Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Bodies in Context:
A Comparative Study of Early Childhood Education
in New Zealand and Japan

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
in Social Anthropology
at Massey University, Albany,
New Zealand

Rachael Sarah Burke
2013
Abstract

Early childhood education in both New Zealand and Japan is increasingly being seen as an essential experience for children as evidenced by the growth of the early childhood sector and lively political debate. In New Zealand, the bi-cultural curriculum makes a clear commitment to supporting ethnic diversity in the classroom. While Japanese centres have been categorised as culturally homogeneous in the past, focus is now turning to accommodating children from a variety of backgrounds. In both countries less attention has been paid to the latent cultural assumptions underpinning children’s, families and teachers’ experiences of early childhood education.

Using Tobin et al.’s (1989, 2009) PSC3 methodology to stimulate a multi-vocal text through the use of videotape, this thesis examines how early childhood settings in New Zealand and Japan incorporate these implicit beliefs into pedagogy and practice. This study suggests that implicit cultural practices not only shape many of the interactions of the early childhood context, but also many of these practices often go unnoticed or unrecognised as culturally informed. Using visual methods to reflect on comparative material is a powerful way to reveal hidden cultural assumptions. The video-cued method works to collapse and accelerate the traditional ethnographic fieldwork process as the videos provide a focus for discussion, and help reduce the kind of ambiguity that can occur when interviewing across cultural contexts. Through the layers of dialogue stimulated by the videos, children’s bodies emerged as the locus of the work. Although the body was once neglected as an object of scholarly study, it has now become a significant site for anthropological analysis. Inspired by Foucault (1995) scholars came to acknowledge that the body is not only socially and culturally produced, but historically situated within conceptions of society and nature. Using the theories of Foucault (1995), Douglas (1966, 1996) and Mauss (1973) as a framework, this study argues that the ways in which children’s bodies are constructed, protected, disciplined and challenged provide a useful lens through which to examine unseen cultural practices.

As early childhood settings become more diverse, it is hoped this study will provide points for reflection and offer practical applications for teachers. With this aim in mind, the thesis incorporates film, qualitative interviews, vignettes and personal reflections to make the work accessible to a wider audience than traditional academic writing.
Acknowledgements

There are many people who have kindly contributed towards making this thesis a reality. First and foremost, my heartfelt gratitude must go to the staff, children and parents of the two early childhood centres in New Zealand and Japan where I conducted fieldwork. In order to preserve your anonymity, I will not list your names here, but without your willingness to open up your centres to me, this project could never have been realised. Being followed around by a camera-wielding researcher takes a great deal of bravery and I thank you so very much for your patience, tolerance and interest in my work in the midst of busy teaching and family demands. I hope that you will find something of applied use to your centre within these pages, and that you accept the huge contribution you have made to this study.

I am equally grateful for the support shown by members of the New Zealand and Japanese early childhood community in the form of focus group sessions across both countries. Again, I will not go into specifics so that your confidentiality can be maintained, but I am thankful for the way you generously made time for an emerging researcher. Your insightful comments, discussions, and feedback have provided me with precious insights into the worlds you inhabit.

In Japan, I would like give my heartfelt thanks to all those who supported me by providing accommodation, food, transportation, information and, above all, their valued friendship during my fieldwork: Vicky Kobayashi, Hiroyo and Keiji Sato, Katsuhiko and Hitomi Igarashii, Masayuki and Keiko Maeda, Emi Nakamura, Kayoko Suzuki, Hikaru Kawamoto, Shuji Nakano, Kayo and Masanobu Miki, Midori Sasaki and Caroline Cooley. I am especially grateful to Valerie and Kazuhiko Shimbu for having my son and me to stay for the month that I conducted fieldwork in Hokkaido. I would also like to thank Kiyoko Peacocke for her assistance in translating subtitles for the edited Japanese version of the film, and Andrea Wylie for her proof-reading help.

I owe a great debt to my supervisors, Dr Graeme MacRae, of the School of People, Environment and Planning at Massey University and Dr Judith Duncan, of the College of Education at the University of Canterbury who have kept me moving forward at all times. Their timely wisdom, academic knowledge, perceptive comments and prompt feedback have been invaluable. I am grateful to Graeme for his enthusiasm for this thesis, and for all of the conversations that have contributed to this journey, both anthropologically and personally. Judith, you have supported me not only academically,
but in ways that only another mother can truly understand. Not only have I felt fully supported throughout the research process, but also I feel privileged for the friendship with my two supervisors that will endure after this thesis is submitted. I am also thankful for the help of Dr Elena Kolesova at the Unitec Institute of Technology who served as a co-supervisor in the early months of this study, providing valuable advice on the Japanese cultural context and lending her support to the project.

This study was financially assisted by a Massey University Doctorate Scholarship and by grants from the New Zealand Postgraduate Study Abroad Award Programme and the Massey Graduate Research Fund. This funding enabled me to conduct overseas fieldwork in Hokkaido, which was such an essential part of my research, and helped towards the purchase of video equipment.

Last of all, I would like to thank my family for their love and support: my mother, Lynda Burke, for her faith in my ability to finish this thesis when it all seemed insurmountable, and my husband, Adrian Heays, for his insightful observations, juggling of responsibilities, passion and belief, and above all, for reminding me that there is much more to life than this.

Finally, I dedicate this thesis to my three sons, Finn, Gabriel and Angus, who have each inspired me in different ways to begin, continue and complete this journey.
# Table of Contents

**ABSTRACT**  
II

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**  
III

**LIST OF TABLES**  
IX

**LIST OF FIGURES**  
X

**LIST OF VIDEO SEQUENCES**  
XI

**CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION**  
1

- **Beginnings and endings**  
  The rationale for this study  
  The value of a cross-cultural or comparative approach  
  4  
  6

- **The field**  
  Field site structure and daily routines  
  7  
  13

- **Outline of the thesis**  
  15

**CHAPTER 2: RESEARCH METHOD**  
21

- **Introduction**  
  The aim of this study  
  Focus groups  
  22  
  25  
  26

- **Defining the method**  
  Engaging with the field  
  Technical challenges  
  Translating and subtitling  
  Working with film as a medium  
  28  
  32  
  34  
  36

- **Conclusion**  
  38

**CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGICAL ISSUES**  
40

- **Introduction**  
  40

- **Unpacking the method**  
  Ethical considerations  
  Power and authority in the field  
  Negotiating access to the videos  
  Practical concerns  
  Responsibility to participants  
  Developing sensitivity  
  41  
  43  
  45  
  48  
  49  
  51  
  53

- **Positioning myself in the research**  
  55

- **Theoretical underpinnings**  
  59
Reflections on embodying the curriculum

CHAPTER 7: RISK AND THE BODY

Towards a discourse of risk
The position of children in the risk society
Perilous play: the kindergarten playground as culturally contested space
A pedagogy of risk

Creating real and imagined boundaries to minimise risk
Cultural definitions of safe supervision
The low profile of Japanese teachers
“What happens if there is an accident?”

The use of real tools
Tools as iconic symbols
Assessing the risks and the rewards of real tools

“We don’t encourage using weapons”
Defining objects in play as safe or risky
Risk as meaningful

Perceptions of risk and the body

CHAPTER 8: THE BODY AS A SITE OF DISCIPLINE

Deconstructing noise
Noise as counterproductive
Noise as organic

Conflict and confrontation
Rights discourses in New Zealand
The lessons of conflict

Learning communicative competency
Developing empathy

The use of time and space
Time and space as disciplinary techniques in the Japanese kindergarten
Signifiers of temporal change

Children’s bodies as objects of the medical gaze

Reflecting on the body as a site of discipline

CHAPTER 9: CONSTRUCTING DIRT, POLLUTION AND PURITY

Dirt and the body

The physical body as a microcosm of society
The symbolism of protective barriers
Bodily fluids as metaphors of disorder

Purification of the body
Polluted spaces

Food in and out of place
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rituals around food</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The lunch box as a reflection of cultural ideology</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflecting on constructions of dirt, pollution and purity</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 10: CONCLUSION</strong></td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bodies from the beginning</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constructing the body</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The body and its products</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internalising techniques of the body</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Order and the body</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approaches to dirt and pollution</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future directions</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A story to finish the journey</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coming full circle</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>REFERENCES</strong></td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>APPENDICES</strong></td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A: Human Ethics approval letter</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B: Information sheets and consent forms for participants</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information sheet for staff</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff consent form</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information sheet for parents</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent consent form</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information sheet for focus group participants</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus group participant consent form</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C: Letters of introduction for the Japanese kindergarten</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japanese letter of introduction</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English translation of Japanese letter of introduction</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GLOSSARY OF KEY TERMS USED IN THE TEXT</strong></td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terms from the Japanese context</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terms from the New Zealand context</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical or methodological terms</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

Table 1: Structure of the New Zealand and Japanese centres 18
Table 2: Breakdown of focus groups 24
List of Figures

Figure 1: View of the early childhood centre where New Zealand fieldwork took place 12
Figure 2: View of the kindergarten where Japanese fieldwork took place 12
Figure 3: Oka Kindergarten children 17
Figure 4: Map of New Zealand 19
Figure 5: Map of Japan 20
Figure 6: An excerpt from an article about my research published in a Hokkaido newspaper 29
Figure 7: Japanese children are photographed by a professional photographer during the annual kindergarten sports day 31
Figure 8: Kaimai Kindergarten children 63
Figure 9: New Zealand early childhood centres try to create a homelike environment 74
Figure 10: Parents at Oka Kindergarten watch events at the annual sports day 85
Figure 11: Early childhood experiences mark the transition from home to the education sector 88
Figure 12: Partitioned toilets with lockable doors are a feature of this modern Hokkaido kindergarten 115
Figure 13: Display in a Japanese childcare centre explaining how various actions are related to producing a good bowel motion 117
Figure 14: A New Zealand teacher observes children's play in the sandpit 127
Figure 15: Japanese children enjoy body painting at kindergarten 128
Figure 16: A young New Zealand girl paints a Spiderman design on her friend's face 129
Figure 17: Children at a Japanese childcare centre settle down for naptime 141
Figure 18: Children play a class game on the slide at Oka Kindergarten 160
Figure 19: An unfenced early childhood centre in Hokkaido contrasts with a bounded outdoor area at the New Zealand centre 167
Figure 20: Boys at Kaimai Kindergarten challenge themselves on a beam atop safety surfacing 186
Figure 21: At Kaimai Kindergarten a teacher mediates in a conflict in the sandpit 197
Figure 22: Oka Kindergarten children listen to the morning talk at assembly 203
Figure 23: New Zealand children are encouraged to become confident, competent learners through exploration of their own working theories 210
Figure 24: It is quite common to see New Zealand children playing barefoot both inside and outside 224
Figure 25: A Japanese kindergarten teacher spoon feeds a reluctant child the remains of his lunch 231
Figure 26: Meal times are the focus of protracted rituals at Oka Kindergarten 236
Figure 27: Planting ritual at an Osaka Kindergarten 249
Figure 28: Planting in the New Zealand centre is often instigated by the interests of individual children 251
Figure 29: My middle son and his friend make mochi (glutinous rice cakes) as part of New Year celebrations at their kindergarten in Japan 252
List of Video Sequences

Video sequence 1: Children wait to be washed down by their teacher at Oka Kindergarten 92
Video sequence 2: Girls at Kaimai Kindergarten enjoy a finger painting session 131
Video sequence 3: Children at Kaimai Kindergarten wear smocks during an arts and crafts session 134
Video sequence 4: The teacher uses her body to control Kiharu at assembly 145
Video sequence 5: Boys engaged in carpentry at Kaimai Kindergarten 174
Video sequence 6: At Kaimai Kindergarten a boy brandishes a large stick at children inside a drum 180
Video sequence 7: Peter's bleeding knee 213