central city and a number of surrounding suburbs. Many buildings, houses and infrastructure are still in a state of disrepair two years after the second earthquake. A top-down approach to decision-making and repairs has left Christchurch residents feeling alienated from the rebuild process. The
scale of the rebuild is so large that without community support it will take decades to complete and many rehousing, land mitigation and inner city rebuild projects will become unviable. It is argued by community groups, such as Greening the Rubble, that if communities were encouraged to be part of their own solution including initiating localised PBE approaches, then it would lead to a vast increase in ownership, ingenuity, intrinsic wellbeing and ultimately the success of these projects (Montgomery, 2012).

(iv) History
The history of a place is critical to a person’s relationship with it. History is socially constructed granting epistemic privilege to the few (Bruce & Brown, 2010). To counter this subjectivity Freire (2001:12) believed students need to learn to critically reflect on issues that affect them. This enables them to challenge the structures that lead to oppression. Gruenewald and Smith add economic globalization is potentially economically devastating, culturally homogenizing and ecologically destructive to local communities yet school prepares our youth to embrace this philosophy unquestioningly (2008:xiii). PBE’s emphasis on critical thinking teaches students to challenge conventional education and its assumptions, colonial history, inequalities of power and myths of opportunity (Gruenewald, 2003:5). Righting past wrongs is fundamental to community and PBE.

Manning, in his Doctorate “History teaching for the NZ curriculum” (2008:54) pointed out that PBE used the processes of decolonization which unlearns much of what the dominant western-focused school curriculum teaches. He explained this is followed by a process of reinhabiting, involving learning more socially just and ecologically sustainable ways of being in the world. Such an approach, Manning argued, makes PBE essential to move students beyond learning for knowledge to learning for change and empowerment. PBE inspired, historical consciousness builds patterns of community through identity, culture and connection to foster healthy sustainable communities.

(v) Locality
Parnwell (2008:113) believed a locality must have a political dimension which includes social justice and self-determination. An example of this is demonstrated by Thaman (2007:5). She observed the centralized Fijian education is geared towards university and yet, according to figures from the Fiji Ministry of Education, indigenous Fijians who entered kindergarten in 2003 had a 10% chance of making it to Form 7, the university preparatory year. PBE responds to local needs and is therefore advantaged by localising
through decentralization. Gruenewald (2003:10) points out PBE focuses on social justice by renewing indigenous relationships of care for others after the disruptions from colonization and neocolonisation. He argued that conventional classrooms do not do this and a fundamental change to include a placed-based education model, which utilises critical pedagogy, is needed (2003:10).

**SUMMARY**
This section explored an alternative to material wellbeing which is referred to as intrinsic wellbeing. To build an alternative perspective, postdevelopment and indigenous values were utilised. The literature identified ‘ends’ wellbeing and the actions that generate those ends directly. The actions were summarized as ‘people to people’ and ‘people to their place’.

The section then considered the capacity of the two education paradigms discussed in Chapter 2, conventional and place-based education, to promote intrinsic motivation. It demonstrated PBE explicitly promotes intrinsic wellbeing but formal western-style education explicitly promotes extrinsic wellbeing.

**3.5 CONCLUSION**
Orr (1992 cited in Gruenewald, 2003:8) challenged: “… educators to consider that if education everywhere does not explicitly promote the wellbeing of places, then what is it for?” This study concurs with Orr and explored two understandings of wellbeing. The first, material wellbeing, was shown to be socially and ecologically unsustainable (Schor, 2010). Intrinsic wellbeing, in contrast, is based on enhancing relationships that sustain the community and the environment (Gegeo, 1998; Nabobo-Baba et al., 2012:38).

The study then interrogated PBE as an education alternative with the potential to engender intrinsic wellbeing. The review of PBE literature against the intrinsic wellbeing themes suggests it has that potential. The following table, Table 2, summarises western and non-western approaches to development, the economy, education and wellbeing. In reality there is a hybridising of the two approaches and this reality will form part of the analysis later in this study. However the table neatly summarises the literature reviews of both Chapter 2 and Chapter 3.
### Table 3.1: Alternative development approaches

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paradigm</th>
<th>Western, extrinsic view</th>
<th>Indigenous, intrinsic view</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td>Orthodox (normative)</td>
<td>Postdevelopment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy</td>
<td>Formal</td>
<td>Informal, nonformal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Growth/capitalist</td>
<td>Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Local</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Grey</td>
<td>Green</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Controlled externally</td>
<td>Grassroots autonomy and sovereignty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unsustainable</td>
<td>Sustainable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Formal</td>
<td>Alternative, non-formal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conventional</td>
<td>Place-based (PBE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pro-capitalist</td>
<td>Pro-grassroots</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Global</td>
<td>Local</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Homogenous, monoculture</td>
<td>Diverse/unique cultures and languages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Centralized</td>
<td>Decentralized</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Qualification-driven</td>
<td>Passion-driven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Promotes individual</td>
<td>Promotes community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hegemony unchallenged</td>
<td>Hegemony challenged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Urbanising</td>
<td>Localising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wellbeing</td>
<td>Extrinsic, ‘means’</td>
<td>Intrinsic, ‘ends’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Material</td>
<td>Relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Disconnected</td>
<td>Connections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not shared, independent</td>
<td>Shared, interdependent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unsustainable</td>
<td>Sustainable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Individual</td>
<td>Community</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: author

The next chapter, Chapter 4, prepares a path for fieldwork on an alternative education example. A case study can provide a greater insight into the promotion of community wellbeing through education.
CHAPTER 4: METHODOLOGY

4.1 INTRODUCTION

The primary aim of this thesis, as described in Chapter 2, is to investigate the effectiveness of education that is aligned to the postdevelopment requisites of self-determination, dehegemonisation and the legitimising of local processes. Royal (1992) and Bishop (1996) (cited in Penetito & Sanga, 2003:12) suggest research be conducted “… using techniques and approaches that sit philosophically and methodologically within those [Maori and Pacific Island] fields”. Consequently this chapter presents a methodology informed by those postdevelopment requisites and is the methodology that guides this research.

The research uses a qualitative approach to data collection. The rationale favouring an approach that acknowledges communities’ rights to their own knowledge production is presented. Nobobo-Baba (2006) suggests Vanua research should be employed in fieldwork conducted in Fiji. It will be argued that Vanua research conforms to the postdevelopment requisites for rural Fiji. This approach encourages the use of an ethnographic awareness which includes Fijian indigenous values and customs. Nabobo-Baba (2006:24) points out because this adds trust to the process it increases the accuracy of the participant data collected. Vanua research guides the methodology of this study.

O’Leary (2010:30) believes all researchers come to their research with biases and as a result she argues it is necessary for the researcher to reveal those biases. Therefore I discuss my positionality and the inherent biases that brings, and the reflexive approaches taken to mitigate those biases.

Ethics are discussed through two vantage points. The first is the formal processes of ethics approval and the second is ethical processes in the field. An explanation of these processes is given as well as how the implementation of Vanua research has assisted ethical considerations.

As explained in Chapter 1, Geoff Bamford, has worked in rural education in the Pacific for fifty years. He recommended Tutu Rural Training Centre (Tutu RTC) in Taveuni Fiji as the venue for fieldwork because of its capacity to turn graduates into successful farmers. In addition, literature reveals the training at Tutu RTC is described as non-formal (McVerry, 2011, McGregor et al., 2011), indigenous (Thaman, 2011: personal
communication) and traditional education (Kedrayate, 2001). These authors lend force to the optimism that Tutu RTC may represent an effective alternative approach to education.

The research utilised three methods of data collection. The processes involved in the semi-structured interviews, participant observation and document analysis will be presented and discussed. That validity of the data collected will form part of that discussion in particular the method of sampling and the use of data saturation and triangulation to verify data reliability.

This chapter will finish with an acknowledgement of the limitations of the research. Two limitations were identified. The first was not gaining access to certain strata within the population and the second limitation was the brief period of two and a half weeks in the field. The discussion will argue, nevertheless, for the verifiability of the data and the validity of the results.

4.2 METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH

The methodology used in this fieldwork was designed around the collection of qualitative data. O’Leary (2010:113) describes a qualitative approach to data collection as critical of positivism and its assumption of universal truths. Positivism and scientific method are reflected in quantitative approaches. Conversely qualitative approaches recognise there are alternative forms of knowledge production. Escobar (2007:21) claimed postdevelopment supports the right of southern communities to their own knowledge production, sustainability, autonomy and diversity. Therefore a qualitative methodology aligns with postdevelopment principles and is the approach used in this research.

The qualitative approach contends that knowledge is a human construct which is based on personal experiences and the cultural context. O’Leary (2010:6) refers to this epistemology as constructivist and Bernard (2006:24) uses the term interpretivist. Constructivist and interpretivist methods embrace local knowledges because they are premised on knowledge as a cultural construct, (or knowledge as cultural interpretation), and therefore are consistent with postdevelopment. The methodology adopted in this thesis complies with the constructivist epistemological view.

Fijian academic, Nabobo-Baba (2006; 2012) argued that critical to successful research in Fiji is the application of an indigenous lens to methodological processes. She called these processes *Vanua* research. Nabobo-Baba (2006:24) defined *Vanua* research as grounded in
the culture in which it is conducted and seeking to decolonise hegemonic influences. This aligns with Aporosa’s description (pending:Ch.6, p1) of postdevelopment as an evolving ideology founded on the culture of the ‘local’ and self-determination aimed at eliminating external hegemony. This clearly has considerable synchronicity with the five broad principles of postdevelopment, (autonomy, deconstructing, reconstructing, localising and partnership building), identified in Chapter 2. Vanua research, to be explained further overleaf, guides the fieldwork methodology used in this study.

The approach therefore uses an inductive ground-up collection of the data that does not have the predetermined definitions and realities encouraged by quantitative data collection. Mayoux (in Desai, 2008:116) explained a qualitative approach is a holistic understanding of complex realities where even hypotheses and questions emerge as the fieldwork is undertaken. O’Leary (2010:262) calls this process inductive reasoning. She describes this as a process where themes and theories are induced from the collected data and its analysis rather than a hypothesis deduced from an external theory. It rejects “…some or all of the ontology, epistemology, and methodology of systematic approaches” (Johnson in Bernard, 2000:140). Thus, continued Johnson (2000:141), there is less focus on the means of research and systematic strategies and more on the ends of credible data. The inductive methodological approach was employed in the fieldwork in this study.

In addition a number of aspects were incorporated into the fieldwork to allow it to fit Howitt and Steven’s (2005) definition of post-colonial research and what O’Leary (2010) referred to as post-positivism. As discussed, the research encapsulated by these terms accepts there are multiple realities and each is valid. Therefore I understood my fieldwork position to be the learner and accepted both staff and students as the teacher. This stance had the effect of affirming and granting recognition for the knowledge that the Tutu community brought to our interactions.

Quantitative methodology conforms to a rational positivist, systematic and empirical approach to data collection and analysis (Bernard, 2006:3). Alternatively a postdevelopment framework, reflected in the interpretive, post-positivist, Vanua research adopted in this study, is well suited to the use of a qualitative methodological approach.

4.3 PRINCIPLES AND VALUES IMPORTANT TO THE RESEARCH

Research complying with the tenets of postdevelopment within an indigenous setting, specifically Fiji, required the guidance of four principles. These were Vanua research
approaches, ethnographic awareness, a statement of positionality and the use of reflexivity. How these four areas contributed to the fieldwork is now discussed.

Vanua Research

The Fijian word Vanua is used in the same context as the NZ Maori word Whenua (commonly translated as land). However Vanua, like Whenua, has a much broader definition than land. Nabobo-Baba (2006:x) describes the term Vanua as embracing the people, their chief, their environment, their spirituality, their history, epistemology, culture and all relationships that link them. Vanua research must be cognisant of all aspects of Vanua and adhere to vakaturaga (chiefly values which are strong guiding principles for all indigenous Fijians). These values govern behaviour through a mix of humility, knowing one’s place, obligations, sharing, forgiveness and exhibiting a quiet demeanour (Nabobo-Baba, 2006:25-36).

As discussed previously Vanua research is a postdevelopment-informed indigenous research methodology. University of the South Pacific education researcher Nabobo-Baba argues effective indigenous fieldwork in Fiji should employ this methodology as it respects and affirms local protocols and generates authentic data (2006:25). All data collection and fieldwork approaches endeavoured to fit the values and themes encapsulated in Vanua research. For example Nabobo-Baba (2006:25) defines Vanua research as affirming existing protocols. As the researcher and guest I consciously remained positive and interested in all aspects of local life. This however was never a burden as the interest was genuine. A second example was recognising the village is about relationships (2006:33). This led to me spending time building relationships before conducting semi-structured interviews and maintaining informality through the interview.

Ethnographic Awareness and Building Relationships

O’Leary (2010:115) described ethnography as exploring a way of life from the participant’s point of view or seeing the world through the eyes of the observed (2010:210). Fife (2005:1) explained that an ethnographer studies a given context and looks for patterns. For the time I was conducting fieldwork at Tutu RTC I was mindful of ethnographic processes, as expressed by O’Leary and Fife, and employed these approaches where possible. This involved staying exclusively onsite during the fieldwork and effectively living and contributing either as a staff member or a student.
Employing an ethnographic awareness enriched the primary interview data. The rapport created by living, working, eating and sleeping in the same conditions as my local counterparts assisted in gaining the trust and confidence of the participants. This led to their willingness to be interviewed as well as the reliability of their responses and, as a result, the authenticity of the data. Ethnographic interviews are unstructured (O’Leary, 2010:118). Although the methodological design was to conduct more structured interviews with participants it transpired that less structured interviews yielded more in-depth responses revealing genuine local values and beliefs. My interviewing approach, therefore, was best described as semi-structured interviews.

Ethnography is the preferred type of qualitative research and Davidson and Tolich (1999:133) describe it is a mix of participant observation and unstructured interviews. Though a true ethnographic approach was not possible because of the limited time in the field, I applied the principle of ethnography where possible and maintained an ethnographic awareness throughout. I sought to immerse myself within the culture of Tutu. In support, O’Leary (2010:116) added cultural empathy is needed by the researcher to understand the frameworks that produce meaning and behaviour. The analysis, she concluded, is the resulting ‘thick descriptions’ that express the discoveries and interpretations of the fieldwork (2010:116). Clearly Nabobo-Baba’s Vanua research is a local Fijian manifestation of ethnography so each approach was self-reinforcing.

Empathetic understanding is the essence of ethnography (Schweizer in Bernard, 2000:62). The reader can gain some idea of the level to which that understanding was sought through the activities I engaged in. I breakfasted with the religious staff or students, worked with staff and students in carrying out their duties, had lunch and siestas in the field with students, assisted with the planting, weeding, harvesting and processing of yaqona, visited the majority of young farmers on their blocks, attended staff meetings, participated in kava ceremonies with staff and students, attended church services, watched touch rugby, attended a course on Tutu RTC with staff from the Solomon Islands and Vanuatu, and interacted with all the Tutu community. In this way I gained and empathetic understanding of Tutu life, affirmed that lifestyle and enjoyed a unique experience.

The immersion into the Tutu culture provided me with a deep insight into the training and a fuller understanding of the values and demonstrable motivation both staff and students shared. O’Leary (2010:116) wrote “Ethnography exploration involves a bid to understand,
discover, describe, and interpret”. Within the limitations of being an outsider and the brief research period, the ethnographic awareness approach generated such an understanding of Tutu RTC.

**Positionality**
If knowledge is a human construct then knowledge is subjective. Therefore it is necessary for a researcher to recognise their own subjectivity (Bernard, 2006:22). As a secondary school teacher with 25 years of mathematics teaching experience I developed a strong positivist view of the world. Mathematical theorems with formulaic proofs are considered universal and success relies on the correct application of those theorems. However, being questioning by nature, having lived and worked in the Polynesian island of Niue, and more recently engaging in postgraduate study, I have adopted an increasingly postdevelopment viewpoint. Therefore, in spite of my ‘universal truths’ beginning, I brought an emerging constructivist perspective to the research.

Schweizer (2000:54) noted interpretation is based on previous preconceptions and is therefore always subjective. Hence O’Leary (2010:30) directs researchers to recognise and manage their subjectivity particularly for value-laden qualitative approaches. Having a diverse epistemological background assisted my subjectivity management. For example I recognise I am a strong supporter of indigenous education and consequently have a vested interest in the success of Tutu RTC. However the Tutu training having so little class time, no qualification to aim for and no apparent curriculum was alien to this secondary school teacher with nearly thirty years’ experience. Bernard (2006:22) suggests such diverse experiences help train subjectivity and use one’s own values and beliefs to gain insight from the fieldwork. I believe this was the case for me at Tutu.

**Reflexivity and Trust Building**
O’Leary (2010:31) warned unmanaged subjectivity leads to projecting one’s own world view on the researched and can lead to being insensitive to race, class or gender. In contrast to this I had a vested interest and some expectation that Tutu RTC would represent a successful postdevelopment model of learning. Separating my hopes for Tutu from the data collection process was my subjectivity challenge. Being reflexive about my interpretation of observations and interviews, and not analysing that data until it has been completely presented, helped in my keeping an open mind and managing that subjectivity.
‘Truth’ is the constructed reality for a given group. To capture ‘truth’ the research must be authentic (O’Leary, 2010:34). O’Leary described authentic research as requiring rigor, reflexive practices and a building of trust. Trust is important in eliciting credible responses from participants. Ethnographic awareness helped eliminate the perceived power differential and therefore build trust (O’Leary, 2010:35). Rigor was needed to prevent my own subjectivities being known to participants and potentially anticipating what I wanted to hear. The practice of reflecting in a journal each evening on the day’s interviews, observations and interactions informed my fieldwork approaches and allowed adaptations to be made when appropriate.

Self-imposed guidelines requiring me to affirm the work of the staff and students of Tutu RTC during the fieldwork were applied. Howitt and Stevens (2005) recognised that research can be a colonial process of maintaining power imbalances. In contrast postdevelopment research should foster self-determination, be culturally affirming and “respecting the legitimacy of the others knowledge” (Howitt & Stevens, 2005:33). As a result, affirming the work and achievements of staff and students at Tutu RTC was in a sense affirming my own belief in intrinsic learning. Affirmation was restricted to Tutu RTC staff and students’ personal endeavours and achievements rather than philosophical positions as this would have compromised my independence.

Clearly a white, western, middle-aged, male teacher and researcher creates certain preconceptions and responses. However the effect of my appearance was diluted in a number of ways. I dressed and behaved as inconspicuously as possible. I spent time forming relationships and joining in as many activities as possible so I, the person, could emerge from beneath the exterior. Though the narrative data collected on Tutu RTC was overwhelmingly positive, this was constant from interviews, to observations and to independent reports.

**Summary**

The methodology employed by this fieldwork endeavoured to convey respect and maintain dignity to the researched and the ethnographic awareness approach was personally rewarding and humbling. The Tutu community of staff and trainees were appreciative of my hands-on involvement and interest. Adopting these approaches not only was consistent with research under a postdevelopment framework and *Vanua* research but the greater acceptance of me in the Tutu community led to a greater willingness to participate and
therefore ensure data quality. Given the level of trust required of participants to share intimate details, behaving ethically and adhering to formal ethical procedures was essential. Those processes are now discussed.

4.4 ETHICS

There is a fundamental responsibility for researchers to protect the dignity and wellbeing of their participants (O’Leary, 2010:40). Ethics are the rules through which this protection is obtained and maintained. Ethical considerations for the fieldwork will be dealt with on two levels: formal ethics processes and behaving ethically in the field.

Gaining formal ethics approval for this research was a rigorous process that forced this researcher into confronting and dealing with many of the main ethical challenges. The process began with completing a Development Studies in-house ethics document. The proposed study was then discussed in an internal meeting with my supervisors and one other staff member of the School of People, Environment and Planning. Following this, the Massey University Human Ethics Committee (MUHEC) accepted that the research was low risk and I was given permission to conduct the research. The fieldwork was carried out in accordance with the MUHEC Code of Ethical Conduct for Research, Teaching and Evaluations involving Human Participants.

In the field I was guided by Vanua research. Nabobo-Baba (2006:25) instructs indigenous researchers to “… support and affirm existing protocols of relationships, ceremony and knowledge acquisition”. Affirming protocols by participating with enthusiasm has already been discussed. She also referred to reciprocating the love, support and resources given by the people during the fieldwork. I brought gifts from New Zealand to be shared, money for the local resources I used, and appreciation for the relationships I formed.

Nabobo-Baba adds: “The Vanua researcher ensures that no harm is done to the Vanua”. All interview participants were asked permission before the interview and were asked after it was conducted if they consented to it being used and signing a form to verify that consent. In addition, names of participants were replaced with pseudonyms and confidentiality was ensured.
4.5 SELECTION OF FIELD SITE
In addition to ethics approval for the fieldwork, two other forms of approval were required. First I required permission from Tutu RTC. Geoff Bamford, who funded the Tutu Pilot Course, initiated this process. After meeting Geoff initially in The Solomon Islands I sought his advice on an appropriate fieldwork location. I explained I was seeking an alternative indigenous education that is embedded in its local context. He was adamant that Tutu presented the best opportunity for the research.

Geoff contacted the Tutu RTC Principal, Father Michael McVerry. I followed this with emails and arranged a telephone call to Father McVerry seeking permission to conduct research at his centre. He was interested in the aims of the research and approved my fieldwork on the basis of that conversation and my research proposal emailed to him. His approval in writing was required, and received, to finalise the Massey University ethics approval process.

The second form of approval for me to conduct the research was required from the Fiji Department of Immigration. I contacted Fiji Immigration by phone and was informed a permit to conduct research in Fiji for less than twelve weeks is covered by a Visitor’s Permit for a New Zealand Citizen. This is under Section 9(3) (a) and Section 9(7) of the Fiji Immigration Act, 2003. A Visitor’s Permit is issued on entry to Fiji.

4.6 APPROACHES TO DATA COLLECTION
Three qualitative methods were chosen for the fieldwork: semi-structured interviews, participant observation and journaling, and document analysis. Each of these methods will be discussed regarding the rationale of their selection, the processes used in the field and the quality of data collected. A discussion of the process of obtaining the interview participant sample follows the methods. The section concludes with a discussion of two techniques for verifying and validating, data saturation and triangulation.

METHODS

Semi-structured interviews
In a purely ethnographic study unstructured interviews are appropriate (Bernard, 2006:210). However, in most cases, time is limited and a semi-structured approach is taken. Such interviews use open-ended questions and provide the flexibility to change the content and direction of the questions to suit the interviewee’s responses (2006:212).
Before departing for Fiji I developed a relatively prescriptive set of questions. Weller (2006:374) maintained the weakness of this more structured questioning is that not enough is known of the field. This proved correct. The language of the questions proved awkward for the interviewees and the formulaic questions elicited formulaic answers.

Two changes to the interview process were made. Firstly, a genuine semi-structured interview process was used. Secondly, I employed Levy and Hollan’s advice (2006:338) instructing researchers to know the culture and build trust and rapport with the researched. The combination of these two shifts generated deeper and more reflective data.

Interviews were all conducted in English and no interpreter was needed. However fluency in English varied among the trainees and some simplifications were needed. The main simplification needed was interchanging wellbeing for ‘the good life’ and ‘your dream’. All participants gave permission for me to use a digital recording device and to put people at ease I started with closed and less reflective questions. The device proved very efficient for gathering what was a considerable volume of data.

Interviews of current staff were left until later in the data collection process. The pattern of interviewing trainees earlier and staff later in the fieldwork occurred because it took time to understand staff roles, responsibilities and influences. It became clearer over time which staff might provide new or unique perspectives or fill gaps in the data. In contrast, participant responses from a cross-section of students were required so interviews could be done earlier in the fieldwork.

An unexpected interview approach evolved when setting up the staff interviews. The teaching staff at Tutu RTC are hired as couples and are encouraged to work as couples. The belief is their effectiveness is greater than the sum of their parts (Tutu Study Tour, 2011). Also their own relationship and dedication to their roles grows stronger, and they serve as role models for the students. Therefore it was appropriate to interview some staff as couples. In fact the three couple interviews were thoughtful and illuminating which resulted from the ideas of one sparking more discussion from the other. Hence couple interviews exhibited some of the benefits of focus groups. Getting a free flow of discussion and drawing out a depth of opinion are some of the advantages of focus groups (O’Leary, 2010:195-196). There was no evidence of gender roles or dominance in any of the couple interviews, a feature dealt with later in this thesis.
The semi-structured interviews were enjoyable to conduct. Interviewees were willing to participate and no person approached declined to be interviewed. The confidence, enjoyment and respect in the interview process was evident in the way interviewees were willing to participate and were at ease during the interviews.

**Participant Observation**

Fieldwork that involves getting close to people in such a way that they feel comfortable enough for aspects of their daily lives to be recorded is called participant observation (Bernard, 2006:342). Bernard (2006:344) added it is “[...] stalking culture in the wild”. O’Leary (2010:208) defines interviews as direct data since the process generates new information. In contrast indirect data, such as that obtained from observation, exists whether the researcher is there to record it or not. O’Leary adds this pre-existing indirect data is not tainted from the outside and therefore lends validity to the research (2010:209).

I took a non-structured approach to observation which allowed me to participate whenever I could. This required a degree of tenacity at times. For example my enthusiasm for participation led to my assisting the cultivation and harvest of *yaqona*, sheltering from the rain on the farms high on the slopes with a group of young farmers, eating by hand from a shared bowl of *dalo* and *dalo* leaves, and drinking kava with staff into the night. My routine was to write these experiences up each night. My field notes also became my reflection journal.

A rich source of observational data resulted from my attendance at the four-day Tutu Study Tour presented by Fr McVerry, Tutu staff couples and Geoff Bamford. The course was attended by principals and administrators of rural training centres from the Solomon Islands and Vanuatu. The purpose was to learn about the features that have led to successful outcomes from the training at Tutu RTC. The course was presented so the attendees could pilot similar approaches back in their own schools.

The Tutu Study course involved staff presentations and discussions, and three fieldtrips to past pupils’ homes, families and farms. A booklet on Tutu RTC processes, philosophies and constitution as well as internal reports was also provided. Participation on this course provided a unique insight into the philosophy of Tutu RTC and the commitment of staff. It provided an ideal platform from which to start the fieldwork and I felt privileged to be part of the course.
Document analysis

O’Leary called working with existing texts a source of rich, in-depth qualitative, indirect data (2010:220). Bernard (2006:22) uses the term hermeneutics to refer to interpretation and reinterpretation of any form of textual material. He used a Clifford Geertz (1973) quote claiming culture is an “assemblage of texts” (2006:23) to illustrate the contribution the hermeneutic approach makes to data collection and analysis.

Fr McVerry, the Tutu RTC Principal, made available two written reports on Tutu RTC and an electronic copy of two reports on Tutu RTC courses. The first, written by Andrew McGregor and Levai Tora with Geoff Bamford and Karala McGregor was “The Tutu Rural Training Centre” (2011) commissioned by the Asia Development Bank (ADB) to evaluate Tutu RTC. The second was by Vave and Rigamoto called “Report on the Review of the Young Single Women’s Course Marist Training Centre Tutu, Taveuni” (2009). Together these reports contributed a rich source of textual information available for hermeneutic interpretation.

Accessing the reports had an inside connection. Fr McVerry, the author of the in-house reports, was interviewed. Additionally three of the authors of the ADB commissioned report on Tutu RTC visited Tutu during my fieldwork. I interviewed Levai Tora, the Fijian co-author who conducted the extensive interviews with all the available past students of Tutu RTC courses and Geoff Bamford. These connections added depth to the insights contained within the reports and afforded an insider dimension.

Sampling approach

The staff participants interviewed were chosen using non-random purposive sampling to ensure a greater depth in the responses was obtained (O’Leary, 2010:168). The participant responses were stored on a digital audio recording device. Trainees, staff, key informants and past students were interviewed. Key informants were staff with particular responsibilities at Tutu RTC. The full list of interview participants is shown in Table 4.1. Participant names have been removed and a code used so the interviewees could not be identified, though identification was not of concern to the participants. To allow a smoother flow of the text, the coded reference for interviewees is substituted for pseudonyms. The codes have been retained in case they are required in the future.
Table 4.1: Participants in the Tutu RTC Interviews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code (Pseudonym)</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Island of trainee’s home village</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Formal Schooling</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>T1 (Stefano)</td>
<td>YFC trainee</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Taveuni</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>F.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T2 (Jimilai)</td>
<td>YFC trainee</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Vanua Levu</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>F.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T3 (Waisea)</td>
<td>YFC trainee</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Taveuni</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>F.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T4 (Jojii)</td>
<td>YFC trainee</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Vanua Levu</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>F.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T5 (Isake)</td>
<td>YFC trainee</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>Vanua Levu</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>F.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T6 (Joeli)</td>
<td>YFC trainee</td>
<td>20s</td>
<td>Vanua Levu</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>F.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T7 (Ilai)</td>
<td>YFC trainee</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Vanua Levu</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>F.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YFG1 (Timoci)</td>
<td>YFC Graduate</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Vanua Levu</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>F.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCG1 (Suliana)</td>
<td>MCP Graduate</td>
<td>40s</td>
<td>Taveuni</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCG2 (Levani)</td>
<td>MCP Graduate</td>
<td>40s</td>
<td>Taveuni</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI1 (Kenneth)</td>
<td>Key Informant</td>
<td>70s</td>
<td>NZ</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI2 (Geoff)</td>
<td>Key Informant</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI3 (Sikeli)</td>
<td>Key Informant</td>
<td>30s</td>
<td>Vii Levu</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI4 (Kesa)</td>
<td>Key Informant</td>
<td>50s</td>
<td>Taveuni</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI5 (Niko)</td>
<td>Key Informant</td>
<td>50s</td>
<td>Taveuni</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KI6 (Wami)</td>
<td>Key Informant</td>
<td>40s</td>
<td>Taveuni</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S1 (Emori)</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>40s</td>
<td>Solomon Is</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S2 (Lauan)</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>30s</td>
<td>Taveuni</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S3 (Sisa)</td>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>30s</td>
<td>Taveuni</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Codes used: YFC = Young Farmers’ Course, MCP = Married Couples Programme)

Age, village, gender and last year of formal schooling were collected to gain an overview of the participant demographic. These questions also proved helpful in putting the participant at ease. The category column specified if the interviewee was a current or graduate trainee, staff member or a key informant. The remaining questions, which took approximately half an hour to complete, related to the participants’ perception of ‘the good life’ and how they saw both Tutu RTC and formal schooling contributing to that life.

The participant selection used a mix of researcher-selected participants and snowball sampling. The students were a comparatively homogenous group in so far as they had been at Tutu RTC for the same length of time and had the same responsibilities and status within the group. For convenience I chose to do snowball sampling in this group which involved participants referring new participants.

Given staff are less homogenous I relied on selecting the sample. I sought staff and key informants, most of whom were staff, whose responsibilities are influential in the running
of Tutu or those who can fill gaps in knowledge. For example Geoff Bamford, the
organiser of the Tutu RTC Pilot Course, has a wealth of knowledge both of Tutu RTC and
rural training centres generally. When the possibility arose for him to be interviewed it
was clearly an opportunity not to be missed and thankfully he consented to it. Mayoux
(2008:118) referred to this method of research as ‘random encounters’ and recognised its
usefulness in providing alternative perspectives. Interviews from random encounters were
used with four participants.

**Triangulation**

The credibility of the research was supported by the use of triangulation. Triangulation is
the use of more than one source to confirm the authenticity of each source of data
(O’Leary 2010:115). The fieldwork used one primary data source, recorded interviews,
and two secondary sources, observation and document analysis. The use of multiple data
types and collection techniques serve as a cross-check of the validity of each data set.
Each data source will be authenticated if the information aligns into common
understandings. Mayaux (2008:123) maintained the three sources of data not only permit
data credibility through triangulation but also allow multiple layers of understanding to
expose deeper trends and meanings and convey those ideas in different ways to different
audiences.

**Data saturation**

Saturation results from sufficient interviews so that no new data is being collected from
additional participants (O’Leary, 2010:114-5). A degree of saturation occurred with
trainee interviews and document analysis. Saturation was reflected in a repetition of
responses in these interviews and common themes in the variety of documents. However
the constraint of limited time prevented the opportunity of reaching saturation with staff
interviews and participant observation. Observation in particular yielded new data daily in
the form of new training routines and processes as well as deeper insights. Triangulation
was able to mitigate against a lack of saturation in some areas of data collection.

4.7 **ACKNOWLEDGING LIMITATIONS OF THE FIELDWORK**

O’Leary (2010:38) outlined three steps in dealing with the inevitable shortcomings of the
research. First the necessity to honestly state the limitations of the study, secondly to
outline the strategies used to ensure the data gathered retains its integrity in spite of those
limitations, and finally to justify that the actions taken to ensure data credibility. In
discussing the fieldwork’s shortcomings these three steps will be applied to the two significant limitations identified in this study.

**SAMPLE RESTRICTIONS**

The interviews did not include female students, the students’ parents, or villagers. Hence the scope was narrowed to male students, staff and key informants. These exclusions occurred because the Young Single Women’s Course (YSWC) was not operating during my time at Tutu, and a much longer stay would have been needed to gather data from a number of villages.

To compensate for the lack of female student perspectives two staff key informants, who had responsibility for the young women’s course, were interviewed. In addition two reports were consulted. The first was the comprehensive report by McGregor et al. (2011) compiled from interviews of nearly all past students who had attended both the YSWC and the YFC. The second is an independent report commissioned by Tutu RTC specifically to review the YSWC by Vave and Rigamoto (2009). The targeted interviews and the two reports designed to inform the research on the YSWC, rendered qualitative data that was consistent, self-reinforcing and frank.

**TIME SPENT IN THE FIELD**

As with most fieldwork, a lack of time for data collection emerged as an issue. Permission was granted for three weeks and this time was bounded by arriving to synchronise for the Tutu Study Tour at the beginning and leaving before the trainees left for their five week oscillation period in the village at the end. This was problematic as it took time to create rapport, build trust and unravel the roles of staff to allow key informants to be identified and approached to participate. To a large extent the time I had available did allow identification of key interviewees to occur, though there were some additional key informant interviews that I would have included if time permitted earlier identification.

More time would also have allowed additional staff and student interviews. There was however saturation in the responses from student interviews and data approaching saturation with the staff interviews. As stated above, however, other interview categories such as parents and villagers could not be conducted. Informal discussions with four parents along with the multiple data sources provided by observation and Tutu documents allowed crosschecking. This created triangulation through document and observation data
by reinforcing common themes. Commonalities verify the villager data is consistent and hence valid (O’Leary, 2010:115).

The participant observation utilised an ethnographic awareness approach. Ethnography requires living as the observed lives to understand local epistemologies. Though time would never allow this to be completely achieved, clearly more time would have engendered stronger connections. However the data collection approaches outlined successfully countered these limitations.

4.8 CONCLUSION

The methodology used for this research is the postmodernism-influenced constructivist approach. Constructivism directs this research to understand learning and wellbeing at Tutu through the values and beliefs of the surrounding community. This approach rejects universals and instead truth and culture are understood in relation to socio-historic context (O’Leary, 2010:6). The socio-historic context of Tutu RTC is a subject of the next chapter.

The relativist approach to the fieldwork aligns with Nabobo-Baba’s *Vanua* research (2006). Nabobo-Baba is a Fijian researching in Fiji and thereby affording credibility to the methodology chosen and the data collected in this study.

Having applied a postdevelopment lens to the methodology, two approaches followed naturally. The research should involve the collection of qualitative data and an ethnographic awareness approach should be adopted in the field. These approaches provide narrative data which better captures human interactions. Fernandez and Herzfeld (2000:110) recognised that these interactions yield rich data as they convey an understanding of life and its meanings.

Employing an ethnographic and qualitative approach logically led to the following three methods to be employed in the field. The first, semi-structured interviews allowed the interview process the flexibility to follow the interviewees thinking within the researchers parameters. Consequently the digital audio data collected gives an enormous amount of information of the type that allows qualitative interpretation (Levy and Hollan, 2000:3540).

Participant observation is inherently ethnographic (Dewalt and Dewalt, 2000:266). Observation emulates the way we as children learn our own culture. Observation collects
rich information efficiently when good rapport is established (2000:267). Good rapport was a feature of the Tutu RTC fieldwork.

The third method of data collection used was the text from reports on Tutu RTC. This method generated considerable readily useable data. The credibility of this data was enhanced as three of the writers were participants in the interviews. Further validity was generated from participating in the Tutu Study Tour workshop presented by two report authors. The workshops revealed many insights on Tutu over four days that would have taken much longer as a lone researcher.

A lack of time was identified as a limitation of the fieldwork. However the quality and authenticity of the data collected, the rapport generated and the triangulation provided by the three separate data sources countered these limitations. Where interviews and observations were underutilised the rich data from other sources ensured data credibility.

To conduct fieldwork at Tutu RTC was a rare honour and I feel extremely privileged to have had this opportunity. The rich data that this experience has provided will allow a high degree of confidence in the findings of the chapters that follow.
CHAPTER 5: EDUCATION IN FIJI: SITUATING TUTU RTC

5.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter investigates the first part of the third thesis objective which asks: Is Tutu Rural Training Centre (Tutu RTC) an example of an alternative approach to education? Chapter 2 identifies principles of an alternative education framework which is informed by postdevelopment and indigenous values. This framework will be used to examine the training at Tutu RTC. The second part of objective three, exploring Tutu RTC’s effectiveness, will be covered in Chapter 6.

The chapter begins by presenting the context for Tutu RTC as an education institution in Fiji. That context investigates the unique features of the centre and why and how it evolved into its current form. This investigation involves unpacking the national system of education in Fiji with the understanding that this education system is itself a reflection of the society, history and geography in which it is embedded. Therefore this chapter starts with an overview of Fiji followed by an understanding of education in Fiji. The context section will conclude with how Tutu RTC positions itself within both the needs of the nation and the educational needs of young adults.

5.2 FIJI: THE CONTEXT

GEOPOLITICAL HISTORY

Fiji is an island state in the South Pacific consisting of 330 islands of which 100 are inhabited. It has a total land mass of 18 thousand square kilometres spread over 1.3 million square kilometres of sea. The total population of Fiji is 840,000, 54% of whom are ethnic Fijian Melanesians and 38% Indo Fijian (Fiji Government, 2011:1). It has a history that can be traced back 3500 years (2011:2).

The largest island of Fiji is Viti Levu which is referred to as the main island. It is inhabited by 70% of the population (Fiji Government, 2011:1). Viti Levu also houses the capital Suva, the second biggest city, Lautoka, and the next most populous city, Nadi. Nadi is also the site of Fiji’s main international airport.
Figure 5.1: Fiji


Figure 5.2: Taveuni
The second largest and second most populated island is Vanua Levu. Together Viti Levu and Vanua Levu make up the vast amount of land, 80%, and the majority of Fiji’s population (Fiji Government, 2011:3). Tutu RTC is on the western side of Fiji’s third largest island, Taveuni, one kilometre south of the village, Wairiki. Taveuni has a population of 14,000 and an area of 470 square kilometres (Fiji Government, 2011:3). There are 14 provinces in Fiji and the province of Cakaudrove encompasses Taveuni as well as the eastern section of Vanua Levu. Vanua Levu has two further provinces, Macuata and Bua.

Fiji became a British colony in 1874 only gaining independence in 1970. Between 1879 and 1916 the colonial government brought over 60,000 indentured labourers from India to work on sugar plantations (Takasaki, 2011:6). Thousands more Indians immigrated voluntarily to Fiji in the 1920s and 1930s when the indenture was revoked (US State Department, 2012). This ethnic group, referred to as Indo-Fijians, currently constitute 37% of the population.

The constitution, set in the year of independence in 1970, returned land from colonial to traditional mataqali (clan) ownership ensuring land remained in indigenous Fijian hands. Today most of the land (88%) is ethnic Fijian owned, only 4% is state owned and the remainder is freehold (Fiji Government, 2011:1). As a result most of the Indo-Fijian population reside in the urban areas of the two main islands and have become dominant in the areas of commerce and business. In contrast ethno-Fijians are rurally-based across the islands and largely derive a living through a combination of subsistence and small-scale commercial agriculture (US State Department, 2012:para. 4).

Under the 1970 constitution each of the fourteen provinces provides representatives in the 55 member parliament. Provinces also have a representative on the Great Council of Chiefs, a politically autonomous body with considerable influence on political decision-making and on the Fijian people.

There have been four coups in Fiji since independence. The 1987 elections produced a coalition dominated by Indo-Fijians and this resulted in two coups that year. Since then, there have been two further coups, one in 2000 and the latest in 2006 (US State Department, 2012:para. 8-14). Takasaki (2011:9) maintains these have been largely about ethnic Fijians retaining political control. However Takasaki presents a simplistic picture. Though he was correct in saying the four coups are motivated by ethnicity the most recent
Coup appears to promote political representativeness and not ethno-Fijian control. Bainimarama led Fiji’s most recent coup because he suspected the civilian government of being supportive of the 2000 coup plotters (US State Department, 2012:para. 14). Frank Bainimarama formed a government which included Chaudhry, the Indo-Fijian leader of the Fijian Labour Party, demonstrating cross-cultural power sharing. This unelected regime still currently governs Fiji.

In spite of the high-profile political events, a United States Department of State briefing on Fiji (2012:para. 19) classified Fiji as one of the more developed of the Pacific island economies, although it recognised Fiji “remains a developing country with a large subsistence agriculture sector”. Fiji’s economic performance traditionally relies on the sugar industry and tourism. Raw sugar production accounts for about 10% of GDP and employs about one fifth of Fiji’s total employed labour (2012, McGregor et al., 2011:3). Tourism has expanded since the early 1980s and is the leading economic activity in the islands.

**RELIGION**

Nearly all indigenous Fijians are Christian and three-quarters of these are Methodist. Eighty percent of Indo-Fijians are Hindu (US State, 2012:para. 4). Tavola (1991:7-22) concluded the early Methodist mission schools (1830s onwards) inextricably linked evangelising with education and as a result Methodism became grafted to Fijian indigenous culture. McGregor et al. (2011:12) claimed the Church has encompassed the very essence of the Fijian traditional way of life. This fusion of tradition and Christianity plays a strong role in creating cultural values and direction to Fijian youth.

However the influence of the Church can also have a negative impact. Daily routines and obligations revolving around the Church can distract young people from agricultural enterprises leading to frustration and anger (McGregor et al., 2011:12). While acknowledging the positive impacts of the Church its prominence can detract from other important areas of livelihood and wellbeing.

**CHALLENGES**

Since the 1960s, Fiji has had a high rate of emigration, especially among Indo-Fijians discouraged by racially motivated coups, racialisation of domestic politics and the search for better economic opportunities. This has been particularly true of people with education and skills (US Department of State, 2012:para.24). Indigenous Fijians have also begun to
emigrate in large numbers, often to seek employment as home health care workers. Remittances from overseas workers are second only to tourism as a source of foreign exchange earnings (2012:para.24).

Fijians are also moving from rural to urban areas in search of jobs (US Department of State, 2012:para.5). The drift has created large areas of urban poverty, particularly in squatter settlements, affecting Fijians of both ethnicities. Romanos (2005:51) noted that poverty is exacerbated by unemployment resulting from 12,000 school leavers competing for 2000 new jobs in the formal economy. In addition, the low wages paid are insufficient to keep families above the poverty line (Romanos, 2005:51). McGregor et al. (2011:2) added:

*The high rates of out-migration from rural areas adversely affect the source communities and brings with it environmental, and the social problems of poverty, over-taxed infrastructure, congestion, pollution, crime and political instability.*

As in other countries in Melanesia, urban drift is problematic.

Though girls are outperforming boys in Fiji secondary school education, women continue to be over-represented in low-wage occupations (Romanos, 2005:52). This manifests persistent beliefs in Fiji that women should seek domestic employment rather than professional work and men are the decision makers while a woman’s place is in the home (2005:53).

There is a widespread tolerance of domestic violence in Fiji. Romanos (2005:53) cites Fiji Women’s Crisis Centre (1998) which stated that 66% of Fijian women have been physically beaten by their husbands or partners. Though such discriminative practices are often couched as Fijian values and norms, Romanos (2005:54) argued those practices were strongly influenced by two centuries of European contact. Romanos postulated that British coloniser attitudes reinforced the pre-colonial patriarchal behaviours of Fijians (2005:54).

5.3 EDUCATION IN FIJI

The Fijian context, therefore, is one of a tropical island nation whose people have a strongly traditional culture that collides with colonialism, Christianity and western culture. This collision has resulted in intense religious observance, racial tension, urban drift, poverty, and sexist attitudes and violence against women. The following section explores
the evolution of education in that environment and how the current state of schooling interfaces with Fiji’s unique context.

**PRE-COLONIAL APPROACHES TO EDUCATION**

Before colonisation, education in Fiji was focused on “cultural transmission and continuity” (Nabobo, 2000:4). This pre-colonial description aligns with this study’s definition for indigenous education which is: promoting the needs of the local culture through the local culture. Kedrayate (2001) refers to pre-colonial education as traditional education which she described as maintenance of the social and cultural life in the community. Skills were obtained through observation, imitation and ‘on-the-job’ training. She added traditional education was essential as the family and community’s sustainability and continuity depended upon it (2001:2). Traditional education is a subset of place-based education, described in this study, and Thaman’s definition of indigenous education (2011, personal communication).

**COLONIAL APPROACHES TO EDUCATION**

A marked educational change occurred in the 1860s as colonial missionaries set up training institutions in Fiji. Nabobo claimed this introduced formalised education which promoted “Eurocentric and foreign notions of knowledge and pedagogy” (2000:4).

Initially the formal education provided by missionaries was designed to convert Fijians to Christianity (Kedrayate, 2001:3). Later religious schools trained students in new skills such as carpentry, horticulture and home economics. This was the first experience for local Fijians of roles and jobs outside traditional subsistence activities. In the decades before independence (1970) colonial administrators used education to create a class of Fijians to fill middle-management positions in the civil service (Kedrayate, 2001:4). Schooling was in English and focused on jobs. Kedrayate (2001:5) concluded that, as a result, the curriculum was largely irrelevant to the daily lives of the majority of Fijians.

**CONTEMPORARY APPROACHES TO EDUCATION**

(i) Formal approaches

After independence in 1970, schools were established throughout Fiji. Sharma (1990:5) noted that schools were predominantly academic using imported examination systems to screen out a professional class and label the rest as ‘dropouts’. Aporosa asserted that the imported western-style education system runs counter to the local traditions of Fiji and is therefore a strong factor in student underachievement (2006:54).
Formal education for Fijians begins at age 6 and has been compulsory for children of age 6 to 15 since 1997 (Fiji MoE, 2000). Primary schooling runs from Class 1 to 8 which equates to New Zealand (NZ) Year 1 to 8. Most students continue to secondary school which teaches Form 3 to Form 6 and is equivalent to NZ Year 9 to 12. Some schools offer a Form 7 curriculum which is a preparatory year for university. Fiji-based national exams occur in Class 8, Form 4 and Form 6. Exams are used for promotion to the next level and, in the case of the standardised Form 6 exam, eligibility for tertiary study (Takasaki, 2011:13-14).

The province of Cakaudrove, which includes Tutu RTC, has 64 primary and 10 secondary schools. Takasaki (2011:40), who conducted a survey in the Cakaudrove province, found 70% of boys and 80% of girls reached Form 4. He calculated only 30% of boys and 40% of girls completed secondary education to Form 6. The Cakaudrove statistic is consistent with the nationwide figures for Fiji (Takasaki, 2011:16).

**Critiques of formal education approaches**

A fundamental goal for formal education is the Millennium Development Goal 2 which seeks universal primary education by 2015. A report carried out by UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) (2009:19) concludes “Fiji has already achieved this goal through strong and effective policies”. In addition, the report also acknowledged gender equity has been achieved in primary and secondary enrolments. This goal is the education component of MDG 3. Furthermore the Fiji MoE (2009:42-51) listed improvements in: the percentage gaining entrance to university; special needs outcomes as 200 students were mainstreamed between 2006-2008; an increase in professional development uptake by rural teachers; and a new subject, Citizen Studies, developed by the UNDP, added to the secondary curriculum in 2009 called. Numerous reports and strategies have been implemented in the education sector of Fiji to improve education outcomes.

However the Fiji MoE Strategic Development Plan 2006-2008 (2006:16) questioned the viability of formal education in Fiji based on the poor student retention due to the high dropout and chronic truancy rates across the year levels. The MoE expressed the concern that “dropouts from primary schools may reach alarming levels if [if the rate is] not arrested”. The MoE recognised that an education system with weak student support, reflected in students dropping out, declining enrolments beyond Form 4, and falling
student attendance, risks being unsustainable. The MoE plan identifies a lack of curriculum relevance and the poor chance of gaining employment as the dominant causes of the student dropout rate. As a result, the MoE report claimed, student engagement and performance is low, class behaviour has deteriorated and drug abuse has escalated (2006:15).

The situation where 65% of rural Fijian youths are opting out of education and returning to the village with no school and no work is problematic. Coxon and Munce (2008:151) consider this to be a Pacific wide problem: “Youth are often labelled an economic, social and political ‘time bomb’”. This, they argue, is the result of large numbers of youth in the Pacific who are unemployed or underemployed. Coxon and Munce concluded (2008:165):

\[
\text{[The] current education provision does not provide a significant number of Pacific Island youth with the knowledge, skills, attitudes and values that enables them to participate in the social, spiritual, economic and cultural development of their communities.}
\]

The National Council for Building a Better Fiji claimed in urban areas of Fiji, those who do not find work are often drawn to drug abuse and criminal activity (2008:33). The growing number of school leavers who migrate from their rural village to urban centres are more susceptible to unlawful activity because of their overcrowded conditions, cultural disconnect and lower chances of obtaining work (Baba, 1986:187 cited in Kedrayate, 2001:7). The majority of youths who remain in the village fall into an unproductive cycle of touch rugby and hours of kava drinking (McGregor et al., 2012:11). It is within this underutilised and destructive youth environment that Tutu RTC seeks to make a positive contribution to the lives of young people in the region.

(ii) Non-formal approaches: Vocational, place-based, alternative approaches to education

In chapter 2 I use the term formal education. It is used throughout this thesis to represent the conventional, mainstream system of schooling that leads to national qualifications and builds towards entrance to tertiary courses. Non-formal education represents learning that is outside the formal curriculum. Kedrayate defined two kinds of non-formal education (2001:85). The first is through Government sponsored institutions which are solely focused on formal employment and therefore lack community involvement and ownership (2001:85). The second non-formal education governance is through NGOs. These often
rural-based centres are flexible to community needs and promote ownership and autonomy. Kedrayate observed that these centres are sometimes, in effect, providing traditional education (2001:20) defined earlier in this section.

**Rationale for non-formal education in Fiji**

Kedrayate, isolated two reasons for a renewed emphasis on non-formal education. The first is as an alternative to the “monopoly of formal education” (2001:83). She explains formal education has limitations such as a lack of curriculum relevancy and the reality that fifty percent of Fijians live in rural areas and are sustained by subsistence agriculture. This study refers to this rural lifestyle as the non-formal economy. Compulsory formal education prepares students for the formal economy which represents the reality for only a half of the school leavers. The other half of that reality is a requirement for skills relevant to the non-formal economy.

The second reason for the renewed interest in non-formal education is because of what it can offer. Kedrayate (2001:92) defined non-formal education as “activity concerned with identifying community education needs and implementing actions to meet those needs through the community”. She believes non-formal education has the potential to conserve socio-economic and cultural values. This is done by non-formal education centres focusing on self-employment skills as they reinforce community priorities (2001:82). Cultural values are strengthened through school-based or centre-based training that encourages community and individual resilience and resourcefulness (Baba, 1986 cited in Kedrayate, 2001:82).

In summary, this section has provided a context for the subject of the case study, Tutu RTC in Taveuni, Fiji. Though Taveuni is on an idyllic island in the popular destination of Fiji, it also faces many challenges reflecting wider Fijian issues. Young people who return to the village after leaving school are considered failures and those who seek employment in the city are often unsuccessful and are forced into the margins (Romanos, 2005).

Kedrayate (2001:83) argues formal education creates urban drift and a feeling of failure in the village. The result threatens the sustainability of the fifty percent who live in the village and puts pressure on urban infrastructure. Non-formal education is seen as having the potential to enhance village life through a relevant curriculum which promotes local values and identity while providing realistic opportunities for young people. Kedrayate
(2001:85) uses Tutu RTC as a particular example of non-formal education which she classified as traditional education. Tutu RTC is discussed in the following section and is the focus of the fieldwork site for this thesis.

5.4 TUTU RTC: AN ALTERNATIVE PLACE-BASED APPROACH TO EDUCATION

BACKGROUND

The Tutu Marist Training Centre is located on Fiji’s third largest island, Taveuni, which is 200 km from Fiji’s capital Suva. The term Tutu Marist Training Centre refers to the entire complex. This section will use the generic term Tutu when referring to the centre in its entirety. The term Tutu Rural Training Centre (Tutu RTC) is used to refer to the areas of Tutu dedicated to the training of students. Tutu is owned by a Catholic Marist order, The Society of Mary, and consists of four campuses built on 480 hectares of freehold land. One campus, The Catholic Noviciate, which began in 1969, provides one year of training to novices from the Oceanic region. The other three campuses provide training for young adults in the Cakaudrove province and therefore forms part the Tutu RTC.

The training at Tutu RTC began in 1972 and is now provided through five courses. The original programmes were termed volunteer courses as the hands-on learning involved building the campuses, the hydro-electric facility (which supplies power to Tutu and some neighbouring houses), and setting up the farm (McGregor et al., 2011:18). In addition, volunteers from villages throughout Cakaudrove assisted in this initial work. Alekesio Tatani, the current Deputy Principal, was present from the initial setup of Tutu RTC. He believes having community involvement at the beginning has created strong local ownership which has on-going benefits (Fieldwork Journal, Nov. 2011).

Three campuses cater for the five different courses Tutu RTC offers. The Young Farmer’s Course occurs at the Naisevere Centre, the Young Women’s and Married Couples courses at Naqumu, and the Laura community houses religious staff and their living facilities as well as whole staff meetings. Shorter village and parent’s courses are spread among these three campuses.

PHILOSOPHY AND VISION OF TUTU RTC

Father McVerry (2011:2), the Tutu Principal, refers to the education provided by Tutu RTC as training for self-employment. He defines the training as non-formal education as it
is learning skills that relate to life in the village rather than skills to be used for employment elsewhere. Fr McVerry's non-formal education definition differs from the more general definition used in this study of learning that is not part of the conventional school curriculum. However the training at Tutu is a significant subset of non-formal education.

All courses at Tutu RTC are taught in the local vernacular as that is the language of the village and the village is where self-employment takes place. Teaching in another language, such as English, is only useful if the course skills are to be used beyond the village. Therefore Tutu RTC’s has the philosophy of not recruiting from too large a catchment because of regional dialectical differences. Furthermore staff believe the diversity of Fiji is such that expanding the catchment area too far can compromise the relevance and authenticity of the training because of cultural and crop variations. Hence Tutu RTC’s reach is geographically bounded.

Mission Statement
The overarching philosophy of Tutu RTC is in their Mission Statement (McGregor et al., 2011:19):

*The aim of the Marist Training Centre in Tutu is to provide a place/presence in which the people of Cakaudrove are empowered to become more autonomous and take charge of their lives in a rapidly changing world. It involves a transformation and a reciprocal outreach to the peoples of the Pacific.*

Estimates presented on the Tutu Study Tour course (10 Nov 2011) show that of the 18,000 school leavers in Fiji in 2010, 4,000 went on to further training, 4,000 found temporary employment and 10,000 young people returned to the village. The reference to rapid change refers to the increasing numbers leaving the village in search of employment. Villagers use the label ‘dropout’ to refer to those that return to the village after schooling because parents expect paid employment to be the result of their son or daughter’s schooling (McGregor et al., 2011:24). This puts added pressure on youth to move to urban areas.

In addition, village life is constricting. Imposed duties from parents and the village, plus religious commitments, prevent individual decision-making. In response to a lack of individual choice, and the dropout label, many school-leavers are non-productive. This is
particularly so for males who play touch rugby until dark and drink kava into the night. They sleep until late the next day and then repeat this cycle. Parents are obliged to feed and house their sons and daughters so dependency on parents is reinforced rather than a gradual independence and responsibility (McGregor et al., 2011:11).

A school leaver is faced with the choice of the village with a non-autonomous life of dependency on parents and village obligations, or the city and the likelihood of life in the margins. It is within this lack of real choice that Tutu RTC seeks to empower the young adults to take charge of their lives. Consistent with their Mission Statement, the centre sees its role as empowering the young people of Cakaudrove to be fruitful, autonomous, self-employed, and contributing members of their community (Tutu Study Tour notes, Nov. 2011).

**Funding and Fees**

A government grant has been allocated annually to Tutu RTC since 1972. In the last five years the grant has averaged over F$300,000. This average represents a recent doubling of government funding designed to offset the extra burden of increasing the student catchment to areas within the Bua and Macuata provinces of Vanua Levu (McGregor, 2011:51).

Tutu prefers to not rely on non-government organisation (NGO) donor grants. Father McVerry explains that regular grants can compromise Tutu’s autonomy. However NGO funding has been utilised on a number of occasions to offset unforeseen circumstances such as damage from cyclones or capital expenditure. The collective government and NGO grants contribute a high proportion of Tutu’s revenue (85% in 2009) (McGregor et al., 2011:49).

Self-funding contributes the remainder of Tutu’s income. These funds are from sales off the Oceania Farm and interest on investments. The report by McGregor et al. (2011:52) suggests other forms of self-funding are possible such as the sale of excess electricity and returns from agro-forestry.

Despite Tutu RTC’s government grant its policy of no fees means costs must be carefully managed. The no fees policy is especially challenging as all residents are provided with accommodation and food during their time at Tutu RTC. The comparatively low wage bill
and the use of volunteer labour significantly assist the achievement of a nil annual deficit (McGregor et al., 2011:53).

The centre is a partnership between the Church, the community, and the Government (McVerry, 2011:1). The Church, represented by the Catholic Marist Society of Mary, supplies Tutu RTC its religious staff, 1200 acres of fertile land and the accompanying buildings, and a shared raison d’être. The community, which is the people of the province of Cakaudrove, has been involved in the operations of Tutu from its inception, granting a strong sense of community ownership. Volunteers, representing a variety of religious denominations, have played a key role in building the centre and are still involved in Tutu especially through the village courses. The Government, as stated previously provides funding and support. Tutu staff are mindful of this three-way partnership.

**STAFF**

There are thirty staff at Tutu RTC creating annual salary expenses in total of around $200,000 Fijian (F$1 = NZ$0.70). McGregor et al. (2011:53) describes the F$200,000 figure as “remarkably low considering the calibre of staff”. There are three Marist priests, one of whom is Father McVerry, the Principal, and one Marist Brother. Religious staff are not paid a wage. All lay-staff live on site and are provided with a house and free electricity. In addition they are allocated land on which to grow their own food and also supplement their income with cash crops.

McGregor et al. (2011:53) observed that the Tutu RTC staff are extremely committed. He noted they often work considerably longer hours than others in paid employment (2011:53). All senior staff are Tutu RTC graduates most were selected from the married couples and village courses. In most cases staff-members have been successful farmers and have a strong association with Tutu RTC and the Catholic Church. These are factors in generating high motivation and commitment amongst the staff in their work at Tutu (McGregor et al., 2011:53). This motivation was clearly evident during my fieldwork. McGregor et al. (2011:53) cited a period of several years after the 1987 Fijian coup where staff worked without wages because of government funding cuts, clearly demonstrating their commitment.
COURSES

Two courses, the Young Farmer’s Course and the Young Single Women’s Course, cater for young adults between 18 and 24 years of age who have chosen to live in the village. The much shorter Parent’s Course is designed to complement these courses through information sharing for the trainees’ parents and village chiefs. Both the Married Couples and the Village courses are for adult couples and are designed to strengthen their marriage and therefore their community. The detail of each of the five courses is now discussed.

(i) The Young Farmer’s Course
The Young Farmer’s Course (YFC) is Tutu RTC’s most popular and time intensive course. It is a four year programme and is restricted to an intake of around 50 male students who are between 18 and 23 years. They are the only intake for the four year duration of the course. The constitution of the YFC is to train and help young single men establish themselves as farmers on their own land (Tutu Study Tour, 2011:10). To achieve this students are assisted in becoming managers of themselves, their land and their finances. Trainees are taught agricultural practices involved in intensifying subsistent and commercial use of land. The young farmers learn carpentry skills by making their own furniture and mechanical skills such as use and maintenance of chainsaws, sawmilling, outboard motors, tools and machines associated with farming life. In addition, they are given an understanding of human relationships, leadership and the world around them, and how they can make a positive contribution to determining the nature of that world (McVerry, 2011:2). These aspects are dealt with in the Human Development topic discussed below. The contribution McVerry refers to is demonstrating alternatives to paid employment. These understandings link the YFC to the Tutu RTC’s mission statement discussed above.

Human Development curriculum

The principal, Father McVerry, referred to the promise of good financial returns for trainees as the ‘hook’ that motivates participants early in the course (Tutu Study Tour, Nov. 2011). It is, however, the training of students to become autonomous and responsible young men who will enrich the village that emerges as the paramount objective and motivation. Although this emphasis on autonomy develops in a holistic way throughout the course, much of the focus is given through a separate topic called Human Development.
Human Development has a strong emphasis on developing the whole person and covers knowing and appreciating one’s self, developing the spousal relationship, parenting skills, leadership, personal and business management skills, and health. This is a major component of all five courses offered by Tutu RTC.

In their independent report on Tutu RTC, McGregor et al. (2011:34) asked former students for the factors that contributed to their success. The report found:

*The ex-Young Farmers saw human development as moral understanding, personality issues, social issues, identity formation and conceptual understanding. ... Most of the Young Farmers interviewed agreed that this component of the program gave them a realisation of their purpose in life. Understanding human relations, leadership attributes and life management skills were instilled gradually during the course. Gaining a full appreciation of the significance of their individual lives was seen as the breakthrough to starting the transformation process.*

Similar sentiments on the Human Development sessions were expressed by participants of the married couple’s course (McGregor et al., 2011:40):

*The aim of these sessions was to leverage participants to take charge of their own lives and reconnect to their marriage vows. All the participants that were interviewed agreed that this process has been a turning point in their lives.*

Part of this personal development, or what Tutu RTC refers to as ‘personal autonomy’, is a responsibility to contribute to the *Vanua* (people, land and culture of the village). Tutu RTC requires young farmers to share the proceeds from their enterprises with their parents. “This bonding and sharing gesture guarantees flexibility from the family and maintains a very important link that strengthens the bond between the village and the young person” (McGregor et al., 2011:34). Through Human Development students learn the balance between personal autonomy and personal responsibility.

Learning personal autonomy is the essence of the Human Development course. It presents the case that subsistence life in the village has given way to commercial life, individualism and money (Tutu Study Tour, 2011:31). This results in a tension for villagers to, on the one hand, maintain a sense of belonging by fulfilling their Church and traditional obligations and provide for their families on the other (2011:31). Trainees are challenged to ‘articulate the falsity of the myths’ and differentiate the healthy traditional practices that
sustain Fijian life and renew those that do not. From this development process the autonomous person

*has their life in their own hands, discerns the best of the Vanua, knows their resources and manages them with wisdom and knowledge. They serve others as they serve their family economically, socially and with joy* (2011:32).

In another report, Vave and Rigamoto (2009:3) concluded that the Human Development topic is

... the mainstay, and key to the sustainability of the Tutu model which has impacted the lives of so many young women and men who have passed through the Tutu programme.

This section returns to a discussion of specific features of the Young Farmers Course.

*Eligibility criteria*

Eligibility criteria for the YFC have been set so that young farmer aspirants have already begun the process of establishing themselves on their own land. In the year before the new intake begins the aspirants must plant 1000 *yagona* (kava) plants and 1000 *dalo* (taro) on land they can demonstrate is theirs to use indefinitely. This planting, together with interviews by Tutu RTC staff, determines the applicant’s commitment and ability to prosper when the student returns to the village after graduation.

The YFC intake of July 2011 consisted of 54 trainees chosen from the 239 applicants who had planted 1000 *yagona* and *dalo* (McGregor et al., 2011:28). After the selected trainees have benefited from one year at Tutu they are expected to coach those who were not selected for the course. In this way those that missed the course, often referred to by staff as YFC2, can benefit indirectly from Tutu RTC’s training and become successful farmers in the village. In fact YFC2 is often referred to as Tutu’s most successful course as participants learn to be self-employed farmers without officially attending Tutu RTC. More importantly the process of young farmers assisting others in the village allows Tutu RTC a much larger influence in the region. Tutu RTC staff continue to assist and monitor YFC2 students when they visit their village.

*Financial returns*

*Yagona*, the principal income generator for YFC trainees, takes four years to mature. Each plant can then expect to fetch $50 Fijian (F$50) (Tutu Study Tour, Nov 2011). Therefore 1000 *yagona* can expect to generate F$50,000. *Dalo* is a shorter term crop and can add
significantly to this return. Also YFC2 applicants who maintain their village plantings can gain similar returns.

In addition to the trainee’s village plantings as part of their entry requirement, YFC students are given two acres of land for their exclusive use while at Tutu RTC. Students use their block to plant a further 1000 *yagona* and *dalo*. The two acre block becomes a significant part of the young farmer’s curriculum during their four years at Tutu RTC. The proceeds from these plantings are withheld during the four years of training and are released in full to the young farmer when he completes the course. At that point the majority of students can provide sufficient money to build a house on their village land and set up their horticulture business (McGregor et al., 2011:32).

**Oscillation principle**

The YFC oscillates between learning at Tutu RTC and the practice of those skills on their plantings in the village. Each oscillation is five weeks duration. This is considered a critical feature of all Tutu RTC courses as it allows a phased approach to issues such as peer pressure and village, family, Church and social obligations. Approaches can be trialled by students during their five weeks in the village then discussed and refined when evaluating their effectiveness upon the student’s return to Tutu.

As part of the training Tutu staff visit the students in their village environment every six months to monitor their progress in their local context. The staff also meet with Tutu RTC graduates and new Tutu RTC course aspirants as well as building on relationships with communities by working with parents and *mataqali* chiefs. The measure of the regard in which Tutu is held throughout its catchment area is demonstrated by Tutu staff not needing to take supplies on their two week long trips as food, as well as accommodation, is readily provided by villagers (Fieldwork Journal, Nov. 2011).

**YFC routine**

Fees are not charged at Tutu RTC because Tutu was built on voluntary labour and the philosophy is to find the students who would benefit most from training rather than lose them because of financial hardship. To compensate for the loss of fees Tutu RTC requires each student to work as a volunteer on the general Tutu farm on one of their five and a half training days per week. A further work-for-income day is required focusing on routine maintenance of the buildings and grounds. This pay is used to buy bulk food and supplies
to supplement the food grown in the student’s communal garden during their half day’s work on Saturdays. The remaining three days are set aside for the young farmers to work in their two acre farms. They are free to work beyond the allocated times and this practice appears to be common (Fieldwork Journal, Nov. 2011).

When the young farmer is on his own farm, during the five week oscillation in the village, a similar programme operates to the Tutu weekly itinerary. The village-based oscillation consists of three day’s work on their own farm, one day’s work for the village, one day’s work for money and a half day to contribute to the family’s needs. This approach is used to build community responsibility and family loyalty into the student’s training while maintaining their personal autonomy.

The daily routine begins with the trainee waking up to the Fijian drum at 6am. After washing they have chores until 7am. Chores rotate weekly and are designed to be both saving of labour and reinforcing of self-sufficiency and resilience. Many of these duties centre on the food for the day’s three meals. Examples observed were setting the table for breakfast, harvesting dalo, grating coconut for cream to contribute to lunch and tending the communal garden. As a result of the full rotation of duties, trainees learn the essential aspects of creating and utilising home grown food.

Other chores involve tidying and cleaning. Of particular interest to this researcher was the manner in which the toilets were cleaned. Clearly this is one of the less desirable roles so the trainee’s attitude to the cleaning would give an indication of their ownership of the YFC. Significantly, I observed that the cleaning operation was done with the same joyful enthusiasm as the other duties (Fieldwork Journal, Nov. 2011).

After breakfast and optional Mass the young farmers walk up to their farms, a few kilometres uphill, where they work until 12pm. Breakfast may be proceeded by a class and one such class was observed on maintaining a debit/credit account of their income and expenditure. Lunch, prepared by staff from the food gathered by the morning’s chores, is delivered by tractor to the 54 young men. The traditional dalo meal is followed by a siesta. At 1.30pm the trainees return to their farms to work until 5pm. By observing most of the trainees at work it became clear regular supervision was neither given nor needed. All trainees worked with purpose and were clearly motivated by the farming enterprise they were involved in.
While some work until dark, others play touch rugby. The evening meal is served at 6.30pm. Lights are out during the week at 10pm. On Friday nights, however, a YFC kava ceremony is held for the students, staff, guests from the wider community and even the odd researcher. Young people with free access to a drug can be a recipe for trouble. In this case the intention is to teach moderation and self-discipline as well as learn the culture attached to kava drinking. The trainees mix and dispense the kava with no intervention from others. The young farmers do not abuse this right, reflected in the midnight finish being voluntarily adhered to, and the two nights this researcher observed, though lively, were most enjoyable and entertaining evenings.

The success of the YFC
McGregor et al. (2011:28) conducted a comprehensive study of Tutu RTC graduates. They found that of the 224 young men who have graduated from the YFC since 1983, 200 (89%) are farming their own land. The same report shows that since 1983, 75% of students who enrolled in the YFC completed it. In addition the report showed that graduates average income of $11,000 (McGregor et al., 2011:26), is approximately double the fulltime average wage of their employed counterparts across Fiji (McGregor et al., 2011:33). Given these findings, and the realisation that less than 50% of young people seeking fulltime work are successful, it can be concluded the YFC at Tutu RTC is highly successful.

The current courses at Tutu RTC are the culmination that began with a Marist Brothers training course set up on Society of Mary land in Taveuni. Volunteers throughout Cakaudrove assisted with the initial buildings in expectation of the training Tutu would provide (McGregor et al., 2011:16). The first courses had disappointing numbers returning to farm in their village. Tutu staff have taken a flexible approach to the course structure and use frequent course evaluation (2011:16-20). As a result differing course durations, oscillation periods, staff support, entry requirements and preferred crops have been trialled. The Young Farmers Course (YFC) which grew from the previous courses began in 1983. It has itself evolved because of the experimental approach taken by Tutu RTC. For example there is now a stronger human development component in the course and a compulsory savings scheme for earnings from Tutu. Tutu RTC’s success is evidenced by the high retention rate (70% since 1983), high numbers that return to the land (89%), and the popularity of the courses (over 300 applications for 55 places in 2011) (McGregor et al., 2011).
YFC ten year plan

The YFC is a four year course, but in fact its goals span ten years (Tutu Study Tour, Nov. 2011). The first of two consecutive five year plans is put in place when an application is made. The plan is made one year before the Young Farmer’s four year course commences and covers the goals each student wishes to achieve by the completion of the course. A second five year plan is then devised, again with input from Tutu RTC staff. It covers the farming and personal goals of each student for the five years after graduation.

Progress on these plans is monitored by staff when visiting the villages. At the completion of the second five year plan graduates are expected to establish their own five year plans throughout their working lives. The relationship between Tutu RTC staff and trainees past or present is on-going and is a strong contributor to the success of Tutu RTC courses. Indeed staff regard these follow-up visits as the most important part of their job (McGregor et al., 2011:36).

In summary, through the YFC young farmers learn to be resourceful, resilient and contributing members of their community. The practices that sustain life in the village are incorporated into the course while training the young farmers to be autonomous. By being their own person students learn to identify and challenge the harmful effects of some aspects of the village lifestyle while reinforcing local values and contributing to all that is good within it.

(ii) The Young Single Women’s Course

The six months long Young Single Women’s Course (YSWC) began at Tutu in 1995. There is a significantly higher outmigration from the village of young women than young men (McGregor et al., 2011:41). This outmigration reflects a shortage of opportunities in the village and the availability of tourism jobs for women in larger towns. Outmigration also presents a challenge to the YSWC.

The self-esteem of young women who remain in the village is particularly low because they become domestic helpers in their homes and villagers believe a school leaver has failed when not gaining paid employment beyond the village (Tutu Study Tour, Nov. 2011). The villagers refer to the returnees as ‘flops’ and ‘dropouts’. Changing those labels and improving self-esteem are strong foci for the YSWC. Both the self-perception of the trainees and the perception of the villagers are challenged into rethinking a fruitful life is
about young women being their own boss and contributing members of the village community.

The YSWC seeks to equip women with the skills to be financially independent in their communities. Tutu staff and students build on their identified talents and interests to generate a viable income. Some of those skills are sewing and craft, cooking, and farming and marketing vegetables. The financial gain is the ‘hook’ that allows Tutu staff the opportunity to assist in the development of confident and autonomous young women who can challenge harmful practices, such as sexual abuse, from within and outside their community. One to one discussions with female staff together with the Human Development topic are the major vehicles for the empowerment of these young women.

The young women’s course also uses the five week rotation between the village and Tutu RTC. This ensures barriers to applying Tutu RTC approaches to the village context are recognised and responded to. Staff visit the young women to monitor their progress and adapt to the issues that shape their lives, self-image and identity (Vave & Rigamoto, 2009:3). At the end of the course a three year plan is developed between the student and a staff member. Tutu RTC staff will continue to monitor this plan when visiting the graduate’s village. The plan outlines the aspirations of the young woman that are to be completed within three years. The course prepares each student to continue to plan their goals throughout their life.

In line with the YFC, no fees are charged for the YSWC trainees to attend Tutu RTC and similar work-in-kind is expected. Money earned by trainees from the sale of goods produced at Tutu RTC is retained and released at the completion of the course to pay for the setting up of each student’s new business. Financial planning forms an important part of the course.

Vave and Rigamoto (2009:4) conducted a report on the YSWC at Tutu RTC. The authors referred to Tutu’s development of young people in the following way:

*We found in our investigations that the YSWC has over the years become a process of self-realisation, liberation, autonomy and transformation for young women who have been oppressed either through societal attitudes or dysfunctional families or an educational system that did not recognise their special needs and in due course became a vehicle of oppression rather than liberation.*
Vave and Rigamoto (2009:4) concluded the YSWC has had a positive effect on the young women’s lives because the demand for the course always exceeds YSWC places and there is a high degree of respect and trust with which Tutu is regarded in the community. The authors also added that parents report positive changes in their daughters and students appear to achieve their targets.

In spite of the clear benefits, the YSWC has the weakest demand of all Tutu RTC courses. This reflects the significantly fewer young women than young men living in local villages (Niko; Wami Interview, Nov. 2011). This gender imbalance threatens the sustainability of communities. Changes that provide more options for women in the village are therefore urgently required. Tutu RTC seeks to fill this space and has systems to ensure the YSWC (and the other courses) are frequently reviewed to consider how the centre can continue to respond to such challenges (Vave & Rigamoto, 2009:5).

(iii) Married Couples’ Programme

The Married Couples’ Programme (MCP) is a six months course available to couples who have been married for at least four years, have their own land for farming and are in the Cakaudrove province. No fees are charged so work in kind is expected. As with other courses there is a five week oscillation between Tutu and the couple’s village. Children are fully catered for during their periods at Tutu.

The aim is to assist and train farming couples to “joyfully accept their call as rural farming families in their family situation” (Tutu Study Tour, 2011:3). This training involves developing the skills for a wife to share her husband’s farming responsibilities and a husband supporting his wife to generate income from a home enterprise. Through the Human Development curriculum topics such as developing their own spousal relationship, parenting skills and leadership for village life are covered (Tutu Study Tour, 2011:1).

The MCP also assists the learning of practical skills such as small engine maintenance, cabinet making, sewing, sawmilling, cooking, budgeting and horticulture. In each case the focus is to learn by doing. An example of this experiential learning is that the cabinet making classes involve making furniture for the couple’s own house. Tutu RTC has the motto “if you have got it we will teach it” (Vave & Rigamoto, 2009:5). The implication is the practical skills curriculum is limited to the specific needs of each couple.
The couple’s course finishes with a combined business and personal plan for the next five years. The plan witnessed and signed by the husband, the wife and the Tutu RTC Principal becomes the graduating certificate.

(iv) Parent’s Course

This one week course occurs two weeks after the commencement of the YFC and YSWC. It is designed to demonstrate to parents and mataqali chiefs the rationale for these courses so they are able to better support their sons and daughters in their training and future self-employment. The Parent’s Course seeks to challenge villager’s mind-set that positions school leavers who return as failures and replace it with the perception that earning a sustainable livelihood from local resources is a successful outcome. The chief signs the agreement granting the trainee long-term use the land and the parents sign the course constitution. The constitution lays out obligations for the young adult to their family and to Tutu RTC. The parents also sign their obligation to grant a level of autonomy to their son or daughter.

The week starts with listening to the parental concerns and a turning point occurs when the parents and mataqali visit the young farmers in the field. When parents witness the commitment and achievement of their son or daughter and the willingness the trainee has to gain their approval, it frequently becomes an emotional experience (Tutu Study Tour, 2011). This reflects the downside of the dependency relationship many young adults have with their parents. Young adults are reliant on established routines in the home and village and this leads to low expectations of them as well as a lowering of self-esteem.

Tutu RTC staff maintain the Parent’s Course is critical to the success of the YSWC and YFC as it ensures the sustainability of the graduates enterprise. The mataqali chief guarantees land tenure and the renewed understanding and commitment the trainee receives from their parents allows the young farmer the time, and decision space to be autonomous (McGregor et al., 2011:43). The Parents’ Course engenders the support of the village for the new graduate’s enterprise.

(v) Village Course

Village Courses began in Tutu RTC in 1972 and since then over 30,000 adults have gone through the course. It is designed for couples and is led by Tutu RTC staff who facilitate as married couples. The course runs over a weekend, Friday to Sunday night, and,
depending on availability, can run up to eleven weekends. The content covers topics such as marriage, leadership, village relationships in a changing society, and religious beliefs. The emphasis is on communication skills and encouraging couples to work as a partnership.

Volunteer couples, who have completed the parallel Tutu RTC leadership course, assist, or run, the sessions. Leadership training empowers selected couples to run village courses in their own communities (Tutu Study Tour, 2011). As a result Village courses have spread well beyond the original catchment of Cakaudrove. In fact Tutu RTC staff and graduates have participated in village courses throughout Fiji, Tonga and the Solomon Islands. Village support groups, formed from these courses, meet as a follow-up to the initial course and some have been running for 15 years. All village courses are catered and paid for by these support groups (Tutu Study Tour, 2011). Tutu RTC staff report these courses have provided important links to the community and have had a positive impact on village life (McGregor et al. 2011:44).

In summary, the Tutu RTC mission statement shows that the aim of each of the courses of Tutu RTC is to empower village communities to remain sustainable. After their extensive report McGregor et al. (2011:58) observed:

*The TRTC [Tutu RTC] has had a major impact on agricultural and rural development in the Province of Cakaudrove. This impact is most readily quantifiable with respect to the Young Farmer’s Course. Most of these graduates were found to have returned to farm their own land and to generally earn incomes in excess of what they might expect to have obtained from wage employment if such jobs could be secured. These impressive results have been achieved in an outer-island region that is considered statistically to be amongst the most impoverished with high rates of outmigration.*

On the surface Tutu RTC offers young adults a viable lifestyle for those who remain in the village. More importantly Tutu RTC courses nurture and sustain the village. The courses enhance the traditional Fijian culture by demonstrating life as a villager provides a generous income, a proud heritage, and the autonomy to support what enhances village life and challenge what does not. Because of its success, Tutu RTC has influence in its home province of Cakaudrove, neighbouring provinces Bua and Macuata, wider Fiji and to the nations of the Pacific, fulfilling their Mission’s goal of a reciprocal outreach.
5.5 Conclusion

This chapter has presented the context in which Tutu RTC has evolved and currently operates. The close to one million inhabitants of Fiji shares a country comprising over three hundred spectacularly scenic islands enjoying a tropical climate. However, in the last two centuries, as noted by Romanos (2005:50), the benefits of European colonisation have been uneven. Wealth and influence has accumulated in some areas such as church groups and traditional hierarchies resulting in many urban migrants and the fifty percent who reside in rural villages in poverty (Romanos, 2005:51). In the last three decades, globalisation and neoliberal economic policies have exacerbated this disparity.

Formal education has contributed to the disparity in Fiji by siphoning school leavers from the village into urban areas (McGregor et al., 2011:9). Urban drift drains the village of its youth and causes financial stress to the new migrant as well as putting pressure on urban employment and infrastructure (Romanos, 2005:51; McGregor et al., 2011:2). That stress often results in squatter settlements and youth crime. It is in the space created between the fusion of western moneyed culture with Fijian traditional culture that Tutu RTC seeks to have meaning and influence. In particular Tutu RTC offers an alternative to formal education, namely non-formal education, which seeks to arrest urban drift and provide a vehicle for young people to lead fruitful lives in the village.

Village life in Fiji has negative connotations in some quarters. This mind-set damages young people’s self-esteem and is particularly acute for young women resulting in the imbalanced village demographic of fewer young women than young men (McGregor et al., 2011:23). In addition young people are often underutilised on agricultural activities but burdened by church and family duties. The community and the Church dominate decision-making at the expense of the needs of the individual.

It is in this village context that Tutu RTC finds the balance between tradition and individual autonomy and works with the communities in the interests of the trainee and, as a result, the village. McGregor et al. (2011:58) concluded:

*Had the TRTC not existed a high percentage of these 1,000 or so young adults who participated in the programs would have likely joined the outmigration from the Province with little prospect of securing worthwhile formal employment in urban areas.*
Kedrayate (2001:81) labels education designed to solve community needs through community as non-formal education (NFE). In fact Kedrayate used Tutu RTC as an example of NFE (2001:87). NFE, the type practiced at Tutu, is traditional or indigenous education (Kedrayate, 2001:94; Thaman’s personal communication, 2011) and, as defined in Chapter 2, place-based education. Furthermore, in Chapter 2 of this study, PBE and indigenous education were found to fit a postdevelopment-inspired education framework. Table 5.1, below, establishes the training at Tutu RTC is postdevelopment-inspired place-based education by aligning the principles of PBE identified in Chapter 2 with the fieldwork findings of Tutu RTC.

Table 5.1: Alignment of Tutu RTC and PBE Principles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Place-based education principles</th>
<th>Aligning features of Tutu RTC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Autonomy</strong>: self-determination and personal sovereignty</td>
<td>The overarching goal is personal autonomy for trainees. Tutu has some Government and NGO funding but experiences limited top-down control.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Deconstruct</strong>: critical thinking, counter hegemony</td>
<td>Challenges village structures as well as the hegemony of formal schooling, employment, and western epistemology.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reconstruct</strong>: culture, language, tradition</td>
<td>Non-formal indigenous education, self-employment, and Fijian customs, epistemologies and values are emphasised.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Localise</strong>: community</td>
<td>Emphasises the village, local enterprise, halts outmigration and challenges harmful customs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Partnerships</strong>: with benevolent outsiders</td>
<td>Constructive partnerships with village communities, produce-buyers, NGOs and Government.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The aim of this thesis is to investigate if education informed by postdevelopment can contribute to community wellbeing. This chapter has shown the training of Tutu RTC is an education alternative consistent with the broad principles of postdevelopment and
promoting of indigenous values and ways of knowing. The next chapter explores the case study data of Tutu RTC to investigate if this postdevelopment-informed, alternative education makes a significant contribution to community wellbeing.
CHAPTER 6: TUTU RTC AND COMMUNITY WELLBEING: THE FINDINGS

6.1 INTRODUCTION
The aim of this thesis is to explore if an alternative education, informed by postdevelopment and indigenous values, offers advantages over formal education in contributing to community wellbeing. The study positions enhanced community wellbeing as a measure of education effectiveness. This positioning reflects Gruenewald’s (2003:8) question which asks if education does not enhance wellbeing what then is it for.

This chapter specifically addresses the third thesis objective which is to examine if Tutu RTC provides an example of an alternative approach to education which promotes community wellbeing. This objective has two parts. The first examines if Tutu RTC is an example of alternative education fitting a postdevelopment framework and adhering to indigenous values. Chapter 5 concluded the courses offered at Tutu RTC do indeed offer such an education alternative. This chapter deals with the second part of the third objective which asks: Does the education at Tutu RTC promote community wellbeing?

Data collected from Tutu during the fieldwork will be used to ascertain local perceptions of wellbeing as definitions of wellbeing are culturally rooted (Christopher, 1999 cited in Ryan and Deci, 2001:19). A synthesis of Tutu fieldwork data on wellbeing will be compared to the summary of wellbeing tenets that emerged from the literature review in Chapter 3. Having defined broad characteristics of the Tutu community’s perception of wellbeing, the fieldwork data will be examined to reveal the effectiveness of Tutu RTC in attaining that wellbeing. Interview, observation and document analysis data will be used in this examination. The contribution of formal secondary schooling to wellbeing is also explored to understand the relative merits of each educational approach and provides a point of reference for the effectiveness of Tutu. The chapter concludes with an evaluation of the postdevelopment-informed, place-based education of Tutu RTC. This will direct the path to generalisations on alternative education and the contributions it can make in other forums.

6.2 TUTU PERCEPTIONS OF WELLBEING
The meaning of wellbeing is controversial and unresolved (Ryan & Deci, 2001:19). That meaning is further complicated by its dependence of the cultural background and the
locality of the subject. Therefore the interview question on perceptions of wellbeing required flexibility. “What contributes to your wellbeing?”; “What is the good life for you?” and “What is your dream?” are used interchangeably to extract the local Tutu community’s understanding of wellbeing.

Fijian indigenous writer Nabobo-Baba (2006) uses the term “good life” and Solomon Island academic Gegeo (1998) uses it extensively when coming up with an alternative to the western economic-focused term development. The term was well understood by the Tutu community. Similarly the concept of the student’s dream was used as a goal setting exercise for each of Tutu’s courses. Singer Celine Deon’s “The Power of the Dream” song is played regularly to the new student intake. A flexible use of these terms generated thoughtful responses from the interviewees.

The responses were categorised initially into extrinsic and intrinsic wellbeing as discussed in Chapter 3. Ryan and Deci (2000:71) defined intrinsic wellbeing as occurring from doing activities for the inherent satisfaction of the activity itself. Intrinsic wellbeing is referred to by Chambers (1997:1748) as ‘ends’ wellbeing. Alternatively, extrinsic wellbeing is doing an activity in order to obtain some separable outcome. Money and possessions are extrinsic motivations. Chambers referred to extrinsic as ‘means’ (to an end) wellbeing. Throughout the thesis extrinsic wellbeing is referred to as material wellbeing.

**Tutu Perceptions of Extrinsic/Material Wellbeing**

Every student interviewed, past and present, mentioned building a house as important for the good life. Isake (2011) spoke for many in his response

*I heard about Tutu as a way to build my house. We had someone in the village that came back from Tutu, I didn’t know what they did there but he came back and got a house and a wife.*

Significantly, a house as important for wellbeing was expressed by only one non-student interviewee. An explanation for this is twofold. Firstly all other participants were older and likely to be living in their own home or in a house on site negating their motivation for a house. Secondly building a house from the earnings while on the YFC is a realistic challenge and therefore one that neatly fits the student’s five year plan. As such building a house formed a prominent part of each student’s ‘dream’.
Less than one third of those interviewed mentioned money as a component of the good life. Of those all but two saw it as synonymous with building a house or creating a farming business. One of the remaining two would use some money “to see the world” (Joji, 2011), and Joeli (2011) stated “if you put some money in the bank you gain interest”. A key informant added when the current grandparents were the student’s age, money was not required as the whole village helped to build the house and provide necessities (Wami, 2011). Living in the village in Fiji requires more cash as lifestyles become less self-sufficient.

An emphasis on material wellbeing is evident in the Tutu Study Tour (2011:10) document. The second of the two main objectives of the Young Farmers Course states:

*To establish young people as farmers, and run their farm as managers at home, and the build their own house.*

Owning a house and the money required for its construction and financing the setup of the farming enterprise are considered by Tutu RTC as critical requirements. However, Ryan and Deci (2000:8) cautioned that extrinsic goals can detract from wellbeing. Material aspirations can conflict with self-initiated and shared intrinsic activities. They found the more people focus on materialistic and financial goals the lower their wellbeing (2001:13-14). None of the participants interviewed appeared to be in danger of this fate.

It should be stated that the wellbeing presented here was that of the Tutu student, staff or associates. Other Fijians, even those from the village, may have different views. Indeed it has been well documented already in this thesis, that parents see a successful result of formal schooling as gaining paid employment in the larger towns. However the scope of this section does not allow a discussion of this paradox which has been well dealt with in previous chapters. The focus here is to simply report the views of the Tutu community.

**Tutu Perceptions of Intrinsic Wellbeing**

Ryan and Deci (2000:7) list relatedness, autonomy and competence as the three “innate, essential and universal” needs for intrinsic wellbeing. They describe relatedness as the need to feel belonging and connectedness with others and with a locality (2000:6). They judge relationships as the single most important factor in intrinsic motivation (2000:14). They also recognised an inherent need for individuals to exercise their areas of

---

3 Terms like universal are considered counter to postdevelopment thinking. However the authors are not saying how these needs would 'look' in any given society so the use of these terms is judged acceptable.
competence. Exercising competence necessitates personal autonomy which they describe as acting on one’s volition (2001:20). They contend that “no single phenomenon reflects the positive potential of human nature as much as intrinsic motivation” (2000:3). Alienation results when these three intrinsic wellbeing needs are not met they add.

The descriptions of Ryan and Deci help clarify the intrinsic wellbeing categories and provide assistance in the data analysis of the ‘good life’. Expressing competency will be considered part of autonomy as demonstrations of competence will occur if the freedom of true autonomy exists. Therefore autonomy and relatedness present a useful intrinsic division.

a) Autonomy
All courses at Tutu RTC specifically mention autonomy as one of their primary aims or objectives. The Young Single Women’s Course (YSWC) objectives state

To be autonomous, creative and self-sufficient through developing her special talent or gift (Tutu Study Tour, 2011:18).

This objective reflects two of Ryan and Deci’s (2000, 2001) three needs, namely autonomy and competence.

Sixteen of the nineteen (84%) interviewees mentioned autonomy, by inference, as part of wellbeing. Whereas Stefano spoke about “being my own boss” and Joji expressed it as “coping with difficulties”, staff used more sophisticated terms such as “a life of struggles requiring us to create solutions” Levani and “freedom to think and feel what he wants, free of religious, cultural and village constraints” Kesa. Meanwhile Lauan simply expressed autonomy as “to take charge”.

It seems the rationale for the emphasis on autonomy at Tutu moves beyond Ryan and Deci’s grassroots ownership and responsibility as noted in Kesa’s comment about being free of religious and cultural constraints referred to in the paragraph above. Kenneth believed there needs to be a balance between belonging and autonomy. This was restated in a journal entry following a conversation with the same Tutu staff member:

In the west they seek independence but in Fiji it is dependency. What we are going for is interdependency.

The Tutu Study Tour (2011:5) continues this theme noting
Many books and programs produced in the western world are focused on developing ‘belonging’ and [this] can further add to the suffocating and oppressive religious and cultural structures in the Pacific that inhibit the need to develop a greater sense of personal and group autonomy.

This reflects the Tutu view that the western people lack belonging but Fijians are inhibited by it. Clearly autonomy and belonging are seen as vital elements of intrinsic wellbeing within the Tutu community on a number of levels. The tensions between autonomy and belonging are well noted and this is an area of specific focus by Tutu RTC. To achieve self-determination and autonomy the training at Tutu RTC requires strategies for challenging traditional systems which are oppressive.

b) Relatedness

Relatedness is critical for generating intrinsic wellbeing. This study uses Ryan and Deci’s description of relatedness as the need to feel belonging and connectedness with others and with places (2000:6). In other words relatedness is the strength of relationships human and non-human. Relatedness can be understood in terms of the word *Vanua*. Indigenous Fijian Nabobo-Baba (2006:x, 155) describes the Fijian term *Vanua* as embracing the people, their chief, their environment, their spirituality, their history, epistemology, culture and all relationships embraced within it. When the right leadership by the chief creates a “good life to the people” by promoting and maintaining all the dimensions of *Vanua* “… that results in the community being saatu (well)” (2006:84). Therefore enhancing the “… relationships with others and with the land, spirits, resources and environment …” enhances community wellbeing in Fiji (Nabobo-Baba, 2006:77-78). Relatedness is an essential component for wellbeing.

For consistency the wellbeing framework discussed and synthesised in Chapter 3 of this thesis will be employed here. The chapter found relatedness (or connectedness) occurred as ‘people to people’ and ‘people to place’ relationships. This place/people distinction will be used to present findings that identify relatedness (or connectedness) as important to the good life.

**People relationships**

Three types of ‘people to people’ relationships emerged from the fieldwork findings.
(i) Family

Of the nineteen interviews, 74% referred to some aspect of family as important to the good life. Responses included finding a wife, having a family, looking after parents or children and good relationships generally.

The Tutu Study Tour booklet discusses the six months Married Couples Course and the shorter Village Courses. The aims and objectives of both courses are to develop spousal relationships and upgrade parenting skills (2011:3). In fact all courses have an “emphasis on communication skills, human relationships, sexuality and marriage” (2011:10). The importance of family at Tutu is evidenced by staff being hired as couples. All three couples interviewed mentioned the personal and professional benefit of working as a couple and Kesa and Lauan commented that it creates important role-model opportunities for the young adult trainees. Tutu sees quality family relationships as an important aspect of intrinsic wellbeing.

(ii) Community

Tutu refers frequently to the network of human relationships using phrases such as “appreciating the gift of their own persons” and “an emphasis on communication skills and human relationships” (Tutu Study Tour, 2011:10). Its importance is further emphasised by a leadership skills for village life component on all courses. The Study Tour booklet illustrates the community (albeit global) emphasis in the following the Young Farmer’s Course objective (2011:10):

To help them grow in understanding of the world around them and to stimulate their awareness of how they can make a positive contribution to determining the nature of that world.

In an article in the booklet (2011:8) discussing the structure of the courses the priority of community is evident:

We believe the dedication and devotion of church personnel, the strong network of human relations and trust at grass roots level ... are all integrally essential elements in the rural development of peoples.

Tutu sees its role as not only nurturing the individual but enhancing the whole community:
The choice to accept with joy the special call to be of the village and the call to service in the very heart of the village lifestyle today is the gospel choice” (2011:31).

Tutu argues that the moral choice is to be at the centre of community (2011:32).

Mirroring participant support for family, 74% of interviewees referred to community being synonymous with the good life. Most of these talked specifically about community, the village or relationships.

(iii) Culture

Only three participants referred to culture and in each case they talked about traditional values. However religion, which loosely fits in the realm of Fijian culture, was mentioned as being important by four other interviewees. This, to some extent, reflects the categorising of references to village as a proxy for community when it could be argued that the intent was the traditions and culture of the village. A further explanation is that concepts such as tradition and custom are such a way of life it is difficult to see them as separate characteristic of wellbeing.

Tutu emphasis on culture is demonstrated by the YFC objective:

To help them gain an understanding and appreciation of cultural awareness, economic and social changes and Christian development. (Tutu Study Tour, 2011:10)

In discussing the dilemma of finding the balance between the traditions of the Fijian village and the new village reality of materialism and independence, the Tutu Study Tour booklet (2011:32) states:

The wise person of the village has his life in his own hands, reads the signs of time, discerns the best of the Vanua, knows his resources and manages them with wisdom and knowledge. He serves others (in particular] the Vanua) as he serves his family economically, socially and with joy. He believes this is his special calling.

Clearly Tutu sees culture as critical but here the directive is to evolve to a moderating hybrid comprised of the best of tradition with the inevitability of western culture. This is a tension that will be discussed later in section 6.3.

An important aspect of culture is language. “Language is like a container inside which is packed our values, cultures and what is distinctive about us as Pacific peoples” (Nabobo-
Baba, 2012:38). Nabobo-Baba asserts if a language is lost the sustainability of the culture is seriously at risk. Tutu RTC concurs with this as illustrated by the fact that all training occurs in the local vernacular.

Relatedness to ‘place’

In addition to relatedness to others, the fieldwork data showed relationships with a place was also seen as important to wellbeing. Two main types of place connectedness emerged land and locality and each will now be discussed.

(i) Land

Land is used in the broader sense to refer to the soil, environment, ecology and the spirit of the land. Of the nineteen people interviewed 37% mentioned an aspect of land. Expressions like living from the land and to be a farmer on the land were used. Ilai, a young farmer, expressed it with passion:

I am sweating every day. So many people want to go to the town but for us it is in the soil. In the village it is good to be in the soil. If you want the money, you can’t get it if you don’t sweat. If I don’t sweat then I am not a man. When you sweat you feel good, you feel strong.

Tutu RTC recognises that there needs to be a strong connection between the training at Tutu and the land each student farms in the village (Study Tour, 2011:7). Oscillating between Tutu and their own land makes each student’s learning authentic and purposeful. Nabobo-Baba (2012:23) in describing Vanua (land and all it harbours) explains “… it defines their [Fijian] identity, their culture, their spiritual roots, their relationship, their knowledge and language”. When these aspects of the land are nurtured the people experience sautu (wellbeing). “Sautu is therefore a very desirable and sustainable state for the people of the Vanua” (Nabobo-Baba 2012:33).

(ii) Locality

The terms locality, village and culture are difficult to separate. Many of those interviewed, (53%), referred to the village being important for wellbeing. Village refers partly to the culture and partly about the belonging to and identity from the locality. Geoff expresses this in saying wellbeing occurs from “… a productive life in the village, a life with meaning and belonging”.

103
Learning during each of the courses takes place in the home village, through the oscillation process, and the language of instruction is the local vernacular. This shows the importance that Tutu places on retaining connections through locality and in turn sustaining the village.

Indigenous knowledge and its creation is integral to the *Vanua* (Nabobo-Baba, 2006:84) and therefore to wellbeing in Fiji. “Indigenous knowledges are linked to long term everyday occupancy, knowledge production and experience of living in a particular location” (Nabobo-Baba, 2006:xvi). She adds indigenous knowledge is one of localised ownership belonging to a specific place and all histories are local histories (2006:xviii). Connectedness with your locality, which is nurtured and sustainable, is essential for wellbeing.

**Summary**

Essentially wellbeing, as defined at Tutu, is the connectedness people experience with other people and with the places they inhabit. People relationships were divided into family, community and cultural relationships. Place connectedness has been identified as occurring through relationships with land and through locality. Two cross-cutting values emerged: autonomy and sustainability. The need for a balance between personal autonomy and depth of connectedness were revealed as critical. Further each category of relatedness must be sustainable. The Tutu community’s definition of wellbeing will be used in the next section.

**6.3 The Effectiveness of Tutu RTC in Promoting Wellbeing**

The previous section examines Tutu understandings of wellbeing. This section explores Tutu RTC’s effectiveness in terms of extrinsic and intrinsic wellbeing. Income and building a home are used as indicators for extrinsic or material wellbeing. Intrinsic wellbeing will be considered against the five features of connectedness identified. Each relationship (family, community, cultural, land and locality) will be explored through the fieldwork data to ascertain if these features are promoted by Tutu RTC. As part of this process an assessment will be made on the balance between autonomy and belonging for each feature. Finally in this section the effectiveness of Tutu RTC’s training will be judged on the enhancement and sustainability it promotes for each of the five relatedness categories.
MATERIAL WELLBEING
McGregor et al. (2011:26) explain most Tutu RTC YFC graduates can generate good livelihoods through exceptionally good incomes. The 2011 graduates can expect to gain an average income of $28,000 per annum. The 2007 graduates averaged $11,000 which is “well in excess of what could possibly be earned in informal wage employment if such jobs could be obtained” (2011:26).

The YFC offers young men a sustainable lifestyle (McGregor et al, 2011:27). Not only do a high percentage of YFC graduates return to farming their own land, but most participate in commercial agriculture for the remainder of their working life.

Most young men use the funds saved during their YFC training to build their own house. “For the 37 Young Farmers who completed their course in 2007, 34 have been able to finance the building of a house on their own land” (McGregor et al., 2011:29). Similarly six months before the completion of the current intake, 27 out of 48 had already completed the building of their house.

The compulsory savings system at Tutu also allows the young men and women graduates to finance the start-up costs of their enterprise unencumbered by debt (McGregor et al., 2011:58). YFC graduates have an enhanced material wellbeing when compared to their counterparts in formal employment. In addition their lifestyle promotes autonomy and has proved sustainable.

INTRINSIC WELLBEING
The five elements of intrinsic wellbeing will be dealt with separately.

(i) Family relationship
A cycle of dependency of young people on their parents to provide for their necessities is disempowering and can lead to a breakdown in that relationship. In addition parents tend to see paid employment as a successful outcome and remaining in the village as failure. This creates low self-esteem for those who return to the village (McGregor et al., 2011:8). Father McVerry, quoted in McGregor et al. (2011:10), explains a majority flee to the urban world and become squatters to avoid the frustrations of village life. “Our challenge is to work with those who remain behind …”. Tutu works to facilitate the trainees to have access to their own land and break the cycle of disincentive. Tutu RTC invests considerable effort to challenge cultural barriers and generate parental support (2011:9).
The Parent’s Course has been an important part of reconstructing and reconnecting the foundation between the parents and their children (McGregor et al., 2011:38). Parents and trainees discuss expectations. Parents believe their children are obliged and indebted to them so the young adult’s autonomy becomes central. “The aim [of Tutu RTC] is to take the duty out of the relationship and give freedom to the relationship” (McGregor et al., 2011:38). To achieve balance between tradition obligation and autonomy trainees are encouraged to give a share of the proceeds from their land to their parents. Jimilai, a current Young Farmer, explained:

*It has really really touched our lives. We don’t have to depend on our parents; our lives are in our hands.*

Family connections are also enhanced by the role modelling by staff couples and through the subject Human Development. Topics within Human Development related to family are: knowing myself, accepting my masculinity/femininity, marriage, basic child psychology and responsible parenting (Tutu Study Tour, 2011:4). “Most of the Young Farmers interviewed agreed that this component of the programme gave them a realisation of their purpose in life” (McGregor et al., 2011:30). The young women trainees mirrored this response.

**(ii) Community relationship**

Villages in Fiji are under pressure. Young people are lured to the towns for paid employment or seek an escape from the pressures of the village (Kedrayate, 2001:7; Tutu Study Tour, 2011:31). This youth migration, particularly of young women, threatens the sustainability of the village. Tutu confronts these two main issues that lead to outmigration, the lure of employment and village pressures, and offers solutions.

The lure of paid employment is misleading. Over 50% of school leavers return to the village without paid work or further study (McGregor et al., 2011:x). Tutu RTC offers another way such as young men earning incomes higher than that of paid work through a farming enterprise in the village. McGregor et al. (2011:30) concludes Tutu RTC has made a difference in this area. They concluded:

*Tutu’s prime objective is to train people to return home to farm their own land. It has been highly successful in achieving this objective. Had Tutu not existed, a high percentage of the 1,000 or so young men who participated in the programmes would*
have likely joined the outmigration from the province with little likelihood of gaining worthwhile employment in urban areas.

Key informant, Geoff Bamford, emphatically illustrated Tutu RTCs success in halting outmigration:

I am an agriculturalist. All my working life I have endeavoured to assist rural youth to become young farmers using their land back in the village. Tutu seemed to be the most successful programme I had seen anywhere in 50 years of looking at models worldwide. I had been all around the Pacific and to Africa and had not seen anything as good as Tutu. In our evaluation in 2011 (the McGregor et al. report) it proved to be – 90% back on the land.

The second reason impacting the community village relationship is the issue of outmigration. This occurs due to parental, traditional and religious obligation. These obligations which originate from Vanua customs mask the reality that people are not living as sharing communities but rather individual economic family lives (Tutu Study Tour, 2011:31). This document adds:

Traditional subsistence life is no longer a reality. Commercialism, materialism and individualism have taken root in the modern village life (2011:31).

While the Vanua requires gifting and sharing, family life in the village needs money to feed, clothe and educate. This struggle creates a tension between belonging and economic individualism.

Tutu RTC seeks another way. Instead of the dependence of the village culture or the independence of modern life, an alternative, interdependence, is practiced. Through Tutu RTC’s training, the traditional structures are interrogated and differentiating between the healthy and unhealthy practices is discussed. Trainees learn to uphold the good practices and adapt those that erode autonomy. This gives life to the individual as well as village society. The wise person utilises the best of the traditions and manages their resources to best serve their family (Tutu Study Tour, 2011:32).

As noted previously, Kesa, a teacher, believes people are imprisoned by their cultural, religious and family obligations. The interdependence approach by Tutu releases them. Interdependence occurs when the community understands this traditional/modern hybrid
and uses the village structures to assist local enterprises. This understanding is able to take root through the spreading influence of the five courses offered by Tutu RTC.

Examples of the community wellbeing engendered by Tutu RTC are expressed in the following interview responses:

*My heart is in Tutu.* (Joji)

*Tutu is not a school but a second home.* (Levani).

*It is almost as if it is as life is supposed to be.* (Niko).

*When I first came to Tutu I was shocked, trainees were self-confident and planned ahead. This is not normal in Fiji.* (Sekeli).

(iii) Cultural relationship

Tutu RTC nurtures the bond between the trainee and their culture. For example the centre prescribes the home village period of a trainee’s five week oscillation. Three days are spent working on their own farm, one day working with the family for subsistence and cash crop production and one day per week on village community work (McGregor et al., 2011:23). This maintains a balance between traditional obligation and personal sovereignty.

As mentioned in the previous section, language is the carrier of culture and at Tutu RTC all courses are conducted in the local Fijian dialect. The Tutu Study Tour document explains this is because the skills are to be used for self-employment in the local village. The alternative language, English, is used for formal employment in urban areas (McGregor et al., 2011:52). In addition Tutu was reluctant to expand both the Young Farmer and Young Women’s courses beyond the province of Cakaudrove despite the Fiji Government request to do so. That reluctance, in part, was due to maintaining the cultural relevance of Tutu RTC’s training.

An example of a custom that is promoted is the kava ceremony. The Young Farmers participated in a ceremony every Friday and it both affirmed the local culture and modelled moderation. I observed two such events and can testify to Tutu’s achievement of both goals.

The level to which the Tutu community engenders community is evidenced by the key informant Wami’s comment:
The programme spreads the goodness by trainees living the values learnt at Tutu. They don’t explain about Tutu – they just live out what they have learned.

Clearly Tutu courses add to the sustainability of village culture by offering a blend of financial viability and traditional values that complement the modern reality of village lifestyles.

(iv) Connection with the land
Kedrayate (2001:7) found the result of village migration to urban centres is overcrowding, unemployment and crime. Contrasting with this scenario is the success of Tutu RTC graduates in generating fruitful lives from the soil. That success is highlighted by Geoff Bamford, a person with unequalled agricultural education experience in the Pacific: “This is the most successful agricultural programme I have seen in 50 years.” Because of his conviction Geoff Bamford financed the Tutu Study Tour in November 2011.

Nabobo-Baba recognised that land defines Fijian identity, culture, spiritual roots, relationships and knowledge (2012:23). Clearly when people are able to use land to provide for their families, the very feature that provides meaning to life, intrinsic wellbeing is generated. Tutu RTC has provided this opportunity for their trainees by establishing commitments for the use of mataqali (clan) land and autonomy and agricultural skills for the trainees. Ilai, a trainee, sums up this opportunity in saying: “At Tutu you don’t get a piece of paper, you get a life”. In addition this lifestyle is particularly sustainable as McGregor et al. (2011:27) recognised “… most participate in commercial agriculture for the remainder of their working life”.

(v) Relationship with locality
Tutu RTC has helped to retain young people in their localities and its influence is widening. Emori, a non-Tutu RTC staff-member reaches the same conclusion: “Tutu has influenced people’s lives and is spreading”. Culture, local knowledge and sense of belonging are generated by a fixed locality. Lauan, a staff member, remarked “Tutu has become a model for the village”. As mentioned in the above paragraph, the connectedness of the Tutu graduates with their locality is long term and sustainable.

In addition Village courses have been run by the Tutu RTC since 1972. These have spread beyond the Tutu catchment into the rest of Vanua Levu and other parts of Fiji. The course is run by five Tutu staff and volunteer couples and promotes the village through marriage support, communication and leadership. It is estimated over 30,000 adults have benefited
from these courses (McGregor et al., 2011:38). Tutu staff believes the Village Course has impacted positively on local village life through strengthening indigenous values while promoting autonomy.

In Summary this section evaluated Tutu RTC on its effectiveness in promoting wellbeing for the community. The characteristics of wellbeing upon which that effectiveness was judged were generated from the Tutu fieldwork data. The evaluation exercise shows Tutu RTC encourages autonomy, is sustainable and has a profound effect on community wellbeing.

6.4 THE EFFECTIVENESS OF FORMAL SCHOOLING IN PROMOTING WELLBEING
Just as Tutu RTC was interrogated against the wellbeing features in the previous section, Tutu impressions of formal education will be examined against their own identified features of wellbeing.

MATERIAL WELLBEING OF FORMAL EDUCATION
Owning a house and generating sufficient income are used as material wellbeing criteria. Paid employment is available only in urban settings. The exception to this is work in tourist resorts and these positions, largely taken by young women, are often menial and poorly paid. Kedrayate (2001:7) reports unemployment in the large towns is high because young people from the village compete against urban school leavers for scarce jobs (69% of the unemployed in 1992 were youth). Regular income is rare and modest so the chance of migrants from the village owning their own house is minimal.

Interview participants were asked how formal schooling had contributed to the good life. A variety of answers were given regarding the benefits of school, none of which related to intrinsic wellbeing. A cross-section of responses is included here. One occurrence common to a number of participants was a noticeable pause in response to ‘how does school promote the good life’, question. The pause occurred while the interviewee searched for something positive to say. A significant number (33%) gave the single answer of English or Mathematics indicating this was the only significant benefit that came to mind, from as much as ten years of schooling.

Many participants (44%) were critical of formal schooling. The sentiments that follow reflect some of the responses given to the question asking for the contribution formal education has made to the good life.
Joji, who has completed tertiary study, observed

*Formal education works on one side of the brain.*

*You get some paper, but where to? (Ilai).*

This reflected his belief that academic qualifications often do not lead to a job.

*Employers set the agenda and syllabus for formal education and the situation out there sets the syllabus for non-formal education* (Kenneth).

*School provides training to leave the rural area, even Navuso* (Geoff Bamford).

Geoff Bamford, one of the interviewees during the fieldwork, was principal of Navuso Agricultural College in Fiji for 12 years. He organised the Tutu Study Tour.

Finally, Sisa suggests that the ‘disconnect’ created by schooling for students, also occurs for to the teachers.

*They [teachers] do it for the money, not much inside aye.*

A local village high school teacher of English explained motivation is a considerable struggle in the formal school setting (Journal, Nov. 2011). This contrasted with the Young Farmers who were so motivated they worked on their farms until dark (Journal, Nov. 2011).

Only one respondent, a teacher of the Married Couple’s Course, had positive comments on formal education:

*All our children have good jobs in Suva [as a result of formal schooling] and they have kept the Tutu values we taught them*” Suliana.

Suliana mentioned she and her husband would eventually sell their land and house on Taveuni as their children would not return to live.

Kesa noted:

*What we see is the ones who go to school will talk, the other ones have a lower self-image and we have to build on that. We must put in a lot of time with these students.*
Though Kesa implies years at school is correlated to higher self-esteem it was not clear if the lower self-esteem of early school leavers was the result of less exposure to school or the students carrying the burden of their own perceived failure at school.

**Intrinsic Wellbeing of Formal Education**

This section assesses the Tutu community’s responses on formal education contribution to a student’s connectedness through their human relationships with family, community and culture and the place relatedness to land and locality.

Significantly no participant, interviewed or observed, made a connection between formal education and any aspect of intrinsic wellbeing when asked in what way formal education contributes to wellbeing. Though Ryan and Deci (2000) emphasised the intrinsic qualities of autonomy, competence and relatedness as essential for overall wellbeing, none saw formal schooling contributing to these qualities. However Suliana observed, in spite of their formal schooling, her own children kept the values she and Levani taught them. Also Kesa and Niko observed those with more secondary education had higher self-esteem. As discussed above the interpretation of this observation is ambiguous.

Formal schools are the antithesis of granting autonomy. The curriculum, culture, instruction and systems require conformity rather than autonomy. Kenneth states the curriculum and qualifications are “the employer’s agenda”. Kesa observed school “teaches discipline through systems to obey”. A need to show competency can also be a casualty of formal education. Isake believed schooling is only for a talented few conceding “I have not a good mind”.

School is seen as a way for parents to wash their hands of their child education. Timoci lamented non-formal education options, aside from Tutu are available on Taveuni:

*but the parents don’t support them – maybe too much grog (kava) drinking by parents so it is easier to just send them to school.*

Furthermore, after 50 years in rural education, Geoff Bamford concedes “formal education is really training to leave the village”. He concluded this form of education, even the agricultural college Navuso where he was Principal, leads to rural youth becoming alienated and redundant in their own village. The resulting disconnectedness threatens the wellbeing of the community and the sustainability of the village.
Table 6.1, below, summarises the interview data collected on how Tutu RTC and formal education promote community wellbeing.

**Table 6.1: A comparison of Tutu RTC and formal schooling in relation to promoting community wellbeing**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Wellbeing characteristic</th>
<th>Tutu RTC</th>
<th>Formal schooling</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Material wellbeing</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House ownership</td>
<td>Most Young Farmers build own home at graduation.</td>
<td>Unlikely to own their own home if in paid employment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
<td>Income exceeds those in paid employment</td>
<td>Income is often exceeded by Tutu RTC graduates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intrinsic wellbeing</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy and competency</td>
<td>Overarching goal is personal autonomy.</td>
<td>Schools are centralised. School leavers often left with a ‘dropout’ label.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family relationships</td>
<td>See this as critical to Tutu’s success and Parent’s Course to builds this relationship.</td>
<td>Parent passes responsibility for education to school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community relationships</td>
<td>Emphasises local enterprise thereby halting outmigration and generating sustainability.</td>
<td>Promotes a global outlook at the expense of the ‘local’ threatening the sustainability of their community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural connectedness</td>
<td>Learn in local vernacular and through and about culture.</td>
<td>Diminishes local knowledge so loss of culture and values.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship with land</td>
<td>The central focus of the training is utilising the land.</td>
<td>Learning is geared towards the urban environment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connection with locality</td>
<td>The curriculum is learning to live well in the village</td>
<td>The learning renders the village redundant.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.5 CONCLUSION

This chapter has sought to answer the question: “Does the education at Tutu RTC enhance community wellbeing?” To answer this question a local Tutu perception of wellbeing was required. Ryan and Deci (2000) found wellbeing to have both material and intrinsic dimensions and this served as a useful division for analysis.

The characteristics of intrinsic wellbeing that emerged from the Tutu fieldwork data aligned very closely with the qualities of wellbeing when viewed through a
postdevelopment lens. This was explored in the literature review of Chapter 3. It identified wellbeing as having two broad intrinsic relationships, ‘people to people’ and ‘people to place’. The Tutu data’s features of people’s connectedness with others, family, community and culture, and peoples connectedness with places, land and locality, were essentially the same as Chapter 3. The conclusion reached as a result of this close alignment is that indigenous Fijian perceptions of wellbeing adhere closely to a postdevelopment-inspired understanding of wellbeing.

Two cross-cutting themes were identified through the data as important for wellbeing at Tutu. The first is self-evident. Clearly the source of the wellbeing, the five relationship categories, must be sustainable. For example there cannot be community wellbeing if the actions generating that wellbeing create net outmigration rendering the village unsustainable. The second theme is autonomy. The five relationships, family, community, cultural, land and locality, must be balanced with personal autonomy to remain sustainable. In other words these relationships must be equitable and two-way.

The findings described above from the good life data created a framework through which the training of Tutu RTC and formal education could be understood and evaluated. The assessment of Tutu RTC under this framework, Objective 3 of this study, was that Tutu does an exceptional job in enhancing community wellbeing. The potential is created for material wellbeing to be greatly increased and the five relationships for intrinsic wellbeing are nurtured through the courses and the follow-ups. Strategies for ensuring these relationships are two-way are an integral part of the training. McGregor et al. (2011) has found the community wellbeing emanating from the courses is not only sustainable but its reach is spreading.

Formal education responses were analysed against the Tutu wellbeing criteria. It was noticeable that interviewees struggled to relate what they learned at school with ‘the good life’. Table 6.1 shows, according to those interviewed, the training at Tutu RTC is much more effective in promoting community wellbeing that formal schooling.

Chapter 7 asks: What are the implications of these findings and can they be generalised to urban settings in Fiji? This may lead to further generalisations for education in the Pacific and other indigenous settings as well as how we educate in the western world.
CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSION, DISCUSSION AND IMPLICATIONS

7.1 INTRODUCTION
This thesis has examined the training of Tutu RTC in Taveuni Fiji. The examination was conducted on the basis that the objective of education is wellbeing. As outlined in Chapter 1 the study had one central aim and three objectives that acted as scaffolding for that aim which is:

**Aim:** To investigate if a postdevelopment-informed alternative approach to education is more effective in promoting community wellbeing than conventional education.

The three objectives supporting this aim are:

**Objective 1:** To articulate how indigenous and postdevelopment thinking can inform an alternative approach to education.

**Objective 2:** To define and posit the promotion of community wellbeing as an indication of educational effectiveness.

**Objective 3:** To examine if Tutu RTC provides an example of an alternative approach to education that enhances community wellbeing.

This final chapter places the findings of the previous two chapters in the context of the thesis aim and objectives. The first two objectives relate to the two literature review chapters, Chapters 2 and 3, and the third objective relates to the two chapters that present the research findings, Chapters 5 and 6. The aim of the thesis is dealt with in this chapter, the conclusion. The approach to achieving the thesis aim is to discuss and draw a conclusion on each of the objectives. This process culminates in an overarching conclusion relating specifically to the studies central aim. The thesis concludes with a discussion of the limitations of the research and its conclusions and some ideas for future research.

7.2 REFLECTION ON OBJECTIVES AND CENTRAL AIM
In this section the three objectives will be discussed separately and a conclusion for each will be reached. The process leads to an examination of the overall aim of the thesis.
Objective 1: Defining an alternative approach to education informed by postdevelopment

Formal education, like development, has its dissenters. Indigenous writers in particular criticised conventional education for replacing the local culture with western monoculture (Thaman, 2007); creating elite capture for the few and poverty for the rest (Prakash & Esteva, 2008); and disconnecting students from their families, communities and environment (Gatto, 2009:130).

Postdevelopment offered a radical alternative approach to development practice. In addressing the first objective Chapter 2 discerned five principles of postdevelopment practice. They are to gain the autonomy to exercise self-determination and sovereignty; an exercising of that sovereignty to deconstruct and dehegemonise western notions of colonialism and neo-colonialism; reconstruct and recolonise the region with a focus on local assets and needs, and epistemologies; to be locally focused; and to form hybrid enterprises with partners external to the locality. These five principles were used as a postdevelopment framework in the research.

Education was then explored to inspect alternative approaches that adhered to these principles. Two alternative approaches were identified as conforming to postdevelopment thinking. The first, place-based education (PBE) focuses on local ownership of the education provision, involves a locally-focused curriculum, teaches critical thinking, and encourages hybrid partnerships with central government (Gruenewald, 2003). The second alternative approach concerns indigenous education where the curriculum is built around the assets and needs of the community and is taught through the local culture. In effect this form of indigenous education is a subset of PBE. The conclusion from Objective 1 is that place-based education (PBE) and indigenous education, as defined in this study, aligns with postdevelopment-informed education.

Objective 2: Posit community wellbeing as an indicator of education effectiveness

To examine the relative merits of formal education and PBE an education effectiveness indicator was needed. Chapter 3 established wellbeing as that indicator and explored the nature of that wellbeing. Two categories of wellbeing were identified, extrinsic or material wellbeing and intrinsic wellbeing. The extrinsic motivation of material gain is needed when the activity such as work or study is not intrinsically motivating. Too much
emphasis on material motivation can be destructive of wellbeing as it is often contingent on non-autonomous employment thus reducing a person’s connectedness to their community (Ryan & Deci, 2001:148-149). Therefore, for the purposes of this study and harmonising with the Tutu community’s priorities, the material wellbeing indicator was limited to owning a house and achieving a liveable income.

The three intrinsic motivations of autonomy, demonstrating competence, and relatedness are essential to wellbeing (Ryan & Deci, 2001:141). Relatedness (or connectedness) was divided into a person’s relationship with people and with ‘place’. People relatedness was categorised into family, social capital, community and cultural relationships. Place relatedness was divided into environment, ecology, commons, history and locality. These dimensions were refined according to the Tutu community’s priorities to generate five categories of relatedness: family, community, cultural, land and locality. These categories formed the intrinsic wellbeing indicators.

The conclusion of objective 2 is that the above material and intrinsic wellbeing categories were supported by the literature and aligned with the Tutu community’s perceptions and can therefore be used as the basis for interrogating the effectiveness of place-based education and formal school education.

**Objective 3: Examine Tutu RTC as an alternative approach to education that enhances community wellbeing**

This objective relates to the fieldwork conducted at Tutu RTC. Chapter 4 described the research methodology used and Chapter 5 and 6 presented the findings from the fieldwork. Therefore Chapter 4 lays the foundation for the next two chapters to be able to achieve this final objective.

In fact this objective was divided into 2 parts. The first part related to ascertaining if Tutu RTC could be described as an alternative approach to education. The alternative referred to here is postdevelopment-informed education and is manifested in place-based education (PBE) and autonomous forms of indigenous education. Objective 1 presented five criteria defining a postdevelopment framework. These criteria were compared to the education at Tutu RTC. Table 5.1 of Chapter 5 demonstrated that Tutu RTC aligned very closely with PBE and the principles of postdevelopment. Reinforcing this conclusion local academics Thaman (2011: personal communication) and Kedrayate (2001) use the training at Tutu
TRC as an example of indigenous education. This establishes the training at Tutu RTC is an alternative approach to education that fits a postdevelopment framework.

The second part of Objective 3 asks does Tutu RTC enhance wellbeing? The wellbeing criteria are presented in Objective 2 above. Data collected from the fieldwork on Tutu perceptions of wellbeing, referred to as ‘the good life’, was crosschecked with these wellbeing criteria. The Tutu wellbeing perception data yielded most of the elements of wellbeing discerned from the literature review of Chapter 3. They were home ownership, sufficient income to meet their needs, autonomy, and relatedness with family, community, culture, land and locality. These form a significant subset of the synthesis of wellbeing literature from Chapter 3. That the elements of wellbeing from the literature review and the Tutu perceptions of wellbeing so closely align verifies the authenticity of each wellbeing description.

Having established and verified the wellbeing criteria for Tutu RTC, Chapter 6 analysed the interview data against this criteria. In addition, the chapter analysed the Tutu documents and participant observations to triangulate the three data sources. This process of interrogating all data sources against the Tutu wellbeing criteria validated the conclusion which was common to all three sources. Tutu RTC is particularly successful in promoting community wellbeing.

Bringing together the two parts of Objective 3 allows the conclusion to be made that Tutu RTC is an example of an alternative approach to education that enhances wellbeing. Moreover, that alternative approach represents education through a postdevelopment lens, and it is an example of ‘local solutions for local needs’ indigenous education (Thaman, 2011), and it can be called place-based education.

Having achieved these three objectives, it now clears the way to assess the central aim of this thesis.

**Thesis aim:** To investigate if a postdevelopment-informed alternative approach to education is more effective in promoting community wellbeing than conventional education.

The steps required to achieve this aim have been largely completed through the achievement of each of the three objectives. They showed a postdevelopment-informed alternative approach to education is highly effective in promoting community wellbeing.
The one aspect of the aim that remains is to discover if the alternative approach is more effective than formal education in promoting community wellbeing.

This is not a comparative study and therefore fieldwork was not undertaken for a formal school. However the reference in this study’s aim to the comparison with formal education was necessary to provide a touchstone for the study. The formal education touchstone for this thesis was founded on three approaches. The first approach involved a critique of formal education in Chapter 2 highlighting the clear parallels education has with orthodox development (see Table 2.1). Studies on World Bank education policy by Jones (1995, 2007) as well as World Bank and UN reports were consulted. Also indigenous and alternative education writers were explored. A clear view that formal education fails to meet the needs of many communities emerged.

The second approach focused on formal education in Fiji and presented in Chapter 5. Fiji MoE and UN reports were consulted as well as local writers (Nabobo-Baba, 2006, 2012; Kedrayate, 2001; Thaman, 2007) to reveal the state of formal education in that country. Again it was evident that formal schooling in Fiji is not making a positive contribution to the lives of many of the young people of Fiji or the communities to which they belong.

The third approach was to gain an understanding of how school education was perceived by the Tutu community. This involved asking for them to describe the ‘good life’ and then answer how Tutu RTC followed by school has contributed to helping achieve that good life. Chapter 6, and in particular Table 6.1, conveys those responses. It showed, though trainees were grateful to learn English, they were not able to articulate ways in which their formal schooling promoted their wellbeing.

The education benchmark of formal education in Fiji was revealed by the second and third approaches outlined. Where Tutu RTC creates stronger sustainable relationships, across the dimensions of wellbeing, formal education weakens these relationships and, in some cases, threatens the sustainability of rural and urban life (Kedrayate, 2001:7; McGregor et al., 2011). Coxon and Munce believe neoliberalism poses a threat to semi-subsistence lifestyles (2008:148) and, as argued in this thesis; formal education is an efficient vehicle for neoliberalism. In addition, the interview data shows that formal schooling for the Tutu community has, at best, had a neutral relatedness effect on students, whereas, Tutu RTC creates a strong connectedness with people and ‘place’. This thesis therefore concludes an
alternative approach to education (Tutu RTC) is more effective than conventional education in enhancing community wellbeing (in the Tutu community).

Though this conclusion has achieved the aim of the thesis in the context of Tutu some generalisations can now be explored.

7.3 GENERALISING FROM THE TUTU CONTEXT
This thesis has demonstrated PBE is more effective than formal education in promoting community wellbeing in the Tutu community. However can this be generalised? There are two levels of generalisation.

**Generalisation 1:** Indigenous education (or PBE) is more effective in promoting community wellbeing in indigenous communities than conventional education.

The first level is, given Tutu RTC represents indigenous education in an indigenous setting, can the study's conclusion be generalised to all indigenous education in a predominantly indigenous setting? Specifically, is all indigenous education (or PBE) more effective in promoting community wellbeing in indigenous communities than conventional education? Though it is tempting to decide in the affirmative some rigour is required to be definitive. Postdevelopment thinkers would argue each indigenous region has their own diverse wellbeing criteria. In addition each indigenous education centre must determine its own brand of indigenous education (or PBE). However, though each situation is unique, it is likely the wellbeing criteria for indigenous groups are similar and would fit within the ‘people’ and ‘place’ dimensions of wellbeing presented in Chapter 3, the majority of which were discerned from indigenous writers. Furthermore, though autonomy means creating a group’s own education characteristics, the centre’s features will not deviate significantly from the five generic postdevelopment principles. Therefore this study concludes an education which adheres to the principles of autonomy, de/reconstruct, community and hybridity is more likely to foster connectedness in an indigenous context than conventional schooling.

**Generalisation 2:** PBE is more effective in enhancing community wellbeing in all community settings, than conventional education.

This wider generalisation of the thesis conclusion, namely that Tutu RTC is more effective than conventional education, posits that PBE is a more effective education option than formal schooling in all circumstances. Much of the literature reviewed and discussion
resulting from it in this study has not been specific to Fiji or indigenous peoples. Indeed the arguments have been deliberately kept general even though the fieldwork was specific to Tutu in Taveuni, Fiji. The second and most profound generalisation, then, is argued through the literature, and the fieldwork is used merely as an illustration of it.

In the opening paragraph of this thesis Jones asks where should the balance be for education’s focus within the mix of moral – material aspects of education “so that human dignity, diversity, equity and freedom rest easy with tangible material needs” (2007:xii). This study refers to the ingredients of the Jones moral - material dilemma as intrinsic and material wellbeing. Clearly PBE positions that balance at the intrinsic end. Jones, a long-time researcher on the influence of the World Bank on education, argues formal western-style education is predominantly concerned with building human capital for economic growth and material wealth (2007:xii; 1995). Clearly Jones, and the evidence of this study, concludes western education has a predominantly material focus within education.

Many writers conclude economic growth is not sustainable (Schor, 2010; McEwan, 2009; Goulet, 1992). Growth creates pollution, disparate incomes leading to excessive wealth and abject poverty, depletion of resources, and global warming (Schor, 2010). Yet western school education, which has become compulsory global schooling, is primarily concerned with economic growth. On this basis education promotes a message that is ultimately destructive of wellbeing. However the alternative approach to education, PBE, promotes local solutions to building on local assets and local needs. Those needs and assets are seen as nourishing connectedness with people and places as well as material aspects of livelihood. PBE fosters relationships and connectedness which reduce income disparity and strive for equity, embrace diversity and preserve the environment. Clearly the alternative to conventional schooling, PBE, promotes sustainability.

Indigenous societies have a natural affinity for schooling, such as PBE, that emphasises intrinsic wellbeing (Penitito, 2004:18). However the strength of relationships engendered by intrinsic learning has the potential to create wellbeing for all peoples (Ryan and Deci, 2000; 2001). PBE also encourages autonomous learning that grants students the freedom to pursue their interests and exercise their competence (Littky, 2004). Autonomy, competence, and relationships are key to wellbeing and “thwarting these needs will result in negative psychological consequences in all social and cultural contexts” (Ryan and Deci, 2001:147). However western education’s emphasis is on material wellbeing at the
expense of intrinsic values (Jones, 2007:xii). While material wellbeing is necessary for livelihood, when extrinsic goals for wealth and possessions exceed the essential livelihood needs, it leads to non-autonomous work and individualism which Ryan and Deci (2001:154) emphasise, reduce wellbeing. In its pursuit of material goals Gatto (2009:130) believes schools in all societies disconnect learners from their families, communities, traditions and adventure.

A system that diminishes intrinsic wellbeing, overemphasises extrinsic wellbeing, and undermines relatedness reducing wellbeing. In fact Jones (1995, 2007) and this study argue that conventional education overemphasises material wellbeing. Alternatively PBE, as has been argued, promotes community wellbeing through the very characteristics that are fundamental to it, autonomy and connectedness. Therefore this study concludes that the place-based alternative approach to education is more effective than conventional education in enhancing community wellbeing regardless of the makeup of the society in which it operates.

7.4 REFLECTIONS ON THE STUDY
Given the profound conclusion of this thesis it is somewhat contradictory that formal education is achieving such dominance globally and place-based education is relatively unknown. This highlights a major obstacle of the study. Although PBE has been shown to be more effective in promoting community wellbeing than conventional schooling it is rejected by the vast majority of education consumers. Future studies might like to consider myriad of answers to the question: “Why do people support formal schooling which decreases wellbeing over alternatives such as PBE that increase wellbeing?”

Leaving the explanations behind the irony of willing participation in a system that can diminish life satisfaction to a future study a solution is to seek PBE hybrids which are state sanctioned, yet deliver intrinsic values (see Gruenewald, 2003, 2008; Littky, 2004; McInerney et al., 2011). This compromise conforms to the postdevelopment principle of partnership. Tutu RTC is the example used in this study. It is largely funded by central government who assumes some control, while Tutu retains operational autonomy including autonomy over the content of the curriculum and the type of qualifications offered (which are their countersigned five year plans). The research has shown in the example of Tutu RTC, this hybrid is highly effective in generating community wellbeing (see the authors listed in this paragraph).
The United States (US) has a system of Charter Schools as discussed in Chapter 3. A number of examples have been included in this chapter including Big Picture schools and First Nation schools. They benefit from more autonomy and a much more intrinsic focus while needing to adhere to the US state qualification system. Sorenson (2008:79) notes this form of PBE partnership can raise test scores and raise wellbeing at the same time. Where the ‘hook’ to capture students for Tutu RTC was the lure of building their own house, PBE Charter School partnerships can attract clientele through the possibility of improved qualifications.

In New Zealand (NZ) the dominant qualification system consists of earning credits. Charter Schools, appropriately called Partnership Schools in NZ, also offer possibilities for PBE hybridity. The hook in this instance could be the availability of credits with which the Partnership School’s flexibility offers some advantages such as easier access to non-academic more intrinsic credits. NZ Maori indigenous-focussed hybrids, locally-focused partnerships, or PBE Partnership School hybrids with an environment focus are realistic possibilities. A legitimate caution to the introduction of Partnership Schools is the motivation behind a group setting such a school up. If the focus is community then this study supports it. However if the motivation is profit then wellbeing outcomes will be compromised by profit.

The limitation of people wanting conventional education over PBE schools can negated through the postdevelopment principle of forming partnerships or hybrids. Working through the country’s centralised education system grants respectability to the PBE school while hopefully allowing enough flexibility to utilise the intrinsic motivation inherent in PBE to generate the qualifications required by the state authorities.

In the spirit of this partnership the last word goes to Pacific Island academic Konai Helu-Thaman. She asks (1999:76) external agents of education support to the Pacific allow local communities to:

> Examine more closely their different indigenous notions of education in order to enable them to bring about the kind of synthesis required of the old and the new, thus bringing about the kinds of educational change that incorporate those values that have helped nurture Pacific cultures for millennia; values that might go a long way to counteract the forces of globalisation.
7.5 IMPLICATIONS AND FURTHER RESEARCH

*Whanau Ora* is a system of funding social services for NZ Maori through Maori run services. Consideration has now been given to funding education through *Whanau Ora*. This study supports the move to self-directed funding and would recommend hybrid, place-based schools be investigated as an appropriate education model.

Charter Schools and Partnership schools are very topical in New Zealand at present. Much negative publicity has been aired but true independent research on how they can form mutually beneficial partnerships with PBE is needed to engender worthwhile debate and potentially positive results for community wellbeing.

A manual on PBE, for Pacific countries and more generally, could be produced for a wide audience such as parents, students and educators. Its focus should be the rationale for PBE and a ‘how to’ guide. Though each school is unique making a prescriptive approach problematic, a step by step approach is possible if major decisions such how to involve the community, and what are the assets and needs of the community that are to be served by the education envisaged. This study reiterates that the greatest asset of all communities is its people. The manual should be guided by the overarching postdevelopment principles of autonomy, deconstruction and reconstruction of local knowledge, community and partnership.

Finally, the real need for change is in the west. It is not poverty alleviation we need but wealth alleviation. There is a ‘disconnect’ that has been described as a ‘spiritual poverty’ in modern western society. Formal education has been a global carrier for the materialism of the west. Western-style consumption is not sustainable. Alternative educational approaches, to which this study adds a few drops, need to be theorised, explored and trialled so the excess of the west makes way for connected citizens locally then globally. Then genuine sustainability for the diverse communities that comprise our planet is possible. Researchers involved in such a quest would be advised to start with indigenous systems of learning, systems that have sustained their societies for millennia.
Bula vinaka

My name is Steve Connor. I am a high school teacher but am currently working on a Master’s thesis project in Development Studies at Massey University, New Zealand. This thesis aims at gaining an understanding about Tutu RTC’s contribution to community wellbeing.

Therefore, as someone who is connected to the Tutu community I invite you to be part of this project and participate in an interview. Participants will include Tutu RTC students, staff, graduates, parents and villagers. By conducting interviews and observing the processes involved with Tutu training, I hope to explore community understandings of ‘wellbeing’ and if Tutu RTC contributes to community wellbeing.

If you agree to participate, I will ask you to sign a consent form. I would also appreciate it if you would agree to have the interview recorded. The interview will take between half an hour to an hour.

You are under no obligation to accept this invitation. If you decide to participate, you have the right to:

- decline to answer any particular question;
- withdraw from the study at any time;
- ask any questions about the study at any time during participation;
- provide information on the understanding that your name will not be used unless you give permission to the researcher;
- and should you have agreed to have this interview taped, ask for the recorder to be turned off at any time during the interview.

Written and recorded data will be kept secure during the research phase and upon returning to New Zealand. All data will be stored safely in locked facilities at all stages of this research. A hard copy of my thesis, summarising the research findings, will be made available electronically through Massey University Library, and I will send a hard copy to the School Principal of Tutu RTC, asking for it to be placed in the school library.

My thesis will not include names of participants. Instead I will pick a pseudonym to keep your information private and confidential.

Thank you very much for participating in this project.

**My contact details are:**

Steve Connor  
109 Watford Street  
Christchurch 8052  
New Zealand  
Phone: +64-3-3523088  
Email: steveandmary06@hotmail.com

**My supervisor’s contact details are:**

Dr. Maria Borovnik  
Development Studies Programme  
Massey University  
Palmerston North 4410  
New Zealand  
Phone: +64-6-3569099 ext 7249  
Email: m.borovnik@massey.ac.nz

Steve Connor
Appendix 2: Question Catalogue

The following questions were used as a guide only. The direction of the discussion was dictated, to a large extent, by the interview participant.

**Current Students** – {Name, gender, age, village, course}

1. What, in your opinion, is a good life? What would you say are the ingredients of a good life (or wellbeing)? What do you think makes you flourish? Do you have a good life? Do you see yourself as flourishing? How do you know? What do people need to have for a good life?

2. What role does the village have in your life? Does the village contribute to a good life? And to wellbeing? Could you give me some examples to show this is so (or not so)?

3. What kind of schooling have you experienced so far?

4. Could you tell me about how you came to enrol at Tutu RTC? How did you apply? When was that? Why?

5. How does schooling relate to how you see a good life and wellbeing? Could you tell me more about this? And what about Tutu RTC and the training? Does this relate to wellbeing?

6. What else could you tell me about Tutu RTC?

7. What are your dreams when you finish Tutu?

**Tutu RTC Staff** – {Name, gender, birthplace, where do you live, position, years at Tutu}

1. What do you like about Tutu RTC?

2. Tell me how you started teaching at Tutu?

3. Had you had teaching experience before you came to Tutu?

4. What is the most important thing education can do for a student?

5. How would you describe the ‘training’ you experience here at Tutu in comparison to ‘schools’?

6. Is there anything about Tutu RTC that you feel could have been done better?

7. On a different topic: how would you describe a good life? Tell me about your thoughts. How about wellbeing? How do you know you are ‘well’?

8. What do you think students need – to have a good life?

9. Do you feel that schooling or Tutu training is needed to lead the good life? Why?
Tutu RTC Graduates – {Name, gender, age, village, course attended, when did you finish}

1. Could you please tell me about your experiences at Tutu RTC? When did you attend this training centre? For how long? Did you enjoy it? What did you enjoy? What did you not enjoy so much?
2. Did Tutu have an influence in what you are doing right now? What is it that you are doing? Tell me more….
3. Could we talk for a moment about something else? I am interested in hearing about your views on: what is a good life? What do you think are the components of a good-life (or wellbeing)? What do you think makes you flourish? What do you think people need in order to have a good life or wellbeing?
4. In terms of your life in this village: How is living in the village related to living the good life? Does the village assist young people to have a good life?
5. I want to talk about school. Do you think it contributes to wellbeing (the good life)? What about the kind of training Tutu RTC has to offer – does this assist young people to have a good life? Tell me more….

Parents – {Name, Gender, course when: past/present, son/daughter, village}

1. Were you happy about your son/daughter’s decision to apply for Tutu RTC? Why?
2. Are you helping / have you helped your son/daughter do well at Tutu? How? Why? Tell me more about your son/daughter’s experiences at Tutu and your involvement.
3. Did your child attend school before enrolling in Tutu RTC? What kind of experiences did your son/daughter have while enrolled at school? And your experiences?
4. On a slightly different topic, I would be interested to hear what you think about: what is a good life and wellbeing? What allows people to flourish? What do you think people need to have a good life?
5. Now about your village: Does the village provide a good life for people? How? And what else would be needed? What about young people?
6. Now about schools: Do schools have something to do with the good-life? Why (why not)?
7. And now about training centres such as Tutu RTC: Do you think it somehow assists young people to have a good life, or to find a good life? How does it do that? If not why not? What else would be needed? Tell me more about your thoughts on training centres/Tutu RTC.
Villagers (Only if time permits) – {Name, village, number of children, children’s schooling, own schooling}

1. What is most important to you in your village?
2. I would be interested to hear what you think about: what is a good life? And wellbeing? What allows people to flourish? What do you think people need, to have a good life?
3. Does the village provide a good life for people? How? And what else would be needed? How about young people?
4. Now about a training centre such as Tutu RTC: Do you think it somehow assists young people to have a good life or to find a good life? How does it do that? If not why not? What else would be needed? Tell me more about your thoughts on training centres/ Tutu RTC?

Key Informant – {Name, birthplace, time at Tutu, position}

1. What is your role in the position you have at Tutu RTC? When did you start? Could you tell me a little more about what this job requires of you? Do you enjoy this? What changes to your role would you prefer?
2. Could you tell me about your views on the background of your students? The effect of this training? Of schooling? Other?
3. I would be interested to hear what you think about a good life. What is a good life? What are the main aspects of a good life? (Or wellbeing? What do you think allows people to flourish)? How would people achieve a good life?
4. Does the village provide a good life for people? How? And what else would be needed? How about for young people?
5. Regarding a training centre such as Tutu RTC: Do you think it somehow assists young people to have a good life or to find a good life? How does it do that? If not why not? What else would be needed? Tell me more about your thoughts on training centres/Tutu RTC.
6. Are you in any way involved in assisting young people to find a good life? In what way is that? Why? Could you tell me more about your role and your views on young people finding a good life?
REFERENCES


