Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
TEACHING AND LEARNING IN NURSING EDUCATION:
A CRITICAL APPROACH

JUDITH M. R. CLARE
RGON MA

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN TOTAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

MASSEY UNIVERSITY
NEW ZEALAND
JUNE 1991
This thesis investigates tutors' and students' experiences of teaching and learning nursing during the final year of one three year comprehensive (polytechnic) nursing course. The use of critical social science exposes for critique the ways in which sociopolitical forces constrain individual and professional action. The critical reflexive analysis of the perceptions of nine tutors and thirty eight students illustrate the ways in which dominant ideologies embedded in the social practices of nursing education and health care shape the consciousness of tutors and students towards conformity, compliance and passivity.

Although previous studies provide useful descriptions of socialisation and educational processes, they overlook the importance of the reflexivity of understanding and action, and of the structural constraints in nursing education and practice. By focussing on either individual agency and deficiencies, or on bureaucratic conditions of education and practice, previous studies directed attention away from generating the political knowledge which may have assisted nurses to overcome some of the contradictory and constraining conditions of their practice.

It is the political processes of teaching and learning and their practical effects which are revealed for critique and transformation using a critical reflexive methodology. It is claimed that this methodology motivates research participants themselves to become aware that their preconceptions are shaped by aspects of the prevailing social order such that they are prevented from achieving their nursing ideals and educational goals. Thus, through the processes involved in becoming socially critical, tutors and students would be able to transform those sociopolitical
constraints. Although collective political action is not fully demonstrated in the time frame of this study, it is suggested that engaging in this research has had ongoing liberating effects for the participants.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis is the culmination of many years of reflection and experience in nursing education and practice. I wish to thank many people for their assistance and support throughout this project. Without them the thesis may not have been completed.

Associate Professor John Codd, a superb supervisor and academic mentor whose encouragement, patience and scholarliness allowed me to be myself and who constantly challenged me to think critically and rigorously.

Professor Norma Chick and Professor Ivan Snook, supervisors and mentors who have provided support and criticism at important points in the study.

I especially acknowledge the tutors and students who willingly and enthusiastically became co-researchers reflecting on their own teaching and learning experiences. I hope that the experience of sharing in this research has in some way enhanced their understanding of nursing knowledge and its transmission as it has mine.

My special thanks go to Laraine Ruthborn who provided practical, emotional and intellectual support especially when it all seemed impossible.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

| Abstract | i |
| Acknowledgements | iii |

## PART ONE - INTRODUCTION

### CHAPTER ONE - The Context

- Historical and educational issues and thesis outline  
- Formal nursing curricula  
- Graduate employment  
- Professional socialisation  
- Thesis Outline

## PART TWO - THEORY AND METHOD

### CHAPTER TWO - Previous Studies

- Empirico analytical studies and interpretive studies  
- Empirico analytical studies  
- focal points of empirico-analytical studies  
- The interpretive tradition  
- studies of nurses in the interpretive tradition  
- challenges to interpretivism  
- Critical social science  
- studies using a critical theory approach  
- Summary

### CHAPTER THREE - Critical Social Theory

- Critical theory - a general outline  
- Challenges to critical social theory  
- Critical theory and nursing education  
  - culture  
  - culture and the hidden curriculum  
  - relations of power  
  - emancipatory knowledge and communicative competence  
  - hegemony  
  - ideology  
- Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER FOUR - The Research Process

Introduction
The specific context of this study
the sites
the participants
the curriculum
the fieldwork
The discourse
the interviews
the journals
Objectivity and subjectivity in research
Ethical concerns:
  confidentiality, negotiation and reciprocity
Validity concerns
Summary

PART THREE - THE RESEARCH ACCOUNT

Introduction to Chapters Five and Six

CHAPTER FIVE - Tutor Discourse

The experience of reflexivity
the past
the present
the future
Reproducing cultural knowledge
  knowledge as information
  student centred learning
  knowledge through enquiry
  knowledge through dialogue
Classroom and clinical experience:
  working in two worlds
Summary

CHAPTER SIX - Student Discourse

Themes
Student centred versus tutor directed learning
Reproducing nursing culture
  specific classroom experiences
  examinations
  specific clinical experiences
  power and conformity
  classroom and clinical congruence
  separation of theory from practice
  developing professional competence
Tutor-student relationships
Post graduate employment
Summary
CHAPTER SEVEN - Further Interpretation and Discussion

Hegemony and consciousness 184
Cultural paradox and compliance 187
Sociopolitical domination 189
Knowledge and power 193
Tutor - student relations of power 197

CHAPTER EIGHT - Revisiting the Study

Concluding Statement 206

APPENDICES

1. Massey University Ethics Committee for Research on Human Subjects 208
2. Consent Form 211
3. Project Timetable 212
4.1 Interview Transcript - tutor 215
4.2 Interview Transcript - student group 231
5. Field Notes 247
6. Letters to Participants 250

REFERENCES 254