Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
A QUANTITATIVE MODEL FOR THE DESIGN OF
NUTRITIOUS AND ACCEPTABLE FOODS

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment
of the requirements for the degree of Ph.D.
in Product Development at Massey University

Allan Malcolm Anderson
1975
ABSTRACT

A quantitative model was developed for the systematic selection of raw materials for nutritious and acceptable Thai foods. The basis for the quantitative model was linear programming. Unlike most other applications of this technique which considered only nutritional needs, this model also took into account the consumer's requirements for an acceptable food. The development of the model formed part of a research programme in the Food Technology Department of Massey University which is investigating quantitative product development techniques.

The linear programming model was used firstly to select raw material mixes which would satisfy the daily nutritional requirements of the Thai people. Selection was made from a list of 151 available raw materials - 144 indigenous Thai raw materials and 7 New Zealand dairy products. The requirements for 26 nutrients were satisfied. These included protein, fat, calories, fibre, 3 minerals, 9 vitamins and 10 essential amino acids. The lack of specific upper limits on most of the nutrients resulted in solutions with a gross nutritional imbalance. Recent investigations indicate that such imbalances may be detrimental to human health and it is suggested that a more satisfactory diet is one where all nutrients are balanced, at or near their lower requirement levels. Considerable problems exist in achieving a balanced diet using range constraints in the linear programme due to the probability of solution infeasibilities.

Goal programming, an extension of linear programming, has been used in other fields of research to minimize the deviation of solution variables from specific goals. This technique showed potential in attaining a balanced nutritional diet where the goals represented the requirements for specific nutrients. A goal programming model was devised which firstly achieved a balance of essential amino acids as close to that of egg protein as possible. Secondly, a solution was obtained where all 26 nutrients were at
the 'optimum' balance. The achievement of a balanced nutritional diet resulted in a large increase in cost and indicated the importance of careful definition of the requirements for nutritional balance in future research where cost minimization is a priority.

The raw materials selected by both goal and linear programming were totally unacceptable as ingredients in a Thai food dish without extensive processing to change both flavour and texture of the mixture. It was more logical to provide a procedure for raw material selection on the basis of their combined acceptability in a Thai food dish. Nonmetric multidimensional scaling was used to derive a 3 dimensional configuration of 40 raw materials from consumer information on the use of these raw materials in Thai food dishes. The axes of this space represented the dominant properties of raw materials in determining food dish acceptability. An ideal point was located in this space. This point was defined as the 'optimum' combination of raw material properties required in a Thai food dish.

Nonmetric multidimensional scaling provided the basis for derivation of metric scale values for the 40 raw materials and the ideal point. These values were used to derive a linear function relating raw materials to food dish acceptability. This function was used in the linear programming model together with nutritional constraints to provide a systematic method of raw material selection for nutritious and acceptable Thai food dishes. The raw material mixes selected by this model showed a marked improvement over those chosen by the linear programme subject to only nutritional constraints.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The research contained in this thesis was supported by financial assistance from a fellowship provided by Rank Xerox (NZ) Ltd. The allocation of the funds from this fellowship were administered by the New Zealand Dairy Research Institute. Other financial assistance was obtained from a Mauri Brothers and Thomson scholarship.

I will always be grateful to my main supervisor, Dr Mary Earle, for the confidence, encouragement and above all the patience she showed during all stages of the project. To my second supervisor, Dr Bill Schroder, I express my appreciation for his many useful suggestions and criticisms.

The successful completion of the research was largely due to the cooperation obtained from Chulalongkorn University in Bangkok. In particular I would like to thank Patchree for making my visit to Thailand possible, for her help in translating questionnaires and for teaching me so much about Thai customs. I am also indebted to Chaiyute for his help and guidance during my stay in Bangkok and to Kumjon and Yuthana for their assistance with the consumer surveys.

I would also like to express my appreciation to many people, both in New Zealand and overseas, who assisted in a variety of ways. In particular my thanks go to:
Dr Bill Edwardson for initiating the research programme of which this thesis forms a part.
Dr Colin Boswell and the staff of the Computer Unit, Massey University, for the computing facilities and programming advice.
The library staff at Massey University for their willing assistance in locating reference material.
Professor Richards and the Food Technology Department for the use of facilities and for their support throughout.
Dr Ian Spence, University of Western Ontario and Dr John Ogilvie, University of Toronto, for their advice on the application of multidimensional scaling.
Janet Milne for eventually agreeing to type the manuscript and for making such a great job of it.

Finally, to my wife Janet, who has shared in all the ups and downs of the past three years. Her positive contributions to the successful completion of this thesis are too numerous to mention.

Allan Anderson
Palmerston North
New Zealand
December, 1975
# CONTENTS

## TABLES

vi

## FIGURES

viii

## PREFACE

x

## 1. THE ENVIRONMENT AND THE MODEL

1.1 The environment 1
1.2 The model 14
1.3 Summary 17

## 2. LINEAR PROGRAMMING AND NUTRITION

2.1 A brief review of linear programming applications in the food industry 18
2.2 The data required 21
2.3 The raw materials 22
2.4 Nutritional constraints 28
2.5 The weighted average per capita daily requirements 48
2.6 Setting up the data for computer solution 50
2.7 Summary 55

## 3. SOLUTIONS TO THE NUTRITION PROBLEM

3.1 The linear programming approach 56
3.2 The application of goal programming 60
3.3 Goal programming on the amino acids 64
3.4 Goal programming on all nutrients 69
3.5 Summary and conclusions 75

## 4. FOOD CHARACTERISTICS AND CONSUMER ACCEPTABILITY

4.1 What is consumer acceptance? 79
4.2 The classification of sensory properties of foods 85
4.3 The measurement of the sensory properties of foods 96
4.4 The measurement of consumer acceptability of food 104
4.5 The problems in using conventional sensory methods 109
4.6 A study of multivariate techniques 112
4.7 Summary and conclusions 114

## 5. MULTIDIMENSIONAL SCALING - THEORY AND APPLICATIONS

5.1 What is multidimensional scaling? 117
5.2 Nonmetric multidimensional scaling 119
5.3 Applications of multidimensional scaling 128
5.4 Summary and conclusions 132
5. DATA COLLECTION FOR MULTIDIMENSIONAL SCALING ANALYSIS

6.1 General comments on data collection
6.2 Raw material similarity data
6.3 Raw material association data
6.4 'Raw material by use' data
6.5 Food dish similarity data
6.6 Raw material and food dish acceptability
6.7 Summary and conclusions

7. MULTIDIMENSIONAL SCALING ANALYSES

7.1 The application of multidimensional scaling
7.2 Raw material similarities analysis
7.3 Raw material association analysis
7.4 'Raw material by use' analysis
7.5 Comparison of raw material spaces
7.6 Food dish similarities analysis
7.7 Unfolding analysis on the raw materials and food dishes
7.8 Ideal point location
7.9 Summary and conclusions

8. INCLUSION OF ACCEPTABILITY FACTORS IN THE L.P. MODEL

8.1 The derivation of a linear function of acceptability
8.2 Data organization for acceptability optimization using L.P.
8.3 Linear programming solutions
8.4 A summary of the total model
8.5 Validation of the model
8.6 The flexibility of the model
8.7 Summary and conclusions

9. QUANTITATIVE PRODUCT DESIGN IN PERSPECTIVE

BIBLIOGRAPHY

APPENDICES

1. Raw material composition tables
2. Daily nutritional requirements
3. Raw materials used in the nutrition problem
4. Distribution of the Thai population (1970)
5. Solutions to the linear and goal programming applications to the nutrition problem
6. The data for multidimensional scaling analysis
7. Description of 20 food dishes used in the food dish similarity survey
8. L.P. solutions with nutritional and acceptability constraints
## TABLES

1.1 Occurrence of nutritional deficiency among patients attending 62 hospitals in 57 provinces of Thailand (1970)  
1.2 Cumulative percentage of households having income less than a specific class, municipal area and village  
1.3 Percent expenditure per household for consumer goods and services  
1.4 Household expenditure. Percent distribution of expenditure on various food groups  
1.5 Quantities of foods consumed by food groups (1962-63)  
2.1 Summary of linear programming models in nutrition problems  
2.2 The nutrients considered in the problem  
2.3 Sources of raw material compositions  
2.4 Weighed average daily per capita nutritional requirements  
2.5 Recommended daily calorie allowances for infants and children  
2.6 Recommended daily protein allowances  
2.7 Calories from fat in Eastern countries  
2.8 Recommended daily calcium allowances  
2.9 Recommended daily allowances for iron  
2.10 Recommended daily allowances for vitamin C  
2.11 Recommended daily allowances for vitamin A  
2.12 Recommended daily allowances for vitamin B12  
2.13 Recommended daily allowances for vitamin B6  
2.14 Recommended daily allowances for 'free' folate  
2.15 Recommended daily allowances for pantothenic acid  
2.16 Selected essential amino acid patterns  
2.17 Nutrients requiring extra allowances during pregnancy and lactation  
3.1 Percent deviation of nutrients from goal programme on indigenous raw materials  
3.2 Percent deviation of nutrients from goal programme using all raw materials  
4.1 A history of taste classification (Boring (13))  
4.2 A history of odour classification (Boring (13))  
4.3 A system of texture classification (Szczesniak (198))
4.4 Comparison of the suitability of various multivariate techniques for the second stage of the research

6.1 Raw materials used in the multidimensional scaling analyses

6.2 The 15 Thai food dish categories used in the 'raw material by use' survey

6.3 Average level of use in food dishes for 40 raw materials

6.4 The 20 food dishes used in the food dish similarity survey

6.5 Rank order of raw material acceptability

6.6 Rank order of food dish acceptability

7.1 Scale values for the raw material similarity space

7.2 Scale values for the raw material association space

7.3 Scale values for the 'raw material by use' space

7.4 Scale values for the food dish space

8.1 Weighted average daily nutritional requirements for 20-29 year old Thais

8.2 Solutions from the parametric runs optimizing ACCEPT

8.3 Solutions to parametric changes in PREFAC with COMPFAC at zero

8.4 Solutions to parametric changes in COMPFAC with PREFAC at 10.679

8.5 Raw material combinations used in Thai taste panels

8.6 The actual and predicted acceptabilities for 21 raw material mixes
FIGURES

2.1 Linear programming matrix for the Thai nutrition problem
2.2 Row and column summary for nutrition problem. Listed by the SUMMARY procedure LPS/1130
3.1 Effect of improvement in amino acid balance on cost
3.2 Graphical representation of an L.P. problem
3.3 Card input for objective function of goal programme on amino acids
4.1 Part of a consumer behavioural model (Engel et al (43,p46))
4.2 The taste tetrahedron (Henning (81))
4.3 The smell prism (Henning (80))
4.4 A procedure for evaluating texture (Szczesniak and Kleyn (201))
4.5 The 9-point Hedonic Scale
7.1 KYST control cards for scaling solutions in 5 through to 1 dimensions
7.2 Plots for the raw material similarity space
7.3 Plots for the raw material association space
7.4 Plots for the 'raw material by use' space
7.5 Plots for the food dish space
7.6 KYST control cards for the unfolding analysis of raw materials and food dishes
7.7 KYST control cards for the ideal point location
8.1 Plot of PREFAC against COMPPAC for 21 raw material combinations
PREFACE

Food product development is the procedure by which raw materials are selected and then combined through a system of processing into a food product acceptable to the final consumer. For many years, product development has been based more in intuition than on objective judgement. There has, however, been a gradual infiltration of quantitative techniques in recent years in an attempt to bring greater objectivity into the system of product development. Some examples of these techniques are:

Idea generation by systematic methods
Market evaluation based on Bayesian decision tree methods or cost benefit analysis
Formulation based on linear programming methods
Business analysis including market forecasts, market surveys and buyer simulation models.

The introduction of these techniques has been largely in a haphazard fashion. The Food Technology Department at Massey University has begun a research programme to develop a systematic approach to the application of quantitative techniques through all stages of product development. The design of nutritional products for consumers in developing countries is being used as the basis for this programme. An overview of the entire research programme is given in a thesis by Edwardson (41).

Edwardson provided an objective procedure for the selection of raw materials to be used in low cost nutritional products for the Philippines. The major problem encountered by Edwardson was the incompatibility of raw materials selected by linear programming based on nutritional criteria. It was only possible to produce an acceptable product from these raw materials through extensive processing and addition of flavouring ingredients.

It was the object of this thesis to both complement and extend Edwardson's work with the application of the linear programming model to the selection of raw materials for the production of low cost food dishes
which would meet the nutritional needs of people in Thailand. Emphasis was placed on the extension of Edwardson's model to include consumer acceptance criteria. A procedure was devised whereby raw material selection was made on the basis of their predicted acceptability in Thai food dishes.

Thailand was chosen as the environment for the study in preference to the Philippines because a cooperative programme had recently begun between the Department of Chemical Technology at Chulalongkorn University in Bangkok and the Food Technology Department at Massey University. Information on Thailand was therefore more readily available.

Thailand has a reasonable supply of food raw materials and even exports rice and sugar, but problems of malnutrition still exist, particularly in the North and North-east regions of the country. There is a definite need for the locally grown raw materials to be put to the best use through their optimum combination in acceptable food dishes. In this thesis, considerable emphasis was placed on the selection and use of indigenous raw materials.

Supplementation of local materials with imported foods has played an important role in the design of nutritional food products. Included among the most commonly used supplements are dairy products. The use of some dairy products as ingredients in local Thai dishes was evaluated both as complements to indigenous raw materials in the supply of essential nutrients and on their general acceptability in these dishes.

This thesis first reviews the availability of foods in Thailand and then suggests how the linear programming model could be used to design nutritional foods. The nutritional compositional data for a wide variety of indigenous raw materials and imported dairy products were collected, and the per capita daily requirements of the different nutrients in Thailand were found. Using this information in the linear programming
model, raw material mixes were selected to meet the nutritional needs of the general Thai population.

Goal programming, which is basically an extension of linear programming, was applied in the selection of raw material mixes to give nutritionally balanced diets. This technique was also used to evaluate dairy products as complements to indigenous raw materials in providing firstly an ideal balance of essential amino acids and secondly a balance of all 26 nutrients which were considered in the model.

A procedure for raw material selection based on their acceptability in combination in food dishes was obviously required in the linear programming model. A review of the literature relating to sensory evaluation and consumer acceptance of foods failed to provide any procedure which might be used directly. The problems of definition and measurement of the raw material properties which influence the acceptability of food dishes directed the research toward a study of multivariate techniques. Nonmetric multidimensional scaling was identified as a technique which could not only resolve the properties but could also provide metric scale values for these properties which might be used directly in the linear programming model.

A subset of the original list of raw materials was selected. Proximities data on these raw materials were obtained from consumer surveys in Thailand and were subjected to multidimensional scaling analysis. A 3 dimensional spatial configuration of the raw materials was derived and the axes of this space were identified as the dominant properties of the raw materials in determining their acceptability in Thai food dishes. A linear function was derived relating these raw material properties to the acceptability of food dishes in which the raw materials are used. The function was included in the linear programming model together with nutritional constraints to provide a quantitative model for the selection of raw material mixes for nutritious and acceptable Thai food dishes.