

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

ASPECTS OF THE GROWTH OF SELECTED COLD-TOLERANT PATHOGENS
AND *ESCHERICHIA COLI* ON BEEF

a thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree of
Master of Veterinary Science
at Massey University

Michael Philipp Reichel

1992

ABSTRACT

Strains of the cold-tolerant pathogens *Aeromonas hydrophila*, *Listeria monocytogenes*, and *Yersinia enterocolitica* were inoculated onto high-ultimate pH beef slices. Sample steaks were either packaged under vacuum or carbon dioxide atmosphere and stored at temperatures of +10, 5, 2, 0 and -2°C. In vacuum-packaged meat, *Aeromonas hydrophila* and *Yersinia enterocolitica* grew at all storage temperatures at rates that were similar to or greater than that of the spoilage flora. *Listeria monocytogenes* did not grow in vacuum-packaged meat at -2°C, and at higher temperatures generally grew at growth rates similar to or less than that of the spoilage flora. In samples packaged under carbon dioxide, all three organisms grew at +10°C, but only *Yersinia enterocolitica* grew at +5°C. None of the test organisms grew under carbon dioxide at temperatures of +2°C or lower temperatures.

Storage life of high ultimate-pH beef packaged under carbon dioxide atmosphere was extended by at least a factor of two, and at the lower storage temperatures by up to a factor of three if compared with vacuum-packaging.

The hygienic adequacy of a hot-boning process of beef in a commercial New Zealand meat plant was assessed by a temperature function integration (TFI) technique. The potential proliferation of mesophilic organisms was estimated

using the growth of *Escherichia coli* as an example. The growth potential was calculated from 50 temperature histories for the slowest cooling site on a carcass and within a carton. In the first survey of 50 temperature histories the mean calculated growth potential was 9.3 generations of growth, with a mean time of 13.3 hours to reduce the temperature of the meat to +7°C. The mean calculated proliferation for the improved hot-boning process was 7.1 generations of growth of *Escherichia coli* which is comparable to results that had been obtained for conventional cold boning. The mean time to reduce the temperature to +7°C was 12.2 hours with a range from 9 to 16.5 hours. The maximum observed microbial proliferation was less than that found in the conventional carcass cooling operation.

A profile through the geometric centre of a cooling carton of hot-boned meat revealed the location of the point of highest potential proliferation of mesophilic bacteria, i.e. the slowest cooling spot within a carton. In cartons cooling with lids closed over the mass of hot-boned beef this was located at the midway point between the geometric centre and a point halfway between the geometric centre and the surface of the cooling meat mass.

Observed proliferations of inocula of *E.coli* in cooling cartons were compared with the proliferations calculated from the temperature histories obtained from sites adjacent to the inoculas and found to agree within a range of ± 1 generation

in 81% of comparisons. In 62% of comparisons the calculated growth potential exceeded the actual observed growth.

The value of TFI evaluation for the purpose of process assurance and regulatory hygienic processing control is described. Suggestions for a need to assess other current meat processes, in particular, offal cooling for its mesophilic growth potential are made. The possibility of replacing some of the current bacteriological sampling regimes with TFI monitoring is also discussed.

Acknowledgements

Many thanks are due to Prof David K Blackmore who encouraged me to persevere with this project and was a great support in getting it all started. To Dr Colin O Gill who acted as my scientific supervisor, at the Meat Industry Research Institute (MIRINZ) in Hamilton where all the cold-tolerant growth work was conducted, and also during the hot-boning survey which was conducted at the Lowe Walker Paeroa Ltd plant in Paeroa, East Waikato.

During the cold-tolerant growth work I had plenty of advice on microbiological techniques and encouragement from staff at MIRINZ's microbiology section, namely David Lowry, Jackie Boerema and Karen deLacy. At Paeroa John Harrison and Rhys Jones helped to work out the techniques and it was Doug Philipps, from the Engineering section at MIRINZ who developed and refined the computer software.

Thanks are also due to the management and staff at Paeroa, who allowed and/or assisted with the project, foremost John Phillips and Brian Goldsack, but also the meat inspection staff, Ned Hunt, Paul Devery and Jan Melbye who supported me while I was placing and collecting loggers in the freezers.

I am grateful to Prof Colin Wilks, Per Madie and Stan Fenwick who acted as supervisors and who have read and re-read the various drafts of this thesis many times and helped with

their constructive criticism. I am particularly grateful for their support and patience as most of this work was produced away from Massey and especially now, while the manuscript is being prepared in the South Atlantic, their help has been invaluable.

Table of contents:

Title	i
Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	v
Table of Contents	vii
List of Figures	x
List of Tables	xiii
List of Plates	xv
I. General Introduction	1
II. Factors affecting microbial growth	4
1. Substrate and initial flora	4
1.1. Substrate	4
1.2. Initial flora	6
2. pH	7
3. Water activity	10
4. Temperature	12
5. Atmosphere	14
Part 1:	
III. Growth of cold-tolerant pathogens	16
1. Introduction	16
1.1. Changes to consumer behaviour and requirements	16
1.2. Public health implications	17
1.3. Aims of the work	18

2. Selected pathogens	19
2.1. Yersinia	19
2.1.1. <i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i>	20
2.2. Listeria	21
2.2.1. <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i>	22
2.3. Aeromonas	25
2.3.1 <i>Aeromonas hydrophila</i>	26
3. Materials and Methods	28
3.1. Organisms	28
3.2. Preparation of the inocula	28
3.3. Meat samples	29
3.4. Storage of meat samples	30
3.5. Sampling procedure	31
4. Results	34
A. Storage temperature +10°C	38
B. Storage temperature + 5°C	42
C. Storage temperature + 2°C	46
D. Storage temperature 0°C	49
E. Storage temperature - 2°C	52
F. Confirmation of pathogen isolates	55
5. Discussion	57
A. Vacuum-packaged samples	58
B. CO ₂ -packaged samples	59

Part 2:

IV. Temperature Function Integration	66
1. Introduction	66
1.1. Aims of the work	69

2. Materials and Methods	71
2.1. The commercial Hot Boning process	71
2.2. Collection of Product Temperature histories	76
2.3. Integration of temperature History data to calculate bacterial growth	76
2.4. Proliferation profiles of cooling cartons	81
2.5. Evaluation of the hot boning process	83
2.6. Verification of the bacterial growth model	84
2.6.1. Preparation of E.coli inocula	84
2.6.2. Comparison of calculated and observed growth of E.coli	85
3. Results	87
3.1. Plant Survey	87
3.2. Thermal Centre	96
3.3. Comparison of calculated and observed proliferation for E.coli	101
4. Discussion	105
V. General Summary	117
1. Cold-tolerant pathogens	117
2. Temperature function integration	120
VI. References	123
VII. Appendix	137

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Growth of bacteria in (a) vacuum and (b) CO ₂ packs at +10°C.	41
Figure 2: Growth of bacteria in (a) vacuum and (b) CO ₂ packs at +5°C.	45
Figure 3: Growth of bacteria in vacuum packs at +2°C.	48
Figure 4: Growth of bacteria in vacuum packs at 0°C.	51
Figure 5: Growth of bacteria in vacuum packs at -2°C.	54
Figure 6: Dimensions of a carton of hot-boned, bulk-packed beef in the commercial meat process at Paeroa.	72
Figure 7: Positioning of cartons of hot-boned, bulk-packed beef on metal stillages for freezing in the commercial meat process in Paeroa.	74
Figure 8: Positions of metal stillages, cooling unit and fan in a freezing chamber in the commercial hot-boning process at Paeroa.	75
Figure 9: Placement of five temperature logger tips along the vertical axis through	

the geometric centre of a carton of
hot-boned, bulk-packed beef.

82

- Figure 10: Frequency distribution of calculated *E.coli* proliferation values in 50 bulk -packed cartons during the initial assessment of the commercial hot-boning process. 90
- Figure 11: Mean proliferation values for different row positions of cartons in (a) the first plant survey, and (b) the second survey. 94
- Figure 12: Frequency distribution of calculated *E.coli* proliferation values in 50 bulk -packed cartons during the assessment of the upgraded commercial hot-boning process. 95
- Figure 13: Proliferation values (mean of 15) recorded at five points through the geometric centre of hot-boned, bulk-packed cartons with lids either closed or left open during the cooling process. 100
- Figure 14: Scatter plot of calculated against observed growth of *E.coli* on inoculated samples of high ultimate-pH beef that were cooled in cartons of hot-boned beef. 104

Figure 15: The frequency distribution of *Escherichia coli* proliferations calculated from temperature histories for the aitch-bone pocket sites of 50 beef sides cooling in a commercial chiller (from Gill et al. 1991).

107

LIST OF TABLES

Table I:	Proportion of enterobacteria as a percentage of the spoilage flora at different sampling days of high ultimate-pH beef.	36
Table II:	pH-values of CO ₂ -packaged steaks at five different storage temperatures.	37
Table III:	pH-values of vacuum-packaged steaks at five different storage temperatures	37
Table IV:	Values for the spoilage flora, <i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i> , <i>Aeromonas hydrophila</i> and <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> for growth on beef under vacuum at +10°C.	40
Table V:	Values for the spoilage flora, <i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i> , <i>Aeromonas hydrophila</i> and <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> for growth on beef under carbon dioxide at +10°C.	40
Table VI:	Values for the spoilage flora, <i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i> , <i>Aeromonas hydrophila</i> and <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> for growth on beef under vacuum at +5°C.	44
Table VII:	Values for the spoilage flora, <i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i> , <i>Aeromonas hydrophila</i> and <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> for growth on beef under carbon dioxide at +5°C.	44
Table VIII:	Values for the spoilage flora, <i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i> , <i>Aeromonas hydrophila</i> and <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> for growth on beef under vacuum at +2°C.	47
Table IX:	Values for the spoilage flora, <i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i> , <i>Aeromonas hydrophila</i> and <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> for growth on beef under carbon dioxide at +2°C.	47
Table X:	Values for the spoilage flora, <i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i> , <i>Aeromonas hydrophila</i> and <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> for growth on beef under vacuum at 0°C.	50
Table XI:	Values for the spoilage flora, <i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i> , <i>Aeromonas hydrophila</i> and <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> for growth on beef under carbon dioxide at 0°C.	50
Table XII:	Values for the spoilage flora, <i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i> , <i>Aeromonas hydrophila</i> and <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> for growth on beef under vacuum at -2°C.	53

Table XIII:	Values for the spoilage flora, <i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i> , <i>Aeromonas hydrophila</i> and <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> for growth on beef under carbon dioxide at -2°C.	53
Table XIV:	Summary of generation times and time to spoilage for the growth of <i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i> , <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> and <i>Aeromonas hydrophila</i> on high ultimate-pH beef at five different temperatures and two different packaging atmospheres.	56
Tab. XV:	50 <i>E.coli</i> proliferation values, maximum temperatures and time taken to reach +7°C, obtained in the first survey of a commercial beef hot-boning process.	88
Tab. XVI:	50 <i>E.coli</i> proliferation values, maximum temperatures and time taken to reach +7°C, obtained in the upgraded commercial beef hot-boning process.	92
Table XVII:	Proliferation values at five locations along the vertical axis of 15 cartons of hot-boned, bulk-packed beef cooled with their lids closed.	98
Table XVIII:	Proliferation values for <i>E.coli</i> at five locations along the vertical axis of 15 cartons of hot-boned, bulk-packed beef cooled with no lids.	99
Table XIX:	Comparison of computer derived proliferation values with observed proliferation in samples of high ultimate -pH beef inoculated with <i>E.coli</i> .	102

LIST OF PLATES

- Plate 1: Growth of *Yersinia enterocolitica*
on CIN-Agar 139
- Plate 2: Growth of *Listeria monocytogenes* on
Lithium Chloride-Phenylethanol-Moxalactam
Agar 141
- Plate 3: Growth of *Aeromonas hydrophila* on
Starch-Ampicillin-Agar 144