Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
“Kiwis” in the Middle Kingdom

—— A Sociological Interpretation of the History of New Zealand Missionaries in China from 1877 to 1953 and Beyond

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
in
Sociology

at Massey University, Albany, New Zealand

Sylvia Yang Yuan

2013
Abstract

Between 1877 and 1953, 254 men and women went to China as missionaries who were associated with Aotearoa/New Zealand in one way or another. This thesis presents a sociological interpretation of this historical phenomenon using Goffman’s Dramaturgy as a theoretical framework. The dramaturgical narration begins from the “back-stage” of New Zealand as a sending country and then extends to the “front-stage” of China as a mission field. Substantial space is dedicated to a scrutiny of the day-to-day life of “Kiwi” missionaries living in the arena of the “Middle Kingdom”, including adoption of Chinese names, language learning, clothing changes, dietary changes, compound accommodation, itinerant and residential evangelism, medical and educational works, summer retreats, racial and gender dynamics, romance and marriage, child-bearing and child-rearing, and the childhood of “missionary kids”. There were various interludes to their missionary career when their sense of self-identity was heightened and challenged. The change of government in China brought an abrupt end to all missions. Nonetheless, the closing of the “theatre” and the exeunt of the missionary actors/actresses did not bring a full ending to the drama. The researcher tracks the post-China developments of ex-China missionaries in both New Zealand and overseas through a variety of sources to come to the conclusion that the China experiences had a life-long impact on most of these missionaries, and that such impact has extended inter-generationally to their families. Personal interviews have been carried out with 21 available living missionaries and/or their descendants, which provide a unique perspective of missionary lives in China. The researcher’s own subjectivity as a Chinese immigrant who came to the Christian faith in New Zealand also comes into play in the construction of this academic analysis. One crucial element of her subjectivity is her reflection on her aunt’s life-story as an opera actress, running parallel with that of the China missionaries. The historical development of the Chinese immigrant community in New Zealand is interwoven into the story of New Zealanders’ missionary involvements in China at various stages.

Key words: missionary, missionary children, China, New Zealand, Goffman, dramaturgy
Acknowledgments

This thesis cannot be accomplished with the support, advice and assistance of the following people and organisations.

In their roles as supervisors, Associate Professor Peter Lineham and Senior Lecturer Warwick Tie have been exemplary in their professional advice and support, and their passionate interest in the subject materials and theoretical discussion. I am supremely grateful for their generous time, wise counsel, gentle admonition, and consistent encouragement demonstrated over the course of this doctoral research.

I have greatly valued the indispensable professional help of many archivists and librarians. I particularly wish to thank: Kathy Caddy and Rosslyn Devenish (Librarians, Bible College of Victoria, now Melbourne School of Theology); Yvonne Wilkie and Jane Bloore (Archivists, Knox College, Dunedin); Eddie Sun (Archivist, St. Johns Theological Library, Auckland), Jo Smith (Archivist, Methodist Church of New Zealand Archives, Christchurch).

Special acknowledgement is paid to the various members and staff of the OMF office in Auckland, Melbourne, Hong Kong, and in the Singapore Headquarters, including Dr. Patrick Fung (General Director), Tim Cross (State Director of Victoria), Catherine Wu (Personal Assistant, Victoria), Christine Harding (NZ National Director of OMF), Pam Singleton (Administrator, NZ), Tania English (Archivist, NZ), Richard Schlitt (International Director of Evangelisation), Steve Griffith (International Director of Personnel), Dr. Warren Beattie (Director of Mission Research), Kimberly Goh (Liberian at Headquarters), Ruth Page (Personal Assistant to General Director), and Ruth Gould (Guest Home Manager).

I am thankful for the confidence of all people who allowed me to conduct interviews in relation to the missionary heritage of their personal and family life (in alphabetical order): Murray Beck, Dr Phyllis Charlton (nee Taylor), Mary Crozier (nee Jacobs), David Hayman, Linnet Hinton (nee McIntosh), Kathryn Howie, Marion Howie, Margaret Howie-Pask, Ross Howie, Nancy Jansen (nee Langford), Margaret Knight, Margaret Lloyd (nee Howie), Dr. Graham Milne, Margaret Moor, Shona Murray (nee Duncan), Gladys Nancekivell (nee Anderson), Maybeth Roberts (nee Conway), Dr. John Sturt, Po Chue Sue, David Taylor, and Eileen Taylor.

I also acknowledge access given to an unpublished and incomplete database of New Zealand missionaries to 1939 compiled by Hugh Morrison of the University of Otago.

I gratefully acknowledge the generosity of the Tertiary Education Committee for the granting of a Top Achiever Doctoral scholarship, and the Graduate Research
Projects and Funding Committee of the Massey University School of Social and Cultural Studies (and later School of People, Environment and Planning), for the granting of a Graduate Research Fund. These funds enabled archival research to be undertaken in Dunedin, Melbourne, Hong Kong and Singapore.
Table of Contents

Title page i
Abstract ii
Acknowledgements iii
Table of Contents ................................................................. 1
List of Tables ............................................................................. 3
List of Abbreviations ............................................................... 4

Chapter I: Introducing a Dramaturgy of the Missionary Movement ........................................ 5
  1.1. Introducing the Researcher and the Research .................................................................. 5
  1.2. Introducing Existing Literature and Current Methodology ........................................... 7
  1.3. Introducing the Definitions and their Fluidities .............................................................. 9
  1.4. Introducing the “Facts” .................................................................................................. 18
  1.5. Introducing the Epistemological Orientation .............................................................. 22
  1.6. Introducing Goffman’s Dramaturgy ............................................................................ 26
    1.6.1. The “Back-Stage” – Getting Ready for Sailing from New Zealand .................... 33
    1.6.2. The “Front-Stage” – What to Anticipate in China ................................................. 33
    1.6.3. In the Arena – the China Experiences ................................................................. 34
    1.6.4. Interludes – Furlough and Internment .................................................................. 35
    1.6.5. Exeunt – the Withdrawal from China ................................................................. 36
    1.6.6. Epilogue – the Post-China Days ......................................................................... 36

Chapter II: The “Back-Stage” – New Zealand as the “Home-base” ........................................... 38
  2.1. Colonial Christianity and the Emergence of Missionary Interest for China ............... 41
  2.2. The Spectacle of the Chinese Immigrants in Comparison with New Zealand Missionary Recruits for China ................................................................. 58
  2.3. Intertwined Racial and Gender Politics .................................................................... 71
  2.4. Efforts of Home Mission .......................................................................................... 75
  2.5. The Gendered Culture of New Zealand .................................................................... 84

Chapter III: The “Front-Stage” – China as a Mission Field .................................................. 103
  3.1. A Brief History of Christianity in China ..................................................................... 104
  3.2. Mission Societies Prior to the Arrival of New Zealanders ....................................... 112
  3.3. Chinese Chronicle .................................................................................................... 124
  3.4. The Country as the Setting ...................................................................................... 127
  3.5. Chinese People as the Audience ............................................................................. 134
  3.6. China’s Earliest Awareness of New Zealand ........................................................... 142

Chapter IV: In the Arena – “Kiwis” in the Middle Kingdom ................................................ 147
  4.1. Adoption of Chinese Names ....................................................................................... 148
  4.2. Language Learning .................................................................................................. 150
  4.3. Everyday Life of a China Missionary ........................................................................ 153
    4.3.1. Yi (衣) – Clothing .............................................................................................. 154
    4.3.2. Shi (食) – Eating ............................................................................................... 160
    4.3.3. Zhu (住) – Living ............................................................................................. 163
    4.3.4. Xing (行) – Travelling .................................................................................... 173
4.4. Medical and Educational Work ................................................................. 180
4.5. Summer Retreat ......................................................................................... 189
4.6. Racial and Gender Dynamics in the Field ................................................ 192
4.7. Romance and Marriage .............................................................................. 203
4.8. Household Keeping ..................................................................................... 210
4.9. Child-Bearing and Child-Rearing: the Parents’ Perspective ..................... 212
4.10. Childhood in a Missionary Setting: the Children’s Perspective ............... 215
4.11. Conclusion ................................................................................................. 225
Chapter V: The Interludes – Furlough ............................................................. 226
5.1. Interludes during Furloughs ...................................................................... 228
5.2. Interludes at POW Camps ......................................................................... 244
Chapter VI: Exeunt – the Permanent Withdrawal ............................................. 253
6.1. The Change of Tune .................................................................................... 256
6.2. A Reluctant Exodus ................................................................................... 260
6.3. A Personal Reflection ................................................................................ 270
Chapter VII: Epilogue – Post-China Hang-over ................................................. 276
7.1. Post-China Influences in New Zealand ..................................................... 278
7.2. Post-China Influences in Other Mission Fields ......................................... 308
7.3. Intergenerational Legacies ........................................................................ 321
7.4. Conclusion .................................................................................................. 342
Chapter VIII: A Dramaturgy of Multiple Roles .................................................. 344
Chapter IX: Conclusion ...................................................................................... 384
Appendix I: Biography of Known New Zealand Missionaries in China (in Alphabetical Order) ........................................................................................................ 393
Appendix II: List of New Zealand Missionaries and Their Children in POW Camps in mainland China and Hong Kong .......................................................... 475
Appendix III: Template of Interview Question .................................................. 477
Appendix IV: Short Biography of My Aunty (Yuan Xuefen 袁雪芬) .................... 481
Bibliography ........................................................................................................ 485
List of Tables

TABLE 1: NUMBER AND PERCENTAGE OF NEW ZEALANDER MISSIONARIES IN DIFFERENT OVERSEAS FIELDS, 1850-1939. .......................................................................................................................... 19

TABLE 2: NUMBER AND PERCENTAGE OF CHINA MISSIONARIES FROM NEW ZEALAND BY MISSION ORGANISATIONS........................................................................................................... 21

TABLE 3: DENOMINATIONAL BACKGROUND OF CIM MISSIONARIES FROM NEW ZEALAND, 1891-1949............................................................................................................................. 50

TABLE 4: THE DESTINATION OF PCNZ MISSIONARIES, 1866 – 1930....................................................................................... 52

TABLE 5: A BREAKDOWN OF PCNZ’S FOREIGN MISSION NON-CAPITAL EXPENDITURE, 1912/1913 -1934/1935 ............................................................................................................................. 52

TABLE 6: THE DESTINATION OF NZCMS MISSIONARIES, 1893 – 1930.................................................................................... 55

TABLE 7: THE BREAKDOWN OF NZCMS MISSION BUDGET FOR THE YEAR, 1947-1948. ...................... 56

TABLE 8: THE DESTINATIONS OF NEW ZEALAND BRETHREN MISSIONARIES, 1896 – 1930. ............. 58

TABLE 9: MARRIAGE STATUS OF CHINESE IN NEW ZEALAND, 1874-1926.................................................. 68

TABLE 10: NUMBER AND PERCENTAGE OF CHINA MISSIONARIES FROM NEW ZEALAND BY MISSION ORGANISATIONS AND BY GENDER. ........................................................................ 70

TABLE 11: NON-MAORI SEX RATIO (MALE PER 100 FEMALES) BY SELECTED PROVINCES AND THE WHOLE OF NEW ZEALAND, ALL AGES, 1851-1901. ................................................................. 73

TABLE 12: CHINESE RELIGIOUS AFFILIATIONS IN 1936 ......................................................................................... 77

TABLE 13: NUMBER OF MISSIONARIES DEPARTED FROM NEW ZEALAND AT DIFFERENT PERIODS.125

TABLE 14: NUMBER OF MALE AND FEMALE MISSIONARIES SAILED FROM AUSTRALASIA EACH YEAR WITH THE CIM, 1890-1949........................................................................................................ 206

TABLE 15: STATISTICS OF PRISONERS UNDER THE JAPANESE IN WORLD WAR II .................. 249

TABLE 16: A LIST OF SUPPORTING LOCAL CHURCH ORGANISATIONS AND THEIR CVM “OWN MISSIONARIES” ................................................................................................................. 295

TABLE 17: ITEMISED CONTRIBUTION MADE BY DIFFERENT PCNZ’S BUSY BEE GROUPS TOWARDS A. JAMES’ CAR. .................................................................................................................. 296
### List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABCFM</td>
<td>American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BFBS</td>
<td>British and Foreign Bible Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEZMS</td>
<td>Church of England Zenana Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIM</td>
<td>China Inland Mission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CORSO</td>
<td>The Council of Organisations for Relief Service Overseas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSM</td>
<td>Church of Scotland Mission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CVM</td>
<td>Canton Villages Mission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAU</td>
<td>Friends Ambulance Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FSU</td>
<td>Friends Service Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRC</td>
<td>International Red Cross</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LMS</td>
<td>London Missionary Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZCMA</td>
<td>New Zealand Church Mission Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZCMS</td>
<td>New Zealand Church Mission Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCNZ</td>
<td>Presbyterian Church of New Zealand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PWTI</td>
<td>Presbyterian Woman Training Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POW</td>
<td>Prisoner of War</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QKM</td>
<td>Queensland Kanaka Mission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCM</td>
<td>South China Mission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPFEE</td>
<td>The Society for Promoting Female Education in the East</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPG</td>
<td>Society for the Propagation of the Gospel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNRRA</td>
<td>United Nations Relief and Rehabilitation Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WCTU</td>
<td>Women’s Christian Temperance Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWCA</td>
<td>Young Women's Christian Association</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter I: Introducing a Dramaturgy of the Missionary Movement

1.1. Introducing the Researcher and the Research

As the work of an Evangelical Christian woman and a first generation Chinese immigrant who is pursuing a historical project that links her country of birth and country of adoption with a sociological approach\(^1\) in a secular university, this research is destined to be full of paradoxes from the start. There are a number of factors which brought my attention to this particular topic. The seed of this research interest was sown in personal contact with people associated with China missions, which has led me to speculate that New Zealand missionaries to China probably have had a much greater influence in both countries than what is generally recognised. However, as part of my training in sociology, I found the increasing literature on “the Chinese in New Zealand”, whether with historical or contemporary focus, says little about the role that the New Zealand church played in the Chinese community.\(^2\) Equally perplexing, the literature on “New Zealanders in China” makes little reference to the Chinese within New Zealand, although they belong to the same ethnic group that the New Zealanders were prepared to travel by sea to influence.

Reading the history of the Sino-New Zealand civil relations through a multi-angular lens as a New Zealand Chinese Christian woman scholar, I cannot

---

1 For a more in-depth discussion on the relations between the two disciplines, please see Peter Burke, *Sociology and History* (Ithaca, N. Y.: Cornell University Press, 1993).
help asking myself a series of questions: In what terms did the two countries, so culturally and spatially distant, develop an awareness of each other’s land and people from the earliest days? If it appears to be a more rational choice for the New Zealand church to evangelise those “savage isles” closer to home, then, why did generations of enthusiastic young New Zealanders long to sail for a geographically gigantic, logistically inaccessible, and culturally dissimilar country such as China? In what terms did the New Zealand missionaries interpret the Christian message: was it as being acultural and universal, or as part of the western civilisation (perhaps with capital “W” and “C”)? How did the Chinese perception of the New Zealand missionaries vary from the New Zealanders’ own self-perceptions? By what means did the missionaries manage Chinese impressions of themself (that is, enact “impression management”)? In what ways did their China experience impact upon the hierarchical organisation of gender and ethnic relations of that period within Christendom? In what ways might the experience of China have altered the missionaries’ perception of the conditions of Chinese living in New Zealand? To what extent did these missionary messengers take New Zealand with them to China, and to what extent did they take China with them back to New Zealand? Most importantly, how did their China experience change for those missionaries what is commonly now called “a sense of identity” in regard to the questions “Who am I?” and “Where do I belong?” How did the lingering effect of the China experiences manifest in the post-China days of these missionaries’ lives? And how did the children and grandchildren, as well as the “spiritual heirs” of these China missionaries inherit their “China factor”? Due to the complex and interwoven nature of these questions, I have come to the conviction that these can only be sufficiently addressed by a critical dialogue between historians and sociologists.
1.2. Introducing Existing Literature\(^3\) and Current Methodology

A range of literatures influence the methodological and theoretical bearings of the current project. Most mission organisations have kept an archive of primary sources, including applications, correspondence, reports, memoirs, meeting minutes; some have been transferred to an archive centre for better storage.\(^4\) Some families also have preserved diaries and memoirs of their parents or grandparents. In addition to these primary sources, a rich body exists of published church records, mission magazines, biographies/autobiographies, and reference texts, being either contemporary to the time or written retrospectively. Generally speaking, the style of these materials is hagiographical, anecdotal, and non-reflective. Based on these sources of information, a fair number of academic research projects have been completed by secular and theological scholars. These have usually taken the form of MA or PhD theses, usually in history departments. In this latter vein, Richard L. Roberts’ work of the late 1970s\(^5\) is not particularly about China missions, but provides a comparative analysis of the growth of different international mission societies in New Zealand, among which the China Inland Mission (hereafter CIM) is one of the

---


\(^4\) See the relevant section in the Bibliography for details of these archives.

major developments. Several more works were completed in the early 1990s.

Mathew Dalzell focuses his analysis on New Zealanders, missionaries and aid workers alike, in the Republican era\(^6\) while both Evan Moore and Tom Phillips’ work focused on the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand’s (hereafter PCNZ) China Mission only.\(^7\) The 2000s saw the completion of two more works. Hugh D. Morrison’s doctoral thesis provides a general overview of how New Zealand emerges as the home base of overseas mission from 1868 to 1926.\(^8\) Appendix six of his work compiles a list of known New Zealand missionaries from 1869 to 1930, with a valuable summary of demographic details. As a project of Library and Information Studies, Anita Renee Volisey’s MA thesis is more like a bibliography review.\(^9\)

New Zealand missionary endeavour in China has virtually gone unnoticed on the Chinese side. There are several possible reasons: the small size of the New Zealand team in comparison to the English and American counterparts; the peripheral status of Chinese scholars working in the field of mission history due to political sensitivity until recent years; the non-existence or inaccessibility of church archives; New Zealand’s lack of political, academic and medical influence in modern China. Two recent journal article-length publications break the silence: one is the case study of Edgar’s Tibetan study,\(^10\) while another is an overview of

---


New Zealand missionaries in China.\(^{11}\)

The present research employs personal interviews as an additional source of data and this alone marks it out as unique amongst this list of existing literature. The number of surviving China missionaries is getting smaller each year. Family members and missionary descendants are also included as informants and participants. Though my choice of sample is practically the only choice available, I did not see it as a second option, or a substitute in place of something that was unobtainable. Rather, the children’s perspectives open a number of new ways of looking at the missionary experiences of their parents. In Goffman’s terminology, which will be introduced shortly, the children provide a “back-stage” view of their missionary parents that would be otherwise unobtainable. Moreover, most of the missionary children interviewed have entered the later season of their lives themselves, a season in life when they are better abled to re-evaluate their childhood memories and parental influences more reflectively and more conclusively, so the interviewing process elicits a timely reaping of the ripe fruits of these families’ spiritual heritages.

1.3. Introducing the Definitions and their Fluidities

Compared to the English and American schools on mission history in China, New Zealand missionaries in China are an understudied subject.\(^{12}\) Being a critical study, a contestable narration of “New Zealand missionaries in China”

---


\(^{12}\) For example, in the 1966 publication of An Encyclopedia of New Zealand, edited by the Parliamentary Historian, as a result of a Cabinet decision, 31 pages are dedicated to the section on “expatriates” while very little attention was paid to missionaries, and the only person noted under the subheading “China” was a secular humanitarian Rewi Alley (p.578). There are substantial references on missionaries to New Zealand in the Encyclopedia, but hardly any on missionaries from New Zealand.
challenges the usual meaning of every word of this phrase.

Who were the “New Zealanders” in the specified period of this study? “Kiwi-bred”\textsuperscript{13} missionaries began sailing for China over nearly three quarters of a century during which period New Zealand had moved from an imperial to a national constitution via a process of devolution from a Crown colony to representative government in 1852, to responsible government in 1856, to dominion status in 1907, and finally to sovereignty through the 1931 Statue of Westminster, which was not adopted in local law until 1947, and solidified in 1986. It was only two years before the mass withdrawal from China, and when most Missions stopped recruiting, that the British Nationality and New Zealand Citizenship Act created a category of separate New Zealand citizenship. Moreover, the words “British subject” remained on New Zealand passports until 1977, along with “New Zealand citizen”.\textsuperscript{14} It was only in 1983 that New Zealand was formally declared “The Realm of New Zealand” even though the Treaty of Westminster was adopted in 1947, and in 1986 the Constitution Act removed all power from the United Kingdom to legislate for New Zealand. What these historical developments translate into in terms of missiological context is that nearly all “New Zealand” missionaries were holding British passports while they were in China, and most likely saw themselves and were remembered by the local Chinese as English people. “New Zealanders” of the period concerned a state of belonging to what might be called “an international footloose community”. They are only now retrospectively listed as New Zealanders even though they had lived most of their lives overseas (whether in the “field”, in their countries of birth or other countries of adoption). New

\textsuperscript{13} Kiwi is the name of a bird endemic to New Zealand. Since the kiwi is a national symbol of New Zealand, the term “Kiwi” is used as the colloquial homonym for New Zealanders.

Zealand’s smallness and ambivalent status as a modern state has certain bearing on how its missionaries saw themselves and how they were perceived by others. Given this fluidity with regard to national identification, the New Zealanders involved are simultaneously claimed as Australian missionaries (e.g. Florence S. H. Young) or English missionaries (e.g. Samuel Dyer). There are also cases where the New Zealand missions through which the missionaries operated, especially the PCNZ’s China mission, employed foreign workers. New Zealand Church Missionary Society (hereafter NZCMS) also had a couple of English workers transferred to their Organisation from the London based Church Missionary Society (CMS). Therefore, these people were “New Zealanders” only because they had joined a “New Zealand mission”, while others were actually in auxiliaries of international or overseas-based missions. Missions that had originated from Mother England were willingly and warmly accepted in New Zealand. This was different from our current age when the notion of “identity”, national or otherwise, has become almost fetishised, members of these mission organisations back then did not think of themselves as “New Zealanders”. On the other side of the coin, when New Zealanders gained prominence, their nationalities were often misrepresented in publicity.

---

15 For example, Dr. & Mrs. John Kirk (Edinburgh), Dr. Edward Kirk (Edinburgh), Dr. and Mrs. R. E. Patersons (Lanarkshire, Scotland), Mr. and Mrs. A. G. Wilson (Melbourne, Australia), and Natta Yansen (Australia).
16 For example, Dr. & Mrs. Charles Frederick Strange and Muriel Dixon.
17 London based Missions included CMS, LMS, SPG, BFBS, and BMS. The CIM in the 1890s were still largely a British Mission, as its international auxiliaries were in embryo forms. American directions were much less felt by New Zealanders until they arrived in the China field, which was increasingly under the influence of American personnel and missiologies from the turn of the 20th Century.
18 For example, George Shepherd was frequently referred to as an American missionary in overseas literature. Kathleen Hall was referred to as an “Australian missionary nurse” by an American journalist (Agnes Smedley, Battle Hymn of China (London: Gollancz, 1943), quoted in Rae McGregor, Shrewd Sanctity: the Story of Kathleen Hall, Missionary Nurse in China, 1896-1970 (Auckland, N.Z.: Polygraphia Ltd., 2006), 98). Likewise, J. H. Edgar was referred by Chinese scholars as an Australian missionary (Sheng and Chen, “Ye Changqing,” 58.)
Who were “missionaries”? Who did they see themselves as and how were they perceived as “missionaries” then and now? There are a great range of definitions provided in missiology textbooks and general dictionaries on the meaning of missionary. The definition can be as broad as “one who attempts to persuade others to a particular program, doctrine, or set of principles; a propagandist”\(^{19}\) or as narrow as “one who is sent to witness across cultures [the Christian message]”.\(^{20}\) This study limits its scope to Protestant Christian missionaries and as a common protocol for most mission history work, does not include those sent by sectarian groups such as Jehovah’s Witnesses groups and the Church of the Latter Day Saints (Mormon). Although Catholic Missions had had a much longer tradition in China, dating back to the 13\(^{th}\) Century, they are also excluded from this current study.\(^{21}\) In the narrowest sense, a missionary’s job description might appear to primarily be concerned with itinerant evangelism and church-planting. However, from a very early stage the work of missionaries extended into the provision of civil education and medical care. The interchange between evangelical and social missions makes a clear demarcation almost impossible. Mathew Dalzell classifies the CIM as “primarily evangelistic”,\(^{22}\) the PCNZ and NZCMS as “both evangelistic and social”, and the Council of Organisations for Relief Service Overseas (hereafter CORSO) and aid work as “primarily social”. The latter group can be hardly admitted into a “missionary” category even though


\(^{21}\) The exceptions were Dr. George and Margarete Gratzer, who were Jewish by birth, Austrian by nationality, and Roman Catholic by religious affiliation.

\(^{22}\) “Evangelism” is a complex religious concept or phenomenon which is difficult to define precisely. One of the best known summaries is proposed by the British historian David Bebbington, who identified a quadrilateral definition of evangelicalism: 1) conversion (an emphasis on the “new birth” as a life-changing experience of God); 2) biblicism (a reliance on the Bible as ultimate religious authority); 3) activism (a concern for sharing the faith); and 4) crucicentrism (a belief that Christ’s death is the only pathway for spiritual redemption). See: David Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Britain: A History from the 1730s to the 1980s* (London: Unwin Hyman, 1989), 2-17.
they too had what Dalzell called a “transformative intent”. The famous New Zealander in China, Rewi Alley, cannot be classified as a missionary for the same reason even if he had a “mission” to achieve. Having said that, it would be equally unwise to exclude members of these aid agencies from this study as they also worked for Christian missions at times. Another decision to be made is whether to include Friends Ambulance Unit (hereafter FAU) workers as “missionaries”. The purpose of the FAU was to practise humanitarian ambulance and relief work in China without preaching their pacifist ideology. Those who hold a strong evangelistic view would even argue whether British and Foreign Bible Society (hereafter BFBS) is a legitimate mission board. Part of the reason is that the BFBS limited their scope of operation to Bible translation and distribution. Their China “agent”, Samuel Dyer, would have to be taken off the “missionary” list. A similar argument applies to professionals and tradesmen. The mission field absorbed numerous professionals from the beginning in a way churches did not. A considerable proportion of the missionary force was engaged in administrative and logistic support. In some missions (e.g. Methodist Mission), doctors and artisans were categorised as assistants to ordained clergy in the mission field and were forbidden to preach. If this approach is adopted, then architect Andrew G. Wilson has to be dropped off the list. New Zealanders arrived in China in an era when women had earned their place in missionary work. However, missionary wives were customarily omitted in the “the list of workers and stations” in notable texts such as the Proceedings of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian

24 For example, quite a number of the IRC (International Relief Committee) workers were also members of LMS (i.e. Joyce Horner), Canadian Mission Hospital (i.e. Isobel Brown), the PCNZ (i.e. Dr. John Kirk Brown), Soochow Mission (i.e. Reima Henderson), the CMS (i.e. Betty White) (Dalzell, Appendix IV in “New Zealanders in Republican China,” 190).
25 This is probably the very reason that the organisation is not listed in R. G. Tiedemann’s Reference Guide to Christian Missionary Societies in China: From the Sixteenth to the Twentieth Century, while the Friends Service Council (hereafter FSC) of the same denomination (Quakerism) is.
26 Valerie Griffiths, e-mail message to the researcher, April 12, 2010.
Church of New Zealand.\textsuperscript{27} Chinese evangelists of the missions, also, were not classified as “missionaries” but as “helpers”, “teachers”, “evangelists”, “native pastors”, “Colporteurs”, “bible women” etc. Exemplifying the logic in play here is the case of the New Zealand educated Chinese Doctor Kathleen Pih. Dr Pih was not mentioned in the biography of Rev. George H. McNeur, written by the Very Rev. Henry H. Barton (1955), but this omission has since been rectified in Dalzell and Morrison's lists at the turn of the 21st century.

Did missionaries have to be sent “to” China and to work “in” China? Any candidates who did not succeed in his/her application or were unable to proceed to reach the land of China would have to be excluded,\textsuperscript{28} even though they held a missionary zeal toward China throughout their lives. Those who worked in the home mission to the Chinese in New Zealand, such as Alexander Don and church workers of the Baptist and Anglican home missions, can only be defined as missionaries “to” the Chinese rather than missionaries “in” China. Oswald and Edith M. Sanders are listed as missionaries to China regardless of the fact that they had never worked in China.\textsuperscript{29} It is also true that not all New Zealanders who were sent to China were sent to the Chinese. Two New Zealand women (J. H. May and N. May) joined the Shanghai Hebrew Mission to work among the Jewish refugees there. Lastly, it is a deliberate choice to avoid using the preposition “to” in the place of “in” as the former word connotes a subtle dualism of “home country” and “foreign field”. Such a discursive context implies an implicit geo-political hierarchy, wherein a missionary is “sent to” the

\textsuperscript{27} Jeffrey Cox notes that the ABCFM had begun to count wives as missionaries at least by 1880s, but it took several decades for other Protestant missionary societies (particularly the British ones) to follow the precedent (Jeffrey Cox, \textit{The British Missionary Enterprise Since 1700} (New York; London: Routledge, 2008), 196).

\textsuperscript{28} Dr. W. Melville Brookfield and Rev. Alan Brash did not take up positions in China (Brash became the Secretary of National Missionary Council, also the Editor of the book \textit{How Did the Church Get There}?).

\textsuperscript{29} Sanders only made a passing visit to various CIM stations in China about a year after he was appointed the Australasian Director from March 1946. See “Our Home Director in China,” \textit{China Millions} (Australasian version, Nov 1947) 329.
heathen land empowered with an unequal colonial structure between the evangelists and those to be evangelised.

What was “China”? China had gone through a turbulent time during this period of study, moving from an Imperial, to a Republican, and finally becoming a Communist political formation. The size of its territory could change dramatically as the strength of its sovereignty changed. Certain parts of China (e.g. Manchuria, Mongolia, Tibet) were inaccessible at times due to political or military turmoil. To the CIMers, the inland was the “real” China while the treaty ports mattered much less. During the Sino-Japan war, missionaries moved between the “occupied China” and the “free China”. Moreover, Hong Kong as a British colony and Taiwan as a Japanese colony were within China’s territory although not within its sovereignty during this time. Consequently, the study of church history in Hong Kong and Taiwan are conventionally separate from that of Mainland China. Dalzell sees the case of NZCMS missionary Margaret Jennings as “anomalous” since her field of work was in the Diocese of Victoria (i.e. Hong Kong) and thus cannot be “considered to have been active in the Republic of China”. 30 This present study follows the precedent set by previous scholarly work and will concentrate on New Zealanders in the Mainland. A distinction should also be made between the “mission to China” and the “mission to the Chinese”. The former focuses exclusively on the activities which went within the territory of China while the latter has a much broader and even more fluid horizon which will include not only missionary activities in both New Zealand and China, but also those in other countries. Before China was forced to open its gate to foreigners as a result of the Opium War, the majority of so-called “China missionaries” were based in British Straits Settlement. 31 The

30 Dalzell, Appendix III in “New Zealanders in Republican China,” 189.
31 For example, 21 out of the 25 LMS missionaries for the China field sailed prior to 1843, stationed in Pinang, Malacca and Singapore; only eight ever touched the land of China (e.g. Robert Morrison, Walter Henry Medhurst, Samuel Dyer, James Legge), plus another two stayed very briefly in Macao and Hong Kong (e.g. William Milne) (Irene
first Protestant missionary Robert Morrison’s notion of an “Ultra-Gangs Mission” visualised Malacca as part of the “China field”. Within the New Zealand cohort, the Brethren missionary couple Alex and Daisy Barry, who left New Zealand to work among the Chinese immigrants in Australia, should be included in this study if the “mission to the Chinese” approach is adopted. Those who sailed to work among the Chinese residents in Southeast Asia should also be brought into the picture. “The mission to China” ends when China proper was closed to missionary activities virtually after 1950 while “the mission to the Chinese” includes globe-wide activities that continue to this day.

What year should mark the beginning of the periodisation? This question depends very much upon the basis on which any decision on that matter can be justified. One way to approach this matter is to choose the date by the first China missionary from New Zealand and the date at which he/she sailed for (or arrived in) China. Conventionally, it has been believed that the sailing year of the first CIM missionary, Annie Harrison, which marks the beginning of the period (1891). There are also suggestions that a Mr. Dyer joined the CIM as early as 1875. A more recently released source suggests that this person was Samuel Dyer Jr., son of the LMS missionary Samuel Dyer, brother-in-law of the founder of the CIM, born in Malay, educated in England, who spent 17 years in

---

Chang 张陈一萍 and James Hudson Taylor III 戴绍曾. Appendix 10A: List of LMS China Missionaries (1807-1843) in Even to Death – The Life and Legacy of Samuel Dyer 《虽至于死 —— 台约尔传》 (Hong Kong: OMF, 2009), 290-292.) Up to the end of the first Opium War, only 18 of the 59 western missionaries lived in Macao and Canton, the rest of them based primarily in Southeast Asia cities including Singapore, Malacca, Batavia, Pinang, Siam, Bangkok, Borneo, and Sumatra (Zhu Feng 朱峰. Jidujiao yu haiwai huaren de wenhua shiying: Jindai dongnanya huaren yimin shequ de gean yanju 《基督教与海外华人的文化适应：近代东南亚华人移民社区的个案研究》 [Christianity and the Cultural Adaptation of Overseas Chinese: A Case Study of Chinese Immigrant Community in Modern Southeast Asia] (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju 中华书局, 2009), 7.)

32 See James Ng, Windows on a Chinese Past, vol.2 (Dunedin, N.Z.: Otago Heritage Books, 1995), 194, and endnote 24 on page 215; Morrison, “‘It is Our Bounden Duty”, 33, and footnote 79 on the same page; Evangelist, Dec 1875, p.4. This person is omitted in Dazell’s list.
New Zealand and Australia, and served for 21 years in China as the BFBS “agent”. This new finding brings the date of the “first China Missionary from New Zealand” back from 1891 to 1877.

*Which year should mark the end of the periodisation?* This question proves unproblematic for Dalzell, insofar as he chooses to use the dates of the Republican China to set the temporal parameters for his own study. The logic deployed to demarcate the current study is far less clear-cut. No new missionary left New Zealand for China after 1949 but many remained in China until 1951, and the last New Zealand missionary (Courtney Archer) left China in 1953. In a physical sense, the China mission never ended as long as the missionaries were still “in” China. In a psychological sense, the missionaries took “China” with them when they withdrew from the field. Some participants in the present study have gone further and comment that the ending year should include the time the mission relocated outside communist China. For example, the PCNZ’s China mission lingered on in Hong Kong right into the 1970s while the CIM renamed itself OMF and relocated to Southeast Asia, going full circle back to Robert Morrison’s idea of the “Ultra-Gangs Mission”. Most existing work on mission history in China left this intriguing element unexplored within their notion of an “exit”, which defines the meaning of the China missiological project for those who once worked as missionaries in China, and sets the contours of the post-China missiological mentality. Findings from this study suggest that China has remained very much in the mind of the missionaries years after they left the country, or even symbolically reincarnated within their children. The effect of the “China-oriented mentality”, negative as well as positive, can still be felt in the descendants of these China missionaries even to this day.


34 Nancy Jansen, letter to the researcher, Nov. 27, 2009.
1.4. Introducing the “Facts”

Bearing in mind the above definitional debates, a list of all known New Zealand missionaries to China has been compiled based on previous works. A short biography of each is included as Appendix I. In his thesis, Morrison painstakingly built up a list of 736 New Zealand missionaries for the period of 1868 and 1930, and this figure increased to 1,042 by 1939. A complicating factor is that some missionaries had worked for more than one “field” and thus would have been counted more than once. As illustrated in Table 1, among the 45 countries, China was the second most common “field” for New Zealanders after India (26%), followed by Solomon Islands (11%). Not quite a British colony and much more remote than the Pacific Islands, China absorbed almost 20% of the New Zealand missionary force.
Table 1: Number and Percentage of New Zealander Missionaries in Different Overseas Fields, 1850-1939.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country/Area</th>
<th>Number (%)</th>
<th>Country/Area</th>
<th>Number (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Asia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 India</td>
<td>270 (26%)</td>
<td>6 Singapore</td>
<td>5 (0.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 China</td>
<td>196 (19%)</td>
<td>7 Korea</td>
<td>1 (0.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Malaya</td>
<td>26 (2.5%)</td>
<td>8 Sumatra</td>
<td>1 (0.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Japan</td>
<td>9 (0.9%)</td>
<td>9 Thailand</td>
<td>1 (0.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Ceylon</td>
<td>5 (0.5%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtotal for Asia = 514 (49.3%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Africa       |            |              |            |
| 10 Sudan     | 25 (2.4%)  | 19 Transvaal | 2 (0.2%)   |
| 11 Southern Rhodesia (Zimbabwe) | 21 (2%) | 20 East Africa | 2 (0.2%) |
| 12 Ethiopia  | 15 (1.4%)  | 21 Uganda    | 2 (0.2%)   |
| 13 Congo     | 14 (1.3%)  | 22 Tanganyika| 1 (0.1%)   |
| 14 Egypt     | 9 (0.9%)   | 23 Pondoland (South Africa) | 1 (0.1%) |
| 15 Nigeria   | 8 (0.8%)   | 24 Chad      | 1 (0.1%)   |
| 16 Kenya     | 6 (0.6%)   | 25 Western Africa | 1 (0.1%) |
| 17 South Africa | 6 (0.6%) | 26 Eritrea | 1 (0.1%) |
| 18 Middle Africa (exl. Congo) | 6 (0.6%) | 27 Zambia | 1 (0.1%) |
| Subtotal for Africa = 112 (10.7%) |

| Pacific Islands |            |              |            |
| 28 Solomon Islands | 113 (11%) | 35 Australia | 9 (0.9%) |
| 29 Fiji          | 73 (7%)    | 36 New Britain | 8 (0.8%) |
| 30 New Hebrides  | 58 (5.6%)  | 37 New Guinea | 6 (0.6%) |
| 31 Papua         | 23 (2.2%)  | 38 Banks Islands | 3 (0.3%) |
| 32 Norfolk Island | 15 (1.4%) | 39 Loyalty Islands | 3 (0.3%) |
| 33 Samoa         | 9 (0.9%)   | 40 Other      | 2 (0.2%) |
| 34 Tanga         | 9 (0.9%)   |              |            |
Subtotal for Pacific Islands = 331 (31.8%)

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bolivia</td>
<td>Amazonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>41 (4%)</td>
<td>3 (0.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Argentina</td>
<td>British Guyana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>32 (3.1%)</td>
<td>2 (0.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Paraguay</td>
<td>Mexico</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>11 (1%)</td>
<td>2 (0.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Uruguay</td>
<td>Chile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>11 (1%)</td>
<td>2 (0.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>Cuba</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>10 (1%)</td>
<td>1 (0.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peru</td>
<td>The USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>7 (0.7%)</td>
<td>1 (0.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>3 (0.3%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Subtotal for America = 132 (12.7%)

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Palestine</td>
<td>Holland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>13 (%)</td>
<td>2 (0.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Persia</td>
<td>Lebanon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>3 (0.3%)</td>
<td>1 (0.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>Algeria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>2 (0.2%)</td>
<td>1 (0.1%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Subtotal for Europe & Middle East = 22 (2.1%)

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Palestine</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Persia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Subtotal for Europe & Middle East = 22 (2.1%)

Total Number = 1042


Up until 1949, a total of 255 known “New Zealanders” had arrived in China as missionaries. Table 2 provides a break-down of the total number of China missionaries by mission organisations and by gender. Nevertheless, when looking at the figures in Table 2, a critical reader must bear in mind the factors discussed above. As emphasised over and again in this current study, these numbers are only indicative and often technically incomplete. A redefinition of criteria could easily bring significant changes to these supposedly “factual” figures. The CIM (39%) is by far the largest recruiter for the China field,

35 This total number is less than the adding-up sum of regional subtotals because some missionaries had worked in more than one “field” and thus have been counted more than once.
followed by the PCNZ’s China mission (25%) and all the Anglican Missions taken together (13%). As mentioned above, some of the women (especially wives) were only included in the list retrospectively after gender politics became a common consideration in academic research.

Table 2: Number and Percentage of China Missionaries from New Zealand by Mission Organisations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mission Organization</th>
<th>Year of the first China missionary</th>
<th>Total number of China missionaries</th>
<th>% of the total China missionaries</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CIM</td>
<td>1891</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCNZ</td>
<td>1901</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglican (NZCMS, CEZMS &amp; SPG)</td>
<td>1906</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brethren</td>
<td>1904</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAU</td>
<td>1945</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salvation Army</td>
<td>1917</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LMS</td>
<td>1896</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSM</td>
<td>1897</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Church of Canada/CORSO</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BMS</td>
<td>1948</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shanghai Hebrew Mission</td>
<td>1937</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BFBS</td>
<td>1877</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWCA</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Board of Missions</td>
<td>1929</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bible Christian Church Mission</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mission background unknown</td>
<td>1903</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>255(^{36})</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{36}\) One person (i.e. Lindsay Crozier) joined FAU and CVM subsequently. Therefore the total figure is one less than the sum of the subtotals.
1.5. Introducing the Epistemological Orientation

The nature of the sociological inquiry for this study requires a particular blend of epistemological and methodological perspectives. Firstly, because this research is more about perception, identity and subjectivity, than figures and events, I attempt to incorporate the everyday life of “history from below” with the grand historical chronicles. The story will be retold in a particular kind of chronological order at a personal level, in a series of snapshots depicting the life cycle of an average China-oriented New Zealand missionary. This order of presentation is more in line with the narrating style of this thesis as opposed to the more common narration order based on themes, organisations, or historical periodisation.

Secondly, because women made up two thirds of the missionary force, special attention is paid to the women’s perspectives (wives as well as spinsters) alongside that of the conventional male-centred representation. Care has been taken to avoid the “add and mix” approach in which women’s experiences are simply added to the masculine “norm” of the day. Women might have chosen a missionary career for very different reasons, and thus the missionary career might generate very different meanings for them. Moreover, their experience on the mission field, largely confined to the so-called “women’s ministries” and often included child-bearing and child-rearing, were also quite different from their male colleagues. Their interaction with Chinese men and women adds an interesting twist in the racial and sexual discourses in an era of high imperialism. Just as how Britain remade the rest of the world and was itself “made” by its empire of which the New Zealand missionary force was a part, the mission field also unmade and remade British forms of social and cultural practices, particularly the gender norms. When “missionary feminism” began to

37 Further details and analysis is introduced in Table 10 and its associated discussion in Chapter II.
38 Prevost defines “missionary feminism” as both self-identified feminist and those who
challenge and overwrite “imperial feminism”, the field experiences demanded New Zealand women to re-evaluate the frames of reference which constructed their understandings of Christianity and womanhood. Such a focus would incline the reader to adopt the women’s history approach. A more balanced analysis of both male and female missionaries deserves further consideration at length in their own right. Nevertheless, since gender is a relative concept, since what we think of women is only relative to and meaningful in relation to what we think of men, the examination of the intricacies and contingencies of the gender discourses that women missionaries were negotiating will bring some insights to the lives of their male counterparts.

Thirdly, while most English work on mission history in China was written from a western point of view, this research attempts to incorporate Chinese historiography into the picture. Researchers of any cross-cultural and inter-national project have to make the difficult decision about which national chronicles to use as the predominant timeline for story-telling. Dalzell chooses the Chinese chronicles while Morrison opts for the New Zealand one. Dalzell’s focus is the “field” while Morrison’s the “Home”, each suiting the purposes of their own research projects. Modern missiologists such as William R. Hutchison have given excellent discussions on the dichotomy of “Home Base versus Foreign Field”. Used as standard rhetoric of the day, this pair of metaphors has accumulated broad connotations and has overlapped with the military semantic domain. A significant challenge the present study thereby poses is that worked through missionary institutions to advocate female emancipation from patriarchal power structure (Elizabeth E. Prevost, The Communion of Women: Missions and Gender in Colonial Africa and the British Metropole (New York: Oxford University Press, 2010), 10).


of understanding how the contrary logics running through alternative national chronologies might be deployed to a mutually constitutive analytic effect.

A closely related phenomenon to the above point is that the study of western missionaries in China is often organised by sending countries while the study of foreign missions in the modern missionary movement is often organised by mission field. The real life picture was that denominational boards in the “home-bases” sent missionaries to multiple fields. A corresponding phenomenon in the receiving end of the missionary movement was that missions from various countries worked together in a single field. The experiences of the missionaries and mission supporters were a lot more “inter-national” and “cross-country” than most academic conventions suggest. Instead of adopting the conventional “single country approach”, the current research aims to present a wider picture for more meaningful comparisons. The rationale of this broader approach was that unless one is familiar with what had been occurring globally, it is nearly impossible to determine whether a certain practice was idiosyncratic to New Zealand identity or common to Protestant mission of the day.

There have been scholarly attempts to bring the British metropole and the colonial peripheries together as a “single analytic category”. However, critiques of this approach argue that such integration has the effect of reproducing a “metropolitan gaze”. Since China had not quite been colonised by Britain, the metropole-periphery never quite worked for the study of Sino-British relations, let alone a study of Sino-New Zealand relations. New Zealand’s status as being both the centre and the periphery in the modern missionary movement further

---

adds complication to the analysis. Thus the current research seeks to bring the field and the home together as an interwoven story between Christian constructions of universalism and colonial/indigenous constructions of difference. The comparison between the overseas China mission and the home missions targeting Chinese immigrants is also worth pursuing. To reconcile the gap between the discourses surrounding “the Chinese out there” and that which surrounds “the Chinese right here” poses a real challenge for a social scientist since the literatures of each subject often belong to different streams of scholarship. Migrant study and mission study are usually two strands of scholarship that rarely overlap, even though both fields of study are getting increasing attention for similar reasons. The former is often in the domain of social policy while the latter is the domain of history or missiology: both will benefit from a critical reflection from sociology. Missiology claims to be a discipline with a focus on the church and its extension while sociology, or its subdivision, sociology of religion, is a secular branch of social sciences. A missiological approach and a sociological approach to mission history may differ in their ontological and epistemological standing on things “transcendent”. It is only on the practical aspects of the Christian mission that the two disciplines have a common platform. However, recent trends in social science involve movements towards post-secularism. The production of knowledge is an open-ended process that is subject to changing socio-cultural conditions of the knowledge-makers. Religious knowledge is but one of these forms. Being aware of the limits of each discipline and in view of the recent overlapping of the two, a comparative and multidisciplinary approach is employed to examine the meanings that New Zealanders assigned to their missionary life in China and the way they bring New Zealand into the picture.

42 Morrison rightly points out this paradox in the title of a discussion paper: "Centre or Periphery?: Reflections on Origins and Patterns in New Zealand Mission History." Paper presented at Henry Martyn Centre, Westminster College, Cambridge University, June 16, 2010).
Lastly, studies of mission history in China almost invariably focus on missionaries themselves and usually end when the missionaries physically left China. Since nearly all missionaries were compelled to leave Communist China in the early 1950s, this seems to be the natural cutting-off point of “mission to China” for historians. However, such a “1949 threshold” unnecessarily segments the continuity of history and life-story. China missionaries’ work life and family life went on after this artificial date. Moreover, when they left China, they often took China with them and have passed their “China factor” on to the next generations. It is to be admitted that the focus on missionary children is a result of practicality as well as methodological deliberation. On the one hand, carrying out a research project on China missionaries 60 years after their China experience inevitably involved interviewing descendants of the missionaries instead of the missionary themselves. On the other hand, the advantage of the timing of the current study lays in its evaluation of the intergenerational effect of the family’s missionary engagement in China. The significance of these children’s perspectives is multifold and multidimensional, providing a bonding thread that links the past with the present, the field with the home, experiences with interpretations, memories with realities.

1.6. Introducing Goffman’s Dramaturgy

There is more than one way to present the story of New Zealand missionaries in China. Generally speaking, a history from below is more akin to micro-sociology while the production of a single and overarching history belongs to the domain of macro-sociology. Since this research aims to decode the day-to-day significance of personalised history, with a dual cultural approach, Erving Goffman’s dramaturgical perspective provides an appropriate conceptual framework. He also interspersed sociological sources with materials and references that are unconventional to sociologists but are familiar to historians, such as biographies, memoirs, books of etiquette, instruction manuals, handbook
of rules and so forth. It is generally agreed that there has never been a “Goffman school”. Few social scientists have been prepared to pick up his “golden shovel”, partly because he has a “signature style” that is nearly impossible to emulate.⁴³ Although Goffman himself was dubious about the applicability of his notions to non-western cultures,⁴⁴ I would like to use this cross-cultural study to expand the analytical potential of Goffman’s original theory.

Forming the right impressions in the eyes of an audience through strategic interpersonal behavior is not a new idea. Plato spoke of “the stage of human life” and Shakespeare made it even more specific in this sentence “All the world is a stage, and all the men and women merely players”.⁴⁵ George Herbert Mead was the pioneer in interactionism, which places emphasis on micro-scale social processes that provide subjective meaning in human actions. His student and interpreter, Herbert Blumer, coined the term “symbolic interaction”, and set out three basic premises of this phenomenologically based theoretical frame: human beings act toward things on the basis of the meanings they ascribe to those things; the meaning of such things is derived from, or arises out of, the social interaction that one has with others and the society; these meanings are handled in, and modified through, an interpretative process used by the person in dealing with the things he/she encounters.⁴⁶ Accordingly, human interaction is mediated by interpretation, by the use of symbols and signification, and by the ongoing action of ascribing meaning to each another’s actions.

⁴⁵ William Shakespeare, As You Like It, 1600.
Kenneth Burke, a literary theorist and philosopher and a lifelong interpreter of Shakespeare, used dramatism as the social and political rhetorical analysis to decode language usage.\textsuperscript{47} Nevertheless, it was Goffman who enabled the wide acceptance of dramaturgy as a sociological perspective, with his 1959 book \textit{The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life}. Along with many other sociologists of his cohort, Goffman used Herbert and Blumer’s idea of interactionism in developing his own dramaturgical approach to human interaction. Goffman introduced most of the related terminology and applications in his first and most famous book, which is thought to be a “handbook of action”.\textsuperscript{48}

There are some key concepts in Goffman’s argument that require due attention. In a broad sense, dramaturgy is defined as “the study of how human beings accomplish meaning in their lives”.\textsuperscript{49} “Interaction”, “performance” and “routine” are three closely associated concepts that Goffman employs throughout his work and thus it is crucial that we as readers are clear as to their metaphoric connotations. “Interaction” meant for Goffman “the reciprocal influence of individuals upon one another’s actions when in one another’s immediate physical presence”.\textsuperscript{50} Similarly, a “performance” refers to “all the activity of a given participant on a given occasion which serves to influence in any way any of the other participants”.\textsuperscript{51} “The pre-established pattern of action which is unfolded during a performance and which may be presented or played

\textsuperscript{48} Fine and Manning, “Erving Goffman,” 468.
\textsuperscript{50} Goffman, \textit{The Presentation of Self}, 26.
\textsuperscript{51} Ibid., 26. Goffman redefined the concept of “performance” in his later work to limit its applicability to “arrangement which transforms an individual into a stage performer, the latter, in turn, being an object that can be looked at in the round and at length without offense, and looked at for an engaging behavior, by persons in an ‘audience’ role” (Erving Goffman, \textit{Frame Analysis: An Essay on the Organization of Experience}, (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University, 1974), 124)
through on other occasions” is called “routine”. While Goffman sometimes uses the terms interchangeably, he preferred “performance” over the other two to accentuate a dramaturgical argumentation.

Goffman then introduces a second set of concepts: front, setting, appearance, and manner. “Front” is the “expressive equipment … intentionally or unwittingly employed” by the individual during his/her performance which “regularly functions in a general and fixed fashion to define the situation for those who observe the performance”. Goffman uses “setting” to refer to scenic aspects of front, consisting of static background items, and a “personal front”, to other physical and behavioral expressive equipment intimately identified with the performer. These can be further divided into two categories: “appearance” is a static sign vehicle that reveals the performer’s social statuses; and “manner” is a set of dynamic sign vehicles that warn the audience of the role that the performer expects to play in the forth-coming situation.

To Goffman, interpersonal actions are dependent upon time, place, and audience. The “self” is thus a sense of who one is. In dramaturgical sociology, a sense of self is created by a dramatic effect emerging from the immediate scene being presented. The goal of such a presentation of self is acceptance from the audience through carefully conducted performance, or more succinctly, through “impression management”. In the context of mission work, the missionaries, in a metaphorical sense, assumed the role of an actor, shaped by the socio-cultural environment and target audiences of their times. The objective of their performance is to provide the audience with an impression consistent with the desired goals of the actor. In addition, individuals differ in their responses to the interactional environment through a process of self-monitoring. In the context of

---

52 Ibid., 49.
53 Ibid., 32.
54 Ibid., 32-33.
this research topic, some missionaries were not responsive to the reactions of the host country while others actively responded to audience reactions in order to make their message more acceptable. The role of the missionaries is two-fold: they were being watched by an audience, but at the same time they were an audience for their viewers’ play.

The impression management of the missionary community links well with Goffman’s notion of “back-stage” and “front-stage”. The front-stage is where the actor formally performs and adheres to conventions that have meanings to the audience. To Goffman, the front-stage involves a differentiation between “setting” and “personal front”. Setting is the scene that must be present in order for the actor to perform. A Sunday worship gathering, missionary exhibitions, mission mobilisation conventions, gospel hall, and mission study groups are all settings in the “home-sides”. On the other side of the globe, mission stations, mission compounds, mission hospitals, mission schools and alike, are examples of settings in the China field, which are also identified by Mary Louise Pratt as the “contact zone” of the colonial era.55 The personal front consists of items or equipment needed in order to perform, which can be further divided into two aspects, appearance and manner. Clerical robes and deaconess dresses reflect missionaries’ social status at their home churches but could be an object of ridicule or even offence in Imperial China. Likewise, cheong-sams, mandarin jackets with their associated body movements, while adopted by some missionaries as part of their identification with the local lifestyle, would only be a novelty or curio back home. While observing the theatre of everyday life as a director, one must also take the notions of “status” and “role” into consideration. A status is similar to a part in a play and a role serves as a script, supplying dialogue and action for the characters. The status of the missionary at home was

55 Pratt defined "contact zones" as "social spaces where disparate cultures meet, clash, and grapple with each other, often in highly asymmetrical relations of domination and subordination" (Mary Louise Pratt, Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation. (London: Routledge, 1992), 4).
someone to be “commissioned” or “sent”, while their status in the mission field was often “uninvited” or “unwanted”. Every new missionary had to learn the conventions, often unspoken and conspiratorial, in daily interaction with local people as well as in communication with supporters back home.

The back-stage is where actors are present but the audience is not, and the actors can step out of character without fear of disrupting the show. It is where facts suppressed in the front-stage or various kinds of informal actions may appear. Nevertheless, Goffman adds that “back region” is only a relative term; it exists only in relation to a specific audience. There will almost never be a true “back region”. When actors are back-stage, they are often in another performance: that of a loyal team member. Translating it into the missionary context, when missionaries sent prayer letters and field reports home, they would be more critical about the host culture and people, while at the same time still retaining a certain degree of self-censorship. When missionaries were on furlough or deputation, the home churches became the audience while the mission field became the back-stage. The mission board and mission supporters largely relied on the missionary’s representation of the mission field. Due to the cost and length of international travel at the time, very few members of the home churches could ever visit the field themselves and “hunt down” the true picture.

In theory, the back-stage is completely separate from the front-stage so no members of the audience can appear in the back. However, in the unique set-up of the PCNZ’s China Mission, the target audience, Chinese immigrants from the rural parts of Canton, were moving between the two worlds just as the missionaries did. In view of the anti-Chinese sentiment and discrimination of the time, such “inopportune intrusions” frequently disrupted the desired impression, and could result in what is termed in theater as “breaking character”.

It should not take much space to explain that borders or boundaries are
important in keeping the front versus back-stage demarcations. Actors need to be able to maneuver boundaries to manage who has access to the performance, when and how. Goffman attributed particular significance to the unruliness of social boundaries, which is frequently tested in the acts of negotiation and boundary-crossing. Both border-controlling is highlighted by Victor Turner’s conception of liminality.\textsuperscript{56} The missiological significance of lay believers and women being given the title of a “missionary” is no less than an anthropological rite of passage. The management of thresholds occurred also in the mission field. Chinese church workers were kept from entering the missionary community despite the fact that they were doing the same work or even did better or more. They might be allowed in for various settings, but field council meetings and summer retreat gatherings were almost always missionary-only occasions. The Chinese could only be invited as colleagues/fellow-workers without the aura of missionary.

In an era of the Americanisation of social theory (and of the missionary movement), qualitative-oriented microsociology has been unduly relegated to a minority position under the domination of quantitative approaches to sociology. In the case of evangelical Christians, there seems to be an acceptable theoretical trend, to unfold the biblical story as a grand story.\textsuperscript{57} It would be equally

---


appropriate to present “the act of mission” in dramatic terms. My personal and familial affinity with theatrical contexts also adds idiographic subjectivity to this thesis. Snapshots of the life story of my Aunt, who was a renowned actress of a Chinese Opera, will be used as illustrations to illuminate the dramatic aspects of missionary career.\textsuperscript{58} Thus, the story of New Zealand missionaries in China will proceed as follows.

1.6.1. The “Back-Stage” – Getting Ready for Sailing from New Zealand

New Zealand missionaries went to China for very different reasons from those Chinese miners who came to New Zealand. The initial section of the thesis deals with the historical construction of New Zealand as the “home-base”, including the arrival of Christianity in Aotearoa, the emergence of a missionary interest, the spectacle of the Chinese immigrants, gender politics and its consequences for overseas missions. All these dynamics have contributed to shape the group profile of the New Zealanders sailing for China as missionaries. Different mission societies had different recruitment criteria and their own in-house ethos, and that often resulted in distinctive subcultures. Being the conventional unit of analysis in the existing literature, “mission society” is also what might be called by American sociologist Robert K. Merton the “middle-range concept”, a level of study that is neither too broad (e.g. national identity) nor too narrow to be analytically useful (e.g. hometown, sailing group, occupation).

1.6.2. The “Front-Stage” – What to Anticipate in China

New Zealanders arrived and stayed in China on different socio-political terms (negotiated on their behalf) from that by which the Chinese entered New Zealand. This section will give an overview of China as a mission field,

\textsuperscript{58} See Appendix IV for this person’s biographical summary.
including the treaty system, extraterritorial rights, and consular jurisdiction in the late Qing Dynasty and early Republican era. This was the broad backdrop against which the New Zealanders played their part. To the Christians in New Zealand, China, as long as it remained in a “heathen” state, was the “ends of the earth”, while to the gentry in China, New Zealand, as long as it did not belong to the Confucianism-based tributary system, was the “ultima thule”\textsuperscript{59}. In terms of geopolitical significance, the latter is properly more accurate than the former perception. Unlike the first group of Chinese miners, the missionaries were not invited by the Chinese Government or the Chinese people and were often seen as escorted by gunboats and accompanied opium-traders. A mistrust and unequal relation between the evangelists and those to be evangelised had developed well before New Zealanders entered the scene. Few of those New Zealanders appeared to understand it, let alone anticipate it sufficiently. In the hindsight provided by this current age, acquainted as it is with a more advanced understanding of cross-cultural communication and self-reflection, the recruits were ill-equipped for the task ahead.

\textbf{1.6.3. In the Arena\textsuperscript{60} – the China Experiences}

The expatriate experience had just been as difficult for the New Zealanders in China as for the Chinese in New Zealand. The field was where they aimed to convert people and where they were converted. It was a place to go through re-socialisation, to identify with the Chinese lifestyle but tactfully avoid anything “sinful”. It was the place to test the missionary’s ability of “impression management” before the prospective “heathen” audience. It was the place to know when to start and when to stop, what to continue and what to discontinue,

\textsuperscript{59} There is a Chinese expression very similar to that in English, which literally means “sky-line and ocean-corner”.

\textsuperscript{60} In the Arena is the title of the autobiography of the renowned Canadian CIM missionary writer, Isobel Kuhn, inspired by the Biblical verse, “for we are made a spectacle unto the world, and to angels, and to men” (1 Cor. 4:9, KJV).
or to lose the ability to know, to handle cultural shock, to get confused and
disappointed. “Foreign devil” might be the very first label attached to them. This
section will examine the following aspects of day-to-day life of New Zealand
missionaries in China including adoption of Chinese names, language learning,
clothing changes, dietary changes, compound accommodation, itinerant and
residential evangelism, medical and educational works, summer retreats, racial
and gender dynamics, romance and marriage, child-bearing and child-rearing,
and the childhood of “missionary kids”.

1.6.4. Interludes - Furlough and Internment

The period during which New Zealanders were in China was the most turbulent
era in modern Chinese history. Their missionary terms were often interrupted by
forced withdrawal, internment by the Japanese authorities and later by the
communist regime, captivity by bandits or the Red Army. These dramatic
experiences added to the extraordinariness of missionary life. Scheduled
furloughs were the ordinary type of “interludes” to the missionary story. The
mentality of missionaries often remained very China-bound or China-oriented
when they were back home on furloughs. They were investing in things and
skills (e.g. undertaking a course in tropical disease) that were only useful in
China or for the benefit of the Chinese people. Many would be assigned with
deputation tours to promote the China mission. The missionaries came back to
New Zealand only to find that they were no longer “New Zealanders” as such.
They returned home with an outlook that had been developed in the field and
were often faced with, unexpectedly, reverse cultural shock. For China-born
missionary kids, New Zealand might be the first place where they encountered
cultural shock, a mild form of what their parents experienced when they first
arrived in China.
1.6.5. Exeunt – the Withdrawal from China

The number of Chinese immigrants dropped rapidly from the late 19th Century, as a result of systematic anti-Chinese immigration regulations by the New Zealand government. However, the policy makers never managed to eliminate the “yellow aliens” totally. On the northern side of the globe, a state of complete and irreversible withdrawal from China became a shared and dramatic experience for New Zealand missionaries. It was indeed a process of “Reluctant Exodus” as the title of a CIM book succinctly suggests.61 The communist party tactfully used the Chinese Christians as the instrument to drive out missionaries. “Running dogs of imperialists” was their new name tag. Some were forcefully expelled but others voluntarily applied for exit visas so as to avoid embarrassment to their Chinese associates. There had been some critical times for the China Missions as a whole, and individual members had to work out a resolution to the paradox of being “called” and “sealed” by God to serve anywhere but China, and to the reality of a closed China. After all, without China, what was “China mission” and who were China missionaries?

61 Phyllis Thompson, Reluctant Exodus (Littleton: OMF, 2000).

1.6.6. Epilogue – the Post–China Days

This last section merges and completes the two stories: the China missionaries returned to New Zealand (their country of birth) while the Chinese immigrants obtained a right to residency in New Zealand (their country of adoption). There would have been individuals from both groups who found this ending as an undesired outcome, a reality beyond their control. Post-China occupations often demonstrate how the China experience has influenced life back in New Zealand or other countries (including “new fields”). Many found the home life too “ordinary” and too comfortable compared to the adventurous and extreme living conditions in China, but few took up new challenges. They were hesitant to look
for a country to replace the China in their heart and mind. For ex-China missionaries, making sense of the current, and planning for the future was often done by way of looking backwards towards their China days. Their China story never ends, and still plays on today, six decades after they had physically left China. Are we certain that we as ordinary New Zealanders, have never been affected, directly or indirectly, by the China story of these missionary forefathers and foremothers? How much has the diplomatic recognition of China by the New Zealand government in 1972, coupled with the influx of ethnic Chinese immigrants since the 1980s, aroused a renewed awareness of an incredible past of the Sino-New Zealand relations that was otherwise fading and sealed? I, thus, invite readers to step into the historical drama that was rich in social connotation and emotional charge, a kind of history that could potentially move us all from seats in the audience to places on the stage wherein we might begin to engage in meaningful dialogue with the characters.
Chapter II: The “Back-Stage” – New Zealand as the “Home-base”

Before I came to New Zealand, I used to live with my Aunt, who was a renowned actress of a Chinese folk opera. Though she was no longer active on stage, there were constant flows of visitors coming to pay respect and seek guidance. Many of them were her colleagues, associates, or apprentices. She often took me, a teenager then, to watch operatic performances. I have never seen my Aunt on stage but I’ve seen her on screen and TV, filmed in her forties as well as seeing her daily life in semi-retirement. My association with my Aunt also allowed me to see her apprentices in both front-stage and back-stage. It was quite common for me to dine with the actresses at my Aunt’s house one day and watch them performing in make-up and costumes on the stage another day, or even on the same day. There had been more than one occasion where I visited the back-stage of the theatre when the actors and actresses were dressing up or undressing either before or after seeing the show on the front-stage. After I came to New Zealand, I began to experience the ritual of attending church on Sundays: the English-speaking preachers behind the pulpit appeared to me somehow to have resembled the image of an actor (and only occasionally actress), of someone on the stage that I usually only see on special occasions, from a distance, among a crowd. The audience experience was surprisingly similar in that I had to rely on translators for the message as I had to rely on subtitles for opera lyrics. As my English skill and biblical knowledge

\[1\] Goffman’s notion of “back-stage” and “front-stage” are social artifacts rather than geographical fixities. Therefore New Zealand is referred as the “back-stage” only in a metaphorical sense. As unfolded in Chapter IV and Chapter V, there are socially constructed “front-stages” within the broader geographical back-stage. Another reason to adopt Goffman’s dramaturgical terms instead of the traditional missiological terms such as “home-base” and “foreign field” unqualifiedly is to avoid reinforce to the Orientalistic power inequality implied in such a dualism (see discussion in section 1.5).
improved, I was asked to assist translations myself. That was when I got to see a little bit of the preparation stage of the sermon. Sometimes the front-stage was set up in a private space (or a space that would normally to be considered back-stage), where Chinese Christians and non-Christians were invited for an English lesson, Bible studies or Fellowship meals in a “Kiwi” home. It was not until years later, when I attended an OMF prayer meeting where retired missionaries prayed for new recruits departing shortly for their ‘fields’, I regained the sense of seeing the real ‘back-stage’.

The idea of front-stage and back-stage is something that persistently intrigued me as a researcher when pursuing the study on the mission history in China. As a gross generalisation, Chinese scholars tend to focus on what the missionaries did and said when they were in the “front-stage” of the mission field and how they were perceived by the Chinese\(^2\) while western scholars tend to focus on the development of the mission infrastructure and ideologies in the “back-stage” of the “home-base” and on how missionaries saw the Chinese\(^3\). Although these are two sides of the same coin, discrete discussions tend to segregate the wholeness of the history. As international exchanges, at both church and academic levels, become more commonplace, there have been some serious attempts to bring the two perspectives together.\(^4\) A more complete story requires a scholar who is able to move between the

\(^2\) It would be impossible to list all the work in this very limited space. As a generalization, most studies of “anti-missionary riots (1860-1900)”, “anti-Christianity movement (1922-1927)”, and of regional Church history come under this category.

\(^3\) Again as a broad generalization only, most studies on interfaith comparison and on missionary recruitment come under this category. James Reed’s *The Missionary Mind and American East Asia Policy, 1911-1915* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University, 1980) and Patrical Neil’s edited book *United States Attitudes and Policies toward China: The Impact of American Missionaries* (Armonk, N.Y. : M.E. Sharpe, 1990) are also examples of these.

sending and receiving nations with relative ease, to integrate and make sense of the fragments (consistency and inconsistency) of both worlds.

Much of the deconstruction by post-modern and/or post-colonial analysts is achieved through challenging the neutrality of the observer. The front-stage and back-stage metaphors highlight the significance of the perspective from which a scholar looks at an issue. Australasians often use the “down-under” map to remind the rest of the world that there is more than one way to look at the planet, let alone the world. Our angle or standpoint determines what we see first, more closely or clearly, what is central and peripheral. It is thus also important for the readers to know that what they are going to read is only going to be partial (i.e. either the front or the back). Those who are able to see both stages will have a more coherent view of the whole story. It is where I can introduce my position as a knowledge-maker of multiple roles. Born and growing up in China, but spending my most constructive and productive years in New Zealand, I see myself as a “Chinese gooseberry becoming Kiwifruit”\(^5\). Coming into contact with Christianity not as a “national”\(^6\) but as an immigrant, my faith is tinted with multifaceted cross-cultural expressions. When I work in partnership with Pakeha diaspora missioners, we form a united front to the Chinese settlers who we try to reach. Writing this thesis after more than a century when New Zealanders began to arrive in China in organised numbers as missionaries, China is not necessarily “heathen” and New Zealand is no longer “Christian”. The absolute number of people claiming Protestant faith in mainland China had far exceeded that in New Zealand although the proportion of the population has remained small.\(^7\) The

---


\(^6\) This is a short way of saying that I did not become a Christian when I was in China. “National” is the post-colonial term that has replaced the old colonial term “native” in mission literature when referring to people of the host countries where missionaries working as expatriates.

\(^7\) The size of the Protestant community in China is a contestable subject. The official figure provided by Chinese government in 1997 states that the total number of Protestant Christian is about 10 million, plus 4 million Catholics (Zhongguo de zongjiao xinyang ziyou zhuangkuang, “中国的宗教信仰自由状况” [statement of religious freedom in China],
percentage of Christians among ethnic Chinese in New Zealand has exceeded the percentage of Christians in mainland China. The unique makeup of my identity allows diversity-in-unity, equipping me as the researcher of this study to shift and move between the front and the back-stages with relative ease, and to capture the fluidity and unruliness of the boundaries between the two worlds of acts.

2.1. Colonial Christianity and the Emergence of Missionary Interest for China

Christianity first arrived in New Zealand, in the forms of Anglicanism and Methodism, as a missionary faith. Presbyterianism and other smaller denominations


and sects followed as “settlers’ faith”. In the context of a colonial Christianity, Aotearoa was initially a front-stage for British overseas missions. Although the Maori Christians who went to Tonga in 1822 and 1827 with the Methodist missionaries from Australasia were arguably the first overseas missionaries from New Zealand, it was not until 1848 that New Zealand began to send its men and women to labour in overseas mission fields. Gradually, as Aotearoa became New Zealand, it also became a back-stage for missionary activities. From then until now, New Zealand had simultaneously been a receiver as well as a sender of Christian messengers. In a similar manner, Yue Opera had gone through rapid development since its embryonic beginnings. By 1935, there were as many as 20,000 people out of the total 400,000 inhabitants in Shengxian involved in the Yue Opera trade, making up 0.5% of the local population. There were more than 200 circuses playing Yue Opera and the number of theatres staging Yue Opera increased from 13 in September 1939 to 36 in early 1941, almost tripling within less than two years. Likewise, as a new sending country, New Zealand rapidly built a record of supplying men and women for foreign missions and earned herself the reputation of having a high missionary percentage per capita among Christendom nations by the early 1930s.

Morrison argues that “the stirrings of a missionary consciousness” found fuller expression and support from the 1890s in Aotearoa New Zealand. New Zealand's

---

11 Landi, Cisheng zhiwei Yueju Sheng: Yuan Xuefen 《此生只为越剧生：袁雪芬》, (Shanghai: Jinxiu Wenzhang Pub.上海锦绣文章出版社, 2010), 63.
13 Morrison, “‘It is Our Bounden Duty’,” 19.
earliest recognisable missionary endeavours overseas were nearer home and around the Pacific islands south of the equator: the Melanesian Mission of the Church of the Province of New Zealand from 1848, and the New Hebrides Mission of the PCNZ from 1862. In the next stage of missionary enthusiasm, marked by the formation of the Baptist Union of New Zealand in 1881 and of the New Zealand Baptist Missionary Society in 1885, the scope of overseas mission was then expanded to a more distant British colony, East Bengal in India.

China entered the horizon of evangelical New Zealanders as a mission field from the 1890s, according to Morrison, “a decade of heightened expectation” when the missionary sentiments and involvement had substantially elevated across the whole country.\(^\text{14}\) Morrison listed the following trends, facts and events as part of the explanation for the local growth of missionary movement for the 1890s. Firstly, the developments in New Zealand were “both a reflection of, and a response to” the growth of western international missionary movements during the same time.\(^\text{15}\) The 1890s saw a decade of optimism and of confidence in New Zealand, paralleling the expansionist sentiments of the era of “high imperialism” of the British Empire. Being a young nation and a new sending base, New Zealand churches were acutely aware of the Centennial celebrations launched by a number of the first generation mission societies in the Old Country.\(^\text{16}\)

Secondly, confluence between external stimuli, and national reservoirs of religious revivalism stimulated enthusiasm concerning overseas mission. Whilst the social and religious influences were still predominantly from Mother England, there was also evidence of growing American influence, and of New Zealand's emerging self-awareness as one of the new nations of the Pacific Rim. Many evangelicals

---

\(^{14}\) Ibid.: 50, 73.


\(^{16}\) For example, BMS’s centurial anniversary in 1892, LMS’s in 1895, and CMS’s in 1899.
would agree with Piggin's assertion that overseas missions work was “the thermometer of spiritual temperature”. Revivalism heightened religious enthusiasm as much as it increased the number of churchgoers, which in turn led to generally enhanced missionary support and involvement.

Thirdly, confluence between missionary awareness and social, political and economic developments within New Zealand, having recovered from the 1880s depression, had provided the logistical basis for overseas mission. New Zealand's geographical and social proximity with Australia was a well-acknowledged source of influence. The founding of two main China-related New Zealand missions (the NZCMA and the CIM) derived from the developments in Australia. The founding of the Presbyterian Woman's Missionary Union in 1896/1897 was also modeled on Australian precedents. The trans-Tasman influence of Australian missionary speakers and training homes in Sydney, Melbourne and Adelaide were pervasive before the founding of the Bible Training Institute (hereafter BTI) in Auckland.

The three elements of social movements identified by Charles Tilly were all manifest in the missionary consciousness-raising movements: campaigns, repertoires and WUNC displays. Tilly's notions of “repertoire” and “display” were particularly close to Goffman's notion of dramaturgy. The “Worthiness” of the missionary enterprise, the “Unity” of the church to fulfill the “Great Commandment”, the “Numbers” of “heathens”, the “Commitment” to a higher spirituality, were all common themes throughout mobilisation repertoire. The various special-purpose associations, missionary exhibitions, mobilisation meetings, solemn processions, vigils, rallies, statements to and in public media, pamphleteering and lobbying launched by churches and mission societies can all be seen as a symbolic presentation

18 Morrison, “‘It is Our Bounden Duty’,” 80-86.
of a social programme.

The emergence of a missionary endeavour can also be seen as a reflection of the colonial nationalism beginning to form around the same time. According to Katie Pickles, the retreat from the British Empire was disguised as the long-planned evolution of self-governing colonies and their transformation into autonomous dominions on the pattern of Canada, Australia, New Zealand, and less happily, South Africa. As New Zealand gradually moved away from Britain as a superior centre, she had to form her own sense of natural identity, and seek ‘local’ heroes and heroines. Indicative of the “nation within empire” mentality, myths of nationhood were constructed around the notion of proving the worth of New Zealand outside New Zealand. In a logical but often unconscious endeavour, “Kiwis” who achieved overseas were lauded. In an age of imperialism, the stages for such prowess were the sports field, the battlefield and the mission field. In the church context, the ability to send missionaries abroad, were seen as a sign of spiritual maturity and autonomy. While such men and women were made in New Zealand, their achievements were overseas. Like the “Unknown Soldiers” who served with the Empire’s forces in foreign lands, the majority of New Zealand “unsung heroes and heroines” working in the “heathen worlds” were not remembered individually by their compatriots, rather, they helped to form a collective colonial icon of an evangelical elite.

The emergence of a missionary consciousness does not by itself explain why a substantial portion of missionary candidates chose China as their designated field. Mission statesmen would say that all missionaries had an experience of being “called” to China, some from a very young age. From the turn of the 20th Century, China had become an established mission field for New Zealanders. In the single year of 1923, more than twenty New Zealand missionaries were recruited for China.

---

ten by the Anglican Church, seven by the PCNZ, one by the Society of Friends, several others by the CIM.\textsuperscript{21} Since the stimulating factors from China will be discussed in the next chapter, this section only focuses on the domestic scene. Comparisons across missions are important sources of insight into mobilisation strategies for the China field, the reasons for certain missions attracting certain types of personnel, and the emergence of mission-particular protocols and practices. Dalzell’s research is an exemplar of such cross-organisational study. Dalzell also points out that the mentalities that are particular to New Zealanders, and activities undertaken by New Zealanders compared with those from other parts of the West in the same missions (e.g. the CIM and the NZCMS) is an intriguing topic of study.\textsuperscript{22}

There is more than one opera in China. Likewise, there had been more than one mission in China. Within the same opera trade, various circuses were formed that each centred on an established actor/actress. Some were men-only circuses while others were women-only. All actors/actresses played the same classic stories but some had developed their own personal style. Over time, a certain repertoire would come to personify the founder of a circus. Similarly, nearly all Protestant missionaries attempted to tell the same biblical story, but often employed different tactics and means. Both circuses and mission societies, as human-led organisations, had their own systems of operations, recruitment, training, and financial arrangements. Consequently, different circuses and different missions targeted different audiences and attracted different personnel, though it was surprisingly common for an apprentice to change circus or even move between different kinds of opera trades.

The missionary community is the conceptual equivalent of what Goffman called a “team”, a group of individuals whose close co-operation is required if a given

\textsuperscript{21} The Reaper (Jul 16, 1924): 5.
\textsuperscript{22} Mathew Dalzell, “New Zealanders in Republican China 1912-1949” (Master’s Thesis, Auckland University of Auckland, 1994), 18.
projected definition of the situation is to be achieved. Secrecy underlies all social interaction. As we all participate on teams we must all carry within ourselves something of the sweet guilt of conspirators, so did the missionaries of different societies. Four missions (the CIM, PCNZ, Anglican, and Brethren) are selected to illustrate the points. They are the bigger and more influential ones, discussed in the order of the sizes of their China “teams” from New Zealand.

The CIM was an interdenominational mission founded by an English missionary, James Hudson Taylor, in 1865. During the last decade of the 19th Century, the CIM became an international society by establishing Councils in North America (1889), Australia (1890), New Zealand (1894) and by sharing its infrastructure with a dozen Associate Missions23, largely Scandinavian. CIM is thus not only international but also multi-lingual. CIM was the largest western mission in China up until 1949, and one of the world’s most influential mission societies during the period of this study. As shown in Table 2, having recruited 39% (101) of the total missionary force to China, the CIM was the largest recruiter of missionaries to China in New Zealand. The ethos and legend of the CIM had played a significant role in raising New Zealanders’ missionary aspiration to China.24

---

23 Associate Missions that had joined the CIM up until the turn of the 20th Century were: Bible Christian Mission of England (1885), The Swedish Mission in China of Stockholm (1887), The Finnish Free Church (1889), The Norwegian Mission in China (1889), The Swedish Holiness Union (1890), The Scandinavian Alliance Mission (1890), The German China Alliance (1890), The Swedish Alliance Mission (1892), Pilgrim Mission of St. Chrischona (1896), The Norwegian Alliance Mission in China (1900).

24 For example, the 1893 visit of Eugene Stock and Rev. Robert Stewart to Australasia was partially a response to an invitation by Australasian bishops increasingly concerned about CIM recruitment of Anglicans since the formation of the Melbourne Council in 1890 (Eugene Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society in New Zealand* (Wellington, N.Z., NZCMS, 1935): 674-675; *Church Gazette* (Oct 1892): 111). Brethren missionary Reginald Sturt applied to the CIM as his first choice, after being turned down for health reasons on two occasions, joined the Brethren China mission on the suggestions of D. E. Hoste (General Director of the CIM). It is also interesting to note that Annie Harrison (1891), the woman that was conventionally believed as the first missionary from NZ to China, was a CIM member, and the one who preceded her, Samuel Dyer (1877), was the brother-in-law of the founder of the CIM, and had worked very closely with the CIM after he was appointed the BFBS agent in China. The first missionary of the CVM, Rev. George McNeur, initially applied to the CIM in the context of growing number of Presbyterians going to India or China with non-denominational missions (Morrison, “‘It is Our Bounden Duty,'” 50). The
missionaries (Florence S. H. Young and Annie Harrison) were accepted and sent by
the Australian Council. In 1893, the CIM missionary couple Rev. George and Ms. M.
A. Nicoll on deputation in Australia made a tour to New Zealand, and led the
North Island Council (Auckland) and South Island Council (Dunedin) to be formed
in the next year. Auxiliaries were gradually set up in Wellington (1905), Waikato
(1912) and Christchurch (at least 1909) while the mission administration was run
from Australia. After a substantial growth in the level of missions interest in early
1937, the new General Director of the international body of the CIM, George Gibb,
spent ten weeks in Australasia and came to the decision to separate the work in New
Zealand from Australia. Late in the year, a New Zealand member of the mission,
Eleanor Kendon, became his second wife. Two years later, the couple revisited
Australasia and saw the amalgamation of North and South Island Councils into a
single Council for the whole dominion.

The CIM had a distinctive subculture among the Protestant community of its day.
The CIM is commonly known as a “Faith Mission” and is missiologically defined as
an interdenominational society. Neither the founder nor its successors ever
pronounced that the CIMers had more faith than other Christian organisations, rather,
“faith principles” were simply a particular way of expressing their belief in divine
provision for missionary work. Having no denominational boards as their logistic
backbone and at the same time trying to avoid competition, the CIM adopted a
financial policy of no solicitation, no indebtedness and no guarantee of allowance.
Moreover, the donations received by the mission were pooled together and divided
equally among the members regardless of gender, talents, qualification, ordination
status, position, and seniority. The CIM also tended to hold a different view on

only missionary of Chinese origin sent by a New Zealand mission to China, Dr. Kathleen
Pih, was the adopted daughter of a CIM missionary Margaret Reid.

25 Nicoll joined the CIM in 1875 in London. Ten years later, J. H. Taylor sent Nicoll to
Australia to recover from dysentery. He promoted the work of the CIM there for four years.

26 For more details, see: Marcus L. Loane, The Story of the China Inland Mission in
Australia and New Zealand 1890-1964 (Sydney: CIM OMF, 1965).
women in ministry which suggests that whoever felt a call to missionary service should not be hindered on the basis of their gender. Though the CIM was not the first mission that recruited laypersons, it was the first mission that officially gave laymen and laywomen the same status as ordained clergy in a missionary team. It was a radical policy in a class-oriented society such as Britain, or in a nation that held a high regard for professionalism such as the US, but probably it was more acceptable in the frontier culture of New Zealand with its emphasis on colonial egalitarianism: humble, ordinary, everyday men and women working together toward collective team achievements. The majority of CIM missionaries were trans-Tasman Bible College graduates with minimum theological training, recruited on the basis of spiritual qualities rather than religious ordinations. Being a small country without an “established church”, denominational lines in New Zealand had generally been quite loose and blurred. Being a frontier world, pioneering New Zealanders tended to prefer hands-on experiences over book-learning. In this sense, New Zealand was good soil for this interdenominational mission.

The CIM seemed to have maintained a good relationship with the denominational missions, particularly with the Presbyterian Canton Village Mission (hereafter CVM) in its early days. As Table 1 illustrates, Presbyterians and Baptists were the largest groups in the CIM New Zealand members from 1891 to 1930. It was in such goodwill of “Protestant consensus” that Hewitson wrote to Mawson in 1906, “he [Mr. Malcolm27 of the CIM] said there should be hearty sympathy of the part of the PC towards the C.I.M., and that when men and women of our Church wish to go to the field but are not able to face the training that we demand, they should be directed to the C.I.M.”28 The proposed CVM-CIM straddle can be best illustrated by the Howie brothers: Dr. Tennyson Howie joined the CVM (in 1931) to work in Canton while Dr.

27 Probably Rev. William Malcolm (1867-1959), a Presbyterian minister who joined the CIM, worked in China between 1895 and 1924.
A. Hallam Howie joined the CIM (in 1935) to work in the Chefoo School. The high proportion of Baptists in the New Zealand team of the CIM reflects the noteworthy phenomenon of New Zealand Baptists joining non-Baptist, chiefly interdenominational missions. Since the New Zealand Baptist Foreign Missionary Society confined its ministries to India, those who felt called to work in China would generally join the CIM.

**Table 3: Denominational Background of CIM missionaries from New Zealand, 1891-1949.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Denomination</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Percentage (N=57)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baptist</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presbyterian</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brethren</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodist</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglican</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denominational background unknown</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The emphasis on missionary engagement of New Zealand Presbyterians can be traced back to the Scottish church’s commitment to missionary responsibilities from the 1820s. The first Presbyterian ministers and settlers arrived in New Zealand from the 1840s with a missionary outlook as the “mental furniture of the European”.

Besides three home missions (settler mission, Maori mission, mission to the Chinese in New Zealand), the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand (PCNZ) had three foreign missions: New Hebrides Mission (from 1866), Canton Village Mission (1901), Punjab India Mission (1908). Each worked closely with the national church of the

---

29 Dalzell has a photograph of Hallam’s visit to Tennyson at Kong Chuen (Dalzell, “New Zealanders in Republican China,” footnote 78 on page 83).
30 An incomplete list of New Zealand Baptists working in non-Baptist societies as missionaries as at 1947 was 108; it was also estimated that there had been more than 250 New Zealand Baptists working in non-Baptist missions up until 1947 (Alan A. Brash, *How Did the Church Get There: a Study of the Missionary Activity of the Churches and Missionary Societies Belonging to the National Missionary Council of New Zealand* (Christchurch, NZ: Presbyterian Bookroom, 1948), 39).
host country: New Hebrides Synod, the Church of Christ in China, and the United Church of Northern India. From 1937, the name of the Mission was changed to South China Mission to reflect the expansion of the field.

PCNZ’S China Mission was a locally developed project, and according to Tiedemann, “the first independent mission in China to be opened from the southern hemisphere”. The origin of the CVM lay in the goldfields of Otago and Southland. After a personal survey of the field, the missioner to the Chinese gold-miners, Alexander Don, persuaded the Synod to send a mission to the two villages near Canton, from where eight out of every ten Chinese miners sailed to New Zealand. The rationale was that the work among the sojourners in Otago might provide a unique inroad for the Christian message in their hometowns back China. The work of the PCNZ with Chinese nationals and Chinese immigrants is thus a fine exemplar of bridging “the China overseas” and “the China within”. In October 1901, the Synod ordained the Rev. George McNeur as its first missionary to China after his completion of preliminary Cantonese training and pastoral apprenticeship under Don. A steady flow of missionaries came from the south land of New Zealand to the south land of China over the next five decades, totalling 62.

The PCNZ set up a very structured missionary hierarchy, typical of denominational missions of its time, in which lady missionaries and ordained missionaries, single women and missionary wives had different rates of remuneration. The males usually had to go through the Knox College course while the women through the two year course at the Presbyterian Women’s Training Institute (hereafter PWTI) in addition to their respective professional courses. Up until 1930, the China Mission had sent out 42 recruits, making up 36% of the whole PCNZ foreign missionary force,

32 Brash, How Did the Church Get There, 16.
34 The only comparable missionary project that the author can think of was Florence Young’s Queensland Kanaka Mission (QKM) and its later branch South Seas Evangelical Mission (SSEM) in Solomon Islands.
outnumbering the “oldest daughter church” of the New Hebrides and the new Indian mission, although the difference from the former probably does not have any statistical significance (Table 3). The annual budget for the Presbyterian China Mission was £10,112 for the year 1947-1948, taking up 33% of the foreign mission funds (Table 4).

Table 4: The Destination of PCNZ Missionaries, 1866 – 1930.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The New Hebrides Mission</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China Mission</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India Mission</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>116</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>New Hebrides Mission</td>
<td>£2460</td>
<td>£1513</td>
<td>£1651</td>
<td>£1042</td>
<td>£973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China Mission</td>
<td>£3230</td>
<td>£7134</td>
<td>£7975</td>
<td>£4628</td>
<td>£5747</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India Mission</td>
<td>£1884</td>
<td>£5829</td>
<td>£9213</td>
<td>£10971</td>
<td>£11137</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


There were three Anglican missions that New Zealanders could join to work in China: New Zealand Church Missionary Society (NZCMS), Church of England Zenana Missionary Society (CEZMS), and Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts (SPG). NZCMS started as an auxiliary of its parent society CMS, founded in 1799 in London. The CMS’s work in New Zealand started in 1814 in the form of missionary endeavour amongst Maori. For most of the 19th century, CMS
activity in the Pacific was largely confined to New Zealand. From the 1840s, waves of systematic Anglo-European settlements had brought, what Morrison argues, the second arrival of Christianity in New Zealand. By the late 1860s, Anglicanism (40%) became the largest denomination in the colony, followed by Presbyterian (25%). The organisation of the colonial Association largely belonged to the “settler church” stream of Anglicanism, alongside a “Maori mission” component. In such a context, the New Zealand Anglican church repositioned itself in the world mission from a “mission field” to a “mission home base”.

Morrison identified several strands to the general Anglican missionary awareness which existed prior to NZCMA’s formation: the long presence of the CMS in New Zealand since 1814 on the one hand, and the puzzling absence of CMS auxiliary groups in New Zealand on the other; and the impact of ex-missionary clergy and visiting bishops; plus regular missionary publicity in diocesan periodicals (e.g. Church Gazette). The immediate catalyst for the formation of NZCMA in late 1892 was the visit of Eugene Stock and the Rev. Robert Stewart of the same year, which was possibly a partial promotion of the Keswick inspired campaign to recruit up to one thousand CMS missionaries during the 1890s. Initially formed in the more evangelical Nelson Diocese, NZCMA soon became a national organisation. Morrison pointed out two further developments of the NZCMA which were ahead of the other denominations: the formation of a Ladies’ Committee in 1895 and the appointment of a paid full time Organising Secretary in 1899. In 1916, the NZCMA was renamed the NZCMS and was duly incorporated in 1917.

---

35 Morrison, “‘It is Our Bounden Duty’,” 3.
36 Census of New Zealand, 1871, p.x.
37 Morrison, “‘It is Our Bounden Duty’,” 53.
38 Stock was the CMS Editorial Secretary.
39 Stewart was an English CMS missionary in China.
40 Morrison, “‘It is Our Bounden Duty’,” 57. In comparison, the Presbyterian General Assembly did not appoint their first fully paid Foreign Missions Secretary (Rev. Alexander Don) until 1913; the NZBMS created a paid secretarial position in 1919; and the CIM appointed its first New Zealand Organizing Secretary (Rev. H. S. Conway) in 1924.
41 Kenneth Gregory, Stretching Out Continually: “Whaatorio Tonu Atu” A History of the
The relationship between the NZCMA, the Anglican Church of “the Province of New Zealand”, and the parent society CMS had never been easy. The settlers’ church was less evangelical than the CMS and Bishop Selwyn demanded that the missionaries be placed under the control of local bishops. Meanwhile the CMS in England became more inclusive in its theology than the NZCMA. The NZCMA was entrusted with the tasks of promotion and publicity, autonomously recruiting, vetting, training and financially supporting New Zealand members while the CMS reserved the right of placement, transferring, overseeing and dismissal whenever necessary.

The first recruits, Marie Pasley and Della Hunter-Brown, were allocated to Japan in 1893. Thirteen years later, A. Maud D. Dinneen was appointed as the first NZCMA missionary to China. From that point and until 1930, China became the most common destination for NZCMA recruits, seconded by India (see Table 6). NZCMS’s China team was made up entirely of women except for Dr. Strange. Though in 1830, CMS mission statesmen still thought single women were unfit for missionary work, the feminisation of the NZCMS missionary force was perhaps

---


42 In Brash’s booklet published in 1948, the work of NZCMS is still included in the Chapter Title: “Missionary Work of the Church of the Province of New Zealand (Commonly called the Church of England)”.  
43 The Anglican Church in New Zealand had its own link with the Melanesian Mission and with the Anglican Board of Missions while CMS was a voluntary society made up of evangelical Anglicans but was not under Anglican authority. In this sense, the NZCMS was symbolically the body representing evangelicals who otherwise were weak in the New Zealand Anglican church.  
44 NZCMS had no foreign field of its own until it took over the CMS mission in Sindh, India, in its Jubilee year of 1942, Even then, women missionaries working alongside there were still under the CEZMS (Brash, *How Did the Church Get There*, 8).  
45 CMS received the first offers of service from single women in 1815 but declined it. In 1830 Bishop Wilson, while appealing for money for the instruction of women and for mission households to take girls in to teach, feed, and clothe, emphatically turned down one single lady who wished to go to China: “No, the lady will not do. I object on principle to single ladies coming out to so distant a place with the almost certainty of marrying within a month of their arrival” (Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society in New Zealand*, 316).
a logical consequence of CMS's policy change in 1890 which was revised to cover cases of female candidates received by the Committee in London.\textsuperscript{46}

### Table 6: The Destination of NZCMS Missionaries, 1893 – 1930.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>Melanesia</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Solomon Islands)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>Tanganyika</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>Palestine</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ceylon</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Morrison, Morrison, “Appendix 6 – Listing of Known New Zealand Missionaries, 1867-1930” in “It is Our Bounden Duty,” 296-351.

The SPG was an English society formed in 1701 with a charter issued by King William III at the request of the Bishop of London. Unlike the CMS, the SPG was always under the control of the bishops, although it was established to enable outreach in areas beyond the English established church. Starting off as a pastoral care mission aimed at providing priests and school teachers for the colonists in America, the SPG expanded into multiple fields around the globe during the era of British colonial exploration. It was not until the second half of the 19\textsuperscript{th} Century that single women were accepted by this Society as overseas missionaries. The SPG did not have a formal branch in New Zealand during the time period covered by this study. A New Zealand minister, the Rev. C.W. McDouall of Oamaru, joined the SPG and started working in the North China diocese from 1909. On his furlough back home, he recruited several women missionaries. As a result, the North China mission became the "field" for New Zealand recruits. As in the NZCMS, women (9) outnumbered men (2) disproportionately in the New Zealand team of the SPG. In

April 1912 the CMS, CEZMS and SPG churches in China became part of the Zhonghua Shenggong hui (中华圣公会), the Chinese national church of the Anglican Communion in China.

Three missions of the six missionary institutions (the NZCMS, the SPG, the Melanesian Mission, the Diocese of Polynesia, the Jerusalem and the East Mission, and the Mission to the Chinese in New Zealand) coordinated with the New Zealand Anglican Board of Missions to aim for the evangelisation of the Chinese. In the budget ending 30th June 1948, the allocation of a total annual mission fund of £21,900 was outlined in Table 7. Taken together, the money invested in China missions was approximately about £4867, 22% of the whole mission budget.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mission</th>
<th>Funds allocated £</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Melanesian Mission</td>
<td>9000.00</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZCMS</td>
<td>8000.00</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diocese of Polynesia</td>
<td>2600.00</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPG</td>
<td>1450.00</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jerusalem and East Mission</td>
<td>400.00</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mission to Chinese in NZ</td>
<td>450.00</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>21900.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Brash, How Did the Church Get There, 11.

The Anglican missions to China provided a typical model for most other denominational missions with a field in China, such as the FAU, the Salvation Army,

---

47 This estimate is taking the China mission of the NZCMA (£2967), the SPG (£1450), the home mission to the Chinese (£450) together.
48 There was an increase of £1100 to NZCMS for the year to cover development work in the district of Sind, India. If this amount is taken out, the usual annual fund should be £6900. If the proportion of fund dedicated for the China mission was determined by the proportion of China missionaries to the total number of NZCMS, China mission probably took 43% of the sum according to Table 7, i.e. £2967.
According to Peter Lineham, New Zealand’s first Brethren missionary was James Kirk, who went to Argentine in 1896, followed by a party of five to Malaya.\textsuperscript{49} Morrison’s study shows that the Brethren community in New Zealand has had a much stronger missionary outlook than any other denominations. The ratio of missionary to membership was 1:186 in the 1890s and was 1:129 during 1900-1926.\textsuperscript{50} The Brethren missions were also far more dispersed than any of the New Zealand missions under review. Among the twenty “fields”, India attracted 43% of the New Zealand Brethren up until 1930. China, in comparison, was much less popular, ranking after Argentine, Malaya, Bolivia and Paraguay. Most Brethren leaders and missionaries were self-taught and tended to have a low view of both church and formal training. Another feature of the Brethren mission is that their personnel seemed to be more mobile across nations and countries and thus some have been counted more than once in Table 8.

The first New Zealand Brethren missionary to China, Oscar Persson, sailed in April 1904, followed by the famous “two Alices” (Alice Gresham and Alice Rout) in September of the same year. From 1904 to 1949, a total of 14 Brethren sailed to China as missionaries, of whom eight were women and six were men.

\textsuperscript{49} Peter Lineham, \textit{There We Found Brethren: A History of Assemblies of Brethren in New Zealand} (Palmerston North, N.Z.: GPH Society, 1977), 143.
\textsuperscript{50} Morrison, “‘It is Our Bounden Duty’,” 110.
Table 8: The Destinations of New Zealand Brethren Missionaries, 1896 – 1930.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>Holland</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argentine</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaya</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>Palestine</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bolivia</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>Fiji</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paraguay</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>Ceylon</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uruguay</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>Peru</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congo</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>Central Africa</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Guiana &amp; Jamaica</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>Chad</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>Field unknown</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Total = 129</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Morrison, Morrison, “Appendix 6 – Listing of Known New Zealand Missionaries, 1867-1930” in “It is Our Bounden Duty,” 296-351.

2.2. The Spectacle of the Chinese Immigrants in Comparison with New Zealand Missionary Recruits for China

The picture of the “home-base” would be incomplete without a description of the presence of “Asian aliens”, largely Chinese, the very people that New Zealand missionaries traveled by seas and lands to make contact with. Robin Hyde’s semi-autobiography, *The Godwits Fly*, suggests two images of “China” that alternate in the minds of an average New Zealander, a hazily defined romantic distant China and one that was associated with the mundane local Chinese scenes.51 The “local image” is well captured in *Aliens at the Table*, a book based on the content and

---

visual analysis of cartoons appearing in New Zealand newspapers between 1865 and 2005. Under the sensationally worded title “Ugly Asians -- the faceless Mongolian horde”, the authors summarised the image of the Chinese, over one and half centuries in the eyes of their “Kiwi” beholders, in the following terms:

The Chinese were seen to be weak and effete in physique, and cunning and sycophantic in manners. Their ‘sickly smile’ too often disguised their evil intentions towards gullible Europeans. They were also considered to be dangerous because they could be carriers of leprosy and other unspeakable infectious diseases. The ugly, dirty and mysteriously evil Chinatown quarters were dens of sin. .... In contemporary times the Asians are undesirable in other ways. As shown in some contemporary cartoons, they still have buck teeth and leering smiles, and now they also wear thick glasses. They are too rich and brash, as well as arrogant. They all live in over-sized houses and drive late-model expensive cars, which become lethal weapons because of their hazardous driving habits. As every true Kiwi would know, the term ‘Asian’ has taken the place of ‘women’ as the synonym for ‘bad driver’. Furthermore, they may be members of mysterious and powerful triads and bring in crime. ...They look so alike.  

The Chinese arrived in New Zealand in organised numbers about a quarter of a century earlier than the organised recruitment of New Zealand missionaries to China. 

---

53 The CIM was the first mission society to systematically recruit New Zealanders for the China field. The sailing year (1891) of Annie Harrison is often used to mark the beginning of New Zealand’s missionary effort in China.
19th Century as “creating a fairer Britain of the South Seas”, the first group of 12 Chinese miners arrived from Victoria, Australia, in 1866 at the invitation of the Dunedin Chamber of Commerce to work in the Otago mines deserted by European miners. While the number of Chinese rapidly grew, so did anti-Chinese prejudice.

By 1871 there were calls to restrict Chinese immigration. The Anti-Chinese Association, the Anti-Chinese League, the Anti-Asiatic League and the White New Zealand League were formed around the turn of the century, which was, ironically, around the same time the first wave of missionary interest for the China field formed in New Zealand. Imitating the practices of other British colonies of Canada and Australia, New Zealand imposed an entry tax on Chinese immigrants. The Chinese Immigrants Act of 1881 introduced a ‘poll tax’ of £10 (equivalent to $1600 in 2011), together with a restriction on ships’ passengers – one Chinese passenger per 10 tons of cargo. In 1896 the ratio was reduced to one passenger per 200 tons of cargo, and the poll tax was increased to £100 (equivalent to $18,000 in 2011), an amount equivalent to the annual salary of PCNZ’s single women and widow missionaries. Although the tax was waived by the minister of customs from 1934, it was not repealed until 1944, when all other countries had abandoned it. Moreover, other statutory discriminations imposed on Chinese immigrants had included: the creation of Chinese – the First Immigrants,” http://www.teara.govt.nz/en/chinese/2, accessed December 10, 2012.

Wong Ahpoo Hock Ting (also known as Appo Hocton) was the first known Chinese settled in New Zealand after the British annexation of Aotearoa. Hock arrived in Nelson in 1842 and was naturalized in 1852. Edward Gibbon Wakefield formulated detailed plans to bring in Chinese as valuable labour in 1853. Wakefield eventually gave up this scheme as the oppositions was too strong. See Manying Ip. “Chinese - The First immigrants,” Te Ara - the Encyclopedia of New Zealand, updated March 4, 2009, URL: http://www.TeAra.govt.nz/en/chinese/2, accessed April 9, 2012.

“Poll tax on Chinese immigrants abolished,” URL: http://www.nzhistory.net.nz/poll-tax-on-chinese-immigrants-abolished, (Ministry for Culture and Heritage), updated August 30, 2012, accessed April 9, 2013. As a comparison, South Australia, Victoria, and NSW introduced the £10 poll tax in the same year (i.e. 1881), while the restriction on passage for Victoria and NSW was one Chinese per every 100 tons. Queensland and NSW increased the poll tax to £100 in 1887 and 1888, and the restriction on passage to one Chinese per every 300 tons.

of a requirement from 1907 that all arrivals would be required to sit an English reading test; the naturalisation of Chinese, which was stopped in 1908 and did not resume until 1952 while permanent residency was denied from 1926; a new regulation which was introduced from 1908 such that Chinese who wished to leave the country temporarily needed re-entry permits, which were thumb-printed; and Chinese people being deprived of the universally-available retirement pension, until 1936. The post-World War I climate in New Zealand was anti-Asian; few New Zealanders appreciated the fact that China was an ally of the British Empire, and that the Chinese authorities did their best to expel all Germans in the Far East. “We fought not for the Chinese but for a white New Zealand” was the popular slogan of the time. As a result, the “Permit System” of the Immigration Restriction Amendment Act required all incoming Chinese to be given only temporary permits of six months to two years.

Statutory complications arose when Dr. Kathleen Pih, one of only two Chinese Nationals to be granted the status of a naturalised New Zealander between 1904 and 1951, was accepted as a missionary to China. The PCNZ Foreign Mission Committee secretary had to make numerous inquiries on behalf of Dr. Pih as “passports are not ordinarily issued to Chinese immigrants naturalised in New Zealand”.58 On receiving “an ordinary New Zealand passport”, the Secretary still had to write to the comptroller of Customs to confirm whether it was still necessary for Pih to apply to the Customs authorities for a permit to return to New Zealand within a specified time on racial grounds.59

World War II changed the fate of Republican China as well as the fate of its emigrants in the South Pacific. As a result of the pleading made by the Presbyterian

58 Mawson to Pih, July 9, 1930, CVM, staff file, Dr. Pih, 1929-1938, AA10/3, PCNZ Archive, Knox College, Dunedin.
59 Mawson to Pih, August 14, 1930, CVM, staff file, Dr. Pih, 1929-1938, AA10/3, PCNZ Archive, Knox College, Dunedin.
Church on behalf of the Chinese immigrants, the New Zealand Government gave permission for the immediate family of these residents to seek refuge in the dominion under restricted conditions. This provision was considered a benevolent act because even permanent-resident Chinese had had no right to apply for their wives and dependent children to join them. When the Pacific war was over and the civil war started in China, the Presbyterian Church lobbied the government again to grant permanent residence to these Chinese dependents. Since then, the “dying race” of a community, largely made of “men alone”, has been able to reproduce itself on a much larger scale.

The profile of Chinese immigrants in New Zealand was partly shaped by the pull factors and the restriction imposed by New Zealand, and partly by the push factor in South China. The original reasons for choosing Chinese miners to rework abandoned claims included: they were thought to be hardworking, inoffensive, and they were bachelor sojourners rather than settlers so would not eventually upset the racial balance of a White New Zealand. The overall picture of the early Chinese miners seemed to fit the expectations. An interesting observation can be formed by a comparison between the profile of Chinese miners in New Zealand and that of New Zealand missionaries in China. Firstly, both groups were composed of young adults. Most Chinese arrived in New Zealand were under 35 years of age. Likewise, according to Morrison, the average age of New Zealand missionaries up to the 1920s was 28.60 Due to the demand of learning a second language, the usual age requirement for missionaries was that they be under 30. Edith Searell was initially turned down due to the fact that she was aged 35. She was eventually accepted on the understanding that she would join the teaching staff of Chefoo School.61 Samuel Dyer was another exception, who finally sailed for China at the age of 44. He was accepted because he had been acquainted with the Chinese culture during his

60 Morrison, “It is Our Bounden Duty”,” 269.
childhood in Malaya, and his appointment as the BFBS agent in China would never require face-to-face communication with local Chinese on a daily basis. These exceptions prove the rule. Ordained clergy and medical doctors were consistently older due to the length of their professional training. The CIM, as a result of its extensive recruitment of laymen and women, and its emphasis on language acquisition, perhaps had the youngest cohort of personnel on departure.

Secondly, the Chinese miners as a group were perhaps more fit physically, compared to the average class of immigrants, among whom some came on medical advice to recover from certain illnesses (particularly tuberculosis) via a sea voyage or outdoor living. Although the standard of health care was very low in rural Canton, those admitted in New Zealand were remarkably healthy as a result of the medical screening at the ports of departure and arrival. Likewise, all mission societies used a comprehensive medical scheme to screen out candidates who did not appear to be robust and resilient enough to endure the extreme climate of China. For example, Reginald Sturt came to Australasia on such medical advice (he would not have been allowed to enter New Zealand if he had been a Chinese), and he was turned down by the CIM twice for medical reasons. Despite medical advice, he worked for more than forty years in northern China, and outlived his two wives.

Thirdly, nearly all Chinese of that generation hoped to return home eventually and sent savings home whenever they were able. However, many of them arrived under the credit ticket system, by which a guarantor – commonly a relative, village elder or prospective employer – advanced the fare and also the poll tax. It usually took immigrants some years to repay the debt. In comparison, mission workers of that generation were what is called today “career missionaries”, who intended to work in China until retirement. In a strange sense, missionary men and women also had to work for a certain number of years in order to cover the cost of their outfit and voyage. The CIM Field Manual spelled out the terms of resignation and
reimbursement:

... anyone leaving the Mission before the end of the second year of residence in China will be expected, as soon as able, to refund in full any sums expended by the Mission towards his or her outfit or passage money; if during the third year, three-quarters of the amount; if during the fourth year, one-half; and if during the fifth year, one-quarter. ...In the case of any probationer or member leaving the Mission within three years of arrival in China, for marriage, for salaried employment or for purposes of trade, the amount expended on the support of such probationer or member from the time of his arrivals in China should be added to that expended on the outfit and passage money, and be repayable in like proportion. 62

The Manual goes on to stipulate that missionaries resigning after taking furlough should refund to the Mission the “sending costs”.

The PCNZ’s Mission Handbook contained similar clauses:

Every missionary shall, on appointment, sign an undertaking to repay to the Foreign Missions Committee the sum expended on training, outfit, and passage, in the event of withdrawal from the mission within eight years after arrival on the field, a fifth part of the amount being remitted for each year of service (not including furloughs), after three full years on the field.63

Next, nearly all Chinese emigrants came from a peasant background around the Pearl

---

63 Constitution of the CVM of the PCNZ, 1910?, 5.
River delta area in Guangdong (广东) province. Some might be illiterate in their native language, though by 1907 all had to pass an English reading test in order to be admitted to New Zealand. Village life had taught these Chinese transferrable life skills to work in the mining claims, and later in the market gardening and fruit selling trades. According to Census records, the most common occupation for the Chinese immigrants in 1894 was mining and quarrying and in 1926 was agricultural and pastoral work. Jean McNeur thought the Chinese made “admirable domestic servants, being easily trained, deft, willing and faithful to their employers”. They also worked as chimney-builders, thatchers, carpenters or cabinet makers, whatever the occasion demanded.

Both Chinese immigrants to New Zealand and “Kiwi” missionaries to China had to be handymen to survive in a new country. In comparison, the missionary cohort had much higher educational attainments. Denominational mission boards particularly set very high standards for candidates, who must be qualified as clergy, or educational or medical professionals. It is not an exaggeration to argue that New Zealand had sent some of its finest men and women to work in China as missionaries. Having said this, many grew up or lived in a farm or a bush-settler’s home as part of their socialisation, worked to varying frequency as bushmen, dairymen, fencers, carpenters, in addition to keeping poultry, bees and/or a vegetable garden, and hunting for ducks, hares and eels. Some worked as temporary hands and seasonal labour or hired as “roundabouts” as part of their student life. Almost all women candidates worked as domestic helpers in either their own family home or someone

64 About 67% of them came from Panyu (番禺) county; the rest were from Siyi (四邑), Zengcheng (增城), Dongguan (东莞) and Zhongshan (中山). The Chinese name Siyi means “four cities”, which further includes Xinhui (新会), Kaiping (开平), Enping (恩平), and Taishan (台山) counties.
65 That is, 4067 out of a total Chinese population of 4794 (84.8%), (Census of New Zealand, quoted in Jean McNeur, “The Chinese in New Zealand,” 72).
66 That is, 1193 out of a total Chinese population of 2936 (40.6%), (Census of New Zealand, quoted in Jean McNeur, “The Chinese in New Zealand,” 72)
else’s. The “Number Eight Wire Mentality”\(^{68}\) loosely refers to a cluster of qualities such as fixing anything, making anything work, and coping with anything, qualities that often formed where specialised craftsmen were not available. In a colonial society such as New Zealand, “Jack of all trades” was a term of unqualified approval while in rural Britain; alternatively, the same phrase was followed inevitably by the qualifier “but master of none”.\(^{69}\) The colonial frontier was, in this sense, an ideal training ground for missionary fields.

The myth of “Kiwi ingenuity” was most pronounced in the recruitment of FAU members in New Zealand. Due to the nature of the emergency and relief work involved in war-torn China, the Reinforcement Committee was looking for men with technical skills as well as high degree of ingenuity. World War II interrupted the professional training and careers of most pacifists in New Zealand, for many had to take on temporary jobs to make a living or were “manpowered” into essential industries against their preferences. The British FAU representative, Wilym Jenkins, had such a great faith in the New Zealanders’ natural resourcefulness to rough it and to improvise that he justified the lack of pre-field training on the ground that these recruits would quickly learn on the job.\(^{70}\) The myth seemed have travelled to the field across the sea faster than the “Kiwi” recruits, such that they were greeted at the hostel upon arrival: “The New Zealanders are here -- and do not they look tough!”\(^{71}\) The “Kiwi” recruits did survive the test encapsulated in the FAU’s motto of “Go Anywhere, Do Anything”. Taking Lindsay Crozier as an example, Crozier found his first job, as a young adult, in a rabbit-processing factory. He then spent two years in a photographic studio while taking teacher training. After successfully appealing

\(^{68}\) No. 8 fencing wire with a certain thickness is used in farming business for a wide range of purposes.


\(^{71}\) Graham Milne, Interview by Caitriona Cameron, July 1, 1988, Oral History Collection, MS C 2113, quoted in Cameron, *Go Anywhere Do Anything*, 43.
against military service, he was forced to work in a bacon factory as all conscientious objectors had to leave publicly funded positions. When he joined the FAU in China as a medical mechanic, his multi-skills proved most valuable when he travelled from place to place to repair hospital equipment, to remove bombs and to make artificial limbs from crashed aluminum, turning bombers into bedpans. Crozier was also asked to undertake phonographic and filming work, which led to his appointment as the Compound and Works Manager for the PCNZ mission. 72 The Johnson brothers were another classic case. Neil, the older brother, having completed a degree in science and physics, found the only work available was war-related. While working in a sheep station as a clerk, he studied accountancy at night. John, the younger brother, was dismissed from his apprenticeship in fitting and turning as a result of refusing to work on machine-gun mountings. He had to take on a variety of temporary jobs until joining a Ministry of Works survey gang in North Canterbury. When the Johnson brothers went to China with the FAU, they were assigned a series of jobs, ranging from driver, mechanic to hospital business manager and finance officer, not to mention the various engineering projects they were involved with. 73

The last, but not the least, feature of the Chinese spectacle was their “wifelessness”. Given the expected age for marriage was around the mid-teens in China, many Chinese men were married on arrival, but hardly anyone brought his wife and/or family with him. They were thus perceived as bachelors and counted as “never married” in the census! According to Table 9, even before the introduction of the poll tax, which was considered a disincentive to bring women, there were only 9 women to 4424 men (1:492) in 1878. This was equivalent to 492 Chinese men to every Chinese woman. This ratio remained more or less so for the next forty years and only eased slightly in 1926 to 316 women to 2770 men (i.e. 87 men to every

73 See pages indexed under "Johnson" in Cameron’s Go Anywhere Do Anything.
woman). This pattern of sex ratio was also typical throughout the North American “Gold Mountain” and the Down Under “New Gold Mountain”. The so called “never married” category of Chinese men was correspondingly high between 1874 and 1916, remaining over 90% of the total male population, only dropping to 38% in 1926. Given that married Chinese men (i.e. with wives in Australasia) always outnumbered married Chinese women, most would have married Irish or Maori women.

Table 9: Marriage status of Chinese in New Zealand, 1874-1926.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Never married</th>
<th>Married</th>
<th>Widowed</th>
<th>Unspecified</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1874</td>
<td>4785</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4814</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878</td>
<td>4352</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4424</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>4409</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>3574</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3685</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1906</td>
<td>2435</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1916</td>
<td>1747</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>1933</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1926</td>
<td>1049</td>
<td>1493</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>2770</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Never married</th>
<th>Married</th>
<th>Widowed</th>
<th>Unspecified</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1874</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1878</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1886</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1906</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1916</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1926</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


74 Chinese men not having wives in New Zealand or any Australian States were to be recorded as unmarried.

75 Other figures: There were only nine women to 4,995 men in 1881 – the year that saw the
The gender pattern for the missionary force was also imbalanced, but in the opposite way: there were approximately twice as many women to men in this missionary cohort when missionary wives are included retrospectively (see Table 10). This is in line with the general gender ratio of the New Zealand missionary force between 1868 and 1930. Nearly all men were joined by their wives or got married within the first term, while many “unattached” women remained single. The missionary male was one of the very first examples of “family man” in a colonist frontier. This pattern was transplanted from “Mission to New Zealand” to “Missions from New Zealand”.

---

76 According to Morrison, women made up 60% of the New Zealand recruits for this period (Morrison, “It is Our Bounden Duty”, 1). Moreover, women made up 70% of the white staff in the New Zealand Methodist mission to the Solomons up from 1922 to 1972 (Daphne N. Beniston, The Call of the Solomons: The New Zealand Methodist Women’s Response (Auckland N.Z.; Wesley Historical Society, 1994), 1).
77 Hayden Mellsop (CIM) was probably the only known New Zealand man who had never married.
Table 10: Number and Percentage of China Missionaries from New Zealand by Mission Organisations and by Gender.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CIM</td>
<td>41 (40%)</td>
<td>60 (60%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCNZ</td>
<td>23 (34%)</td>
<td>41 (64%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglican (NZCMS, CEZMS &amp; SPG)</td>
<td>3 (9%)</td>
<td>31 (91%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brethren</td>
<td>6 (43%)</td>
<td>8 (57%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAU</td>
<td>10 (83%)</td>
<td>2 (17%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salvation Army</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>8 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LMS</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSM</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Church of Canada</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shanghai Hebrew Mission</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BMS</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BFBS</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWCA</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Board of Missions</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bible Christian Church Mission</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mission background unknown</td>
<td>2 (50%)</td>
<td>2 (50%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>87 (34%)</td>
<td>168 (65%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Contrary to the common view that men are more risk-taking and adventure-seeking, the first China missionaries for both the CIM and NZCMA were women. Women outnumbered men in nearly all China missions except the FAU, whose activities involved physically dangerous work and mechanical skills that were almost exclusively monopolised by men in those days. Women made up the entire New Zealand list for the CSM and the Salvation Army. The issue of what might be called “feminisation” is most dramatic for the Anglican missions. The number of CEZMS workers is so small (i.e. three) that they are unlikely to skew the ratio.
2.3. Intertwined Racial and Gender Politics

Much work has been done on the Chinese in New Zealand or New Zealand Chinese, but few of the scholars looked at the “problem” of the early Chinese miners from the broad picture of the gendered culture of the country. One of the reasons given by the anti-Chinese activists/movements was that the single Chinese men were perceived as posing a sexual threat to white womanhood. The Chinese were regarded as undesirable not only because of their “flat faces, slit eyes and stub noses”, which were symbols of ugliness according to the standard of European beauty. Eugenics and social Darwinism prevailing in the 1920s and 1930s added to the fear that they might “tamper with girls”. If European and Maori women were enticed by “the almond-eyed” Chinese men, any offspring would become “mongrels” and thus would lead to a “piebald New Zealand”. As the readers will see in Chapter IV, such a belief was in sharp contrast with the general missionary perception of China that it was safe for single women missionaries to travel with Chinese male servants and among Chinese civilians.

A popular explanation of the overrepresentation of women in English missions was the surplus of over one million unmarried women in the British Isles. Regardless of the validity of this claim, it never applied to the colony of New Zealand. According

---


80 Ip and Murphy, Aliens at My Table, 87.

81 Analyses of census dating from 1851 to early 20th Century show that the excess of women were exaggerated as the “over one million unmarried surplus women” were among mainly
to Census data as summarised in Table 11, men outnumbered women in New Zealand as a whole, and in its major provinces, right through the turn of the Century. The gender imbalance among the Chinese was in itself, an extreme form of the overall picture of a frontier society. The first census in 1851 recorded a sex ratio of 160 men for every 100 women in the non-Maori population while the arrival figures for Chinese immigrants were 1596 men for zero women in 1871. Some assisted female immigrant schemes throughout the Nineteenth Century were specifically designed to overcome the sex ratio imbalance in the colony. As a solution to the surplus women in Britain and surplus men in the dominions after World War I, a similar scheme was introduced to offer free passage to British women aged between 18 and 40 to emigrate to New Zealand in the 1920s, with the hope that they too would take part in the breeding of “a new Britain under the Southern Cross”. This imbalanced sex ratio more or less persisted until World War I for the Pakeha population and until World War II for the Chinese population. New Zealand was not only considered by prospective migrants as a “man’s country”, but also as a “white man’s country”. While the “Pakeha Man Alone” had never married in its literal sense, many of the “Chinese Men Alone” were actually married men who left wives at home to look after the men’s parents, due to a combined effects of their sojourn mentality and the prohibitive cost of the toll tax. According to Jock Phillips’ work


83 About 12,000 young single women, who were brought out to be domestic servants and almost inevitably became wives, arrived on subsidized fares during this period. See: Charlotte MacDonald, A Woman of Good Character: Single Women as Immigrant Settlers in Nineteenth-Century New Zealand (Wellington, N.Z.: Allen and Unwin/Historical Branch; Bridget Williams Books, 1990).

84 In traditional Chinese society, when men were traveling on business or for work, they were usually without the company of women (be it mother, wife, sister or daughter). That was why the Qing Government prohibited the presence of western women in the trading port Canton even during business season. It was expected that western men should be doing business without the company of women in the same way that Chinese men were. For an academic discussion on this issue, see: Guo Weidong 郭卫东 “Yapian Zhanzheng
on the historical meaning of Pakeha masculinity in New Zealand, many men in 19th Century New Zealand spent most of their time in the exclusive company of their own sex, and held women and marriage in contempt. Mating was almost seen as an act of treason to mateship. Exclusive male community, while seemingly normal, or even legendary when associated with white colonists, was seen as disgraceful or even sinful when it occurred among Chinese gold-miners.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Auckland</th>
<th>Wellington</th>
<th>Canterbury</th>
<th>Otago</th>
<th>New Zealand</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1861</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>352</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1871</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


It is evident that masculinity has different meaning for each ethnic group in Aotearoa/New Zealand. The masculine qualities that are associated with the notion of the “Pakeha Man Alone”, of independence, egalitarianism, and anti-intellectualism, were hardly envisaged for the “Chinese Man Alone”. Physical violence or anti-authoritarianism was never considered as part of the “yellow peril”. It was mainly the threat to racial purity that alarmed the anti-Chinese leagues. Being a China-born-and-grown missionary daughter, Jean McNeur had a far more informed and balanced view than her contemporaries. Nonetheless, her description of the

qianhou waiguo funv jinru zhongguo tongshang kou’an wenti’ 鸦片战争前后外国妇女进入中国通商口岸问题 [The Problem of Foreign Women Entering Chinese Treating Ports around the Opium War], Modern China History Studies 《近代史研究》 (1)1999, 242-268.

“general features” of the Chinese community was associated with more womanly qualities: honesty, sobriety, thrift, frugality, civility, patience, trustworthiness, docility, and law-abidingness. In sympathy with the Chinese, McNeur seemed to lift the image of the Chinese men to a level with that of colonial women. For example, her emphasis on the Chinese virtue of sobriety easily reminded her readers about the women’s temperance movement forty years earlier. Returning to China as a missionary the year after the completion of her thesis, Jean McNeur eventually saw the Chinese becoming the “model minority of the country” in the late 1940s, marked by the granting of permanent residential right, which was surprisingly similar to how New Zealand women had become the “moral fibre of the nation” in the late 1890s, marked by the granting of voting rights. Kate Sheppard’s argument to the Premier, Richard Seddon, was unapologetically racist: “any naturalized negro or Chinaman was eligible to take his seat in Parliament, but the most refined and cultured woman could not so serve her country.” After all, white womenhood and Chinamen belonged to two different worlds of politics.

While the notion of Family Man promoted a solution to lock a mobile Pakeha male labour force into the realm of marriage and family, it was not applicable to Chinese bachelors since intermarriage was not considered desirable, especially when the Chinese men had wives back in their villages. The social function of Pakeha women was to reproduce “British stock”, not “half-castes”. The breeding of a new generation of the “yellow race” also ran contrary to the national goal of the white policy. Ironically, as history turned out, the Pakeha gendered culture provides a means by which Maori, Pacific Islanders, and Chinese could be assimilated into the mainstream society. The Chinese miners were ‘Men Alone’ in the late 19th century while the Post-World War II Chinese market-gardeners and fruiterers had become

87 In her generally sympathetic thesis, Jean McNeur could not find a more appropriate word than “half-caste” for children of inter-cultural parents (p.52). It was the language of the day, which reflected and shaped the mentality of the day.
“Family Men” as their wives and children were allowed to join them as war refugees during Pacific War and to stay permanently after the War.

### 2.4. Efforts of Home Mission

Since the Chinese population living in the country were quite visible, it seemed natural for evangelical New Zealanders to share the gospel with this unevangelised community. The Church took this initiative. The Presbyterian, Anglican, and Baptist churches had made organised efforts to reach this group. One of these home missions grew into a foreign mission.

As early as 1868, the Otago Synod of the PCNZ saw in the thousands of “Chinese strangers within the gates” a missionary call. Within two years, the home mission to the Chinese began with the “import” of a Chinese catechist from Australia. After frequent change of personnel, the Synod decided to train its own missioner instead of seeking outside help. That was when Alexander Don came into the picture. He was sent to Canton to study the language for 18 months and began his ministry to the Chinese miners from 1883, when the numbers started to dwindle. Don supplemented his work at Riverton and Lawrence with an annual inland tour during which he visited virtually every Chinese of Otago and Southland. Don became known as “Jesus Don” by his parishioners. In April 1897, a Chinese Church opened in Dunedin, where the largest single Chinese community was living by then. Perhaps disappointed with the lack of success of the home mission, after a trip to Canton in 1897 and 1898, Don caught a vision to “export” this missionary endeavor to the home villages where the Chinese miners came from or had returned to in South China. That became the PCNZ’s Canton Village Mission.

Dunedin Baptists started English classes for Chinese from 1897; one of these was launched as a preparatory school for foreign missionary candidates. From 1900, the Hanover Street “Baptist class” was taken over by the renowned Baptist minister, the
Rev. Alfred North. Fifteen Chinese were baptised through this class and nine of their Pakeha teachers entered into some forms of foreign missionary work.\(^{88}\) When many Chinese moved from the Otago goldfields to the cities for urban work, the Wellington Baptists also started a mission to the Chinese. In a similar manner, the Anglican Church began reaching out to Chinese immigrants from the early 1900s, in the greater regions of Wellington and Christchurch as well as an area represented by a line from New Plymouth to Napier. During the depression years of 1931-32, the Baptist and Anglican missions joined hands in Wellington. Such missionary endeavour was regarded by the missionary statesman Brash as a “foreign mission”.\(^{89}\) The Methodist Church at one stage had an outreach programme for the Chinese immigrants as part of their Dunedin Central Mission.\(^{90}\) Nonetheless, the size of the personnel involved in these home missions was very small and at times irregular.

There are at least two phenomena that seem puzzling. While the Christian community in China was growing at a steady rate, the equally dedicated effort met with little success among Chinese in New Zealand. In 1878, compared with a population of 4379 Chinese believing in Confucianism and Buddhism, there were only 54 self-declared Protestant Chinese. The later number grew to 73 in 1881.\(^{91}\) The religious mapping of the Chinese population became more mixed as time passed by. The decrease in the Buddhist/Confucianist adherents was interpreted as consequences of “blind assimilation” into New Zealand British life”.\(^{92}\) As suggested in Table 12, the total portion of self-claimed Chinese Protestants (32%) had, by 1936, well exceeded that of Chinese Buddhist/Confucianist.

---


\(^{89}\) Brash, *How Did the Church Get There*, p.9.


### Table 12: Chinese Religious Affiliations in 1936

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Buddhist/ Pagans/</th>
<th>Anglican</th>
<th>Presbyterian</th>
<th>Baptist</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Protestant</th>
<th>Catholic</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Full blood</td>
<td>760</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>267</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>2570</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed blood</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>363</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>subtotal</td>
<td>761</td>
<td>324</td>
<td>268</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>330</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>2933</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Another phenomenon that required explanations was that all three home missions suffered from a lack of suitable staff and frequent changes in pastoral personnel. It seemed ironic for a country “exporting” hundreds of missionaries to China having to “import” several from overseas to cater for the Chinese among them. This pattern persisted right into the 1970s. When Sturt W. Greif was conducting research into the political attitude of the Chinese community, he found that Chinese clergy were always drawn from overseas, usually Hong Kong and there had been no single case of New Zealand Chinese ordained into the New Zealand ministry. Very few New Zealand missionaries had contacted the “Chinese within” before or after they were sent to the “Chinese overseas”. Even for the CVM missionaries, the local Chinese communities or congregations mainly served as an experimental lab for missionary training, a temporary placement for missionaries on furlough or recuperation, or a place for semi-retirement transition.

---

93 For details, see George H. McNeur, *The Church and the Chinese in New Zealand* (Christchurch, N.Z.: Presbyterian Bookroom, 1951).


95 Joseph Thompson (CIM) and Maud Cannon (Methodist) were among the few exceptions who taught the local Chinese immigrants before sailing for China. For Myrie Wood (CIM) and Hayden Mellsop (CIM), their childhood encounter with Chinese market-gardeners was remembered as a “seed” for their missionary motivation.
Answers to the above issues have to address the question of motivation. A search for motivation is always difficult to establish. Scholarly reflections have varied from time to time and person to person. Having grown up in a mission compound in South China and educated in South Otago where the Presbyterian Chinese church was located, Jean McNeur might have pondered the differences between the two branches of evangelism. Starting with the following statement: “Mission work among the New Zealand Chinese has its own particular difficulties which, in most respects, are greater than those experienced by missionaries in China itself”, she cited both the past-orientedness of the Chinese and their unjust treatment in New Zealand as two main reasons. Sixty years later, the PCNZ re-evaluated their earlier effort to evangelise the Chinese immigrants as “quite unexpected” to start with, citing “linguistic barrier, cultural difference”, and “the devotion to the religion of gold” as problems on the part of the Chinese, “blunderings”, “paternalist overtones”, and lack of sympathy on the part of the Church. By then, the Church had also become more aware that the “Presbyterians were far more bound up with Anglo-Celtic culture than they realised”.

The author has several plausible explanations in addition to make sense of the above ostensible contradictions. Firstly, the size of the Chinese community in New Zealand was too small to stir attention and urgency. The highest number of Chinese emigrants was recorded in 1881 when it was 5004 (including 9 women), a drop in the sea compared to the picture of China itself with “a million a month dying without God”.

Secondly, the Chinese community was concentrated in certain parts of New Zealand,

---

97 Ibid., 73-74.
99 It was the motto or the catch word of the CIM, as well as the rationale behind the title of the mission’s monthly magazine: China’s Millions.
particularly in the gold fields of Otago. By the time that the Chinese were more scattered in the main city centres as well as some small towns, their numbers had greatly diminished and thus became much less visible. Alexander Don’s records of annual up-country tours gave some idea of how geographically spread the Chinese were even in the area of Otago. In the summer season of 1888-1889, he had to spend 55 days travelling 2067 miles in order to meet 1150 people in person in a total Chinese population of 1380.\footnote{Alexander Don, \textit{Chinese Missions in Otago}, quoted in McNeur, “The Chinese in New Zealand,” 79.} This was the highest figure in his record in terms of numbers. While the population had steadily decreased to 436 people in 1907-1908, the traveling mileage seemed to have increased, which suggests a further dispersal of the Chinese residents. A minister who accompanied Don for part of his tour complained of “ten miles for one man; half a day for two”.\footnote{McNeur, \textit{The Church and the Chinese in New Zealand}, 23.} Eventually it was no longer considered worthwhile to continue these tours.

By the 1920s, Rev. E. Y. Lee, the Chinese Deacon and later missioner of the Anglican Chinese mission was complaining that his “parish” was defined on ethnic grounds instead of being geographical grounds, and that he had to tour around Christchurch (two to three times), Wanganui, Masterton, Napier, Hastings, Taradale, Palmerston North, Otaki, Levin, Carterton, Martin, Martinborough, Greytown, and Featherston within a single year to reach his countrymen.\footnote{Reaper (May 16, 1923): 5; Reaper (Sep 15, 1925): 4.}

Thirdly, the Chinese in New Zealand were all from the province of Guangdong and would be best reached with people speaking the Cantonese dialect. Canton was one of the earliest coastal provinces that had a missionary presence, so the CIM did not choose to establish any missionary presence there. While most CIM missionaries would be fluent in Mandarin and maybe some inland dialects, hardly anyone would have become acquainted with enough Cantonese to communicate effectively.
The last and more subtle reason might be the “back-stage mentality” of New Zealand churches in relation to overseas missions. Though many cultures were placed at the receiving end of world evangelism, Chinese was probably the only national group that was subjected to the concurrently-run overseas and domestic missionary operations of many English-speaking countries. Such a concurrence was not unique to the New Zealand church. There is evidence of similar phenomenon in the study of American home mission to the Chinese.\(^{103}\) The American missionary, diplomatist, and Sinologue F. W. Williams wrote frankly about the late Nineteenth Century that “[I]t is much easier loving the souls of the heathen in the abstract in America than it is here in the concrete encompassed as they are with such dirty bodies.”\(^{104}\) Though hard to quantify, H. J. Ryburn’s words in 1937 gave some hints to the reflections of church spokesmen at the time on this issue, “There is reason to believe that we have been tempted to comfort ourselves for defeat at home by the thought of possible victory abroad.”\(^{105}\)

Anti-Chinese sentiment within New Zealand also made it difficult, if not impossible, to carry out the evangelical task effectively. The effect was two-fold. On the one hand, the prevailing anti-Chinese sentiment in New Zealand society as well as in the church was a stumbling block for attracting financial and personnel support. The number of anti-Chinese societies outnumbered both domestic and home missions

---


targeting the Chinese, with the earliest one launched before any Chinese actually arrived in the region. The racist attitudes towards the Chinese remained strong right into the early 1920s. The Chinese Consul, Mr. Li, wrote a strong letter to the Evening Post, protesting that:

Some of the milder terms used by people, when addressing the Chinese, are “Chow,” “yellow belly,” “yellow guts,” “Chinkee,” etc. When I leave my gate in the performance of my duties as Consul for China, I do so in fear and dread of insults which may be cast at me before I return to my home.

The purpose of the New Zealand Anglican Board of Missions in publishing the extract from this letter was to warn its readers that “the great hindrance to the work of our mission to the Chinese in New Zealand is the manner in which many Europeans treat the Chinese in our midst.” The fact that most overseas missionaries made the courageous choice to stay in China during times of wars and riots demonstrated a strong degree of identification, which was rarely found among New Zealanders who were engaged with home mission outreaching the Chinese immigrants. Such a contrast seems to suggest that the challenges associated with facing criticisms from one’s own country fellows required more courage than facing life threats from warlords, bandits, the Japanese army, and the Communist regime. More often than not, the mission incumbents, with Alexander Don serving as a typical example, shared the prejudices of their time and were unable to develop genuine cultural sympathy with the people they tried to reach. Being a Chinese

---

108 Ibid.
Presbyterian, Dr. James Ng was far more critical of his own denomination’s effort to the early Chinese miners; one only has to compare Ng’s version, with Strathern's version of Don’s life and legacy to see the difference. Ng plainly concludes that “the Presbyterian mission never achieved integration with the Chinese community”, and that Don’s “limited success as a missionary” was very much a result of “the insensitivity he too often displayed”. Based on her visit to the CVM's field in Canton, a New Zealand CIM member reluctantly came to the conclusion that “the more the Chinese have to do with foreign civilisation the harder they are to reach”. It is for this very reason Ng laments that “Neither in China or New Zealand were the church’s missions able to fully offer the Chinese true brotherhood in addition to the Message”.

On the other hand, the Chinese recipients might well conclude it as being hypocritical for someone who expressed interest in their souls but showed little compassion in their social conditions, or even took part in the general anti-Chinese campaign. While the Chinese in the Middle Kingdom tasted Christianity in the context of the opium trade and gunboat diplomacy, their overseas sons in New Zealand were exposed to Christianity in the context of poll tax and Anti-Chinese Act. Tai rightfully points out that New Zealand missionaries first arrived in China when discrimination against the Chinese immigrants in New Zealand was at its height. To extend Tai’s proposition, the author would argue that if it was difficult to sail for the

111 Ng, “Don, Alexander”.
112 Ibid.
114 James Ng, "The Presbyterian Church of New Zealand and the Chinese" (Annual Lecture, Presbyterian Historical Society, 1988), 19.
115 “Middle Kingdom” is the literal translation of China, Zhongguo (中国).
heartland of those who were considered ‘vile, dirty, and undesirable’ back home, it would be nearly impossible to work among them within the sight of their hostile compatriots. By the time the bulk of New Zealand missionaries arrived in China in the first half of the 20th Century, the anti-Chinese movement had cooled down as the numerical threat of the Chinese had diminished. Correspondingly, the image of the Chinese had by and large transformed from “yellow peril” to “model minority”. This perhaps explains the “conspiratorial-like” silence in missionary communication about ill treatment of Chinese in their home-base.

The geographic distance between New Zealand and China also benefited the missionaries if they were chosen to be sent overseas. As Eric Robert Reinders points out, “The image of courageous evangelism could be better maintained when located far away and when their representations were mediated through institutional channels…. In this sense, ‘far-chased’ could mean more plausible rather than less”. This is most likely why the home missioner to the Chinese, Alexander Don, was subject to more criticisms than his overseas counterparts. This was particularly true for woman missionaries. As we will see in the following discussion, while there were few ministerial roles for woman in “mother church back home”, they were free to practice to a much greater degree in “daughter churches abroad”. Taking the financial aspect as an example, the salary of a deaconess seemed to be very ad hoc.

The Presbyterian Maori Mission, a sphere where deaconesses could be commonly found was reliant on money coming from the PWMU, the Busy Bees, and parish support. Sister Mary McQueen’s salary was provided by the deacons’ court from the proceeds of organ recitals and individual contributions. In comparison, women

---

missionaries’ stipends were more or less guaranteed on the same ground as their male colleagues.

2.5. The Gendered Culture of New Zealand

In its formative stage, the Yue Opera performing force was, like many other Chinese operas at the time, made up exclusively of men. It gradually became a woman dominated occupation. For the most part of my Aunt’s active stage life, the Yue Opera were exclusively played by women. In my Aunt’s days, the alternatives to opera actresses for her sex were to be a child bride in the village or a child labourer in the city. One of my Aunt’s younger sisters was sent to an orphanage on birth. Another younger sister was given away to another family 44 days after birth. That incident was the direct stimulus for my Aunt to sign up to an apprenticeship for opera performing. These “infant brides” were not uncommon at the time. The urban centres in China were badly affected by the Depression as were those in New Zealand, so becoming an apprentice actress seemed to be the only wage-earning option. She did not have much “missionary” zeal at the age of 11 but performing art eventually became an outlet for her self-expression or self-realisation, and even a means to bring social reform. Such a paid job brought an enviable financial return, but changed little in her social standing. They could be queens, dowagers, princesses, heroines on the front-stage, but were still subject to the exploitation, humiliations, harassment and threats imposed on them at the back-stage. Many years later, as I begun to read the biographies of woman missionaries, I saw some surprising parallels of their roles between the two worlds of “field” and “home”. Only when I commence the story from how the “Kiwi” women were socialised and situated in the back-stage of the ‘home country’, can I then comprehend how they were re-socialised and re-positioned in the front-stage of the ‘mission field’.

The analogy between mission women and opera actresses presented here is not

119 There was one narrow escape from forced concubinage at the age of 13 and another one from disfigurement at the age of 24.
intended to suggest that New Zealand women were driven to foreign mission out of poverty in the same way that Chinese rural children were. It was also not my intention, by giving an overview of women's career choices (paid and unpaid), to hint that many mission women had been professionals, nor that many were housewives at the time of sailing. It was rather the opposite. Financial rewards would be the least cited motive, even fewer had the opportunity to social advancement and many were “unattached” single women (though some were engaged). If overpopulation, land shortages, famine, drought, banditry, and peasant revolts were the “push factors” in South China for young Chinese men to seek their fortunes in the Pacific Rim, the lack of alternative employment, and the prejudice and discrimination against women even in some of the more prestigious occupations, had contributed as “push factors” for the large proportion of young Christian women offering for overseas mission.

New Zealand is proud of being the first country in the world that gave women the right to vote in 1893, and produced the first woman to earn a B.A. degree in 1877 in the person of Kate Milligan Edgar, and the first woman in the entire British Empire to win a degree with honours in 1880 in the person of Helen Cannon. As shown above, feminisation was an impassable feature of the New Zealand missionary force in China. Arguably the most well-known New Zealand missionary in China in the eyes of Chinese was a woman (Kathleen Hall) while the most

---

120 That is, nine years ahead of Australia (1902), 25 years ahead of England (1918), 27 years ahead of America (1920), 37 years ahead of South Africa (1930), 51 years ahead of France (1944), 56 years ahead of China (1949), and 78 years ahead of Switzerland (1949)! The dates for some other countries are: Portland (1918), Belgian (1920), India (1921), Turk (1934), Phillippines (1937). See: “Women’s Suffrage,” http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Women%27s_suffrage, accessed November 26, 2012.
122 A marble statue in the image of Hall has been erected in the city of Quyang (曲阳) and a primary school is named after her Chinese name. No other western missionary has enjoyed such honour from the government of the People's Republic of China. Hers is also the only
well-known China missionary for New Zealanders was arguably also a woman (Annie James). However, it would be too naïve to conclude that New Zealand had been advanced in terms of gender egalitarianism. The overrepresentation of women in foreign mission, on the contrary, was a reflection of their low social status at home.

The historical contingency of British colonialism in Aotearoa had shaped New Zealand’s gendered culture. While the concepts of manhood and womanhood were “imported” largely by British migrants and differed little from other English-speaking countries, the New Zealand gendered culture was part of a solution to the exigencies of the colony. Few of the mission women, being evangelical Christians, would admit that they were under the influence of what James and Saville-Smith call “the Cult of Domesticity”. Used metaphysically, this term refers to the socialisation process by which women became acceptable members of the adult world, and in this context, of the Christian community.

The early Pakeha settler household was a base for subsistence production and reproduction. In other words, the household was simultaneously the home as well as

---

123 In terms of publicity, there are probably more biographies based on A. James’ life story than any other China missionaries, including Annie I. James, I Was in Prison (Christchurch, N.Z.: Presbyterian Bookroom, 1952); Roy Belmer, The Teeth of the Dragon: The Incredible Story of a Woman’s Survival (London: The Epworth Press, 1964); Donald Neil MacDiarmid, Tse Koo – A Heroine of China: The Story of Annie James (PCNZ, 1945); Rita Snowden, Never a Dull Moment (Christchurch, N.Z.: Presbyterian Bookroom, 1948).

124 For example, James and Saville-Smith argue that the national feature of New Zealand life is a “Gendered Culture”, as opposed to a “Classed Culture” in Mother England or a “Raced Culture” in South Africa. By this term, the two scholars do not refer to notions of masculinity and femininity that exist in every culture, nor simple sexual inequality, but a “heuristic device”, or the way in which national interests were articulated through the structuring of gender relations (Bev James and Kay Saville-Smith, Gender, Culture and Power: Challenging New Zealand’s Gendered Culture (Auckland, N.Z.: Oxford University Press, 1994), 6-7, 11.).

125 James and Saville-Smith, Gender, Culture and Power, 11. Similar expressions in overseas literature include “angel of the house”, “true womanhood”, “the notion of the lady”.

86
the workplace for the whole family and the hired hands. Research on other colonial societies also shows a similar pattern of interdependent partnership between men and women. However, waged work in urban centres was challenging the pioneer household as a mechanism of government by the mid-1880s. The promotion of a domesticised female culture seemed to be an economical solution to re-impose social order. Women’s roles had been increasingly narrowed down to that of wives and mothers, and women’s lives are structured as dependent and privatized. The expansion of female employment in the non-agricultural work-force coincided with a tendency to define motherhood and wifehood as sanctified vocations. By the 1920s, Housewives Union, Mothers’ Union, the League of Mothers, and alike had taken root and flourished.

Such a gendered culture was popularly embraced because of its perceived naturalness and immutability. It was also readily acceptable in a church context since the creation of man and woman as different beings was understood as a divine and biblical revelation. The masculine counterparts of the gendered culture have two contradictory constructions: the Man Alone and the Family Man. In this context, the enfranchisement of women in 1893 can be seen as an uneasy alliance between feminist and propertied gentry (usually the Family Man): while the former saw the vote as a basis for social reform, the latter saw women’s suffrage as a counterbalance to the political power of a mobile male labour force living on waged work (usually the Man Alone). However, the role of women in the evangelical churches was often ambiguous. Though they almost always outnumbered men, and provided main

127 Olssen also identified the period between 1880 and 1926 as a distinct phase in which New Zealand became predominantly urban and that work became more specialised and occupation became the crucial clue to social and economic status (Erik Olssen, "Women, Work and Family," in Women in New Zealand Society, eds. Phillida Bunkle and Beryl Hughes (Auckland, N.Z.: George Allen and Unwin, 1980)).
130 Ibid.
support of charitable church activities, they were given no ecclesiastical authority, nor church offices. The Woman’s Christian Temperance Union (hereafter WCTU), formed in 1885, offered a resolution by providing New Zealand women with an active ministry. Though it was the only national organisation of women at the time, the WCTU never became a mass movement. Its membership throughout the decade 1885-1895 was only about 600, made up predominantly of urban elite Christian women. Their motto “For God, and Home, and Humanity” suggested a symbolic pattern less concerned with legislation and justice, but more with assumptions about the nature of men and women. The founder of the WCTU (Mrs. Leavitt) travelled throughout New Zealand to preach that “the home is woman’s kingdom”. Later, New Zealand women would read in the Prohibitionist pamphlet that

[you] must lay aside the remembrance that you are a conservative or a liberal, and feel that you are just women -- that a vote is A SACRED POSSESSION [capital original] for the protection and welfare of your sex, your homes and the moral benefit of the community at large.131

Here, women’s alleged moral superiority and conservatism, in conjunction with women’s role as the purifier of both the private world and the public world, were cited as important reasons for participation in the hitherto corrupt world of male politics.132 All WCTU members constantly wore their white ribbon badges as a symbol of purity. Phillida Bunkle identified “purity” as the unifying concept of the temperance world view in a colonial society: women’s purity domesticated men’s bestiality. Women in the home absorbed and neutralised male sexual threat. Her

purity was the source of her power.\textsuperscript{133}

In a similar vein, mission women, whether in the person of wives or spinsters, were seen as unassuming purifiers of Christian values in a ‘heathen’ land, a light in the darkness. Both the female migration scheme, women’s suffrage, and the “export” of women missionaries, in this sense, could all be seen as parts of the female imperialism that was throughout the “British world” of the era.\textsuperscript{134} That was, to promote the interest of the empire, to confirm women’s traditional place, and to preserve British culture as “Britannia’s daughters” with Queen Victoria herself as a role model.\textsuperscript{135}

One of the core functions of the New Zealand gendered culture is to provide a rationale to define women’s conditions of paid work as temporary, subordinate, supplementary to the “family wage” that male colleagues earn, regardless of marital status. In 1936 only 8.5% of the female labour force was married.\textsuperscript{136} Moreover, according to the 1930 Unemployment Act, women, alongside with Maori, Asians, and boys under 16, were not eligible for unemployment benefit, though all working women were taxed. The fetishisation of “home-making” transformed the role of housewife into an unpaid profession, while at the same time contributing to the feminisation of a narrow range of occupations in the paid labour market. Churches and missions had not been immune from the thoughts and practices of the age. With the exception of faith missions, which define women and men, single and married, as equal partners in mission work, women missionaries were usually paid less than men and their

\textsuperscript{133} Ibid., 67-74.  
\textsuperscript{134} NZWCTU affiliated with the World's Union in 1888.  
\textsuperscript{135} Pickles, “Colonisation, Empire and Gender,” 224-226.  
allowance went to a “family wage” of the husbands once they married.

The 1930s saw the biggest decadal number of New Zealand missionaries leave for China despite the impact of the Depression. Ebbett’s work, though not strictly academic, paints a fair picture of what the world of work was like for career women in the 1930s. There were three basic categories in which women could find some form of paid work outside of the private home. First, for women of lower socio-economic background, domestic service, shop assistant, factory workers and semi-skilled trades (e.g. hairdressing, dressmaking) were the most common choices. In the early colonial days, the scarcity of single women inflated their “market value” as wives and as employees, much to the chagrin of the gentry who constantly complained about the lack of domestic staff and the high wages they could command. However, Ebbett noted that domestic service had become young women’s last choice by the 1930s due to the vulnerability of the work: exploitation both by men and their own sex, poky accommodation, low wages and long hours.

The discussion about how to raise the status of domestic service to the dignity of a career echoed the core discourse of “the Cult of Domesticity”. That is, “home-making” was turned into a “science” which should be attended with modern technology and professional operators, along with the standardisation of domestic hygiene defined by the doctors, home scientists, and child specialists. Since “lady help” was seen as doing what most women would normally do “for love” (read “for free”) as daughters, sisters, wives and mothers, the changing of labels to “domestician” or “home assistant” did little to raise their working conditions and social status. “Girls” preferred shop and factory work for more defined tasks, shorter hours and better social life, which often did not correspond to better work

---

conditions. Waged work was primarily introduced as opportunities for men. Women were only used as very cheap labour, usually in millinery and dressmaking, where their conditions of work prompted a national inquiry into “sweated labour”\(^{140}\) and the passing of the Factory Act in 1894. Typistes were equally overcrowded and underpaid. The premium required to learn a trade was one of the major obstacles for many women to undertake apprenticeships. As an extension of seamstress, which many women did “free of charge” for the family, dressmaking was unlikely to claim higher wages. In comparison, a tailor, a male-dominant occupation, was seen as a more specialised trade.\(^{141}\) By later 1930s, mass production and large number of imported garments made it even more difficult for any dressmaker to sign on an apprentice. Those who had been in the trade would find there was little room for creative dress designing.\(^{142}\)

Second, women of middle class background were more likely to choose a “professional” job, such as teacher, nurse, midwife, doctor, pharmacist, librarian, or stenographer. Within a few years following the enfranchisement of women, New Zealand saw its first woman medical and law graduates in two Jewish immigrants.\(^{143}\) However, in 1938 the nation had less than a hundred women doctors, less than fifty women dentists, about a dozen woman lawyers, similar number of women holding a Bachelor of Commerce, and the only women professors were in Home Science.\(^{144}\) The political scene had not been any better: forty years after New Zealand women had won (or been given) suffrage, the first woman MP, Mrs. Elizabeth McCombs,

\(^{140}\) The Royal Commission on Sweating defined “sweating” as “working in overcrowded or insanitary conditions, for long and irregular hours, and for low pay” (quoted in James and Saville-Smith, \textit{Gender, Culture and Power}, 35).


\(^{142}\) Ebbett, \textit{Victoria's Daughters}, 61, 66.

\(^{143}\) They were Emily Siedeberg in 1896 and Ethel Benjamin in 1897 (Maureen Kate Cooper, “Chosen people: the Jewish Kehilah in Nineteenth-century Dunedin” in \textit{Building God's Own Country: Historical Essays on Religions in New Zealand}, eds. J. Thomson and J. Stenhouse (Dunedin, N.Z.: University of Otago Press, 2004), 89.

\(^{144}\) Ebbett, \textit{Victoria's Daughters}, 44.
being the wife of a MP, won a seat in her third attempt in 1933 but died two years later. It took another decade for the next woman (Mabel Howard) to enter the House. With the consequences of conscription during the two world wars, women were able to “sneak” into the offices of business and state as clerks, typists and stenographers. Nonetheless, they could not be employed as permanent public servants up until 1947.\textsuperscript{145}

Among the above mentioned professional jobs, the confluence between Christian disciplines and values with the work ethics of teaching and nursing appealed to middle-class Christian women. That was why 19th Century China became attractive to so many western nurses and teachers in the role of women missionaries.\textsuperscript{146} A brief overview of the back-stage conditions for medical professionals, with a particular focus on the gender dynamics, helps to foster a more comprehensive view of their front-stage performance. The Otago medical school, the hospital training system, and the Karitane system had produced some of the finest medical men and women. Still, as a small sending country, New Zealand missions (e.g. NZCMS and CVM) had opted to adopt and support several male doctors who were overseas born or trained. On the contrary, almost all women medicals were locally trained. Nursing (including midwifery) and teaching were two of the biggest single professions for women missionaries in general.\textsuperscript{147} Nursing was seen as an extension of women’s

\begin{footnotes}
\item[147] According to Roberts’ calculations for New Zealand interdenominational mission societies, the percentages for teachers and nurses were 21.3\% and 19.1\% respectively for the
\end{footnotes}
“natural” ability to care and to nurture, and thus were considered by middle-class families as respectable occupations for their daughters. Although New Zealand was the first country in the world to pass a Nurses’ Registration Act (1901), followed by an Act for the registration of midwives three years later, a critical step toward professionalisation of the occupation, in early 20th Century New Zealand, “ministering angels” were still unreasonably expected to happily accept exploitation, and thus tended to be “overworked and undernourished, harshly controlled and unsympathetically disciplined”. An attempt to establish a diploma of nursing in the University of Otago in 1925 failed, though a postgraduate school for nurses was set up three years later, providing for a much smaller group of learners. There was little room in nursing for career development. It took years to move from housemaid, to probationer nurse, to Sister and, if ever, to Matron, who were still under the male authority of doctors and superintendents.

Women doctors did not fare much better. Unlike nursing, there was little encouragement for women to enter the world of medicine. The common perception at the time had been that women’s brains were too small, their physique too delicate, their very presence would embarrass male students, who, ironically, were unruffled by the presence of female nurses. Medical professors would address the class as “Gentlemen!” although women made up more than one-third of the class from World

---

CIM/OMF recruits between 1891 and 1975; the figures for the WEC recruits up to 1975 were both 23%; the figures for the UFM recruits of the similar period were 17% and 21%; the figures for the SIM recruits up to 1976 were 17% and 23% (Roberts, “The Growth of Inter-Denominational Mission Societies”, 30, 52-53, 56, 65). In all cases, teacher and nurses had been the two biggest single professions of the mission society.

149 Quoted in Ebbett, Victoria’s Daughters, 46.
150 Before Nurse Mary Lambie enforced a provision in the Nurses and Midwives Act for a preliminary training period from the year 1933, probationer nurse used to start working with no training for a three-year course with low pay (about 12s 6d), a lot of domestic work of the wards (e.g. sweeping, dusting, cleaning lockers, window cleaning), and did not always get the supposed weekly day-off (Ebbett, Victoria’s Daughters, 44, 46). Nursing under this circumstance was almost another form of “sweated work”.

93
War I, or simply thought “nobody is here today” if there were only “girls” in the classroom. Though most female medical students came from reputable middle class background, it was not easy for them to find practice or to work. They either had to compete for the few posts in the school medical service or in a St. Helen’s hospital, or to take unpopular positions in mental hospitals or in sanitoriums. “Lack of suitable accommodation” was often given as the reason for not employing women doctors as house surgeons. As late as the 1930s, the prevailing thought was still that the public at large did not like women doctors, and that they were unacceptable to men, and that even women patients preferred the traditional male doctor. In her letter to the NZCMS secretary in 1922, Dr. Phyllis Haddow expressed her concern over job discrimination against women doctors in the New Zealand public health system: only one of the six “girls” obtained a Hospital position as new medical graduate.

In the case of the first Chinese medical missionary, Kathleen Pih, the sexist discrimination was tinted with a racist twist. She had to fight with loneliness and contempt all the way through. While Pakeha women medical students were facing discriminations from their male lecturers and students, they held a sense of arrogance towards Asiatic classmates. That was probably the reason why Kathleen stayed in the dormitory of Presbyterian Woman Training Institute (PWTI) instead of that of the Medical School. She was terrified on hearing some patients’ threaten to leave the Hospital when she started to work as a house surgeon at Oamaru Hospital.

Dr. Pih’s application to the CVM was assessed with great caution. In a confidential letter to W. Mawson, H. Davies cited Dr. North’s concern that “very few women

---

152 Dr. Phyllis Charlton, interviewed by the researcher, August 2, 2010.
153 Ebbett, Victoria’s Daughters, 48.
154 Haddow to Pring-Rowe (NZCMS Secretary), April 5, 1922, personnel file, ANG 143/3.00/53, John Kinder Library.
have the physical strength necessary to make good surgeons”. He went on to add the
general feeling of the field Executive meeting was “the work that Miss Pih could do
in the hospital at Kong Chuen could be done equally well by women doctors secured
in Canton ... It is proving a more difficult matter to get a good Christian male
surgeon, but it is not so hard to get a good female doctor”. The post of
Superintendent in the mission’s hospital during a time of turmoil is “a responsibility
which can hardly in fairness be placed upon the shoulders of a woman”. The
concluding attitude therefore was “if it comes to a choice between her and another
male doctor, opinion seems to be in favour of the latter”.156 It took this Mission ten
years to see one of their woman colleagues (Annie James) shoulder the sole
responsibility of a village medical institute at a warring time and space while the rest
of the Mission were kept in internment or held back home. As secretary of the
Foreign Mission Council, William Mawson compromised by noting Dr. Pih’s
appointment would not block a more suitable appointment if such “a good man came
forward and approved himself to the Church”.157 In handling such an unusual case,
her missionary colleagues and mission administrators also had difficulty in spelling
Dr. Pih’s Chinese surname, variations found in her personnel files included “Pat”,158
“Putt”,159 or even “Pig”.160 Apart from the “pioneer problems” that Dr. Pih had
gone through as the first Chinese doctor graduating from a New Zealand university
and the first missionary of Chinese origin sent from New Zealand, she was warned
that a “non-European student was always at a disadvantage when it comes to getting
practical experience in hospital posts” upon applying for postgraduate study in

156 Davies to Mawson, May 26, 1929, McKenzie to Mawson, January 8, 1930, FMC - MSIC
(CVM), 1929-1931, AA16/5/8, PCNZ Archive, Knox College, Dunedin.
157 McKenzie to Mawson, January 8, 1930, FMC - MSIC (CVM), 1929-1931, AA16/5/8,
PCNZ Archive, Knox College, Dunedin.
158 Davies to Budd, May 1, 1936, FMC - MSIC (CVM), 1929-1931, AA16/5/8, PCNZ
Archive, Knox College, Dunedin.
159 Letter to Miss A. Sustins, November 3, 1936, FMC - MSIC (CVM), 1929-1931,
AA16/5/8, PCNZ Archive, Knox College, Dunedin.
160 Letter to Dr. K. A. Pih, July 8, 1936, FMC - MSIC (CVM), 1929-1931, AA16/5/8, PCNZ
Archive, Knox College, Dunedin.
England during her furlough.\textsuperscript{161} The observation that she was “a little over sensitive on points relating to her peculiar national position” should not surprise anyone.\textsuperscript{162}

While nursing and midwifery were exclusively women’s occupation, women teachers had to compete with their male colleagues. If the medical hierarchy was composed of professional males as doctors, surgeons and specialists on the one hand, and semi-professional women as nurses and midwives on the other; the educational hierarchy was similarly composed along gendered lines, with male professors concentrating in the tertiary sectors and male department leaders or headmasters in schools, while women were overrepresented in kindergarten, primary, and secondary teaching staff. There was no evident antagonism to women seeking higher education with teaching in mind, probably because it was seen as an extension of the moral guidance a mother gave her family. The first annual report of the Minister of Education in 1878 shows that nearly 41% of teachers were women, when pupil-teachers were included, the percentage increased to 48%.\textsuperscript{163} Not many realised that a teaching career in primary and secondary New Zealand schools entailed rigid codes of conduct and physically demanding tasks. Rules for women teachers in 1915 right into the 1930s ran a long list of “musts” and “don’ts” which included “must wear at least two petticoats”, “not loiter downtown in ice-cream stores”, and specific housekeeping instructions.\textsuperscript{164} Whereas girls’ secondary schools created a female world of learning, women teachers in primary schools faced the hurly-burly of mixed classes and male competition for work. They were expected to take larger classes than male colleagues on the grounds that these were junior classes. Indignant

\textsuperscript{161} FMC secretary to Dr. Pih, March 7, 1935, CVM, Staff file, Dr. K. A. Pih, 1929-1938, AA10/3, PCNZ Archive, Knox College, Dunedin.
\textsuperscript{162} FMC secretary to Dr. Kirk, March 4, 1930, CVM, Staff file, Dr. K. A. Pih, 1929-1938, AA10/3, PCNZ Archive, Knox College, Dunedin.
\textsuperscript{164} The cleaning instructions included: sweep the floor at least once daily, clean the blackboards at least once a day, scrub the floor at least once a week with hot soapy water, start the fire at 7am so the room will be warm by 8am (Ebbett, \textit{Victoria's Daughters}, 42).
accounts of the injustices in salary and status often occurred in *White Ribbon*, an organ for discussing women’s issues.\textsuperscript{165} The poor workplace condition of New Zealand teachers explained why Dr. F.C. Batchelor’s speech given in 1909 met with applause of an audience of a similar social stratum when he said: “the competent domestic usually promptly acquires an establishment of her own, while the scholarship girl with a ‘D’ certificate will probably face many years of weary teaching in a back block school”\textsuperscript{166}

Young women’s decisions to quit teaching for foreign service reflected the limitation of that vocation: salaries were low, conditions erratic, and there were few possibilities for advancement - headships were a male prerogative.\textsuperscript{167} Even headmistresses were only paid half the salary of a headmaster.\textsuperscript{168} Teaching was a “way station” for young women looking to support themselves temporarily, presumably prior to marriage. They rarely considered it a sacred calling or a fulfilling vocation. During the Depression, there was considerable argument about the right of married women teachers to work and whether women teachers should be paid as much as men. PCNZ missionary candidate Jean McNeur was readily released from the three-year teaching bond by the Secretary of the Otago Education Board to sail for China, partly because her vacancy was needed by others during the Depression.\textsuperscript{169}


\textsuperscript{166} Quoted in Olssen, "Women, Work and Family," 169. Dr. Batchelor was a leading specialist in women's diseases. This speech was made in the second annual conference of the Society for Promoting the Health of Women and Children, better known as the Plunket Society.

\textsuperscript{167} In 1920, women made up nearly 40\% of the principals in state secondary school.

\textsuperscript{168} At the turn of the 19\textsuperscript{th} Century, a Headmaster for a boy school was paid £800 p.a. whereas a Headmistress for a girl school was paid £400 p.a. (Ada Wells, *White Ribbon* (February 1901), 11, quoted in Laurie Guy, *Shaping Godzone: Public Issues and Church Voices in New Zealand 1840-2000* (Wellington, N.Z.: Victoria University Press, 2011), 191.

Lastly, for devout Christian women, church provided a platform for voluntary work, largely unpaid. According to Rachel Gillett, the Women’s Christian Temperance Union, Presbyterian Women’s Mission Union and the Young Women’s Christian Association had created active roles in church organisations both visible and accessible to a growing number of women. Nonetheless, the order of Deaconess was the only formal office given to women in the realm of the Church. The sexually differentiated assumption that a woman’s nature made her the best of nurses, the gentlest of almsgivers, the tenderest of educators for the young of both sexes, and the great trainer and moral reformer of her own was century-old, but it was not until the first half of the 19th century that the Protestants in most western countries began to institutionalise the dedication of “unattached women” through professional female agencies, set apart for charitable and religious work as the business of their lives. According to Margaret Tennant, women’s commitment to deaconess work in New Zealand was driven more by religious conviction than by the myth of “redundant women” in Britain. By the 1900s, all the main denominational Churches in New Zealand had established their own Deaconess training houses. Many urban middle class women were well-represented on the “lady’s associations” in churches, women’s mission unions and boards of charities. Rather than challenging the church hierarchy, deaconesses were expected to be subservient to male clergy and elders in a similar way that nurses were to doctors, and women teachers to male headmasters. Such gender imperatives were encapsulated in the mottoes of the

172 The Anglican Community of the Sacred Name was established in Christchurch in 1890s, which was responsible for setting up both St. Margaret’s College in Christchurch and St. Hilda’s Collegiate School in Dunedin. The Auckland Anglican deaconesses were known as the “Grey Ladies” as their house of training was located in Grey St, Auckland. The PWTI was formally opened in June 1903, based on a Missionary Training Home started in 1898. The Methodist Deaconess House was established in 1908.
Presbyterian and Methodist deaconess order: “By Love Serve” and “Not Self, But Others”. The voting members of the PWTI Committee were male ministers and elders. Although Mrs. Jeannetta Blackie, the lady superintendent of PWTI (1903-1919), was the first woman to hold an official administrative position within the PCNZ, “ladies associated” with the Institute attended meetings but did not have the right to vote. Unlike the professional tuition received by male students at Knox Theological College, tuition at PWTI was provided by people who volunteered to give freely of time and expertise. After all, deaconess training was thought to be a “curriculum for girls”. Likewise, the Lambeth Conference of the Anglican Church in 1930 suggested that women should enter the deaconess order, which was not equal to the diaconate for men and did not belong to the holy orders of deacons, priests and bishops. For Presbyterian women, it was more than twenty years after the closing of the China mission that every deaconess was given the opportunity to become a minister in the PCNZ, a policy change that spelled the end of the order of deaconesses. In the light of this, Kate Keen (later Mrs. Hutley) singled out as a rarity of her time, was the only woman missionary to China that was ordained as a minister with the title of Reverend.

Apart from the Anglican sisterhood modeled after conventual life, Protestant deaconesses were generally quite careful to distinguish themselves from Roman Catholic nuns. One way of demarcation was to keep the option of marriage and motherhood open for those trained Christian women, though Protestant deaconess-ship built the reputation of a long-term occupation. The role of deaconess

175 Ibid., 201-202.
was the first paid position, though poorly paid and lowly regarded, for women in denominational Churches. They were notable for their public roles at a time when most women were confined to the home. By providing aid to the poor and distressed they contributed to the development of social work in the country, which did not have secular training for social work until 1950.\textsuperscript{178} Inner city slums (including Chinese “dens”), isolated Maori settlements and overseas fields were the common outlets for new deaconesses. Between 1903 and 1924, 89 students had passed through the PWTI, the Methodist numbers were fewer, and the Anglican pattern was even more intermittent. Within this small numbers, not all graduates became ordained deaconesses.\textsuperscript{179} PCNZ employed 13 deaconesses for its parishes in early 1933, while the Methodist number was only five in 1915. The number of deaconesses working with Maori and other Home Missions was nine for both denominations.\textsuperscript{180} In comparison, overseas missions were sometimes seen as less constraining with less scrutiny by local parishioners than working among New Zealand’s urban poor or Maori communities. Sister Mabel Cartwright became more involved with parish politics as a result of her transfer to St. John’s in Wellington.\textsuperscript{181} Likewise, Sister Rita Snowden, the author of Annie James’ biography, herself a trained deaconess, underwent what is known today as “burn-out” after only a couple of years’ work in the Methodist Central Mission in Auckland.\textsuperscript{182} Tennant points out that the post-Depression Labour government had commandeered the language of the churches in its references to “applied Christianity”, aiming itself towards a welfare state. Tensions within the deaconess’ role were exacerbated by the advent of the welfare state and by the expectations of the churches.\textsuperscript{183} Unable to be appointed as social worker, parish assistant, religious educator or evangelist and feeling inadequate to be any of them with the limited training received, deaconesses were


\textsuperscript{179} Tennant, “Sisterly Ministrations,” 16.

\textsuperscript{180} Ibid., 17.


\textsuperscript{182} Rita Snowden, \textit{The Sun is High} (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1974), 69-70.

\textsuperscript{183} Tennant, “Sisterly Ministrations,” 18-20.
facing a personal identity crisis. Forming the intermediate step between untrained
womanly benevolence and the emergence of professional social work in New
Zealand, the deaconess’ role was less defined than that of nurse, teacher and foreign
missionaries.

Frustrated by the national gendered culture, struggling for independence, aspiring for
spiritual sanctification, foreign mission was one of the few acceptable and
honourable channels of self-expression for young Christian women. In her study of
the first “lady graduates” from Otago University during 1885 and 1900, Dorothy
Page observed that mission work was one of the main employment categories for BA
graduates in which marriage was not the end of a career.\textsuperscript{184} When denominational
missions reluctantly opened its door to women candidates, and when Faith Missions
extended the aura of Missionary from laymen to laywomen, feminisation of the
originally male-defined workforce was a logical outcome. It would be reasonable to
conclude that consequences of unequal sexual division of labour were no less
problematic in the “Home Country” than what was believed in the “Mission Field”,
though each took different forms and provided different outlets. The affinity between
New Zealand and China would be difficult for the mission women to admit and for
the “Chinese audience” to detect. Although for performing art, affinity between the
actor and characters brings easy identification, the distinction between the plot and
life-story is often blurred. For the Chinese, Christian and non-Christian, seeing the
mission women on the field, where they were free to travel, to admonish, and to lead,
tended to think that they must have enjoyed the same (if not more) degree of
freedom and authority back home in their motherland.

The front-stage is always different from the back-stage. It often takes several years
of back-stage preparation before an apprentice could face the actual audience on the
front-stage. Those who are so well-prepared in rehearsal could easily lose their

\textsuperscript{184} Page, “The First Lady Graduates,” 112.
confidence and effectiveness as soon as they step on to the real stage. Others who might seem homely would eventually win the eyes and hearts of the audience. How well did the colonial New Zealand prepare missionary candidates for China? The Pacific Ocean expanding between the two countries symbolises the vast social and cultural distances between the two nations. With six thousand good British miles in between, would “Kiwi” raw recruits survive the change of climates, languages, diet, clothing, as well as social expectations? Could their pietistic spirituality bring any meaningful relevance to the “heathen” Chinese? Would they find sabbatical observations practical for themselves as well as for their converts in a society that had operated with a different concept of time for thousands of years? How would the glimpse of the local Chinese immigrants and the random consumption of transatlantic depictions of the Oriental life prepare them to deal with the live Chinese native in their homeland? Had the farming life or bush work in rural New Zealand equipped them to converse with the Confucian gentry? Would the Cult of Domesticity enable the women to enter the Chinese zenanas? One does not know until one has examined the front-stage, the subject that I am going to turn in the next Chapter.
The Yue Opera is a relatively new opera in China. The origin of this folk art can be traced as far back as 1852, when a peasant hummed a new melody in his barnyard. Towards the end of the 19th Century, this crude form of folk song began to be more ritualised and more opera-like. In 1917, a country opera team made their first expedition to Shanghai, the most modernised and westernised treaty port in China but made little progress. Up until then, the Opera was played exclusively by men.

The idea of a woman operatic circus emerged in 1922, the same year that my Aunt was born. By the time that she joined a circus as an apprentice, the Opera had developed into a unique style. Many of the bodily movements and vocal techniques had been ritualised and formulated, though never as rigid as some of the long-established operas, to be passed on from one generation to another through oral instructions. For her to be a successful actress, my Aunt had to learn all these conventions developed by her predecessors, men and women, as well as to suffer the humiliation targeted at the actress class as a whole. It was a common practice for an apprentice to start her stage life as a “walk-on”. Many remained there and some even became “subaltern players”. Only very few would ever rise to the fame of an “Opera Queen”. In missiological terms, China was just one of many front-stages that New Zealand missionaries had entered. Compared with their dominance in the Melanesian or the Solomon missions, they were late-comers in the Middle Kingdom.

1 “Goffman’s notion of “back-stage” and “front-stage” are social artifacts rather than geographical fixities. Therefore China is referred as the “front-stage” only in a metaphoric sense. As unfolded in Chapter IV and Chapter V, there are socially constructed “back-stages” within the broader geographical front-stage. Another reason to adopt Goffman’s dramaturgical terms instead of the traditional missiological terms such as “home-base” and “foreign field” unqualifiedly is to avoid reinforce to the Orientalistic power inequality implied in such a dualism (see discussion in section 1.5 )”

2 For example, the Kun Opera, which has about 600 years of history, or the Peking Opera, which has about 200 years of history.
Not only that, Buddhism, Islam and Catholicism had long been established, but also other members of the Protestant missions had come before them. Joining the missionary enterprise as colonists from the furthest corner of the British Empire, New Zealanders had to learn the conventions of the trade from veteran missionaries, often of English or American backgrounds, as well as to bear the bitter consequences of previous Sino-Western conflicts. “Kiwi” missionaries started off as a “walk-on” in the China missionary scene and had never progressed very far from that of the “subaltern players”.

3.1. A Brief History of Christianity in China

Protestant Christianity is the newest religion introduced to China among the five religions\(^3\) officially recognised by the current Chinese government. When the Jesuit missionary St. Francois Xavier was preparing his way to China in 1552, he knew nothing about the Middle Kingdom except what was filtered through from his Japanese associates and from the legendary fragments of the Venetian merchant, Marco Polo. Xavier never entered China himself, but many of his Catholic successors did and had established quite an influential presence there. When the first Protestant missionary Robert Morrison sailed for China in 1807, he had to learn about his future “field” through the Catholic missions and via the East India Co., the business establishment that monopolised the trades “to the east of India”. He spent most of his time in China translating the Bible into Chinese and compiling an Anglo-Chinese dictionary, paving the ways for future missionaries. When the early mission societies such as LMS, CMS, ABCFM, American Baptist and Presbyterian missions first entered the treaty ports in the early 1840s, they were free to develop mission policies and strategies to cope with the idiosyncratic social conditions of imperial China. When the newly launched CIM arrived in China in the form of the Lammermuir Party\(^4\) in 1866, it was possible for its founder Hudson Taylor to

---

\(^3\) The other four are Catholicism, Buddhism, Taoism, and Islam.

\(^4\) It is said to be the largest Protestant missionary party sailed at once, with 18 adults (seven men and 11 women) and four children.
revolutionise many of the missiological conventions. After his methods proved to be effective and successful, these new ideas became more or less institutionalised in the mission’s first edition of Principles and Practice in 1884, of which every member of the Mission, including New Zealanders had to “cordially approve” before their application could be taken into consideration.

By the time that New Zealanders arrived in the field of China in organised teams in the 1890s, the ground had been laid, terms had been negotiated, precedence had been set, on their behalf but without their input or consent. There was little room left for them to make many changes to the prevalent practices of the international Anglo-American culture. It would not take New Zealand missionaries very long to realise that they were not to enter a “virgin land” such as “Aotearoa” had been. China was not only a land full of its own history and heritage, but also full of foreign interpretations and representations of the host culture. It was a politically and emotionally charged space through which the New Zealanders had to find their way. Different evangelical approaches had been experimented with in order that they could be narrowed down to a limited number of choices.

The massive missionary presence in China was by no means a natural occurrence. The title that Broomhall gave to his seven-volume book Hudson Taylor and China’s Open Century, refers to the hundred years between 1840s and the 1940s. This “Open Century” should not be taken for granted for its place in Chinese history. Both Xavier of the 16th Century and Morrison of the 19th century had to cope with the closed character of the vast empire. Xavier never entered China despite his numerous attempts while Morrison only managed to secure his residential rights in the country by taking secular employment as a member of staff in the British East India Company. Like all the other expats, he was only allowed to come to Canton for the

6 Question 23, the CIM Candidate Application.
trading seasons (March to October). While in this China’s only trading port with the West, he was confined to the “foreign factories”, located outside the city of Canton and was only allowed to visit a nearby temple, a retreat granted by the Emperor Qianlong for the expats, on three specified days of the Chinese month. Since these very limited concessions were not extended to women, Morrison had to leave his wife and children in Macao while he was on business in Canton.

The defeat in the Opium War in 1842 dragged China into a new era of an unequal treaty system, which gradually broke down its self-enclosedness. Though unanimously condemning the opium trade, the small missionary community was ambivalent about the Opium War and the consequent opening of China. The concurrent signing of the Treaty of Waitangi in 1840 and that of the Treaty of Nanjing in 1842 marked the heyday of imperialism, which both the ends of the earth and the Middle Kingdom became incorporated into the British colonial sphere. The effects of the dozens of international treaties China signed with the foreign powers can be traced in three stages. In 1842, the Nanking Treaty that concluded the First Opium War granted all expats, including the missionaries and their families, residential rights in the five treaty ports of China as well as in the British colony of Hong Kong. For the first time, foreign women were allowed to live in Chinese cities. This policy change made it possible for Christian women to arrive in China as missionaries.

The Tientsin Treaties in 1858 and the Peking Treaties in 1860 that concluded the Second Opium War opened up more Chinese cities as treaty ports and granted foreign missionaries residential rights into the “inland” (basically the rest of China).

---

7 They were Guangzhou (Canton), Xiamen (Amoy), Fuzhou (福州), Ningbo (宁波), and Shanghai (上海).
8 China signed a Treaty of Tientsin with four powers: Russia (June 13), America (June 18), Britain (June 26) and France (June 27).
9 China signed a Treaty of Peking with three powers: Britain (Oct 24), France (Oct 25), and Russia (Nov 14).
Two of the seven Treaties signed during this time had significant implications for missionaries. In the Sino-America Treaty of Tientsin (1858), two American missionaries, S. Wells Williams and William A. P. Martin, in their capacity as interpreters for the diplomatic negotiation, tactically inserted what was later known as “the toleration clause”, that is, to “tolerate” the spreading of the Christian religion in China. The sixth article of the Chinese version of the Sino-France Treaty of Peking (1860) allowed French missionaries the right to rent and purchase lands and to build houses in every province of China. However, this provision was not included in the French version. By the time that the Qing Government fully understood the socio-political consequence of this linguistic discrepancy, it was too late to reverse the precedence. Both clauses were initially relevant only to missionaries of a particular country, eventually applied to all foreign missions via the most favored nation clause. It was based on these diplomatic preconditions that missions of an “Inland” kind were made politically possible.

In 1876, the Chefoo Treaty that concluded the Margary Affair provided protection for foreigners to travel inland China, while designating another four Chinese cities as trading ports. This provision encouraged the missionaries to move further inland.

10 The full wording of Article XXIX of the Treaty of Tientsin was: “The principles of the Christian religion, as professed by the Protestant and Roman Catholic churches, are recognized as teaching men to do good, and to do to others as they would have others do to them. Hereafter those who quietly profess and teach these doctrines shall not be harassed or persecuted on account of their faith. Any person, whether citizen of the United States or Chinese convert, who, according to these tenets, peaceably teach and practice the principles of Christianity, shall in no case be interfered with or molested” (Charles Irving Bevans, Treaties and Other International Agreements of the United States of America 1776-1949 (Department of State, 1971), 670.)

11 In international economic relations and international politics, "most favoured nation" is a status or level of treatment accorded by one state to another. The term means the country which is the recipient of this treatment must, nominally, receive equal advantages as the "most favoured nation" by the country granting such treatment. Since most western powers obtained this status through their “gunboat diplomacy”, in effect, a country that has been accorded this status may not be treated less advantageously than any other country with such status by the promising country.

12 It refers to the event when the junior British diplomat Augustus Raymond Margary and his personal staff were killed on Feb 21, 1875 in Yunnan.

13 They were Yichang (宜昌), Wuhu (芜湖), Wenzhou (温州), and Beihai (北海).
Wishing to evangelise millions of Chinese living in the unreached provinces, the CIM entered Shanxi (山西), Shaanxi (陕西), Gansu (甘肃), Sichuan (四川) provinces in 1876 and Guizhou (贵州) and Guangxi (广西) provinces in 1877. The number of the CIM stations increased from 53 in six provinces in 1876 to 94 in 15 provinces in 1891, the year that saw the arrival of its first New Zealand members. Wherever Hudson Taylor appeared, he scattered his colleagues in every direction as if an exploding “bombshell”.

Most missionaries do not seem to savour global politics, particularly those with a strong separatist fundamentalist outlook. Few New Zealander missionaries appear to have studied the international power struggles that had shaped Sino-foreign relations, the same power structure that enabled them to step on the shore of China’s coast as uninvited guests. As British subjects, New Zealanders automatically enjoyed all the rights provided by international laws as well as expatriate privileges granted by these unequal treaties. Austin pointed out that the flotilla of British gunboats looming above the Chinese junks and sampans in the harbour of Shanghai, the gateway city to China, was a vivid reminder that the phrase “I am a British subject” was more potent than “Civis Romanus sum” had been in the days of Apostle Paul. As late as the inter-war days, it was “emotionally satisfying” for colonist children to be part of the great British Empire, and to sing “Land of Hope and Glory” in

---

*14 China’s Millions, (British edition, December 1876), 228-229.
15 China’s Millions, (British edition, Aug-Sep. 1891), 119-120.
16 Irene Chang 张 (ed.), et al. eds., Christ Alone: A Pictorial Presentation of Hudson Taylor’s Life and Legacy (Hong Kong: OMF, 2005), 73.
17 Fundamentalism as a movement arose in the United States at the turn of the 20th Century as a reaction against modernist theology. Theological conservatives rallying around the following "five fundamentals" came to be known as “Fundamentalist”: belief in the inspiration of the Bible and the inerrancy of scripture as a result of this; belief in the virgin birth of Christ; belief in Christ's death as being was the atonement for sin; belief in the bodily resurrection of Christ; belief in the historical reality of Christ's miracles. Fundamentalists also eschew activities that are seen “worldly” (e.g. politics and social reform).
18 Alvin Austin, Saving China: Canadian Missionaries in the Middle Kingdom, 1888-1959 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1986), 10-11.
19 The lyrics are: “Land of Hope and Glory, mother of the free,/ How can we extol thee, who
school and “Lift high His royal banner”\textsuperscript{20} in Sunday Schools, both with gusto. This led the author Ebbett to conclude that the Church and the Empire were two “impregnable fortresses” that provided unquestioned security and protection for the New Zealand children despite the deprivation of ordinary life during the Depression.\textsuperscript{21} New Zealand missionaries’ encounter with the Chinese political, social and cultural landscapes offered a competing frame of reference which complicated their sense of connection with “Greater Britain”. The most significant expatriate right for British subjects in countries like China was extraterritoriality and consular jurisdiction.\textsuperscript{22} The implication was that while in the land of China, New Zealanders were still subject to the British law, rather than Chinese law if in conflict with fellow westerners or local Chinese. In a novel based on her own missionary experience in China, A. M. D. Dinneen speaks through the protagonist, a single woman missionary from New Zealand, on one occasion, that it was only her extraterritorial rights that saved the mission properties from the plague of military lodging.\textsuperscript{23} Later, at the upsurge of the anti-foreign movement in 1927, the protagonist had “the greatest joy to point out to some of these [European] ladies, who had in years past been most active in abusing the British Navy, that, without the British Navy, they might all have stayed to be murdered with their children”.\textsuperscript{24}

\textbf{The lyrics are: “Stand up, Stand up for Jesus, ye soldiers of the Cross./ Lift high His royal banner, it must not suffer loss./ From victory unto victory, His armies shall He lead,/ ‘Til every foe is vanished, and Christ is Lord indeed.”}

\textsuperscript{20} The lyrics are: “Stand up, Stand up for Jesus, ye soldiers of the Cross./ Lift high His royal banner, it must not suffer loss./ From victory unto victory, His armies shall He lead,/ ‘Til every foe is vanished, and Christ is Lord indeed.”


\textsuperscript{22} Extraterritoriality and consular jurisdiction are two closely related yet different concepts. The former refers to the state of being exempt from the jurisdiction of local law, usually as the result of diplomatic negotiations and is limited to the head of state and diplomatic representatives. The latter refers to a narrow sense of extraterritoriality, in which diplomatic extraterritorial rights are extended to all expats. The former is still widely acceptable in contemporary international relations while the latter is seen as a notorious product of colonial world politics.


\textsuperscript{24} Ibid., 120.
It is not being implied here that New Zealanders *misused* their right to consular jurisdiction but they must have *used* it, directly or indirectly, individually or corporately, through their mission affiliation. Before another round of negotiations between British and Chinese governments over Treaties ended in 1925, the Standing Committee of the Conference of British Missionary Societies submitted a Memorial on behalf of its member Societies, which declared that they did not want that their legal rights in China to rest upon existing Treaties, particularly upon the so-called “toleration clauses” dealing specifically with missionary work, but to be accorded by China as a Sovereign Power. Moreover, it was also stated that the Societies welcomed the abolition of the current article relating to extra-territoriality, and supported provisions that were mutually agreed upon in equal conference between China and other powers. Among those who put their names to this resolution were CIM, CMS, SPG, LMS and a couple other mission societies that New Zealanders worked for.\(^25\) It is important to note that all the New Zealanders who joined the CIM had to renounce their right to demand for help or protection from the Consuls, before they handed in their applications. The fourteenth article of the mission’s *Principle and Practice* clearly spells out:

> While availing himself of any privilege offered by the government, he [while two thirds of the missionaries were women] must make no *demand* [italic original] for help or protection, though in emergencies he may need to ask for it. Appeals to Consuls, or to Chinese officials, to procure the punishment of offenders, or to demand the vindication of real or supposed rights, or indemnification for losses, are to be avoided …. Should trouble or persecution arise, a friendly representation may be made to the local officials …. In no circumstances may any missionary on his own responsibility make a written appeal to Consular authorities … Respect must be shown

---

towards all in authority…

The *Principles and Practice* was firstly issued by the mission’s founder Hudson Taylor in 1884 as a summary of his reflection on effective missiology in China. Forsaking expatriate rights was part of the principle of “close identification with the Chinese”, along with adopting Chinese dress and diets. It was noted by a Taiwanese historian that the implementation of this principle had been erratic in the early days of that mission, and was probably still inconsistent even after it was formally documented as mission policy. Civil-mission relations in China were at their worst state during the first 40 years of the mission’s operation in China (i.e. 1860-1900).

The statistics of anti-Christianity riots for this period ranged from 300 to over 1600. By the time New Zealanders began to arrive in China in organised numbers,

28 Although the CIM was formally founded in 1865, its founder had been working in China since 1853, and had started sending new recruits to China from the early 1860s.
29 Civil-mission conflicts are labeled differently by western and Chinese scholars, the former tend to call it “anti-Christianity riots” while the later “missionary cases”, each blamed the other party for the cause of the conflict. The statistics of these “riots” or “cases” also vary widely from scholar to scholar depending on the parameters of definitions and periodisations, and usually made no distinction between Catholic and Protestant missions. For example, an edition dated 1933 of the Republican era thinks the number was 354 (*Jiaooan shiliao bianmu 《教案史料编目》*); likewise, the mainland scholar Gu estimated the number to be just over 400 (Gu Changsheng 郭长声. *Chuanjiaoshi yu jindai Zhongguo* 《传教士与近代中国》 [Missionaries and Modern China] (Shanghai: Shanghai Renmin Pub., 上海人民出版社 1991), 126); however, other mainland scholars believed the number was as great as 1639 (Liao Yizhong and Li Yunhua 廖一中、李运华, *jindai Zhongguo jiaooan xintan* 《近代中国教案新探》[New Exploratory Study of Missionary Case in Modern China], Hefei 合肥: Huangshan shushe 黄山书社, 1993), 7). According to Wu and Chen, there were only seven “cases” during 1851-1858 that claimed diplomatic attention; this number increased to 92 during 1860-1874 (Wu Shengde and Chen Zenghui 吴盛德、陈增辉, “jiaooan shiliao bianmu” 教案史料编目, *Dalu Zazhi 《大陆杂志》*, Vol. 35, No. 6, (1941):196). The Taiwanese scholar Chen clearly defined his parameters and carefully calculated the number of these riots/cases to be 811, excluding those occurred during the wide-spreading Boxer Rebellion period. Within this total number, 219 cases (27%) were never fully settled,
the relationship had significantly improved. There is little evidence to suggest that New Zealanders stirred up much civil-mission conflict. But it is equally important to remember that consular jurisdiction in a mission field is something that New Zealanders had the choice to take or forsake, or even resort to under extreme circumstances, while the Chinese had no choice but to obey the civil law they were subject to. This meant an inevitable sense of condescension on the part of the missionaries. In Goffman’s language, the missionary’s status, as shaped by the socio-political preconditions, determined their “role” (i.e. script) in everyday interaction with the Chinese.

3.2. Mission Societies Prior to the Arrival of New Zealanders

The number of Chinese folk operas, with their variants, was as great as the number of Christian denominations in the West or that of Protestant mission societies in China.30 A westerner could be easily confused by the differences and similarities between Chinese folk operas just as a Chinese might find themselves confused by the differences and similarities between Christian missions and denominations. Different folk operas gained popularity in different areas and attracted different classes of audience. Some took residence in up-market theatres and large cities, while others wandered around tea-houses, village temples and houseboats. A few became nation-wide entertainment, while most were largely confined to regional and

30 There have been about 360 different kinds of folk operas and another 300 kinds of folk singsongs in the first half of the 20th Century in China, though some are dying out. In R. G. Tiedemann’s compiled work, there had been about 255 Protestant Missions operating in China during 1807-1950. The number of Protestant denominations worldwide is a contentious issue, ranging from hundreds to thousands. I only use these figures in a loose sense to signal a metaphoric similarity.
provincial borders. Likewise, Christian missions in China were operating on an informal agreement of comity.\textsuperscript{31} The big denominational missions were like the few national operas, concentrating in the coastal cities and colossal ports; smaller Scandinavian missions were like regional folk songs, carefully investing its capital to a limited number of market towns. The Yue Opera started off as a village folk song, gradually entered theatre-stages in Shanghai, and eventually became a nationally recognised Opera largely through my Aunt’s effort of reform. In a similar fashion, the CIM started in a radical fashion, operating on the periphery of missionary enterprise, so as to become acceptable to middle class Christian communities by 1880s and an established model for faith missions around the turn of the century.

When the first cohort of New Zealanders arrived, they were immediately dispersed into every corner of China. As at 1 January 1893, the CIM had 104 stations in 11 provinces with its 432 missionaries.\textsuperscript{32} The Brethren network had covered about ten cities in four provinces.\textsuperscript{33} The CMS, being one of the oldest Protestant Missions in China, had established four sub-missions.\textsuperscript{34} In 1902, over two hundred out of the total 1276 CMS missionaries were in China.\textsuperscript{35} In 1950, 84 out of the 120 Anglican missionaries remaining in China belonged to the CMS.\textsuperscript{36} The SPG had entered

\textsuperscript{31} The word “comity” has a special meaning in Protestant world mission. One definition refers the term as “the division of territory and assignment of spheres of occupation including delimitation of boundaries, on the one hand, and noninterference in one another’s affairs, on the other” (R. Pierce Beaver, \textit{Ecumenical Beginnings in Protestant World Mission: A History of Comity} (New York: Nelson, 1962), 15.

\textsuperscript{32} Phillip Brotchie, “The Importance of the Contribution of Australians to the Penetration of China by the China Inland Mission 1888-1953” (Ph.D. Thesis, Deakin University, 1999), 280.

\textsuperscript{33} The British Brethren mission was formally known as Christian Missions in Many Lands. They had established mission stations in the following Chinese regions before 1890: Jiangxi (江西)(at least 1893), Shandong (山东)(1889), Zhili/Hebei (直隶/河北)(at least 1885) and Zhili/Liaoning (直隶/辽宁) provinces (1885).

\textsuperscript{34} They were Zhejiang (浙江) Mission (1845), Fujian (福建) Mission (1850), South China Mission (1862) and West China Mission (1894).


\textsuperscript{36} George Hood, \textit{Neither a Bang nor a Whimper: The End of a Missionary Era in China} (Singapore: The Presbyterian Church in Singapore, 1991), 57.
China in 1868, and developed five stations\(^{37}\) in its North China and Shandong dioceses. In organisational terms, New Zealand Anglicans in China were much more scattered than New Zealand Presbyterians.

Being the gateways to the inland, Hong Kong, Canton and Shanghai were the showrooms of “the anarchy of Protestant evangelism”,\(^ {38}\) displaying uncoordinated proliferation of missionary groups in China. The vicinity of Canton was the only field in China where New Zealanders had established a recognisable presence. Correspondingly, the China experience of PCNZ members was largely confined to the province of Guangdong and thus had its own narrowness and provincialism. At least 14 mission societies had been active in the province before the PCNZ arrived: four British, seven American, and three German.\(^ {39}\) Shanghai, a treaty port since 1842, was where most foreign missionaries would land, depart, wait, transit, take holiday, or seek medical services, therefore established a viable expatriate community. By the early 1890s, Shanghai was not only the landing port for all CIM missionaries, but also the decision-making headquarters for this international organisation,\(^ {40}\) being the only sizable western Christian mission to make such a

\(^37\) They were Beijing (北京)(1863), Chefoo (烟台) (1874), Tai’an (泰安)(1878), Pingyin (平阴)(1879), and Yongqing (永庆)(1880).

\(^38\) Reinders, Borrowed Gods and Foreign Bodies, 36.

\(^39\) They were LMS (1807), ABCFM (1830), American Baptist Missionary Union (South) (1836), American Presbyterians (North) (1844), CMS (1845), Rhenish Missionary Society (1847), Basel Mission (1847), Berlin Missionary Association for China (1851), Wesleyan Methodist Missionary Society (1853), English Presbyterian Mission (1858), American Baptist Church (North) (1860), Evangelical Free Church (1887), United Brethren in Christ Mission (1889), Reformed Presbyterian Mission (1895). The list is adopted from: Zhao Chunchen 赵春晨, Lei Yutian 雷雨田, and He Dajin 何大进. Jidujiao yu lingnan wenhua 《基督教与近代岭南文化》[Christianity and Modern Lingnan Culture] (Shanghai: Shiji Pub., 世紀出版社 2002), 93; the English name is checked against R. G. Tiedemann, Reference Guide to Christian Missionary Societies in China: from the Sixteenth to the Twentieth Century (New York: Me. Sharpe, Inc., 2009) which suggests there had been several mission societies other than the 14 listed above being operating in the Lingnan region before 1901. For example, the Sothen Baptist Convention (1845).

\(^40\) From 1890-1930, CIM’s Headquarters was in Wusong Rd. (吴淞路), and moved to Xinzha Rd. (新闸路) from 1930 until its evacuation from China.
move at the time. Shanghai was also the city where three Protestant Missionary Conferences were held in 1877, 1890 and 1907, hosting hundreds of representatives from dozens of different missions. New Zealanders would soon find they were thrown into a larger sea of far more internationalism than could ever be imagined in the Antipodes.

In the international organisation of the CIM, North Americans were assigned to a field in Kiangxi, Anglican members went to the diocese in East Sichuan as per the comity agreement between CIM and CMS, and the various Scandinavian and German Associate Missions were often assigned to a small patch to share regional responsibility. Brotchie made a painstaking effort to trace the “geographical penetration” of the Australian members from 1910 to 1950, but the so-called “areas of concentration” were too diverse to have any significance. It would be even more difficult to establish a significant pattern of distribution of the New Zealand team, who were scattered all over the vast land of China, working alongside western missionaries of all nationalities. Their footprint was almost congruent with the entire coverage of the CIM mission network.

When “Kwis” participated in World Wars, they fought on the far side of the globe as part of an Australian force within an Imperial army. In a similar vein, when “Kwis” became involved in world evangelisation, they worked mostly as individuals in an international group of missionaries. With the exception of the CVM, the small number as well as the scattered nature of the New Zealand members of all

---

41 According to Austin, three quarters of Canadian and American members of the CIM recruited prior to 1900 were assigned to Jiangxi (Austin, Saving China, 15).
42 For example, the Finnish Free Missionary Society only worked in two stations in the Jiangxi province, the German Women’s Missionary Union worked in three stations in the Sichuan province, and the Norwegian Alliance Mission worked in five stations in the Shaanxi province.
43 For example, nine provinces out of the fifteen provinces where the CIM had a presence are listed for the year of 1910 (Brotchie, “The Importance of the Contribution of Australians,” 281-286).
international mission boards made it almost impossible to establish a “New Zealand field”, let alone a sense of national identity. They were not only lost in the “heathen millions”, but also in the “missionary thousands”.

Australiasian missionaries, although their country was part of the British empire, arrived in China in the era characterised by the Americanisation of the mission enterprise. According to Hunter, American missionary personnel in China had more than doubled between 1890 and 1905, and had more than doubled again to 3,300 by 1919. The survey of the 1890 Missionary Conference held in Shanghai showed that there were 41 foreign missions and 1,296 foreign missionaries in the whole of China. As late-comers, New Zealanders inherited a rich Sinological literature from an earlier generation of missionary pioneers to help them learn about the China field, and about a dozen versions of the Chinese bible to choose from, plus nearly

48 They are Robert Morrison’s version (1822), Joshua Marshman’s version (1822), Walter Henry Medhurst’s version (1835), Charles Gutzlaff’s version (1835), two Delegate’s
a hundred vernacular versions in at least ten dialects. They were not overly concerned about the heated debate on how the notion of the Christian “God” should be translated in Chinese. Their small number and scattered allocation also helped them to maintain the “Protestant Consensus” and to eschew the controversies between theological fundamentalism and liberalism, between direct and indirect approaches to the Christianisation of China, which so bitterly divided the American missions in the early 20th Century.

New Zealand missionaries arrived in time to be exposed to the lengthy transition from “church(es) in China” to the “Church of China”. They also witnessed the full growth of medical and educational arms of the missionary enterprise. Therefore, they worked alongside a growing body of Chinese Christian workers and leaders. In 1890, there were a total of 105 mission medical institutes, including 61 hospitals and 44 clinics. These figures increased to 164 hospitals and 240 clinics in 1905. About 20 Bible Colleges had been set up in 1876. There were 2196 day schools, plus 389 primary, secondary and tertiary schools under the auspice of western missions in 1905. By 1906, 14 universities had emerged in China from various Christian secondary schools or colleges, though all students were still in their foundation year. Tertiary education was largely an American investment; very few New Zealand versions (1855 and 1863), Mandarin versions (1857 and 1875), Griffith John’s versions (1886 and 1887), Henry Blodget’s version (1889).

50 Between July 1877 and June 1878, there had been over 60 articles appearing in the missionary magazine A Review of the Times (Wan Guo Gong Bao 万国公报) (vol. 448-495) about the translation controversy over the name of the Christian God. This issue was partly solved by a compromise made for the 1919’s Chinese Union Version of the Bible, in which both translations (shen/神 and shangdi/上帝) were kept in prospective editions.
51 RGCPMC, 1890, p.732.
52 Donald MacGillivray, A Century of Protestant Missions in China – Being the Centenary Conference Historical Volume (Shanghai, 1907), 669-672.
53 No specific number is recorded for the number of Bible Colleges in the 1890’s RGCPMC, but 1877’s RGCPMC shows that there were 20 Bible Colleges in 1876.
54 RGCPMC, 1890, p.732.
55 MacGillivray, A Century of Protestant Missions in China, 667.
56 Kenneth Scott Latourette, A History of Christian Missions in China (New York:
Zealanders taught as University professors or achieved eminence in student ministry.\footnote{MacMillan, 1929}, 626-627.

The feminisation of the New Zealand missionary force was a reflection of an international gender culture amongst the English-speaking overseas mission.\footnote{The discussion in this section is limited by scope and space. For further discussion on women and mission, refer to Jeffrey Cox, The British Missionary Enterprise Since 1700 (New York; London: Routledge, 2008), 107-113, 187-195, 196-202; Elizabeth E. Prevost, The Communion of Women: Missions and Gender in Colonial Africa and the British Metropole (New York: Oxford University Press, 2010); Jocelyn Murray, “Anglican and Protestant Missionary Societies in Great Britain: Their Use of Women as Missionaries from the late 18th to the late 19th Century”, Exchange 21 (1992), 1-20; Fiona Bowie, Deborah Kirkwood and Shirley Ardener, eds. Women and Missions: Past and Present: Anthropological and Historical Perceptions (Providence, RI: Berg, 1993); Rhonda Semple, Missionary Women: Gender, Professionalism and the Victorian Idea of Christian Mission (Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell & Brewer, 2003); Mary Taylor Huber and Nancy C. Lutkehaus, eds. Gendered Missions: Women and Men in Missionary Discourse and Practices (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1999).} Prior to 1860, women’s contribution had been limited to official, unpaid work as wives and kin of male missionaries.\footnote{The Society for Promoting Female Education in the East (SPFEE) was formed outside denominational auspices in 1834, largely as means of raising official support for the unofficial work executed by missionary wives.} However, from 1860, missionary societies began to seek out single women as missionaries in their own right. Such a shift was a result of two main movements in missionary practice. On the one hand, most denominational boards formed ladies committees or auxiliaries in the mid-19th Century for the development of women’s work, particular in education.\footnote{Following SPFEE’s model, the Ladies Association for Heathen Women (Scotland) was formed in 1843; the Methodist Missionary Society formed a Ladies Committee for Ameliorating the Condition of Heathen Women in 1859; the high-church SPG sanctioned its Ladies’ Association in 1866 while the low-church CMS formed its own Ladies’ Candidate Committee in 1906 and sanctioned the autonomous CEZMS in 1880; the Baptist Missionary Society formed the Association of Ladies for the Support of zenana work in 1867; the LMS formed the Ladies Committee for Female Missions in India, Africa, China and the east in 1875; the Irish Presbyterian Female Association for Promoting Christianity among the Women of the East was formed in 1873; the Presbyterian Church of England Women’s Missionary Association in 1878.} Consequently, the number and percentage of women missionaries had rapidly increased and in many case the
gendered ratio of most traditional missions had reversed about 1900. The same movement was also happening on the other side of the Atlantic. When the first woman missionary society, the interdenominational Women’s Union Missionary Society was founded in 1861, there were less than a dozen of single American women serving as foreign missionaries. As the number of women’s missionary societies and auxiliaries increased, so did the number of woman missionaries. The jubilee celebration in 1910 saw no fewer than 44 women’s societies, backed by two million women meeting in small groups throughout the country. By 1890, the married women of the general missionary boards and the single women of the women’s boards together composed 60% of the American mission force. By 1919, both Northern and Southern American Methodist boards had more than twice as many women as men in the China field while the ABCFM had as many single women as married and single men together.

---

61 For example, the CMS sent only 16 women missionaries between 1873 and 1883. This number increased to 192 between the decade 1884-1893. Their women recruits outnumbered men in 1892, before the official launching of its Ladies’ Candidate Committee in 1906 (Jocelyn Murray, “The Role of Women in the Church Missionary Society, 1799-1917,” in Kevin Ward and Brian Stanley, eds., The Church Mission Society and World Christianity, 1799-1999 (Grand Rapids, Mich: W. B. Eerdmans, 1999), 66-90). The Women’s Mission Association of the SPG supported about 100 women missionaries in 1900, this number had increased to 343 by 1915, including 58 non-Europeans (M.D. Rice, “The Progress of SPG Women’s Work in the Mission-Field, 1866-1915”, July 1915, 183, cited in Prevost, The Communion of Women, p. 4, footnote 6). For the last decade of the 19th Century (1890 – 1900), the percentage of women recruits was 51% (388) for the CMS, 37% for the LMS, 28% for the WMMS, and over 60% for the CIM. By 1900, of 18,782 missionaries throughout the world, 3,628 were single women and 4,340 wife (C. Peter Williams, “‘The Missing Link’: The Recruitment of Women Missionaries in Some English Evangelical Missionary Societies in the Nineteenth Century,” in Fiona Bowie, Deborah Kirkwood and Shirley Ardener eds. Women and Missions: Past and Present: Anthropological and Historical Perceptions (Providence, RI: Berg, 1993), 63).
62 The Congregational Church formed the first denominational Woman’s Board of Missions in 1869, followed by the Methodist Woman’s Foreign Missionary Society in the same year.
64 Hunter, Gospel of Gentility, xiii, 3.
65 Ibid., 13. In 1914, female made up 65% of the worldwide ABCFM missionary staff (209 single women and 205 missionary wives to the total personnel of 638) (Deborah Gaitskell, “Rethinking Gender Roles: The Field Experience of Women Missionaries in South Africa,” in Andrew Porter, ed. The Imperial Horizons of British Protestant Missions, 1880-1914 (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Wm. B. Eerdmans Pub., 2003), 149).
On the other hand, the rise of interdenominational missions, largely influenced by the “holiness movement”, 66 began to encourage the recruitment of the “neglected forces” of the western church, largely laymen and women on equal footing with male clergy. 67 The use of women was part of a general “counter-revolution of values” and of the “anti-establishment and anti-clerical radicalism” of new generations of mission leaders. 68 The CIM was a prominent example and reshaped the gender pattern of the missionary community in China. According to the 1907 Records of General Conference of the Protestant Missionaries in China (hereafter RGCPMC), the centennial year of Protestantism arriving in China in the person of Robert Morrison, there were a total of 3,445 foreign missionaries, of which only 1,443 were males (or 41.9%). The 1,038 missionary wives and 964 single women made up 58.1% of the entire missionary presence in China. 69 By the time the Australasian members joined the CIM, a stereotypical system of categorisation had built upon previous experiences about which Chinese provinces were harder to “work” than others. Women also tended to be placed in “soft” postings, or at least under the protection of a male senior missionary in a “hard” locality. 70

The missionary career started off as a male career. The two “M”s began to fall apart when women, single and married, became formally listed in missionary registers. The American study of foreign missions shows that the feminisation of the mission force accompanied a decline of male interest in mission work during the 1880s. 71

66 The holiness movement was a Protestant revivolist movement that advocates the right of all Christians, including women, to enter into a status of holiness and the resultant power to be able to minister more effectively. When translated into missiological discourse, it was often argued that God empowers both men and women by his Holy Spirit to do his work regardless of their sex, status and qualification. For discussion on the relationship between the holiness milieu, church and mission, see: David Bebbington, Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1730s to the 1980s (London: Unwin Hyman, 1989), Chapter 5; Williams, “‘The Missing Link’,” 45-57.
68 Bebbington, Evangelicalism in Modern Britain, 166; Williams, “‘The Missing Link’,” 47.
69 MacGillivray, A Century of Protestant Missions in China, 671.
70 Brotchie, “‘The Importance of the Contribution of Australians,’” 169-173.
71 Hunter, Gospel of Gentility, 14.
The efforts of Mission Boards to restore the waning prestige of mission work in the early 20th Century not surprisingly focused on efforts to restore its reputation as a “manly calling”.\textsuperscript{72} The masculine nature, and to some extent military tone, of missionary culture was reflected in the vocabulary it used. For example, the “home-front” and “field” dualism, though more associated with agricultural discourse of gleaning and reaping of the biblical context,\textsuperscript{73} was also mirroring the military model of “home-base” and “battle-field”. The fact that new recruits were referred as “reinforcements”, and retired missionaries as “veterans” was unmistakably military, and thus implicitly masculine. Terminology with connotations of warfare, such as “pioneering”, “penetration”\textsuperscript{74}, “occupation”\textsuperscript{75}, and “deployment”\textsuperscript{76} are still in use today.

Membership of a specific mission strongly shaped the New Zealanders’ missionary experience in China. It was not uncommon for missionaries to switch missions just as it was for apprentice actors/actresses to move between opera trades. The “sliding door” effect was probably most evident in the case of Rev. George McNeur, whose initial intention was to join the CIM, but eventually became the first PCNZ missionary to China at the persuasion of Rev. Alexander Don. Had he joined the

\textsuperscript{72} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{73} Several mission periodicals were named “Reaper” (NZABM, BTI) and “Gleaner” (CMS).

\textsuperscript{74} Ironically, a thesis claims to make "particular reference to the work of Australian women missionaries" adopts a very masculine expression, "the penetration of China" (italic mine) in the same sentence of the title (i.e. Brotchue, “The Importance of the Contribution of Australians to the Penetration of China by the China Inland Mission 1888-1953”). Feminist literature critics has pointed out that the word "penetration" suggests male-oriented sexual dominance.

\textsuperscript{75} The nation-wide church survey report published in 1922 was entitled \textit{The Christian Occupation of China: A General Survey of the Numerical Strength and Geographical Distributon [sic] of the Christian Forces in China}. The word "Occupation" has attracted much criticism by Chinese scholars, thus when reprinted in 2007, the Chinese version of the same report was simply named as \textit{A General Survey of Christianity in China 1901-1920} (《1901-1920年中国基督教调查资料》).

\textsuperscript{76} A doctoral thesis submitted in 2002 employs the expression of “redployment to new fields” in its title (i.e. David Antony Huntley, “The Withdrawal of the CIM from China and the Redployment to New Fields in East Asia: An Understanding of the Methodology and Decision-Making Processes” (Ph.D. Thesis, Trinity Theological Seminary, 2002)).
CIM, he would have done itinerant work in an inland province rather than taking up residence in the most long-standing coastal port for foreign trading. He would have adopted Chinese gowns and worn a queue instead of keeping his white suit. He would have accepted equally shared allowance with women and unordained colleagues through a pool system. He would have worked without guarantee of income. He would have lived in a Chinese-style cottage rather than in a huge compound. His term of service would have been seven years instead of four. He would more likely have become a superintendent overseeing a whole province rather than leading a group of missionaries self-confined within the wall of a compound. He would be more likely to teach in a Bible school or a Spiritual Institute instead of a Union Theological College. Elizabeth Stinson’s switch of missions was taken in the opposite direction. She started off as a CEZMS missionary nurse in 1909, transferring to NZCMA in five years later. She resigned from the Anglican mission in 1925, protesting over its compromise of the faith in the mission field of China. She had come to the conviction that the role of CMS among locals had become “an employment bureau”, where Chinese staff were “eating church rice” and where educational ministry had taken precedence over the evangelical call. She further alienated herself from Anglicanism by being re-baptised, and transferred to the more evangelistic-oriented Baptist mission under the covering of the CIM.\footnote{Stinson, 1925, E. Stinson folder 2/1922-1925, personnel file, ANG 143/3.115/, John Kinder Library.}

Contrary to the classic “Stimuli-Response Paradigm” of the American Fairbank School, China had never been a passive receiver of external influences. Rather, the Chinese, Christian or secular, were active filters or even re-interpreters of foreign messages and their messengers. Few missionaries and their contemporaries realised that the mission field of China had shaped the Protestant Christendom just as the West changed and molded her.

Taking the largest Mission Society in China as an example: on the one hand, the
CIM exerted great influence in China; while on the other hand, China also brought the CIM into being. Almost all of the CIM principles, as ground-breaking as they were, reflected the social conditions of imperial China in the mid-19th Century. Firstly, the geographical distribution of the Chinese society, with 80% of its population living in the countryside, alongside the corrupting impact of the expatriate community in the coastal treaty ports, led Hudson Taylor to supplement the “coastal approach” of denominational missions with an “inland approach”, an approach gradually adopted by missions working in other fields. Secondly, the anti-foreign sentiment of the Chinese populace, caused by traditional xenophobia and a series of defeats associated with Opium trade and territorial loss, was a constant reminder to CIM missionaries to alleviate local resentment by distancing themselves from imperialism as well as identifying with the lifestyle of rural Chinese by forsaking the modern comforts of Victorian England. Thirdly, the density of the “China millions” compelled Taylor to enlarge the missionary force by opening the threshold for the “reserved army” of laymen and laywomen from every evangelical denomination. Moreover, the sexual segregation of Chinese society raised the strategic value of women missionaries, and particularly opened a new venture for single women. Next, geographical and communicative distances between interior China and sending countries prompted Taylor to establish the decision-making headquarters in the mission field instead of any of the capitals of Protestant countries. Last, the vastness of China’s territory also made comity arrangements, or on what R.

78 In the latter half of the 19th Century, “inland” became a keyword in the mission circle, reflecting a general shift of focus from the contact zones of the coastal regions (or treaty ports in the Chinese context) to the interior or the regions beyond. The CIM was the first mission that stipulated its “inland focus” in its organisational name (i.e. 1865). There had been quite a number of missions named after the fashion of the "China Inland Mission": Livingstone Inland Mission (1878), Soudan Interior Mission (1893/1898), African Inland Mission (1895), Aborigines Inland Mission (1905), Congo Inland Mission (Mennonite, 1911), Australian Inland Mission (Presbyterian, 1912), Heart of Africa Mission (1913), Canada Inland Mission (Brethren, 1945), Brazil Inland Mission (1955), India Inland Mission (1964), and Himalayan Inland Mission (1983). It could be argued that the CIM’s success story disseminated the missionary ideal of “the inland approach” or “the forward approach” to other mission fields.
Pierce Beaver called “denomination by geography”, possible within and outside of the CIM system. In other words, it was China that revolutionised the CIM, through which in turn changed the Protestant missionary thinking and practice.

FAU provides another example of the reversal of influence. According to Cameron, the FAU had at its largest, most complex, and most distinctive operation, in China. Its China Convoy was the only part of the worldwide FAU operation to develop a large-scale transport system, as China presented a greater challenge than FAU ventures in other parts of the world. The isolation and the vast needs of the war-torn China also challenged the China Convoy to forfeit some Unit traditions to recruit and maintain a more diverse and more international membership. For example, they accepted a non-pacifist doctor, Graham Milne, as a worker on secondment. Another distinctive feature of the China Convoy was that it was determined to break down the traditional barriers between Westerners and Chinese, and benefactors and beneficiaries by establishing a community democracy. When this goal could not be fully realised, its peculiarly isolated status in China fostered strong bonds within the foreign members.

3.3. Chinese Chronicle

A question from this discussion of the New Zealand missionary scene remains yet to be answered: why were more missionaries recruited for China than other fields, while the home conditions remained the same for all potential missionary candidates. Table 13 provides an interesting comparison between the total number of New Zealand recruits and the number of China missionaries from New Zealand for different decades. It is worth noting that while the overall number of missionaries recruited had only increased by 7% from the decade 1890-1899 to the decade 1890-1899 to the decade

79 Beaver, Ecumenical Beginnings in Protestant World Mission, 15.
1900-1909, the number of China missionaries had a dramatic increase of 79% for the same period. However, while general recruits had increased by 73% from the decade 1920-1929 to the decade 1930-1939, the ratio of increase in the number of China missionaries had dropped to 14% for the same period. The percentage of China missionaries to the total New Zealand missionary recruits reached its peak (29%) during the decade 1910-1919 and then gradually decreased.

Table 13: Number of Missionaries Departed from New Zealand at Different Periods.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Total number of NZ Missionaries</th>
<th>Ratio of increase</th>
<th>Total number of China Missionaries</th>
<th>Ratio of increase</th>
<th>% of China M. of the period to the total number of China M. (N=255)</th>
<th>% of China M. to the total number of NZ M. of the period</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1850-1889</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1890-1899</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>7.5%</td>
<td>13.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1900-1909</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>13.4%</td>
<td>23.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1910-1919</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>-0.7%</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>16.5%</td>
<td>28.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1920-1929</td>
<td>253</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>18.9%</td>
<td>18.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930-1939</td>
<td>306</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1940-1949</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>-8%</td>
<td>18.5%</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sailing time unknown</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total/Average</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>255</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To understand these curious differences, one needs to look at what was happening in China. Growing up in a British dominion, most New Zealanders obtained their sense of history from western chronicles. However, their host country was living according to a quite different historical memory and presence. New Zealand was by and large a land of peace, while China had been a land of turmoil during much of the time New Zealanders were there. These included the First Sino-Japan War in 1895, the Boxer Uprising and the consequent Eight-Nation Alliance’s occupation of Beijing in
1900-1901, the Xinhai Revolution in 1911, the Northern Expedition during 1926-1928, the Mukden Incident in 1931, the Second Sino-Japan War during 1937-1945, the full scale Communist-National Civil War during 1945-1949, not to mention the regional riots erupted from time to time and place to place.

Three events occurring around the turn of the 20th Century can be counted as the stimulus that aroused missionary interest for the China field: the massacre of CMS missionaries in Ku-Cheng, South China in 1895, which included the Rev. Robert Stewart who visited New Zealand in 1892 and was instrumental in the establishment of the NZCMA; the Boxer Rebellion which claimed the lives of at least 188 Protestant missionaries in 1900, among whom Edith Searell was the only New Zealander; the increasing frequency of famines in India combined to heighten the profile of the “east of India field”. It is generally believed that the post-Boxer era was the “golden days for Christianity” in China, covering about two decades. One of the reasons was the replacement of the traditional imperial examination system by the modern education system in 1905. This change brought a two-fold effect on missions. One was the loss of power of the gentry class who often stirred up riots against foreign teaching; and another is the increased demand for qualified teachers.

Thus in Table 14, we see the average annual departures for China nearly doubled during 1900-1919 from the previous decade (from 1.9 to 3.4 per year). The “golden days” ended with a refreshed anti-western sentiment aroused by the controversial Paris Peace Conference in 1919, developing into the anti-Christianity movement.

81 A memorial service was held in the Christchurch Cathedral on Sunday, August 11, 1895 as recorded in the Press, August 12, 1895, p.3; eulogies of Rev. Stewart appeared in the Church Gazette, September 1895, p.171.
84 Article 156 of the Treaty of Versailles, concluded at the Paris Peace Conference in 1919, transferred the concessions of the Shandong peninsula to Japan rather than returning
in 1925, and the civil instability caused by the Northern Expedition which peaked in the Nanjing Incident in 1927. The CIM’s campaign for 200 new workers by the end of 1931 explains the increased number of New Zealanders joining the CIM for the decade 1931-1940 whereas the PCNZ number dropped by more than half in the same period. While the overall number of new China missionaries from New Zealand halved during the 1940-1949 decade due to the restrictions and the aftermath of World War II, the conditions and consequences of the civil war drew pacifists’ attention to China, which led to the recruitment of 11 FAU workers. The average rate of annual arrivals reached its peak during 1930-1939 (5.1 per year). This corresponds with the period immediately preceding the Pacific war, after which all New Zealand missionaries were expelled or interned by the Japanese and China was torn apart by war.

3.4. The Country as the Setting

The following is not an objective introduction (if there is ever to be one) of China and its people, rather, it is an image or impression formed in the eyes of the New Zealand missionaries. Lacking its own sinologists, New Zealanders started off consuming “borrowed images of China” from overseas publications. Thus it was not uncommon for the missionaries, even if it was their very first time to set foot in China’s land, to claim “familiarity of Chinese strangeness” in their genre of “first impression”. Courtney Archer, who had been fascinated by the country for many

sovereign authority to China. Chinese outrage over this provision led to demonstrations and a cultural movement known as the May Fourth Movement.

85 The Northern Expedition (Chinese: 北伐; pinyin: běi fǎ) was a military campaign led by the Kuomintang from 1926 to 1928. Its main objective was to unify China by ending the rule of warlords. Nanjing Incident (Chinese: 南京事件; pinyin: Nánjīng Shìjiàn) occurred in March 1927 during the capture of Nanjing by the National Revolutionary Army (NRA) in their Northern Expedition. On March 24, soldiers and civilians started large scale rioting against foreign interests, burning houses and attacking the British, American and Japanese consulates, and executing the American vice president of Nanking University, Doctor John Elias Williams while almost assassinating the Japanese consul. Several other foreign residents, were killed by Chinese soldiers.

years, felt “as if I was coming home” when he first arrived in China.87

New Zealand’s consumption of these national images was not directly imported from China, but filtered through England and America. The American scholar, Harold Isaacs, breaks down the chronology of Western, especially American, interaction with the Chinese up until the end of the 20th Century in this way:

i. The Age of Respect (18th Century)
ii. The Age of Contempt (1840-1905)
iii. The Age of Benevolence (1905 - 1937)
iv. The Age of Admiration (1937-1944)
v. The Age of Disenchantment (1944-1949)
vi. The Age of Hostility (1949 - )88

The different images of China correspond to different times and spaces. The idea that the Chinese are a superior people is connected with China’s ancient civilisation and its long history, while the idea of Chinese as inferior people is associated with the era during which British and European forces militarily and ritualistically humbled the great Celestial Empire. It was only a small step from the conception of the Chinese as an inferior race to the image of the Chinese as wards. The birth of Asia’s first Republic in China and the corresponding “Missionary Golden Age” painted a rosier picture of a more attractive people. The Sino-Japan war and the subsequent alliance between China and the English-speaking countries made China a “risen heroine” while the fall of China into Communist hands switched the image to a “fallen heroine”. International politics also led the west, particularly the Americans, to see the Chinese as “ungrateful wretches” and an “awakened dragon”.89

87 Courtney Archer, Interview by Caitriona Cameron, June 9, 1988, Oral History Collection, MS C 2113, quoted in Cameron, Go Anywhere Do Anything, 41.
88 Isaacs, Scratches on Our Minds, 71.
89 Ibid., 89-238.
The international status of China depreciated in the mid nineteenth century from a condition appropriate to “the Age of Respect” to one associated with “the Age of Contempt”. When William Milne applied to a London-based Mission to become a missionary in early 19th Century, the Committee was afraid that he was not good enough for the Chinese. 90 One century later in a peripheral colony such as New Zealand, a Headmistress referee thought Frances Ogilvie was “too good for the Chinese”. 91 Such a change of attitude was only a reflection of the generally condescending status of a superior China to that of an inferior China.

With a different focus, a Chinese scholar divided the American version of “China images” into three historical periods: in the later 18th Century, China was a “positive Other”, in the 19th Century an “inferior Other”, and in the early half of the 20th Century, a “controllable Other”, each was constructed to help the formation of the American self-image in different international political contexts. 92

The New Zealand version of “China images” took a slightly different route. The two countries were brought into what Tony Ballantyne called the “Web of Empire” during the era of British colonial expansion. A whole range of networks and linkages opened New Zealand up to a myriad of different influences with its intersection of

90 LMS’s original decision was to send William Milne to the African field, and start him as an assistant to ”missionary proper”. Robert Morrison’s appeal for additional worker altered the plan so he became the second Protestant missionary to China.
the British and Chinese empires focused on Canton and Hong Kong. New Zealand’s trade with China dated back to 1792, even before New Zealand had a government, with the consignment of sealskins. The seal trade was consistent with Marco Polo’s version of Cathay, that China was “a land of limitless wealth”. New Zealand’s convenience as a jumping off point for the China trade was part of early discussions of British annexation of New Zealand. Brian Moloughney points out that settlers from Britain had already internalised aspects of Chinese culture before coming to New Zealand, so much so that these things came to be disassociated from their Chinese roots. Apart from tea, the western domestic garden, imported to New Zealand from Europe, was also rich in plants that had their origins in China, most famously the rhododendron. These plants transformed western gardens during the 19th Century, so that, as S.A.M. Adshead argues, “Szechuan was now in the suburbs, and gardening, the most widespread aesthetic activity perhaps apart from choice of clothes, was deeply affected”.

With the emergence of a missionary interest and China’s sliding position in international politics, the image of China switched from one of “luxurious Cathay” into that of a “godless China”. As conveyed in missionary literature such as *Never a Dull Moment* and *The Teeth of the Dragon*, the missionary reports in the first half of the 20th century portrayed a “restless China”. Robin Hyde’s title for her experience in the war-torn China, *Dragon Rampant*, was a secular counterpart. Finally, the recollection of a missionary encounter with the New China also gave the reader a glimpse of the “communist China” that was soon going to retreat behind a

“bamboo curtain”.

New Zealanders inherited “a borrowed British view” regarding Asian politics. Up until World War II, Asia only featured as a vague and undifferentiated landmass to New Zealand. The attitude towards China was generally quite contemptuous, whereas the feeling towards Japan was more respectful. Such prejudices manifested in political cartoons. For example, after the Treaty of Versailles transferred German concessions in Shandong to Japan, rather than returning sovereign authority to China, New Zealand’s sympathy lay with Japan. A cartoon entitled “China complains that Japan is using threatening behaviour towards her” portrays China as a grotesque figure with a queue, even after eight years since the birth of the Republican and thus the massive cutting of the queue across the country. Few New Zealanders saw the injustice of this settlement, let alone were aware of the consequently outraged reaction in China, leading to demonstrations and a nationalist movement known as the “May Fourth Movement”, and of a refusal to signing the Treaty by the Chinese representative at the Paris Peace Conference. Twenty years later, the full scale of the Japanese invasion in China had inspired a growing call to boycot Japanese goods, for example, the banning of Japanese onions in New Zealand. In a cartoon entitled “They don’t want to know these onions”, the cartoonist unsympathetically portrays the Chinese greengrocer as a grotesque figure, though without queue. Ironically, less than two years after the publication of this cartoon, New Zealand and China became allies in the Pacific war, fighting against Japanese imperialism and militarism. Against this general stereotypical understanding of Asian politics, the missionary reportage of Japanese cruelty and brutality and the Chinese endurance and braveness was one of the few alternative voices.

Almost without exception, textbooks about China always begin with a description of the landscapes of the country with a hint of geographic determinism. When being exposed to the “real” Chinese in their native land, New Zealanders had to borrow vocabulary and expressions from earlier missionary writings with which they were acquainted in order to make sense of such encounters. One feature in missionary writings of the late 19th and early 20th Century China was to link the mission field to biblical sceneries, often Old Testament ones. The dissonance of Asian experience led missionaries to look for touchstones of continuity. On the one hand, the sounds of nature such as rain, the caw of the crow, the singing of the cricket, and the crying of the babies, were the only bridges across a great chasm of culture. On the other hand, by making analogy to biblical contexts, it was at least comprehensible for western missionaries to appreciate the strange roadside scenes or surroundings in the neighbourhood – waterwheels, women at the well, startled flocks of geese, and many other exotic objects and people. Most New Zealanders would agree with the general conclusion of the American missionary Guilelma Alsop: living on the mission field felt like having “one foot in the 20th century and one in the ages B.C.”

Even the China-born missionary doctor, Kathleen Pih, used to think that the scenes in South China were “really like the days of Jesus”. Likewise, the baptism of a family of four, perhaps not an uncommon scene in a country that valued family ties, made Flora Wilson “visualise better the stories told of families in the Acts of the Apostles”. The contrast between western modernity and Chinese antiquity was more pronounced in the inland parts of the country than the coastal cities. As late as in the 1940s, the further the FAU members travelled from the city, the more they felt that they were “stepping back into a medieval world”. The journey in the North West region lived up to the expectations of John Johnson and Owen Jackson. In nostalgic excitement, one of them wrote:

---

102 Wilson’s “letter to folks”, June 23, 1938, CVM, Staff Files, F.M.Wilson, PCNZ Archive.
103 Cameron, *Go Anywhere Do Anything*, 41.
[We] followed the desert on the old silk route to Persia, the same ... route, that Marco Polo followed, and the country is much the same as in his time. It was like the popular conception of Morocco or Syria or Biblical Palestine: bare rocky deserts, sand hills, mule and camel trains, and the population either nomad or living in large square block forts...  

One of the informants of this research linked the Chinese salt-refining techniques with a biblical analogue:

[My parents] were all up in the hills there. The Chinese salt-carrier used to walk pass somewhere near there .... If you read in the Scripture where ‘but if the salt have lost his savour, wherewith shall it be salted’ ... [pointing to a photo of a man pounding in the mortar and pestle]... He is actually breaking up the rock salt .... A lot of the Chinese used to pick up a bucket of rock salt, stir it into whatever they were cooking to get a certain amount of salt dissolved into it. And then put it aside. If you do this often enough, all the salt would be leached out of it. And you just get left with a piece of rock. That is if the salt has lost its savour. That’s sort of thing I find very interesting. Because we live in New Zealand, all our salt are sea salt. ...

A qualifying clause must be added here that the biblicalisation of the China field was by no means unique. Brian Stanley reminds his readers that rural Africa enabled

---

104 Johnson to Butler, December 15, 1945, quoted in Cameron, *Go Anywhere Do Anything*, 72-73.
106 David Taylor, interview by the researcher, July 21, 2010.
evangelical missionaries to recapture the world of the biblical narratives in a way they could never do at home in the increasingly industrial West.\textsuperscript{107} It was a shared perception of the mono-cultural missionary movement during British imperial expansion.

Another feature of missionary reports was to judge the Chinese ways of life by a western standard. One missionary wife wrote in the early 1910s:

What a funny country it is! The people seem to do everything upside down [or back-to-front – the researcher]. When they write they begin at the wrong end of the paper [which is the right end for the Chinese – the researcher], and when they read a book they begin at the end and read backwards. When they want to say ‘How do you do?’ they shake their own hands instead of yours. They keep their hats on in company, instead of taking them off, and they mount a horse from its right instead of its left side. They begin dinner with dessert and end with soup. They drink their wine hot instead of cold, and when the schoolboys are saying their lessons, they turn their back to the schoolmaster instead of their faces. In fact we really feel we have come to Topsy-Turvy Land!\textsuperscript{108}

\subsection*{3.5. Chinese People as the Audience}

\textit{A Chinese operatic circus had a difficult audience to please. The early conditions for my Aunt’s performance were best summarised in the name of the community she belonged to: “straw stage circus”. The stage could be anything between a house-boat, a barnyard, an open-air market, a temple, a private home, a teahouse,}

\footnotesize
\textsuperscript{107} Brian Stanley, \textit{The Bible and Flag: Protestant Missions and British Imperialism in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries} (Leicester: Apollos, 1990), 168.
and a commercial theatre. Operatic performance was often only one part of the many social repertoires going on simultaneously to form the entire celebration. The audience might be coming and going as a stream, on foot or in boats, standing or sitting, drinking tea or wine, chatting to mates or family, eating melon seeds or moon cakes, negotiating business or talking gossip, paying respect to gods or hosts, and buying or selling goods or services (e.g., a hot towel to wipe away sweat). The actresses could lose the audience’s attention at any moment, which might be (or might not be) brought back by the deafening effect of musical instruments, skillful handling of long sleeves, or martial art like movements. Having said that, the audience was amazingly educated so as to know what to expect with regard to the best parts of the plot, and zealously gave their approval or disapproval. The experience of having coins thrown into her faces as douceur is recounted over and again in my Aunt’s biographies. The humility must have been unremarkable for her and her colleagues. A western observer who is used to the orderly and solemn atmosphere of theatrics would find the Chinese audience like an excitable mob. Linking missionary endeavour with performing art, I often wonder what the foreign missionaries had gone through in the “front-stage” of the China field. They had to give a sermon whenever possible. It could well be the same public spaces that operas were occurring, alongside many other daily activities of the Chinese societies. Their audience, often the same audience for operatic performances, might pay attention, wrongly, to the messenger rather than the message. Being a stranger in a strange land, it was never difficult to attract a crowd, yet it could be equally possible to stir up a mob. Knowing and managing the audience thus became an essential life skill.

The missionaries were fully aware that China was not a virgin land, but a land full of people. The missionary goal of “saving China” had to be achieved through saving its people. Thus, impressions of the Chinese were the second salient feature of missionary writings. The Chinese has many faces in the English speaking countries.
Harold R. Isaacs describes how the images of the Chinese come in jostling pairs:

The Chinese are seen as a superior people and an inferior people; devilishly exasperating heathens and wonderfully attractive humanists; wise sages and sadistic executioners; thrifty and honorable men and sly and devious villains; comic opera soldiers and dangerous fighters.\(^{109}\)

According to Isaacs, the missionary images of the Chinese swayed between “the wonderful heathen” and “the exasperating heathen”.\(^{110}\) We see what we expect to see; missionaries were no exception. In his renowned book, *Borrowed Gods and Foreign Bodies*, Reinders presents a long list of the missionary images of the Chinese body such as diseased, atrophied, feeble, stagnating, mentally deficient, in a stupor, drugged, sleeping, dead, childlike, and feminine.\(^{111}\) Reinders suggests that to new missionaries who could not comprehend what was being said, all they could see was largely Chinese bodies. Consequently, the Chinese seemed to be “mindless” and therefore, “body-ful”.\(^{112}\) If bodily appearance was taken as a reasonable indicator of national character, it was thus logical for missionaries “to move from bound foot to bound mind, from long hair to effeminacy, from dirty bodies to sinful souls”.\(^{113}\)

One of the most frequently highlighted features of the Chinese nation was its population density. Coming from an isolated small colony, most New Zealanders were overwhelmed by “China’s millions”. In 1920, Canton had a population of 1,600,000, Shanghai 1,500,000, Hong Kong 650,000, and Hangzhou 525,000, while the most populated urban areas in New Zealand, Auckland and Wellington, only had

---

\(^{109}\) Isaacs, *Scratches on Our Minds*, 70-71.

\(^{110}\) Ibid., 127-140.


\(^{112}\) Ibid., 39.

\(^{113}\) Ibid., 40.
a population of 157,757 and 107,488 respectively in 1921. The crowd was probably one of the strongest formative experiences of missionaries. On the one hand, far-away people were seen as crowds; on the other, in crowds of people seemed far away. In stage life, if one is an actor/actress, the audience is always a crowd. In a mission field, if one is a foreigner, the locals are always a crowd, until mutual interactions enable foreigners to see individual differences and personal character of the host people. Although the urgency of “the perishing of millions of souls” was the very reason that drove them to China, the faceless and nameless Chinese mass must have created a sense of breathlessness and helplessness on the part of the New Zealand missionaries. “Kwis” were young players facing a massive audience. Moreover, crowds in a strange land could induce intimidation. An undifferentiated mass was also dehumanising, capable of violence and savagery. It was common for an incited theatre audience to shout with acclamatory noise, to throw coins or cabbage onto the stage. Being foreign, missionaries were equally likely to excite a pack of strangers. In civil conflicts the Chinese people were usually described as a crowd, if not a mob. Being a singular observer, a missionary giving an account of events inevitably implicitly implies that the narrator was a cultivated beholder and his/her audience belonged to a weaker race in need of a master.

The Chinese mass was often depicted as a homogenous mass. Westerners’ inabilities to differentiate between Asian peoples became a justification for discriminative practice. The very excuse for New Zealand custom to practice thumb-printing for Chinese immigrants was that “all Chinese looked the same”. This was the same reason that the police opposed bail for the 32 Chinese who were arrested at a Chinese gambling den in Christchurch in June 1899. European readings of Chinese expressions were often “no expression”. Don tells of one occasion when he escorted an educated Chinese, just arrived from China, along Elizabeth St. in Melbourne, and looked in vain for signs or words of surprise or admiration. Don thus took it as

---

114 The population for the city areas alone was 81,712 for Auckland and 88,920 for Wellington (Census of New Zealand, 1921).
arrogance and ignorance of things outside of China.\textsuperscript{115}

To missionary observers, idolatry would be another outstanding feature of the Chinese heathens, a feature that they were obliged to report to their home church and to justify their existence in China. To contrast the pagan front-stage with the more imaged-than-real Christianised back-stage brought New Zealanders a sense of pride. In such descriptions, the Chinese appeared as puppets, robots, machines, statues, or automata, unable to give rational account of their ritual action. Being a newcomer who could perceive no rationality of Oriental spirituality, it was too easy to think there was none. Furthermore, images of opium addiction and other social vices resonated with the dominant image of Chinese religious life: dark, grimy, dim, dusty, shabby, fading away in the gloom of the shrine, faces devoid of expression, helpless, wailing, sad, hopeless, lazy, unbelieving and indifferent.

It took a very small step to infer that a nation of idolatry was also a nation of deception. According to Goffman, the notion of people “acting” themselves out upon a stage forms the impression of falsity of human action as founded on pretense or even deceit applies to everyone as a universal schema. Likewise, Reinders observes that the missionary narrative presented to readers in the English world was “a view of China as a place where much of the culture was a matter of appearance, and all appearances were deceiving.” He adds that “Chinese ritual was presented as a kind of absurd theater, in which ‘a nation of actors’ engaged in stylized fictions full of sound and fury but signifying nothing”.\textsuperscript{116} The distinction between Chinese in ordinary clothing and Chinese actors/actresses in costume meant little to missionaries who first encountered the Oriental world. To them, China was one big act, one great fictional performance, contrasted with the rigidity or solidity of Western Christians. The Chinese creative faculty was considered most apparent in


\textsuperscript{116} Reinders, Borrowed Gods and Foreign Bodies, 96.
the arts of deception, and the Chinese people were thought to tell polite lies disguised by rituals of acceptance and courtesy.\textsuperscript{117}

Being the very first New Zealander who travelled to China to study the language, Alexander Don’s writing was influential in forming Southland New Zealanders’ perception of the Chinese people. His visits to South China and his ministry among the Chinese miners gave him the authority to conclude that “The Chinese suspects, and expects to be suspected. So he is very careful in avoiding doing what might be misconstrued, and will often not do at all what a European will do unhesitatingly.”\textsuperscript{118}

Quoting Don, Jean McNeur, with the authority as a missionary daughter who had grown up in South China, added the following comments: “The mutual trust between Chinese and Europeans is so much the more remarkable when compared with the lack of confidence between the Chinese themselves in their own land”.\textsuperscript{119}

Coming from the “gendered culture” described in Chapter II, it was only too natural for New Zealanders to pick up the feminised discourse, closely linked with idolatry and sometimes with Catholicism, of the Chinese nation. According to Reinders, the ethos of Victorian missionaries was strongly influenced by the notion of Christian Manliness, or that of “Muscular Christianity”, a broad-based cultural movement in the late 19\textsuperscript{th} Century\textsuperscript{120} which “associated physical strength with spiritual strength, vigorous activity with religious certainty, and masculinity with Protestantism”.\textsuperscript{121}

Both the Chinese front-stage and Aotearoa back-stage were set against the British colonial backdrop, putting on a dramatic show in which the dominant West was busy using its physical (including industrial, material and military) strength to subdue the

\textsuperscript{117} Ibid., 89-90.
\textsuperscript{119} McNeur, “The Chinese in New Zealand,” 43.
\textsuperscript{120} Reinders lists the movement against Anglo-Catholicism, the overlapping phenomena of the Christian manliness and rational recreation movements, the rise of mass participation in sports, the expansion of the Empire, the adulation of the soldier as components of this movement (Reinders, \textit{Borrowed Gods and Foreign Bodies}, 59).
\textsuperscript{121} Reinders, \textit{Borrowed Gods and Foreign Bodies}, 57.
“weaker” peoples of Maori and Chinese. A well-known example would be the Cambridge Seven of the CIM who arrived in China in the mid-1880s. The roll-call of these Cambridge men sounds like a caricatured list of athletes, including the Royal Artillery and Dragoon Guards, the Old Reptonian Prayer Union, English test cricket and the Trinity College and University Boat Clubs.\textsuperscript{122} In such a political context, “a fetishization of the robust” became “a spiritual justification of conquest”.\textsuperscript{123} In this discursive framework, “the ‘adult males’ had their ages reduced, their gender changed, and their religious and civil rituals were regarded as child’s play. Rhetorically, Chinese men become girls. The symbolic feminisation of the idolater has a long history in anti-Catholic polemics and in descriptions of worshipping Chinese…”\textsuperscript{124}

In the section entitled “Love and Affection” in \textit{Standing in the Sunshine}, published in 1993 to mark the centenary of women’s suffrage in New Zealand, the award-winning journalist specialised in women’s issues, Sandra Coney, mistakenly uses a portrait of Alexander Don and his Chinese teacher at Shameen\textsuperscript{125} as a portrait of George McNeur and his Chinese wife!\textsuperscript{126} Rather than an isolated error, Coney’s interpretation reflects a general misperception of gender characteristics of Chinese on the part of New Zealanders. The ponytail, soft shoes made of fabric, heavily embroidered silks of Chinese men, especially men of status, look indeed very feminine in the eyes of his western beholders.

Though national images are usually male-defined, to skip the gender discourse is to leave only an incomplete picture. In addition to the general feminisation of the

\textsuperscript{123} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{124} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{125} Hocken Library, Uare Taoka o Hakena, University of Otago, Dunedin, neg. 01361.
Chinese nation, certain features of Chinese women were often highlighted in missionary literature. If Chinese men were described as womanish, what could be expected of Chinese women? Apart from the key topics such as bound feet, concubinage, enclosed life, child bride, and illiteracy, missionaries often regarded Chinese women as more inclined to idolatry than men, just as, in a more positive sense, women were considered more naturally inclined to piety.

Ironically, it was the particular social conditions of oriental women (including Arabic, Chinese and Indian women in the near and far east), as opposed to tribal or “barbarian” women in the Africa and Oceania fields, that opened the way for western women to enter the missionary career. Oriental women did not only make up half of the population, they also took care of the younger generation. Because of sexual segregation, the world of Chinese women and children’s was largely impenetrable by men, let alone western men. Without women colleagues, missionary men could only reach adult men and had little hope that the Christian faith would pass onto the next generation. When the “women’s sphere” gradually disappeared in Asian countries as a result of modernisation and urbanisation in the post-WII era, women’s role in mission also faced a fundamental challenge.

New Zealanders’ perception of the Chinese says as much, if not more, about the missionaries themselves as about their host people. As Reinders speculates, “the supposed Chinese obsession with their bodies was in fact an effect of the missionaries’ consciousness of their own bodies than those of the Chinese, a consciousness heightened by the discomforts of being foreign”. Goffman’s two-sided view of human interaction stipulates that the actor/actress is an audience for his/her viewer’s play. Thus the next question of analytical value is “what was the host country’s perception of New Zealanders before they arrived?”

127 Reinders, Borrowed Gods and Foreign Bodies, 62.
3.6. China’s Earliest Awareness of New Zealand

Yuen William Tai goes through a long list of Chinese and English literature to reconstruct the Chinese awareness of Aotearoa New Zealand prior to 1911, the year of the birth of the Republican China. According to Tai, the *Complete World Map* (《坤舆全图》) made by the Jesuit missionary Ferdinand Verbiest (南怀仁) for Emperor Kangxi of the Qing Dynasty, incorporated Rumold Mercator’s world map of 1587, Johannes Bleau’s world map of 1648 and 1660, and Matthew Seutter’s world map of the 17th Century. While displaying the influence of Chinese cartography, it was the first map in the Chinese language showing the two territories of Australia (Hollandia Nova, 新阿兰地亚) and New Zealand (Zeelandia Nova, 新瑟兰第亚). It was also the first map in the world showing the insularity of New Zealand, and the approximate correct size of New Zealand in proportion to Australia.\(^\text{128}\) The first generation of Protestant missionaries in China also introduced some general knowledge about New Zealand in both English and Chinese publications. Between 1860-1911, no less than 300 pieces of information on or relevant to New Zealand published in the *China Mail*, the *Hong Kong Daily Press* and the *Hong Kong Telegraph*, including reports reproduced from *New Zealand Herald, Christchurch Review, Otago Daily Times, Southern Cross, Taranaki Herald, Tuapeka Times*.\(^\text{129}\) By 1911, New Zealand had no less than 36 names in Chinese.\(^\text{130}\) Nonetheless, the proliferation of names was a sign of confusion or neglect, rather than one of attention.

Chinese tradesmen might remember the Australasian sealskin carried by American


\(^{129}\) Ibid., 26-27.

\(^{130}\) They are: 新西兰, 新锡兰, 新瑟兰第亚, 新锡兰, 新塞兰, 新来得, 新基兰, 新瑟兰, 新西兰, 新西兰士, 新寨兰地; 纽西兰, 纽西阑, 纽丝伦, 纽思兰, 纽齐兰, 纽芝兰, 捷日伦, 捷日伦, 鸟诗伦, 鸟司伦, 纽诗伦, 纽西兰, 纽裁伦, 牛齐兰, 牛席阑, 牛锡兰, 牛西兰, 纽呼西伦, 纽约诗伦, 纽西伦, 鸟施伦, 纽斯兰, 鸟矢伦, 鸟丝伦 (Tai, *The Origins of China’s Awareness of New Zealand*, 31)
ships\textsuperscript{131} and consigned by the British East India Co. in the late 18\textsuperscript{th} Century, the decline of Chinese tea trade as a result of the rising of more competitive products such as India and Ceylon tea, and the “commercial flag” of New Zealand\textsuperscript{132} that appeared in Chinese waters during 1860s and 1870s, and perhaps the port city offices of the South British Insurance Company and the New Zealand Insurance Company. Trading with China was “the forerunner of a trade that established sealskins as New Zealand’s first export commodity”.\textsuperscript{133} The most startling fact to a modern New Zealander might perhaps be the high level of Chinese imports in the late 19\textsuperscript{th} Century, largely initiated by Chinese immigrants.\textsuperscript{134} When the first trade returns were published in 1859, China (£4925) was New Zealand’s largest “foreign” market in terms of export value, followed by Peru (£3451) and South sea islands (£676), while the value of exports with America was as little as £13.\textsuperscript{135}

Another group of people who had had a long-term interest in things New Zealand were the families and countrymen of New Zealand-bound gold-miners from the vicinity of Canton. Compared with missionary letters home, the information fed

\textsuperscript{131} American ships alone have taken 2.5 million skins to Canton between 1792 and 1812 (Lindsay Watt, \textit{New Zealand and China towards 2000} (Wellington N.Z., Institute of Policy Studies, 1992), 23).

\textsuperscript{132} According to Tai, this flag derived from the flag of the United Tribes of New Zealand (1835-1840), chosen in March 1834 by 25 Maori chiefs from 3 flag designs arranged by James Busby. It served as the national flag until the signing of the Treaty of Waitangi. It was adopted as the house flag of Shaw Savill & Company, an English shipping company formed in 1858, with only minor modifications. It featured a red St. George’s cross on a white backdrop and four six-pointed white stars over a smaller St. George’s cross in red against a blue field on the upper left quadrangle. Shaw Savill ships started to sail from New Zealand to London via Shanghai, Fuzhou or HK from 1859. The six ships took such routes were \textit{Eastern Chief, Cananoque, Portland, Surat, Capitolani, Violet} in 1864 (Tai, \textit{The Origins of China's Awareness of New Zealand}, 105-107).


\textsuperscript{135} Ibid: 98.
back by the miner emigrants to their family tended to be fragmentary, sketchy and often matter-of-fact, as most had to convey messages through a scribe or a shopkeeper, and at a price. Before the start of the Imperial China Post services in 1896, postal services between China and the rest of the world were conducted through British, American, French and Japanese postal agencies at the treaty ports. The postal services of the British Colony of Hong Kong, starting from 1863 by *Messageries Imperiales* steamers, was another favoured channel of mail correspondence for Chinese miners in Australasia. In 1866, letters from Hong Kong to Otago and Southland numbered 502 and 32 respectively. Messengers were another channel of exchanging remittances and letters. For example, Alexander Don brought 522 letters from Canton to Otago after his trip to China in 1897-1898. Between 1871 and 1911, a total of nearly 9,500 Chinese or about an average of 226 Chinese per year departed from New Zealand, most presumably to return to China. Nonetheless, hardly any of these written records have survived the ravages of time; any speculation would have to take into account the anti-Chinese sentiments during the era and the consequences borne by the Chinese community.

Diplomatic perceptions of New Zealand, on the part of Chinese authorities, were also very thin. Nonetheless, Chinese diplomatic personnel visited New Zealand many years before New Zealand envoys arrived in China. The Chinese envoy Huang Houcheng (黄厚成) visited New Zealand as early as 1906 but the Qing Empire did not send any diplomatic representative to Australasia until 1908. The ones who came to New Zealand were Huang Rongliang (黄荣良)(1908.5-1911.5), Xia Tingxian (夏

---

In summary, the Chinese awareness of New Zealand was filtered through four sources: geographers, emigrants, merchants, and diplomats. Each group had its own viewpoint as well as blind spots. The knowledge they produced about New Zealand was, even at its best, selective, incomplete, lagged, and lacking in details than those provided by missionaries about China. Chinese in general had little awareness or even interest in New Zealand. It was not only because of its remoteness and smallness, but also, ironically, because it had never claimed any privilege or territory from China. Tai is quite right to point out that New Zealanders in the Middle Kingdom were perceived and defined by what they were not as much as by what they were. That is to say, they were not seen as gunboat commanders, opium traders, or diplomats demanding concessions and extraterritoriality. Tai’s conviction is endorsed by commentators who were contemporaries of the China missionaries.

After Arnolis Hayman was released by the Red Army, a journalist reported:

> The Reds believed New Zealand to be a British Colony, and all New Zealanders to be sufferers under English oppression. The English they hated as being the world’s worst imperialists, and Mr. Hayman they regarded more as a victim of imperialism than as an active imperialist himself.

In the theatre of world evangelism, there have been many “foreign fields” providing “front-stages” for missionary performers prepared by the “back-stages” of many “home-bases”. On the one hand, the China field hosted missionaries who had sailed

---

140 National Palace Museum Archive Department 故宫博物院明清档案部 and History Department of the Fujian Normal University 福建师范大学历史系, eds., *Qingji zhongwai shiling biao* [Chinese and Foreign Ambassadorial and Consular Personnel in Late Qing], (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju 中华书局, 1985), 82-83.


from various places of Christendom, including the British Isles, the European Continent, North America, and Australasia. On the other hand, China was but one of many “foreign fields”, including also India and the Solomon Islands, for the numerous mission-minded Protestants at the back-stage of New Zealand. Each “mission field” and “home-base” intersected in the embodiment of missionary personnel. After all, a stage only becomes real when there are actors and audience. Without an active audience and the dynamic of the actor-audience interaction, the front-stage differs little from the back-stage as a place for rehearsal. In this sense, the story of New Zealand missionary in China should be seen as one of many concurrent shows performed in the global theatre. Would the “Kiwi” actors and actresses meet the expectation of the Chinese audience? Would the Chinese they met invoke any familiarity of strangeness? What would the missionaries describe, upon arrival, in their first letters home? How were they going to perform alongside missionaries from other “home-bases”, also in a state of impression management? Would they become an entirely different person, or even play cross-gender roles, on the stage? These are the questions that the next chapter is going to address. The West, embodied in a particular cohort from the “down-under” world of the West, was going to meet the East.
Chapter IV: In the Arena – “Kiwis” in the Middle Kingdom

Operatic acting is a highly regulated and stylised form of play. Opera actors and actresses in China usually start their training from a very young age. My Aunt was sent to an opera circus at the age of eight for the first time. Since these young teenagers would soon become the centre of attention on the stage, they needed to look good and sound nice to the eyes and ears of the audience from all possible angles. In order to achieve this, they had to go through a whole process of resocialisation which could last for three years, especially in cross-gender role characters. The symbolism of operatic-acting demands from its role-players a new way of talking (to sound more womanly, more manly or more elderly), a new way of walking (to mimic steps of bound feet or horse-riding), and a new way of expressing joy or sorrow. Over time, the internalisation of these rhythmical movements and stylised voices often leave marks in the person of the actors/actresses. They no longer look and sound ordinary and their disciplined bodies often give them away even in the midst of crowds. Western missionaries in China more or less had to go through the same process of resocialisation, especially in missions such as the CIM which closely identified with the indigenous lifestyle. Whether they liked it or not, they became the centre of attention whenever they appeared in a Chinese street, even when they were in Chinese dress. They had to learn to speak and write a new language, to walk in native clothing, to eat local food with chopsticks, to behave appropriately according to Chinese perception, and to travel in primitive transports. It was also about adapting the body to make skillful movements. The world of acting and the world of preaching begin to meet in the process of “bodily discipline”.

American literary theorist and philosopher Kenneth Burke\(^1\) unfolds his argument at

\(^1\) Kenneth Burke (1897 – 1993) had a lifelong interpreter of Shakespeare. His primary
the very outset of his *Grammar of Motives* as such: “Using ‘scene’ in the sense of setting, or background, and ‘act’ in the sense of action, one could say that ‘the scene contains the act’. By using ‘agents’ in the sense of actors, or actresses, one could say that ‘the scene contains the agents’. It is a principle of drama that the nature of the acts and agents should be consistent with the nature of the scene.”\(^2\) As per the narration in Chapter II and Chapter III, it is easy to see that the scenes of the New Zealand setting and the setting of China were dramatically different. It was “dramatic” in two senses: in an ordinary sense, it simply meant that the difference was radical; in Goffman’s style of argument, it meant that New Zealand and Chinese society had different rules governing the presentation of self in everyday life. Throughout the process of resocialisation in the mission field of China, the original selfhood a missionary felt that he or she was born with seems to cede more of its meanings and significance to its dealings with the new audience and with the physical, mental, and social settings in which it finds itself. The socially available self, the self that is “in play” with the everyday relationships in the temporal-spacial context of its era, is thus subject to change. This chapter is mainly concerned with the process of such change and its social consequences on New Zealand missionaries in China. Given the lack of cross-cultural awareness training at the time, this process had never been easy. Instead of going through the usual history records of mission achievements and failures, this research takes on an angle of “history from below”. In a paradoxical sense, I also invites readers to become “exiles from the familiar”, using a mirror of metaphors and analogues, and at the same time, to engage in a dialogue with the actors of the distance past as a critically aware theatre audience.

**4.1. Adoption of Chinese Names**

Name change has a social and religious significance for Christians, dating from

---

biblical times. All Jesuit missionaries adopted Chinese names while Chinese converts adopted Latin names. In the Protestant circle, the CIM was probably the most consistent and professional in giving each of their members a proper Chinese name. The other societies were much more casual and sporadic. There is something very sociological in the way the missionaries chose their new names: to signify the appropriate femininity and masculinity in a new culture, to connote the Christian message, to show appreciation of the Chinese civilisation, and to some extent to retain some elements (often just the sound) of their English names. Renaming oneself is a ritual of re-socialisation. The new native name is the symbol of a new identity, and of the identification with the local culture for New Zealand missionaries.

Being called by a new name was also one of the very first things that a China missionary must adjust to. It was a ritual for opera actors/actresses to adopt a stage name to hide clan identity so they could be one person to the audience and another to the family. Having two names, the missionaries became one person to the Chinese and another to the mission community or the home churches. Moreover, each name only had relevance in its own linguistic context. Most children that I interviewed cannot remember their parents’ full Chinese names and most Chinese churches do not have records of the correct English names of the missionaries stationed there.

The titles they received in China were also worth scrutiny. Men, except doctors, were almost universally called “pastors” in Chinese, regardless of their ordination status. Women, even with the same qualifications as men, were called teacher or other family titles, guniang (Miss), a-zi (older sister), koo (Aunt) or shimu (pastor’s wife) for wives. Such discrepancies were a reflection of gender inequality in both New Zealand and China society.

3 Old Testament examples include the event of God renaming Jacob Israel, New Testament examples include the event that Saul was renamed Paul.
4.2. Language Learning

Missionary was a category of people whose primary reason for coming to China was to speak. The sense of the language as a barrier to preaching must have assumed existential significance. Chinese is a language that is notoriously difficult for westerners to learn and thus was considered a specialist skill reserved for sinologists. Each mission society had a different language training system and thus their members mastered the language/dialect to varying degrees. The usual course of study was set to be two years. The PCNZ assigned three years for language study. Only those who were fluent in conversing would function well in the host society, and communicate the message more effectively. Given what language does to mentality, it was usually those who could speak differently would be able to think differently and see things differently. Ng casts doubts on Alexander Don’s competence in the Cantonese dialect, yet he was the only person to instruct on Chinese language and culture in the PWTI from 1904.

New arrivals of missionaries had to begin with “foreigner talk” – the kind of speech that simplified their own languages and borrowed fragments of the local language, loud repetition, the loss of prepositions, tenses and plurals – or “English Pidgin Chinese” – the rude, distorted and horrible sounds of Westerners speaking Chinese. According to E. H. Parker, a Victorian specialist on Chinese dialects, foreigners in China could not speak Chinese as well as they thought they could and tended to be dismissive of efforts to learn it properly. Even sinologists of reputation might declare the tones to be a myth, the aspirates to be useless etc. Thus, the general knowledge of

---

4 Constitution of the Canton Village Million of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, (1910?), 4.
colloquial Chinese as mastered by an average missionary could be very superficial. The learning process humbled New Zealanders, who might have thought Chinese immigrants’ English to be substandard.\(^8\)

If there is anything calculated to take the last ounce of pride out of one, it is to stand up and try to address an audience in a foreign tongue. It is a good thing the Chinese are a patient, polite race. They seldom laugh outright, though sometimes we detect, or fancy we do, a suppressed smile.\(^9\)

On the other hand, coastal Chinese in Canton and Shanghai had developed Chinese Pidgin English (CPE). CPE was not good English, but neither was it bad English. The ambiguities of CPE meant that many New Zealanders had the subjective experience of hearing degenerate, primitive, or childish speech from the mouths of some adult Chinese. The experience of hearing “bad English” constantly might have predisposed New Zealanders to think of Chinese as not only speaking pidgin but also thinking pidgin. Missionaries in China might also have been more conscious of the bad English they heard than the bad Chinese they spoke. Literal translation of proper Chinese sometimes would sound improper according to English grammatical rules. In her novel based on first-hand missionary experience in China, A. M. D. Dinneen’s attempt to capture the authenticity of Chinese etiquette simultaneously created an impression of substandardness:

\(^8\) It was very common for cartoonists to mock Chinese accent and grammar. For example, John H. Gee (John Gilmour)’s 1924 cartoon entitled "Our League of Nations: If Dr. Nansen had his way?" gave a "John Ah Hung, from Canton" his line of speech as "Come along, my flen, welly many welcome! Welly nicee country this; getee lich topside welly quick!" (New Zealand Free Lance, September 17, 1924, C-27822-1/2, Alexander Turnbull Library, reprinted in Manying Ip and Nigel Murphy, Aliens at My Table: Asians as New Zealanders See Them (Auckland, N.Z.: Penguin, 2005), 61). Mission literature was no exception. In the cartoon strips about a Chinese orphan girl, who in real life spoke Cantonese only, adopted this speech: “Thankee, Mr. Pleecieman velly velly muchee.” (“The story of ‘Bo-Gum’”, The Reaper (NZABM) (May 22, 1931): 5)

Chinese proficiency was a crucial element in determining seniority, especially in the CIM system with its emphasis on indigenous policy. The PCNZ required new missionaries to master 500 characters during their first year and 2000 by the end of their second year. Given the high level of illiteracy in imperial and republican China, once missionaries were acquainted with the written characters, they duly appeared to the Chinese as true teachers. It is thus not so bewildering to think of the situation where the foreign missionaries mastered Chinese as their second language and taught Chinese village people to read the Bible in their own language. The CIM required a probationer to spend an average minimum of 60 to 75 hours a month in language study. A probationer could only be recognised as a junior missionary when he or she passed two language exams. Furthermore, a junior became a senior when they passed all of the six sections of the prescribed course. However, there was a gender variation in the language requirement. Based on the 1891 edition of the Principle and Practice, Brotchie concludes that “a systematic form of discrimination was built into CIM advancement arrangements” in which men were required to

---

10 Alice Maud Dalton Dinneen, Not of Gennesareth: Romance and Adventure in China (Dunedin, N.Z.: A. H. Reed, 1933), 49, 53.
13 Phillip Brotchie, “The Importance of the Contribution of Australians to the Penetration of China by the China Inland Mission 1888-1953” (Ph.D. Thesis, Deakin University, 1999),
obtain more thorough knowledge in the Chinese language, geography, and history within a shorter timeframe than their women colleagues.\textsuperscript{14} Even when women exhibited language facility, the implicit priority of men’s careers insured that husbands often ultimately surpassed wives in language learning. Moreover, men were also given the opportunity to study administrative aspects of mission organisation. This should be no surprise for an era when it was generally believed that serious learning was more difficult for women or even harmful to their physical and mental health.\textsuperscript{15} In 1900, the China Council cited the inability to keep up language study due to “frequent headaches, etc., indicating, apparently, a lack of mental capacity or brain power” as a specific problem for women missionaries.\textsuperscript{16} However, women as a group might be better gifted for second language learning. Chinese characters, with their pictorial representation, could also be more appealing for women. These differences in the design of a training curriculum seemed to suggest that women were trained for a different kind of work from that of men, that is, “work among the Chinese women” (who were often illiterate anyway) with all the condescension the term implied of a lower position while men were prepared for supervisory, or even superintendent, responsibilities.

4.3. Everyday Life of a China Missionary

One of the prevailing practices of the opera trade in my Aunt’s early days was the simultaneous presence of both acting staff and logistic staff on the stage. Alongside


\textsuperscript{15} The CIM was not alone in its belief in weaker female brain-power in the 19th Century. When one of the very first English woman missionary candidates designated for the China field “showed signs of insanity”, the LMS board attributed the mental disturbance with Chinese language study (E. Aldersey White, *A Woman Pioneer in China. The Life of Mary Ann Aldersey* (London, Livingstone Press, 1932), 11-12).

\textsuperscript{14} For example, men were to learn the Sacred Edict in Mandarin in the course of the first three sections while women were given five sections to master it, men were required to write the characters of Chinese geographical names while women were only required to write it in Romanised Mandarin (Brotchie, “The Importance of the Contribution of Australians,” 153-155).
actors/actresses in their full costumes playing the story, there would also be sidemen sitting on the stage, playing their instruments in their everyday clothing; props men came and went to remove props and rearrange the scene; or even servants came and went to serve tea to their masters (usually the leading actors/actresses), who, by the design of the plot, might have a servant, in full costume and on the same stage, carrying out another business. The servants might come to serve tea to their master actor/actress who was playing a role of a prisoner who could never afford a servant in the plot, or was supposedly being interned alone under the eyes of jailers. The convention of the Chinese opera has developed to allow the real plays to overlap with the unreal, and the audience would have little difficulty differentiating the two. Every foreign missionary in China would have, to varying degrees, made some effort to become useful in their front-stage roles. Some could even pass for an ordinary Chinese and be well accepted by the local community as one of them. At the same time, missionaries often clung to objects or practices that were common features of their back-stage life to maintain a sense of cultural identity. Sometimes these odd objects would slip onto the front-stage and appeared “out of place”, giving away the true identity of the owners. It could be simply be odd combinations of eating Chinese bean curds with forks and knives, or playing cricket in Chinese scholar’s gowns. How did the missionary players live with these discordances and how did the Chinese audience interpret them?

To the Chinese, everyday life is about clothing, eating, living and moving (yi-shi-zhu-xing/衣食住行). The following discussions about missionary life will accord the same sequence of the four aspects.

### 4.3.1. Yi (衣) - Clothing

The sociology of dress is more “dramatic” than all the other three aspects because

---

There seems to be a resurgence of this practice in contemporary Chinese opera performance to restore a sense of traditionalism.
performing art has more to do with physical appearance. From womb to tomb, the body is a dressed body. A dressed body is a cultural phenomenon that is defined geographically, historically and sexually. When one undresses the western outfit and puts on the Chinese clothing, it opens many possibilities of interpretations.

Here, the CIM’s policy of identification with Chinese lifestyle again required all frontier missionaries to adopt local clothing. It was an outrageous decision for Hudson Taylor to enforce Chinese dress in the 1860s, for both male and female missionaries. Missionaries, while in the field, were, by definition, foreign. It had been a common problem that the conspicuous foreign body of missionaries interfered with their missions. The “Taylor-made” solution was that if missionaries could not change physical skin, at least they could replace social skins. However, there had also been a certain fear of the “Anglo-Saxon race” going “native” in an era dominated by the colonial conquering of “Others”. The act of being clothed in native dress was the most visible sign of this state. In dramaturgical terms, opera usually depicts an ancient story and the fancy costume worn by actors/actresses was one of the enchantments which attracted the audience. When opera depicted a modern story with contemporary clothing, the story became somehow disenchanted. The paradox lies wherein a missionary would adopt Chinese dress, he/she lost the image of foreignness to the Chinese beholder but simultaneously created a sense of exoticism to their audience back home. Photographs depicting missionaries in Chinese clothing look both exotic and at home. It can also be said that dress simultaneously includes and excludes. For a foreigner to remain in foreign clothes was to distance himself/herself from the Chinese neighbour. The opposite was also true, for a westerner to adopt the Chinese cloth is to cut himself/herself from the expat community.

Few realised that to adopt Chinese clothing was not only a cross-cultural act, but also a cross-gender act. To the eyes of Victorian Englishmen, the dress-like gown
and long queue of the Chinese males of the Qing dynasty was a deformity insofar as it conveyed feminine features. In the long history of the Chinese context, however, the very same gown and queue were symbols of masculinity and the barbarianism of Northern Tartars. On the other hand, for people from a culture where skirts were inseparable from femininity, and were the chief item of distinction between male and female, to adopt the full trousers and long coat of Chinese women, was to look distastefully manly. Protestant missionaries had good reason to disapprove of the blurring of gender distinctions. Ironically, with the most conservative theology, the CIM missionaries became a group of “trousered women” and “skirted men” in the eyes of the Victorian expats of “trouseried men” and “skirted women”. During the period of the New Women (1870-1930) in America, there had been debates about clothing reform, particularly the possibility of women wearing trousers or bloomers. Since trousers were the symbol of the male and male domination, the proposal that women should adopt them was seen as a threat to the whole structure of society. During the female franchise movement in New Zealand, trousers were also associated with unwomanly character. In a cartoon that lampooned the suffragists, Sir John Hall is presenting trousers to a grateful woman, while a row of men holding babies watches a parade of grim-faced women with an equal rights banner.

Though male members of the CIM who came to China after 1911 were no longer required by the mission management to wear a queue since the Chinese were cutting off theirs, and the distinctions between Chinese dress and western dress became less

20 John Hall (1824-1907), appointed the Premier of New Zealand on October 8, 1879. He carried out reforms of the male suffrage while in office. Hall also took an active interest in women’s rights and moved the Parliamentary Bill to extend the voting rights to women in 1893.
controversial, the social meaning of skirts and trousers remained an issue, with its lingering effect into the 1960s. One of the informants recalled a conversation with her mother:

When I was talking to Mum about whether she minded me wearing slacks when I was 20 – you still couldn’t wear them in the Bible College – She said, “No. I had to wear trousers when I was in China.” She never wore trousers probably until she went there. But it was acceptable there. So she’d definitely worn Chinese dress.22

The social meanings of dress were different for men and for women. Generally speaking, the dress of men was to meet the demands of practical efficiency and of the economic activities of his life.23 Therefore, change of dress for missionary men could be rationalised as being instrumental to the demand of his vocation when he was on missionary duty. In other words, the Chinese dress was to a missionary man what military gear was to a soldier. The dramatic analogue became “real” when the word “costume” is used to describe Chinese or tribal clothing. Native clothing was used not just as some sort of workplace uniform, for the missionaries often wore it when they were “on the stage”, be it a preaching trip in the field or a missionary exhibition or deputation meeting back home. The very same Chinese cloth served to create invisibility in the former setting while arousing attention in the later setting. In CIM albums, there are photos of missionaries of mixed clothing, a gathering of actors “on duty” and “off duty”.

For male missionaries to adopt Chinese dress was controversial largely among the men, but for western women adopting Chinese dress produced situations where they had to face objections from both men and women. The dress of women is primarily concerned with the motif of sex. British woman, even those from the colony, had to

---

be in a kind of dress which emphasised in a thousand subtle ways the fact that she was female in order to preserve the muslin delicacy of the Empire. Even when she was on missionary duty as a wife or a spinster, a woman was still expected to replicate western domesticity by expressing peace and power in her attire. Unlike her male colleagues, to adapt native Chinese cloth was to fall short in this supposedly “womanly” attribute, to undress the corset and the skirt was to “de-sex” herself. Moreover, having heads uncovered with hats was not only aesthetically indiscreet, but also theologically questionable. However, accentuation of female curvature was an offence to the Chinese host. Compared with the comfortable Chinese clothing, western woman’s dress of the late 19th and early 20th century, characterised by bustles and corsets, limited both action and health, and materially interfering with their full human development.

When women missionaries appeared in sensible Chinese clothing, the Western expat circle took it as if it reflected on their inability to ensure their women to be in proper clothing.

Having lived in China longer than her husband, Mrs. Taylor warned that the decision to adopt Chinese dress, especially for women, should not be taken lightly. Not only because western women who dressed like Chinese women would be despised in the same way that Chinese women were despised by Chinese men, but also because western women who dressed like Chinese women must act like Chinese women, according to Chinese customs. It was not simply a matter of adopting their clothing, but of living their lives, in resonance with the change of outward appearance. A foreigner could be forgiven many discourtesies for simply being “foreign”, but one in Chinese dress could not. Furthermore, to move about in this

---

24 Up until mid-20th century, the social custom in most western countries required respectable women to cover their head, usually with a hat, at least in formal occasions or public spheres. There was also theological interpretation of 1 Corinthian verses 1-16 that links covering of the female head with female submission.

25 The discussion here is limited to clothing only. The researcher is fully aware of the detrimental physical and social effects of the custom of bound feet on Chinese women.

26 The first Mrs. Taylor was Maria Dyer. She came to China in 1852 at the age of 15 to teach in a mission school in Ningbo.

27 Valerie Griffiths, Not Less Than Everything: the Courageous Women Who Carried the
loose-fitting, clumsy-looking Chinese dress was no less a skill than to pick up bean curd with chopsticks. To master clothing was to have a differently disciplined body.

There were some restrictions on the CIM policy of indigenisation. Bound feet were certainly out of the question. Few missionary women would acknowledge that while they were trying to liberate Chinese women from bound feet, the loosely fitting Chinese dress had liberated them from the corset. The controversy about dress was largely a CIM issue; it probably never entered the mind of Alexander Don and George McNeur that they should do the same. They opted to retain western clothing to command respect. It is hard for us to determine whether it was a conscious choice of strategy or a mindless continuation of familiar practice. One of the advantages of appearing alien was the connotation of foreign power and civilisation. McNeur and some of his male colleagues wore a white suit in a number of photos. It was uncertain whether they ever used it as “duty uniform”. Preaching the “Word of Life” in the “Colour of Death” to the Chinese peasants of rural Canton was culturally out of place. But seeing their ordained clergy dressing in a Chinese gown would be just as demeaning to the home church.

In photographs of mixed nationalities that were aiming to portray images of unity and brotherhood/sisterhood, the PCNZ missionaries were often the only persons who stood out in western attire. While in South China, women missionaries still kept their Presbyterian deaconess dress code including dark blue serge, Norfolk bodice, plain skirt, linen cuffs and collar, or even the sailor hat. In later times, there would be some members of the Chinese elite, usually men, who appeared in western clothing. In the highly ritualised social act of the wedding, it was usual for Christian Chinese grooms and brides to adopt western suits and dress, the dress for a one-off show. In the first half of the 20th Century, modernisation overlapped with westernisation, in which the western became the norm, the standard, and the professional. For example,

Chinese medical staff in mission hospitals, Christian or not, adopted western style uniform, the dress for duty. A parallel trend was for some of the New Zealand missionaries to recognise the practicability of Chinese clothing. Jean Moore recalled a vivid picture in her memoir:

One evening in winter, when several guests were invited, the five Europeans wore long, Chinese-style silk-padded gowns while the three Chinese male guests wore European-style suits. I will leave the reader to guess who were the warmer?²⁸

The clothing issue brought a different controversy for pacifist missionaries. The war condition in China required every FAU member to wear a uniform while on duty in order to ensure Red Cross protection in the event of capture by the Japanese. Having paid a great personal cost for exemption from military service, the New Zealand team had to face the irony of being outfitted from the Army Store as a result of the New Zealand Red Cross Society technically becoming an auxiliary of the New Zealand Army Medical Service.²⁹ Even though the Khaki uniform prominently displayed a Red Cross badge, signifying their status as the first members of the newly created Joint Council of the Order of St. John and the New Zealand Red Cross Society, their self-consciousness was inevitably heightened when their bodily movements, so atypical of military bearing, attracted street attention in Wellington.³⁰

### 4.3.2. Shi (食) - Eating

Although the dynamics between diet and identity were less instant and “bodily” than that of dress, in the “history from below” school, dietary choices are not insignificant

²⁸ Moore, Daughter of China, 64.
³⁰ Ibid.,36.
social phenomena. Compared with the McDonaldisation of the world and the wide acceptance of ethnic cuisines in western countries today, and in an era in which cultural practices were so distinctive from one ethnic group to another, the slogan of “You are what you eat” might well be taken literally with a change of diet.

A 15th Century Dominican friar, Domingo Fernandez Navarrette, once said that the Chinese urine helped their crops grow whereas western urine killed plants. The Chinese diet is historically high in vegetable and carbohydrate content but low in protein. By contrast, the Western appetite for meat and dairy products, famously the English, was much greater and was conspicuous to the Chinese. The high protein in meat produces high nitrogen in urine, which makes for poor fertilisation. CIM’s policy of identification with the Chinese lifestyle required all frontier missionaries to adopt the local diet. It was a matter of missiological principle as well as that of logistical pragmatism. Nonetheless, New Zealanders, especially the women, were not passive recipients of Chinese cuisine. They might as a compromise cook with local ingredients using western methods. Items of back-stage cuisine would also occasionally slip into the front-stage. Even within the CIM system, it was observed that attempts to “live on Chinese food only” were recognised as having “resulted in loss of health and strength”, and thus “workers who go to live in the villages are strongly urged to take with them butter and milk”. “A decent cup of tea” was important to many, though probably not as essential as it was to English missionaries, while some even experimented with the making of ice-cream in the interior of China.

Those working in the CIM Shanghai Headquarters, the students and staff at Chefoo School, and the PCNZ missionaries living in the vicinity of Canton, regularly imported western foodstuffs to relieve the craving for their home cuisine. The need

31 Quoted in Reinders, Borrowed Gods and Foreign Bodies, 147.
33 Mrs. H. L. Taylor's diary, February 15 and 17, 1937, February 3 and 5, 1940.
to have butter and cheese in the compound was a legitimate excuse to maintain the same stipend level with the drop of exchange rates. “A cup of tea” was seen as “the ultimate panacea” throughout the British Empire. Jean Moore recalled the damaging effect of the deprivation of “real” dairy products to the expats community during World War II.

The Seventh Day Adventist Mission owned trucks which carried supplies from India along the Burma Road. In this way their food was augmented by certain delicacies such as cheese, sent in from the States. We had not seen real cheese since the beginning of the war, though we had attempted to make a kind of cheese from buffalo milk. On a picnic one day a young Adventist missionary was happily chewing his cheese sandwiches, as he ate, envious eyes followed each movement of his jaws. When he finished, one of our number said wistfully, “Do let me smell your breath.”

Reinders suggests that both Chinese and westerners associate meat and milk with Christianity, the West, modernity, virility, and with healthiness. Moreover, when milk-powder and tinned-ham began to signify higher status for Chinese elites who were in the contact zone with westerners, the social meaning of food became entangled in all race, class, and gender aspects: Westerners, the rich, and men ate more meat and dairy products than the Chinese, the poor and women. However, back in New Zealand, the pauperisation of the Chinese was interpreted as a threat of economic competition: they lived on the smell of an oily rag or the smell of someone

---

34 For example, in one letter explaining the implications of exchange fluctuations, the correspondent mentions that the purchasing power of a missionary’s salary was largely affected by the cost of imported foodstuffs such as milk, butter, cheese etc. (Davies to Budd, December 19, 1936, MCI&OC: CVM Council, 1935-1938, AA6/5, PCNZ Archive).
35 Moore, Daughter of China, 89.
36 Ibid., 66-67.
37 Reinders, Borrowed Gods and Foreign Bodies, 168.
else’s dinner.\textsuperscript{38}

A biospatial or biotutelary explanation for the territory of body odour would imply that most nations have an odour which is peculiar to them. The Chinese hosts tended to believe that the Westerners had a distinctive odour as a result of their diet. Descriptions of physical smell have normally flown below the historiographic radar. However, references to bodily odour, though considered in bad taste, were frequently made in missionary correspondence. Recalling his time in North China as a missionary child, the humiliation received as a “smelly foreigner” remained vivid to John Sturt:

In spite of eating and dressing like Chinese we were obviously foreigners. ... Chinese gentlemen walking past would put their noses inside the large sleeve of their coat because they claimed we had an unpleasant smell. This was attributed to eating mutton, whereas they ate beef or pork. I don’t know how true that was — their gesture may just have been a more subtle way of offering an insult. For our part, we were certainly aware of the odour of many unwashed bodies around us in a crowd.\textsuperscript{39}

\textbf{4.3.3. Zhu (住) - Living}

Brotchie asks a series of questions on the social function of the mission compound which are worth quoting in length:

Was it a fortress which insulated the Westerners from contact with

\textsuperscript{38} The later expression was the title of Ellis’ (Tom Glover) cartoon published in \textit{New Zealand Free Lance}, August 9, 1922, N-P966-FRONT, Alexander Turnbull Library, Wellington, reprinted in Ip and Murphy, \textit{Aliens at My Table}, 121.

the Chinese except on their own terms? Was it a sanctuary to be used by all, Chinese and Westerners alike, in terms of civil and international strife? Was it a sanatorium where Chinese Christians and Westerners could find rest and recuperation in terms of illness and stress? Was it a beach-head for invaders of a foreign land? …How well did it function as a half-way house between the Mission and the alien culture in which it had placed itself? To what extent was it open, and to what extent closed?40

Brotchie’s singular answer to his own questions is that “it was all of those things at different times”.41 While its initial role was as “a bulwark against Chinese antagonism” and as a “deterrent” to petty thieves or burglaries,42 it became a neutral space between rivaling Chinese military forces, “an asylum” during the first half of the Sino-Japan War,43 and in the CVM case, the site of house arrest for its owners during the Pacific War.

Mission compounds varied in size and style, but were usually self-contained with a household, a chapel, a school and/or a clinic. The CIM stations and substations in inland towns and villages were usually small unmodified Chinese residences, whereas their purpose-built headquarters in Shanghai, the woman’s language school in Yangzhou, the mission children’s school in Chefoo, and a small number of mission hospitals, were built with large western style architecture. Compound experience changed missionary life as it changed Chinese social life. With its rigorous recruitment campaign, the CIM headquarters and language schools had seen a constant flow of young men and women arriving from all corners of Christendom.

41 Ibid., 412.
42 Ibid., 414.
Leaving a world of immigrants and settlers, coming to an inter-denominational, inter-national, and inter-lingual mission, New Zealanders were entering one melting pot from another. Since nearly all new recruits were unmarried on arriving in China, they were sent to the woman’s school in Yangzhou (扬州) and the men’s school in Anqing (安庆) respectively. When Britons left settled society and entered the frontier world of tents and huts, it became increasingly difficult to maintain symbols of class distinction. Likewise, when Church workers left the Christendom of their homelands and entered the mission field, comradeship begun to overwrite ordination status, especially in mission societies growing out of the lay movements. Phillips notes that telling yarns was a way of establishing new social bonds and loyalties in frontier communities.⁴⁴ Likewise, it was a common practice for new “reinforcements” to share testimonies. Since CIM missionaries came from widely diverse backgrounds and geographical origins, apart from the value of hearing a “spiritual pilgrimage”, personal testimonies helped fill in those backgrounds and enrich each other’s knowledge of their fellows within a novel proximity. The compound, in this sense, served as an arena where regional distinctions were made personal and immediate, and even when such distinctions were subsumed in public nationalism they remained sources of private uncertainty.

Jane Hunter’s study of American missionaries in turn-of-the-20th-Century China showed that new national pride and social confidence of the Americans enabled them to acquire an international stature in the mission field of China.⁴⁵ Their struggle for superiority was not only in relation to Europeans, but also to those from the colonies. Joining a Mission that was dominated by Europeans and North Americans, Amy Carter felt a national pique during a sharing time at the language school:

---

it was the custom on Sunday afternoons for each woman in turn to speak about her own country, giving some spiritual overtones. When Amy’s turn came, she thought, ‘I’ll show them!’ Hanging on the wall was a big map of the world. She swung round to point out her beloved homeland and, lo and behold, it wasn’t there! Whoever had prepared that map hadn’t even included New Zealand, God’s Own Country!

When the laughter had subsided, she struggled on. Somewhere in her talk came the illustration of a small boat on the Mississippi River. Every time it blew its whistle, the engine stopped. There wasn’t steam for both! Afterwards a young American came up to Amy and snapped, “Why’d you put that boat on the Mississippi? Why didn’t you put it on one of your little New Zealand rivers?”

The PCNZ, in their later years, tended to send new recruits to Cheung Chau Island for language study as compound life would be too distracting. The community feeling within such a European enclave made the probationers feel very much at home. Sports activities such as volleyball, tennis and swimming, plus evening entertainments with dining and dancing, competed for their attention with their language studies. Tennis became known as “the missionaries’ game” because it was one of the few active, competitive games that could be played in a limited space.

When the CIM missionaries were assigned to smaller compounds in the interior, often they rented Chinese-style properties, and they were simply “living on the job”. There was no clear separation of home and work, and home was simply not a

---

47 Alvin Austin, Saving China: Canadian Missionaries in the Middle Kingdom, 1888-1959 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1986), 13.
comfortable retreat. In her book *Have We No Rights?*, the American CIM missionary Mabel Williamson describes a busy day with visitors, which would be typical to many of her New Zealand colleagues working in the interior.

The day had been a busy one. The first visitor had appeared before breakfast, a precursor of a seemingly never-ending stream. There were uneducated country women, whose curiosity could only be satisfied by going through every room in the missionary's house and minutely examining each article that met their eyes. There were those who were educated and formally polite, and dexterously steered the conversation into other channels every time we endeavored to present the claims of Christ to them. There were Christians, some coming with their troubles, others with plans for forwarding the work of the church, and still others with requests for us to set a time when we could go with them to call upon their unsaved friends or relatives.

Finally at four-thirty, after we had ushered out a couple of callers, we returned, for the first time that day, to an empty room.48

On hearing her desire to leave the house for a time of solitude, her missionary sister “stood stock-still”, looking at her in amazement. “Where in China do you think you'll find a place where there aren't any people?” Lifting her eyes she saw:

People, people everywhere, even out there in the country! These were the people whom I had come to China to seek; yet if I could only get away from them for a few hours! ...... There was absolutely no place I could go to be alone! The best that I could do was to go home to the mission station, into the house, up to my room, and close

---

the door. Even then, who knew how soon someone would call me?49

The unstable nature of frontier evangelism and the itinerant character of the mission meant that friendship was frequently disrupted. Colleagueship was a relationship of circumstance. When one moved on, another would fill the place. New Zealanders were exposed to a greater internationalism under their own roof. In the vast land of China, “Kwis” sought each other out and discovered common bonds which transformed nationhood to collegiality.

In contrast, the PCNZ’s compound in Kongchuen was about five acres, enclosed by a bamboo hedge. Within the hedge there were a 100-bed hospital, four missionary residences, a girls' boarding school, and a chapel. At one time, the size of the compound population residing within its boundaries was about some four hundred people, missionaries, Chinese staff, students, patients, servants, and alike.50 It was probably still a very modest size by the standards of American compounds.51 Being the only substantially visible architecture within miles of rice fields, dwarfing village cottages, clan halls, temples or even pagodas, while creating an impression of “money well-spent” to the home constituency, it was simultaneously a sailent proclamation of western arrogance to its Chinese audience. When Annie James first arrived at the compound, she was wondering how one who had come to minister to those who lived in windowless honeycombed hovels should be living in a two-storied house, with large airy rooms, and wide balconies to protect it from the sun.52 No evidence shows that she linked this scene with the scorn expressed back home about urban Chinese bricking up many of their widows and living in dark

49 Ibid., 44.
50 "Statement on the armed guards situation at the Kong Chuen mission compound," p.4, OMC, MSP, SCM, 1949, AA2/2/1, PCNZ Archive.
52 Rita Snowden, Never a Dull Moment (Christchurch, N.Z.: Presbyterian Bookroom, 1948), 55.
houses in fear of local ruffians throwing stones to break the glass. Nonetheless, she was only half convinced that the rationale for a comfortable and familiar living space was to keep the missionaries in a good state of health. History showed that better accommodation did not always correspond to better health or staff turn-over. It was estimated that 60% of those missionaries working in South China, mostly supported by better-off denominational missions, were eventually invalided home or died prematurely on the field.

In many places, the Chinese household was a walled space, blocking the gaze of curiosity. New Zealand missionaries growing up in farmland opening onto green pasture or in cottages surrounded by gardens often found the walls of Chinese cities oppressive. Nonetheless, they might come to welcome compound walls within cities for the very reasons that the Chinese had built them, as security against the physical and sensory assaults of an impoverished populace. However, at the same time, the walled space also made them less approachable, and consequently their message more alien. Mission compounds could also arouse the suspicions of the Chinese host. Rumour mongers would point to impenetrable mission compounds as sites of missionary infanticide of Chinese children and immoral sexual contact with Chinese women.

The paradox of the PCNZ compound as the witness of both western superiority and affluence simultaneously provoked local avarice and hostility, which defeated the very purpose of the dwelling and its dwellers. Being “the best in missionary fellowship”, welcoming visitors from other Mission Societies who were seen as “cousins to our mission”, the PCNZ compound also attracted “uninvited visitors”.

In response to Frances Ogilvie's conscientious objection to the employment of armed...
guards on the mission compound, the Field Council prepared a ten-page long statement over the issue. According to it, this “fine well-built red brick premises”, “conspicuous in the rural landscape”, had over the years been prone to wandering trespassers and prowlers. Even before any missionaries took residence here, in 1917, it had been an object of looting and raiding. The architect Andrew Wilson lost $800 (in Canton dollars) of possessions in one armed robbery. As a result, six robbers were beheaded. A little later in the same year, the compound was damaged by the battles of two Chinese armies. The reaction was to seek compensation through British diplomatic representations. George McNeur reported to Alexander Don in 1916 that “The Civil Governor has placed a guard on the compound”, and he had “little doubt that British Consul will insist on the damage being repaired”.

Four armed robberies occurred in the compound during the lawless age of Sino-Japan war. Dr. Eaton was shot by the intruder in one of the raids. Armed robberies continued to occur despite the fact that a Chinese guerrilla leader and his men were quartered on the compound. As a result, night watchmen and compound labourers began to be armed with rifles as a kind of local defence corps. The Chinese section saw the use of guards as axiomatic. It was in this socio-political context that Ogilvie’s Christian ideals clashed with field reality. Her deep conviction that “to use violence such as guns to protect us in a foreign land in the service of the Prince of Peace was a contradiction in terms and a denial of Christian truth” was “the only dissentient voice”. The only way she could pursue her point was to submit her resignation. The designer of this compound had never envisaged such a day when the magnificence of the buildings matched that of a Governor-General’s demesne in

---

56 “Statement on the armed guards situation at the Kong Chuen mission compound,” OMC, MSP, SCM, 1949, AA2/2/1, PCNZ Archive.
a British colony, but the consequent interdependence between missionary personnel and Chinese colleagues, and the concentration of hospital, school and missionary residences within the same compound, had not only failed to provide safety, but also had caused division in the Christian representation.

The PCNZ story represented the compound-centred approach of missionary endeavour in China. In operatic costume, long sleeves are extension of arms, feathers on a crown are extension of head, and stilts are extension of legs. As a symbolic icon of foreign fortress, the mission compounds stood as the extension of foreign bodies. The compound style of life makes the mission a foreign territory within a region. In her letter to her mother, Flora Wilson confided that “in Kong Cheun Sunday services had been held all these last years on the mission compound which I don’t think is at all ideal. It is too apt to strengthen the people’s already held belief that the whole Church business is a foreign affair”.61

Descriptions of arriving again within the protection of the compound suggest a longing for familiarities and cultural enclaves. Several accounts describe mission settlements as like a paradise regained after the horrors of the surroundings. For example, Flora Wilson’s first impression of the compound went like: “I’ve been expecting something very beautiful but somehow it was beyond all my imagining - like an oasis in the desert”.62 Quite often, the sense of home-coming had more to do with social structures than the physical dwellings. The mud-brick and tile-roofed buildings of FAU hostels, though looking modest or even humble, still provided an emotional retreat for its members partly because the foreign staff was housed separately from the Chinese employees and their families.63 The mission compound

---

60 For example, in Wilson's "letter to folks at home", she describes the Kong Cheun Compound as "a place which could have been a Governor-General's demesne" (April 22, 1938, SCM, Staff File, F.M. Wilson, PCNZ Archive).
61 Wilson to Mother, October 20, 1945, SCM, Personnel File, F.M.Wilson, PCNZ Archive.
62 Wilson's "letter to folks at home", April 22, 1938, SCM, Staff File, F.M. Wilson, PCNZ Archive.
63 Cameron, Go Anywhere Do Anything, 82, 87.
was thus a socially constructed back-stage, or a “contact zone” that was also a “comfort zone” for western missionaries to meet the host nations in their own terms and conditions. Brotchie likens it with the medieval castle:

The missionary’s house was his castle, and the use of the latter epithet carries with it all the symbolic implications of moat, drawbridge, portcullis, and high, thick walls which in reality accompanied the medieval original. The missionaries could go out to the Chinese, but there were barriers to the Chinese coming in to them.  

Even during the Sino-Japan War when civil-mission relations were felt to be mutually acceptable, the mission compound never appeared to be a platform where Chinese and westerners met on an equal footing. The FAU transport members were particularly distressed about the refusal of some of the Protestant mission compounds to accommodate the Chinese crew. Their mixed feelings about accepting hospitality were also about the contrast between the insulated western comforts and the surrounding Chinese misery. While it was usually expected for missionaries to offer hospitality to other foreign travelers, especially at the CIM stations that were often the only habitat for western residents in the whole area, there are very few references in the literature about missionaries extending the same hospitality to Chinese Christians. In her autobiography, Jean Moore, who “married out” to an Irish missionary doctor, gives a detailed description of her life in the Methodist Mission compound, and she became a host to a great variety of missionaries returning to their stations in the interior of China as well as military officers, doctors, and professors from the British colony of Hong Kong, but with scarcely a mention of any Chinese associates.

---

65 Cameron, Go Anywhere Do Anything, 76.
66 Moore, Daughter of China, 60-77.
4.3.4. Xing (行) — Travelling

For an opera company to take residence in a big city, contracted to a reputable theatre, attracting a regular audience, they were expected to have a good variety in their repertoire so as to keep their audience interested. Opera companies moving from village to village can survive on repeating the performance of a handful of classics. Resident operas and resident circuses usually held a higher status than their itinerant counterparts as being more sophisticated. Around the turn of the 20th Century, the division between the compound approach and the itinerant approach within missionary practice had become quite evident. The former was usually associated with the “social gospel” of mainline (usually denominational or ecumenical) missions while the latter was linked with a more evangelistic standing (usually interdenominational or faith missions). Nearly all missionaries had itinerant and residential experiences at different stages of their missionary career. There had been dissenters within both camps and the division had never been absolute.

Frustrated by the confines of the compound, Annie James (PCNZ) and Kathleen Hall (SPG) each started a branch clinic in a remote village. Likewise, the dissatisfaction with a narrow sense of village evangelism in the Brethren mission led George Shepherd to switch to the more modernist camp of the ABCFM. Starting from “a back eddy in the stream of the Christian program,” he moved from a village missionary, to a leader in regional rural reconstruction, then to a leader in a nation-wide ideological reform, and finally as a close confidant of the generalissimo. It is a career development that could be hardly found among his fellow hardware salesmen back in New Zealand.

After working alongside the CIM missionaries in the Shanxi relief in the late 1870s,

Rev. David Hill, a Wesleyan Methodist Missionary, once said, “The policy of the CIM is diffusion while most other societies is concentration”. Though subject to much criticism, the diffusion approach was confirmed in the CIM’s Wuchang (武昌) meeting in late 1881. As a generalisation, the CIM extensively used the itinerant preaching pattern while the CMS and PCNZ were more focused on the resident approach. Being a mobile populace back home, it had not been difficult for New Zealanders to travel from place to place with great frequency, to be alone, and to pioneer. The colonial experience had given New Zealanders some transferable life skills that proved to be useful in the mission field. Learning to “rough it” became as central to the experience in the colonies as it was to the missionary experience in China. The ability to endure these physical hardships and to cope successfully without domestic comforts, too, became the mark of adaptable colonists and missionaries.

Missionary experience was in many aspects a lonely experience, which had been accentuated by a diffusionist and itinerant mission strategy. We are left with many missionary pictures of “Men Alone”, or as the title of one missionary biography signifies, Children of Wildness. Mathew Dalzell wisely chooses James Huston Edgar as an extreme case for itinerant evangelism. Born in the South Island of New Zealand, he left home for farm and bush life at the age of fourteen. Whilst a missionary, Edgar became a Fellow of the Royal Geographic Society and a Fellow of the Royal Anthropological Institute. With missionary as well as ethnographic ambitions, Edgar’s itineration traversed thousands of miles during which he distributed thousands of texts between 1914 and 1927. For example, he claimed to have traveled 2,025 English miles and sold over 13,000 Scripture portions and tracts during eight months in 1914/1915 along the Szechuan-Tibetan border alone. To

---

70 Ibid.
Edgar, the claim that a missionary is an explorer should “carry with it a compliment”.

His missionary reports conveyed “a sense of an exploratory expedition into as-yet-uncharted human geography” or “terra incognita.” Dalzell fails to recognise the feminine connotation of the phrase “terra incognita” in his usage of the word, which, when paired with a male explorer, mirrors the power imbalance between the explored and the explorer in a genderised discourse. In one of his reports, Edgar lamented that “Book-selling is a lonely work. Every man you see is a stranger, and multitudes are always staring at, satirising, or overtly insulting the ‘man with the Book’.” While reading this passage which suggests a picture of a “Man Alone” in a sea of hostile heathens, very few readers would realise that Edgar’s itineration was often protected by an armed escort, aided by the Post Office in addition to Bible Society agents, Chinese porters, muleteers, and colporteurs (who probably did most of the selling), and occasionally with companions from academia, the CIM or the YMCA.

Reginald Sturt’s evangelism method was probably less extreme and more typical of itinerant missionaries of his day. Based in his home in an inner-Mongolian city, Sturt travelled long distances each summer to make contacts with Mongol tribes who met in large groups for trade and games. His itineration in many ways mirrored by Don’s annual summer tour for Chinese gold-miners, except the modes of transportation were different. Sturt traveled on horseback, covering up to forty miles a day, or on horse-drawn wagons, at five to ten miles an hour, or bullock carts, plodding along at about two miles per hour. He once recorded covering over 5000 miles in a single year. It was not an unusual practice for him to pitch a tent on the open steppe or sleep

---

72 A lecture delivered in Australia and New Zealand during one of his furlough as recorded in J. H. Edgar, The Land of Mystery: Tibet (Melbourne: CIM, 1927), 18.
out under the stars. In later years he purchased a 1934 Dodge 6 van. Though it sped up travel across the grassy Mongolia steppes, it required a team of bullocks to pull it if it broke down. After having tested the maps of Mongolia and the Gobi desert drawn by Sturt, Owen Lattimore, a renowned traveller and author, recommended him to the Royal Geographical Society, and so he too was elected as a Fellow.76

While the son’s recollection of the father’s trips perpetuates the image of “Man Alone”, conveyed in his use of singular pronoun (he) and depictions of solitude, Reginald Sturt’s own letters home used plural pronoun (we) and contained references to helpers, guides, and other companies.77

A primary task of Edgar and Sturt’s itinerations was to sell and distribute Bible portions and Christian booklets. In the latter case, bible literature was supplemented by needles, thread and matches as cash commodities, given in exchange for hospitality received, or bartered for milk, cheese or parched millet, and pamphleteering was more likely to be complemented with personal dialogue with individuals.78 When distributing Gospel almanacs and tracts to households of remote regions, both men linked the presence of Christian literature with “a daily silent testimony for the Lord” and “unbound power of the Word of God”.79

According to Reinders, the Protestant emphasis on “getting the word out” inevitably led to the giving of such texts to illiterates, but the missionaries’ sense of the overwhelming population yet “unreached”, together with their faith in the miraculous power of the Word, justified a certain degree of wastefulness in their pamphleteering.80

76 Sturt, Loving Life, 61-63.
80 Reinders, Borrowed Gods and Foreign Bodies, 78.
Unlike the CIM and the Brethren mission, the FAU was an international relief unit made up of conscientious objectors, who worked in war stricken areas. Though their mission was more humanitarian than evangelistic, the FAU volunteers shared the same degree of vagrancy with itinerant missionaries. FAU’s involvement in China included hauling medical and other vital supplies throughout Free China, and when necessary, staffing and servicing “unmanned” mission hospitals, hospital workshops, rehabilitation centres, public health schemes, refugee situations and even Japanese prisoners waiting to return home. Although modern transportation had replaced the primitive means of travelling, the speed did not necessarily increase. The unsealed roads in the interior of China, particularly in mountainous regions, was a test for both the driver’s ingenuity and the vehicle’s resilience. Road accidents damaged the driver’s pride more than his vehicle. The New Zealanders were experimenting with an ever increasing list of alternative fuels, and had an endless catalogue of breakdowns. Drivers frequently suffered haemorrhoids or even concussion as a result of being jolted between a springless seat and cab ceiling. It was also their first experience to master a converted “coal cart” constructed out of an old petrol drum. Vivid descriptions of the eccentricities of charcoal trucks take long space in the members’ memoirs, revealing nostalgia of the disappearance of this wartime invention in China.

Descriptions such as the above reinforce the mystified icon of “Man Alone”. In actual fact, they were working alongside Chinese garage staff, learning from their ingenuity and relying on their support. The rule of thumb for each supply run was to assign at least one foreigner, paired with a “Chinese boy”, in the hope that a foreign face could ensure protection or favourism. Despite the Quakers’ egalitarian tradition

---

81 For example, liquid fuels made from vegetable oils, alcohol from sugar cane, tung oil distillate and charcoal gas (Cameron, *Go Anywhere Do Anything*, 61).
82 For example, tyres torn on the rough rods and exploded in the heat, axles and springs broke, chassis members cracked, brake failure, and bearing seized (Cameron, *Go Anywhere Do Anything*, 59).
83 China Convoy - Newsletters, quoted in Cameron, *Go Anywhere Do Anything*, 59.
and the FAU’s determination to achieve a state of cross-cultural camaraderie, the relationship with the Chinese had been a constant source of frustration. Even men such as Courtney Archer, who had decided that he “hadn’t come all this way, to a strange country, to live with a group of expatriates”, 84 would have to agree with Graham Milne, that the FAU foreign staff only “skirted around and floated across the top of Chinese society”, 85 an inevitable outcome for itinerant workers.

If itinerancy was a mark of masculinity for missionary men, taking up itinerant work altered the meaning and dynamic of gender for missionary women. In a British colony such as New Zealand, a system of chaperonage was taken as good social convention, especially within the church context, although it was not always practical. However, in the China field, it was not uncommon for single women, spinsters, wives and widows, to travel without the company of missionary men. Alongside the picture of “Men Alone”, there could be an even greater number of “Women Alone”. The robust matronly figure associated with women working in foreign lands resonates with that of “Kiwi” pioneer women, who were also isolated from centres of civilisation and artifacts of domesticity which defined them. Kate H. L. Hutley, after rejoining the LMS as a widowed minister, was known for being “indefatigable” in village itineration. She once reported casually that she had walked 550 miles within 7 months. 86 Elizabeth Stinson’s involvement in countryside itineration was considered so unusual, in terms of the CMS standard, that a recommendation was made for an extra travel allowance. 87

It would not take very long for readers to realise that neither these men nor women were literally traveling alone. They were always accompanied by “native helpers”,

84 Cameron, Go Anywhere Do Anything, 87.
85 Ibid., 86.
and often surrounded by Chinese crowds. They were seen as “alone” in the sense that the Chinese were seen as the ‘Other’ (especially the non-Christian crowds). Images of “Men Alone” and “Women Alone” were thus actually images of “white men alone” and “white women alone”, combating a heathen culture in the field instead of combating a hostile nature back home. The native helpers, colporteurs and bible women trained probationer missionaries just as senior nurses trained interne doctors. A CIM missionary, John Beck, reported his early experience of street preaching in the following terms:

our Colporteur, Mr. Ho, begins to preach. He is quite capable of speaking for more than two hours without a break, so that by the time for anyone else to have a turn. The people listen well, even when I inflict my very mutilated Chinese upon them.88

His fiancée, Myrie Wood, reported a similar experience in her visit to villages: “our Chinese woman would go forward to speak and we would follow”.89 Likewise, Florence Young showed her appreciation for the Bible woman who came to comfort her after her first attempt to preach and pray in Chinese on her arrival at the station, and after it hobbled up to her room on her bound feet to pray with her.90 On one occasion in the early years of her missionary life, a junior missionary who was incapable of communicating meaningfully, Naomi Grey successively pleaded with three senior Bible women to explain to a Chinese girl the way of salvation.91 At a later stage, she also marveled how a new convert was “more missionary” than she was.92 In a similar vein, though a different context, the FAU members’ art of improvisation was much inspired by the ingenious work carried out by the Chinese

91 Naomi Grant, “Memoirs of M. Naomi Grant” (unpublished manuscript, undated), 73-74.
92 Ibid., 85.
Even after the missionary had acquired sufficient language skills, he/she was more of a token value than a “native helper” in day-to-day evangelism. The attracting effect, or rather distracting effect, of the sight of a foreign woman can be best illustrated in Grace Young’s depiction:

In a few minutes faces peeped over the wall and round corners, and soon I was surrounded by 33 or more. …One took off my hat, another fingered my dress. It is terrible to be a fair person in a land of dark people. I have never before wished to be dark, but it would be much less conspicuous to be so. Miss Steven says it is terrible to be tall among short women. …She …has just come from a place where Katherine Hall is the only foreign woman they had seen. They thought Miss Steven was Katherine Hall grown up.94

Senior Chinese staff also provided a role model and admonished young missionaries on cultural proprieties when accompanying the trips. Jean recalled a Chinese pastor’s wife’s disapproval of Jean’s act of picnicking outside the village with a sniff remarked on “eating on the ground like beggars”.95

4.4. Medical and Educational Work

In China as well as in many other mission fields, local staff took over the preaching work fairly quickly after a period of pioneering work by western missionaris. Two subsidiary branches of mission work, medicine and education, remained largely under the auspices of foreign missionaries.96 New Zealanders came to China in

---

93 Cameron, Go Anywhere Do Anything, 45.
94 The Reaper (NZABM), (December 14, 1929): 3.
95 Moore, Daughter of China, 37.
96 For a general overview of missionary involvement in education and medicine, see Norman Etherington, “Education and Medicine,” in Missions and Empire, ed. Norman
organised groups when western medicine and western education had been recognised by the Chinese society as an acceptable, and in some areas, prestigious institution. Correspondingly, many mainline missions, such as the CMS and the PCNZ, had separate education and medical departments, where teaching, nursing, midwifery and surgical skills were readily transferable. A good proportion of New Zealand missionaries were categorised as teaching and medical staff. Nurses (often including midwives) and teachers were the two biggest single professions for women missionaries in general. Moreover, almost all missionaries had to carry out some aspects of medical and teaching work alongside their evangelistic duties.

Medical missionaries often had an abrupt introduction to medicine in China. Graham Milne had to make critical medical decisions with only one year’s experience as a junior house surgeon and with the aid of the few textbooks only on tropical medicine and war-zone surgery. He was asked to perform his very first operation within days of arriving in the FAU depot. Likewise, Courtney Archer was expected to administer chloroform and spinal anaesthesia without any supervision after only one week of observation.

The China field opened new opportunities for women teachers and nurses. A mission field, like a colony, was a space that rendered specialist training unnecessary or luxurious. It was a “make-do” space where both mission and church not only allowed men to take on different jobs, but also encouraged leadership to turn a blind eye to women’s multitasking, or even to undertaking conventional male roles.

---


97 According to Roberts’ calculations for New Zealand interdenominational mission societies, the percentages for teachers and nurses were 21.3% and 19.1% respectively for the CIM/OMF recruits between 1891 and 1975; the figures for the WEC recruits up to 1975 were both 23%; the figures for the UFM recruits of the similar period were 17% and 21%; the figures for the SIM recruits up to 1976 were 17% and 23% (Richard. L. Roberts, “The Growth of Inter-Denominational Mission Societies in New Zealand” (Master’s Thesis, University of Auckland, 1977), 30, 52-53, 56, 65). In all cases, teachers and nurses had been the two biggest single professions of the mission societies.

98 Cameron, Go Anywhere Do Anything, 46.

99 Ibid., 46.
Doctors, men and women, had to work in an “almighty” generalist capacity, handling enormous cases loosely categorised as “tropical diseases” that they were largely ill-equipped for. Moreover, the ongoing difficulties of recruiting qualified doctors meant that many mission hospitals, and a much greater number of clinics, had to rely on the skills and experiences of matrons and nurses, not to mention the unrecognised role of missionary nurses and midwives in coaching and supporting junior missionary doctors who had little facility in language to communicate complicated medical matters with the patients and local staff. While working in a superintendent-like and supervisory capacity, they were still paid as nursing personnel. When they were in inland China, nurses and midwives were indiscriminately called “doctors” by the Chinese patients, and sometimes even by the Chinese staff. Disregarding the western medical regulation that midwives were only permitted to attend “normal” births, missionary midwives had to handle all kinds of obstetrical cases, and were frequently called to attend other emergencies.

Inequality was not only experienced between men and women, but also between missionaries and Chinese. In the opera trade, it was very common for the chief actors/actresses to earn outrageous wages while the walk-on were only paid a survival rate. That was how my Aunt was able to live on only 10% of her remuneration while spending 90% of it on her reforming projects, paying wages to a not insignificant staff. Surprisingly, income discrepancies between foreign and native staff in the missionary enterprise were just as wide as that was in the opera trade. When Dr. Strange was on military duties, his stipend, raised by the NZCMA, was sufficient to cover the salary and rents for four Chinese doctors. In an appeal for funds, New Zealand supporters learned that £250 could employ 20 native catechists throughout the year, while it could barely keep one married European missionary

---

100 They were Dr. Tsong, Zwun, Liu and Tso (Kenneth Gregory, Stretching out Continually: “Whaatoro Tona Atu” A History of the New Zealand Church Missionary Society, 1892-1972 (Christchurch, N.Z.: NZCMS, 1972), 50.
Missionaries’ salaries were more in line with their counterparts in home mission or home ministry back in New Zealand, than that of their Chinese colleagues in the field.\textsuperscript{102} In 1930, the annual salary was £48 for Chinese pastors, between £24 and £32 for teachers, between £12 and £16 for Bible women, and between £21 and £36 for school teachers.\textsuperscript{103} For the same year, the annual salary expense in the PCNZ was between £420 and £484 for a married missionary couple, and between £197 and £227 for a single woman worker.\textsuperscript{104} In each category, the missionary’s income was more than ten times that of their Chinese counterparts. Even in cases when both Western and Chinese staff were similarly qualified with professional credentials, the remuneration compensations were scaled differently. In 1930, the salary for a Chinese doctor was about $150 per month, approximating to £100-£120 per annum,\textsuperscript{105} though twice as much as a Chinese pastor, was still lower than that of the

\textsuperscript{101} "What retrenchment means," The Reaper (NZABM), (March 15, 1923), 3. As a comparison: the one-off expense for sending out a single woman missionary in the same year required £300 which covered training expenses, outfit, passage to China and stipend ("Miss Tobin," The Reaper (NZABM), (July 16, 1923), 5). In 1890, the expenses of sending western missionaries to China by the same Society was £400 for the one-off sending-out cost plus an annual maintenance cost of £290 ("Extracts from resolutions of the parent committee of the CMS, relating to the Mid China Interior Evangelistic Mission," ANG143/3/23, John Kinder Library).

\textsuperscript{102} For example, while Sister Mary McQueen's salary in the early 1900s was £70, raised to £80 at the end of her first year, woman missionary candidates received an annual allowance of £80, which increased to £100 once they became field missionaries as stipulated in the mission’s Constitution. In 1922, the Home Mission Committee stipulated that the stipend for ordained missionaries should be £182 for married couple and £165 for bachelors, and £150 for women workers (“Appendix II - Report of Home Mission Committee November,” Proceedings of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand (hereafter Proceedings), 1922, 103). These provisions were very close to that of foreign missionaries.

\textsuperscript{103} McKenzie to Mawson, February 26, 1930, FMC- MSIC (CVM), 1929-1931, AA16/5/8, PCNZ Archive.

\textsuperscript{104} “Appendix XIX - Report of the Foreign Missions Committee,” Proceedings, 1930, 233. According to the 1926’s Proceedings, the new salary scale for married men should be between £280 and £320, with an additional children's allowance between £25 and £40 per child, for single men, between £170 and £190, and for single women, between £150 and £170 (p.123). It is unclear why the actual payment in some cases exceeded the official stipulation.

\textsuperscript{105} The convention of the time was that monthly salary was stated in Mexican dollars, while
single women missionaries among whom many were nurses. Not only were the Chinese staff paid less, but they often had to carry out a heavier workload than their missionary superiors. According to Turbott’s reminiscence, the Kirk brothers of the CVM were involved in many other things besides working in the mission so the work of the hospital was mainly left to the two Chinese doctors and the probationer Turbott. The superior status, and a salary disproportionately higher than that of the native Chinese staff, used to make the China-born missionary doctor Kathleen Pih uncomfortable. On marrying a Chinese medical professor, she was soon to be placed on the Chinese scale of staff salary when teaching with her husband in the American-founded school, St. John’s University.

On the one hand, New Zealand medical professionals carried with them specifically western notions of health care to rural and urban China. Some of these western ideals faced challenges in the reality of the field. Brought up with the Victorian fetish for fresh air and sunshine, the first thing noticed by New Zealand missionaries were the windowless, and thus airless and lightless, Chinese houses. One lasting impression that they made on the mind of the Chinese was their insistence on opening windows even during the cold seasons of the year. Holding to the principle “cleanliness is next to godliness”, almost as a biblical truth, Kathleen Hall insisted that the cleaners, porters and gardeners of the Mosse Memorial Hospital in Datong maintain better personal hygiene, only to find out that her reproach failed to inspire the labourers as the annual salary was stated in British pounds. Perhaps the Chinese pastor needed to know the monthly figure in Chinese term for household budgeting while the the PCNZ Mission Committee needed to know the annual figure of the mission budget.

109 Ibid., 44.
110 The researcher's visit to Joe Thompson's field in 2009.
they could not see any point of doing filthy jobs with clean body and cloths.  

Likewise, New Zealand educational missionaries brought with them a set of educational codexes to apply to the Chinese setting. They concentrated on primary and secondary schooling and occasionally taught in normal school and theological seminary. Girls’ schools at the turn of the 19th Century New Zealand were under strong pressures from the community to train their pupils for marriage and motherhood as it was generally believed that women were not suitable for hard study or professional life. The irony was that the pioneer generation of women graduates, once in charge of various girls’ schools, supervised the introduction of a sex-differentiated education that tended to lock women into subordinate jobs.

An interesting cross-national comparison could be made between the Fraser sisters’ experiments in girls’ education. The older sister, Mary Fraser, was a champion for girls’ education when education for women was still an alarming prospect. When she was appointed the Lady Principal of Wanganui Girls’ College in 1893, she introduced new classes in cooking, first aid, dressmaking and physical education. Under her leadership, the Wanganui Girls’ College gained a reputation as a fine establishment for young ladies, and became New Zealand’s largest boarding school for girls by 1898. However, just as my Aunt had to fight with the male theatre-owners, Mary Fraser often faced a hard battle with an all-male Board of Governors. Just as my Aunt had to pay the circus staff out of her own pocket, Mary Fraser was required to administer the boarding establishment, employ the matron and domestic staff and defray any domestic costs from her annual salary of three hundred pounds. Just like my Aunt had to oversee the reform programme as well as carrying

---

113 Ibid., 117.
out performing duties, Mary Fraser was expected to take charge of the day-to-day running of the school as well as to carry her own share of teaching responsibilities.\textsuperscript{114}

In comparison, China was probably a better socio-cultural space for Mary’s younger sister, Kate Fraser, to try out her ideas with other spinsters. Kate Fraser set up an industrial training school for girls at Ichang around the same time her sister was appointed Lady Principal. In this school, torchon and point-lace “kept the fingers of the girls busy” for four hours daily, and the rest of a school day was made up with writing, reading, and singing centred on religious themes, supplemented with “native classics”, simple math, geography, and a twice-a-week drawing practices.\textsuperscript{115}

Working in an isolated mission station, Kate Fraser and her woman colleague Mary Moore enjoyed a degree of autonomy that Mary Fraser did not have. In an era when mass education for women was newly introduced in both countries, New Zealand and China provided two different platforms for women pioneers to experiment with ideas. The irony seems to lie in the fact that even with greater freedom in a mission field, girls’ education as provided by “Kiwi” teachers in China still mirrored what was seen as an ideal religious education for young ladies back in New Zealand. The emphasis was always on domesticity and piety, even though the housekeeping skills of the missionary teachers such as Kate Fraser, being single women living in a compound staffed with Chinese cooks and servants, were getting rusty.

The success story of the Ichang School should not suggest that women missionaries’ ingenuity was free from the gender politics back home. More often than not, the scope of power struggles extended from the “back-stage” of the “home-base” to the

\textsuperscript{114} “Isabel Fraser: Hand Carried the First Kiwifruit Seeds from China,” \url{http://zesprikiwi.com/about/history/isabel-fraser}, accessed October 21, 2012.

\textsuperscript{115} Catherine G. Fraser, "China - The end of the term," \textit{News of Female Missions} (October 1902), N.S., No. 58, 74-75. Some twenty to thirty years later, the programme in the Tak Kei Boarding School of the PCNZ compound run similar lines and included reading, hygiene, Bible study, arithmetic, singing, with a focus on practical skills such as knitting, shoe-making, cross-stitch embroidery, handcraft, and the making of mosquito stockings. See: Gordon Ogilvie, \textit{Little Feet in a Big Room: Frances Ogilvie in China} (Christchurch, N.Z.: Shoal Bay Press, 1994), 36.
“front-stage” of the mission field. In an era when the prevailing missiological view was that women’s work in the foreign field must recognise the headship of man in ordering the affairs of the kingdom of God, Annie Hancock had her frustrations with the male governmental structures that interfered with her work for female education at the Union Normal School. Her letter to Professor Hewitson, expressed a degree of resentment, referring to “the clutches of gentlemen”.

Despite the remote-control of male boards, the front-stage of the China field was still taken as a space where “Kiwi” women could practise things that they were not allowed back home. Teaching and dispensing contraceptives was one classic example. In the English-speaking world, the privileged classes had known about the more reliable methods of birth control from the 1880s. For the poor, it seemed cheaper to conceive a baby than paying for the knowledge or the appliances to avoid conception. New Zealand tended to be more conservative than other English speaking countries. In the 1930s, contraception was not taught in New Zealand medical schools. Doctors received no training in contraception and were unaware of the latest developments. The opposition to contraception came from both men and woman. In an Inquiry into Abortion in 1936-37, only eight out of 18 women’s groups supported the creation of birth control clinics. Correspondingly, contraceptives were generally “crude, unreliable, expensive and difficult to obtain” for an average New Zealand woman.

---

116 Hancock to Hewitson, April 11, 1920, CVM, Staff file, A. Hancock, Aa 9/8, PCNZ Archive.
118 The Family Planning Association of New Zealand was founded in 1936, six years later than its British counterpart, and 15 years later than the American Birth Control League. Moreover, the first birth control clinic was not established in New Zealand until 1953, 32 years behind Britain and 37 years after the first attempt to open a family planning centre in the States.
120 Ibid., 197.
The church’s attitude had also been one of reluctance. It was only in 1930 that the worldwide Anglican Communion gave cautious sanction at its Lambeth Conference for married couples to use artificial methods to space out their families, and it still stressed that the primary method of spacing ought to be abstinence, based on a life of discipline and self-control. The 1930 pronouncement was only a grudging acceptance rather than positive endorsement, which did not come until the Lambeth Conference of 1958. Only *Working Women*, a magazine with a Communist Party backing, was willing to print an advertisement on birth-control. Most publishers were afraid to offend the other advertisers. The association with communism and atheism made it even more difficult for Christian women to promote the use of contraceptives. Given such a backdrop, it was quite a courageous action for missionary nurses such as Kathleen Hall to teach village couples practical knowledge of birth control. Such “innovations” were usually eschewed by missionary publications even when it was mentioned in missionary letters or reports, for fear of causing offence and losing support. Therefore, this detail was only recorded in a biography after her death, and by a left-wing biographer.

China was both exhilarating and frustrating for woman missionaries. The pioneering projects of Kathleen Hall (SPG), Annie James (PCNZ), Annie Hancock (PCNZ) and Kate Fraser/Mary Moore (CSM) all reflected idiosyncratic traits of these spinsters. It is often difficult to distinguish between restrictions perceived by these women and restriction that actually existed. It is also hard to discern if the frustrations they experienced were a result of their gender status or a result of their strong personalities. After all, both medical and educational projects of missionary enterprise were largely reliant on professionally trained single women whose group traits of self-direction was fostered and reinforced by the conditions of overseas missions.

---

124 For further discussion, see: Rachel Gillett, “Helpmeets and Handmaidens: The Role of
4.5. Summer Retreat

Opera players were expected to perform under extremes of climate, in the freezing cold or baking hot, with their full costumes. For missionaries, alternatively, whilst remaining in the field throughout their terms of service, there was one escape. That was the summer retreat, a back-stage within the field. Summer time was a trying season for western missionaries right from the days of Robert Morrison. It was known as the season of death, when epidemics of “tropical diseases” were most likely to spread. Summer was also known as “the riot season”, when civil-mission conflicts tended to erupt in heated weather. \(^{125}\) Originally established as sanitariums, resorts in mountains or on the sea fulfilled a desperate health need for missionaries stationed in the surrounding countryside. When the mission boards in the United States protested the need for summer retreats, missionaries in the field responded that the “church at home must choose between paying such expenses, or paying funeral expenses”. \(^{126}\) Likewise, PCNZ missionaries had to stress to the Foreign Mission Council back home that “summer furloughs are as difficult and expensive as they are essential in South China”. \(^{127}\)

There were several well-known sites for missionary retreats in China. Those working in the Yangtze Valley would go to Guling (牯岭); in Zhejiang Province, to Moganshan (莫干山); in North China, to Beidaihe (北戴河); in Henan Province, to Jigongshan (鸡公山); and in the Fujian Province, to Guling (鼓岭). The Presbyterians working in Canton often went to Lan Tau or Cheung Chau Island near Hong Kong. The later destination was not seen as an ideal resort as it only provided

---

Women in Mission Discourse” (BA Honours Diss., Otago University, 1998), 58, 74.

\(^{125}\) Both the Yangzhou Riot and the Kucheng Massacre happened in summer, and the eruption of Boxer Rebellion also occurred around the summer season when the drought was at its height.

\(^{126}\) Quoted in Hunter, Gospel of Gentility, 146.

\(^{127}\) McKenize to Mawson, January 9, 1930, FMC - MSIC (CVM), 1929-1931, AA16/5/8, PCNZ Archive.
“a change from inland heat to seabord [sic] heat”.128 Japan, as an alternative
destination for recuperation, was often taken as a compromise between a full
furlough back in New Zealand and a short retreat in a nearby island. These summer
resorts were another combination of time and space that exercised exclusion rather
than inclusion. They were little colonies scattered in the vast land of China, or small
replicas of the home-base in the midst of the heathen world. In Goffman’s language,
summer resorts were back regions in the midst of a broad “front-stage”. In Guling
alone, there were 518 holiday houses owned by foreign communities by 1928,
making up 73% of the total residences. About two thousand expatriates, among
whom half were missionaries, came annually to escape the summer heat.129 In
Moganshan, expatriate proprietors owned 118 holiday houses, making up 77% of the
total residences.130 Summer retreats were usually an exclusive gathering, where
missionaries isolated in small country stations during the year could recharge
national and ethnic identities. Though still attended by Chinese servants,
missionaries rarely brought any Chinese colleagues with them. It was customarily
considered as a racially exclusive annual occasion, an interim furlough, or an
opportunity to resume socialisation “with our own kind”.

As a younger generation missionary, Flora Wilson was quite shocked with the racial
exclusiveness expressed in the meeting of the residents association with the District
Officer while undertaking language study in the Cheung Chau Island:

all the matters being brought up are ones that I have already heard
discussed -- e.g. As to whether Chinese should be allowed to walk on
the paths of the hill reservation, as to whether the Chinese farmers in
the village should be allowed to make their terraces gradually higher

---

128 Ibid.
129 “Kulin,” http://zh.wikipedia.org/wiki/%E7%89%AF%E5%B2%AD, accessed September
11, 2012.
and higher ... as to whether Chinese junks should be allowed to anchor in the bathing bay ..., as to whether Chinese should bath at these bathing beaches... as to whether the two are for the supply of water to foreigners only or for the Chinese as well ... There are others too. But you will see from these that a good many of them are brought up by people who want to see that the Europeans have all the plums. ...We think there’s a dreadfully unChristian Spirit being shown... and most of them are missionaries.\textsuperscript{131}

The privilege of being a missionary was not only shown in their presence in the exclusive resorts, but also in their acutely felt absence at the mission stations. The length of retreat lasted from several weeks to several months, depending on mission policies and their conditions. The CIM provision of annual holidays was one month for the men and six weeks for the women.\textsuperscript{132} The PCNZ’s provision was much more generous. In the PCNZ foreign mission secretary’s letter to Mr. Howie, it was stated that as a missionary doctor he had to work ceaselessly for nine months out of the year, so presumably spent the remaining three months in a summer resort.\textsuperscript{133} There was no mention of the fact that the Chinese staff were expected to work all year round, coping with an increased workload as a result of the seasonal absence of missionary staff. This was the very reason why Dr. Pih’s application for extending of her furlough to take a post-graduate course met with the “considerations arising from her position as a foreign trained Chinese doctor”.\textsuperscript{134}

Missionaries did not only retreat from heat and humidity, but also from Chinese life and China’s sorrow. Shortly after the eruption of the Sino-Japan war, and in the wake

\textsuperscript{131} Wilson's "letter to mother", May 22, 1939, CVM, Staff Files, F.M.Wilson, PCNZ Archive.
\textsuperscript{132} Field Manual of the China Inland Mission, 28.
\textsuperscript{133} Secretary to Howie, November 3, 1930, CVM, Staff file, Dr. A. T. Howie, 1930-1937, AA9/7, PCNZ Archive.
\textsuperscript{134} FMC secretary’s letter to Dr. J. Kirk, March 4, 1935, CVM, Staff file, Dr. K. A. Pih, 1929-1938, AA10/3, PCNZ Archive.
of the Nanjing Massacre, Flora Wilson, then a language student at Cheung Chau island (near Hong Kong), wrote:

I think I have probably not mentioned anything about the war .... The truth is that we don’t have much reason to think about it .... Away here in the midst of British islands we don’t see any signs of other nations’ quarrels.135

4.6. Racial and Gender Dynamics in the Field

Though my Aunt played a woman’s role by the definition of the role category (or “hang dang”, 㹼ᖃ) that she was trained into, her performing partners would usually be a fellow woman playing a man’s role. As the plot required, my Aunt often played feminine characters disguised as men, and less frequently, her partner, being a woman herself, played male characters disguised as women. It was part of the fun to watch these cross-gender acting knowing the sex of the actresses and that of the characters they were playing. Given the low status of women and actors in the pre-1949 society, playing men on the stage, acting things that would be impossible in “real life” must have brought a sense of liberation and self-fulfillment to the actresses, however illusive. It is also worth pointing out that it was predominately women who watched and appreciated these women-played shows in the theatre. Such stage gender exclusivity and the consequent cross-gender acting are not as uncommon as it first seems to be, since the masculine version can be found in the Chinese Peking Opera, the English’s Elizabethan Theatre, the Japanese Kabuki Theatre, and the Indian Katakali Theatre. Chinese male actors who played women’s role – the same role category that my Aunt was trained in – were often seen as “less manly” and even being called homosexual prostitutes. Even when these men played

135 Wilson's "letter to Donald", January 16, 1938, SCM, Staff File, F.M. Wilson, PCNZ Archive.
136 Like many Chinese operas, there are two major role categories in Yue Opera: Sheng (male) and Dan (female).
woman characters disguised as men, they were not expected to act straightforwardly as men acting men, but to retain a certain degree of femininity. As I am slowly beginning to see the missionary movement from a dramaturgical perspective, some surprising affinities between the missionary women and the opera actresses, between the Chinese church leaders and opera actors are emerging. The mission field provides a platform for a certain degree of liberation and self-fulfillment for “Kiwi” women, however temporary. When the “Kiwi” women entered the missionary stage of China, they were often made to, or allowed to, play some of man’s roles which were impossible for them back home. In other words, they become “more than women”. Ironically, sent as living examples of “Christian womanhood”, they were often seen as “less womanly” by the Chinese audience. A recurring theme paralleling to this perception would be that Chinese men were often seen as “less manly” by the Westerner beholders, even when they took up spiritual posts that were usually reserved for male clergy in the West.

Paradoxes of the field experiences for New Zealanders included a simultaneous extension and reversal of conventional western gender politics. This paradox is evident in many aspects of mission operations. Racial relations with Chinese nationals need to be looked at as interwoven with gender relations in both New Zealand and Chinese societies. While single Chinese gold-miners, regardless of their marital status, had been a most peculiar sight for the European spectators, few New Zealanders would realise that on the other side of the globe, single western women, some of whom were from New Zealand, had been a most peculiar sight for the Chinese spectators. With taller stature and bigger feet, western women were already seen as “less feminine” in the eyes of the Chinese beholders, but being without husbands and mother-in-laws made them even more eccentric in a culture where women were almost universally married. Moreover, the curious trade-off in Western cultures, which granted women signs of deference in return for a lack of privileges, was unknown in China, so that the Chinese naturally interpreted chivalry toward
women as an indication of their superior status over western men. Pursuing a good image of oneself according to western mannerism, the missionaries unknowingly presented a wrong impression in the eyes of the Chinese audience.

While western women were seen by the Chinese as more “manly”, Chinese men were seen by westerners as more “womanly”. Apart from the queue and the robe which looked like a dress (especially when embroidered) to western eyes, there was also a subtle perception of Chinese effeminacy. Contrary to Western standards of masculinity that drew on a chivalric and military tradition, Chinese men of virtue eschewed violence, and cultivated moderation and wisdom. Missionaries tended to honour their Chinese teachers and staff for qualities of sensibility and refinement with a more generalised Western condescension to Chinese men as these were qualities more often associated in the West with women. Hunter speculated that missionary women and Chinese men, unconsciously and without preparation, met on a basis of gender ambiguity which came closer to approaching gender equality than either had known before. Ironically, this zone of freedom was based on cultural misunderstanding: on the one hand, missionary women might fail to recognise the subtle signs of sexual disrespect which were all that the more controlled Confucian order would allow. And the Chinese, for their part, judged the socially sanctioned initiatives of conventional western women by Chinese standards, which made out every missionary gentlewoman a shrew.\(^{137}\)

The western assumption that women needed the protection either of marriage or of a married man was only exaggerated by the real and imagined threats of the foreign field. However, the custom of lodging single women with families caused confusion among local Chinese, who assumed that one of them was a second wife. In her novel, A.M.D. Dinneen describes how the protagonist, a single woman missionary wished to move into the new premises of the mission’s Girls’ School as she “had been long

\(^{137}\) Hunter, *Gospel of Gentility*, 204.
enough in China to realise how distasteful to Chinese ideas was her residence in the married missionary’s house”.

Hunter further argues that only in contrast to the relations of missionary women with western men does the extraordinary nature of their relationship with Chinese men come into focus. Missionary observance of chaperoning decorum back home seemed to suggest that different rules applied when missionary women were traveling with Chinese evangelists and barrowmen, or when they remained at stations with male servants. These rules were based on the widely shared assumption that Chinese men did not pose sexual threats to western women. In other words, Chinese men were not seen as quite as men, or viewed as relatively asexual. This could be part of the reason why Chinese Christian leaders could never be given the same prestige that western missionaries received. Rather, they were called colporteurs, “native helpers”, church assistants, personal teachers, mission school teachers, preachers, and evangelists in missionary discourse. Very few were given the title “pastors”, let alone that of “Reverend”. When men’s roles were more diversified, “Bible women” was the only paid position for Chinese Christian women, just as deaconess was the only recognised office for western women in the Church.

Women missionaries in China, in this sense, were somehow mirroring the value of the deaconess in Christendom. In New Zealand city missions, a deaconess could go into homes where a minister would not be welcome, while in China, it was only possible for a women missionary, instead of an ordained man, to “penetrate” a Chinese household or zenana. In New Zealand, the distinctive uniform gave a deaconess, like the woman Salvation Army officer, the impunity to go into a perilous situation that was denied other women. In China, the foreignness of women missionaries also gave them the freedom to perform acts that were not only impermissible for Chinese women, but also often quite unimaginable for their New

138 Dinneen, Not of Gennesareth, 47.
139 Hunter, Gospel of Gentility, 213.
Zealand sisters. Consequently, while western men could only reach Chinese men, western women, especially single women stationed in isolated places, could reach both men and women, and thus developed a more comprehensive understanding of the Chinese household.

Though many have recognised that the CIM was revolutionary in granting women, especially single women, an equal standing in frontier evangelistic work from its founding days, very few would realize that single women had a special role that was unmatched by single men or even married couples in the CIM. Against a backdrop of cross-cultural understanding, or rather, misunderstanding, of gender and ethnicity as described above, the CIM creatively used women missionaries as the western spiritual mentor for the national church to encourage Chinese men to take up leadership roles and to confide their problems. Jane Blakeley and Florence Young were assigned to the Guangxin River, which was known in the CIM system as “a field for women”, from the mid-1880s. It was a deliberate strategy for the CIM founder and subsequent leaders to appoint single women in sole charge of these mission stations. The reason was simply that the Chinese Christians would defer decisions about church development and management to western men if they were around. However, the patriarchal Chinese culture made the Chinese Christians much less likely to assume woman missionaries would take charge of church business. As it was, the missionary women, while presenting no threat to male Chinese authority, provided a handy source of knowledge, wisdom and guidance whenever needed. Moreover, the women’s focus on the world of women made a collegiate relationship with the Chinese pastors easier than their male counterparts.140 By the time that Blakeley and Young arrived on the scene, the Guangxin valley had gathered no less than 30 single women workers, heading 12 mission stations.141 One of the

140 Griffiths, Not Less Than Everything, 117, 132, 322.
141 They were: Anren (安仁), Pogan (珀玕), Guixi (贵溪), Shangqing (上清), Yiyang (弋阳), Hekou (河口), Shixi (石溪), Huangjinglin (黄荆林), Yangkou (洋口), Guangfeng (广丰), Yushan (玉山), Shenkeng (深坑) (CIM Prayer Directory, 1894, 8-9).
informants to this study confirmed that even in the late 1920s, it was still possible for a single woman, not a single man, to head a mission station in the CIM system:

Mum and Dad married because Dad wanted his own mission station. He didn’t want to work under an older single woman. But the Mission would not let single men have a mission station on their own.

Though denominational missions were more cautious about women assuming leadership in ecclesiastic issues, they were less worried about women missionaries supervising Chinese staff in teaching and medical institutes. While nursing was an exclusive female vocation in the West, many mission hospitals had a staff of male nurses. Missionary matrons, when given the responsibility of overseeing a hospital in the absence of European doctor, would be in charge of Chinese doctors. The Protestant enterprise in China put on a show that was unimaginable in western Christendom, in which missionary matrons oversaw Chinese male nurses, missionary headmistresses oversaw Chinese male teachers, and lady missionaries oversaw Chinese pastors and evangelists.

No matter how powerful missionary women appeared in the eyes of the Chinese colleagues and Christians, sexual inequality had its lingering effect within the hierarchy of the missionary community. When woman missionaries left the mission frontier and retired to the back-stage of mission administration, they were bound by the policy of the parent boards concerning representation and voting in the field councils which did not favour women. According to Hunter, the American missionary community was very conservative in respect of female representation.

---

142 Interview conducted by the researcher, July 2010, name undisclosed.
143 For example, the CMS Hospital in Hangchow had a fair number of male nurses. In 1903, 12 out of the 33 baptism candidates were male nurse, while 3 were female nurses and 6 were midwifery students (Gregory, Stretching out Continually, 51).
The Methodist conferences barred those who were not ordained and thus automatically barred women who were ineligible for ordination.\(^{144}\) Methodist women maintained a separate women’s conference until at least 1927, only participating in a consulting capacity in the governance of the general community, which was restricted to ordained ministers. The Congregationalist board in 1888 granted women neither the right to vote nor the right to speak at their station meetings. By 1894, the ABCFM had decided that women in the field should have a voice, but only “in consideration of questions touching their own work”, a policy which remained in effect until the 1920s. A major source of inequalities in the field lay within the structure of the home church. The Presbyterian denominations denied lay women privileges at home until at least 1927, a restriction that also limited the participation of women in the church polity in China.

The New Zealand case was not much better. Guy argues that although the church was active in the leadership of early New Zealand feminism, including the suffragist movement, it was slow in giving women the right of full participation in church courts and conferences. The Canterbury Anglican Synod rejected motions in 1897 and 1900 to give women the right to vote in parish meetings, as did the triennial National Synod in 1898. While the progressive Canterbury Baptist Association had female representation in 1892, the Baptist Union of New Zealand rejected the possibility of women delegates in both 1892 and 1896, finally agreeing to female representation in 1908.\(^{145}\)

In the mission field, the PCNZ Constitution stipulated that wives of missionaries were only associate members, “uniting with their husbands in desire and purpose to further the Kingdom of Christ in China, but without vote”.\(^{146}\) When a prospective

\(^{144}\) Hunter, *Gospel of Gentility*, 84.  
^{146}\) Constitution of the Canton Villages Mission of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, 1.
missionary doctor (Dr. Loan) was engaged to a women doctor (Dr Eunice Janet McLean), the PCNZ field council finally agreed to revise the clause in the Constitution as “wives of missionaries shall be members of Council in full status”. This women candidate, with unusual determination for her time, wrote to the FMC to demand a “separate appointment” to the mission hospital as she believed that “her profession must take first place” even after she had been given the status of “a missionary in full standing”. As the most senior staff member of the Mission and probably one generation older than her, Herbert Davies simply reiterated that “as the wife of Dr. Loan she will be able to get all the opportunities of practicing her profession that her particular circumstances from time to time will make possible”, and that “a full time appointment from the Committee” and “the conditions of married life” would only make it unhappily incompatible at times for her to fulfill her engagement.

The CIM story provides an interesting variation. In 1922, the directors and superintendents in the China field raised the concern that the extensive work undertaken by the women was not represented at the top administrative levels in the Mission. Though 16 women members attended the first National Christian Conference of China in 1922, they were denied representation in the China Council, the mission’s highest and most representative decision-making body, as well as the Home Councils. When the General Director D. E. Hoste invited the three Home Councils to share their views on inviting women onto the China Council, the North American Council opposed, the London Council agreed, while the Australasian council prevaricated, willing to allow the China Council to proceed as long as the principle was not extended to home councils. Ironically, the response of the

147 Minutes of annual meeting of Council held at Kong Chuen, April 9, 1941, SCM, Council minutes, 1936-1941, M16/1/3.
149 Quoted in Lois Michell, “Leading Women: the Development of the Leadership Role of Women in Protestant Mission with Special Reference to the China Inland Mission/Overseas
women members themselves also tended to support the status quo. Of those women members evacuated to Shanghai, 61 were opposed to the idea of having women on the China Council, 12 were neutral and only 10 in favour.\textsuperscript{150} In an era when male headship and female subordination were seen as an integral part of Biblical teaching, a heated debate dividing modernism and fundamentalism, the restructuring of gender hierarchy became much less flexible after the 1920s when the fundamentalist-modernist controversy entered its height.\textsuperscript{151}

One informant, a pastor himself, made the point explicitly when talking about his missionary mother:

I think in an odd sort of way, mum, having been the youngest daughter, had a sense of equality in China that she didn’t have with her family. In some ways, being a missionary in China gave mum more standing.\textsuperscript{152}

What Bridges said about Robin Hyde could be equally said about missionary women from New Zealand:
[The idea of China] had become a construct to which Hyde’s predicament as a woman and a writer could be related. To this imagined culture based on her reading she attached some of her own hunger for understanding and acknowledgement … she viewed that other cultural tradition as supportive of her identity and preoccupations in a way that the cultural milieu she herself inhabited was not.153

When the Religion and Church People Working Group of the Dictionary of New Zealand Biography pondered the names of who should be considered into the Dictionary, it did not take them very long to discover that the most capable women made their reputation overseas as missionaries.154 This discovery is also true in the context of this study. Among the mission women whose previous occupation had been that of domestic helper, Annie James (PCNZ) became a legendary name in New Zealand and received the MBE at Government House. Among those dressmakers, Sarah Hardisty (CIM) was in charge of the women’s class of annual Bible schools in coastal China.155 Among the nurses, Kathleen Hall (SPG) became a legendary name in China and was the only New Zealand missionary whose biography has been published in Chinese.156 Among the women doctors, Phyllis Haddow (NZCMS) became Deputy Superintendent of “the largest mission hospital in the world” in the

155 Other dressmakers included Margaret Evans (later Mrs. Trevor Gibbs), and Grace McGregor (later Robert Sinclair Hamilton).
156 In 2006, the researcher translated five biographies of New Zealand missionaries into Chinese and had them published as appendices to a book (Yi Wen 亦文, “Appendix I: Niuxilan nv chuanjiaoshi liezhuan” 纽西兰女传教士列传 [Biographies of New Zealand Women Missionaries], and “Appendix II: Gebi guying” 戈壁孤鹰 [A Lone Eagle in Gobi] in Xishuo xuanjiaoshi 《戏说宣教士》[A Collection of Short Plays of the Lives of China Missionaries], 208-273, Taipei: Cosmiccare Book 宇宙光, 2006).
midst of war. Among the teachers, Stella Purchas (NZCMS) became the Financial Secretary for one of the most long-standing Protestant missions, administering allowances for 200 missionaries from four Commonwealth countries serving in five different regions across the entire China field, discussing business in a number of intermission committees, including the “Associated Mission Treasurers”, the NCC of China, the Christian Literature Society, and the BFBS, as the only official CMS representative in Shanghai.

Both Chinese bachelors and “Kiwi” spinsters were a threat to the gendered culture of New Zealand, the former having gone through much cruelty and discrimination in New Zealand, while the later enjoyed a greater degree of freedom and privileges in China than back home. The distance between China and the colonial chauvinism helped “Kiwi” women to escape the bondage of western sexual conventions in the mission field. Instead of acknowledging the limitation and frustration faced by Christian women in New Zealand, discourses of mission recruitment always stressed the plight of Chinese women. Ironically, the call to break into the Oriental “women’s sphere” also sounded as a call to escape from the colonial domestic cage in the South Seas. The missionary movement, a movement spreading across the two countries, was a liberating movement for both Chinese and “Kiwi” women. If the lack of career opportunities and prejudice and discrimination against women even in some of the more prestigious occupations had contributed as a “push factor” for the large number of women who offered for overseas mission, the opportunity to stretch one’s talent in a distant land, as reported back and modeled by veteran missionary women, would be a “pull factor” for aspiring Christian women. The development of the notion of “housewife” at the turn of the 19th Century New Zealand was ironically getting closer to the notion of “women of zenana” in Near and Far East. While industrialisation and urbanisation had led to an increasing association of waged work with men and unpaid domestic and voluntary work with women in the west,

157 That is, the CMS Hospital in Hangchow (Gregory, Stretching out Continually, 87).
“zenana” had also became a special missionary variety which recruited only women from the west to “liberate” their sisters in Asia. Only a glance at the social conditions of women in the West would reveal the fact that the cross-cultural differences between the “civilised” and the “heathen” were more superficial than real. Women missionary work involved in zenanas which resembled sex-segregated service professions such as teaching or nursing in the modern West.

### 4.7. Romance and Marriage

The role of missionary was probably one of the few occupations within which private matters such as romance and marriage were closely monitored and regulated by both the mission boards and the host country. In contrast to Catholic celibacy, marriage and family are important part of Protestant identity. For clergy and missionaries, family signifies legitimacy and contributes to sanity. In its early colonial days, when New Zealand was still largely a “man’s country” and a “mission field”, only the missionaries were expected to bring their wives. The reasons for sending missionary wives, or rather, married missionaries, were manifold: the presence of a wife signified to the indigenous people that the missionary had a peaceful intent; a wife could reduce her husband’s temptation to sexual philandering, provide a role model of femininity and domesticity, complement (not compete with) men’s missionary activities, be a helpmeet to her husband, and create a pious Christian home by bearing and rearing children. Such a long list leads the reader to conclude that more was expected of the wives than of their missionary husbands. In the Aotearoa mission field, the intention of reproducing an English family home was for the CMS home to be the centre of a model village in order to attract Maori from their pagan surroundings to this paragon of English virtue. It was believed that “if Maori ‘girls’ could follow the evangelical domestic purity and piety exhibited by the missionaries, then conversion would be the natural next step”.

When New Zealand changed into a “mission home-base”, the same pattern was repeated with the missionaries they sent overseas. As a generalisation, missionary men were encouraged to be married, before or not too long after they arrived in a field. Expectations for women missionaries were much more ambivalent. On the one hand, the cult of domesticity expected that all women would eventually become wives and mothers. On the other hand, the mission board, having paid for the cost of training and sending of their female candidates, wanted to make the most out of them for the longest period possible. The very reason that Bishop Wilson objected “on principle” to sending single women to foreign missions in 1830, was “the almost certainty of [those women] marrying within a month of their arrival”.\(^{159}\) Even when denominational mission boards opened their doors to woman candidates, it was a common practice for single women, but not single men, to sign an undertaking not to marry within three or five years, since “marrying-out” of a young trained worker was considered as a loss to the mission, as expressed in the phrase “loss by marriage”. One SPG Committee member went so far as to suggest that it should be impressed on men missionaries that they should not “propose to the girls”. The problem was still under discussion in the 1930s when the general ruling was that, “Marriage severs the connection of a missionary unless she is appointed as an Associated Worker by the Bishop of the Diocese”.\(^{160}\)

As a result, nearly all missionary men eventually married. The CIM variation was that missionary candidates must defer marriage until they had been in China for at least two years, and had passed the first two of the prescribed language examinations. Those who were assigned to the more distant and isolated regions of Sinkiang (Xinjiang) and the Tibetan border, presumably men, were warned to be prepared to


maintain an initial period of celibacy for five years.\textsuperscript{161} Each of those CIM candidates who were engaged or married at the time of application had to go through the same screening procedure of discerning suitability on his/her own right. The CIM also stressed “the desirability of a period of acclimatization” before marriage for women probationers, perhaps in reference to implications related to child-bearing.\textsuperscript{162} All married women were viewed as “a missionary in active service”.\textsuperscript{163} Once they were in China, they had to observe the Chinese cultural taboos regarding bodily movements of social mingling between sexes such as no hugging and no holding-hands in public.

The mission statistics show consistently that there had almost always been twice as many single women as single men on the mission field. The China field was no exception. As Table 14 shows, out of the Sexagenary Cycle, women outnumbered men in the CIM Australasian parties. Over a 35 year period the same number of both sexes sailed in 8 years, and men outnumbered women only in 13 years. The natural chance for a man to choose a spouse was much greater than that of women.

\textsuperscript{161} "Wanted," \textit{The Reaper} (NZBTI), (August 1929): 129.
\textsuperscript{162} Field Manual of the China Inland Mission, 6.
\textsuperscript{163} Ibid., 21.
Table 14: Number of Male and Female Missionaries Sailed from Australasia Each Year with the CIM, 1890-1949.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>M.</th>
<th>F.</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>M.</th>
<th>F.</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>M.</th>
<th>F.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1890</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1910</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1930</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1911</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1931</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1892</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1912</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1932</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1893</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1913</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1933</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1894</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1914</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1934</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1895</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1915</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1935</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1896</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1916</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1936</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1897</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1917</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1937</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1898</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1918</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1938</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1899</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1919</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1939</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1900</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1920</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1940</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1921</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1941</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1902</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1922</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1942</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1903</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1923</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1943</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1904</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1924</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1944</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1905</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1925</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1945</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1906</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1926</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1946</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1907</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1927</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1947</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1908</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1928</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1948</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1909</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1929</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1949</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


A narrow circle of eligible acquaintances, an unbalanced gender ratio within the missionary community, and infrequent opportunities for mixed social occasions, all
contributed to precipitous marriage arrangements. The summer resorts and post-offices were two spaces where romances were likely to develop.\textsuperscript{164} However, as one missionary letter confided:

There are thirty-three of us here [in summer resort] now: seven married couples with nine children, nine single ladies, and one single man! There is one more single man expected, we hear, but even at that, I’m afraid there isn’t much hope for us!”\textsuperscript{165}

Consequently, many of those women who did not wish to forsake their missionary career remained single. With basic home-making skills and the help of domestic servants, two unmarried missionary women could live together and make the mission station seemed like a home, while “baching it” was usually a sorry business for bachelors.

In most denominational mission lists, men were categorised according to whether they were \textit{ordained}, women by whether they were \textit{married}. Prospective marriage partners of male missionaries had to be approved by the mission committee. The Manual of PCNZ’s FMC required “satisfactory evidence of the lady’s fitness for the position of missionary’s wife”\textsuperscript{166}. Timing and propriety of missionary marriage was not only to do with efficiency of mission administration, but was also linked to perception back home. When discussing Winnifred Stubbs’ marriage to Dr. Edward Kirk, Alexander Don pointed out to G. H. McNeur that “Knox Church was grievously disappointed because their first “own missionary” became engaged to be married on her way to the Field and had to resign on arrival there”. The underpinning assumption was that “the disabilities consequent upon marriage”

\textsuperscript{164} Williamson, “\textit{Have We No Rights?”} 60.
\textsuperscript{165} Quoted in Williamson, “\textit{Have We No Rights?”} 55.
\textsuperscript{166} Manual of the Foreign Mission Committee of the PCNZ, 1931, 9.
would make it “quite impossible” for her to render the missionary service.\textsuperscript{167} Even after having been in the field for less than two years, Ethel Baker could still clearly feel the “great indignation amongst supporters when a lady missionary gets married after only a short term of service”, when announcing her engagement to a fellow missionary. Almost apologetic, she pleaded to the Mission Committee to trust that her “usefulness as a missionary will be increased, not lessened” as a married woman.\textsuperscript{168}

Despite the emphases on doing things the Chinese way, all of the New Zealand missionaries, including those with the CIM, had a western-style wedding in China. A wedding, wrapped with its rich cultural meanings, were non-negotiablely western. As a ceremony conducted in church, the weddings also had to be in Christian style. In the early 20\textsuperscript{th} Century, to be Christian was to be western. One source indicates that being outside the British Empire, their marriage celebrant had to be either a Bishop of the Church of England or a Consular Official.\textsuperscript{169} Some would have a civil wedding service in the Consulate in addition to a service in a church. The Trinity Cathedral in Shanghai and the Union Church in Hankow had fond memories for many New Zealand missionaries.

Once married, single women missionaries became the “incorporated wives”\textsuperscript{170} to their husbands, who alone were considered “the Missionary proper”. In denominational missions, the “family wage” would go to the wedded men but it was expected that his wife would share the missionary burden.\textsuperscript{171} The Constitution of the

\textsuperscript{168} E. Baker folder, 1909-1910, personnel file, ANG 143/3.00/8, John Kinder Library.
\textsuperscript{170} “The Incorporated Wife” is the name of a book edited by Hilary Callan and Shirley Ardener.
\textsuperscript{171} For example, in his report, Dr. Edward Kirk describes the value of his wife (Winifred M. Kirk nee Stubbs), a trained nurse, in the following words: “even a cursory glance at the list
PCNZ stipulated in 1910 that the individual salary was £130 for single men and £100 for single women. Once a woman worker married, the family wage, starting from £200, went to the married men. An average “housewife” in New Zealand was supposedly only having to do “housework” and taking no “public roles”. In the mission field, even if the wife did exactly what she had done as a single worker, the work of married women would no longer be recognised financially.

At the same time, a good number of New Zealand women remained single right until (or even after) the end of their China years. Single women who had already done an uncommon thing by enlisting for foreign service, were constantly haunted by the possibility that they might not complete a process already begun. Overseas study shows that the use of single women appeared to be a deliberate choice adopted by many mission organisations. Since single women did not need the medical attention constraining the assignments of married men with families, they could staff the most remote stations. In 1919, 13% of all missionary stations in China were entirely staffed by single women. The better known New Zealand women of operations performed will give the reader an impression of her intensive workload as she was responsible for the sterilisation and preparation of the operating theatre, as well as the post-operative nursing” (Dr. Kirk’s report in “Appendix VII: Report of the Foreign Missions Committee,” Proceedings, (1910), 115). Likewise, Mrs. Joseph Ings (Jessie Ings nee Wilson) assisted the doctors and worked in the women’s wards; Mrs. Herbert Davies (Margaret Davies nee Anderson) delivered lectures at Canton Christian College etc. with a focus on hymns and hymnology; Mrs. William Mawson (Sara Margaretta Mawson nee Gordon) did evangelistic work; Mrs. George McNeur (Margaret McNeur nee Sinclair) worked as an assistant missionary in evangelising capacity, itinerating and visiting homes, answering calls for medical help or settling quarrels, as well as taking charge of the girls’ school at Siu Kong, and the Bible women at Shek Tseng.

172 Constitution of the Canton Village Mission of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, 6. As a comparison, the Methodist Mission’s salary scale in 1922 paid £115 for single women, £160 for lay missionaries and £220 for ministers. A married lay missionary received an additional £30 while a married minister received £40 extra. In a sense, the "worth" of the missionary wives was dependent on the value of their husband's job (Daphne N. Beniston, The Call of the Solomons: The New Zealand Methodist Women’s Response (Auckland N.Z.; Wesley Historical Society, 1994), 23-24).
173 Hunter, Gospel of Gentility, 52.
174 Ibid.
missionaries were all spinsters. “Unattached” women, such as Kathleen Hall and Annie James, demonstrated their loyalty to the Chinese community by staying behind in times of war when others evacuated. Mary Moore served in China for a total of 51 years right across times of peace and of turmoil. CIM widows, when assessed and accepted on their right in their initial applications, proved their missionary commitment without the company of their spouses. Mrs. Worley (Jessie Pettit) worked for two more decades after the death of her husband.

4.8. Household Keeping

Maintaining a decent household in the “heathen Cathay” had been an ongoing problem for missionaries. The CIM was very concerned to require missionaries to maintain a simple lifestyle close to that of the local Chinese, but anyone who could afford a wife and several children, had enough to eat, a roofed place to live, and servants to do the chores, was considered by the rural Chinese as “wealthy”. This was probably why, on evacuation from China in 1951, the renamed OMF-CIM pressed for an even simpler lifestyle in the new fields of East Asia.175

Missionaries usually lived in mission compounds of different sizes and varying degrees of comfort. The provision of an “outfit” allowance was used to furnish the living quarter. The PCNZ’s standard allowed the furnishing of two rooms, a bedroom and a sitting room.176 Odd western items frequently slipped into the arena of CIM missionaries’ households and gave away their identity. For example, the lost items during a robbery as claimed by Andrew Wilson included cutlery and silverware.177 When asked by the communist regime what kind of magazines she subscribed to from overseas, Nancy Jansen wrote down *Women’s Weekly* and *National Geographic*.178 Such western items appearing in rural China are no less odd than

175 Bournemouth Conference Report, CIM, 1951, 7.
176 Mawson to Reid, June 10, 1930, CVM, Staff file, Dr. K. A. Pih, 1929-1938, AA10/3, PCNZ Archive.
that of an iPad appearing on-stage where a historical drama dating back in the Han Dynasty was unfolding.

Missionaries expected and were expected by others to lead a life of self-sacrifice. However, the use of domestic servants by missionaries seemed to be a most contradictory practice to both “back-stage” audience in New Zealand and to “front-stage” audience in China. Most New Zealanders had not employed servants back home; a few even worked as a domestic themselves. On arriving in China, they found well-established traditions for hiring servants. New Zealand missionaries took on servants partly because everyone had servants. On the other hand, rural China was a labour-intensive society, and thus the employment of extra hands was an inevitable adaptation to circumstance. The regular number of domestic staff was between two to three, a cook, a houseboy/waterman, and an amah/nanny. The headquarter compound in Shanghai and Chefoo school rested on an even more extensive system of servants. Though the availability of servants meant that housekeeping responsibilities were often managerial rather than immediate, there were frequent complaints by women missionaries, especially wives, that training servants was more troublesome than doing the chores themselves. In Ella’s letter to her mother, she often moaned about the “problems” of servants:

You know food in a land like this is too serious a matter to leave too much in the hands of servants. This summer we are eating a lot of cold vegetable salads and they are so delicious but do take such a lot of my time to prepare as I never leave that to the cook.179

…in spite of the servants doing quite well there are so many little things I do not dare to trust to them. All the raw food I prepare myself and then cool in down the well in bottles but it does take a lot

\(^{179}\) Anderson to her mother, July 10, 1933.
Women overcoming fears and gaining confidence in their ability to manage Chinese servants tended to depict the Chinese as a naturally compliant and servile race. Jean McNeur described the Chinese, as both native helpers in China and immigrant workers in New Zealand, as “admirable domestic servants, being easily trained, deft, willing and faithful to their employers”. The missionaries also formed a common impression that the Chinese were wonderful imitators, copying exactly or mindlessly. The “burning toast” story was a shared experience among expatriate households:

There is one story that I like: they [two bachelor missionaries] showed him [servant] how to make toast for breakfast. They burned the toast, and they scraped it. Every morning after that, he would burn the toast, and scrape it. Just copying exactly!

Another theme that constantly occurs in missionary literature was the lack of privacy, more strongly felt by women than by men. Attracting unwanted attention and lacking personal life is a shared feature for both actors/actresses and missionaries. For women not accustomed to sharing domestic duties and home intimacy with strangers, the presence of servants was an uncomfortable burden.

**4.9. Child-Bearing and Child-Rearing: the Parents’ Perspective**

Like romance and marriage, child-bearing is another area of bodily discipline regulated by mission organisations. Apart from reproducing a Christian household, another social function for missionary wives was to bear and rear children and demonstrate Christian parenthood. Nonetheless, new missionaries were not

---

180 Anderson to her mother, September 4, 1933.
182 Margaret Moore, interviewed by the researcher, August 19, 2010.
encouraged to have children too soon. The imminent arrival of children was seen to hinder language studies and evangelistic work.

Bearing children had specific complications and risks in a mission field. In CIM’s Health Manual, women were advised to train for labour “as seriously as men train for a race”.\(^{183}\) In New Zealand, the infant survival rate had improved from 87.4% for boys and 89.3% for girls in 1891 to 96.3% and 97.5% respectively in 1946.\(^{184}\) The infant mortality rate for the missionary community in China, a country thought to be “plagued with an enervating climate and a plethora of virulent diseases”, was surprisingly similar. Brotchie painstakingly worked out that one out of ten missionary children born by Australian CIM couples between 1894 and 1940 died in infancy (i.e. 27 out of 276).\(^{185}\) Losing one’s children was a traumatic experience, losing them in a foreign land accentuated the trauma. Reginald Sturt lost his two wives at childbirth, and two of his children died in China. The Johnstons returned back to New Zealand to deliver birth, taking the risk of dismissal.\(^{186}\) The Millers resigned from their missionary career when their only remaining daughter became seriously ill after the death of another child. Miscarriages were probably even more frequent but rarely talked about. While contraception was a total taboo in missionary correspondence, contemplating public work and family life simultaneously might have amounted to a theory of vocational birth control. Restraint or abstinence seemed to be implicitly expected by some mission management, which considered excessive family size to be ill-advised.

Nearly all missionaries had their children delivered in a mission hospital while on the field. Missionary children were natural ice-breakers between the missionary

\(^{183}\) Health Manual for Missionaries in China, 59.
\(^{185}\) Brotchie, “The Importance of the Contribution of Australians,” 230.
\(^{186}\) Various correspondence, Gansu China 1946-1950, Exodus report 1951, OMF IHQ, AR5.1.4, Box 1.6.
parents and the host community. Despite CIM’s indigenous dress code, missionary families usually wrapped their infants in western clothing. The Chinese neighbours also seemed to coddle the “foreign dolls”. At times of childbirth, husbands were the linchpins of the domestic work unit. The care of new infants temporarily marshalled young husbands in female routines which extended well beyond the realm of diversion, recreation, or comfortable home ritual. The complex task of raising children in China consumed both the time and the imaginations of missionary mothers. Although the CIM policy required its member to take special care that “family claims do not interfere unduly with the service of either parent”, efforts to subordinate family to work often failed, sometimes leaving only a token time to fulfill their responsibilities. Jean McNeur’s description of her marriage life as “Mrs. Moore” portrays a typical house-mother insulated by a compound wall: since the duration of the war was uncertain, the three missionary wives, all at the productive age, “embarked on” producing families. Missionary mothers often lamented the social isolation and cultural deprivation of their children. In her letter to her mother, Ella Anderson asked for Little Tots annual, Tiddley, Chatterbox, puzzles and hymn books to be sent:

We can’t get hymn records in Shanghai. Strange to say so shall have to send to England…. It seems extravagant in a way to have these things but our little people are cut off from so very much that children at home have all the time.

CIM parents tended to encourage their children to play with Chinese children, as there were no white children within miles. A Chinese amah was soon hired to take care of the babies and toddlers. Some did it with ambivalence and reluctance. When children began to speak, missionary parents were often alarmed at the hybridity in

---

189 Anderson to her mother, July 10, 1933.
their speech:

The other day I was trying to find out the trouble and Gladys admitted that she had scratched Ruth so I asked who did it first and Gladys said, “Me do she and she do me”. I never heard such a mixture of grammar as Gladys uses. We think learning two languages may have something to do with it.\textsuperscript{190}

Compared with linguistic confusion, spiritual affiliation was a more serious issue for missionary families. Hunter acutely points out that the conflict between the two “imaginative enterprises” of evangelisation and of childcare expected of missionary women were at times cross-purposes. A Christian mother who was preoccupied with isolating her children from “moral contamination” was invariably compromising her ability to “decontaminate” the heathen host.\textsuperscript{191} Parental attempts to raise their children as Christians in a Chinese setting while at the same time trying to maintain some continuity of the New Zealand identity was no easy goal and could be self-defeating for missionary families.

\textbf{4.10. Childhood in a Missionary Setting: the Children's Perspective}

Missionary children were born into the host culture. Like the second generation Chinese immigrants in New Zealand, missionary children grasped the local mannerisms and dialects more quickly than their parents. For those who grew up in a big mission compound, the amahs and servants were often their only connection with the Chinese world. Children of the Chinese neighbours and church workers were often their only playmates in isolated mission posts. When being asked “did you feel safe among the Chinese” in the interview, the responses given are invariably positive. China had a lasting impression in the mind and life of missionary children.

\textsuperscript{190} Anderson to her mother, September 4, 1933.
\textsuperscript{191} Hunter, \textit{Gospel of Gentility}, 126.
They saw themselves as part of the local community, even though the physical distinctions marked them out and made them the centre of attention. One recalled:

It was taken for granted that we were known [by everybody]. People who came to town would be brought to see us. You just accepted that. That was the way it was.192

Much of their recallable childhood memory centred on the Chefoo experience.193 The Chefoo School was founded by the CIM, modeled after the British boarding school up to secondary level. It was based in the Chefoo peninsula, and later moved to the CIM Headquarters in Shanghai and then to Kuling, the site for summer retreat. “Travelling three days to go to school and not seeing parents for a year” was a common experience for missionary children. According to Semple, Chefoo School was a social space imbued with the racial, class and gender paradoxes of the CIM.194 It could be added that since children from other mission societies were often sent there, the Chefoo experience could be generalised to non-CIM missionary children of New Zealand parents.

First, as an educational institute established by a Mission in the territory of China emphasising identification with the host culture, the most peculiar paradox of the Chefoo School was the homogeneity of colour. On the one hand, the CIM required all missionary children to attend the centralised Mission School,195 rather than mission schools for local Christians. On the other hand, neither Chinese nor children of interracial marriage could attend Chefoo School.196 No attempt was ever made to

---

192 Murray Beck, interviewed by the researcher, November 23, 2011.
193 For detailed discussion on “total institution” such as Chefoo school, see Erving Goffman, Asylums: Essays on the Social Situation of Mental Patients and other Inmates (New York: Doubleday Anchor, 1961).
194 See discussions in Semple, “‘The Conversion and Highest Welfare of Each Pupil’”.
196 In 1903, when a European eman whose wife was Eurasian asking for the admission of his children to Chefoo School, the China Council’s response was “It was not thought desirable to entertain the prospect” (China Papers, April 2, 1903, quoted in Semple, “‘The
integrate missionary children into Chinese schools, let alone Chinese students into western schooling in China. Started as one facet of the mission’s commitment to China as an in-house solution to expatriate education, and as a means to foster a corporate identity of “children of the Mission”, Chefoo excluded non-whites. For children who grew up in the big denominational mission compound, going to Chefoo was about leaving one insularity and entering another. For children of faith missions, while the parents endeavoured to break the barriers by living amongst the Chinese, the children were sent to a segregated world to prevent them “growing up in a no-man’s land of mission interface”. It must have been puzzling for the Chinese children to find their western playmates disappearing around the age of six, only to see them once a year afterwards, or less frequently during times of turmoil, with a diminishing ability to speak the local dialect.

The monoculturalism of Chefoo education was a logical consequence of its mono-racialism, and was most evident in its language of instruction. The educational apartheid was accentuated by a prohibition against speaking Chinese on the premise despite the fact that most of the students were born in China and had acquainted with at least some forms of the vernacular. The CIM leadership once sent out a letter to all parents of children approaching school age to ensure that their children could speak English by the time they came to Chefoo. Children arriving at the School at the turn of the Century recalled being caned for speaking Chinese. An alumna of a later generation remembered that they were not encouraged to speak to the Chinese servants, who cooked, cleaned, carried, mended and plaited her hair as well as pulled the punkah to cool the dining room during the summer months. Chefoo only began to teach Chinese in 1917 when the Shanghai Chamber of Commerce provided

Conversion and Highest Welfare of Each Pupil,” 50 and endnote 55).

Semple, “‘The Conversion and Highest Welfare of Each Pupil,’45.


Murray Beck, interviewed by the researcher, November 23, 2011.

Semple, “‘The Conversion and Highest Welfare of Each Pupil,’” 45.

Moore, Daughter of China, 23.
a scholarship for boys studying the language.\textsuperscript{202} It was not until the 1930s that all students studied the Chinese language and culture.\textsuperscript{203} However, the Chinese curriculum was still disproportionately outweighed by the English curricula so most students had lost their linguistic skills as teenagers. Many grew up to regret the omission and attempted to re-grasp it as adults. Yet, on the other side of the hemisphere, New Zealanders had been accusing the Chinese immigrants, whether as gold-miners or international students, of “sticking together”, being “inward looking” and “not assimilating”. While reviewing Sino-NZ relations in 1992, Watt marvelled at the fact that although the Chinese language had been spoken in New Zealand for only two decades or so less than English had been introduced as the official language, modern standard Chinese was being taught in only four high schools and was not an examinable foreign language at either School Certificate or Bursary examinations, while Indonesian and Greek are.\textsuperscript{204} Back in the early 20th Century, the irrationality seemed even more acute when Mandarin was not taught as a subject in a school located in China and when the parents of the students all had spent two years learning the same language as adults.

In addition to linguistic monopoly, the eurocentrism of Chefoo schooling was also about adoration of the western cultural heritage. One informant recalls the story-telling evenings of the Chefoo life:

\begin{quote}
\textbf{Informant}: “This is the intriguing thing about it. It was such an English school that on Sunday nights, us little ones would be sat down, Mr. Martin would tell us stories. All the stories would be the myths and legends of Greek and Rome. Would you believe that? –
\end{quote}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{202} \textit{China Council Minutes}, December 12, 1917, quoted in Semple, “‘The Conversion and Highest Welfare of Each Pupil’,” 45.
\end{flushright}
Because he was the Classics graduate from Oxford or Cambridge. It just occurred to me, you made me think about it, that why didn’t they tell us the legends of China where we were. . . .”

**Researcher:** “Were these Greek and Roman myths not considered pagan?”

**Informant:** “That was the bizarre thing! I would ask the question if I was faced with Mr. Martin now: You tell me all these pagan stories but you are not going to tell me the Chinese stories. Being missionaries, they saw the Chinese culture and myths as pagan. . . .But, you sitting in the middle of China and you are teaching European children Greek and Roman pagan stories. Somehow it was ok.”

Second, Chefoo School was not just an English school, it was a middle-class English school. Semple saw the development of Chefoo School as a reflection of the ambiguities within the CIM, a Mission Society that was struggling to locate itself both within the sending culture and in the host context: the CIM not only mirrored western society as it became increasingly professional, it also mirrored the expatriate society in its desire to ensure the cultural purity of its children. Yet, at the same time, the CIM endeavoured to protect its staff and their offspring from secular and liberal influences of the home countries. Started off as a school providing basic education, Chefoo’s shift to matriculation for entry into British universities in 1907 was a signal for emulating a more genteel form of Christian witness: sitting Oxford entrance examinations and wearing Eton collars. Gradually, Chefoo reunions in Shanghai in the first half of the 20th Century became elegant black-tie affairs. Although the rank and file member of the CIM were primarily from a working class

---

205 Murray Beck, interviewed by the researcher, November 23, 2011.
206 Semple, “‘The Conversion and Highest Welfare of Each Pupil’,” 35.
207 Ibid., 32.
209 Ibid., 50.
background, Chefoo provided an educational means through which the second
generation could step decisively into a class above their roots back home. By the
time that children of New Zealand parents began to come to Chefoo School, the
School had completed its “upward mobility” transition in terms of buildings,
administration, teaching staff and teaching methods. Increasingly referred to as “the
best school east of Suez”, Chefoo Schooling began to perpetuate feelings of British
privilege through an educational socialisation process that reproduces British class
structure. However, neither the New Zealand colonial egalitarianism nor the simple
lifestyle of a village mission station prepared New Zealand children for the
institutionalised British middle-class boarding school. For some, the Chefoo
experience was more alienating than the “polluting” Chinese culture. One informant
recalls:

I have real difficulty facing school, dealing with the after-math of
Chefoo School. It wasn’t altogether a happy experience for me. I just
couldn’t face it. I just walked away from it all. It has just been
relatively later on in my life that I can actually talk about it. … In
one sense, it was just the way it was, it was never questioned. But I
suffered dreadfully from homesickness. The message that I took from
that homesickness was that I was weak…. I found the hard discipline
of a British model boarding school scary. I have to really struggle to
find positive memory of Chefoo. The people meant well, did well,
they were people of their time. That was what school meant.”

Third, memories of Chefoo School were often gendered. Chefoo was a gendered
memory in a dual sense. The fact that the children, instead of homeschooling or
returning to their home countries with mothers, were ending up in a Mission School
in China was a constant reminder that the purpose of this schooling arrangement was

---

210 Murray Beck, interviewed by the researcher, November 23, 2011.
to free their mothers to work. The establishment and maintenance of Chefoo School was a logical outcome resulting from a Mission that considered married women to be missionary workers in their own right, and expected them to share an equal load of evangelisation. Moreover, the sexual segregation and gendered discourses of the English world were reproduced in Chefoo. The Chefoo dormitories were named after missionary heroes: the boys’ houses were named after Livingstone, Carey and Paton, while the girls’ houses were correspondingly Carmichael, Judson and Slessor. Though outdoor activities were required for both sexes, boys were encouraged to play competitive team sports that took on a militarised tone, stressing a form of muscular Christianity, while the emphasis for girls was more on lifestyle sports such as swimming, hiking, boating, and guiding movement.211 As one of the earliest Missions calling single women to enter missionary vocation, the social ideal of girls’ education in the CIM system was contradictory. On the one hand, Chefoo School taught educational programmes grounded in the domestic sciences, preparing girls for lives as wives and mothers; on the other hand, Chefoo advocated teaching girls to think, “to learn independence and self-help”.212 Semple saw the competition between these alternative ideals as a reflection of the “pedagogical schizophrenia of belief” regarding female education in the British world.213

On the positive side, Chefoo was the platform where missionary kids of New Zealand parentages were socialised as international citizens, meeting with western children of other backgrounds, including those from diplomatic and merchant families, whom they would otherwise never have met. If the Headquarters and the language schools were the “contact zone” for missionaries of all corners of the Christendom, Chefoo School was a meeting place for missionary children coming from all sorts of national backgrounds as well as all parts of the China field. It is the

---

211 Semple, “’The Conversion and Highest Welfare of Each Pupil’,” 43.
space where they were simultaneously exposed to the affluence of the rising America and the aboriginality of Lisuland. In other words, the Chefoo experience was about a novel sense of multi-faceted proximity. Thus “Chefusian” became a “shared identity” for many missionary children irrespective of their mission affiliation and nationalities, so well depicted in the Chefoo hymn:

Far from our homes in wild Yunnan,
In Szechuan or in Hu,
From brigand-fested old Honan,
And far off Kansuh, too.
Across the wide plain of Sian,
We flock into Chefoo!

We travel all the ways we can
Except perhaps canoe.
Raft, litter, cart, or luggage van,
Most anything will do.
Train, motor, steamer and sampan
All help to reach Chefoo.

Our lives here, quite a lengthy span,
Are limited in view.
To us it’s more important than
London and New York too!
Really, we don’t see how you can
Be asking, “Where’s Chefoo?”

Though small upon the map, you scan

214 Lisuland was one of the CIM remote mission station located in the mountainous region of Yunnan province.
The spot that marks Chefoo,
Within the heart of many a man
And many a woman too,
It’s larger in proportion than
A Continent or two.

And when we reach life’s Rubicon
And take a backward view,
There’ll be few memories that can
Outshine those of Chefoo!

On the negative side, Chefoo was a highly controlled space, by rules and regulations, and if necessary, by physical discipline. In the missionary era when evangelisation of China was seen as the highest goal, the cost of familial separation was not sufficiently acknowledged. What began as a better alternative to sending children back to home countries gradually became somehow an “iron-clad rule”.215 Chefoo children had to learn to become emotionally independent from a very young age. David Howie216 recalled that their weekly letters home were read by the teachers to ensure that no overt expression of homesickness was included. Since the admission of being upset would prevent their parents from “doing God’s work”, it was “regarded as a sin”.217 The irony of the Chefoo School lay in the formation of a community that was achieved at the cost of the family. Chefoo was the same place where a child of the Brethren mission on the Mongolian Border could meet with another child of the Presbyterian mission from rural Canton while the Taylor siblings had to be separated:

When we were there, the school was divided into junior school, girl

---

216 Hallam and Mary Howie’s (CIM) eldest son.
217 E. Margaret Howie, "David Tennyson Howie" (unpublished manuscript, 1998), 13.
school and boy school for dormitory purposes. ... the girls to play with the girls and boys to play with the boys. We had meals separately, most of the time. The only time we were expected to get together as a family was the time we walked from the school to the local church. I didn’t really have a lot of contact with my brothers as brothers. … my youngest brother felt particularly lonely at school. He was only six when he went. He was in junior school while the older brother was in boy’s school, so the three of us were in different places of the school. It wasn’t felt as a family.218

Homesickness was a common experience for Chefoo children, especially those whose parents were located in distant provinces. The CIM management only allowed these children to go home for a holiday not exceeding three months every three years.219 One informant remembers the occasion when he was assigned to another family for Christmas:

I can still remember sitting in a class, and the teacher saying, “these are the children who are going to different families for Christmas.” I sat there wondering why if God provided for everything, I couldn’t go home?220

Chefoo children who stayed in China during the Pacific War and the post-war period experienced being vagabonds as the school was constantly relocating, first on the Chefoo peninsula, then to Temple Hill north of the city, and then at the “Courtyard of the Happy Way” in Weihsien. Both were American Presbyterian compounds made into Prisoner of War internment camps. When the war was over, since the original campus premises were left as a shell after the Japanese occupation, so an emergency

218 Dr. Phyllis Carlton, interview by the researcher, August 2, 2010.
220 Murray Beck, interviewed by the researcher, November 23, 2011.
school was set up on the CIM Headquarters in Shanghai. Before long, the children were on the move again to the sites of the American School in Kuling.

### 4.11. Conclusion

Training a new missionary was as time-consuming as training an opera apprentice. Their first term was quickly diminishing as missionaries struggled to remember the Chinese names, theirs as well as others, to develop a meaningful conversation in the local dialect, to nurture an appetite for Chinese food, to manage bodily movements in Chinese dress, to distinguish Chinese men from Chinese women and at the same time reluctantly to accept the local perception of western women being less feminine, to become accustomed to the local modes of transportation while itinerating in the countryside and to the local household while taking residence, to educate illiterate Chinese in the Chinese characters they themselves had become recently acquainted with, to witness or even experience the deadly consequences of tropical diseases for which they had no immunity, to pass language exams in order to marry and to have family, and to master a houseful of servants. Missionary life often meant different stages of changes and adaptation. By the time the missionaries became skilled in forming the right impression in the eyes of the Chinese audience, it was almost time for them to take furlough home. It might be the first time for the China-born children to see their passport country. Would the children belong to the same world of their parents? What was awaiting them on the “back-stage” in New Zealand? Had they been in the mission field for so long that they might no longer remember how to function back home? Or would they be alienated by the changes to their New Zealand back-stage during their absence? This is what the next chapter will turn to.
Chapter V: The Interludes - Furlough

In my Aunt’s days, operatic acting was an all-year-round job. Every now and again throughout a show, usually during an interlude, she could retire to the back-stage to catch her breath but she was expected to return to the front-stage when her turn came. There were a few occasions when my Aunt took short breaks from active performance. Those were often the time she retired to recover from illnesses and to reflect on her career. Every time she resumed stage life after these breaks, she was refreshed with new ideas.¹ The season of missionary life was surprisingly similar. Scheduled furloughs functioned as the “interludes” in the missionary drama. Whether they were in active front-line evangelism, being in China all year long was enough justification for a well-earned break. Every five to seven years, instead of the temporary back-stage sojourn of summer retreats, missionaries could expect to retire to the semi-permanent back-stage of their homeland. The theory behind this practice was that they could be physically and spiritually refreshed for future work. Most expected to resume field work, but a few were never able to return.......

According to CIM’s Furlough Manual, the purpose of furlough was to remove the missionary to a space “away from the pressure of heathen darkness, away from the burden of a trying climate, away from the strain of difficult languages, in a place where people understand you, love you, and will help you.”² Like anything else associated with a missionary career, furlough was a regulated experience. The frequency and length varied from Mission to Mission. For the CIM, missionaries were only eligible for their first furlough when they qualified for their Senior

¹ In 1942, after six months of rest in her village home, she started a full-scale reform project, what could be called the “professionalization of the Yue Opera”. In 1947, after another six months’ rest, my Aunt allied with nine other actresses to launch a series of fund-raising performances for the vision of a theatre building that was independent of opera dealers. They became known as the “Ten Sisters of the Yue Opera”.
² Furlough Manual by Australia CIM/OMF, (October 1955), 1.
Certificate, and when they had finished a seven year term.\textsuperscript{3} The PCNZ provided an 18 month’s furlough after the first term of five and a half year, followed by subsequent terms lasting six and a half year.\textsuperscript{4}

A scheduled event was thought to be routine with no surprises, yet there were many unexpected interludes. “Ill health” was a commonly cited reason for earlier furloughs. The CIM’s Health Manual listed 33 “special diseases and accidents” that were widespread in China, plus six variations.\textsuperscript{5} The risk of being infected with contagious diseases (e.g. malaria, cholera) was higher in China than back home. Missionaries were constantly living under the shadow of illness and death. Women were more likely to admit to a “nervous break-down”, what is known today as “burn-out” or “stress”, than most men, and thus were considered “weaker” workers as a group. “Ill health” was sometimes used as a more diplomatic cover-up for some less expressible reasons for resignation or dismissal from the missionary community.

Accidents also could lead to an unexpected interlude.\textsuperscript{6} The period during which most New Zealanders were in China was the most turbulent era in modern Chinese history. Their missionary terms were often interrupted by forced withdrawal, internment and captivity. Captivity was not an uncommon experience for missionaries. In 1930 alone, it was estimated that there were 25 China missionaries held by Communist groups.\textsuperscript{7} These dramatic experiences had added to the extraordinariness of missionary life. Blanche Tobin was taken captive by bandits when proceeding from Canton to her station at Guilin in 1928. Her interlude of deprivation and terror lasted 44 days. In comparison, Arnolis Hayman’s captivity with his Swiss colleague Alfred Bosshardt lasted 413 days\textsuperscript{8} and attracted more

\textsuperscript{3} Field Manual of the China Inland Mission (CIM, 1947), 27.
\textsuperscript{4} Constitution of the Canton Villages Mission of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, (1910?), 5.
\textsuperscript{5} Health Manuel for Missionaries in China, (CIM, 1937).
\textsuperscript{6} For example, John Beck took an earlier furlough to repair his knee cap.
\textsuperscript{7} “Chinese Reds Free Two American Women,” New York Times (Dec 4, 1930), Section 1:11.
\textsuperscript{8} Hayman was released first on November 18, 1935 and Bosshardt on April 12, 1936 after a
international attention. Some had to delay furlough while others were taking an earlier one. During the Pacific War, both those who were interned as Prisoners of War (hereafter POW) by the Japanese and those who remained in free China were denied outward access home.

5.1. Interludes during Furloughs

Furlough, similar to the first sailing, was a change of time and space. It was about going back to the old world. When missionaries disappeared from the eyes of their Chinese neighbours, they re-appeared in front of the home congregations. Even when the missionaries had physically retired to the “back-stage” of the “home-base”, their activities and mentalities were still very much tied to the mission field in China. Furlough was considered home time, but not necessarily resting time, and was far from idle. After a couple of months’ recuperation, every missionary was expected to carry out deputation work. Deputation work served an important function of promotion and fund-raising for interdenominational mission societies. The variety of speaking engagements included “a brief word to the open session of a Sunday School; a little story for the primary children; a testimony to the Bible class; a Sunday morning message; a young people’s meeting; an opening in a public school; an evening service; a ‘spot’ on the radio; five or ten minutes in a missionary conference”.

Denominational missions took a similar approach to deputation. Knowing too well that the work in China was dependent on the fellowship maintained back home, the PCNZ Foreign Mission Committee saw deputation journeying in New Zealand was just as necessary as evangelisation travelling in China. During McNeur’s furlough in 1907/1908, for example, he had given missionary addresses in 122 meetings (58 total of 560 days of captivity.

10 FMC Secretary to McNeur, March 16, 1934, CVM, Staff files, Rev. G. H. McNeur, 1934-1935, AA10/5/2, PCNZ Archive.
in Sunday services, 32 in week-night meetings, 13 in Bible Class, 11 in Chinese gatherings, and 5 in PWMU meetings, etc.) with an accumulated total of attendance of 15,033. The size of the audience ranged from six to 600.\textsuperscript{11} When he was on furlough in 1922, SPG missionary Rev. S. Crichton McDouall gave 147 talks within six months across five dioceses. As a result of his promotion of the work in China, 19 applicants offered themselves for the North China field, from whom he selected four candidates including the later well-known missionary nurse Kathleen Hall.\textsuperscript{12}

The effect of deputation often dependent on on the skill of the presenter. A common fallacy perceived by the home audience was that a missionary who was able to perform deputation was equally capable, if not better, to perform missionary tasks in the field. In one letter, the FMC Secretary made his private complaint about a woman missionary to McNeur that “she is no more fitted to be a public speaker than I am to be a public singer”.\textsuperscript{13} However, men and women of unassuming manner, who came across as timid or sheepish to western eyes, might appear much more approachable and acceptable to the Chinese among whom they lived and worked.

Besides deputation, the missionaries were also investing in things and skills that were useful in China or for the benefits of the Chinese people. Much was expected of medical missionaries in this regard: to update their knowledge of current medical practices, and to source medical equipment and supplies for the mission hospitals. For doctors, it was often about undertaking a course in tropical disease;\textsuperscript{14} for nurses,

\textsuperscript{11} "Missionary addresses delivered during furlough 1907-1908," CVM, Staff files, Rev. G. H. McNeur, 1899-1915, AA10/4/5, PCNZ Archive.
\textsuperscript{13} FMC Secretary to McNeur, September 3, 1917, CVM, Staff files, Rev. G. H. McNeur, 1916-1919, AA10/4/6, PCNZ Archive.
\textsuperscript{14} For example, Dr. Kathleen Pih took a postgraduate course in ophthalmology at Moorfields Eye Hospital in London during her first furlough, and gained her DOMS in 1937. Dr. Phyllis Haddow took a special course of tropical medicine in Townsville (Queensland) while on furlough in 1928 (\textit{the Reaper} (NZABM), (Dec 14 1928): 5).
to complement their nursing skills with midwifery and post-natal knowledge\footnote{For example, Kathleen Hall took a refresher course at St. Helen's Hospital in Auckland to "rub up" her skills in her 1934 furlough (McGregor, \textit{Shrewd Sanctity}, 57). Annie James enrolled as a trainee in Forth Street Hospital in her 1915 furlough, completed the four-month Karitane nursing course in her 1922 furlough, and took a two-months' course in Child Welfare at the Children's Hospital in Melbourne on her way back to China in 1928 (Rita Snowden, \textit{Never a Dull Moment} (Christchurch, N.Z.: Presbyterian Bookroom,1948), 62, 90). Violet Bargrove also spent some time at the Karitane Hospital in Dunedin (\textit{the Reaper}, NZABM), (Dec 14 1928):5).}. To this end, for example, Dr. Phyllis Haddow collected a wide range of gifts of hospital requisites, surgical instruments, and bandages for the Hangchow CMS Hospital. The amount was so substantial that the CMS secretary wrote to the Chinese Consulate for an exemption of import duty to China.\footnote{Wang Feng (Chinese Consul) to Goldsmith, September 10 and October 8, 1935, Dr. Phyllis Haddow’s file, personnel file, ANG 143/3.00/53, John Kinder Library.} The constant flow of gifts filled 53 packing cases for Annie James, ranging from a refrigerator, doses of the then new medicine, penicillin, as well as homely blankets, bedcovers, and needle-and-cotton.\footnote{Snowden, \textit{Never a Dull Moment}, 201.}

The China-oriented mentality was also reflected in other aspects of missionaries on furlough. One informant recalls the purchasing behavior of his father during his prolonged furlough:

Dad spent all the time purchasing stuff [army surplus], things that he thought would be valuable and useful on his mission station in China. My mother had a brother who was a carpenter, he got him making some nice wooden boxes that we could pack stuff in them. Saddles and clothing, wet weather gear [oiled cotton] for the people in the area. For years, they sat out in the garage. Things like saddles and riding boots could be no use to him in New Zealand ever because we didn’t live in a farm, and didn’t have any access to horses. But in that part of China, that was really the only method of transport. Dad sold them eventually, but between five to ten years he had them. He really
wanted to go back to China and he expected to go back to China.\textsuperscript{18}

In the context of an operatic play, interludes are meant to be short and refreshing. So it was with furlough. However, there were many exceptions to these rules. For some, it became a drawn-out or even a permanent experience. A common experience was for missionaries to postpone their return to the field due to turmoil in China. Most of them kept their commitment to the China field and took on temporary jobs such as interim pastors, relieving teachers, shift nurses, or even labouring work. For example, Trevor Litherland worked as the YMCA’s Assistant Secretary and several interim pastorates during the lingering time of World War II (1939 – 1946). Netta Yansen, the Australian member of the PCNZ, worked as a “casual supply” under the Home Missions Committee of the NSW Presbyterian Church.\textsuperscript{19} Her colleague Alice Cook’s furlough took a more varied route: she was a deaconess in Palmerston North for a year, then among the Chinese in Wellington for a couple more years, and then travelled to help the PCNZ Punjab Mission in India, a place geographically close to China, her desired “front-stage”, so that she could return to Canton as soon as the war ended.

When China finally closed, the waiting came to a final end. What had been meant to be a temporary vacation became a permanent normality. A true actor/actress would never bear the thought of staying in the back-stage for too long. It was an equally hard thing for the China-bound missionaries to drop the “furlough outlook” and settle permanently in their home country. The previous interviewee continues to recall his father’s experience:

\ldots as soon as the war was over, he got a job in insurance. But he didn’t have his heart in it. He didn’t do any of the exams to climb the

\textsuperscript{18} David Taylor, interview by the researcher, July 21, 2010.
\textsuperscript{19} Letter to Yansen, April 20, 1942 and June 10, 1943, CVM, Staff files, A.N.Yansen, 1938-1953, AA11/21, PCNZ Archive.
ladder. He just stayed in the lower rung. He was a lawyer before he went away but he didn’t want to go [back to the law profession]. They hoped for a long time to go back to China but they were unable.  

Besides external constraints, there were also “personal reasons” for prolonged furloughs. New Zealand was not only a place for the China missionaries to report who they had become, but also a place to remind them who they were, especially for the women. Hunter observed that caring for ailing members of the family was the responsibility of women in general and single women in particular. Whatever independence they displayed in forsaking home for a life of overseas service was only conditional, to be revoked in case of family need. It was just as common for women missionaries, especially the unmarried and the widowed, to be held back home to take care of aging parents as women applicants withdraw their applications for foreign services because of “family duties”. Ethel Baker’s application to the CMS had to be withdrawn in order to provide for and support her mother who was experiencing a difficult illness and was unwilling to release her. The apologetic tone of Ethel’s letter conveyed her regret in laying down the opportunity to serve overseas. It was only after her mother had passed away that she swiftly submitted a new application to the same mission. In a similar but slightly different circumstance, one of the pulling factors for Margaret Reid in bringing her adopted daughter, Pih Zhen-Wah, into New Zealand was the failing health of her father. While responsible for her ailing mother between 1941 and 1948, Kathleen Hall confided to her brother in a letter:

20 The Taylor siblings, interviewed by the researcher, July 21, 2010.
22 E. Baker folder, 1904-1906, personnel file, ANG 143/3.8/, John Kinder Library.
I am sorry I have been so long writing. I am afraid it is the deadening effect of having only the company of these old people that makes me so dilatory in thoughts and action. My days seem to drift by with nothing accomplished.24

The woman biographer, Rae McGregor, sensed that at the age of 52, this missionary nurse felt she was losing her identity as well as her confidence in her medical skills.25 She even speculates that “Kathleen’s sadness over the death of her mother was tempered slightly with a guilty feeling of release”.26

If caring for elderly family members was seen as a responsibility of spinsters, starting a family was seen as a rightful duty for missionary wives. The Becks opted to take an extended furlough for three years so the wife could bear children in New Zealand.27

While meeting the requirement of the mission boards and carrying out activities and duties expected of them as a “missionary on furlough”, the returnees came back to New Zealand only to find that they were somehow no longer New Zealanders per se, through what is known today as “reverse cultural shock”.28 Surely in the operatic trade, it was the actors/actresses who put on a show on the stage, but over time the stage life also had a lasting impact on the players. Likewise, the missionaries probably never realised what China had moulded them into, until they returned to New Zealand.

Several factors contributed to the irony of feeling alienated, misunderstood and

26 Ibid., 107.
27 Murray Beck, interviewed by the researcher, November 23, 2011.
28 For detailed discussions, see: Craig Storti, *The Art of Coming Home* (Yarmouth, Me., Intercultural Press, 1997).
lonely while surrounded by “loved ones” during their time of furlough. Lack of attention appears to be one of the first effects the missionaries noticed. In China, their foreign appearance made them the centre of attention, although it was not always the kind of attention they desired. Any ordinary New Zealander could attract crowds of hundreds or even thousands by simply looking foreign. The discomfort of being different was clearly felt and markedly remembered, but their evangelical ethos prevented them from consciously revelling in the pleasure of being conspicuous. Their foreignness disappeared once they landed in New Zealand. They became “homely” back in their home country. In other words, they became nobody. They lost the stage and the kind of following that “the Pied Piper might have envied”.29

In her biographical account, Rae McGregor speculates on Kathleen Hall’s feeling on her first furlough in these terms. Though this does not seem to be based on any private memoir, the description would still find an echo in many missionaries’ hearts:

After the danger and tumult of China, coming back to the structured New Zealand society in 1927 was difficult. Even with the delight to seeing her mother she was once again relegated to being just a younger daughter. The status which she had achieved in China meant nothing within the family even though they were all pleased to have her home. Her experiences were interesting for a short time and then the importance of daily life over-rode anything she had done while she was away. Kathleen, never a person to push her opinions or ideas forward, retreated into the eddy of family relationships.30

Datedness appears to have been another feeling that troubled the missionaries. Dress was a particular concern. The CIM Furlough Manual required all missionaries to

30 McGregor, Shrewd Sanctity, 45.
ensure that their general appearance is “in good taste and befitting a missionary of the cross whose life is dedicated to holy purposes.”\textsuperscript{31} At home as well as on the field, a woman’s dress style was not just her own responsibility, but also an obligation she owed to her sex. Although Hunter suggests that “it is one of the privileges of missionaries to be old-fashioned and not to know it”,\textsuperscript{32} many women were caught between the embarrassment of dated dress and the guilt of spending supporters’ money on clothing. Jean Moore (nee McNeur) recalled her mother’s dilemma on one furlough:

…my mother had bought a sorely needed new coat in winter sales, useful too in the Canton climate which could be bitterly cold in winter when the north monsoon was blowing. …When Mother was leaving to catch the train from Dunedin for a week’s deputation work, she was wearing her shabby old coat which looked terrible, and though my aunt and I begged her to change it, she was adamant. ‘I can’t wear a new coat when poor people are giving their sixpences for the missionary cause,’ she argued, and that was that!\textsuperscript{33}

Next, the physical demands of travelling were a common experience during furlough time. For those stationed in inland villages, getting out of China meant many days of overland travelling before they could catch a ship at a port city. During the time of the Pacific War and Civil War, it meant that some had to escape by the back door of free China to India. The last leg of travelling to New Zealand often meant a stop-over, and sometimes a prolonged wait in Australia or Singapore. For the Duncans, the home trip included a flight in a DC3\textsuperscript{34} from their mission station to

\textsuperscript{31} Furlough Manual by Australia CIMOMF, 6.
\textsuperscript{34} Douglas DC3 was an American fixed-wing propeller-driven airliner, which had its lasting impact on the airline industry and World War II. The speed and range of this aircraft
Chengdu (成都), followed by an ambulance to the US base and then a VIP’s DC3 to Kunming (昆明). Their plane to Calcutta, India, was a four-engine one with bucket seats. It stopped in Burma at Myitkyina for tea. After giving birth to their son, the Duncans travelled from Calcutta to Ceylon, to Perth, and then to Sydney. After being stranded in Sydney for three months, they were finally given priority to sail on the Wahine to New Zealand.35

Jean Moore’s escape from war-torn China was even more fractured, especially given that most of her trans-national journeying was done with three children and without a male escort. She left the Kukong Mission Compound on the last through train to Kweilin, being met by a BAAG open truck. The next leg of their journey was provided by US military aircraft. On arriving in Kunming, they were driven in an ammunition carrier. Once committed to leaving Kunming for India, Jean and six missionary children (hers and three others) flew across the “Hump”, the mountainous region of occupied Burma, in a British RAF Dakota to Calcutta, refuelling at Dinjan in Assam. Only days later, they boarded a train for Dehra Dun in the United Provinces, took a bus to a hill station called Mussoorie, and found their way to Landour. Her husband joined them there and then left again for business after two years of temporary settlement there. Jean received a movement order from the Station Staff Officer to proceed to Calcutta to join a ship for Australia. She took a long and tedious journey by train from Ambalu to Calcutta, only to be told that they had been booked on a ship sailing from Bombay. This meant another train journey across India. The sea voyage to Sydney via Melbourne was a more pleasant journey by comparison, and was followed by a Catalina aircraft in Rose Bay, across the Tasman Sea to Auckland. There followed another flight in an air force Dakota to Christchurch. The last stage of the journey was by train to Dunedin. While living in the family house, Jean still had to make two excursions to visit friends, one to

revolutionized air transport in the 1930s.

Balclutha and the other to Central Otago. It was only nine months later before she left for Wellington to board a ship for Hong Kong again to join her husband.\textsuperscript{36}

In the midst of dangers and delays, the generally high social status of western missionaries of the era also brought them convenience and privileges. The Duncan family was given priority to return home in Cabin Number 2 as a result of the persuasion of the Right Honorable Adam Hamilton\textsuperscript{37} and the Honorable Fred Jones\textsuperscript{38} to the Prime Minister’s secretary.\textsuperscript{39} Jean Moore was able to board with seats which were reserved by the British military.\textsuperscript{40}

The condition of the family sometimes made the interlude more dramatic, or even traumatic. William Anderson recalled his trip home with his wife Ella who was diagnosed with a “nervous breakdown”; when he booked the tickets for all the family for the first time, he was told that Ella could not travel without a registered nurse. Ella’s sister, a registered nurse, travelled all the way to Shanghai to accompany her. Then they were told by the British Consul that New Zealand would not allow Ella into the country in her condition. William had to contact a supporter who was an MP to obtain clearance. When he booked passages for the third time and took down the luggage on the wharf, the Captain refused to take Ella unless there were two registered nurses, one for day and one for night. It was Christmas Eve 1934 and the ship was to depart the next morning. The CIM doctor phoned the Mission Hospital for advice and an Australian nurse was asked to take an early furlough with less than 12 hours’ notice. She spent that Christmas Eve packing so that the six of them could board the ship at 10am on Christmas Day.\textsuperscript{41}

\textsuperscript{36} Moore, \textit{Daughter of China}, 78-93.
\textsuperscript{37} Hamilton (1880 – 1952) was the Leader of the Opposition and Member of the War Cabinet at the time.
\textsuperscript{38} Jones (1884 – 1966) was the Minister of Defence at the time.
\textsuperscript{39} Butcher, “In Pleasant Places,” 22.
\textsuperscript{40} Moore, \textit{Daughter of China}, 78.
\textsuperscript{41} Gladys Nancekivell, “Ella’s Life Story” (Private publication, 2009?), 11-12.
The missionaries would have one more disappointment when they finally arrived home – there was no place that they could actually call “home”. Many, especially the spinsters, had to stay in the different households of their parents, siblings, or other relatives who happened to have room to accommodate them. The Mawsons had to share the home with a sister who had five children. The Committee’s correspondent lamented that “Eight children, representing two families, in one house when a man and his wife are on furlough, must be nearly as restful as going to live in a Chinese bazaar”.42 The CIM members in the 1930s sometimes stayed in the Mission Home in Remuera, which might be felt like a modified “Mission Compound” or dormitory, where they had to share facilities with a constant flow of missionaries or candidates. A few would move into rental properties, but probably soon realised that they had to move on for one reason or another. Having to delay her furlough for her husband’s sake,43 Naomi Grant (nee Grey) took her first furlough after nine full years in China, which proved to involve a constant state of moving about rather than being a restful break. Though longing to see her family in New Zealand, she had to spend some time in Australia first, meeting with her husband’s relatives. After this, the family sailed for Wellington to stay with the wife’s sister, from there to another sister’s home in Dunedin, they paid a shorter visit to a brother’s farm at Lovell’s Flat and to another brother’s home at Gore, then to another household with three boys in Invercargill, breaking their journey at another sister’s home at Christchurch. By the time they returned to the sister’s home in Wellington again, it was almost time for them to return to the Melbourne CIM home before Christmas and to be ready to return to China in January. Though there were many more homes willing to host them, none could be called their own.44

43 Naomi Grey arrived in the field two years earlier than Don Grant, but if they were to take furlough together, she had to wait until her husband had completed the first term of seven years.
44 Naomi Grant, “Memoirs of M. Naomi Grant” (unpublished manuscript, undated), 113-117.
For married couples, the husbands were expected to assume deputation duties shortly after their arrival. The intensity of the deputation itinerary was no less than that of itinerant village work in China. The only difference was that more time was spent on speaking engagements than travelling. Wives soon realised that they saw less of their husbands when on furlough than when they were in the field. They would most certainly miss the provision of “summer retreat” when they could enjoy the company of their husband for at least a whole month. From beginning to end, the leisurely and carefree impression commonly held about a “missionary on furlough” was largely illusory.

For women missionaries, especially the wives, the unavailability of domestic helpers on furlough was acutely felt. Second generation missionary women who grew up in collective settings such as mission compounds, mission houses and mission schools, had to be domesticated for the first time. Many found the demands of the household chores of nuclear families in a modern western world almost impossible. Some had to learn from scratch. Many were constrained by the domestic world. Even those who managed to keep on top of the housework would find that there was not as much public space available for them as there was in China. While their husband and other male colleagues were frequently invited to speak from the pulpit, they would only be invited to lady’s groups to give an “informal and friendly account” of their life in China. Missionary nurses such as Kathleen Hall were only able to speak at Mother’s Union, PWMU, and the Nurse’s Association, with occasional invitations from Bible classes and special missionary services. In an era when no woman had formal ecclesiastical authority in the Church, they were not given opportunities to address mixed congregations, let alone perform other clergy duties. Denial of public lives was a constant reminder of who they should be and where they should fit. They were actually home, but it was a homeland that seemed to have become so

45 The New Zealand Baptist (May 1946):142. This phrase was referring to Marjorie Duncan’s speech at Caversham Baptist in March 1946.
46 McGregor, Shrewd Sanctity, 45, 101.
unfamiliar and estranged. Actually, Australasia had not changed much; it was rather that the missionary women had been changed by their China experience. In other words, back home, the women lost their own stage, a stage that was only accessible for western women in the mission field of China. For those who had internalised the liberty of field experience, this gender-based prohibition came across as a shock.

The denial of the right to perform marriages and conduct baptisms by “antiquated males” in the Home Mission Committee of NSW Presbyterian Church caused the PCNZ missionary teacher Netta Yansen to become “hot under the collar”. The PCNZ FMC correspondent sought to comfort her by telling her that “here in New Zealand the only women workers who have the right to baptise and conduct baptismal services are the ordained deaconesses in our Maori Field and they only have that right in regard to their Maori work”. However, having been exposed to the kind of ecclesiastic authority that missionary women were able to exercise in the China Field, Yansen was determined to have her case reviewed by the General Assembly. As a result, she was finally entitled to “exercise all the rights and the privileges ordinarily exercised by Home Missionaries”. The PCNZ FMC correspondent congratulated her for having achieved “a right that is not granted to women in New Zealand”, and later teased her by asking whether the NSW church had made her a Bishop or a Moderator.

For missionary children who had no memory of their parents’ “sending country”, “taking furlough” and “going home” was a strange idea. China was the only home they knew, somewhere between their parents’ mission station and their mission school. New Zealand at its best was only a home away from home. It was where they

48 Ibid.
were going to encounter cultural shock, a mild form of what their parents experienced when they first arrived in China. Perhaps the most noticeable switch over between the China stage and New Zealand stage was the reversed balance between Europeans and Chinese, or quite often, absence of the Chinese. While in China, missionaries seemed to have forgotten their biological appearance and culturally felt at home among the Chinese. Coming to New Zealand, they found themselves a stranger, if not a foreigner, among other Pakehas. In this “home” context, their physical similarities concealed inward differences. One informant recalls:

When I first came to New Zealand, I was about eight years old. We were living with my grandparents. I wasn’t used to being amongst Europeans, all around me. That was the difference I noticed. I was quite shy about interacting with all these people. I wasn’t used to going to shops with only European people serving.\(^{51}\)

To missionary children, their impression of the “High Imperial Era”\(^{52}\) was probably centred on the association between certain bodies and certain spaces, and they sensed universal penetration of Europeans everywhere they travelled, whether China proper, Hong Kong, India, Singapore, Sydney and New Zealand. They had seen subordination of Chinese and Indian in the mission fields, now they were going to be exposed to the consequence of a colonised Aotearoa. Very few China missionary memoirs referred to the Maori scene when talking about “Home time”. To them, New Zealand was, by and large, a sending base where “white Christianity” was the

\(^{51}\) Margaret Moore, interviewed by the researcher, August 19, 2010.

\(^{52}\) For example, in *A History of Christian Missions* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1964), Stephen Neill marks the periodisation as 1858-1914 (pp. 322-396); in *Pax Britannica: the Climax of an Empire* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1979), James Morris thinks "High Imperialism" roughly covers mid-19th Century to first half of 20\(^{th}\) Century (p.23); in *Discourses of Difference: An Analysis of Women's Travel Writing and Colonialism* (London: Routledge, 1991), Sara Mills also believes that between 1850 and 1930, the British Empire was most interested in colonisation of other nations (p.1).
norm. The children might have noticed something different. Would they realise that their clans were late-comers to the land of this so-called “home country”, just as their parents were guests in the mission field of China? Based on the British geography textbooks, these children expected to see the “native inhabitants” and to see them in “native costumes”. One informant recalls such stereotyping of Maoridom through his schooling:

We were down in a very monocultural part of New Zealand. Maori were “not even there” sort of thing. I can still remember being disappointed. We arrived in Auckland. In those years, there weren’t many Maori migrating to the city. I had a mental picture of Maori in skirts from the pictures I saw in New Zealand. But there was this ‘normal-looking’ man walking down the street, dad said, “That person is Maori.” I said, “It cannot be.” …… So New Zealand was a racist country. It wasn’t monocultural, it was racist.53

The pastoral scenery of New Zealand was also a novelty to the missionary kids. Jean Moore was particularly embarrassed at her children’s exclamations at the sight of sheep and cows as they travelled by train through the countryside. By looking Pakeha but reacting like foreigners, they must have been seen by the New Zealand passengers as somewhat subnormal to be excited by commonplace sights.54

Homelessness left its strong mark on the children as it did on the adults, although it was probably manifested in different bodily movements. For school age children, the schooling experience during furlough was usually very disruptive. As an extreme example, one informant remembering going to five different schools in three different countries within a single year when travelling with her parents on furlough:

53 Murray Beck, interview by the researcher, November 23, 2011.
54 Moore, Daughter of China, 91.
It used to annoy my mother and my teacher that I always twisting pencils with my fingers - the nervous tips that people get when under stress. When you think of that – I had been to five different schools in one year, started with the Kuling School, then the Shanghai British School, then the school in Hong Kong, then Auckland Grammar since we first came back and finally Takapuna Grammar. It wasn’t easy for me to adjust.55

The contrasts between the British boarding school of Chefoo and New Zealand public schools were quite evident. To Jean McNeur, the “convent-like atmosphere” of the Chefoo School was poor preparation for existence in a small New Zealand township.56 It took Murray Beck a little while to relax himself in the Ashburton School.57 John Sturt could never forget the embarrassment on his first Sunday at Eden Hall, on which occasion he was dressed in his best outfit – a black coat with pin-striped trousers.58 The message to these missionary kids was eventually picked up as “You’re in New Zealand now, not Britain”, but they were slow to become “Kiwis”.

One of the bodily features that were frequently picked up by the New Zealand audience was their accent. Growing up in an international expatriate school run after the British model, these missionary children were free from a “colonial twang”. Their acquired British accent was often picked up from their teacher and became a model for other children.59 With the increasing Americanisation of the missionary force in China, it was quite common for some kids to mix yankeeism with Britishness. One informant recalls that his aunt said to him later in his life that “Your

55 Phyllis Charlton, interview by the researcher, August 2, 2010.
56 Moore, Daughter of China, 28.
57 Murray Beck, interview by the researcher, November 23, 2011.
59 John Sturt, interview by the researcher, August 1, 2009.
accent was an unusual accent. At times you sounded like an American, and other times you sounded like something else”.

Missionary children also noticed that they had a wider exposure to the world and very limited knowledge or interest about New Zealand than their classmates. They would be teased for being “Chinese”. Even children of preschool age could sense the embodiment of being out of place. One such toddler refused to speak Chinese during furlough time as he felt that “It doesn’t sound right” in the English-speaking surroundings. The parents tended to reinforce their “white” identity rather than their “Chinese” identity. One missionary mother taught her daughter to respond to peer teasing with this analogue: “if a cat has kittens in the oven, they are not biscuits.”

5.2. Interludes at POW Camps

Interludes could take different forms. There were also New Zealanders who had to spend their furlough in internment as POWs with the Japanese. In the first half of the Sino-Japan war, the general rule was that the foreign communities were left alone by both the Chinese and the Japanese as neutral parties. The British flag guaranteed protection. After the eruption of the Pacific War, New Zealanders, as British subjects, suddenly lost their neutrality in China. The missionaries, along with other allied civilians, were sent to the internment camps in Weihsien, Shanghai, Canton and Hong Kong.

Prison is another social space where the discipline of body was highly

---

60 Murray Beck, interview by the researcher, November 23, 2011.
62 Maybeth Roberts, interview by the researcher via e-mail communication, September 27, 2009.
63 For detailed discussion on “total institution” such as POW camps, see Erving Goffman, Asylums: Essays on the Social Situation of Mental Patients and other Inmates (New York: Doubleday Anchor, 1961).
institutionalised. Civil camp was a special variant of prison where human bodies had to be retrained and resocialised. First of all, in these camps, bodily movement was strictly timed. All camps had a daily schedule. The one posed on Chapei’s bulletin board read:

- Getting up 7:30AM
- Breakfast 8:30AM
- Roll Call 9:00AM
- Cleaning of beds and rooms 9:30AM
- Room inspection 10:30AM
- Fatigue 10:45 – 11:30AM
- Lunch 11:30 AM – 1:00PM
- Free Time 1:00 – 5:30 PM
- Dinner 5:30 – 7:00 PM
- Evening Roll Call 8:00 PM
- Lights out 10:00 PM

At first glance it did not appear too demanding. However, there were endless lists of chores to be carried out and queues to endure throughout the day. Since all manual labour in an expatriate’s household was usually borne by Chinese servants in China, many internees, men and women who had had servants to wait on them, cook for them, and drive them about in autos or rickshaw, they struggled to find time – rather than to kill time – to help themselves. For missionaries, internment was, however, in some ways easier. They were used to a more disciplined lifestyle, primitive in living conditions, and lack of entertainment in remote mission stations. For itinerants who

---


had become accustomed to periodic travelling, some found confinement a trial; others, a rest. As shown below, missionaries helped to reinforce the routine of camp life by introducing religious and social activities, adding both variety and regularity to otherwise idle and desultory hours.

Secondly, interned bodies were almost always packed tightly together in civil assembly camps. Space was as scarce as food and time. Most of these camps had twice as many people as they could comfortably accommodate for the entire period of its existence. In early 1942, 1500 people were crammed into Stanley Camp, four people in a cubicle six foot by eight foot, irrespective of sex, and with two toilets for every 150 people.66 In Temple Hill Camp, a transit camp where all Chefoo staff and children spent about 10 months, 450 people of all ages were moved into six former family residences of the American Presbyterian Mission, where most slept on mattresses side by side on the floor with barely a foot between them.67 People in both the male and female dormitories in Weihsien camp resisted requests to move their mattresses merely a few inches, in order to make space for a latecomer to camp.68 Even those missionaries whose western sense of privacy had been constantly invaded by the curiosity of Chinese neighbours in inland stations found the requirement that they lie, wash, dress and undress every minute of the day in “the full blaze of publicity” breathless and unbearable. The missionaries had to sleep and dine with unexpected fellows in novel, often uncomfortable, proximity.

Thirdly, the condensed space of internment camp was occupied by a great variety of European bodies. Although missionaries and missionary children had experienced varying degree of internationalism in language schools, missionary conferences, summer retreats, and Chefoo school, it was by and large a homogeneous community

67 Ibid., 40.
compared with what they were exposed to in a POW camp. A Roman Catholic nun interned in Weihsien, celebrated the diversity of her companions in the following verse:

Preachers, teachers, electricians,
Bankers, brokers, and accountants,
Bakers, barbers, and librarians,
Milliners and coal mine owners,
Tailors, typists, and technicians,
Invalids and giggling flappers,
Shipping clerks and cabaret singers,
Pilots, priests, pelota players,
Widowers and gay grass widows,
Spinster, mistress, and maidens,
Divorcees and spotty schoolboys,
Not forgetting one Rhodes Scholar,
And a lone Olympic champion,69
Doctors, nurses, and one dentist,
Pharmacists and dieticians.70

Missionary wives could be rostered to stir stews side by side with prostitutes while their husbands were probing into the best method of making coalball using cinder and mud in collaboration with sailors and smugglers. What they might find impossible was the challenge to maintain the aura of being a missionary in the eyes of their roommates. As Longdon Gilkey observed, “There had developed in the Far East a chasm of distrust and contempt between merchant and missionary”. The former saw the latter as “loveless, sexless, viceless, disapproving and hypocritical fanatic”, while the latter tended to think of the former as, addictive, exploitative and

69 Referring to Eric Liddell, gold medal winner in the 1924 Paris Olympics.
70 By Sister Beatrice Fleischbein, quoted in Leck, Captives of Empire, 150.
immoral. It might be more of a job to change the opinion of the people of one’s own country than to change that of a Chinese observer. In many camp committees, business executives and missionaries worked together and pooled their expertise, and gradually learned to appreciate each other. The missionaries often found a sense of achievement no less than they found in the evangelisation of China when they finally won the respect of fellow internees with their manual skills when they took their place “no less skillfully in the butcher’s squad than in the Bible class”, that they could also “pave roads, cut hair, stoke fires, run canteens, teach, clean lavatories and prepare meals”.72

Next, the missionary bodies were an indispensable feature of internment camps. In proportion of their number in China, the missionaries, Protestant and Catholic, formed a large contingent in most camps. For example, at the beginning of internment in Chapei, missionaries and their families made up one sixth of the camp; when 67 Roman Catholic clergy were added, the missionary population increased to one fifth of the camp.73 New Zealanders were a tiny minority in the camp (see Table 15).74

---

73 Leck, *Captives of Empire*, 321.
74 According to Table 15, the total number of New Zealand civilians interned in the Far East was only about 80, making up only 0.06% (80 out of 126,145) of the POW population. The same source stipulates that 9,326 (81%) of the British civilian prisoners were interned in China and Hong Kong while the remaining were in other parts of Japanese occupied regions in Asia (Cliff, *Prisoners of the Samurai*, 15). Proportionately, the number of New Zealand internees in China and Hong Kong would be just over sixty (i.e. 81% of 80), the majority of them were missionaries and their family members (see Appendix II).
Table 15: Statistics of Prisoners under the Japanese in World War II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nationalities</th>
<th>Military</th>
<th>Civilian</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>6,038</td>
<td>13,995</td>
<td>20,033</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>28,000</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td>128,000</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>12,000</td>
<td>11,000</td>
<td>23,000</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>792</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>872</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>23,000</td>
<td>870</td>
<td>23,870</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>550</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>750</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>70,380</td>
<td>126,145</td>
<td>196,525</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


By being a large majority in most camps, Protestant missionaries and leaders were able to play a significant role in the religious and social life of the camps. Internal organisation of camp life often rested on the shoulders of this powerful bloc. At the top of the structure was an elected Camp Representative who had to deal with the Japanese Commandant, both vicariously and directly. Under him were the Chairmen of various Committees and Departments. In a large camp these would include General Affairs, Discipline, Labour, Education, Supplies, Quarters, Health, Engineering and Finance. Under this elected council there would be Monitors, each responsible for a row of houses or a large dormitory. Life would have been even more chaotic and miserable without these self-organised camp governments. Missionaries were often found in various offices of charge. The inmates soon came to term with the fact that “You might not like them, but you could not avoid them.”

The missionaries were ubiquitous, from the teaching staff of the school to the medical and nursing staff of the infirmary. Among them there were also efficient and experienced administrators who often formed a common forum to present a united front. They were often trusted appointees to distribute food and to police the kitchen.

75 Cliff, *Prisoners of the Samurai*, 105; Leck, *Captives of Empire*, 244.
76 Leck, *Captives of Empire*, 321.
to prevent stealing and scrounging. A woman’s auxiliary was sometimes formed by lady missionaries with devotional, recreational, and musical programmes, such as a sewing-bee group.

A religious committee was often formed in each camp and made itself responsible for pastoral services and Christian activities. There were as many as twenty-two Protestant denominations in Stanley Camp in Hong Kong who worked together and formed a body to hold joint services. Consequently, the church took a place in daily life similar to what it had occupied in the Middle Ages with no pub, cinema or Sunday outing to compete with it.77

Internment camps were also extraordinary stages where Protestant missionaries seemed to enjoy a much relaxed relationship with the Roman Catholics, Jews, and the Orthodox Church members. They often approached each other to form associations, organise sports and social events in order to keep up the morale of the camp. Catholic and Protestant missionaries, particularly, were willing to tackle unpopular jobs such as cleaning drains or latrines together.78 The Protestant missionaries might find Catholic priests and nuns, as men and women without family commitments, more willing to sacrifice or even to risk their lives for others.79 The church in Weihsien was busy on Sundays, with a Roman Catholic mass early in the morning, an Anglican morning service, and Union Church services in the afternoon. Many who did not care for the formal services would flock to the Sunday evening music gathering where only a short message was preached.80 Likewise, in the Pudong camp, Anglican and Episcopal churches held services in the dining hall, the Roman Catholics held mass in the pump room, and the Jewish community

77 Ibid., 317.
78 For example, Catholic Fathers, Nuns and Protestant missionaries were washing public toilets in the Weihsien camp (David C. McCasland, *Eric Liddell: Pure Gold* (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Discovery House Publishers, 2001), 263).
79 For example, Father Patrick Scanlan, a Trappist priest, acted as the ringleader for a black market for humanitarian motives.
80 Leck, *Captives of Empire*, 317.
observed holy days in the canteen room. In other camps, Protestant clergy were accepted to perform religious rituals for other groups. Since the Russian Orthodox bishop was not allowed into camps for services, Anglican or Episcopalian ministers sometimes volunteered to officiate special celebration of Holy Communion for the Orthodox congregation. When 400 Catholic Fathers and Nuns left the Weihsien camp to be transferred to Beijing, there was a great mixed crowd seeing them off. One group sang “God Bless America” while another “There’ll Always Be an England”.

Lastly, while interned in China by the Japanese, the missionaries probably remained more western than they did for the rest of their lives. The names they gave to the paths in the camps were full of nostalgia and reminiscences: Park Avenue, Sunset Boulevard, and Downing Street. While a typical day’s menu was congee for breakfast, diluted stew for lunch and some leftover in the evening, the exaggerated names they gave to the boring menu was unmistakably western cuisine: veal cordon bleu and medallions of beef. The food parcels provided by various Red Cross auxiliaries were also carefully chosen to cater for the western palate: powdered milk, tinned butter, spam, cheese, chocolate, sugar, coffee, jam, salmon and raisins. The way they maintained their “western taste” in arts, music and drama was characteristically European. The Amateur Dramatic Society in Longhua Camp produced Shakespeare’s Macbeth and Twelfth Night; in Weihsian Camp, Shaw’s Androcles and the Lion; in Stanley Camp, John Masefield’s Good Friday and Midsummer Night’s Dream, Noel Coward’s Private Lives and The Housemaster, J. B. Priestley’s Laburnum Grove and White Cliffs of Dover. Although Chinese and

---

81 Ibid., 318.
82 Ibid., 319.
83 McCasland, Eric Liddell, 262.
84 Ibid., 260.
85 Ibid., 260.
86 Cliff, Prisoners of the Samurai, 100.
87 J. Fee, Happy Landings (Nelson and Knox: Belfast), 90; Gilkey, Shantung Compound, 70; B. Bream, p.48, quoted in Cliff, Prisoners of the Samurai, 107.
Japanese were taught in optional classes, the formal educational emphasis was still around English and French. The curriculum of the children continued to be staunchly British for Chefoo school children, who sat three years of Oxford Matriculation Exemption. Likewise, in the Stanley Camp the school held two sets of examinations for submission to the London Matriculation Board.\(^{88}\)

An interlude is meant to be a short period, whether spent in home country or in internment camps, something between parts of a larger stage production. The missionaries were expecting and were expected to eventually return to their field. They did not realise how much they had become attached to China and its people until they had been separated from it. It is perhaps ironic then that China was anything but a pleasant place to be in the 1940s, despite famine, ill-health, war and the trauma of enforced evacuation. While most resumed their places on the “front-stage” of the mission, some never made it, and a few entered into eternity during what was supposed to be a temporary arrangement.\(^{89}\) Even those who did make their way back to the mission station never realised that the final end was very close to hand.

---

\(^{88}\) Cliff, *Prisoners of the Samurai*, 106.

\(^{89}\) The sudden death of Dr. Tennie Howie during furlough was an unexpected end to his missionary career.
Chapter VI: Exeunt – the Permanent Withdrawal

From late 1940s, my Aunt attracted unsolicited attention from the Nationalist Government by adapting the work of leftist writers to the stage.¹ In Aug 1946, a mob threw a bag of night soil on her, followed by a series of blackmails, enclosed with bullets and reference to eau forte, implying disfiguration and death. It was later shown that her name was down in the blacklist to be assassinated. Despite various warnings and intimidations, my Aunt decided to stay in Shanghai instead of fleeing to the British colony of Hong Kong. On 24 May 1949, her friends and family felt it was no longer safe for her to return to her apartment to sleep. However, Shanghai was “liberated” overnight and her life turned over a new leaf. Communist liberation meant different things to different people. What pulled my Aunt to stay, pushed the missionaries to leave. But with similar determination, both stuck around and waited for the final resolution of their fate.

The Sino-Japan War, followed by the Civil War, catastrophic as war could be, ironically brought favourable changes to the outlook of the Chinese sojourners in New Zealand, the missionaries in China, as well as the Chinese Communist Party (hereafter CCP). For Chinese immigrants, their fate in New Zealand was altered by what went on in China, through the medium of China missionaries. Shortly after Japanese soldiers overran the Pearl River estuary in Canton in 1939, the homeland of the majority of New Zealand Chinese, 249 wives and 244 dependent children of Chinese men residing in New Zealand, were granted temporary permits of two years to come as war refugees as the result of PCNZ’s pleading. Each family had to pay a 200 pound bond, and the wives had to promise to leave with their children, including any who were born in New Zealand, as soon as the war was over. When VJ Day was

¹ This refers to the play Ama Xiang-Lin (祥林嫂) adapted from Luxun’s (鲁迅) novel Benediction (zhufu 《祝福》).
well past, the Chinese community became unsettled and anxious, as it seemed possible that the New Zealand Government might exercise its right to deport the refugee women and children. The Presbytery of Dunedin was approached via the Chinese Church Session with the proposal that the government should be lobbied to review the pre-war arrangements. After World War II, general public opinion towards the Chinese had softened and warmed as a result of the experiences of a common war against the same enemy. It was in such a post-war climate of generosity and goodwill that the Labour Government granted permanent residence to the Chinese refugee wives and children, together with students who had been in the country for over five years. A total of 1,323 Chinese obtained permanent residence in this manner, ending the “bachelor image” of the Chinese community in New Zealand. As one New Zealand born fruiterer confided in the 1970s, China’s sorrow had become its emigrants’ salvation.\(^2\) However, fear of Asian Communist expansion eventually developed as a feature of New Zealand security objectives, as addressed in a departmental paper in August 1949, in which it was argued that New Zealand must protect itself from Asian racial expansion and Communist aggression.\(^3\) In fear that a communist China would lead to a communist Asia, which in turn would liquidate western interests and influence in the region, the statement presented non-recognition arguments, based on the belief that recognition could lead to the growth of communism among Chinese residents in Australasia and its South Pacific Island Trust territories, leaving New Zealand and Australia precariously isolated in the South Pacific.

The fate of New Zealand missionaries in China was also altered by what went on in New Zealand, through its colonial connection with Mother England in the Pacific

---


War. Though the overall number of missionaries had dropped from its peak in mid-1930s, their relationship with the Chinese people had significantly improved when the mission property became the asylum for war refugees and when their services as “neutral third party” were often the only medical and humanitarian provision covering a war-stricken area. After the eruption of the Pacific War, civil-mission relations were further enhanced when most English-speaking countries became the allies of the Chinese nation. Those who managed to flee to and carry on in Free China continued to provide humanitarian and religious services to the locals and the refugees, shouldering the same hardship and deprivations. Those who were interned in various POW camps under Japanese rule also had to rely on Chinese acquaintances for food, medicine, and information.

During the same period, the CCP multiplied its numbers and power, especially its military component. In my Aunt’s day it was a common practice for theatre owners to pick and choose between different opera circuses. One form of performing arts could replace another over a matter of years if it lost the favour of the theatre owner or when the theatre changed hands. The CCP, raised as the new owner of the Theatre of the China field, simply decided that the missionary drama was out of tone with its atheistic and nationalist propaganda. After a short period of peaceful coexistence (a time of honeymoon in certain areas), the eruption of another war, the Korea War, triggered the end of the missionary drama in communist China.

---

4 The total number of Protestant missionaries was 8250 in 1935, which dropped to 6059 within a year. During Pacific War, there were about 1000 American missionaries working in free China. (Gu Changsheng 顾长声. Chuanjiaoshi yu jindai Zhongguo《传教士与近代中国》[Missionaries and Modern China] (Shanghai: Shanghai Renmin Pub., 上海人民出版社, 1991), 306-367.

5 For example, Chan-Ho May-Yun, a Chinese pastor’s wife, recalled how she disguised herself as a hotel service woman and helped her missionary friends interned in the New Asia Hotel in Hong Kong, through the connivance of her Christian friend who owned the Hotel (Manying Ip, “The Story of Chan-Ho May-yun,” Home Away From Home: Life Stories of Chinese Women in New Zealand (Auckland, N.Z.: 1990), 147). Other European reminiscences also recalled how they managed to operate a black-market and exchange news with Chinese contacts and Chinese coolies (see David C. McCasland, Eric Liddell: Pure Gold (Discovery House Publishers, 2001), 261-262; David Michell, A Boy’s War (Singapore: OMF, 1988), 91-95).
6.1. The Change of Tune

One has to read between the lines and dig into the chronology to come to the conclusion that during the decade prior to the Cultural Revolution when traditional operatic play came to a complete end, my Aunt had been denied many opportunities to perform new roles as a result of the politics game. The frustration and disorientation brought by such deprivation was hardly mentioned in published biographies, but was no secret to us as family members. Once again I see the parallel in this estrangement from one’s traditional role with what the missionaries had experienced in post-war China. Before navigating the withdrawal of New Zealand missionaries in China, it would be useful to give a general review of the changing role of foreign missionaries in the ever changing China.

In a report dated 15th Oct. 1949, a fortnight after the birth of the People’s Republic of China, Paddy Jansen presented a lengthy comparison of the mission-church relations in pre-war and post-war China. Returning to his field after several years of internment, he noticed that the church he left behind had become independent. They were not only less reliant on his counsel, but probably preferred to run the church affairs without his interference. In his animated expression, the contrast went:

The missionary of earlier days ... was free to exercise, unhindered, all his talents of organisation, energy and purpose. The missionary of today often feels like a blooded hound straining to be after the hare but held back by a dozen leashes of propriety and regard for Chinese preference.6

Jansen also attempted to look at the situation from a Chinese perspective and speculated that the Chinese leaders, while they had accepted “the privilege of being

---

host to the missionaries”, “felt hesitant about ordering around people who, so recently, were themselves directing things”.

Having lived in China long enough, Jansen tended to attribute the missionary frustration to cultural differences:

We Westerners have active progressive natures. ... We see all the crying need of the situation, all the glaring weaknesses of the Church, and are hot-footed to change them. ... [The] Chinese go through life comparatively untouched by the needs around them and view every situation with the leisurely unconcern of the unhurried East.

As the most senior male staff on the field, Jansen was the kind of “old hand” who had been active in the process of devolution and change-over, and thus supposedly “grew organically into it”. On the other hand, as the leader of the Mission and the Chairman of the Field Council, Jansen also expressed his concern for the new arrivals, especially those in evangelical offices: “He is assigned to an area, but not to a task”, “he has to create his own opportunity” or he would feel “himself rather unrelated” to the Church in China. He “is just like a floating part, with no definite post to fill, needs a lot of imagination to continue believing in the importance of his presence”. In other words, there was no role for them to play in the bigger show of Christianity in China. To sum up, Jansen pointed out that

On the field a serious gap occurs between the new missionary’s dedicated intent and his effective service. It is a perplexing and frustrating thing to see a man of ability, consecration, and keen evangelical purpose, eager to spend himself in upbuilding the Church and yet finding no satisfying outlet.

---

7 Ibid., 4.
8 Ibid., 3.
9 Ibid., 4.
10 Ibid., 5.
The above picture in the vicinity of Canton at the time of Communist change-over was only a foretaste of what foreign missionaries were going to experience in all corners of the China field for the next year or so. In a similar vein, the China scene also reflected the characteristics of a general “missionary question” that emerged on a global scale in the post-World War II era. Although the “Three-Self formula” (or Triple Independence formula)\(^{11}\) for missionary endeavour had been proposed as early as in the mid-19th Century by mission statesmen Henry Venn and Rufus Anderson, such trans-Atlantic confluence became a “politically correct” lip service in the mission circle.\(^{12}\) Western missions and indigenous churches disagreed on the order of the three “selves”. The former thought self-support as the priority while the latter saw self-government as the first and foremost goal; in practice, self-propagation often out-stripped both. Missionary initiatives in many cases perpetuated their presence. Civil turmoil and war conditions in China throughout the period of church development led to regional and country-wide compulsory withdrawals of the missionary community, lasting months to years, leaving the church in the hands of national leaders. Such unplanned evacuation and indefinite absence from the field, tended to break the dependence syndrome of the local church much more effectively than phased devolution. In the beginning of the Pacific War, the British consular authority ordered all British missions to evacuate their personnel from the mission fields. Church affairs continued during the missionary absence. Almost in every patch of the worldwide field, the returnee missionaries found that they were no longer the leading protagonist on the stage. The China scene was only one part of the global show.

---

\(^{11}\) “Three-Self formula” is a missiological term, commonly expressed as “self-supporting, self-governing and self-propagating”. It is an idealized goal for church-planting in the mission field.

Missionaries’ contacts with Chinese communists occurred as early as the 1920s, especially the PCNZ staff in Canton where the communist activists pushed forward a series of anti-foreign and anti-Christian movements. Arnolis Hayman’s captivity at the hands of the Red Army in 1934 marked the height of an anti-communist feeling in the home-base of New Zealand. Kathleen Hall’s positive recollections of her experience in her contacts with the New Fourth Army and Route Eight Army in the late 1930s was a lone voice in her time. Despite their atheistic claims, many CCP leaders had their schooling in mission schools. In the late 1940s, missionaries in the communist occupied area lived concurrently with the regime. Because the CCP lacked a consistent policy regarding foreign religion and its messengers, missionary experiences with the party often depended on the personal attitudes of the local army leaders. Contemporary observation of the communist approach to the Christian community suggested three phases: 1) tolerance and freedom; 2) toleration with control; 3) active opposition. Within just two decades, the image of western missionary had transformed from that of a demonic title “foreign devil”, as formed in the late Qing Dynasty, to the image of a benefactor during the first half of the Sino-Japan War, to the image of an ally after the declaration of war on Japan by Britain and America, and then a sudden change from “people’s friends” to “people’s enemies”, or a new identity as “the running dog of imperialism” under communist discourse. Missionaries as a group had not changed much: it was the setting where they were operating that was constantly changing its backdrop.

The missionary responses to the communist rising were far from unified. The extreme anti-communist sentiments are exemplified by the Southern Baptist Mission, which relocated its field headquarters from Shanghai to Hong Kong early in 1949. The pro-communist extreme may be found in the YMCA and the Student Christian

---

13 Johnston's Occasional Letter No. 6, June 22, 1949, OMC, MSP, SCM, 1949, AA2/2/1, PCNZ Archive.
Movement, which embraced the communist proclamations as the earthly realisation of a biblical ideal, to an extent that the latter organisation voluntarily disbanded shortly after the “liberation” of Beijing.\textsuperscript{15} While scores of missionary forces were packing up and leaving each day, many missions adopted a “sit it out” attitude. Britain’s recognition of the communist China had given British and Commonwealth missions some false hope. The instruction received by CMS and SPG missionaries was to “stay put”.\textsuperscript{16} The final decision was often made by committee members who were “off the stage” and who had the least contact with the field reality.

\subsection*{6.2. A Reluctant Exodus}

It could be said that the process which the PCNZ took was quite typical of most Protestant missions in China. As things stood in early 1949, Jansen saw that the situation differed markedly from that faced by the western missionaries in 1942, when they were offered repatriation by the British Consuls but refused it. The new situation whittled away their opportunities for service by one restriction after another.\textsuperscript{17} According to Alice Cook’s report, the first rumble of warning came in the summer of 1950 when the government required missionaries to leave the country when their furloughs were due, followed by the issuing of the Three-Self Patriotic Movement (hereafter TSPM) Manifesto. The next stage was reached on 30\textsuperscript{th} November 1950, when the remaining missionary groups were called in to a conference at the Synod in Canton to be told that the growing volume of anti-imperialist sentiment caused by the new war that China had entered against the United Nations in Korea, had made the missionaries an embarrassment to the Synod.\textsuperscript{18} Nancy Jansen recalled how Peter Wong, the General Secretary in the Church of Christ in China Kwangtung Synod called the missionaries to the Canton

\begin{footnotes}
\item[17] Jansen to Stan, May 9, 1949, OMC, MSP, SCM, 1949, AA2/2/1, PCNZ Archive.
\end{footnotes}
Synod office on 29 December 1950 to tell them that “the time you’d all said you’d accept had come”.\(^{19}\) A resolution was passed on that day to conclude that the withdrawal of foreign workers best served the ends of the indigenous Church.\(^{20}\) But it took the PCNZ team three months to be granted their exit permits. On 11\(^{th}\) April 1951, all PCNZ missionaries crossed the border and arrived in the British colony of Hong Kong.\(^{21}\) The Field Council of the Mission was finally dissolved on 14 July 1951 at a meeting in Hong Kong.\(^{22}\) The Jubilee of the Mission coincided with the closure of the Mission.

The CMS, with one of its earliest mission statesmen being the inventor of the Three-Self Formula,\(^{23}\) was altogether too familiar with the “euthanasia of missions” as a missiological goal. The actual practice, however, did not always match the inherited ideal. Despite the claim that the CMS was “doing all it could to train indigenous leadership”, there were only two indigenous diocesan bishops and one assistant bishop in the Zhejiang Mission, one of its earliest Missions, dating back to the 1840s. It was not until 1950 that the western Bishop resigned for a Chinese successor to take over his responsibility, as part of a nationwide independence movement in which all diocesan bishops of the Anglican-Episcopal Church (Chung Hua Sheng Kung Hui/中华圣公会) became Chinese. As a result of this hushed euthanasia, all the expatriate missionaries began to withdraw in early 1951.\(^{24}\)

Despite the non-evangelical stance of Quakerism, the humanistic venture of the FAU did not survive very long under the new regime either. The number of unit members

---


\(^{21}\) The only exception was Annie James who was detained in a rural market town.


\(^{23}\) Henry Venn (1796-1873) served as honorary secretary of the CMS from 1841 to 1873, with his contemporary Rufus Anderson of the ABCFM, they advocated the Three-Self Ideal.

dropped from its peak of 144 in the FAU in Apr 1946 to just over 40 in the FSU by late 1948. The China Convoy seconded its transport team to the International Relief Committee in Chongqing (重庆), and confined its work to a village rehabilitation project in Zhongmou (中牟), and a mobile kala-azar team in Henan. Attempts to resume the emergency-style work were hindered by the Unit’s post-war decision to reduce its transport work when the country’s transportation needs heightened during the Civil War. Convoy members watched with frustration as the hospitals in various cities, which they had so painstakingly rehabilitated, were evacuated by the Missions because of the Nationalist policy of not leaving useable buildings for communists. The most critical problem was perhaps the poor morale among the members as many were disillusioned with the corruption of the Nationalist authorities and their “mission impossible”. The FSU’s desire to exercise a reconciliation role in the conflict also clashed with the political reality which left little room for their pacifist philosophy. Having striven worldwide for decades to maintain its independence from governments, the FSU was reluctant to work under the direction of the new regime if the cost was its integrity. Committed to a tradition of working alongside the Chinese as equals, Unit members were also disheartened with the growing anti-foreign feeling. The FSU’s closure was accomplished by Feb 1951. When it was clear that there was no role for foreigners to play at the Bailie School, Courtney Archer was the last New Zealand missionary, and probably also the last FSU member, to leave China in mid-1953.25

Among all the foreign missions in China, the CIM version of eventual withdrawal was unique for the following reasons. Firstly, it had started off as an organisation specialised in the evangelisation of the inland parts of China, the CIM had no mission field beyond China, not even a foot of land in the peripheral territories such as Hong Kong or Taiwan. China alone was big enough to absorb thousands of

missionaries and tens of thousands of pounds. Secondly, unlike denominational missions, the sheer number of its members scattered in remote corners of China, not only those belonging to the CIM directly but also to 15 different Associate Missions, made a speedy withdrawal logistically and financially difficult, if not impossible. By 1950, the CIM became the most notable remaining body, making up more than one third of the entire Protestant missionary force in China.  

Thirdly, apart from the common pressure faced by all foreign missions in China, the CIM was struggling with its own leadership problem at this critical time. The tradition of “Director Rule” conflicted with that of “field-based decision” as its General Director was convalescing in Melbourne. Despite having established the Headquarters on the field in China and the China Council as the highest decision-making body, the final resolution to the “stay or leave” question had to be made by a single man off the stage at the time. Finally, being one of the oldest missions in China, the CIM had stood many tests of regional and temporary withdrawals in the previous 85 years. Neither the Boxer Rebellion at the turn of the century, nor the anti-Christianity movement in the 1920s, nor the Sino-Japan War followed by the Pacific War in the late 1930s and early 1940s had forced the permanent departure of this Mission. The Mission leadership thought that they could survive the change-over. Such “business as usual” attitudes led the CIM to launch a new recruitment campaign for post-war China. Several New Zealanders were among the notable “Nineteen Forty-niner” reinforcement, the second group of 49 CIM recruits who arrived in 1949, less than a month before the official inauguration of the “New China”.

Regardless of how anti-communist the CIM might be, there were some surprising affinities between the mission’s ethos and the communists’ ideals. Apart from the

26 According to its 1950 edition of Prayer Directory, the CIM had 591 members and 166 associate members listed in the field in the beginning of 1950, making up a total of 757, followed by American Methodist (148), North American Presbyterian (134), and Wesleyan Methodist Missionary Society (72). At the time, the total number of Protestant missionaries (including wives) actually remaining in China was about 1900. Among these, only eight missions had more than 50 members, half of the rest missions had less than 10 personnel. See Victor E. W. Hayward, “Overseas newsletter V,” China Bulletin 89 (Jun 13, 1950):12.
usual parallel between the communist theory of the liberation of the oppressed and the Protestant theology of salvation of the sinner, and between the former’s teaching on communism as the final stage of social development and the latter’s teaching on millennial eschatology, some of the CIM’s distinctive practices also provided a religious counterpart to the communist system. For example, the “pool system” in which every member shared an averaged-out allowance of a common pool regardless of their individual contributions and credentials mirrored the socialist endeavour of economic egalitarianism. Moreover, the non-traditional ecclesiastical role that laymen and women could play under the CIM scheme mirrored the communist dream of a classless or even genderless society. Unfortunately, these affinities did little to bring friendship or favour from the new ruler.

Few members of the CIM realised at the time that the overthrow of the mission-friendly Nationalist China was also the overthrow of the entire missionary enterprise. Most leaders thought that they could recycle old strategies that had helped them survive previous turmoil and hardship. The internal diversity of the Mission enabled it to play many parts. One of the tactics that it had used in the Sino-Japan War was to exploit the multinational composition of its membership in times of international conflicts. These past experiences might have led the CIM mission leaders to believe that even if all the American members were repatriated as the result of a potential Sino-American War, members of all other nationalities could take over from them and carry on their work in China. This, though, soon proved to be naïve.

27 The only other organisations concerned in this thesis that had adopted the pool system was the FAU.
28 For example, when Britain declared the war on Germany in Europe, the Japanese in China, as an ally of the Germans, took over the Mission Hospital in Kaifeng which displayed the British flag and was under the name of an English CIM member, the CIM sent two American members (George Harris and Fred Hatton) to bargain over with the Japanese occupier. After the Pacific War started and even the American members were sent to the POW camps, the CIM still had German and Scandinavian members moving freely in occupied China.
When the TSPM was launched in July 1950, foreign missionaries became the first target, followed by their Chinese associates or anyone who disagreed with the government’s religious reform. The anti-imperialism of the TSPM was a sweeping movement across all sections of the missionary group. To the CIM mission statesman, Leslie Lyall, the Christian Manifesto, published in July 1950, was the “death warrant” of the entire foreign missionary enterprise in China. In the single month of December 1950, the number of signatures on the Manifesto increased from 26,727 to 78,596. By then, the mere presence of a foreign body in the church had become a source of embarrassment. On the 12th of this very month, the Deputy China Director of the CIM formally announced its withdrawal.

When Protestants first sailed for China as missionaries in the early 19th Century, they were sent rather than invited and there had been no indigenous church for them to consult with. One century later, when Protestant missionaries were retreating from China, many took their cue from the national church. Since devolution had more or less been completed in many established churches, missionaries’ discernment of the situation and policy-making largely relied on the attitude of their Chinese colleagues. There had been a heightened sense that they were only guests, in China only at the invitation of the Chinese church. Caught between the new regime and their old benefactor, the Chinese church was divided. The churches that the CIM and PCNZ worked with initially wanted the missionaries to stay on but soon switched their stances and begged them to leave. In early December 1950, with all the embarrassment and euphemism a Chinese could bear in face-to-face dialogue, a church leader from a neighbouring province paid a visit to the CIM Headquarters in

---

29 The *Christian Manifesto* is also referred to as *Three-Self Manifesto* (三自宣言). The complete original title was *The Chinese Christian’s Eadeavor to the Development of New China* (《中国基督教在新中国建设中努力的途径》). It was a document drawn by the Chinese Christian leader Wu Yao-Tsung (吴耀宗) in consultation with Premier Zhou Enlai (周恩来). The *Manifesto* was the founding document of the TSPM, and eventually obtained 400,000 signatories nationwide. For further details regarding the TSPM, refer to Phillip L. Wickeri, *Seeking the Common Ground: Protestant Christianity, the Three-Self Movement, and China’s United Front* (Maryknoll. New York: Orbis Books, 1988).

Shanghai with a simple request: “Please go.” The last straw for the CIM was Marcus Cheng’s letter. Marcus was a long-time friend of CIM’s General Director Bishop Frank Houghton, who invited him to start the Chungking Theological Seminary as the founding Principal in 1944. Despite this association and his fundamentalist stand, Marcus chose to become one of the forty initiators of the Manifesto. He wrote to the CIM Headquarters in Shanghai, asking that all missionary staff who made up the entire teaching staff, to be withdrawn immediately from the Seminary, at the risk of closing it down. This was a big blow to the General Director’s faith in the friendship with Chinese Christian leaders, which partly contributed to his final agreement to initiate “the beginning of the end” for the whole mission.31

Across the whole of China, thousands of missionaries, Catholic and Protestant, began to make their “Reluctant Exodus”. Some were imprisoned, and a few lost their lives in the process. The end of the missionary drama was not euthanasia as Henry Venn envisaged in the 1840s, not even a phasing-out as many had planned, but a rather abrupt ending to “China’s Open Century”.32 The CMS missionary statesman David M. Paton described the process as “the Debacle of Christian Missions in China”.33

Being a small group of the wider mission to China, the New Zealand members were caught up in these complications. Long-time missionaries were torn between the identification with the Chinese and the rejection by the Chinese. They had an impossible role to play between the Chinese government, the British government, the New Zealand government, the Chinese people, and the Chinese church. The New Zealand Government’s attitude on the diplomatic recognition question had been

---

31 Phyllis Thompson, Reluctant Exodus (Littleton: OMF, 2000), 52-53.
32 Broomhall’s book Hudson Taylor and China’s Open Century suggests that historically China’s usual status to the world system has been closed except the period between the mid-C19th to the mid-C20th, which he terms as “China’s Open Century”.
ambivalent and was deferred because 1949 was an election year in both New Zealand and Australia, in which domestic issues always outweighed international affairs. Prior to the election, the Labour government did not have a unified voice concerning this issue, Peter Fraser’s anti-communist and anti-appeasement beliefs, manifested in a mixture of moral and practical concerns, enabled him to go against his advisers’ recommendations for a conciliatory disposition. His successor, the National Prime Minister, Sidney Holland, saw the international situation in even stronger Cold War terms. Anxious to obtain US participation in a Pacific security pact, New Zealand was facing an identity crisis caused between her geographical location, political affiliation and socio-cultural roots. Thus, when Britain extended de jure recognition to the PRC in Jan 1950 to safeguard its commercial interests, New Zealand did not follow suit. The “failure” to follow was considered rather extraordinary as this small “white Dominion” had almost always followed Mother England in the realm of foreign affairs. China’s military confrontation with the UN troops in the Korean War, in which New Zealand troops faced off against Chinese soldiers, was the final seal of New Zealand’s stance of non-recognition.34 On the one hand, the New Zealand government would not let any funds be transferred to the communist-threatened areas.35 On the other hand, the Chinese government froze American assets in China from 28th December 1950. This logistical blocking of funds put an end to one of the important functions, perhaps the last remaining function, of foreign missionaries in their bridging role between the home board and the Chinese church.

The new Chinese government, having made it impossible for missionaries to stay, was now making it extremely difficult for them to leave; no one could go without an

---

35 Unaddressed letter, December 23, 1949, OMC, MSP, SCM, 1949, AA2/2/1, PCNZ Archive.
exit visa, which was not granted until the applicant could prove that he or she left no debts behind. This involved inserting a notice in the local paper, inviting any potential debtors to produce the evidence so that matters could be settled. However, the permission to insert the notice had to be obtained from the local authorities. The most sinister demand was that missionaries must have personal guarantors who would stand surety for them even after they left. Each foreigner could only leave China when a Chinese citizen had undertaken to be responsible for any unpaid debts, undisclosed crime, and for anything the departing foreigner might say or do that was detrimental to the People’s Government when he or she left China. In other words, behind every evacuating New Zealander there was a Chinese hostage. The “voluntary-compulsory exit permit pantomimes” also involved another twist: when the exit permit had been applied for the missionary must stop work, yet the servants and the staff could not be discharged even though there was no work to do and no money to pay their wages. The severance pay for the Chinese staff was in many cases exorbitant in relation to mission budgets.36 While most of the missionaries took their leave peacefully, some were placed under house arrest or even thrown into prison.37 The reluctant exodus dragged on and was not completed until July 1953, and the costs associated with it were much greater than anticipated.

The actual closing of the missionary drama varied from stage to stage and from actor to actor. The Chinese, Christians and non-Christians, expressed their reciprocal love with actions as well as with inactions. Most were not allowed an open farewell but the Chinese could always find a way around the restrictions. Anne Lilburne recalls many gestures of friendship under blades of the official radar.38 The Chinese also

36 Thompson, Reluctant Exodus, 66-67; Anne Lilburne, “I Went Out … Not Knowing” (Private publication, 1994), 190, 192.
37 For example, Annie James (CVM) was detained for 11 weeks, the McIntoshes (CIM) were detained for 11 months, Mary Milner (CIM) was under house arrest for a year, Marjorie Vines (nee Squires) (Brethren) and her husband were under house arrest for two years.
38 These gestures included: the nursing school used the graduation ceremony as a farewell party; students and villagers kept coming quietly to the house to say good-bye; the house servants invited them for a meal; some friends slept on the compound in order to prepare the
helped to make the missionary leave-taking possible and smooth by refusing to carry out a trial. The officials in Canton raked a 30 mile area trying to find people to make accusations against the PCNZ mission but instead found that nearly every family had someone who had been treated in the hospital so that the plan for an accusation party miscarried. Likewise, the Kaai Hau Medical Association officials tried to organise a public trial to deal with Annie James, which would almost certainly have been followed by execution in the name of the “will of the people”. When the time for condemnation came, scarcely anyone turned up so the proceedings had to be cancelled. The natural inclination was so strong that the populace had enough courage to absent themselves. In other words, the people undermined the official repertoire against the “mother of Cong Hua” by simply not showing up.

Although a work of fiction, John Hersey’s depiction of an American missionary who became the object of a public trial can be generalised to all western missionaries who had to endure the ritual of “struggle session”:

It never occurred to them that they were committing a crime of violence against me, because, as they saw it, the ritual itself simply asked an abstract figure to atone for real crimes committed against them for a long time by much larger outside forces, … of which the abstract man is asked to be a miniature representation.

In other words, the missionary’s crime was “that of being an abstraction”.

breakfast on their day of departure; a Chinese pastor accompanied them to the luggage examination point and dissuaded some zealots from harming the departing missionaries; and other ex-staff planned ahead and waited to meet them in Canton (Lilburne, “I Went Out … Not Knowing,” 195, 200-204).

39 Ibid., 203.
40 Annie I. James, I Was in Prison (Christchurch, N.Z.: Presbyterian Bookroom, 1952), 24-25.
41 This is the Chinese title bestowed to Annie James by the local people.
43 Ibid.
When the gate to China clanged shut behind the missionaries at the border, it was a strong indication that China was going to be blocked behind the bamboo curtain for many years to come. In everyday stage life, when one show closes, another show commences very soon. However, the missionaries understood that it was not an interim dropping of the curtain, but the removal of the stage. By the end of 1953, China was by and large closed to the West as a mission field, while still maintaining limited diplomatic and trading relations with the world. The international missionary movement had entered its “Post-China stage”. Before the research addresses the question about how the majority of these missionaries, who were still in the best years of their working lives, spent their after-China years, a brief summary of the New Zealand missionary impact in the Open Century of China is required.44

6.3. A Personal Reflection

My Aunt came from a little village that was part of the Chenghsien (嵊县) County45 in the coastal province of Zhejiang. It was one of the first places where the CIM established their mission stations. The first gospel chapel was built in 1918, four years before my Aunt’s birth, and had still been in use when I visited there in 2008. At least two New Zealand missionaries (William and Ella Anderson) had worked there when my Aunt was a young girl. She performed as a young itinerant actress in Shaoxing (绍兴), Xiaoshan (萧山), Hangzhou (杭州), and Ningpo (宁波), all had had an established missionary presence by then. In 1936, my Aunt went with the circus to Shanghai, a metropolitan locale with a significant international missionary community. Many New Zealanders had landed, lodged and worked in this city. However, their paths had never crossed. In various versions of her biographies and

---

44 For missionaries whose exit had taken the form of death in China, the CIM's annual report for many years contained a list of those who died during active service in China. Such symbolic extension of their commitment to the mission field served a noble case for audience and for prospective mission applicants.

45 Now Shengzhou (嵊州).
knowing her as a family relative, I cannot pick up any hints of contact with Christianity in her life. Less than 1% of her contemporaries were professed Protestants. Since 1920s, communism and Christianity were two key western ideologies that were competing for the hearts of the Chinese people. My Aunt was more influenced by the ethos of communism and eventually joined the CCP in 1954. The primary reason for the Nationalist Government to put her name down on the blacklist was that she appeared to be a Communist in her walks of life. At the time of the missionary withdrawal, Christianity seemed to have lost its battle to communism. Writing this thesis sixty years later – a full sexagesimal circle has great significance in the Chinese almanac – the opposite seems to have become true.

The mission literature creates an impression that the missionary involvement had significantly influenced China’s modern history. By contrast, the communist textbooks attempted to wipe out all the missionary marks in the shaping of modern China. Unless one had a personal or familial association with Christianity, an average Chinese could be totally unaware of the once grandiose missionary enterprise prior to 1950. Substantial reflections, inside and outside of the Christian church, have been well documented.46 A comprehensive review of this literature is well beyond the scope of this chapter and potentially distracting to the main plot of this missionary drama. In the place of a disinterested discussion, I would like to finish the chapter on a more personal note.

I could not help thinking what would have happened if the East had met with the

West in the person of my Aunt and the New Zealand missionaries. This question could be better addressed if we begin to explore the reason why the likelihood of their paths crossing was so slight. It would be a foolhardy attempt to compare the size of my Aunt’s audience with that of Chinese Christians congregating on a Sunday in the same city. To an average Chinese, going to the opera house had a much more powerful appeal than going to a church building in the 1940s. On the other hand, the evangelical missionaries, under the influence of the pietistic tradition, tended to view theatrical and cinematic shows as decadent and thus it was a questionable pastime for a Christian. According to Reinders, representations as such were suspect in Protestant polemics. Iconoclastic sentiments went beyond icons to problematise the entire visual field, including theater, masks, ritual display, pictures, and visual illusions of any kind. Calvin in particular objected to the theater since it blurred reality and unreality, good acting more so than bad acting. By the time large numbers of Protestant missionaries were writing about the Far East, China had been constructed in the Western imagination as “a land of limitless ceremonial ostentation, and therefore insincerity and hollow illusion”.\textsuperscript{47} Given their general disapproval of theatrical frivolity or vanity brought from Christendom, Chinese operas and circus plays, with their “heathen” elements and exotic styles, were further out of the question. References to operatic plays and sing-songs, as sporadic as they appear, were always associated with condemnation of sins and social ills. For example, one of Hudson Taylors’ biographies recalls an incident in which he and William Chalmers Burns\textsuperscript{48} jointly interfered with the village opera performance, which they perceived as lascivious. They saw it as legitimate to pair the opera stage with brothels and gambling booths as part of “Satan’s camp” and “Vanity Fair”.\textsuperscript{49} Articles in mission magazines almost always linked sing-song girls with a “life of shame”, and contrasted it with the “ever-happy” life in mission-managed orphanages and


\textsuperscript{48} Burns (1815-1868) was a Scottish Evangelist and Missionary to China with the English Presbyterian Mission.

\textsuperscript{49} Roger Steer, \textit{J. Hudson Taylor: A Man in Christ} (Authentic, OMF, 2001), 103.
industrial homes.\textsuperscript{50} The theatre where my Aunt was putting on her shows would be viewed as too defiled for any missionaries to visit. The chance for my Aunt to be “reached” was less than for a village girl, a peasant’s wife, a tribe woman, a nun,\textsuperscript{51} an amah, an orphan, a blind girl, a maid or even a prostitute.\textsuperscript{52} In addition to the ecclesiastical reasons given, western audiences would also find the loud and wiry percussion and string band deafening and unentertaining, the strong coloured facial paint and cosmetics an affectation or at least exaggeration, the vulgar lyrics and stories incomprehensible or even distasteful. Even if a missionary had met my Aunt, and my Aunt had showed some interest to their message, one of the criteria to be welcomed into the “body of Christ” would be to quit her “shameful way of life”, which might spell a complete end of the encounter. To use these “heathen forms of arts” to present the divine story of Christianity was out of the question. Even today, the separatist spirit of the Chinese church, largely shaped by missionaries of fundamentalist inclinations, still tends to conceptualise the consumption of popular arts and entertainment as spiritually unsound. Operatic players and evangelical Christians conversed in lines of speech that was mutually exclusive.

On my Aunt’s part, like most of her contemporaries, she saw Christianity as a “foreign religion”, making no sense and having no relevance to her web of life. Under the influence of nationalism, she was unlikely to challenge the cognitive fallacy that all foreigners, be they missionaries, diplomats, merchants, or soldiers, were more or less imperialists, taking advantage of her country and her people. Confined to the city of Shanghai, the work at the grassroots in China’s interior and

\textsuperscript{50} For example, the organ of Anglican missions published a story about a girl who was sold to be brought up as a singing girl and how she was rescued into the Victoria Home and Orphanage (Margaret A. Jennings, “Bo-Gum” – Precious Gold”, \textit{The Reaper} (NZABM), (February 14, 1930):5).
\textsuperscript{51} A Norwegian missionary Karl Ludvig Reichelt (1877-1952) founded the Tao Fong Shan (道风山) Christian Centre in 1930, aiming to foster a better mutual understanding between Christians and Buddhists (http://www.tfscc.org/eg/index.htm, accessed on August 27, 2012).
\textsuperscript{52} The “Door of Hope” was one mission organization established in 1900 in Shanghai that focused on the rescue of slave girls and prostitutes. It was also common for missions to establish industry homes for blind or orphaned children.
borders carried by the CIM and the Brethren missions was out of the range of her sight. Devoted to a career of performance arts, the CMS and PCNZ’s evangelisation projects through education and medicine were largely out of her mind. Bearing the humiliation of being a Chinese civilian during Sino-Japan War, she would have found the Christian pacifist stance most unacceptable and cowardly. Longing for a community-owned theatre and opera training school that were independent from the control of proprietors and magnates, the communist ideal of a common world seemed to her more tangible than the Christian message of salvation. In contrast to the stand taken by western missionaries, nothing prevented the communists from enjoying opera shows, to pay respect to the troupers, however token this respect was, nor did anything hinder them from using opera and other popular arts to propagandise the communist ideals. My Aunt was but one of the renowned actresses across China who nurtured the birth of revolutionary operas, which later developed into the “eight model plays”.

We know now that the paths of these two protagonists never crossed. Back in their days, both ends were searching for means by which to realise their respective missions. Both were celebrated only within their own circles of audiences. My Aunt was for sure not the only one who saw no positive correlations between missionary enterprises and the rise of China as a modern nation. Dr. Francis Chang, Dr. Kathleen Pih’s husband, who grew up in a devout Christian family and was himself a recipient of missionary benefactions, came to the same conclusion that “China would have done just as well without the missionaries”. My Aunt’s story represents but

---

53 One of the prominent communist leaders, Zhou Enlai, watched one of my Aunt's stage performances in 1946.
54 The eight plays included six modern operas: The Legend of the Red Lantern (Hongdengji 红灯记), Shajiabang (沙家浜), Taking Tiger Mountain by Strategy (Zhiqu Weihushan 智取威虎山), Raid on the White Tiger Regiment (Qixi Baihutuan 奇袭白虎团), Ode of the Dragon River (Longjiangsong 龙江颂), On the Dock (Haigang 海港), and two ballets: Red Detachment of Women (Hongse Niangzijun 红色娘子军), The White-Haired Girl (Baimaonv 白毛女).
one of the many missing links that western missions failed to grasp during their course of operation. Without such a contextualisation as this, the biblical story would always remain a foreign drama that was unentertaining and incomprehensible to the Chinese spectators, just as the Chinese opera was to western audiences. New Zealanders, as subalterns of an enormous missionary force, largely administered from Britain and America, only followed the trend. Had they understood their blind spots? How should they have modified their strategies if they had been given the opportunity to live their missionary careers over again? Would they boast that both the communist zeal and the operatic art had waned over the course of time in China, but the Christian faith had flourished despite of official sanctions and human lapses? Or have we expected too much from them, who were only the products of their era and culture? History has left too many gaps and possibilities for the latter generations to speculate, but men and women on their stages only had one script to play in the show of their life-story. Neither of their stories ended at the closing of China as a mission field. The next chapter unfolds the last leg of their journey.
Chapter VII: Epilogue - Post-China Hang-over

My Aunt was forced to quit her stage life completely from 1966, when the decade-long Cultural Revolution started. She always thought that those would be her most productive years if she could carry on. As an actress, she suffered more physical abuse and humiliation from the hands of the “people’s liberators” than from the “people's enemies”. Over the whole of China, many actors and actresses had similar tragic endings to their careers during that time. Some even lost their lives. My Aunt survived to see the end of the Cultural Revolution. By the time she resumed her previous position, she was 54 years in age. Unlike many of her colleagues, she chose not to return to the stage in the role of a young gentlewoman.1 Instead, my Aunt devoted the rest of her life to training the next generation of actors and actresses, and remained as a legendary figure to be admired. Foreign missionaries were forced to quit the front-stage of the China field from 1950. This cut across all generations of missionaries: some were seasoned workers still in their most productive years; others had just acquired fluency in Chinese. Under the shadow of the Korean War, the communist answer to the missionary questions was far more complete to that of the Qing Emperors and the Republican Government. Few missionaries survived to see the bamboo curtain raised again in the 1980s, fewer still were fit enough to revisit it, and none had been allowed to resume their missionary posts in China.

Most mission accounts and history studies on China mission close around the time of the missionary withdrawal. Few scholars have paid due attention to the reverse

1 The only opera story that she ever played in full costume after the Cultural Revolution was *Ama Xiang-Lin* (祥林嫂), which was about the life of a poor village widow.
impact of “China the mission field” on the missionaries. There seems to be an assumption that when one leaves the stage, that is the end of the story. However, human history can never be cut into pieces by historians’ periodisations, nor can people’s life-stories. Artificial “cutting-off” points do not take into account the unruly character of social transitions. In real life, the missionary life-stories carried over from the “front-stage” of China to the parts of the “back-stage” context of New Zealand that was off stage and behind the scenes.

After a brief recuperation from the exodus, the missionaries had many things to face. There was one question of accountability in the minds of congregations that were in the “back-stage” of a “home-base”. Those who had gone through trials at the hands of the communists arrived home as heroes and heroines, others as less triumphant survivors of “Red China”. For those home congregations who were always hungry for “success stories”, the China debacle was anything but success. The process of rationalisation of their initial decision to stay and the final decision to leave helped the missionaries to renegotiate their sense of vocation. Their identification with the mission management sometimes made it hard to differentiate the institutional from the personal. Then there might be the frustration of trying to explain to their untraveled compatriots the delicacy and complexity of things Chinese. By doing so, the missionaries were not only enlightening the New Zealand audience about international politics in East Asia, but also reconsolidating their own China experiences, success and failure. Disheartened by the ending scene of their missionary career in China, they might be further disillusioned by the contrasting vista of their homogenous and insular home life. Far less affected by World War II than China and Europe, New Zealand had entered into its post-war prosperity. Having just left a war-torn China, “Kiwi” missionaries would find the version of home life comfortable but not comforting, abundant but lacking concern for the poor, permissive but less tolerant of the more pietist lifestyle than they grew up with, not to mention the general provincialism and locale-centred perspectives of small-town
New Zealanders. The wide discrepancy between the missionary returnees and local “Kiwis” can be best encapsulated by the response that Nancy Jansen received from her students: “Oh, for you it’s your life. For us it’s just history!”\(^2\) Returnee missionaries soon discovered that the post-colonial movements, the secularisation of the society at large, and the liberalisation of theology within the church began to overthrow the conventional understandings about foreign mission. They failed to save the missionary drama first in China, then in New Zealand.

Such frustration and contrast led to the next set of questions: “After China, what?” and “Without China who are we?” Since the post-China experience is a relatively under-studied topic, it is important to provide a wide range of empirical findings as a basis for further analysis. Consistent with the genre of personal chronicle of this thesis, “post-China” epilogues in this chapter are not limited to those who left China in 1950, but includes post-field experiences of all China missionaries sent by New Zealand for the whole period concerned. Post-China experiences prior to 1950 will be clearly labeled in the analysis to differentiate them from their “exodus” counterparts. For all the known post-China career development of New Zealand missionaries, please see Appendix I. As a generalisation, missionaries’ post-China vocations have exerted influences into three main areas: in New Zealand and other “home countries”; in other mission fields; and in their intergenerational legacy.

### 7.1. Post-China Influences in New Zealand

When missionaries sailed from New Zealand to China, they took New Zealand with them. Correspondingly, when missionaries returned to New Zealand from China, they brought China with them. In this sense, China influenced New Zealand through the medium of missionaries. In the realm of church ministry, the male missionaries sought ordination to the ministry or priesthood. Since only the PCNZ systematically

sent out ordained ministers as missionaries, very few China missionaries were able to hold formal church office without going through further training. Among the few, four were appointed Moderators of the General Assembly in the PCNZ.\(^3\) William Malcolm and William Anderson were the only two Presbyterian members of the CIM that were known to be accepted for Presbyterian parish work. One further person, Andrew Wilson, was a unique case in that, while originally qualified as an architect, he was trained and ordained for the Presbyterian ministry after he returned to Australia. Those women of denominational missions who had an ordained status as deaconess and who remained single were able to resume their ecclesiastic role.\(^4\)

As a result of the high percentage of Baptists joining the CIM (about half) and the more relaxed rules regarding clergy in the Baptist system, a fair number of these returnees became pastors in small-town or suburban Baptist churches.\(^5\) Their congregations experienced the rich cross-cultural imprint of the China experience through their ministries. According to Murray Beck, a missionary child and a Baptist pastor, the CIM has “a mana of mission work” that has transcended boundaries and fed into the denominations through the individuals and the churches associated with the Mission.\(^6\)

Given the high social status that missionaries were able to enjoy in China regardless of their ordained status, it is not difficult to understand the frustration and disappointment of some Old China Hands who felt they were slighted on their return.

\(^3\) They were George McNeur (1926), Herbert Davies (1947), Jack McKenzie (1956), and Paddy Jansen (1967).

\(^4\) Within the PCNZ body, Mary Findlay was appointed as a deaconess at St. Peters, Grey Lynn-Richmond, Auckland for two years; Nance Park, deaconess at Grey Lynn Auckland; Dorothy Robertson, deaconess to St. Paul’s Church in Oamaru. Flora Wilson worked as a part-time congregational deaconess in St. Paul’s Napier for eight years. Frances Ogilvie was appointed the first woman elder in St. Andrew’s on the Terrace in Wellington and became an Elder Emerita in 1978 due to declining ability to hear.

\(^5\) For example, John Beck served in Georgetown Baptist Church; Fancies Duncan in Gore, Tawa and Nelson Baptist Churches; Hector Hogarth in New Lynn and Otahuhu Baptist Churches. Victor Johnson and Howard Knight also worked in various Baptist ministries as an interim vocation while they were looking for something more permanent.

\(^6\) Murray Beck, interviewed by the researcher, November 23, 2011.
Joe and Sarah Thompson had spent more than three decades in south Zhejiang province, in charge of the training and work of hundreds of Chinese pastors, teachers, and Bible women, as well as chairing regional conferences, only to be told that the husband still had to go through the usual course at Baptist College in order to obtain official recognition as a pastor, even after he had served two short term pastorates in two Baptist churches back in New Zealand. Joe eventually accepted the position of Missioner for the British Sailors’ Society in Auckland. Approaching retirement age, Joe’s last job was the assistant janitor for the University of Auckland. It would be a hard job to explain to their colleagues and apprentices back in China as to why their mentors in church management could not secure any formal ministry work back home.

If it was difficult for laymen to enter the realm of church office after missionary work, it should surprise no one that most woman missionaries would remain on the periphery of the Pakeha church. As the case in the field of China, it was slightly easier to trace the activities of single women than for wives, whose movements were again “incorporated” into those of their husbands. Even for the former, we know little more than the two “Alices” of the Brethren mission (A. Gresham and A. Rout) who started a Sunday School at Mt. Roskill in Auckland. Male missionaries who were unable to enter the priesthood adopted this approach as well. The Thompsons, being denied official recognition, started a Sunday School at their modest house, which later developed into the Northcote Baptist Church.

The realm of mission mobilisation is another channel through which returnee China missionaries were able to recycle their missionary zeal and experiences. Male veterans with ordination status often managed to secure formal offices within

---

8 The researcher is a member of this very Church.
denominational mission organisations. “Saturated with the federal mission spirit”, leadership in the Australasian Council of the CIM was open to New Zealanders from a very early stage. One of the most prominent mission statesmen and administrators from New Zealand would be J. O. Sanders. Despite the fact that he had not set foot in the China field, he was appointed the Australasian Home Director of the CIM from March 1946, working from Melbourne. In less than ten years, he was invited to become the General Director of this international organisation, the first incumbent in this capacity without an English background and without field experience. Working from Singapore and travelling globally, his leadership and gifts were becoming internationally recognised in evangelical circles. It is generally agreed that Sanders has endeavoured to develop a resilient evangelicalism with a strong international outlook in New Zealand. Howard Knight was the New Zealander who succeeded Sanders in 1955 to become the Australian Home Director for the CIM after twenty years of field experience in China leading to the position as Northern Regional Director. After retiring from this formal role, Knight became the Secretary of the Evangelical Association in Australia, and later Director of TEAR Fund in Australia, each position lasting nearly a decade. His early experiences as a missionary in North West China had given him credentials for all of these leadership roles.

---

9 Among the PCNZ returnees, William Mawson was appointed Secretary for the Foreign Missions Committee from 1928 until his unexpected death in 1935, while Jack McKenzie served as Assistant Director of Missions in Auckland from 1939.

10 China’s Millions (Australasian edition, January 1893), 1.

11 When James Todd was appointed superintendent of the “Testing Home” in 1899, it was an extravagant move at that time for both the New Zealand and Melbourne Councils. After some years of teaching at the Moody Bible Institute, he returned to Australia and continued to work as a CIM secretary for another decade. After twenty years of missionary work in the “joint venture” of the CIM-Anglican diocese in Szechwan, Henry Funnell worked as the Assistant Home Secretary for New Zealand and Australia from 1945 to 1954.

12 It was only after his appointment as the Australasian Director, Sanders was given the opportunity to make a short trip to West China in 1947, which might be called a “vision trip” in today’s missiological term.

Hayden Mellsop was another New Zealand hero who earned his fame overseas. His narrow escape under a Japanese rifle-fire became a legend among the circle of the CIM supporters. Being one of the rare cases of a male missionary who remained single throughout his life, Mellsop took a furlough in South Africa instead of in New Zealand. The unexpected retirement through illness of the South Africa Home Director led to his appointment as the executive secretary in 1962. He remained in that position for 17 years. The Chinese experiences brought mixed effects in Mellsop’s deputation. On the one hand, he touched a large audience and made a wide circle of friends with his “soul-stirring” and sometimes exaggerated embellishments as a story-teller. On the other hand, there were also “persistent reports” of “his being more inclined to tell of his China experiences (and) Hong Kong days”.14 China had left such a lasting imprint in his heart and mind that this Old China Hand was increasingly becoming outdated with the mission’s expansion into other East Asia countries and regions.

Apart from contributing to the offshore network of this global organisation, New Zealand CIMers also helped to build the home constituency. When the New Zealand member Eleanor Kendon became the wife of the CIM General Director George W. Gibbs, she accompanied her husband for a two month visit in 1939 to her homeland, which resulted in a decision to form a single council in place of the separate North and South Island Councils starting from 1894. Sinclair and Grace Hamilton, who retired from the field due to ill health, found their new venue for exercising missionary enthusiasm by assuming the role of the first New Zealand Council Secretary from 1939 to 1962. Norman and Amy McIntosh started off as missionaries to China, subsequently worked for many years in various Southeast Asia countries, and Norman became OMF’s New Zealand Home Director from 1971 to 1976, and was the last Old China Hand who held this position. After the McIntoshes’ official retirement, they continued to serve as the organisation’s South Island representatives.

14 Houliston to McIntosh, October 21, 1975, Mellsop’s file, OMF NZ Archive.
Women’s contributions to mission administration and representation were not as well documented, and thus were often hard to trace. It was not until OMF released its policy document on “the couple in leadership” in 1987 that wives’ contributions in mission mobilisation were formally recognised. Without executive authority and ecclesiastical status, few wives could develop a personal ministry in partnership with their husbands. Jane Blakeley was one of the rare exceptions, partly due to her status as the very first deaconess in New Zealand as well as the first missionary sent by the New Zealand CIM Council, and partly due to the status of her husband as the honorary CIM Home staff. Blakeley, then Mrs. Brown, served as the secretary of the North Island Council for nearly 40 years from 1905. A. M. D. Dinneen was one of the very few woman missionaries who set her foot in mission management on the denominational board. On her retirement from field work, she became a member of the NZCMS Executive in 1934, a Vice-President in 1949, and continued to sit on the Executive until 1961.

An alternative outlet for missionary enthusiasm and experiences lay in the realm of mission education, though it had not been taken up by many New Zealanders. J. O. Sanders was again a classic example. After retiring from the role of OMF General Director, he accepted many speaking engagements throughout the world, and accepted the position of the principal of the Christian Leaders’ Training College in Banz, New Guinea, though only for a year. Over the years, Sanders published more than 30 books, of which over two million copies were printed, including translations into some 23 languages. Such a prolific outpouring of publications gave him a

---

worldwide reputation as a mission educator.\textsuperscript{17}

The PCNZ counterpart would be Lindsay Crozier, whose filming and recording skills made him an indispensable professional for church publicity and mission promotion. Shortly after his evacuation from China, Crozier was appointed manager of the newly created Presbyterian Church Photographic Unit. He carried with him the motto of the FAU China convoy -- “go anywhere do anything” -- into his new job. His early experience as a FAU member in war-torn China prepared him for constant travel across a variety of cultures and nations in Asia.\textsuperscript{18} When his physical vigor waned in later years, he accepted the position of Field and Publicity Officer of the Presbyterian Social Services Association.\textsuperscript{19} Bible Colleges and Seminaries largely remained closed for women teachers in the 1950s and 1960s, the most glorious evidence that New Zealand women returnees could boast in relation to mission education was that Frances Ogilvie twice relieved as Principal of the Deaconess College in Dunedin.

If church ministry and mission education were the realms of their male colleagues, women returnees, especially the single women, found their niche, or sometimes their ghetto, in the realm of home mission to the Maoris. After many years of working in China as an evangelistic missionary and English teacher, Margaret Russell (nee Reid), worked for the Presbyterian Maori Mission from 1947, and was appointed Head Teacher of Matahi Maori Mission School from 1948. Both Violet Bargrove and Kathleen Hall worked in the NZCMS Maori Mission after many years of working as missionary nurses in China. The cultural affinity between Maori and Chinese was

\textsuperscript{17} Other examples in the CIM body included Victor Johnson and James Todd. The former was appointed the Principal of a Bible Institute in Adelaide for three years and lecturer in the Bible College of New Zealand from 1967, while the later worked for the Moody Bible Institute in the early 1900s.
\textsuperscript{18} For example, one of the assignments undertaken by Crozier was with an Auckland firm Reynolds Television, whose director Don Whyte and the Croziers travelled in Nepal, India, Bangladesh, Singapore, Thailand and Hong Kong, to film the work of the Leprosy Mission, the Baptist Mission, CORSO, and the Ludhiana Fellowship.
replicated in the partnership between the China missionary and her Maori colleague:

“When Kathleen and Wi [Canon Huata] met they immediately understood each other. Their ideas ran along similar lines which was to help people to help themselves.”

Before long her new colleague learned how desperately Kathleen was missing her life in China, and perhaps also how her work among the Chinese villagers in the mountainous region had prepared her for the work among the Maori people around Waitara and Te Kuiti in the Waikato region. Kathleen was hurt very deeply when Maori soldiers from her very own parish became part of the New Zealand contingent during the Korean War, facing off against the Chinese soldiers whom she longed to serve. It was also Canon Huata who backed her up by telling her critics that “We have to interpret communism in terms of [the] Maoridom community.”

Home mission with the Chinese seemed to be the natural placement for China missionaries. It was easier for denominational churches that had had an established home mission to channel their returnees. By the time the first generation of PCNZ China missionaries retired from field service, the PCNZ had established Chinese churches in Dunedin as well as in Auckland. William and Sara Mawson were the first returnee missionary couple who served the Chinese church in New Zealand. William worked for five years in the Auckland church from 1923. Sara was still called on to interpret for Chinese people in the law courts in the 1930s after her husband’s new appointment as Foreign Missions Secretary in 1928 and sudden death in 1935. Andrew and Nellie Miller were another returnee couple who were asked to become full time staff with the Chinese church in Dunedin. After Andrew’s unexpected death in 1944, Mrs. Miller continued to be employed by the Church’s

Missions Committee as an evangelist to the local Chinese body, alongside the pioneer China missionary George McNeur, who was asked to take ecclesiastic charge at the age of 73. Had the Chinese community been composed solely of bachelors, there would have been no formal ministry role for women missioners. As it was the case in China, it was the very presence of refugee women and children that made it necessary for the PCNZ to take on a woman worker in her own right. Both held the job for seven years until the arrival of an “imported” Chinese pastor. Women missionaries who were not given a formal church office worked through their usual informal networks. Among those, Mary Findlay served as a valued member and an Elder of the Chinese Church in Auckland and for some years as Session Clerk.

Apart from the PCNZ body, only one missionary family that I interviewed could recall some form of outreach, for the local Chinese community that their parents’ had initiated. Hallam Howie used to run a Sunday School for the Chinese children of market gardeners, travelling from Epsom to Mangere each week. The Howie children remembered Chinese people in and out of their household from time to time, some “still laugh about the incongruity of [their] father, a dignified, grey haired doctor taking us kids to this grotty fly infested farm house on a Sunday afternoon”.

The only other evidence known was the NZCMS worker, Ethel McKenzie (nee Baker), who became involved in the Anglican Chinese mission through her husband, an Australian veteran who had had 26 years of missionary experience in South China and among Chinese immigrants in Sydney. When he was appointed the superintendent of the New Zealand Anglican Home Mission to the Chinese in 1927, she married into it. However, McKenzie died 11 months after his appointment, so her involvement might also have been very short-lived.

---

22 Margaret Lloyd, interviewed by the researcher via e-mail communication, October 25, 2010; Kathy Howie, interviewed by the researcher, September 11, 2010.
The next realm of influence exerted by returnee missionaries lies within medical practice and public health. Veteran nurses who thrived under the extreme conditions in China, often working in the capacity of superintendent when foreign doctors were unavailable, became competent matrons back home. Missionary doctors supported or sent by the PCNZ provided some distinguished examples. Both of the Kirk brothers developed a prominent career in the medical profession in Britain. Not too long after his return from China, John, the older brother, became the S.A. Courtauld Chair of Anatomy at Middlesex Hospital Medical School, Secretary and Chairman of the board of studies in human anatomy and morphology, and retired with the title of Professor Emeritus. The younger brother became a Member of Royal College of Obstetricians (M.R.C.O.G.) in 1949 and took on hospital work in gynaecology in London until retirement (see Appendix I for further details). Graham Milne, gained his practical experiences through FAU assignments and in PCNZ’s mission hospital over a period of just a few years, was offered a government appointment of Chief Medical Officer for Niue Island in 1952. Peter Milne’s story provides an interesting variation. Having only served a short term of three years as an evangelistic missionary, the great medical need in South China moved him to obtain a medical qualification back home. Having qualified as a medical doctor, he served with the British medical administration in Kenya. Upon returning to New Zealand, he was appointed as the medical superintendent at Seacliff Psychiatric Hospital and later at the Waitati Hospital. Dr. Gratzer, though not a Protestant, nor a New Zealander, was nevertheless supported by the PCNZ due to the difficulty of obtaining missionary doctors. To show gratitude for his faithfulness to the Kong Chuen mission hospital during the Pacific War, while all other New Zealand missionaries were interned as POW, the PCNZ helped him gain his residency in New Zealand in spite of his German citizenship, Catholic faith and Jewish ethnicity. Having worked in South China for more than a decade, often under the sole charge of a large hospital, he developed a great interest in pathology and became a noted diagnostician.
Norman Etherington notes that medical advancements developed in mission fields were often exported back to the sending countries. The most notable example would be Harold Turbott, “the Radio Doctor”. When Turbott was accepted to serve as a house surgery in Waikato Hospital after he passed the final exam in the medical school, the professor’s advice was that the best thing to do to become a surgeon is to go to either India or China so he could gain a very varied experience in a few months he would not get for years in New Zealand. Though he only spent two years in Canton, barely passing the stage of language learning, Turbott developed an interest in public health. When reviewing New Zealand’s health system in 1937 on behalf of the Labour government, S. M. Lambert of the Rockefeller Foundation commented that it was hard to attract good staff other than those possessed of a “certain missionary fanaticism”: Turbott – one of his principal informants – might well have been in his mind. His biographer rightly points out that the seeds of his interest in tropical medicine and Polynesian health had been sown when he gained experience in the treatment of malaria, hookworm and leprosy during his years in China. The two New Zealand doctors who joined the FAU China convoy also developed exceptional careers in the medical realm.

26 Ibid.
27 Dr. Heath Thompson’s two year involvement in the medical work in Guang Sheng Hospital in Changde (常德) and the Union Hospital in Hankou (汉口) stirred up his interest in chest surgery. He undertook further training in surgery in Britain before returned to New Zealand in 1954, and he became the Medical Superintendent of Princess Margaret Hospital in Christchurch. His wife Dr. Bunny Thompson worked in Guang Sheng Hospital alongside with her husband. She had her first taste of medical education when she designed and taught the first western-style physiotherapy course in the Institute of Hospital Technology in Hankou. After she eventually returned to New Zealand, she set up a private practice in thoracic physiotherapy in Christchurch. She pioneered the treatment of respiratory illness and became the first New Zealand Fellow of the Chartered Society of Physiotherapists in Britain in 1996. Her book on respiratory illness has been a widely used textbook for medical
In addition to the individual career path of returnee missionaries in church ministry, mission mobilisation, theological training, home mission and the medical world, missionaries as a group were active in their presentation of China. Brian Moloughney points out that much of New Zealand’s knowledge of China, up until after World War II came directly from missionaries, who interpreted their experiences and perceptions of the Chinese world to New Zealanders back home. Likewise, the former New Zealand Ambassador to China, Lindsay Watt,²⁸ thinks that, lacking sinologists and diplomats in the first half of the 20th Century, missionary writings probably did more than anything else to mould New Zealand perceptions of China.²⁹ Missionary reports were largely specific to the subfield that the writer was assigned to. New Zealanders have read Reginald Sturt’s version of the Mongolian wilderness, James Edgar’s version of the Tibetan border, George McNeur’s version of the rice-fields in South China, and Kathleen Hall’s version of the mountainous ranges in North China. There are as many “temporal Chinas” as there are many “spatial Chinas”. The stories of missionaries were told and re-told, often with some vigour and enthusiasm, through the pages of mission journals, church newsletters, prayer letters, and secular newspapers of the day, as well as when missionaries returned on furlough and gave addresses to eager audiences.³⁰ As described in Chapter III, when the first generation of New Zealand missionaries set out for China, they were consumers of overseas literature about things Chinese. By the mid-20th Century, New Zealand had built its own band of interpreters with first hand experiences and thus no longer had to solely rely on English or American filters

²⁸ Lindsay Watt started his diplomatic career as High Commissioner to Fiji, and then Ambassador to the PRC from 1985-1989. In early 1990s, he was seconded from the Ministry of External Relations & Trade as a Visiting Fellow at Victoria University of Wellington.
or lenses. This rhetoric echoes widely with what was reported back in other western countries to form a worldwide symphony. It may be argued that China has more than one face in the West, for example, the romantic Cathay, the heathen Empire, the yellow peril, the Confucius gentry, the communist totalitarian, and the world manufacturer. There are several “Chinas” defined by cultural, political or economic terms. When the missionary conceptions became absorbed into the mass consciousness, it is not difficult to find the resurrection of this rhetoric overtones within Christian and secular media reportage of China and the Chinese today. Some of the roots can probably be traced back to missionary discourse.

An important part of an average missionary’s job was to keep records, maintain accounts, write letters and compile reports. In the CIM world, “Probationers” were encouraged to keep a diary. Missionaries of any length of service were expected to write quarterly letters through the Superintendent to the Assistant China Director. These letters should be “of the freest character and convey correct impressions as to how his time is occupied”, as they were sources of information for mission periodicals. In addition to these requirements, missionaries also wrote numerous personal letters to family and friends. The letters with accounts of their “first impressions” were a distinctive genre as probationers constantly arrived in China, and as missionaries were being relocated to new stations. Missionary reports were often journalistic in the impressionism with which they treated their subject. It was eyewitness history, but a self-censored account, each writer appealing to what Paul Fussell has described as “the sanction of actualities”. According to the generic convention, “the travelling must be represented as something more than travelling, that it shall assume a meaning either metaphysical, psychological, artistic, religious, political, but always ethical”.

---

33 Ibid., 214.
Regular editions of this time-consuming necessity had to be provided to stir and maintain the interests of the home church. Whenever volumes of these letters fell low, editors of prayer notes or mission magazines would lodge complaints through the mission executives about the scarcity of news of mission work and mission staff. It was once suggested to the Secretary of the PCNZ’s Field Council that a rota be arranged “by which a News Letter of reasonable proportion” could be sent home monthly.34

In terms of its small size and population, New Zealand had a surprising number of Christian periodicals.35 In an era when missionary writings were the only source of information regarding the exotic world, the secular press was often prepared to publish or reproduce articles that were otherwise titled “field intelligence” in mission magazines. Prior to 1950, the press’ reportage on China affairs had often been associated with missionary affairs. A search with “China” and “missionary” found 14,758 results in http://paperspast.natlib.govt.nz.36 George McNeur’s first book was published by a secular press, Otago Daily Times and Witness, rather than the Presbyterian Bookroom.37 Later in 1929, his articles on “China’s Growing Pains” were accepted by the New Zealand Herald, Christchurch Press, and the Otago Daily Times in 1929 and appeared three times so it no longer needed to be put in PCNZ’s official organ.

35 Periodicals circulated at the time containing regular reportage on missionary work in China included the Australasian version of the China’s Millions by the CIM, The Church Missionary Gleaner, Church Missionary Intelligencer, and The Reaper (NZABM) by the NZCMS, Mission Field, East and West, Church Abroad, and Quarterly Intercession Paper by the SPG, The Presbyterian Outlook, The Evangelist, and The Harvest Field (PWMU) by the PCNZ, The Treasury, and Echoes of Service by the Brethren, The Reaper by the BTI, The New Zealand Baptist by the Baptist Union. The missionary’s interpretation of China was also passed on to the next generations through the children’s section of different periodicals. For example, the “Young China” insert of the China’s Millions, “Children’s page” in The Reaper (NZABM), Children’s World, the SPG’s King’s Messengers, and the PCNZ’s Break of Day.
Another means by which missionaries influenced New Zealanders’ perception of China and the Chinese people was deputation. In the first half of the 20th Century, the visit of a China missionary always created great excitement in towns and cities of the isolated Dominion. It was often the local residents’ first and only touch with things in the Middle Kingdom that was distinctively different from the local Chinese greengrocers. McNeur’s furlough in 1907/1908 alone touched an accumulated total populace of 15,033 in 122 meetings. As the YWCA’s business manager for free China, Agnes Moncrieff “talked [her] head off” during her war-time furlough around the country: addressed six Rotaries in seven weeks and was invited as the first woman spoke at the Dunedin University Club. All the secondary schools came to Wellington College to hear her China story except Marsden College. Deputation talks by a China missionary were, almost by definition, about China and the Chinese. Once a missionary was announced as a speaker, the congregation would expect to hear about his/her field. In this sense, the pulpit of home churches became the front-stage of representation. While acting as ambassadors of Christianity, at the time this was so closely associated with western culture in China, they were acting as ambassadors of Chinese culture to the New Zealand audience. With such an in-between identity, the missionaries were moving from one front-stage to another, trying to shape the audience’s interpretations of both worlds. The “home-base” in this sense switched from the “back-stage” to “front-stage” upon which China was represented.

38 Mawson (Secretary of FMC) to McNeur, June 7, 1929, CVM Staff Files, G. H. McNeur, 1926-1929, AA10/5/6, PCNZ Archive.
As a result of reports, deputations, fund-raising activities and special appeals made by PCNZ missionaries over half a century, its Foreign Mission correspondent was able to claim in 1950 that “China is written on the hearts of New Zealand Presbyterians”\(^{41}\) in 1950. In the annual proceedings of the following year, a full statement was adopted by the PCNZ in regarding to the South China Mission:

The South China Mission has held a special place in the life of our Church and has been deeply engraved on the hearts of our people. Partly by reason of the outstanding personalities who have been associated with it, partly by reason of the recurring crises which, again and again, have pressed it upon our attention, and partly because of the sacrifices that have been made and the lives that have been given in its service, it has acquired a power to awaken our interest, and to stir our hearts as few other causes have. It has come to be associated in our minds with danger, and heroism, and that sacrificial spirit which is the hall-mark of the Christian faith. It has called forth the prayers of our people, and the praises of our people, and the generous giving of our people as few other enterprises have done, and is linked in our thoughts with the names and persons of missionaries of whom our Church is justly proud.\(^{42}\)

Likewise, the New Zealand Chinese historian James Ng is inclined to suggest that the major success of the CVM was not in China but in New Zealand, that the mission staff had a lasting impact on the members of the mother churches more so than they did on the members of its daughter churches. In this sense the CVM functioned as “a precarious bridge between the two cultures and offered some

---

\(^{41}\) Letter to Cook, December 11, 1950, OMC, MSP - SCM, 1949, AA2/2/1, PCNZ Archive.

alternatives to the prevailing racism”.43 Not only was the PCNZ as a whole tied to its China mission, but various local churches and Presbyterian organisations were tied to specific elements of the mission, particularly its personnel. The “own missionary” scheme was introduced in early 1900s to encourage local churches or church organisations to adopt overseas missionaries and to contribute towards their support.44 Over time, at least 22 CVM missionaries were “adopted” or “owned” by a New Zealand Presbyterian organization (see Table 16).

---

44 St Andrews was the first congregation to adopt the “own missionary” scheme in about 1905. See “St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church Parish History Jubilee Souvenir 1863-1913”, 36.
Table 16: A List of Supporting Local Church Organisations and their CVM “Own Missionaries”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting Organisation</th>
<th>Name of the CVM missionary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Two Endeavourers”, Otago, and St. John’s Church, Wellington</td>
<td>George Hunter McNeur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Young Men’s Bible Class Union</td>
<td>Herbert Davies, Elwyn George (Paddy) Jansen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Young Women’s Bible Class Union</td>
<td>Kathleen (Kay) Anuei Pih, Dorothy Robertson, Alice Mary Cook</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Church, Dunedin</td>
<td>John Kirk, Eileen Mary Reid, Charles Everard North</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knox Church, Dunedin</td>
<td>Owen Lamont Eaton, John Alistair Loan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Andrews Church, Dunedin</td>
<td>Edward Wilfred Kirk, Annie Doidge Hancock, Annie Isobella James</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knox Church, Christchurch</td>
<td>Winifred (Winnie) Mary Stubbs, Frances Gordon Ogilvie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Paul’s, Wanganui</td>
<td>William Mawson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stirling, Clutha Presbytery</td>
<td>Peter Milne, Elizabeth M. Prentice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Paul’s Church, Invercargill</td>
<td>Ellen (Nellie) Evelyn Wright</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milton Presbyterian Church</td>
<td>Andrew Lindsay Miller</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hawera Presbyterian Church</td>
<td>Agnete Natalie Yansen</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tangible links could often be found between mission assets in South China and particular Christian organisations in the “down–under” dominion. For example, the building fund for the Kong Chuen Hospital was raised by PCNZ’s Layman’s Missionary Movement. Annie James’ V8 Ford car presented an interesting show case in that the car was not only bought with the “honey” collected by the PCNZ’s “Busy Bees” as a whole, but also that each part was itemised by different “hives”.

Table 17 lists how different groups of New Zealand children were attached to certain part of the car.

Table 17: Itemised Contribution Made by Different PCNZ’s Busy Bee Groups Towards A. James’ Car.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hives</th>
<th>Parts of the car</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kelburn</td>
<td>Horn</td>
<td>£3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Napier</td>
<td>Seat</td>
<td>£3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Hutt</td>
<td>Screen</td>
<td>£1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Paul’s Wanganui</td>
<td>Wiper on screen</td>
<td>5/-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roseneath</td>
<td>Light</td>
<td>10/-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knox, Dunedin</td>
<td>Wheel</td>
<td>£1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Otaki</td>
<td>Repair kit</td>
<td>£3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dunedin</td>
<td>Hood</td>
<td>£2/18/6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maori Hill</td>
<td>Petrol</td>
<td>£1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nightcaps</td>
<td>Mirror</td>
<td>10/-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohai</td>
<td>Electric wiring</td>
<td>5/-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Otautau,</td>
<td>Accelerator</td>
<td>£1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Such a linkage was by no means unique to the PCNZ mission, but a commonly practiced fund-raising tactic of all missions. For example, in the SPG system, the

45 “Busy Bees” was the PCNZ’s mission-minded children group; “hives” refers to different sub-groups, while “honey” refers to monetary contributions.
sewing machine of St. Barnabas’ Hospital in Chi Chou was purchased with the money provided by All Saints’ Parish in Palmerston North, while the blankets were provided by the All Saints’ Girl’s Club.46

Missionary exhibitions were another way to “interest, inspire and instruct”47 domestic Christians in the missionary endeavour of the Church as well as a fund-raising schemes. The “East and West” exhibition, held by the Anglican Church in 1923 in Wellington, resulted in a profit of over £500, while the one at Palmerston North in 1925 made a profit of £221.48 Reinders points out that missionary exhibitions were surely entertaining even though there were consistent assertions that they were not entertainments. The very fact that the “mere entertainment” value of these exhibitions was repudiated indicated a piety that stood against displays, shows, frivolous drama, illusion, and façade. The ironic effect of missionary exhibitions lay in the manner by which the showy visual effects that characterised the presentation of heathenism were also an indispensable feature of the exhibition itself.49

It takes only a small step from this to conclude that missionary writings, deputation talks, and missionary exhibitions represented China selectively. Quite often, it included not only what the missionaries had seen and heard, but also what they thought might interest the home-side readership/audience. Just as a five minute talk after a sermon put the pressure on the missionaries to “run through it”, a half column of space in a newspaper and a few square meters of faked Chinese street scene also compelled the presenter to compress China in a reductionist fashion. It was a common tactic for missionaries to use lantern slides, exhibits and curios to give special interest to their talks. Symbols or pictures were adopted to convey a thousand

46 *The Reaper* (NZABM), (October 14 1928):3.
48 “Missionary Exhibitions,” *The Reaper* [NZABM], (February 16, 1925): 4.
words on their behalf, or to grade their languages to work around the general ignorance of the home audience. Inevitably the missionaries had to use words and images of stereotypes so that their messages could be understood and accepted without further explanation. Being taken out of socio-cultural context and transplanted in an alien surrounding, these “specimens” were instrumental in the reinforcement of the “otherness” of the Chinese nation already characteristic of New Zealand culture. Though missionaries as a group presented China more soberly than the popular media, the distance in time and space, as well as that between the missionary and their audience, still made China appear to be “a trope of inversion, a land of unreality, and a marker of unintelligibility” to the general New Zealand public.50

Chinese calligraphy, or more simply, Chinese character, was one of the symbols used by missionaries to represent China. Chinese script, whether in engraved illustrations or in photographic images, all looked to readers as widely dispersed as Napier or Nelson like a set of well-ordered chicken scratches. It made no more intelligible response apart from being a kind of exotic fantasy. The common perception that China was alien and obscure was reinforced in the transformative processes mediating between the real object and the object that met the New Zealand readers’ eyes. Moreover, the presentation of the Chinese characters in the mission publications often suffered from errors and ignorance in the process of communication and reproduction. As late as in the early 1950s, the PCNZ’s Outlook still showed some Chinese characters upside down.51 New Zealand printers must have had to improvise these scripts so that they appeared as a happy jumble of odd angles with the characteristic wedge-shaped strokes that suited the tastes of home readers.

50 Ibid., 206.
51 One is on the cover page of the issue dated October 25, 1950, and another on page 6 of the issue dated February 5, 1951.
Just as my Aunt continued to exert her influence over the performing art of opera in her retirement, China missionaries continued to shape their compatriots’ knowledge and emotions about China after they had retired from active field service or even beyond their lifetime by writing memoirs or having their life-stories rescued by biographers. Mission magazines primarily influenced contemporary readers while books can often be reprinted and passed on to the following generations. The most well-known China missionary in New Zealand, Annie James, had her “China story” published while she was still in active service.\textsuperscript{52} Kathleen Hall might be the only equivalent to Annie James in terms of biographical writings.\textsuperscript{53} Other New Zealand missionaries attracted less attention from biographers other than their children or relatives. The McNeur family produced more than two missionaries to China, and their lives are well documented.\textsuperscript{54} The McIntosh family was the CIM equivalent of the McNeurs of the PCNZ. This was an era in which writing was one of the few channels through which a woman could exert influence. Amy McIntosh became such a mission writer who maintained and developed her flair of writing for many years, informing New Zealanders, evangelicals as well as others wider circles, about things

\textsuperscript{52} As early as in 1945, the director of missions of the PCNZ, Donald MacDiarmid wrote a short story, \textit{Tse Koo – a Heroine of China}, followed by a much fuller version by the Methodist Deaconess writer Rita Snowden entitled \textit{Never a Dull Moment} three years later. Little did the writers or the readers expect an even more dramatic sequel to her time during Sino-Japan War. Annie’s self-account, \textit{I Was in Prison}, was published in booklet-size in 1952 as a response to great expression of public interest. Twelve years later, a more complete version of her missionary career in China was narrated by Roy Belmer in the book \textit{The Teeth of the Dragon}.

\textsuperscript{53} Tom Newnham was instrumental in making her story known in China as well as in New Zealand. His first attempt came out in 1992, which was translated into Chinese in the following year, becoming the very first publication about a New Zealand missionary in mainland China. An abridged version was included in his book \textit{New Zealand Women in China} in 1995. Ten years later, Newnham enlarged his original version and gave it a new title, \textit{Dr. Bethune’s Angel: the Life of Kathleen Hall}. Not entirely happy with this series of writings based on a single interpretation, Rae McGregor provided a feminist perspective in the new biography launched in 2006: \textit{Shrewd Sanctity: the Story of Kathleen Hall, Missionary Nurse in China, 1896-1970}.

\textsuperscript{54} Being the first missionary sent by the PCNZ to China on the basis of his highly respected status, \textit{George Hunter McNeur: A Pioneer Missionary in South China} was published by Henry Barton shortly after McNeur’s death. The McNeurs’ daughter, Jean reminisced about her life in her old age, with her own daughter’s assistance. As a result, \textit{Daughter of China} was produced in the same year of her death. Apart from George McNeur and Jean McNeur (later Mrs. Moore), Graham Milne’s wife, Areta McNeur, was also arguably a missionary to China.
Chinese, Tibetan and otherwise Asian.  

With the exception of Annie James and Kathleen Hall, the life-story of modest single women often went unnoticed. Frances Ogilvie was lucky in this sense to have her nephew Gordon Ogilvie, a local historian and biographer, to document her “China story” in *Little Feet in a Big Room* and to have it published the year after her death in 1992. In a similar vein, Mary E. Moore was lucky to have a distance relative, Yvonne M. Wilkie, an archivist at the PCNZ Research Centre, to unearth her story by going through CSM magazines and publications and to have it appear in www.TeAra.govt.nz sixty years after her death. Anne Lilburne was perhaps the only single woman who wrote down her missionary career in some details, with the title *I Went Out ... Not Knowing*. Nonetheless, Paddy Jansen’s book, *Jade Engraved*, was a collective story of PCNZ missionaries during the Sino-Japan war.

The uniqueness of the FAU China convoy led Caitriona Cameron to interview the surviving members of this group and rediscovered their collective story in *Go Anywhere Do Anything* almost half a century after the event. Furthermore, the Brethren missionary Reginald Sturt’s letters were compiled in *Children of the Wilderness* a few years after his death. Sturt’s colleague, Douglas Broughton, recorded the early days of his missionary career in *Mongol Plains and Japanese Prisons* in 1947. However, the accounts of his life as a biography were not put together until half a century later by his son, John Sturt, who wrote of his childhood in *Loving Life*.

---

55 Ten years after the couple’s retirement from mission leadership, one of the McIntosh daughters, Linnet Hinton, herself a member of the same organisation as her parents, compiled her parents’ life-story with a telling title, *Never Say Can’t*. This biography was the only one about “Kiwi” Old China Hands formally published by the OMF. It was translated into traditional Chinese and published in Hong Kong in 1991, two years ahead of Kathleen Hall’s biography, which made it the very first record of New Zealand missionaries in China in the Chinese language.

56 For example, apart from the sketchy notes in *In His Name: A Record of Assembly Missionary Outreach from New Zealand*, the story of the “two Alices” (A. Gresham and A. Rout) had largely been buried in oblivion. So had the stories of the NZCMS single women workers.
The exact size and scope of the circulation of these books are hard to trace. Nonetheless, it could be reasonable to conclude that, in an era when mission narratives were seen as a source of moral instruction and Christian inspiration, missionary biographies as a whole must have substantially influenced and shaped the perception of China and the Chinese to average New Zealanders, and were often the primary source of readable, if not sensational, information at a popular level.

The opera trade used to be a trade of oral tradition. Since most practitioners were illiterate, the training involved a lot of rote learning and visual memorisation. Consequently there were very few first-hand records about the actors/actresses and the development of the trade. Instead, what are left are impressions represented by members of the literati class who, for one reason or another, were acquainted with the opera circus. Thus we as the later day audience can only access the performing art of the past through a third party’s eyes. Missionary representations of China, whether in the form of letters, magazine-length articles, official reports or personal reminiscences, have served the same function. Given the grass-root origin of the early believers, the Chinese church unsurprisingly had a similar oral culture. Church records had been irregular and sporadic, very little of whatever was generated survived after 1949. On the contrary, western mission boards have collectively kept a vast body of archived material. As a result, the early history of the Chinese church, and probably of any Asian church, was recorded in English – the Protestant language – instead of in Chinese, by missionaries instead of by Chinese Christians, and kept in overseas libraries and archives instead of in China itself.

Being able to record history, to represent the “Other”, and to shape memory was by no means insignificant. The ability to record and to represent demonstrates economic, communicative and administrative power, backed up by a global colonial network. It was not only the ability to inform the New Zealand audience about what China was
like, but also the ability to shape the memory of the Chinese audience in relation to their past. Such process of representation perpetuates China as a “mission field”. When only one voice was heard and survived, it became the voice. I was told by one representative of the Chinese Church in Guangzhou that they did not possess any records regarding the PCNZ mission. He admitted that having no records meant that they had no authority to form or justify an opinion of the past.\(^{57}\) The three Protestant Missionary Conferences held in Shanghai in 1877, 1890 and 1907, the missionary surveys of various data-collection compiled in the 1922 publication of *The Christian Occupation of China* by the China Continuation Committee, all attempted to present a panoramic view of the China’s millions and its missionary thousands. Foucault’s work on the panopticon suggests that a panoramic view was by no means a neutral view. Pratt takes Foucault’s theory to apply to colonial travel writing and proposes that “the panorama is a device for seeing the country as a future colonized country”, and the narrator with a panoramic view arrogates to himself/herself the power of the colonial position.\(^{58}\) Beginning as consumers of this data collection and production, New Zealand missionaries gradually built their own representation of China to the home audience in the back-stage.

The reverse impact of China missionaries back in New Zealand was not only pervasive over time, but also at times incidental. For example, one of New Zealand’s major export products, kiwifruit, was a by-product of the mission movement. If Kate Fraser had not joined the CSM in 1896 to teach in its mission station in Ichang (宜昌), there would have been no reason for her sister Mary Isabel Fraser, Lady Principal of Wanganui Girl’s College to visit this small interior town of the Sichuan province in 1903. The transplanting of the Chinese gooseberries as it was called in the West, or *Yang-Tao*, as it was known locally, would have been an unlikely happening in the South Seas, let alone fall into the hands of a nursery man in

\(^{57}\) Phone communication, January 6, 2012.

Wanganui. Until recently, all commercial kiwifruit cultivars selected over the years in New Zealand could be traced back to those original seeds collected from the mission station in Ichang. Fraser was only one of the trio that sailed from New Zealand for China. In another vein, had her colleague Mary Emelia Moore not dedicated 51 years of her life in these inland cities, or had she not kept more than a hundred articles from China with her when she eventually retired to Dunedin, the Otago Museum would be short of a Chinese collection, or at least the foundation of such a collection would be vastly different.

This section would not be complete without a scrutiny of the lack of influence on the part of China missionaries. Absence of the missionary voice was most apparent in the political and scholarly spheres, where their British and North American counterparts were far more actively involved. Unlike in the US where China missionaries played a vital role in the shaping of American foreign policy in East Asia, New Zealand returnees appeared to eschew political debate. The strong evangelistic outlook of the New Zealand cohort partly explains their lack of political aptitude. Moreover, the political attitude, or rather, the lack of attitude, of the

60 Yvonne M. Wilkie. 'Moore, Mary Emelia - Biography', from the Dictionary of New Zealand Biography. Te Ara - the Encyclopedia of New Zealand, updated September 1, 2010, URL: [http://www.TeAra.govt.nz/en/biographies/3m59/1](http://www.TeAra.govt.nz/en/biographies/3m59/1), accessed September 10, 2012. Moore’s collection was an individual endeavour and the size of her collection was relatively modest, compared with some other Christian missions. For examples, Canadian Jesuit procureurs used to send shopping list to China for specific items to stock the Jesuits’ private museum, the College de Sainte-Marie, the Musee d’art chinois (the Chinese Art Museum), and the “curio shop” attached to it. The way in which missionaries collected souvenirs and artifacts to “represent” the “Other” to their home audience is a relatively new field. See: France Lord, “The Silent Eloquence of Things: The Missionary Collections and Exhibitions of the Society of Jesus in Quebec, 1843-1946” in Canadian Missionaries, Indigenous Peoples: Representing Religion at Home and Abroad edited by Alvyn Austin and Jamie S. Scott (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005), 205-234.
missionary group, reflected the more general character of New Zealand’s foreign policy. There seemed no need for haste in the consideration of political recognition, as New Zealand had few interests, economic, social, diplomatic, or political, to protect in China. Few New Zealanders would feel as strongly as the Americans that China had been “lost” because there was relatively not much to lose.

Though showing no desire to influence or even to enquire into governmental stands regarding the “China out there”, China missionaries were instrumental in changing domestic policy regarding the “Chinese right here”. On behalf of the Chinese community in New Zealand, the Dunedin Presbytery’s Public Question Committee asked for a deputation including the two PCNZ veteran missionaries, George McNeur and Herbert Davies, to wait on the Prime Minister Peter Fraser. Both men’s long-standing missionary services in South China had given them the credentials for “a most understanding and sympathetic hearing”. The result of the government investigation thus initiated was a permanent-residence status granted to all war refugee families, as well as the return of the bond money lodged on entrance to the country. One of the arguments that McNeur and Davies used, seeking the common ground between the Pakeha and the Chinese worlds, was the social value of having united Chinese families in place of sojourner males. As a further result of these representations, the government admitted the wives and minor children of fifty approved Chinese residents for the year of 1948 and 1949. The privilege was given only to men who had been at least twenty years in New Zealand, with preference to those longest married. The part played by the Presbyterian Church in securing these concessions was greatly appreciated by both the Chinese in Southland and those in South China. The outcome of such gratitude ironically resembled that of “rice Christians”, in that the Chinese Association of Otago and Southland issued a circular letter to all Chinese residents urging attendance at the Chinese Church whenever possible, as a Christian profession could be assured nothing but goodwill from the
While politics and the public were usually considered the men’s sphere, the New Zealand missionary community saw a woman displaying unusual boldness in her support for the “new China” in light of the fact of most of her male colleagues’ were relatively silent or took a staunch anti-communist stand on the China question. Kathleen Hall was instrumental in the early development of the New Zealand China Friendship Association (NZCFA), a pro-communist organisation. Launched at the time when the Cold War dominated most New Zealanders’ view of the world, its aim of urging recognition of the new China through the means of a friendship society proved to be unpopular. New Zealand’s involvement in the Korean War was supported by both Labour and National parties and had universal media approval. Only the numerically insignificant New Zealand Communist Party held a different view, and thus any views supporting China or opposing the commitment of New Zealand troops would be regarded as “communist fronts”, and thus largely discredited. The general anti-communist and anti-atheist stand of the Protestant church made Kathleen’s involvement in the NZCFA most intrepid. Being the only ex-missionary founding member, Kathleen found herself moving among returnees of non-religious relief and reform organisations, such as Rewi Alley’s associates, ex-personnel of Shanden Bailie School, Gung Ho Industrial Collectives, CORSO, and those from socialist and trade union backgrounds. When the NZCFA’s first National Conference was held in Wellington in 1958, she became the delegate for the Auckland branch. By the end of the following year, she agreed to be on the Executive of the Auckland Branch. By then, she was also a member of the World Peace Council, and attended the World Peace Congress in Melbourne.

Apart from the medical sector, the missionary influence in the New Zealand academia was near nil. Jean McNeur was a noticeable exception here in that her M.A. thesis completed in 1930 was one of the very earliest academic treatments on the subject of Chinese in New Zealand. While there had always been a small percentage of English and American veteran missionaries who secured university teaching posts, in sinology as it was known in Europe or in China Studies as it came to be called in North America, New Zealand as a small country in the early half of the 20th Century did not have the infrastructure or the platform for its returnee missionaries. As late as 1991, there were only 64 students enrolled in Chinese courses from Form Three to Form Seven in the nationwide schooling system and only one was male, compared with 15,921 enrollments in Japanese. When the first tertiary Chinese course appeared in 1966 in the University of Auckland, the Faculty looked overseas to secure its founding professor, who happened to be a “Mish-kid” from China. It perhaps never occurred to the mind of the recruiters that there could be a pool of domestic candidates as a legacy of the missionary enterprise up until 1950.

A letter to George McNeur who was commissioned to do various translation works for the Department of Internal Affairs, commented that “virtually no reliable Chinese translator had been available” before McNeur had started to assist in document translation. This Secretary for Internal Affairs seemed to be totally unaware of the great number of CIM missionaries who were acquainted with the Chinese written

---

65 Prof. Manying Ip, e-mail message to the researcher, September 15, 2012.
66 Douglas Lancashire was born in Tianjin (天津), China, to a Salvation Army missionary family. He received his early schooling at the Tientsin Grammar School. From 1966 to 1981 he served as Professor of Chinese (Foundation Chair) and Head of Department of Asian Languages and Literatures at University of Auckland. See the following link for more information: “Douglas Lancashire Home Page,” [http://www.christendom-awake.org/pages/dlancash/dlancash.html](http://www.christendom-awake.org/pages/dlancash/dlancash.html), accessed September 20, 2012.
language. On the one hand, the subaltern positioning of the New Zealand cohort in the missionary force made them less likely to rise to high leadership and scholarship; on the other hand, the exceptional few would find no opportunity for their specialist skills back home. When opera became an old-fashioned form of entertainment, the retiring actors and actresses found increasing difficulty in gathering the brightest and ablest apprentices from the younger generation who were interested enough to take over their performing art. In the same way, the language skills and cultural knowledge of China missionaries were largely wasted in the small towns and countryside of New Zealand. James Edgar⁶⁸ and Reginald Sturt,⁶⁹ experts in the Tibetan and Mongolian languages and cultures, were the two most likely candidates for academic scholarship. Both died in China. Had they lived long enough to retire and had they been interested enough to take secular lecturing positions, they were more likely to find these opportunities in British and American colleges and universities than in New Zealand.

Historians and sinologists committed to the “Stimuli-Response Paradigm” tend to see China as a passive receiver of foreign influences, unwillingly responding to various external stimuli imposed on her. Though this model of understanding seems to explain many of the historical events in modern China, it largely ignores the reverse impact that China had had on its uninvited visitors, missionaries included. The post-China developments and activities of the ex-China missionaries provide an apt illustration of the fluidity of social boundaries with which Goffman is concerned. Having been exposed to the “front-stage” and its audiences, actors returned to the

⁶⁸ Edgar was a Fellow of the Royal Geographical Society and of the Royal Anthropological Institute. He launched the West China Border Research Society in 1922, and published over sixty articles in the journal of this Society, that is, about one fifth of all articles published in this journal between 1922 and 1946. During his missionary career in China, he published 152 essays, reports, commentaries, travel notes and poems in various journals such as Geographic Journal, Journal of the North China Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society, Journal of West China Border Research Society, and Chinese Recorder.

⁶⁹ Sturt was also a Fellow of the Royal Geographical Society, recommended by Owen Lattimore, a well-known traveller and author. Sturt also compiled a trilingual Grammar, Primer, and Dictionary in English, Chinese and Mongolian languages (John Sturt, Loving Life: One Physician's Journey (Auckland, N.Z.: DayStar Publications Trust, 2003), 63-64).
“back-stage” living with a different outlook. Likewise, life was never the same again for those who had been exposed to the land and people of the China field. For some, the China scene reinforced their proud sense of being a British subject while for others; they discovered a strange new sense of belonging. The sense of home-coming was particularly strong for the New Zealand Chinese Kathleen Pih. At her Tauranga home surrounded by a Chinese garden, she confided to her interviewer, Manying Ip, in her eighties that

I am really glad that I went back to China. As a girl, I did not like being Chinese at all. The people that I admired were the Scots. I accept that I am Chinese now, but I was very sensitive about it when I was young. Going back to work in China in the 1930s was really good for me, otherwise I would always have felt so sorry for myself for being born Chinese. Only after working in China did I find my Chinese identity.70

Every person is a filter of his/her era. The same stage could have a different impact on different people. Nonetheless, the missionary force had collectively become a different cohort in the midst of their contemporaries. The “back-stage” thus went through subtle changes as a result of the changes in these personnel, the mediators of “back-” and “front-stages”. When those who were meant to be boundary-keepers become boundary-removers, it was no longer easy to differentiate the “front” from the “back”.

7.2. Post-China Influences in Other Mission Fields

In the opening section of this chapter, it is suggested that China missionaries brought China with them as their mental luggage on returning to New Zealand. It could be equally suggested that when those ex-China missionaries were transferred to other

mission fields, they also took China with them. A comprehensive survey of post-China “redeployment” of China missionaries can be better arranged at organisational level. Two mission organisations, the CIM and the PCNZ, are chosen for close scrutiny.

The drama of the CIM’s post-China development is particularly interesting in that it had not only been the biggest mission society in China, but also one whose only field had formed the cornerstone of its collective identity. The success story of the CIM was in many ways a result of the unique conditions of the Imperial China. It could be said that there would be no CIM without China. Moreover, China had been the stabiliser of the CIM, and the anchor of its collective identity. With the expansive laboratory of the China field, the CIM was able to experiment with new missiological methods and to develop coping strategies to counter the demands of an ever-changing China. However, the traumatic experiences of the “Reluctant Exodus” compelled the CIM to adopt a condition of “changelessness” as a survival strategy. In other words, the loss of China had led to a loss of flexibility and creativity in the CIM leadership.

The closing of the mission’s only field brought existential anxiety to its leaders as well as to its members. A critical decision had to be made regarding the very existence of the Mission, with missiological euthanasia on the one hand, and relocation or transformation on the other. In the leadership meeting held in Kalorama, Melbourne, in Feb 1951, it was decided that instead of completely disbanding, the personnel resources and missiological experiences should be channeled into other fields. East Asia was chosen as the region for “redeployment”, a new “front-stage” where the missionary drama could be resumed. In order to maintain internal solidarity among its members and external reputation among supporters, the CIM stuck to a “no change” outlook for a long time. In his announcement of the withdrawal policy in early 1952, the British Home Director had to assure the home
audience that the Mission as a Mission still existed, with the same personnel, the same principles, and the same message.\textsuperscript{71} However, few foresaw that the change of identity would lag many years behind the change of field.

The next dilemma of impression management that this organisation had to face was the change of its name. The new name decided on in the leadership meeting in Bournemouth, England, was long and tedious: China Inland Mission Overseas Missionary Fellowship. It needs to be noted that in the CIM discursive system, the word “overseas” is not only in relation to the West, but also in relation to China. In other words, the CIM was signaling that they were moving to a “third space” mission field that was not only overseas to Anglo-European Christendom, but also overseas to Cathay. It is in this context that the job title “Overseas Director” replaced “China Director”, the name “Overseas Council” replaced “China Council”. Moreover, for more than a decade between 1952 and 1965, the old branding “China Inland Mission” had been kept in all sending countries for its value in raising support and recruitment, while the new name “Overseas Missionary Fellowship” was introduced in the newly adopted fields in East Asia in order to avoid Cold War sensitivity against “red China”. In addition to a dual reading of this name change, the name should be read in a hierarchical sense as “the Overseas Missionary Fellowship of the China Inland Mission”. The use of a more informal word “fellowship” seemed to suggest that the redeployment in East Asia was only a sub-field, or even satellite field, of the mission’s core business. Just as a mega-church could have many fellowships, the mission was developing a new branch of operation in the name of a fellowship while conserving its resources to resume to its main field in a context of uncertainty. It might be unfair to say that the CIM’s redeployment in East Asia was half-hearted, but it was certainly not whole-hearted. It was not until 1965, when the hope of returning to mainland China had vanished, that the mission formerly adopted OMF as its official name world-wide. Prior to 1965, the mission used a hyphen or a

slash between the old and new names in publicity (i.e. CIM-OMF or CIM/OMF); after 1965 and until this day, the mission still has not quite dropped its old name but kept it in a bracket (i.e. OMF (formerly CIM)). Whether hyphenated, slashed, or bracketed, the use of these punctuations reflected an underlying hybrid identity that was closely bound with its “first love”. Therefore, the mission’s transition from China to East Asia was not only a physical and geographical matter, but also a psychological and spiritual process.

On the personal level, the “China factor” had a lasting impact on its Old China Hands. To those who took China as the “blue sea” that makes all other waters unworthy of the name, the Malay Peninsula and the Formosa Island were only a lake and stream in comparison. Reluctance to move into other fields was not a CIM specific phenomenon. Stanley H. Dixon, Secretary of the Conference of British Missionary Societies and an Old China Hand himself, reported that one third of China missionaries returning to Britain were retiring altogether from missionary service, a pattern that raised questions of whether there had been a loss of the sense of vocation. Such reluctance could be equally understood as the aftermath of a strong dedication to the China field rather than a loss of missionary calling. The fact that China had been a particularly happy field of service, and Chinese colleagueship an enriching experience that brought the consequent hesitancy to move to a different “front-stage”. Even those Old China Hands who responded to the renewed call to East Asia of the CIM-OMF could not help indulging themselves in reminiscing on the “Old Golden Days” in China. The longer one had served in China, the more difficult it was for an Old China Hand to adapt to a new physical and social

---

72 This expression is adopted from a well-known Chinese poem: The blue sea makes all other waters unworthy of the name;/ After Wushan, all other clouds are mere puffballs above;/ Ignoring fair blossoms bestrewing my path, /Partly for my precepts, but mostly for you!

73 Report on Far East Consultation, St. Alban’s, 6-8/7/1951, CBMSA, Box 390, quoted in George Hood, *Neither Bang Nor Whimper* (Singapore: Presbyterian Church of Singapore,
environment. Age and the consequent difficulty in learning a new language were aspects, while the degree of identification with the China field was a deeper reason.

In 1955, about three quarters of the OMF’s members were Old China Hands. In 1970, the ratio had dropped to one quarter. Just over half of the original team listed in 1950 restarted their missionary career in East Asian fields (i.e. 394 out of 710). It was not until 1992 that Old China Hands completely disappeared from the current membership list. The consequence of appointing superintendents and directors from senior missionaries who had had ten years of field experience was that the ratio of Old China Hands was much more concentrated at the leadership level than in general membership. The initial Overseas Council was entirely made up of Old China Hands. When CIM formally adopted its new name OMF in 1965, Old China Hands made up all 11 directors, as well as 20 out of the 23 members of the Overseas Council (87%), while they only represented 36.5% of the general membership. When Sanders retired from the directorship in 1969, the ratio of Old China Hands in leadership was still as high as 62.5%, not to mention the two second generation CIMers, David Hayman and Alan Knight, both children of New Zealand missionaries who grew up in China.74 On top of that, nearly all Old China Hands were put on a “reserve list” with the expectation that if China opened its door again, they would be called to return to their beloved mission field.

Such a numerical representation corresponded to a mental representation. The high proportion of Old China Hands in the CIM system with greater concentration at the top, including senior members, superintendents and directors, became a hindrance in its post-China development in other fields. In the China days, the CIM presented its own version of inland China to the Western audience through mission mobilisation; in the post-China days, the CIM-OMF presented China to the rest of East Asia

---

74 These percentages are calculated on the basis of the information in CIM/OMF’s Prayer Directories.
through missionary activities. The “China element” had been a burden as well as a legacy. The “Taylor-made” missiological strategies were in many ways tailor-made for imperial China. Though long-standing and effective, the same strategies did not necessarily suit the social conditions in all countries of East Asia. If the century-long branding, grass-root level church-planting, identification with the local culture, eschewing of political power, simple lifestyle and life-long dedication were the “assets” from its China days, other China day’s principles proved to be outdated in the Post-war era. For example, its inland orientation failed to recognise the rapid urbanisation in most Asian countries, its in-house decision-making was slow to take advantage of amply available external resources and expertise, its financial pool system was indiscriminately blind to the increasing regional differences in living standards, the banning of employing local workers for local work as stipulated in its indigenisation policy, hindered the growth of infant churches, its home versus field dualist thinking made it hard to integrate diaspora ministry in sending countries into “overseas mission”. It could be said that the post-China process of re-contextualisation for CIM-OMF in the mid-20th Century was far more complicated and excruciating than the initial contextualisation in its China days back in mid-19th Century because the reformed CIM-OMF not only needed to detach itself from western thinking, but also it had to unlearn the experiences and precedents built in its China days.

A number of New Zealand members rejoined the intricate post-China transition with the CIM-OMF in East Asia. Being a single man, Hayden Mellsop was the first member of the whole mission transferred from China directly to Malaya before taking a furlough in South Africa. Being one of the Forty-Niners who had never gone any further than language school and was thus much less attached to China, Edna McLaren chose to work among the Tango (Lisu) in Chiangmai, and spent the rest of her working life in Thailand. May Roy, another Forty-Niner, joined the tribal work in West Mindoro, Philippines. She worked for at least a decade amongst a
single-women dominated missionary community before being killed in a road accident. With a little more field experience in China, Mary Milner adopted Japan, China and New Zealand’s common enemy during World War II, as her field of choice. Having worked as a secretary for the Crusader Movement and Scripture Union from the mid-1930s to 1945, she was involved in literature work for 17 years in this highly literate country. Like Edna and May, Mary showed the same dedication as a single woman missionary, and worked there for thirty years.

In comparison, the British colony of Malaya was far more popular as a mission field for many ex-China missionaries, CIM as well as many other British societies. In order to prevent the domino effect of communism, Sir Harold Briggs introduced a resettlement plan in June 1950 involving half a million Chinese “squatters” to cut off the supplies being obtained from them by the Malayan People’s Liberation Army. To make the Briggs plan look more humane, the Colonial Office made a direct approach to British missionary boards to recruit veteran missionaries who had just withdrawn from China. The CIM-OMF was one of the mission societies which responded to this call, but not without caution. The desire to continue working among Chinese people outweighed the hesitation of being seen as agents of imperialism in its close association with a colonial government. In addition, the CIM-OMF even attempted to transplant the model of the CIM-CMS joint-venture in East Sichuan to North Malaya. The failure or lack of success of this replication was another symptom of its lingering “China factor”. The McIntoshes, Norah Conway, Maud Hullah and Ina Tebbs were some of the “Kiwi” Old China Hands who moved between the hundreds


76 In short, it is an Anglican diocese staffed by CIM members who had obtained ordination status from the Anglican Church. For further details, see David A. Huntley, “The Withdrawal of the CIM from China and the Redeployment to New Fields in East Asia: An Understanding of the Methodology and Decision-Making Processes” (Ph.D. Thesis, Trinity Theological Seminary, 2002), 117-132.
of wire-fenced “New Villages”\(^{77}\). As in the tribal work in Mindoro, it was often single women workers who were more likely to endure the restricted conditions of village life, as well as meeting the demand of learning a different dialect and adapting to a more tropical climate. The Brethren missionary couple, Douglas Broughton and Marjorie Vines (nee Squires), and three NZCMS single woman missionaries, Blanche Tobin, Phyllis Haddow, and Edith Parkerson, also worked on the Malayan Peninsula.

For these individuals whose primary calling had been China, the relocation process posed an almost existential question as to what redeployment to the CIM as an organization meant. Everywhere they went they compared it with China. The “this-is-what-we-did-in-China” was often the ultimate justification of their choice of action whenever they were challenged by the younger generation of post-China recruits.

J. O. Sanders’ career development in the post-China stage of the CIM-OMF was particularly interesting and unique in understanding the pros and cons of a “Kiwi”, without actual China experiences, leading an international organisation that was known to be a China-bound mission. Though his role as mission leader and mission statesman mainly involved addressing the home audiences of various sending countries, as a result of the CIM-OMF’s convention of setting up Headquarters on the field, he was largely working from the heart of Asia and thus should be considered as an “overseas missionary”. When J. O. Sanders became the mission’s General Director in 1954, there were two marks against him as the General Director: one, the fact that he had had no field experience; the other that he was a ‘colonial’. Being an Old China Hand from the “down under” world himself, Sanders’ biographer Ron Roberts\(^{78}\) acutely points out that both “weaknesses” turned out to be

---

\(^{77}\) The exact number of Chinese-occupied New Villages varied between 452, 500 and 600. The size of residents in each village varied from 300-500 to 5000-7000.

\(^{78}\) Ron Roberts was an Australian member of the CIM.
his strength: Coming from a small sending country, he “posed no threat”. It could well be added that his very lack of field experience saved him from the habitual tendency held by almost all his senior colleagues to look to past precedents based on China experiences.

While New Zealand members of the CIM-OMF were scattered over the lands and nations of East Asia, PCNZ’s personnel tended to concentrate in the British colony of Hong Kong and the PCNZ’s alternative fields in the Pacific. Being geographically, climatically, linguistically, and culturally very similar to Canton, it was relatively easy for ex-Canton missionaries to re-establish themselves in Hong Kong. When the LMS and the Church of Christ in China established a centre for the training of lay men and women for Christian service in 1950, Hoh Fuk Tong (何福堂) Training Centre (hereafter HFTTC), a good number of ex-Canton missionaries from the PCNZ worked there in different capacities. As we saw in Malaya, it was the single women who most clearly demonstrated their willingness and ability to move and adapt. The two women missionaries who “married out” of the PCNZ also established themselves in Hong Kong.

---

80 Alice Cook went to Hong Kong towards the end of 1952 to work under a Chinese minister. A year later she was asked to become Secretary for Youth Work on top of her congregational work. Alice was appointed Dean of Studies for the HFTTC in 1959, and later Vice-Principal and Principal. She retired to New Zealand at the age of 66 after 20 years of service in Hong Kong and 16 years in South China. Likewise, Frances Ogilvie, spent a further seven years in Hong Kong in addition to her 30 years of service in Canton, initially relieving at the HFTTC, and then serving as the Principal of the Women’s Training School in the Chinese Church, as well as being involved with refugee work. Flora Wilson’s “short term” teaching appointment in the HFTTC lasted for eight years from 1964 to 1971. Veteran nurse Dorothy Robertson’s free clinic on Lamma Island was the only medical service there from 1952 to 1957. At the age of 68, Annie James returned to Hong Kong to work at the Fanling Children’s Home and the refugees, so that she could maintain some sort of connection with the area for where she had dedicated her life, and eventually she was reunited with the Chinese orphan she adopted some years ago.
81 Jean Moore (nee McNeur) accompanied her husband during his appointments, first with the Government Medical Department in Hong Kong until 1962 and later with a Drug Rehabilitation Centre on a small island from 1964 to 1969. While supporting her husband’s work as the Medical Superintendent, Jean became known as “the Mother of Shek Kwu Chau”; both were buried in the island. Kathleen Chang (nee Pih), while accompanying her husband on his appointment as Professor of Anatomy at Hong Kong University from 1955
the PCNZ who relocated to Hong Kong, lecturing at the HFTTC as well as supervising six associated day schools. One common feature that is worth noting is that by this time none of them could be simply sent by western churches, but had to be invited and asked for by the Chinese Church. Nationalist movements did not only occur in China, but were also happening everywhere else, though usually in a less extreme form. The exodus from China was thus in this sense, a warm-up exercise preparing missionaries for the postcolonial era.

The fact that the Anglican Church had long before established a strong foothold in Hong Kong also made it easier for NZCMS and SPG veteran missionaries to recycle their experiences and passion in this British colony.\textsuperscript{82} Hong Kong also seemed to be the ideal choice for those who had a passion for teaching rather than for missionary work.\textsuperscript{83}

India, where British Missions such as the CMS had a well-established presence, was another destination for ex-China veterans in its early stage of post-colonial era. After having marrying an English minister, Margaret North transferred to Kashmir, North India as a missionary wife. Her colleague, Margaret Woods, was transferred to South India to do village evangelism around the same time. Woods soon took charge of the station of Dummagudem. She also helped to build up the lace industry, working particularly well amongst hill tribal people.

The Pacific had been a traditional field for Australasian missionaries, where the denominational churches, especially the PCNZ, channeled their displaced veterans. On her way back to New Zealand, Anne Lilburne was offered a position as a matron to 1969, worked with a Brethren Peace Clinic, administering support to refugees from China, the homeless and the destitute.\textsuperscript{82}\textsuperscript{83} Dr. Phyllis Haddow worked at various medical institutions in Hong Kong from 1955 until 1968. Kathleen Hall also spent a year working with the Mission to Lepers in Hong Kong. Margaret Jennings had worked as an educational missionary in Hong Kong many years before the inland was closed. Annie Hancock, Norah M. Edwards and Nancy Wilson all taught in Hong Kong for many years after officially resigning from the PCNZ.
of the Cottage Hospital in Tongoa, which she took for 15 years and extended it to include various public health programmes. When PCNZ’s Mission Committee was looking for an experienced worker to head the Tangoa Teachers Training Institute, at Onesua, New Hebrides (Vanuatu), they cast their eyes on Paddy Jansen, who held this position for 12 years. Veteran missionaries were often regarded as a back-up reserve for “casual supplies”. For example, Eileen Reid was asked to relieve at Ebuli Hostel and Onesua High School as the matron in 1962, and Frances Ogilvie was asked to assist in the New Hebrides mission for six months.

Taiwan was another field which attracted many Mandarin-speaking missionaries. However, since Taiwan was a sphere of American influence as Malaya was of British, the only known New Zealand veteran missionary to set foot in this island was Jack Johnson, and largely as a result of him having immigrated to the USA after marrying an American wife. Having worked in South China as a PCNZ clergyman, Johnson worked in Taiwan from 1954 to 1984, initially under the Foreign Missions of the Orthodox Presbyterian Church of Philadelphia, and then he was adopted by the Presbyterian Church of America’s Vanguard Presbytery.

Ex-China missionaries who left China prior to the great Exodus had already used the Pacific as an alternative front-stage for missionary passion. Ted Leech, a lay Presbyterian who sailed for China with the CIM, worked among the “Orientals” in Hawaii from 1948 to 1960. Florence Young expressively acknowledges that the six year experience in China was a solid preparation for the launch of the South Seas Evangelical Mission in the Solomon Islands from 1904 to 1926. Based on the principles and practices that she observed and learnt from the CIM, Young extended the scope of the original home mission, the Queensland Kanaka Mission (KQM), to an overseas mission by forming a Solomon Island branch which later became the

---

84 For further details, see: Florence S. H. Young, Pearls from the Pacific (London: Marshall Brothers, 1925).
South Sea Evangelical Mission (SSEM). SSEM eventually replaced KQM when the Kanakas had been forced by the Australian Government to return to the Islands.

The diaspora phenomenon of the Chinese people also broadened the career path for ex-China missionaries. For example, two of the PCNZ sisters, Flora Wilson and Frances Ogilvie, had taught in a Chinese Christian school in Suva, Fiji, before taking teaching positions in Hong Kong. The NZCMS missionary, Margaret Jennings, became the Principal of the Fiji Primary School in Suva after having worked in the Victorian Home and Orphanage in Hong Kong for more than two decades. Even after having retired from the formal position in 1956, she continued to live there and teach English and Bible to the Chinese in her 80s until the 1970s. Likewise, the Brethren missionary, Herbert M. Robinson, worked among Fiji Chinese and in Hong Kong throughout the 1940s. Arthur Saunders’ involvements with diaspora Chinese were even more varied. After being re-admitted to OMF in 1958 at the completion of his linguistics study in Michigan, he taught in Nanyang University and at an Anglican Chinese High School in Singapore, at the same time as he involved himself with Nanyang Christian Fellowship. After he retired to the USA in 1968, he continued to teach English to international students in Spring Arbor College for two years, and to overseas engineers in the University of Michigan for another four years.

It may be hard for us to appreciate fully what it actually meant to lose the stage for an actor/actress, especially one that had had a successful career. Missionaries of the early 20th Century usually sailed for their fields in their late twenties, and inevitably becoming attached to the host country in which they had spent their best years. For young men and women growing up in a small isolated country in the South Seas, China was an extraordinary opportunity in all aspects. It provided a wide platform for self-realisation that was not available back home, particularly for the women who made up two thirds of the missionary force. If it was hard enough for male
missionaries to settle back into ordinary jobs back home, it would be much harder for missionary wives to be domesticated again. The returnees generally found the same kinds of restlessness during times of furlough in this post-China uncertainty. Once an actor/actress, always an actor/actress. They preferred to be relocated than displaced, to be on a different stage rather than off stage. The push factor of the difficulty in settling in home life was often combined with the pull factor of the excitement in exploring a new mission field. Before long, they found themselves on the road again.

In my Aunt’s language, Kun Opera was one of the “wet nurses” of the Yue Opera. As a young actress, my Aunt adapted the essence of the ancient performing art (i.e. Kun Opera) that was being phased out from popular entertainment as the style and genre of an emerging modern opera was emerging (i.e. Yue Opera). In the same vein, China as a closed mission field continued to exert its influences to other “front-stages” of the theatre house of missionary drama through its ex-missionaries. Whether present or absent in the map of world mission, China is inspiring. Its sudden disappearance and prolonged absence probably has been more persuasive than ever before. Goffman might be intrigued by such a formative process in which the end of one show has opened a multitude of other shows. Although in a different context than other modern missionary movements, it was common for individual missionaries or small bands of missions to move from one country to another, the abrupt ending of the China field caused a redeployment of missionary force on a much larger scale. The boundaries previously maintained between different “front-stages” were greatly disturbed, especially in the Asia field. Such disturbance was achieved by the movements of human actors, who had been accustomed to the stage and the audience in one particular show but now must adjust to that of another show.
7.3. Intergenerational Legacies

As exemplified by the life journeys of many ex-China missionaries, China was only one season of their lives, and not necessarily the longest season, but it was often the season that set the tone for the rest of their journeys. While China resulted in a redirection of the life path for the missionaries themselves, it also became an indispensable part in the experience of their children. The reverse impact that China as a mission field had on New Zealand lasted more than one generation. The intergenerational influence of the “China factor” could be traced in a number of ways, taking such forms as missionary enthusiasm, internationally-oriented outlook, interests in things and people from China.

The missionary genes in some families were very strong, particularly among those from faith missions. Three of Reginald Sturt’s five children, two of Howard Knight’s three children, three of the McIntosh’s six children, and two of Anolis Hayman’s six children. In at least two cases, the “China factor” ran through four generations. When the Taylor brothers joined the CIM in response to its call for two hundred workers, little did they anticipate that each of their daughters would

85 Barbara joined Dohnavur Fellowship to work among Indian children, Eleanor joined her father in North China as a missionary nurse while John went to Papua New Guinea as a missionary doctor.
86 Allan and Margaret joined the same missionary organization (i.e. OMF) as their parents, and both worked in Japan.
87 Linnet and Averil joined the same missionary organization (i.e. OMF) as their parents while Gavin joined Interserve.
88 Joy went to the Philippines whereas David went to Japan, both joined the same missionary organization (i.e. OMF) as their parents. Two more of the Hayman’s sons became Anglican ministers.
89 CIM/OMFers fall off in all directions in the family tree of the Conway tribe. Not only were Norah and Gordon second generation missionaries themselves, one of Gordon’s two daughters, Maybeth, also joined OMF. When Maybeth’s daughter, Sandra, joined the team, she became a fourth generation OMFer. Gordon’s nephew, Linton, also joined OMF and later became the National Director for OMF New Zealand. It is worth mentioning that Gordon’s two grandsons through another daughter also engaged in missionary work in Afghanistan (Linton Conway, e-mail message to the researcher, July 4, 2011). Another missionary family can be found in the Thompsons. One of Joseph Thompson’s three sons, David joined the Egypt General Mission for 25 years. Two of the Thompson’s grandsons through David also became missionaries: Paul, served in Bangladesh and is now working for the Baptist foreign Mission arm, Tranzsend, while Stephen served with the Sudan Interior Mission in Somalia.
become missionaries in the Indian peninsula: Phyllis, daughter of Bill Taylor, served with the Leprosy Mission as a missionary doctor, while her cousin Eileen, daughter of Harry Taylor, served with the BMMF as a missionary nurse. The only daughter of James Edgar, Elsbeth, inherited the adventurous spirit from her father. Starting off working in the Bush Nursing Hospital of the Australian Inland Mission for the aboriginals, she later joined the Australian Presbyterian Mission to work in Korea and Vanuatu as a missionary matron and was awarded the MBE for her work.

Nonetheless, missionary children are equally likely to react negatively to the “organisational idolatry” of their parents, whose missionary heritage was the very reason why they didn’t want to become missionaries themselves. One interviewee recalls:

I used to tease mum, by standing up and saluting as a teenage every time she mentioned the CIM or Hudson Taylor, or J. O. Sanders, “Yeh, mum.” She said, “Stop it.” CIM was just woven into my parents’ life in such a way … I had enough. I heard so much of him [i.e. H. Taylor], so it delayed [me reading his biography]. My life had been shaped by this fairy figure of the person called Hudson Taylor. As a teenage I didn’t appreciate it that much. There were times later in my life that made me aware how much I owe to China and to Hudson Taylor, and to CIM.90

The intergenerational parallel is much less evident in the denominational missions, partly due to the decline of their foreign mission arms, and also the disproportionate number of spinsters in its teams. Only two known cases can be traced in the PCNZ realm in its China days. The only daughter of the McNeurs, Jean, joined the same mission organisation as her parents and returned to her place of birth. The only son

---

90 Murray Beck, interviewed by the researcher, November 23, 2011.
of the Davies, Jock, offered for missionary service in South China but was turned down due to health issues and the war condition in China. In some sense, the way that Margaret Reid brought her adopted daughter, Kathleen Pih, into missionary service, was a form of lineage. A small number of missionaries who had no descendants passed on their legacy in the forms of scholarships, memorial plaques, and statues.\(^9^1\) Kathleen Hall is definitely the New Zealand missionary who has received the greatest honour in China, partly because of her association with the Canadian surgeon Norman Bethune: A marble statue was erected in Quyang (曲阳) in 1996 for the celebration of the centennial of her birth, a headstone in the cemetery commemorating her, and the primary school in Song-jia-zhuang (宋家庄) is named after Kathleen’s Chinese name. A scholarship was provided in her name, initially to support a New Zealand Registered Nurse to undertake graduate study, and later to support rural Chinese women to complete nursing training in China.

Not all post-China lingering was rosy or positive. Missionary children could be traumatised by their family experiences. The pathways of the five siblings in one family provide interesting insight into intergenerational influence.\(^9^2\) The oldest son arrived back in New Zealand as a young teenager. Aged 13, he had already been to 14 different primary schools, and had less than two years of formal schooling. Between his birth and then the family had lived in about 25 different places, including three years in a POW camp, changed countries six times (China, Australia, New Zealand, England, Hong Kong), and often had to leave their son with other people.\(^9^3\) As a consequence of a very unsettled childhood, he did not pass his School Certificate the first time through, failed his University Entrance twice, and felt very much a failure. However, with the encouragement of his father, he began to work in

\(^9^1\) For example, after Dr. Owen Eaton was tragically shot by bandits at the mission compound in 1939, a scholarship was set up by the PCNZ through public subscription in his memory and a memorial plaque was dedicated to him in the Chapel of Knox College in Dunedin.

\(^9^2\) For ethical reasons, names and other cues are obscured in order to protect the identity of the children.

a Christian family friend’s architecture firm, and eventually obtained a Diploma in Architecture through a provisional admission to the University of Auckland. Childhood adversity did not hamper his Christian faith, or his affection for China. He became a board member of many Christian organisations, including OMF, and retained a keen interest in China. A few weeks before his tragic death in an air crash, he talked enthusiastically about smuggling Bibles to China as it had just begun to open up, and he believed that he would be going back to China one day. Two of his four children became full time workers in evangelistic Christian ministry with a missionary outlook, one fulfilled his father’s dream of Bible-smuggling to cross the border to China by joining Asian Outreach’s Hosanna Ministries in Hong Kong.

The second son became a doctor on Great Barrier Island.

The oldest daughter was the one in the family that had inherited a strong missionary call from the parents. Born in a POW camp, she had circumnavigated the world by the age of eight. Working on the staff of InterVarsity Fellowship for two years, she became involved in the charismatic movement in the 1970s with her husband. Subsequently, they served for seven years with Christian Blind Mission International (Christoffel Blindenmission) in Kenya and for three years in PNG. She continued to be involved in missionary work after the death of her husband and remained a keen supporter of OMF. She sees her Christian upbringing and missionary heritage as “an awesome blessing and privilege”.

The second daughter was the one who was most traumatised by the China experiences though she was too young to remember the exact cause:

---

94 Ibid., 15, 21-22.
95 Ibid., 38.
96 Personal interview with his widow, September 18, 2010.
97 Due to a lack of information, no discussion is given here.
98 E-mail interview, October 25, 2010.
For me it was negative for many years until I was about 40. Then, I said to God, right, I want to sort this out. I don’t know what’s going on in my head. I don’t want to talk about it. It was blocked out right out. It was all too horrible for me. I knew deep in my psyche that there was some trauma there. But I didn’t know why or how or anything else. For example, my mother used to talk about China, I would cry and go out the room, and not really know why. And I still don’t. It was too painful.99

The unnameable fear which surfaced in unexpected situations such as Third Culture Kids meetings. The “funny things” (e.g. dogs) that triggered her tears might well be props of the China scene. She chose to stay behind to mind her nephews and nieces when her older siblings were revisiting China in 1987, as she could not face up to China on full scale, and did not want to “go there as a pilgrimage to sort out what’s going on inside of” her. Nevertheless, she retains the Christian faith and sees it as source of healing for her trauma of “coming back home from China”. She also starts to make positive connection with the Chinese factors around her life in 21st Century Auckland. She has read books on Christianity in China such as Jesus in Beijing, and is encouraged by the phenomenal growth of the Church, seeing it a justification for the sacrifices that her and her family had made. She also relates well with the Chinese students at the school where she is teaching.100

The youngest daughter is the only one in this family, as well as among all the interviewees who dropped the Christian faith, and who did not wish to grow up in a missionary family. The evangelist zeal of the aging father left such a negative mark on her psyche that she recalls her feeling as follows:

My strictly evangelical up-bringing was really a powerful

99 Personal interview, September 11, 2010.
100 Ibid.
disincentive to stick with it. Because it was so fanatical, so different from every other family or kid at school. I think it was a negative influence in the end in terms of the practising of the beliefs. … Every now and again, I had a friend come to stay with me, I used to be really embarrassed about the prayers we had before breakfast and the little service we had on a Sunday. I just hated it. … Not only were they coming from a mission context, they were different right from the beginning because they were older. My Dad was 50 when I was born. My father would go and visit the neighbours and invite them to Billy Graham crusades and would make me go with him. He also put posters of Bible verses on the garage wall in a glass box called a wayside pulpit which I was very embarrassed about. If someone needed to drop me off at home I would get them to drop me off outside the neighbour’s house instead of ours so they wouldn’t see the text on the garage and also wouldn’t see that the roof or house needed painting! My last discussion with my dad before he was admitted to hospital at the time of his terminal illness was his not letting me go to the school ball as he disapproved of dancing.101

Ironically enough, atheistic and as opposed to proselytism as she is, she and her husband joined the BMMF and worked as medical missionaries in Nepal for three years. When asked how she reconciled her belief with that of the Mission, she recalls:

In fact, we just slipped in. … At the time we weren’t necessarily 100% happy with them. They weren’t necessarily happy with us. But we were keen to go and they were happy to send us. We were very much in a missionary community but we didn’t really participate

101 Personal interview, September 21, 2010.
much in that aspect of it. … We really saw ourselves as aid-workers rather as missionaries. I never liked that term missionary. … But I know there were other people on the team, who were very much like our parents, who were there because that was a way to get the feet in the door, so that you can convert the Nepali people. … Our community wasn’t just Inter-serve, it was [people from] Sweden, Canada, Norway, and Holland. … So it was very much an international community. … We were really able to be ourselves because of the variety of the beliefs and practices. There were a couple of times when we were there that I suddenly had a feeling what must it be like for our parents to be living in a missionary community in a foreign country. … I just had some insight about a lot of that I didn’t accept but I can understand what it must have been like.102

As illustrated by the above family story, China has had a lasting impact on the life of the missionary children, affirmatively or negatively, in thoughts, words and deeds. Though time in the POW camp had been a sorrowful experience for the Chefoo children, it was a source of envy for missionary children who had missed it. David Taylor (son of Harry and Maud Taylor) recalled that:

When I read  *A Boy’s War*,103 I became jealous of the children who were interned there. I thought, well, if I was there, I could have met those marvelous people who were teaching the kids.104 Then, I’d have a very different outlook in life.105

---

102 Ibid.
103 *A Boy’s War* is a book about life in the Weihsien Camp, written by a CIM missionary child David Mitchell.
104 David is mostly referring to Eric Liddell, the Olympic champion who was also interned in the Camp.
105 David Taylor, interviewed by the researcher, July 21, 2010.
David left China at the age of three and grew up in New Zealand since his parents were unable to return to the mission field. However, China seemed to have left a permanent mark on his life:

Well, I watched Irene van Dyke on the television the other day, she was standing in the middle of all these big football people from South Africa, saying that her heart is still in South Africa. And I think that my heart is still in China. I would love to be able to go back. I’d love to do a lot of things that I haven’t been able to do.¹⁰⁶

Part of the trauma for China missionaries and their children was that they were bonded to a place which they considered it as home but were no longer allowed to live there. Many of them retained the hope of returning to the adopted home but only a few managed to go. If Courtney Archer was arguably the last New Zealand missionary to leave China in 1953, Kathleen Hall must be the first one to revisit China. On both occasions, once to attend the celebration of the 11th Year of the People’s Republic of China in 1960 and again by the invitation of the Chinese Peoples Association for Cultural Relations with Foreign Countries in 1964, she was not able to return to the mountainous villages where she had worked. Graham Milne, Jean Moore (nee McNeur), Nancy Jansen, and Mary Crozier were among the few China missionaries who lived long enough to revisit China when it re-opened from the late 1970s. They visited their beloved “front-stage” this time not as actors but spectators. A good number of the missionary children interviewed were also among the first cohorts of foreign visitors to China, and most made their trips in the 1980s. Not all of them managed to go to the place where they grew up as there were restrictions of where foreigners could visit, or they could not locate the mission

¹⁰⁶ Ibid.
station on the modern Chinese maps. Some just took a tour arranged by tourist agents.\textsuperscript{107}

These excursions, tourist-like as they were, nonetheless broadened the horizon of these China missionaries and their families who used to live in isolated mission stations during their China days. Most tours would include the old treaty ports Shanghai and Guangzhou (Canton) as the main attractions, of which most New Zealand missionaries had memories. They would easily recognise the bund,\textsuperscript{108} but few could find the site of the CIM headquarters. For those PCNZ folks whose activities had been restricted to South China and Hong Kong, the very different sights of Northwest China almost made them feel that they were in a different country altogether. For example, the Great Wall of China had fascinated Nancy Jansen all her life. Even as a new bride to a missionary who had a limited budget and during the time of communist change-over, she applied for a travel permit. Knowing full well that nothing would eventuate, she kept asking the outcome each time they went to Canton. It was thirty years later she found herself with both the means and the opportunity to fulfill the long-held desire to see the Great Wall in Beijing and the Buried Army in Xian.\textsuperscript{109}

\textsuperscript{107} John Sturt visited China in 1984, 1989 and 2008 with his wife, twice earning a free trip by serving as a tour leader (John Sturt, interviewed by the researcher, August 1, 2009). Graham Milne celebrated his 90\textsuperscript{th} birthday by taking his daughter for a three week trip in 2008 (Graham Milne, interviewed by the researcher by e-mail communication, October 1, 2009). Linnet Hinton (daughter of Norman and Amy McIntosh) overcame her reluctance to revisit China and took a month’s tour about 2007 (Linnet Hinton, interviewed by the researcher by e-mail communication, December 12, 2009). Phyllis Charlton (daughter of Bill and Kathleen Taylor) took the opportunity of a travel promotion and visited the major cities in a grand tour with her husband in 2005 (Phyllis Charlton, interviewed by the researcher, August 2, 2010).

\textsuperscript{108} The Bund (外滩) is a waterfront area in central Shanghai within the former Shanghai International Settlement. The Bund is one of the most famous tourist destinations in the city, including the wharves and 52 historic buildings of various architectural styles on the western bank of the Huangpu River, as well as some adjacent areas.

Others were invited by the government. For example, Ross Howie (son of Tennnie and Leila Howie) was invited to be part of a delegation in the midst of China’s Four Modernisation Movement in 1980. As a medical professional, Ross noticed that “the Chinese has a health system that fit their needs within their means”, an observation with which Kathleen Hall or Annie James might have agreed. As an advisor to a drug and alcohol Christian counseling agency in Hong Kong, Murray Beck (son of John and Myrie Beck) was invited to help set up a community drug rehabilitation centre in South China in 1990s. Since he was much older than Ross when he left China with his parents, familiar scenery brought back fond memories.

One snapshot that Murray Beck remembered vividly was about the rice field:

On our way to a church in Swatow, there were paddy fields. Without even thinking, I just got up and walked away, stood there and [body language: closing eyes, taking a deep breath and immersing in it]. After a while, someone came to get me: “Are you alright? Are you ok?” They said, “We wondered where you were?” – As a child, this is what I can remember. You would only see it as glimpses.

Those who managed to visit their parents’ mission stations, were greatly encouraged by the resilient Christian presence there, and often bumped into Chinese Christians who had personal contact with their parents.

---

110 Ross Howie, interviewed by the researcher, August 26, 2010.
111 Murray Beck, interviewed by the researcher, November 23, 2011.
112 For example, Ivan and Margaret Howie (children of Hallam and Mary Howie) visited her parents’ mission station in Sichuan in 1986 and found the church was flourishing (Margaret Lloyd, interviewed by the researcher by e-mail communication, October 25, 2010). The Duncan siblings paid two visits to her parents’ mission station in Yichun (宜春) in 1990 and 2009, being treated very hospitably by the local church (Shona Murray, interviewed by the researcher by e-mail communication, April 4, 2012). Likewise, Maybeth Roberts (daughter of Gordon and May Conway) visited her place of birth in 2012 and was still able to find people who remembered her father (Maybeth Roberts, e-mail message to the researcher, July 28 2012.)
Today’s China brought a paradoxical feeling of “going home” and “visiting a new land” to these New Zealand visitors. On his trip in 2006, Barry Taylor (son of Bill and Kathleen Taylor) found the whole of Kuling, the last premises of Chefoo School, had been commercialised into a buzzing tourist resort. This report as well as the report of industrialisation of some of the northwest cities had disappointed his sister Phyllis who dropped her thoughts of revisiting as she did not want to spoil her childhood memory of these places. David Taylor decided to visit China in 1993. In hindsight, he realised that if he had gone any earlier he might not have been able to reach as far as he actually went, and if he had gone any later, some of the people or buildings that he would want to see would have no longer been there. Though he could not obtain approval from the local authority, he arrived in Jiegou (结勾) with the help of a young student, and bumped into someone who remembered the same childhood story as he did. Gladys Nancekivell (daughter of William and Ella Anderson) waited until 2007 and was thrilled to find her childhood home in Shengzhou (嵊州) unchanged so that she recognised it instantly, though she found everything had shrunk in size.

Photographs are often triggers of memory and identification. The children, by then in their sixties and seventies, often found it was easier to relate to pre-Liberation older generations than the younger ones. On the other hand, it was often difficult to convince the locals that the baby or toddler in the photo was the elderly person standing in front of them. John Sturt went as far as the hospital where he was born 55 years ago and what he eventually found was far beyond his nervous anticipation:

We visited the Capital Hospital, as it’s now called, and were

---

113 Phyllis Charlton, interviewed by the researcher, August 2, 2010.
114 David Taylor, interviewed by the researcher, July 21, 2010.
116 The old name was Peking University Medical College hospital, a joint venture between the National Chinese University and Rockefeller Foundation, originally a missionary
shown around most courteously. I asked if they still had birth records going back all that time. Within a few minutes they brought the actual notes of my stay in hospital. … I discovered I’d been kept in hospital for six weeks and the records detailed how many millilitres of goat’s milk I received each day. … One thing that intrigued me was to see my footprint, which had been recorded at birth along with the usual body measurements.¹¹⁷

When Margaret Moore (daughter of Jean Moore nee McNeur) returned to her childhood home in Hong Kong to work, her reactions were different from someone going to the place for a short trip. As a typical missionary child, she moved from place to place and school to school.

I was catching up the lessons all the time! All the time! And friends. Different classmates. Went from one place, to another place, to another, and another… Understand why my degree was in Geography? – The only subject that would benefit. …… Anyway, it was a different kind of experience from just going to one or two schools.¹¹⁸

Finding that life and experiences in New Zealand were very different from what she had been used to, Margaret decided to return to Hong Kong to teach. When she later came back to New Zealand, she chose to live in Auckland rather than go to another part of New Zealand as it provides the greatest variety of people and a more metropolitan lifestyle. During the frequent shifting between Asia and New Zealand, she experienced what she calls “double reverse cultural shock”. First of all, as someone whose grandparents and parents had worked in South China as missionaries since 1901, Margaret did not like being called “kweilou” (foreigner/鬼

¹¹⁷ Sturt, Loving Life, 15-16.
¹¹⁸ Margaret Moore, interviewed by the researcher, August 19, 2010.
Next, it was difficult for her to share costs for taxis, restaurants with friends:

... my colleagues wouldn’t let me pay. I said ‘it is my turn to pay’.
But she said, ‘oh, well, we are Chinese.’ I felt like saying, ‘I’ve lived here longer than you’. I could never ever feel completely at home there because I was regarded as a foreigner. When I came here, again it was different because I was in a different environment, a different community from what I had been used to there. 119

Being a Third Culture Kid herself, Margaret has better insight and is more sympathetic to New Zealand Chinese who were going through the same process:

We had one New Zealand Chinese girl in our class. ... I remember she visited me in Hong Kong later. ... Because she looked Chinese, some people around were abusing her because she couldn’t speak Cantonese very well. She came to see me and, ‘Ah, thank goodness, I can relax.’ So she sat down, we had a cup of tea. People were expecting her to speak fluent Cantonese, just like people don’t expect me to speak fluent Cantonese. She was one of my ‘Kiwi’ Chinese friends in a kind of ‘reverse cultural shock’. That’s the trouble, people go by first impressions. 120

First hand records of revisiting China by New Zealand Chinese are hard to obtain. 121 These experiences can be compared with experiences of furlough times by China missionaries back in New Zealand as well as that of missionary children’s revisiting their childhood home in China. Greif speculates that young Chinese immigrants must have felt dismayed on their return to their clan village after having adapted to

119 Ibid.
120 Ibid.
121 In the oral history collection of Home Away from Home, there are some sketchy recollections of revisiting by Chinese immigrants.
the New Zealand life. He found one interviewee to prove his point. James Ng’s reflection of his China trip is more revealing:

Though I had been looking forward to our Wing Loong visit with a certain amount of nervous anticipation, I felt, to my surprise, little emotion after actually arriving. I had returned to my father’s and grandfather’s world and discovered it was not my own world. True, I was somewhat taken aback with the village’s dilapidated outward appearance, but I felt no hurt. Of course I was interested in our home, but more in a technical than emotional way. Years before, the news of our burnt-out keep had cut my father to the bone, … but the ruins hardly stirred me at all. I registered the sights more in my mind than in my heart.”

The China trip was both affirming and un-affirming. On the one hand, the visit to one’s ancestor’s motherland reconnected the Ngs with their Chinese roots; on the other hand, it also sharpened the Ngs’ self-identification as New Zealanders. They were looking at things through New Zealand eyes and made judgments according to New Zealand standards.

We did not really need to travel thousands of kilometres to find out that New Zealand is our home and country – we already knew. Yet our journey was a major fulfillment in our lives of the answer to the eternal question, ‘Who am I?’ It positively filled out the lingering but undeniable Chinese side of ourselves, a part of us which was blurred, perhaps even uneasy. And so the journey to Guangdong was

everything we could hope for.  

In the same vein, though the trip to China enabled the missionary children to find the missing piece in the jigsaw puzzle of their identity, hardly anyone has endeavoured to return to China to live, to work, or to study for long term. China remains a destination of vocation, a faraway place where one can take off one’s everyday identity, and put on a latent self. If our sense of location is a state of mind, or a stage to switch on certain emotions, China is a remote stage for a special performance.

Ip recorded one story in which the Chinese immigrants returned to China since the family head had become a “persona non grata” with the New Zealand government for being pro-Chinese and pro-communist, only to be rejected in China as “decadent foreign devils”. Just as China missionaries were attacked as cultural imperialists by the critics of their secular compatriots, New Zealand Chinese were under investigation by their fellow countrymen as spies with overseas connection or “stinking capitalists”.

Apart from short trips to China, missionary families had other ways to re-experience the stage life in China in their day to day lives in New Zealand. Chinese food and the Chinese language are the two main props that they clung to. Having cultivated an Oriental-oriented taste bud in inland China where western foodstuffs were simply unavailable, the ex-China missionaries satisfied their craving for Chinese delicacies by spending many hours to prepare a Chinese meal themselves when and where authentic Chinese foodstuff was not always available. It had become a family ritual for them to visit a Chinese restaurant on birthday and anniversary celebrations. Chinese food/meals remained a favourite for the children, and sometimes left a lasting impact on their taste sense, even when they as a child could not name it. One interviewee recalls:

124 Ibid., 54.
There is one fruit that I knew that I’ve had a taste for it but I never knew what it was. ... Once I ate an aged persimmon, then I thought, yeh, that is the taste that I had in my mouth all these years. I can remember the texture, they were squishy and bright orange, and very sweet.126

My Aunt had three sons, but none of them became actors or had anything to do with performing art. Likewise, not all children became missionaries, and not all missionary parents continued their missionary career. Even among those who became missionaries, very few were able to work among the Chinese or use the Chinese language like Margaret Moore. Nonetheless, many of them expressed regret at losing the ability of speaking in Chinese which they acquired effortlessly as children, and some made the effort to relearn it. John Sturt, a retired missionary doctor from PNG, began to study the Chinese language in his 80s. Though discontinuing after a short attempt, Kathy Howie, a health teacher in a Secondary school, immersed herself in the Chinese conversations around her: “When my Chinese students are talking in Chinese, I am about to understand everything they say but actually all I can pick up is just the tones and sounds”.127 Phyllis Charlton, a missionary doctor to India, discovered the same affinity with a Chinese dialect:

I know Cantonese is a totally different dialect but I found by the time I’ve been there for four months I was understanding a lot more than what I’ve consciously learnt. I just know that hearing it spoken around me I was understanding more than I could credit myself for having tried to learn. I could only attribute it to a history of hearing it. I found it was a lot easier to learn than try to learn an Indian language, which I never got grips with Tamil even though I was there for 12

---
126 Kathy Howie, interviewed by the researcher, October 25, 2010.
127 Ibid.
Phyllis’ mother, Kathleen Taylor (nee Barry), a veteran missionary, refreshed her command of Chinese through taking a paper at the University of Auckland the second year after the department was launched in 1966.\textsuperscript{129}

Apart from food and language, the Chefoo School Association was an important outlet for their China nostalgia. Mary Howie (Hallam Howie’s English wife), a graduate of Chefoo herself, as well as a second-generation CIMer whose three kids were also schooled at Chefoo, had been the New Zealand representative for the Chefoo School’s Association for many years. The reunion was often held at their house, mostly with other CIM families. Since schooling experience at Chefoo had not been positive for every child, some deliberately kept away from it. One interviewee took many years to face the alumni reunion.

Once, David Michell\textsuperscript{130} was speaking in a meeting at the Tabernacle about his Chefoo internment. For some reason, I thought, \textit{ok, I’ll go to this}. … It was really worth it because David also talked about experiences as he had in terms of food, having to eat certain things such as eggplant. I was thinking, “yep!” I found myself smiling. It was almost like I was ready now for what God brought me into.\textsuperscript{131}

Other missionary children or even grandchildren were left with interesting traces in their life journey. The way that Ron Malcolm, son of William Malcolm, grew up in the internationalised environment at Chefoo School, had made him a committed pacifist. He was jailed for his belief in a Military Defaulter camp during World War

\textsuperscript{128} Phyllis Charlton, interviewed by the researcher, August 2, 2010.
\textsuperscript{129} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{130} Author of \textit{A Boy’s War}.
\textsuperscript{131} Murray Beck, interviewed by the researcher, November 23, 2011.
II. He became strongly committed to the Howard League for Penal Reform, and other social justice causes, including those of juvenile offenders, the legal system, child welfare, fosterage etc. He was also a communist, showing hearty interests in social equity issues. A more recent example would be Dr. Andrew Butcher, grandson of Frances and Marjorie Duncan, who developed a keen interest in Asian affairs as a young child growing up in an atmosphere where family gatherings had been centred upon Chinese banquets and the display of photographs of Chinese associates back in mission stations. He channeled that personal heritage into a career as the Director of Research and Policy, Asia New Zealand Foundation.

Missionary children often became international citizens or global nomads. The unique conditions of the China field accentuated this tendency. The semi-colonised state of China provided a contact zone where not only the Chinese came into contact with westerners, but also where New Zealanders came into contact with other westerners. During the Sino-Japan war they also had firsthand experience with another Oriental Other, the Japanese. Whether growing up in the Chefoo School, or were interned in POW camps, the children were enclosed in an international white community and learnt to form friendships with fellow kids from different countries. Travelling with their parents, or a family friend, via the various overland and shipping routes, they stopped at various ports and cities dotted between China and New Zealand. The exodus and the consequent relocations to another mission field meant further adjustment to another new environment. If their New Zealand parent was married a spouse from another country, the family as a whole often had to decide which country to take furlough in, or to return to, and to retire to. Quite often, the siblings scattered over a number of countries.

On the one hand, such an exposure to international culture better equipped the


338
children for cross-cultural adaptation. This applies to Overseas Chinese as well as to missionary families. For example, one couple interviewed in Ip’s oral history project told her that since they had friends and relations in every corner of the world, they were able to make a round-the-world-trip to renew old contacts in Hawaii, Tahiti, Los Angeles, San Francisco, New York, Trinidad, England, Holland, Switzerland, Rome, Hong Kong, Japan, Taiwan, and Sydney. Similarly, in their China trip, James and Eva Ng discovered that their extended families on both sides were scattered all over the place: a paternal uncle to Fiji, another paternal uncle to Hawaii, a maternal grandfather to the goldfields in Queensland and later a successful merchant in Townsville, a maternal uncle to Australia and returned to Hong Kong, a cousin of a maternal Aunt to Colombia, a maternal grandfather to Burma, grand-uncles in Australia, New Zealand and United States, and more relatives stretched across Venezuela and Peru.

The intercontinental missionary network enabling its members to travel global wide was in many ways akin to the multinational interconnection of diaspora Chinese. When Jean Moore was evacuated from China, she was able to stay in various mission compounds, mission boarding schools, mission hospitals, missionary households, old temples, community hospitals, and Red Cross Center ward on the basis of her missionary status. She received help from a missionary nurse (Margaret Burkwall) whose family had been her neighbours in Canton. Eileen Reid, her former housemate in Kong Chuen, arranged accommodation for her near Landour. Being an ex-PCNZ missionary in South China, she was able to celebrate Christmas with members of the PCNZ’s India mission at Jagadhri, Punjab. On her way back to New Zealand, she was hosted by Agnes North, a PCNZ missionary doctor’s wife, in Sydney and by Miss Gordon, another PCNZ missionary’s sister-in-law (Mrs. Mawson’s sister) in Auckland. On her way back to Hong Kong, she was on board with her cousin, Areta Milne and her husband Graham Milne, new recruits for the

135 Ng, *Windows on a Chinese Past*, 40-54.
PCNZ. In a similar vein, when John Sturt lived in the Medical Missionary Association hostel, he found that the missionary doctor Professor James Maxwell whose name was bestowed for this hostel was the same doctor that delivered him as a baby in Beijing. When the hostel was taken over by Dr. Stanley Hoyte, another medical missionary in China, John discovered that all of his four sons went to school with him at Chefoo. Besides, John travelled daily by bicycle to attend Woolwich Polytechnic with Dickson Vinden, another Chefooian back in China days.

On the other hand, an unsettling childhood could also make it harder for missionary children to develop life skills in relationship-building. Just as the ex-China missionaries could be simultaneously more adaptive and less adaptive to a new field; their children reacted paradoxically to new milieus. According to Storti, it was common for missionary children to protect themselves from the pain of separation, to be cautious about making emotional attachments that will only have to be broken a year or two down the road. Sturt’s eldest daughter Mary worked for a year in Whitehall after she finished her training in office work, then migrated to Australasia. She tried different office jobs in various trans-Tasman cities. John thinks his half-sister “clearly exhibited the Third Culture Kid behavior of finding it hard to settle in one place”. Another interviewee also confides that there is a “blight” on her life that she had to come to term with, and that was the primary reason for her staying single.

The lingering effects of the Post-China syndrome were a mixed blessing. Unless the China experiences had been too painful, most informants welcomed the opportunities to be interviewed. The fact that I am a Chinese myself also seems to

137 Sturt, Loving Life, 67, 75.
139 Sturt, Loving Life, 200.
140 Personal interview, September 2010, name undisclosed.
bring instant affinity with the informants. It was like talking to someone from their missionary past who could readily understand the scenes and the characters of the old drama. In a sense, the interview process was fulfilling, if not therapeutic, for these informants as it gives them a time and space to reflect and to vocalise a crucial part of their lives that they often cannot find the emparethic ears among other New Zealanders who had never seen the back-stage.

If the post-China development of China missionaries, whether in New Zealand or overseas, is a continuing interplay of missionary lives in a spatial sense between the “home-base” and the mission field, the life-stories of the children and grandchildren of the China missionaries present a form of interplay in a more temporal sense. These children, if taken as living remnants of a past legend, also provide a link between a historical drama with the contemporary exposition of Sino-Australasia relations. The porosity of the various historical stages and geographical locations is embodied in the very persons of these children. Their lifetime has witnessed the emergence of divergent couplets of images across a series of scenes that make up China as a missions field: both the exodus of missionary parents in the early 1950s and the revisit of mission stations from the 1980s; both the retreat trips to expatriate summer resorts and short mission trips to smuggling bibles to inland China; both the home mission reaching out to Chinese miners and market-gardeners and the diaspora ministry among skilled immigrants and entrepreneurs; both an era in which the West had free access to the Rest and an era with an increasing number of “creative access nations”, both the expatriate Chefoo School after the style of a British boarding school and the language schools catering for international students from mainland China using “homestay” accommodation. For these missionary children, space and time differentiations between here and there, now and then became blurred. This is

---

141 “Creative access nations” is a notion used in contemporary missiology, referring to countries with restriction on missionary or Christian activities (e.g. no issuing of missionary visas). Alternative terms include “limited/restricted access nations” or “closed nations”. See: http://home.snu.edu/~hculbert/access.htm, accessed on December 20, 2012.
the very kind of fluidity of social boundaries that underpins Goffman’s shrewd analysis of social life.

7.4. Conclusion

In the opening paragraph of Chapter II, I recall that when I first met my Aunt, she had already retired from stage life and only engaged as an Emeritus Principal of the Opera Institute. She was living her life with diminishing prominence as the entire opera art started to lose favour with younger generations. However, she had not lost her vision for the Yue Opera, or her dedication to the stage that no longer belonged to her. Her role, in her old age, was very similar to that of mobilisers or ambassadors-at-large of mission organisations in the post-China days of the West, maintaining the back-stage fire in order to fuel front-stage endeavours. As a teenager, I was deeply challenged by her life-story. From the surviving audio-visual records of my Aunt’s performing art, I developed a learnt appreciation of a form of traditional performing art that was becoming increasingly unintelligible for my generation. Though never having worked in the same profession, I was able to translate my personal interest into research projects and creative writings such as this thesis. In this sense, I am a spiritual descendant of my Aunt. My Aunt passed away during the course of this research project, at the age of 89. I attended her funeral, standing by the side of the coffin with the rest of the clan. The constant flow of friends, disciples, and strangers coming voluntarily from near and far to pay their respect, weeping or even kneeling, moving non-stop for one and a half hours, was a testimony of the widespread impact that my Aunt had made during her life time. Though not a missionary, my Aunt was certainly a woman with a mission, and will stand in history as a legendary figure representing the Yue Opera to future generations of audience. In many ways, New Zealand missionaries to China had bred many spiritual descendants in China, in New Zealand, as well as in many other lands where their lives touched that of others. Though their lives ceased at one point or another, their legacies remained, spoken or unspoken, in pictures or in words, on stage or off stage.
Readers of this missionary drama might share the same conclusion as the author of the Letter to the Hebrews in that “By faith they still speak, even though they are dead”. 142

142 Hebrews 11:4.
Chapter VIII: A Dramaturgy of Multiple Roles

In this chapter, I would like to align New Zealand missionaries’ life-stories with Goffman’s dramaturgy. Although the previous chapters have employed his terminology throughout, the narration has been unfolded in a chronological order of missionary career, and thus is somewhat data-oriented. Due to the genre of the narration, to apply Goffman’s ideas too tightly would lead to reductionism, in a way that the complexity and fluidity of social life is reduced to a stilted “playing of roles”. This chapter, however, is structured differently to follow Goffman’s flow of thoughts more closely so as to bring forward some elements of his work that I have not been able to elaborate fully. Therefore, this chapter is structured around his theory and unrestricted by the sequencing of the missionary drama. I choose to make the attempt in two phases because the current study is more of an extension to, rather than a simple illustration of Goffman’s original theory.

The applicability of Goffman’s work in approaching other social phenomena does not come from Goffman himself, but also from the wide circle of sociologists. Macro-sociologists committed to structuralism would reject the whole thrust of micro-sociology that looks at the human world through the lenses of symbolic interactionism, just as historians committed to “grand history” think unfavourably of the trivialities of “history from below”. Mainstream “scientific sociology” has been slow to absorb the idea that meanings and reflections are as valid as social structures and functions. Within such broad cross-school rebuttal, there are specific criticisms about Goffman. Some question whether Goffman’s obsession with the minutiae of everyday life is capable of explaining the reproduction of large social structures such as colonialism and international relations. To others, Goffman’s lavishing of analytical energy and conceptual definition on the “small behaviours” of daily
face-to-face interaction seems rather wasteful. He uses empirical materials in what strikes many to be a cavalier fashion, and appears to be unconcerned, at least in conventionally recognisable way, with the construction and testing of “grand theories” about the phenomena he describes. These peculiarities have led some social scientists to dismiss Goffman as an “eccentric and marginal figure”, whose work has little more than curiosity value.¹

With the goal of exploring the capacity of Goffman’s work to meet those criticisms, the current study uses Goffman’s early work, The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life, as the key text to test the validity and universality of his dramaturgy in two senses: How does his work, largely based on the mono-cultural interaction in Anglo-American life, apply to the cross-cultural interaction in a missionary field? How does his work, centred on daily micro-level interaction, reflect macro-level social orders, or even international orders of structure?

Goffman suggests that there are two extremes in performing: at one extreme, the performer is fully taken in by his own act; while at the other, the performer is cynical about his own routine.² There were plenty of examples of each of the extremes in the China missionary community, but many were over a continuum of beliefs and acts, and were subject to change. Faced with a vast nation with a dense population and strong culture, every New Zealand missionary would have had moments of doubt about his/her own ability to contribute to the enormous task of evangelisation. On the one hand, missionaries could be cynical performers whose audience would not allow them to be sincere. For example, when encountering indifference, stagnation or setback, the missionary still had to resolutely produce a glamorous report for the mission’s periodical at the Secretary’s request “for the benefit of other

people”, even if they privately felt much less hopeful. On the other hand, many became what they initially pretended to be and took seriously the impression that they fostered for the audience. For example, when mobilising the home churches to send or support more workers and more projects, missionaries might, over time, come to believe that western funds and western personnel were indispensable parts for building the church in China. Likewise, when initially adopting Chinese clothing and diet as an act of obedience to mission policy, or befriending the Chinese audience, many missionaries internalised the Chinese culture and mannerisms over time. The cycle of belief versus disbelief can take either direction multiple times in the path of what Goffman calls “careers of faith”, in which “the individuals starting out with one kind of involvement … then moving back and forth several times between sincerity and cynicism before completing all the phases and turning-points of self-belief for a person of his station”.3 Through the re-socialising process of missionary careers, New Zealand men and women not only began to know others, but also began to know themselves in a way that was new to themselves. They arrived in the mission field as individuals, achieved characters, and became persons with new self-conceptions.

In the dramaturgical analysis of the missionary context, the all-encompassing compound was the setting for them to dine, to sleep, to live, to preach, to heal, to teach, and even to be interned within. Some believed that they could only begin performing after they had brought themselves to the appropriate places, others made the setting follow along – itinerants and colporteurs with bibles and tracts in their hands brought a mobile setting with them. The reason China missionaries became disoriented back home was partly because they could not take the missionary setting to New Zealand. Furthermore, appearance and manner may contradict. This was the very concern of Maria Taylor4 over western women clothed in Chinese dress before they were fully at home with Chinese etiquette. It was common for missionaries to

3 Ibid., 12.
4 Hudson Taylor’s first wife, co-founder of the CIM.
alternate Chinese and western dresses in different settings, the former was for travelling, for itinerancy, for preaching in a Chinese church, and for the field whereas the latter was for summer retreats, for headquarters and office, for preaching in an expatriate church, and for furlough time. Similarly, personal front and setting must be coherent to bring acceptance. However, coherence of front and settings in missionary life could not be maintained perfectly, and was easily disturbed by odd items that came from another setting. For example, those who had adopted Chinese dress would choose to live in a Chinese house, but still, they might furnish it with things they took from New Zealand, such as cutlery, rugs, or *Women’s Weekly*.5 Likewise, when missionaries retired to their home town, they might display their homes with things they brought from China, such as silk embroidery, chopsticks, or red couplets. The irony lies in that it is the overall coherence between the front and the settings that highlights these odd items, which raises an audience’s awareness of the actor’s association in another world. In various parts of this thesis, it is often the analyses of things and deeds that signal an exception or a disturbance that have enabled us to move from a reading of “Goffman of stage” to one of “Goffman of transitions”.

Goffman also points out the abstractness and generality of the front. While “identifying with the Chinese” was an abstract strategy, adopting Chinese dress and diet was a simplified and visible answer for creating an abstract similarity not only with their Chinese beholders, but also with their missionary colleagues. A more sophisticated answer would be to become a sinologist, which was much less visible and achievable. Though different routines may employ the same front, it is equally common that a given social front can become institutionalised. Abstractly stereotyped expectations can take on a meaning and stability of their own. If this

5 Nancy Jansen had been subscribing to *Women’s Weekly* and *National Geographic* from New Zealand while living as a missionary wife in Canton (Nancy Jansen, “Letters to Ben, A Pot Pourri, Random Reminiscences of Nancy” (unpublished, 1999), 26).
occurs, the front will become a “collective representation”. 6 When Goffman concludes that “fronts tend to be selected, not created”, 7 he certainly does not think of missionaries’ front in China. Being a political and cultural centre for many centuries, China had been drawing pilgrims from neighbouring nations throughout its history. The elite group had never thought it was necessary to import a foreign doctrine, nor did they ever sail overseas to export theirs. Thus “missionary” was a non-existent role in China. However, Goffman is correct in that when the Jesuits first arrived in the 17th Century, instead of creating an entirely new front, they selected an existing one, initially the front of a Buddhist monk, replaced shortly by that of a Confucian scholar, since the latter could receive more respect. This tradition was followed by the Protestant community. Whenever the missionaries adopted Chinese dress, even for those who worked among the grassroots, they would choose that of a teacher, rather than of a mandarin 8 or of a coolie. The notion of adopting a “collective representation” was especially true for New Zealand missionaries in China. As elaborated in Chapter III, when New Zealanders entered the mission field of China, they found that a particular front had been established for them. They often only had to follow the trend to maintain the corresponding front.

In the following discussion on dramatic realisation, Goffman points out that the dramatisation of one’s work involves infusing one’s activity with signs which dramatically highlight and portray facts that can confirm the “correctness” of one’s

---

6 Goffman, The Presentation of Self, 37.
7 Ibid., 38.
8 The Catholic case might be an interesting comparison here: in 1899, Zongli Yamen issued the “Five Clauses Concerning the Reception of Missionaries by Magistrates” 《地方官接待教士事宜五条》, which stipulated that the rank of archbishop and/or bishop was equivalent with that of Chinese Viceroy and/or Procurator, the rank of archpriest with Sidao (a subordinate position under Procurator), the rank of priest with county magistrates. Thus, the Emperor was granting the ceremonial formality of imperial mandarins and diplomatic representatives to the Catholic missionaries. This decree was abolished in 1908. The Protestant community never asked for or accepted the same privilege.
narrative, which might otherwise remain obscure.\(^9\) However, making invisible tasks visible is not a small task. Individuals and organisations often face the dilemma of expression versus action. In other words, those who have the time and skills to perform a task well (i.e. action) may often not, because of this, have the time or skills to make it look well (i.e. expression). Those working in the China field needed to achieve technical standards while those working in the home-base needed to meet expressive expectations. An average missionary could only excel in one or the other; thus a successful mission society must appoint suitable personnel to fulfill both functions. Almost every missionary had to spend substantial time and to give considerable thought to writing prayer letters and reports to his/her home audience, even at the cost of eating into the time for performing the actual missionary tasks. Moreover, in these letters and reports, he/she tended to create an impression that he/she was constantly doing things, that he/she was not wasting time in the field, and only gave passing reference to prayer, retreats and meditation. It was only in family letters, he/she might confide times of relaxation and fruitlessness. In addition to individual endeavour almost every mission society would delegate the public relations role to a specialist, often the secretary or the editor of the mission magazine, a role that would then be shared by various missionaries on furlough from time to time. The CIM particularly ensured that there were gifted writers within its membership, and that they were producing heart-gripping narratives each year.\(^{10}\) By dramatising the missionary enterprise, the mission organisations aimed to assure their audience that their support was “money well spent”.

A performance is not only about fitting the actor with the understanding and expectations of their society, it is also about idealising the self-image of that society to a particular audience. In this sense, the social function of a successful performance is similar to that of a ceremony, and “an expressive rejuvenation and reaffirmation of

---


\(^{10}\) At least in the 1940s, the CIM were publishing the “Story of the Year” series in the place of its Annual Report. In Goffman’s sense, the Annual Report was dramatized.
the moral values of the community". In the missionary context, farewell meetings and deputation speeches often carried characteristics of such a celebration of shared social vision.

Goffman suggested that idealised performances also involved practices of concealment. First, in addition to pleasures derived from “secret consumption”, the performers may engage in a “hidden profitable economy”, a form of activity that is incompatible with the view of their activities which they hope to convey. These concepts, when translated into the missionary context, provide explanatory power to the multifaceted nature of its incumbents’ lives, especially the women, who when offering themselves for missionary work, would stress their call of a felt vocation, and conceal their interest in upward mobility and better self-realisation. Second, errors and mistakes are often corrected before the show starts in order to maintain an impression of infallibility. For example, a missionary might maintain an ideal standard of a preacher in public while reducing his/her prayer commitments in private. Thirdly, during a performance it is only the end-product that was shown so that the audience can only guess the actual effort and time spent on working on it. Fourthly, “dirty work” is concealed. In the missionary context, dismissal resulting from disciplinary action might be covered up by using “ill health” as an official reason for resignation. Some mission reports only supplied information about the number of locals converted and baptised, and of the number of communicants, that is, the end-products, without actually providing the means and methods, which sometimes could be dubious, of achieving these numbers. Fifthly, secondary ideals are bypassed momentarily in order to uphold the principal ideals, especially the most

---

11 Goffman, The Presentation of Self, 45.
12 Ibid., 52.
13 Ibid.
14 Ibid., 52-53.
15 Ibid., 53.
16 For example, a common criticism of overseas missions has been the creation of “Rice Christians” by providing charitable or material advancements to converts. This phenomenon was more common in the Asian fields, particularly China, India and Japan.
visible and the most legitimately important one. Missionary candidates such as Kathleen Pih who lacked the informal qualifications (i.e. being non-Caucasian) were admitted with fanfare and given a highly visible role as evidence of “fair play” in the selection of God’s workers for the field. Finally, an impression of sacred compatibility between the incumbent and the role is often fostered, sometimes through the “rhetoric of training”, a mystical range and length of professional learning to maintain a monopoly and to foster the impression that the licenced practitioner is someone set apart from laypersons. In classical missions, only the ordained clergy were regarded as proper “Missionaries” while artisans and missionary wives were regarded as a second or third class of missionary assistants.

Goffman’s elaboration on the discrepancy between appearance and reality inevitably brings controversial ethical implications in the missionary context. Mission societies as human organisations and missionaries as individuals, were not immune from the above discrepancies and could be very skilled at concealment. Sustaining a strong narrative, such as the “vision statement” of a mission organisation or a “higher life” for an individual Christian, can only operate by concealing the discrepancy between idealism and actuality. Blaming the Chinese was a common strategy to explain away missiological failure. Mission organizations, especially those fiscally tight faith missions, might have to stick to the ideal of “wise stewardship” at the cost of providing fellowship care to its rank and file members. Financial practices of the CIM, the forerunner of “faith missions”, provide some interesting case studies which give interesting insights into the discrepancy of its public reputation of fiscal freedom as expressed by its motto “God will provide”, and its strict management of

17 Goffman, The Presentation of Self, 54-55.
18 The idea that a Christian should pursue and can obtain a “higher life” was the theme for the Higher Life Movement, a movement devoted to Christian holiness in England, which was promoted at conventions in Keswick from 1860s, and continued to this day. The idea of “higher life” is expressed in various other terms such as “entire sanctification,” “the second blessing,” “the second touch,” “being filled with the Holy Spirit”. This particular group of Christian teachers promoted the idea that Christians who had received this blessing from God could live a more holy, that is less sinful or even a sinless, life.
funds. For example, in 1895 the CIM’s China Council determined that children of missionaries should remain at school in Chefoo even while their parents returned home to England on furlough. This decision served dual purposes: the overt message to the public was that in the CIM world private family life came second to “the work of the Lord”, the covert result was that it saved the mission passage money for the children. Likewise, the hard-hearted rule that any missionaries who left their mission stations before the mission’s official decision of evacuation in 1951 had to pay their own passage home was a compounded consequence of a shortage in mission funds and a need to maintain a desirable public image as being enduring, sacrificial, and more “China-oriented”.

Having listed the above examples, a note of caution should be added that it would be uncritical to be over-cynical. It is generally perceived that Goffman has a cynical view of human nature, that he regards human beings as manipulative performers always engaged in creating “false front” in interpersonal relations. The charge comes about because Goffman views individuals as self-conscious beings, and regards social behavior as communicative, involving the ability to project and interpret socially defined attitudes and actions. However, in the context of cross-cultural missionary presentation, expressions of culturally-appropriate discretion are often unwittingly absorbed and only spotted by social scientists. Motives are always difficult to establish. Neither the actors within a social drama nor its critical observers can be fully certain of what is hidden in one’s psyche. It would be equally naïve to accept any speculations of the actor as it is to accept the face value of the

19 China Council Minutes, 3 Jan. 1895, quoted in Rhonda Anne Semple, “‘The Conversion and Highest Welfare of Each Pupil’: The Work of the China Inland Mission at Chefoo,” The Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History, 31(1) (2003):39. One particularly horrifying incident occurred in 1919. A recently widowed father applied for furlough to take his three children home to be cared for by relatives. The youngest was only a few weeks old. Since the father had been home on furlough less than four years previously, the mission took the decision to send the two youngest children home with another woman missionary on her way home on furlough. The oldest child was to be kept in China “by some means until it [emphasis added] can enter the Prep school” (China Council Minutes, 19 March 1919, quoted in Semple, “‘The Conversion and Highest Welfare of Each Pupil’,” 39).
actor’s claim. Lastly, there had been competing voices within the missionary community to challenge these discrepancies and concealments. The CIM, commencing as a dissenter mission to its contemporaries, challenged the “rhetoric of training” that was prevailing at the time, and opened a missionary career to Bible College graduates. As a result, it demystified the range and length of theological preparation conventionally required by denominational boards.

Goffman provided two more strategies by which a performer engenders in his/her audience the belief that he/she is related to them in a special way.\(^{20}\) First, the audiences are segregated so that the audience of one routine will not be the same audience for a different routine in another setting. The missionary drama offers an ideal type of audience segregation in that every missionary had to maintain two fronts almost simultaneously. In reporting from where the actual work was being performed, the missionary was able to paint a rosier, glossier, or more pitiful picture of the missionary field for the sake of his/her argument. To stay away from where modern professions and qualifications are institutionalised and hierarchical, by necessity or by design, China missions were able to let nurses assume doctors’ responsibilities, generalists take specialist jobs, untrained hands handle medical works, laymen and women play ministerial roles. It was as important to keep the Chinese from knowing the anti-Chinese policies and sentiments back in New Zealand as it was to keep New Zealand mission supporters from knowing the exalted status of their woman folk.

Second, performers tend to foster the impression that the routine they are presently playing is their only routine, the most essential one, or the best shot, and that there is something special and unique in this occasion of interaction. The uniqueness of the interaction is often spontaneously exaggerated.\(^{21}\) In an era when communication and transportation were still very limited, the multiple fields developed by


\(^{21}\) Ibid., 57-58.
denominational mission societies were often segregated from the audience point of view. The recipients of the missionary performance in each of these fields only caught a partial version of the show missionaries put on in their villages, while the missionaries, by exchanging correspondence, reading mission magazines and catching up during furlough, maintained a much broader view of what was going on elsewhere. The governing mission society functioned as the director of a drama, possessing a panoramic view of the worldwide parish. These perceptual differences reveal an underpinning of a global colonial structure that inevitably led to divergences in access to information and resources between those in the “field” and those in the “home-base”. Such panoramic views often arrogated to the missionary and mission leaders the power of the colonial position. Even today, scholars of mission studies from previous “receiving countries” still tend to focus on the history of their respective national church while scholars from traditional “sending countries” often seem to have inherited a more cosmopolitan mindset and perspective, not to mention the range of cross-section missionary records narrated in the Protestant common language (i.e. English) kept in the west.

Despite idealisation tactics, social performance is still a fragile formation that can be shattered by very minor mishaps, just as a single note off key can disrupt the tone of an entire performance. Goffman reminds his readers that there is an acutely embarrassing wedge between the official projection and our all-too-human selves, a kind of self which is not to be seen as a kind of “inner cause” of an individual’s behaviour, but as the socially communicated person which that behaviour displays. In this sense, socialisation is about “bureaucratization of the spirit” to enable each of us to give a homogeneous performance at every appointed time.22 If every-day secular performances have to pass a strict test of aptness, fitness, propriety and decorum, how much would be expected of a foreign missionary in the early 20th Century? There was a widely circulated expectation that a missionary must be

22 Ibid., 59-64.
prepared to pray, to preach and to die at any moment. As evangelical Christians, they would prefer the term “sanctification” over “socialisation”, and embrace a more spiritual discourse around the battle between flesh and spirit than one around discrepancy between performance and reality. To Goffman, the discourse adopted by missionary statesmen would itself signal a “bureaucratisation of the spirit”.

Goffman further adds that social performers can misrepresent themselves just as easily as they can give themselves away. The sociological question “What are the ways in which a given impression can be discredited?” is not quite the same thing as asking “What are the ways in which the given impression is false?” Mission societies as organisations and missionaries as individuals that were subject to public liability had developed formal and informal codes of conduct that helped them desist from innocent actions which might potentially give impressions that ran counter to the identities being projected in public performances. Since both honest performers who wish to convey the truth and dishonest performers who wish to convey a falsehood have to take care to enliven their performances with appropriate expressions, sociologists can learn from performances that are deliberately fabricated in order to learn about the routine use of performative strategies in the everyday negotiation of boundaries. Friendship with a Catholic expatriate would be one example of the strategically located points of reticence within the Protestant Community. Missionary wives’ miscarriages, which were not infrequent, and might not cause any less pain than the death of living children, were regarded as a woman’s private matter and were rarely admitted to the public attention of mission supporters. The CIM had to ban inter-racial marriage in order to maintain an all-Caucasian image as if a racially mixed workforce corresponded to a theologically synthesised message. In other words, there was the fear that the visible might misrepresent the invisible. For PCNZ, the acceptance of Dr. Kathleen Pih, a Chinese, and of Dr. Georg Grätzer, an Austrian Jewish Catholic, into the China Mission were contestable

23 Ibid., 73.
decisions, as it raised the fundamental questions about who could be given the laurel of “Missionary” and whether those who lacked formal or informal qualifications might misrepresent the collective symbolic status. Both incumbents were accepted on the ground of their professional qualifications, justified by the pressing needs of staff shortage, rather than challenging the more controversial assumptions about who had the right to play the parts they played.

In a cross-cultural and trans-national setting, the common sense distinction between true and false impressions is not always tenable. For many decades, western missionaries were often generalist medical practitioners in China. They expected and were expected to dispense western medicines, perform first-aid rescue, or even conduct minor operations regardless of their professional credentials. The uncritical and thus sometimes irresponsible dispensing of morphine as a cure for opium addiction resulted in this drug being called “Jesus’ opium”, a self-defeating misrepresentation unintentionally created. Charlatan activity became less acceptable when the Republican government introduced legislation concerning foreign medical qualifications.

There is a logical deductibility from misrepresentation to mystification. The maintenance of social distance between Caucasian missionaries and Chinese converts, at least in terms of membership to international mission societies, provided a means by which awe could be generated and sustained on the part of the audience. Seasonal disappearance to retreat sites and year-long disappearance for furlough, plus segregation in conference and schooling arrangements all helped to place restrictions upon the integration of missionary performers with their Chinese audience. The latter might sense mysteries and powers behind the performance, and the former sensed, willingly or reluctantly, that the real secret behind the mystery was that there really was no mystery.
Individual performance is often an integral part of a projection fostered and sustained by the intimate co-operation of more than one participant. Such a set of individuals can be called a “performance team”, in which every member is held together by a bond no one member of the audience shares.2⁴ According to Goffman, team-mates tend to be related to one another by “reciprocal dependence” and “reciprocal familiarity”. On the one hand, a successful performance relies on every group-player’s good conduct and anyone of them has the power to give the show away. On the other hand, the same group performance cannot be maintained before one another when the audience withdraws.2⁵ One of the social phenomena that Goffman would suggest “rings the bell” for the foreign missionary community in China would be as follows: a grouping of individuals who are divergent in important aspects, and thus who might prefer to stay away from one another, find themselves in a relationship of enforced familiarity characteristics, of being team-mates engaged in staging a show. A sense of a “Protestant Consensus” was first achieved in the mission field, rather than in home countries, which enabled missionaries of diverse backgrounds to present a united front before the “heathens”.2⁶ Although the exact meaning of such a consensus was vague and inconsistent, mission leaders were at least content to operate on the basis of a “comity agreement”. Such a consensus, or comity, gradually broke down in the first half of the 20th Century as a result of the fundamentalist and modernist conflict going on in the sending countries, particularly in North America.2⁷

In the mission field, the choice to call one team the performer and another team the audience was often arbitrary because both the missionary community and the

2⁴ Ibid., 85, 108.
2⁵ Ibid., 88.
Chinese nationals were a spectacle in each other’s eyes. Controls had to be put in place to assure that no individual could be allowed to join both teams. The CIM “non-Chinese” (and in effect, “all-Caucasian”) recruitment policy effectively provided such control. However, when the principle of unanimity could no longer be maintained in staging a definition of the missionary drama, all mission societies had to take sides, or even got involved in open confrontations, to an extent that enabled the Chinese audience to be privy to a view that should have been reserved for co-players. The tension of transitions would arise when the missionary community was no longer able to keep the disagreements as “in-house” issues, and when the back-stage contest became a public display to their Chinese audience. In a similar vein, through obtaining a back-stage view on denominational divisions, on sectarian separatism, on the fundamentalist-modernist controversy, and on other internal conflicts within the Protestant camp that was prevailing in Anglo-American Christendom, the Chinese community is slowly changing their position from that of a novice bystander to that of an educated critic.

Goffman also touched on the potential tension between dramatic and directive dominance.28 For each mission organisation, a small selection of the missionary team was identified as “the stars”. Although these key-players were great icons for publicity and mobilisation purposes, they could well be very poor at co-operation in a common show. The mission leaders, be they secretary, magazine editor, or home council chairman, who were responsible for much behind-the-scene planning and management, might find themselves slowly edged into a marginal role between audience and performers, that is, between supporting churches and missionaries, half in and half out of both camps.

The dramatic and directive dualism was also prevailing in the mission field. Due to language limitations, especially for new recruits, missionaries who were supposedly

placed in positions of visible leadership were often made figureheads. There was an unspoken working consensus that the missionary was someone to look at while the Chinese preacher was someone to listen to. In street preaching or itinerant trips, the body of a missionary might draw a large crowd, but most crowds would respond better to the preaching of a Chinese evangelist. In Goffman’s term, missionaries were bribed with formal headship and dramatic dominance while the Chinese colporteurs and bible women were actually directing the show.

Expressions such as “front-stage” and “back-stage” have been used in previous chapters. However, in Goffman’s original work, he chooses the less self-explanatory terms “front region” and “back region”.²⁹ He borrowed Wright and Barker’s term “behavioural setting” to illustrate the space-time dimensions of regions.³⁰ There are moral requirements as well as instrumental ones associated with certain places and seasons. When Christianity was introduced it was as a foreign religion, and for generations it failed to take root in the local culture, so converts and inquirers would display a distinctive set of behaviours in church-centred institutions, differing subtly or brutally from their everyday behaviour in the community. Likewise, expectations regarding conduct and appearances varied for missionaries and their children in the region of the isolated mission station and the region of expatriate concessions. The back region occasion of summer retreats and other cross-mission gatherings provided opportunities for social behaviours that might be offensive to the host culture, such as courting. For missionary wives, while the field settings required and permitted them to carry out public evangelism and not to be confined to domestic duties, they were expected to resume these duties and were forbidden to undertake church work and to talk about the missionary enterprise back in their home churches.

In contrast to front regions, a back region is usually the space or time of day where

²⁹ Ibid., 109-110, 114.
³⁰ For detailed discussions, see: Herbert F. Wright and Roger G. Barker Methods in Psychological Ecology (Topeka: Kanasas: Ray’s Printing Service, 1950)
and when performers can relax, can drop his front, forgo speaking his lines, or even step out of character, and poor members of the team can be schooled or sanctioned. It is commonly located adjacent to the front region so that performers can receive backstage assistance, and catch their breath in privacy.

For a missionary to China from the West, the most salient need for back region relaxation was probably centred on privacy. In a later section, Goffman cited J. Macgowan’s work on the Chinese’s disregard of back region privacy, in contrast to the western norm. Privacy as a personal necessity is a very odd idea to many non-western cultures. Though seeing the importance of dividing gender roles along outer and inner aspects of social life, and aware of front door and back door deals, the Chinese never saw fit to partition the front and the back-stage for acquaintances. Actually, in my Aunt’s days, the back-stage of the opera theatre was as chaotic as the front-stage. It was the place where the same members of the audience could freely intrude and withdraw, observing or even conversing with the actors and actresses. Privacy as a western idea was broken down by the Chinese way of life whenever the missionaries left the insulation of the mission compound. A. M. D. Dinneen captures this cross-cultural difference in her real-life based novel in the words of a Chinese convert: “You foreigners always want to be ‘by yourselves,’ but we want to be ‘together.’” Likewise, the CIM missionary Mabel Williamson sums up the diverging ways of life over what was known as “privacy” in the West in the following words:

...there is something in many of us that rebels against having one’s private life a matter of common knowledge! The one who has grown up without becoming acquainted with the meaning of the word

---

privacy, on the other hand, may find it impossible to understand why the missionary desires to be alone once in a while!33

The very body of the missionary gave their privacy away. To the Chinese grassroots, privacy equaled secrecy. For those who lived in inland Chinese-style houses, it was near impossible for them to keep their “professional distance” by preventing the constant flow of visitors coming to demand full back region privileges. It was therefore psychologically restful as well as physically soothing for missionaries to go to summer retreats and coastal sanatoriums, where their original sense of privacy could be restored in the expatriate community. On the other hand, the CIM headquarters, for example, sometimes voluntarily gave back region privileges to Chinese Christian leaders. Reciprocally, such invitations could also lead to insights into the back-stage mentality of the Chinese audience which may not be otherwise obtainable given the indirect and non-confrontational style of Chinese communication.

One’s insight into “behind the counter” could weaken as well as strengthen over time. In the missionary context, when children of missionary families were little and in the hands of their Chinese amahs, they were quick to be acquainted with the back region of the Chinese life, such as back lanes and alleys off the main-street where their fathers might be preaching, small doors leading to kitchens and washrooms which were too profane for their mothers to enter. Possessing such knowledge, these children became a better informed “persons in the know” of the Chinese culture than their parents, in proportion to their age. However, these back region perspectives of the Chinese society usually lost their vividness when the children grew older, or at least when they started attending the self-contained and insulated expatriate school of Chefoo.

33 Mable Williamson, “Have We No Rights?” A Frank Discussion on the Rights of Missionaries (Chicago: Moody Press, 1957), 40.
Just as the differentiation between performers and audience is often arbitrary, the demarcation of front region and back region is not always clear-cut in the missionary dramaturgy. There are many regions functioning at one time and in one sense as a front-stage and at another time and in another sense as a back-stage. For example, servants of a missionary household often shared evangelical responsibilities. It was also common for them to travel with their masters and mistresses on itinerant trips, attending to their needs as well as taking their turn pamphleteering and addressing the crowds. By alternating between the roles of domestic hands and bible women, and between the roles of cook and colporteuer, they were switching the back region and front region momentarily, putting on and taking off characters as called for by the immediate settings. Likewise, when the missionaries internalised the local culture and tempo, and when the local Chinese audience gradually became their Chinese team-players to whom they could extend the same warm and frivolous intimacy reserved for western colleagues, they might find home life difficult to adjust to and they had to struggle to put on a show for their New Zealand audience, from whom it was thought comfort and warmth could be provided to the missionaries. In this circumstance, the front of the China field became a back region where they could experiment and rehearse unconventional practices, while the back region of the home churches became an alienated front where they had to wear masks of decorum and formality to meet the western notion of what the persona of a missionary should be.

In illustrating the fluidity between front region and back region, Goffman describes how waiting staff can transform the dining hall of the restaurant by invoking back-stage style in small corners.\textsuperscript{34} This micro-level social phenomenon may find its macro-level counterpart in the missionary settings of the colonial era. Since the later Qing Dynasty, foreign powers had expropriated many sections in treaty ports of

\textsuperscript{34} Goffman, \textit{The Presentation of Self}, 130.
the China Empire to convert them into back regions, symbolically and juridically cut off from the wider setting of China. Missionaries benefited from these little colonies in their vicinity, the opportunities for relaxation and socialisation that they offered. Few would realize and acknowledge that the right to establish and enter a back region in another land was a political privilege that was granted not by merit, but by their racial status, which was backed up by the greater international power structure of the colonial era.

Goffman also mentions a residual region, which was neither front nor back but “the outside”. The secular world of New Zealand, be it political or economic, might provide an example of this residual region, belonging to neither the front nor the back. Chapter II provides a description of the socio-historical dynamics through which a New Zealand identity was crafted in the missionary cohort as shared by their contemporaries. From the foreign mission perspective, the Chinese populace meant more to New Zealand missionaries than to the non-Christian compatriots back home. It was the kind of stage for which they cared least. Other residual regions might include other mission fields as most missionaries believed that they were called to China, and China only. Reciprocally, religious and missionary movements were often omitted or downplayed in general New Zealand history.

Successful performance involves effective boundary control. A highly scripted role such as that of “missionary” is particularly dependent on information control between the back-stage and the front-stage. That is, over-communication of some facts and under-communication of others. Information that may be destructive to

35 Ibid., 135.
36 According to Peter Lineham, the Dictionary of New Zealand Biography made a fundamental policy decision at the outset that the criteria for admission would be based on contribution to New Zealand culture and society. One of the implications of this policy is the exclusion of missionaries (“Missionary Motivation in New Zealand”, a Paper for the Currents in World Christianity Project given at the University of Cambridge, May 18, 2000 and to the Aotearoa New Zealand Association for Mission Studies, Auckland, November 28, 2000.).
performer-audience relations are termed “secret”, and disclosure of different types of secrets can threaten a performance in different ways. Goffman listed a number of categories: dark secrets, strategic secrets, inside secrets, entrusted secrets, free secrets, and latent secrets. Apart from dark secrets which consist of destructive facts that are incompatible with the public image fostered before the audience, most of these secrets involve no moral or ethical implications, but are more about discretion and prudence. Here again, over-cynicism should be carefully avoided by students of social phenomena. Alvyn Austin’s latest work on the CIM reflects the approach of a small circle of scholars who “spot a conspiracy behind almost every bush” in the modern missionary movement. As Dr. G. Wright Doyle rightly points out, Austin’s quotation of phrases such as “conspiracy of silence” and “cocoon silence” from the CIM classics is out of context and purposely misleading. Although a cynical reading of Goffman often come to the impression that he takes human beings as team members who carry within themselves something of the sweet guilt of conspirators, Goffman’s work as presented in this thesis is more of a functionalist kind, rather than conspiratorial. When Goffman suggests that a team has something of the character of a “secret society”, he terms it in symbolic generalisation as a sociologist; when Austin refers to the “dirty secrets” of mission societies, he gives it a literal hint as a historian.

In addition to the leaking of secrets, the porous character of social boundaries is further marked and tested by series of discrepancies. Goffman mentions three important varieties of discrepant roles which occur when a person enters a social establishment in a false guise: informers, shills, and mediators. To different

37 Goffman, *The Presentation of Self*, 141-144.
39 Ibid.
40 Shills is probably an American expression, typically refers to someone who purposely gives onlookers the impression that he is an enthusiastic independent customer of a seller (or marketer of ideas) for whom he is secretly working.
audiences and under different circumstances, China missionaries were seen to play all of these roles. First, the Manchu Court, the Japanese conqueror, and the communist government all thought western missionaries had a hidden agenda behind their benevolent mask. Their use of a foreign language and the modern technology of telegraphy awoke particular suspicions. CIM’s Private Telegraph Code Book was severely attacked by Chinese scholarship.\(^{42}\) Though it sounded ridiculous to some ears, this charge cannot be totally discredited. Nineteenth Century missionaries, like their contemporary adventurers, voyagers, and world-travelers, produced travelling notes and detailed accounts of lands and peoples that could be easily exploited by colonial administrators, diplomats and militarists of western states. Political and technical advancements enabled them to obtain a better view about the countries of the mission field than the “native” could ever obtain about a missionary’s home-base. Even those who did manage to arrive in the “intruder’s” motherland (like the Chinese miners in old and new “golden-mountains”), and left a record of similar effect, it would be most unlikely that such information would cause the same political, economic, or military consequences on the global stage. Under such a power imbalance, it was less a matter about what to convey, but more of a matter about whom to convey it to. Coming from a small country of few ambitions, New Zealand missionaries had fewer reasons and opportunities to play a double game. Their American counterparts, by comparison, were far more anxious about international relations in East Asia.

Secondly, the communist rulers also tended to think of missionaries as shills of

\(^{42}\) Gu’s work on the telegraph code has been most influential on Mainland Chinese scholars’ understanding of the usage of telegraph code (see: Gu Changsheng 顾长声, “jishen shilin chuangxianqu”《跻身史林闯险区》[Braving the Journey in the World of History], in Zongjiao yu Meiguo shehui – zongjiao yu guoji guanxi 《宗教与美国社会——宗教与国际关系》[Religion and American Society: Religion and International Relations], Vol.4, Part 2, ed. Xu Yihua 徐以骅 (Beijing: Shishi chubanshe, 时事出版社, 2007), 889-890; Gu Changsheng 顾长声. Chuanjiaoshi yu jindai Zhongguo 《传教士与近代中国》 [Missionaries and Modern China] (Shanghai: Shanghai Renmin Pub.,上海人民出版社 1991), 118-119.
western governments and commerce, an image captured so well in the famous accusation “running dogs of imperialism”. It was thought that part of their overseas assignment was to persuade the Chinese to embrace western thoughts and goods. There had also been widely accepted rumours that missionaries were using humanitarian benefactions as bait so that they could cut organs from the Chinese followers and sexually abuse the women. These charges were often extended to Chinese Christians, who were thought to play the role of unsophisticated members of the audience while serving the interests of the performing team.

Thirdly, while missionaries’ foreign status often attracted accusations, it occasionally gave them credentials to act as disinterested mediators. There had been cases where Chinese bandits used mission property as premises for peace negotiations. Being foreigners, missionaries were trusted as neutral third parties by both sides. Under extreme conditions of the Sino-Japan war, British and American missionaries were able to provide some protection for the Chinese civilians as citizens of neutrals. When they became “the people’s enemy” under the communist reign, they quickly lost the neutrality of a spectator. It was their Chinese associates’ turn to act as mediators between them and the government: every missionary had to find a local guarantor who was not only willing to clear any potential debts left behind by the missionary, but would also be prepared to be held responsible for any words made by the missionary after his/her departure that might be “detrimental” to the new regime. On the other side of the equator, Presbyterian missionaries mediated between the Chinese refugee immigrants and Pakeha policy-makers and eventually obtained a reluctant grant of permanent residence status for their Chinese protégés. These illustrations from the missionary dramaturgy echo Goffman’s proposition that the go-between’s role is “bizarre, untenable, and undignified, vacillating as it does from one set of appearances and loyalties to another”, and can be simply thought of as a “double-shill”.43

43 Goffman, The Presentation of Self, 149.
Lastly, Goffman names yet another discrepant role of “non-person” to refer to those whose presence was simply disregarded.\textsuperscript{44} The simultaneous presence of both acting staff and logistic staff in Chinese opera is a perfect illustration of a non-person scenario, in which sidemen, props men and personal servants of actors, while physically on the stage, were viewed as if they did not exist, at least in relation to the unfolding plot. The missionary narration also provides revealing examples. There were countless occasions in which Chinese crowds would scrutinise, touch, rub, count, and comment on bodily features of missionaries as if they were less human or lifeless. Likewise, stories of “Man Alone” and “Women Alone” in overseas mission reportages also treated their Chinese companions as non-persons.

Goffman invites his readers to consider four more discrepant roles, which provide some additional perspectives for examining the changing nature of boundaries between front region and back region in the mission field of China. One was that of service specialist. On the one hand, medical, educational, agricultural, and occasionally architectural experts of the missionary community provided professional services to a modern China. On the other hand, Chinese cooks, amahs, door-keepers, houseboys and other servants attended to the daily needs of the missionary family. Unlike the detachment suggested by Goffman, mutual bonding had developed over the years. As explicated earlier, missionaries as service specialists gathered more information about China than what the Chinese could learn about the West. Likewise, it was thought that Chinese servants would have acquired some destructive information about the back-stage life of the missionary, and thus they were often the first informants sought by the communist officials.

Next, Goffman’s approach would recognise various ways through which missionaries pushed at the unruly boundary spaces of a mission field, so as to move

\textsuperscript{44} Ibid., 150-151.
from one role to another as training specialists in the education realm. Almost every missionary would have engaged in some teaching and training roles, whether in developing nursing staff, coaching national leaders, instructing seasonal bible classes, or even directing servants. As mentioned earlier in this section, the communist government tended to see missionary trainers as shills for western ideas and values. According to Goffman, the significance of a trainer is to “evoke for the performer a vivid image of himself that he had repressed, a self-image of someone engaged in the clumsy and embarrassing process of becoming”\(^{45}\). Arriving in China at the turn of the 20\(^{th}\) Century, New Zealand missionaries not only helped foster a young church, but also a young Republic. For over half a century, they witnessed the zigzagging of China’s endeavour to modernity, nationalism, and independence.

Another role testing social boundaries and disclosing discrepancies, as highlighted within social dramaturgy, is that of confidant. In Goffman’s words, confidants are “located outside and participate only vicariously in back and front region activity”\(^{46}\). In the missionary context, they tended to be prayer partners, family and friends rather than mission management. When ex-missionaries wrote their memoirs, their contemporaries or the following generations of reading public are taken behind the scenes and become a confidant of one of the great shows, though the show was by then quite over.

The next role to be considered in relation to boundary control is that of colleague. The difference between teammates and colleagues is that the latter do not participate in the same routine together at the same time and same space before the same audience. Nonetheless, colleagues share a community of fate, and speak the same social language.\(^{47}\) In the missionary context, collegial groups formed at local as well as national levels, on the field as well as at home. American Presbyterians working

\(^{45}\) Ibid., 157.
\(^{46}\) Ibid., 158.
\(^{47}\) Ibid., 158-159.
in the vicinity of Canton were counted as colleagues for New Zealand Presbyterians at a local level, while Anglican, Congregational, and other Presbyterian delegates of the body of the Church of Christ in China (Zhonghua Jidu Jiaohui) would be counted as colleagues at national level. Presbyterians working in different overseas fields were colleagues at global level. Though the Chinese emigrants were probably as scattered as western missionaries, they lacked the political and technical powers to organise into a strong network, or to present a united front.

One particular kind of colleagueship brings interesting insight to the fluidity of social roles. Goffman demonstrates the “visiting-fireman complex” whereby team-mates come in contact with a stranger who is their colleague.\(^{48}\) It was very common for missionaries to provide hospitality to western travellers. Whether they were missionaries or not, these strangers would be given what Goffman would call a “temporary ceremonial or honorific team membership” that hardly any Chinese colleagues or visitors might be accorded. Coming from a small country, “Kwis” were more likely to be delighted when coming across a countryman. Likewise, members of the same mission society also showed an instant affinity toward each other. Sometimes, the goodwill shown between rival teams, such as between Catholic and Protestant, or between liberal and fundamentalist missionaries, could be interpreted as a kind of peace offering or even bribery: “You don’t tell on us and we don’t tell on you.”

It is also possible that people who are colleagues in one capacity may not be colleagues in other respects. For example, claims of reciprocal familiarity would not be extended to Chinese pastors and evangelists who worked in the same local churches as the missionaries when it came to summer retreat options. While accepted as colleagues on the field, missionaries of faith mission and Brethren backgrounds, who were usually Bible college graduates or lay-preachers, were often excluded

\(^{48}\) Ibid., 160.
from the “old boy’s” network of ordained clergy back home. Missionary wives, though engaged in similar ministries as single women missionaries side-by-side, were deprived of Field Council representation in the PCNZ mission.

Members of a collegial grouping are often held responsible for each other’s good conduct in maintaining a clear boundary to outsiders. If one member causes a scandal, the entire collegial group loses some public repute. Even during the late Qing and Republican eras, when communicative constraints and civil turmoils made instant exchange of opinions impossible, the Chinese audience pooled their impressions of the missionary performance they had seen independently, and launched several nationwide anti-Christianity movements. The resonant effect was acutely felt during the communist era when the whole country was under one strong central government. If one was caught as an informer, the whole missionary community was seen as an intelligence agency. In addition to audience perception, the missionary community had its own entry criteria and professional code of conduct they wished to keep before the home and field audiences. When a colleague “went native” or became “a backslider”, and thus dropped the collegial front, such deviants would be termed “renegades” by Goffman. When the CIM insisted on a policy of adopting Chinese dress and hairstyles, members of this mission were said to “let the side down” for the entire white expatriate community in China.

The roles that western missionaries played in China changed from time to time, and switched back and forth, often under the impress of organisational pressures to manage the unruly spaces of boundaries. In Goffman’s term, the devolution process, whether initiated by the missions themselves or demanded by the Chinese government, required missionaries to step from the role of “training specialist” to that of colleague. Civil-mission relations improved greatly during the Sino-Japan War partly because the way western missionaries related to the local Chinese populace had changed from bystander to confidant, or even co-conspirator. However,
civil-mission relations worsened during the communist reign because the collective image of westerners in general and missionaries in particular switched from one of “people’s friends” (i.e. colleagues) to that of “people’s enemy” (i.e. renegades). Disorientation could and did occur because of rapid and frequent switching of social roles. Whatever the change might be, it only confirms Goffman’s proposition that social definition of a situation is fragile, mutable, and thus is subject to disruptions and discrepancies.

Goffman argues that studies on out-of-character communications explain “teams” as well as “interaction disruptions”. The enactment of exclusion is a frequently employed strategy to prevent disruptions from occurring. He suggests that “surreptitious communications” equally reflect reality as the “official communications” with which they are inconsistent. All effective social performers carefully manage both types of communication. The types of communication which convey information incompatible with the official impression include: treatment of the absent, staging talk, team collusion, and realignment actions.49

Back-stage derogation of the absent audience or odd actors is a common strategy to maintain team solidarity. Such a technique not only demonstrates mutual regard between team-players at the expense of those absent, but also compensates for the loss of self-respect which the audience may inflict. Alexander Don’s home mission reports to the Pakeha readership serve as a typical example. The discourses that he employed to denigrate the Chinese miners were in line with the anti-Chinese sentiment of his time. He might have thought that he could do this to sustain local Presbyterians’ support of his work without offending the Chinese community, on the assumption that the latter did not subscribe to Presbyterian periodicals or could not comprehend much English materials. James Ng’s review of Don’s life presents a perfect illustration of the back-stage and front-stage dilemma in this Home Mission.

49 Ibid., 168.
in which information control became far more difficult than foreign missions:

He was careful of the image he presented to Europeans, but to Chinese he displayed an uncompromising, overbearing attitude, and betrayed confidences in his prolific writings … To Europeans Don ‘seemed zealous and tenacious; a man of great physical endurance and dedication, an untiring fund-raiser and excellent organiser, a skillful, meticulous author of church history, and a blameless family man’. He won widespread approbation from European Presbyterians...  

Evidence of back-stage derogation of the missionary by the Chinese has not survived. Criticisms of “agents of foreign religions” during the Anti-Christianity Movement and the Three-Self Movement were open insults and humiliation hurled in the face of the missionaries. Discourses as these had strong public approval, so there was no need for back-stage criticism. Goffman suggests that the momentary possession of a superior’s chair or desk in their absence, by subordinates, symbolically profane the superior’s status or workstation. An illustration of this point might be the assuming of church offices by Chinese subordinates on the withdrawal of missionaries in 1929 and in 1950. What started off as a temporary arrangement remained in place and gave opportunities for assertion of authority by the Chinese associates.

In the Three-Self Movement, it was a common practice for the local government to organise accusation meetings, at which the local populace, especially the Chinese Christians, were expected to recount missionary crimes and evils and thus to put them in public humiliation. However, accounts of these sessions in missionary memoirs often depict a dual involvement. When the two teams met on the stage, the

---

Chinese would only accuse those who had left or had died, that is, the absent, instead of the ones standing right in front of them. The tactic of denigrating the absent solved the dilemma of obeying the new regime and remaining loyal to their friends. In this show, which was put on only for the local government, the accuser and the accused shared a sense of conspiracy in which they would appear to confront each other in a spirit of war, but actually cooperate in a spirit of collusion, a working consensus, just in order to get the business done.

By “staging talk”, Goffman meant rehearsal and debriefing about problems of staging, which may include technical questions about signs, equipment, stands and lines of the assembled membership, merits and demerits of the front region, size and character of potential audiences, tactics to avoid potential performance disruptions, collegial news and gossip, the reception of the last performance, when wounds are licked and morale is strengthened. Goffman emphasises that people with widely different social roles work on staging dramaturgical experience in the same setting. Based on this proposition, the life-story of Chinese opera actresses is linked with that of New Zealand missionaries throughout this thesis. What they talked about might be vastly different, but the way they talked could be surprisingly similar.

Team collusion occurs when people are placed in a collusive relationship to one another vis-a-vis the remainder of the participants. The team acknowledges that the show of candour they maintain, and the show of being only the characters they officially project, is merely a show and they do this by keeping relevant secrets from the others present. The best illustration in the missionary drama would be the collusions shared between missionaries and their “native helpers”. In North China, Naomi Grey was asked by the Bible woman to preach to a group of male villagers because a foreigner would receive more respect. Likewise, during a bicycle trip

---

52 Ibid., 174-175.
53 Naomi Grant, “Memoirs of M. Naomi Grant” (unpublished manuscript, undated), 75.
across South China, it was usually the Chinese co-worker who would “tell of the providence of God”, whereas the missionary worker Jean McNeur, would as a “foreign devil woman” present an object to be “looked at” while teaching the children a chorus to sing.\textsuperscript{54} It was through these conspiracies that a bond developed between the pair.

Goffman develops a complex typology of realigning actions, which can only be incorporated here to the extent that it applies. Three types that are particularly relevant to the missionary dramaturgy are chosen for discussion here. Realigning action in general refers to a feeling-out process whereby individuals reveal their views or statuses to another a little at a time.\textsuperscript{55} In the cross-cultural context, missionaries often had to win local acceptance and respect by a gradually guarded disclosure. To announce their evangelical intent could be out of context or even alarming to the recipients of their message. The medical and education departments of the mission enterprise could be seen as realigning strategies at institutional level. The cross-cutting realigning action of Goffman’s typology is also particularly relevant to the missionary drama. Goffman argues that a specialist is more likely to be loyal to their calling than to the team they happen at the time to be serving. Therefore, they may wait for a backstage recess where they could have a friendly collegial chat to renew and extend their acquaintance with others in the profession.\textsuperscript{56}

During the 20\textsuperscript{th} Century missionary movement, western missionaries scattered in various foreign fields, formed a complex transnational web of alignment based on denominations, homelands, mission societies or even family ties. The various hosting nations and tribes in which they worked among might be hostile to one another. Missionaries, often as uninvited guests, tended to identify with the local people while at the same time maintaining fraternisation with other missionaries.

\textsuperscript{55} Goffman, \textit{The Presentation of Self}, 186-187, 189.
\textsuperscript{56} Ibid., 192-194.
working in different fields. The Opium Trade provides one example. Missionaries in China saw the devastating consequences of opium smoking, while missionaries in India saw the determining importance of opium trade to the Indian economy. Working within the two nations with conflicts of interest, they still cooperated in international missionary conferences. The Sino-Japan War provides another example. By the time the war erupted, Americans had become the largest missionary community in both countries. Though competing voices were printed side by side in mission periodicals, the missionaries by and large found that they had more in common with their compatriots than the nations they were serving. It could be argued that they were loudly forming one team with the native Christians while quietly joining another with their missionary colleagues in the opposite camp. New Zealand missionaries in China were less likely to be torn by this conflicting alignment as they arrived in China when the domestic opium trade had taken the place of the British dominated opium trade, and their missionary compatriots in Japan had been so few that their presence was almost negligible. In a similar vein, the same cross-cutting realignment must have been in operation on the Chinese side in a different context. For example, denominationalism, which had emerged in western church history, appeared meaningless and confusing to the Chinese. Even after they became Christians, denominational affiliations would be peripheral to their faith, maintained simply out of respect to the missionaries. Thus, Chinese church-goers of two competing missionary-planted churches might appear to be aloof towards one another in the presence of westerners, while they were family friends and business associates in everyday social life.

In addition, Goffman observes that extending backstage familiarity to one’s inferiors

---

is another form of realigning action. It is argued that sacrificing the exclusiveness of those at the top will increase the morale of those at the bottom. In other words, reduced social distance will enhance team solidarity. The inclusion of laymen and women into the missionary force, which had originally exclusively comprised clergy and professionals, by interdenominational societies such as the CIM, is one such example in the missionary context. The loyalty of the rank and file members of these mission societies to the mission executives had been generally high. For the same reason, the small number of Chinese Christian elites invited into the inner circle of the missionary community was also more likely to take the missionary’s point of view. On the other hand, “a circuit of reverberations” could occur when particular performers cross the line. The influx of laymen and women into the missionary communities in China was seen as “lowering standards” in the eyes of the earlier generations of clergymen and professionals, for whom a breakdown of the Old Boy network would result in a breakdown of reverence, largely imagined, held by the Chinese beholders towards missionaries. Likewise, to include Chinese in the clergy also created controversies among the missionaries.

Goffman once refers to open confession in the evangelical movement as an illustration of a tactic that induces back-stage solidarity among all present. Testimonies shared in each reinforcement party of the CIM afforded a similar mechanism for building up team spirit and backstage solidarity. To Goffman, these patterned, if not ritualised, expressions can be seen as part of a Protestant anti-dramaturgical social movement, a cult of confession. Living constantly in two worlds made missionary life a real dramaturgy in which their performance was what they could stand back from, back far enough to imagine or play out simultaneously multiple versions of realities.

59 Ibid., 197.
60 Ibid., 200.
A functionalist reading of Goffman’s work would suggest that when individuals come together for social interaction, each would stick to the parts assigned for them according to the team’s routine, and each would join with their team-mates in sustaining the right blend of formality and informality, of distance and intimacy, toward the members of the other team. However, an alternative reading of Goffman’s work would suggest that the capacity for human actors to sustain those social roles actually requires space for unpredictable breaking of the rules by which those roles are scripted. This creates zones of potential instability within the act of playing out established roles. My research, following the latter reading of his work, employs a range of dramaturgical concepts to bring out the “big meanings” of “small behaviours” in a missionary context. In this concluding section, I would like to remind students of social theory how the missionary dramaturgy has stretched Goffman’s original theory.

Firstly, Goffman’s observation and analysis was largely based on modern western society. Goffman has his own doubts as to whether his theory would be equally applicable in non-western societies. In his early work of The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life, Goffman frankly acknowledges that his work is predominately based on the indoor culture of Anglo-American societies, where barriers to perception can be easily bounded visually and aurally. He goes on to say that the Anglo-Americans tend to finish a show once having begun it, are sensitive to jarring notes which may occur during it, and feel deeply humiliated when caught out in a misrepresentation. When Goffman uses China and India to illustrate his theoretical concepts, these illustrations were the exception to the rule, or in Edward Said’s word, the “Other” to the Western norm. For example, Goffman cites from Sinologists works – the procession of a mandarin (p. 35) and the idiosyncrasies of the Chinese culture (p. 157) – to use these (Oriental) exceptions to prove the (Occidental) rules. The Indian/Hindu examples (p.46, 51) and the illustration of shamanism (p.32) serve the same purpose.

61 Ibid., 109, 236-237.
62 Ibid., 236.
63 For example, Goffman cites from Sinologists works – the procession of a mandarin (p. 35) and the idiosyncrasies of the Chinese culture (p. 157) – to use these (Oriental) exceptions to prove the (Occidental) rules. The Indian/Hindu examples (p.46, 51) and the illustration of shamanism (p.32) serve the same purpose.
Chinese notion of time and space was the norm in China while the western alternative was the foreign, if not barbarian, one. The violation of the western sense of personal privacy reoccurs over and over again in missionary writings and proves the point. These cross-cultural examples not only enrich Goffman’s monocultural theory, but also affirm his underlying understanding of human society that one can only identify the sense of continuity when it falls apart. Missionaries who chose to go to a land without rules, or rather, a land governed by different rules, had experienced such falling-apart in full scale, and in every aspect of daily life. Goffman’s demarcation of public and private is probably much less rigid than we assume. His very notions of “impression management” and “presentation of self” reveal his conviction that impression has to be managed, one’s self has to be presented, and boundaries must be established and maintained on an ongoing basis. Goffman is more concerned with the fragility of impressions of selfhood and of boundaries than the solidarity of these social constructions. A structuralist-functionalist reading of Goffman tends to dwell on his ideas of roles and stages as static prescriptions, while the frontier spirit of colonial New Zealand and of a mission field is better understood with a “Goffman of transitions”, that is, a “Goffman of becoming”. Furthermore, though Goffman’s actors appear to be discrete individuals or abstract incumbents of social roles that fit nicely into western societies, he also asserts that individuals’ self-understanding could only be reproduced in concert with others. The missionary drama was such a communal drama, staged by a selection of actors to the Chinese mass and western congregations. New Zealanders did not enter the front-stage of China as individuals, but as members of the international missionary community, facing misconception of foreigners formed by the Chinese audience as the consequences of prior cross-cultural contact.

Secondly, Goffman’s illustrations were largely micro-level daily interactions occurring in a monocultural setting. In additional to the general “fully two-sided
view of human interaction”, the nature of a missionary career created a dual context or dual audiences. Since missionaries had to maintain a balance while moving between the home-base and mission-field and faced both congregations in Christendom and converts in “paganism”, their impression management would be more dependent on the situation than for their monocultural contemporaries. Such a complexity resultant from dual audiences meant that the missionary community had to face, between and across two national stages, was beyond his scope of discussion. Due to geographical distance, entering and exiting from the missionary stage had been much less frequent, though interim back-stages such as mission compound, foreign concessions, treaty ports, and summer retreats brought temporary relief. Though Goffman’s work does not give due attention to the effect of a sustained exposure on the front-stage, as experienced by expatriates such as missionaries, his emphasis on transitions allows ample analytic space for the set of difficulties that come when a front-stage becomes a new back-stage, and where that new back-stage is refused legitimacy by those occupying one’s prior back-stage. Over time, missionaries gradually adapted to and internalised the Chinese way of life into their own sense of identity. When returning to the West on furlough, they found home life difficult to adjust to and home audiences ignorant of Chinese life. The front and the back shifted around the missionary actor who was at the focal point of the theatre. Location becomes a state of mind. Only the “Goffman of transitions” can envisage a labyrinth of playhouses where smaller front-stages scattered in the bigger back-stage as well as smaller back-stages scattered in the larger front-stage, and where the front-stage and back-stage could shift place.

Thirdly, the confusion of front and back-stages was particularly evident for missionary children because they had very different perceptions of the theatre of missionary enterprise from their very earliest memories. The difficulties involved in the transitions between the front and the back sometimes found itself taking material form in their lives. Though not all were born in China, most grew up in a mission
compound, with Chinese amahs as their first point of contact and Chinese kids as their playmates, speaking Chinese dialect as their first language. They nevertheless attracted the same kind of attention their parents attracted simply because of their physical features. Discrepancies arose when they felt at home in a place their parents called “field”. When accompanying parents on furlough and visiting family and friends, it was often their first exposure of “home” in New Zealand. In other words, they saw their parents’ “home” in much the same way that a Chinese audience might see it. A combination of childhood in China and adulthood in Australasia brought them into a third culture, a no man’s land, where some found difficulty to relate to or embrace fully. As there were incorporated wives, there were incorporated children. Though it was the parents who had the vocation to the missionary drama, their children were inevitably part of their stage life. A revisit to China accentuated the sense of fluidity of social transition that is frequently highlighted in Goffman’s sociological imagination. They saw themselves as a hub of constant entering to and exiting from the stages, not knowing which was the front and which was the back.

The final point links closely with the last point. Writing the thesis in the 21st Century, I and my readers have to rely on these multiple filters of information, sometimes contradictory, to exercise my sociological imagination of real life back then. In this social study of an historic topic, the kind of sociological methodology that Goffman employs to record empirical data as the basis of his theorisation is near impossible. The sense that China as “the field” cannot be made real for me by carrying out fieldwork. Consequently, the field of China was not a field for me in the same way as it was for the missionaries. One of the closest ways to approximate the ethnographic state of “participant observation” was through the missionaries’ own reports or their biographers’ ingenuity, sealed and dusted in static penmanship. The striking thing is that the way we approach Goffman is largely the very same way we approach the missionaries, that is, through their own writings. What we, as students of sociology, are left with was his completed and edited work, published by
corporate firms. That is, a “Goffman of words”. We could hardly ever access him as “Goffman of actions”. Nonetheless, a transcription of Goffman’s talk on field work gives us some insights not only into his practices, but also how he might link the life of a missionary in the field with that of an ethnographer in the field, often the same field.64 For Goffman, a fieldworker should subject himself/herself, his/her own body and his/her own personality, as if he/she cannot leave at any time, to the set of contingencies that play upon the local people. It is only by doing so that he/she can “physically and ecologically penetrate their circle of response” to the social situation.65 Goffman’s notion of a “tuned-up” body is very close to the missionary’s disciplined body that was subject to a new set of rules governing self-presentations and impression management (as discussed in Chapter IV).66 The way he challenges his students to cut their lives “to the bone” in the field as much as they can afford to cut it down, or “to be naked to the bone”;67 is very similar to the CIM’s indigenous policy requiring its missionaries to identify fully with the Chinese way of eating, dressing, living, and travelling. It is a hard process for ethnographers to open up to “being snubbed”, to stop making points to show how “smart assed” they are, as it was for western missionaries, especially those who with ordained status and professional degrees, in the 19th Century, to humble themselves before their rural Chinese audience.68 When discussing the “freshness cycle”, Goffman urges his students to take notes all the time on the first day, a day that one will see more than one will ever see again.69 These “first day” notes are very similar to missionaries’ first impression reports on arriving in China. Goffman used diaries, memoirs, and biographies extensively in his own analysis and so he might endorse my use of these because the original words of the missionaries, all these years later, still indicates the

---

65 Ibid., 125.
66 Ibid.
67 Ibid., 127.
68 Ibid., 128.
69 Ibid., 130.
various strategies they were using to interpret their worlds and to mould their immediate environments in ways by which they could see themselves.

The children’s recollections and understandings of their missionary parents’ lives is another filter of data for me as the researcher. Accessing the life-stories of these missionaries through their children’s subjectivity has a number of implications for this research. On the one hand, interviews with the children have been almost the only live source of information that brings a touch of authenticity and dynamism. On the other hand, these children’s subjectivities are paradoxically more or less products of their parents’ lives, lives that were so very different from their contemporaries. Though children’s perspective is arguably a back-stage perspective, their self-understanding can also be seen as a means by which front- and back-stages are mediated. Such intimate perspectives accompanied the children wherever they lived with the parents, regardless of the location of the broader socio-cultural milieus. The children had a unique “back door” access to their parents’ lives in both New Zealand and China that none of us as audience possesses. Such complicacy echoes the multiple dimensions to Goffman’s original theory and enables an analysis of the non-physical sense of location that can be carried around between several worlds.

The evaluation of the use of Goffman’s theory in relation to the Protestant missionary movement would not be complete without including the Christian worldview. Christians share with Goffman in the proposition that life is an area where we are made a spectacle to the whole universe. Nonetheless, there is some sense of essentialism in the Christian faith, which is not content simply with performance. To a Christian actor of social life, God is the ultimate audience across all the stages. Missionary shows differ fundamentally from opera shows and everyday impression management since Christian witness is ultimately governed by

---

70 The Apostle Paul wrote: “For it seems to me that God has put us apostles on display at the end of the procession, like me condemned to die in the arena. We have been made a spectacle to the whole universe, to angels as well to men” (1 Corinthians 4:9, KJV).
a sense of spiritual accountability to a transcendent deity. The biblical view of the missionary spectacle included angels as well as human in the audience. Most were put on display during their missionary career. Some died in the arena of China. All expressed the effect of an other-worldly “call” that surpassed the immediate and the tangible. As a secular theory, Goffman’s work does not have to include the divine director of the human drama. His analysis is more concerned with the mortal world and observable visibilities, and is obsessed with the displayed minutiae of the temporal universe. To include the Christian’s recognition of the hidden hand behind human history and human life adds an extra dimension to Goffman’s original dramaturgy, which enriches his interpretation of how we shape our lives ambiguously for our diverse audiences.

71 Ibid.
Chapter IX: Conclusion

Not only has the missionary drama come to a close, but this thesis has also come to an end. In this concluding Chapter, I would like to invite readers to return to the Introduction Chapter to evaluate how well this narrative has achieved its goals against the parameters set for it. This evaluation will be followed by an acknowledgement of limitations of the current research and suggestions for future research.

Chapters II and III show that the sealskin trade, the Chinese gold-rush diaspora, and Chinese objects adopted by British settlers (e.g. tea and rhododendron) were the earliest links through which China and New Zealand developed an awareness of each other’s land and people, despite the cultural and geographical distance between them. While it appeared a more rational choice for the New Zealand church to first evangelise those “savage isles” closer to home, generations of enthusiastic young New Zealanders longed to sail for a distant, vast, and mysterious country such as China, especially as the emerging missionary enthusiasm was backed up by an increasing national confidence in domestic political and economic developments. Chapter IV elaborates how New Zealand missionaries, as the subaltern members of the international evangelising force, were much less inclined to associate the Christian message with western civilisation, as exemplified in high education and advanced medical work, though none could be totally immune from the prevailing colonialist thought of the day. Missionary men and women struggled with daily “impression management” in the arena as the Chinese perceptions did not always coincide with that of the New Zealanders’ self-perception. Lengthy analysis is given in the Chapter to demonstrate how China as a mission field challenged and revolutionised the hierarchical organisation of gender and ethnic relations which were seen as the norm in Christendom. The opening section of Chapter VI follows on this point to show how the exposure of Chinese life and culture also prompted the missionaries’ response to the conditions of Chinese living in New Zealand, followed by an account of their reluctant
exodus from their adopted field. Next, Chapter VII elaborates how these missionary messengers not only took New Zealand with them to China, but also took China with them back to New Zealand, and various other parts of the world after the exodus. The China experiences have profoundly changed what is commonly known nowadays as “a sense of identity” in regard to the missionaries’ self-understanding of “Who am I?” and “Where do I belong?” The lingering effect of the China experiences manifested in many different ways, during the post-China days of these missionaries’ lives. One of the most significant effects is the various ways through which the children and grandchildren, as well as the “spiritual heirs” of these China missionaries, inherited their “China factor”.

As a small sending country in the “down under” world, New Zealand has sent some of its best men and women overseas as missionaries. China was one key recipient of such overseas “Kiwis” for over seventy years. In a broad sense it may be suggested that the 255 missionaries covered by this study shared a single identity in that they all had some degree of association with both New Zealand and China. My selection is on this common ground, and this study has methodological balance because it incorporates a wide range of diversity within the cohort. Some were English, Scots, and Australians “adopted” by a New Zealand mission, others were first generation immigrants who saw the colony as but one destination of their life journeys; still others, especially in the latter stage, were local born and grown “Kiwis”. The range of professional training and occupation included clergy, teachers, nurses, doctors, lawyers, deaconesses, architects, engineers, musicians, farmers, boat-builders, bush-workers, clerks, salesmen, tailors, dressmakers, and domestics. The majority were of Anglo-Saxon origin, with a few exceptions including Maori (Eunice Preece), Chinese (Kathleen Pih) and Jewish (George Gratzer) lineages. One doctor with the Roman Catholic faith was also admitted on the grounds of his medical qualifications. As their journeys unfolded, New Zealand missionaries soon found that they had more than one face to present. They not only represented the West to the Chinese, but also represented China to the
West, bridging the Chinese immigrants within New Zealand with the Chinese “natives” in their home land.

Firstly, this research supplements the grand history with a focus on everyday subjectivity, in the confidence that these seemingly trivialities reflect larger social structures such as gender and colonialism. The thesis presents a social history of missionary lives, which is markedly different from earlier studies on mission organisations. However, it could be argued that this research is not a “history from below” in its full sense because the object of the study was a largely privileged and vocal social class in their time. Missionaries as a whole were influential men and women of their communities, at home and abroad, introducing ideas and initiating events to compatriots and the “heathens”. Though my focus is on the “subaltern cohorts” of the missionary community, the laymen, the women, and the children, I am unable to incorporate the lives of the outsiders and the forgotten, namely, the Chinese Christians, into the scope of the thesis simply due to a lack of records. The voices of the Chinese, Christians or not, often have to be left silent. Instead of presenting themselves, they were largely represented by others.

Secondly, this research complements the conventional male-centred approach to mission history by incorporating women’s perspectives. Substantial space had been reserved to elaborate on women’s experience in the mission field as well as in the homeland. As there were many kinds of experiences for men, so there were varieties of roles for women, ranging from that of missionary wives, spinsters, nurses, doctors, teachers, and evangelists. Though there were evidences suggesting that women were conscious keepers of family and personal histories, they were also systematically excluded from mission penmanship when it came to official history. What I have managed to glean is only a very incomplete glimpse of the picture.

Thirdly, this research attempts to bring the national chronologies of both China and
New Zealand together into an integrated storyline. The aim is not only to break down the rigid dichotomy of home country versus foreign field, but also to enact a transition between Chinese and New Zealand perspectives on the missionary enterprise. Since there were established “missions to the Chinese” within New Zealand operating during the same time, the idea of a “mission to China” within the period concerned, exemplifying in a classic way the division between home versus overseas mission, and thus provides a perfect case illustrating some of the peculiarities of missiological thinking of the day. Chinese were probably the only national group that was simultaneously subjected to concurrently-run overseas and domestic missionary endeavors of world evangelism. Chapter II and III show that the period during which New Zealanders began to arrive in China as missionaries was unique in Chinese history as well as in the history of New Zealand. At the turn of the 20th Century, New Zealanders left a frontier society under British rule to arrive in an ancient land where diplomatic terms, residential rights, and jurisdiction precedence had been negotiated on their behalf but without their consent. Such uniqueness has set them apart as a group from that of transatlantic Protestant and Catholic missionaries. Nonetheless, I do not wish to exaggerate such differences or downplay the commonalities shared by nearly all western expatriates in China in the 19th and 20th Centuries.

Fourthly, the current research combines migrant history with missionary history in order to contextualise the missionaries’ China experiences with the experiences of Chinese immigrants in New Zealand. Partial discussions of the two counterparts are presented in each chapter to illuminate the similarities and differences in the social performance of the focused group of human actors. A complete parallel between “Chinese in New Zealand” and “New Zealanders in China” did not exist yet it is not difficult to find analogies between the two storylines. Limitation of space has been the major restriction for further elaboration and comparisons.

Fifthly, this research moves in an interdisciplinary manner between sociology and
history, as well as strolling over ontological and epistemological differences between evangelical theology and the social sciences. This methodological approach demonstrates how history and sociology share common ground, and how sociological understanding is necessarily historical. The missionary cohort provides an ideal sample to elaborate the paradox of human agency as an analytical problem of finding a way of accounting for human experience which recognises simultaneously and in equal measure that history and society are made by purposeful individual action. Nonetheless, individual action, however purposeful, always occurs within pre-given contexts of history and social formation. Missionaries, like any of their human counterparts (e.g. their Chinese converts), made their own history, but only under definite circumstances and conditions. They held membership in the social group of “Protestant missionary”, which was itself a product of the past. They acted through a world of rules which their actions created, broke and renewed; they were creatures of rules, and yet the rules were their creations. The historical development of the missionary career highlights the two-sidedness of the social world, a world of which the missionaries were both the creators and the creatures, both makers and captives. Sociologically speaking, the strategies developed to account for becoming “erratic” account equally effectively for becoming an overseas missionary. What they had to do was shaped by the historically given possibilities among which they found themselves. New Zealand missionaries to China constructed a new world for the local Chinese as well as for themselves, but only on the basis and within the framework of what their predecessors had constructed for them. A historical research project inevitably involves the “sociology of becoming”, as well as the “Goffman of transition”, in which society is understood as a process constructed historically by individuals who are constructed historically by society. Missionaries were people who, in their sense of the present, struggled to create a future

---

1 For example, going to bible colleges was a relatively late option for evangelical laymen preparing for missionary career. The earlier generation of missionaries in evangelical positions had to be ordained clergy qualified through theological schools. Moreover, the only option for women to join a foreign mission was to become a missionary wife in the beginning of the modern missionary movement. It was only later on that single women were formally accepted as overseas missionaries.
out of the past. Their senses of identities, thus, implied not merely personal histories but also social histories. This research examines not only the life-cycle of the individuals, but also the chronicles of historical experience, so that life-stories are aligned with world-histories. This is perhaps stresses what Theda Skocpol might call “sociology’s historical imagination”.¹

Finally, this research looks beyond the era of the China mission and explores the post-China experiences of the missionaries and their families. In addition to contributing to the existing knowledge with empirical information, I also try to demonstrate how the field experience has had a lasting reversal-impact on the experience-bearers whose original call was to bring fundamental changes to the field. New Zealand missionaries returned home with a very different outlook, having been exposed to the field of China over extended periods of time. As a medium of mutual influences between New Zealand and China, they carried their missionary experiences in both countries and other parts of the world as they travelled. Discussions about the intergenerational lineage of the missionary families further prove the point that data collection and data interpretation can be affected by the timing of the research in relation to the historical era under scrutiny. Carrying out the research 60 years after the missionary exodus from China generates very different information and understanding from what a research project conducted shortly after the exodus would have found. For one thing, people’s recollections are softened by the passing of time and often tinted with later developments in their lives. For another, it is now possible to take a retrospective overview of this group of missionaries, among which many are deceased, and of some of their descendants as most have reached their middle-age.

Goffman’s dramaturgy is introduced as a broad and overarching structure for the missionary drama. The use of Goffman’s work remained by and large at this level

throughout the chapters. The front-stage and back-stage metaphors help to stage a “dialogue” between the New-Zealandness and the Chinese-ness that had intersected around the figure of the New Zealand missionary in China. Chapter VIII unfolds Goffman’s ideas in the missionary context. I look to Goffman’s work for the surface effect of his conceptual schemas, eschewing a more methodological critique on his ideas about how knowledge ought to be developed and what we should expect of formal knowledge. The rationale for this restraint is that the current study is a sociological inquiry of a historical phenomenon, rather than a conceptual advancement of a social analysis. If discovering social realities in another space and time involves analytical distance as well as empirical access, interpreting historical patterns through theoretical lenses inevitably involves the interrogation of concepts by evidence and evidence by concepts. On the one hand, Goffman’s dramaturgical framework helps to organise the archival and empirical materials. On the other hand, the study on missionary cases has also enriched and stretched Goffman’s original ideas. Firstly, this social analysis of missionaries’ everyday activities demonstrates that micro-sociological observations of symbolic interactions can be used to reveal macro-sociological concepts such as gender and colonial structures. Secondly, despite Goffman’s self-doubt of the applicability of his mono-cultural theory to other cultures, this study shows that his dramaturgy brings out interesting insights of the intricacies of cross-cultural interaction. Lastly, supplementing the static reading of a “Goffman of stages and roles”, this study provides an alternative reading of a “Goffman of transitions”, which reflects more of the dynamic and fluidity of human life, especially in a missionary setting.

The storyline of my Aunt has been a unique feature of this thesis, running parallel with the storyline of the missionary dramaturgy. Bringing along the real life story of a Chinese contemporary in the opera trade not only animates an otherwise dry academic inquiry, but also makes up for the insufficiency in the Chinese perspective of this cross-cultural exploration.
The limitations of the current research echo that of all historical inquiries. Like all other historians, I examine what might have happened through what had been recorded. My approach to these passing historical figures is indirect, accessed through various filters, including missionaries’ self-censored home letters and reports, the mission management’s discernments, the contemporaries’ collective memories, the biographers’ fantasies, and the children’s recollections. Case studies chosen for this study are often not Weberian ideal types, but simply those who are better documented. More often than not, I have to exercise my own sociological imagination to envisage the missionary performance while reading the archives, in a way very similar to visualising my Aunt’s stage movements while listening to her audio-sound recordings. The shape of historical reality is very much dependent on what is accessible, what is left behind, what is available to read, and who is still around to ask. There was no time channel for me to travel backwards and forwards to take participatory observations.

Moreover, the sampling method of interview is limited by who is available. Not all missionary children are willing to be interviewed for an unusual childhood that they might wish to suppress. Besides, not all who might be willing to confide have been available to be contacted. Those who have dropped their Christian faith have largely been lost from the missionary or church communities. All interviewees except one are professing Christians. It can be argued that the sampling is biased towards those who have inherited their parents’ faith, and thus are more likely to keep a rosy picture of their parents’ life, and identify closely with their parents’ choice of career than those who have not had a chance or do not wish to express their views. Furthermore, I am also acutely aware that my identity as an ethnic Chinese might have affected the outcome of the research, especially around the questions regarding missionary relationship with national Chinese. Sitting face to face with a Chinese interviewer, the interviewees would naturally respond more diplomatically with their answer in relation to the Chinese nation.
A conclusion of the current research needs to identify some suggestions for future research. Ambitious and creative as this study appears to be, the scope of the research inherits a conventional “single field approach” and is largely confined within the human movements between New Zealand and China. In other words, limited by space and corralled by the focus on the two countries, this research does not present some more meaningful cross-field or cross-home-base comparisons. One cannot identify the significance of China missions originating from New Zealand without a broad understanding of those from other parts of the Christendom. Other possibilities include the comparison of New Zealand missionary movements in China with those in other social-cultural contexts. For example, comparison of the PCNZ Missions in China and in India might better illustrate the similarities and differences in missionary perceptions of these two countries than the conventional “single field approach”. Both were “Oriental Others” to the “Western Self” while each was surrounded with a unique set of discourses developed over time.

This thesis is neither exhaustive nor final in its narration and analysis of the dramaturgy of New Zealand missionaries in China. Similar to the legends that my Aunt and her associates staged over and again throughout their career, there is more than one way, competing and complementary to each other, to unfold a single story and to play a particular character. It is often through these parallel performances and interpretations that the audience and the readers find unified voice and divergent views, common meanings as well as rivaling understandings. Both Goffman and my Aunt would encourage experimental thinking. I equally encourage my readers to exercise scholarly creativities when re-approaching the pattern in the dust\(^1\) of the historical phenomenon of New Zealand missionaries in China.

Appendix I: Biography of Known New Zealand Missionaries in China (in Alphabetical Order)

The purpose of this collective biography is to provide an overview of each missionary’s life. The details included in each entry in the following order are: title, full name, Chinese name, gender, date and place of birth, family background (details of prominent parents and siblings are sometimes included), pre-China occupation, denominational affiliation and/or church membership, education/qualification, mission membership, date of departure for/arrival in China, movements and activities in the field, post-China development, date and place of death, publications (usually only book forms with some exception of article lengths writings), auto-biography/biography, academic treatment of the person’s life (e.g. referred article, dissertation), descendants (usually just the immediate children, grandchildren’s details are sometimes included if they are strongly connected with church/mission).

Notes on the sources of the biographical information in this Appendix:
Appendix I (CIM), Appendix II (CVM), Appendix III (NZCMS), Appendix IV (Aid work), and Appendix V (miscellaneous) of Matthew Dalzell’s MA thesis (pp. 184-192), “New Zealanders in Republican China” (1995), provide an initial list of China missionaries. This list was cross-checked with Appendix 6 (pp.296-351) of Hugh Morrison’s PhD thesis, “‘It is Our Bounden Duty’” (2004) as well as his unpublished and incomplete database of New Zealand missionaries to the year of 1939. Additional information was obtained from the following sources.

Brethren Missionaries

The Treasury
See the references and notes section (pp.185-202) of Peter Lineham’s There We Found Brethren (Palmerston North: G.P.H. Society Ltd., 1977) for additional Brethren historical sources.

China Inland Mission (CIM)

China’s Millions (Australasian edition), 1893-1950, particularly the indexed materials included in “Supplementary Bibliography” (pp.209-233) of Dalzell’s thesis.
Candidates files of the Australian CIM archive, Melbourne School of Theology (formerly Bible College of Victoria)

Retirees file, archive, National office of OMF in NZ, Auckland

Exodus file, archive, IHQ, Singapore

As about half of New Zealand members of the CIM were Baptists, information can be occasionally found in *the New Zealand Baptist*. In a couple of cases where the CIM missionaries were Presbyterian ministers or home missioners, information from the online register of the Presbyterian church officers at [www.archives.presbyterian.org.nz](http://www.archives.presbyterian.org.nz) is also incorporated.

**Church of Scotland Mission (CSM)**

Additional information can be found in the mission’s official periodicals: *News of Female Missions, Life and Work, the Record of the Church of Scotland in Other Lands*.

**Friends Ambulance Unit/Friends Service Unit (FAU/FSU)**


Additional information can be found in the primary source materials of the Society of Friends in Alexander Turnbull Library and University of Canterbury Library, the personal papers of various FAU/FSU members, or the Society’s periodicals *the China Convoy Newsletters, The Friends Quarterly*.

**London Missionary Society (LMS)**


Additional information can be found in the primary source materials of the LMS in the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London, in the mission’s official periodicals (e.g. *Chronicle of the London Missionary Society, News from Afar, the Congregationalist Yearbook of New Zealand*, James Sibree ed. *London Missionary Society: A Register of Missionaries, Deputations, etc, 1796-1923*, London: London Missionary Society, 1923). The list of New Zealand LMS missionaries in China may be incomplete as the periodisations of both Morrison’s thesis and Goodall’s book do not cover the full period to the year of 1950.

**New Zealand Church Missionary Association/Society (NZCMA/NZCMS)**

*The Reaper* (NZABM), 1923-1940

Additional information can be found in the NZCMS archives, series three, John Kinder Library St. John’s Theological College, Auckland.

**Presbyterian Church of New Zealand (PCNZ)’s China Mission (CVM/SCM)**

The online “Register of Ministers, Deaconesses and Missionaries” at [www.archives.presbyterian.org.nz](http://www.archives.presbyterian.org.nz) provides the basis of the information regarding the PCNZ’s China missionaries. The specific link is provided at the end of each entry.

*Outlook* (PCNZ), 1890-1950

Additional information can be found in the CVM archives at the PCNZ Archive, Knox College, Dunedin (restructured and renamed “Presbyterian Research Centre” in 2013).

**Salvation Army**


Additional information can be found in its official weekly periodical *The War Cry* and in the primary source materials kept in the Salvation Army’s Heritage Centre and Archives, Booth College of Mission, Upper Hut.

**Society for the Propagation of the Gospel (SPG)**

*The Reaper* (NZABM), 1923-1940

Additional information can be found in the society’s official periodicals: *The Mission Field, Church Gazette* and *Church Abroad*, as well as in primary source materials of the SPG at Rhodes House Library, Oxford, and at the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London.

**Other sources**

Information can be found in a wide array of sources, some are quite unexpected. For example, the POW in China listed in *Captives of Empire* includes three missionaries of New Zealand nationality (i.e. Frances Collishaw, Malcolm Young, Mabel Young) who are not mentioned in any other sources.

Information of some prominent missionaries (e.g. Annie James, Mary Emilia Moore, J. O. Sanders, Arthur Saunders, Harold Turbott, Florence Young) are cross-checked with additional sources, particularly the *Dictionary of New Zealand Biography*. 

395
Additional information contained in auto-biographies/biographies, unpublished memoirs, and/or brought up by the interviews conducted by the researcher is not usually referenced. When miscellaneous or isolated resources (e.g. obituaries) are consulted for particular missionaries in addition to the above, it is referenced at the end of the entry or as a footnote.

Efforts are made to unearth the Chinese name used by each New Zealand missionary. Apart from mission organisations’ own records, the primary resource used is the *Translation Dictionary of Special Terms used in Modern China* compiled by Huang Guangyu. [A question mark in brackets indicates when a name cannot be traced.]

Attempts are made to match the romanised names with Chinese characters for the location of the mission stations. Due to the compounding difficulties (e.g. transliteration based on dialects that are unfamiliar to the researcher, inconsistency in the romanisation, change of name for the locality over time), this ambition could not be achieved for all names.

Additional Notes:

a) Woman missionaries’ names in this list are chosen to be the names recorded in the mission documents at the time of their appointment/departure. If a woman started her missionary career when she was single, her maiden name is listed as the surname name, and her married name is shown in brackets. If a woman went to China as a missionary wife, her surname recorded in this list would be her husband’s surname with her maiden name, if known, included in brackets.

b) Children’s details are usually stated under father’s entries unless he is not in the list (i.e. he wasn’t a missionary from New Zealand).

c) Names in bold denote another entry in the list (i.e. another China missionary).

Clare Abbiss, female, sailed with the SPG to North China from 1937.

William Archiblad Anderson (安德生), male, born on 16th July 1891 in Stirling, Otago, a Presbyterian, a farmer, decided to become a missionary to China at a Mission in 1910, joined the Medical Corps and served as a stretcher-bearer at Gallipoli, Egypt and France in WWI. Returned to farming after the Armistice in 1918 as he became unfit for army service. Undertook a course from Moody Bible Institute, graduated from Melbourne BTI, applied to the CIM. Sailed for China on 4 April 1905, assigned to Sinchang (新昌) and Shenxian (嵊县) of Chekiang (浙江) province. Married a fellow NZ colleague Ella Clara Salisbury at Shanghai on 8th Dec 1926. Took furlough in 1927. Retired to NZ due to wife’s health in 1935. Accepted as unordained home missioner by the PCNZ, successively worked in Beaumont (1935), Catlins (1937) and Waihola-Milburn (1940) parishes in central Otago, Waiuku-Awhitu (1946) and

---

1 Some of the CIM’s annual Prayer Directories contains the Chinese characters for each of their stations.

The Andersons had two daughters: Ruth Agnes (8th Jan 1929) and Gladys Kate (28 Apr. 1930).

See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page147.htm

Margaret T. Anderson (later Mrs. Davies), female, born on 25th June 1877, a Presbyterian, applied to the CVM from Dunedin, a trained kindergarten teacher and a graduate from the PWTI. Ordained as a deaconess and sailed for China in 1905, worked in the Evangelical capacity in Canton, married a NZ colleague Rev. Herbert Davies on 29th Sep 1911. When the Pacific War broke out, she was interned in Stanley Camp at Hong Kong from Dec. 1941 to Nov. 1942 while Rev. Davies was interned in the Mission House at Fong Tsuen; Margaret was later allowed to join her husband in internment at Shanghai. Returned to NZ on 1st Dec. 1945. She had written hymns in Cantonese which were later published. Also delivered lectures at Canton Christian College etc. on hymns and hymnology. Retired in 1945. Died on 29th May 1960.


Captain Avelis Andrews (later Mrs. Nelson), female, joined the Salvation Army to sail for China in 1917. Married a missionary colleague, Ensign John Nelson. Worked in Tianjin. Died in 1926 following the birth of her child, buried near the Great Wall.

H. Courtney Archer, male, born in 1918 in Rangiora (?), a pacifist, left the family flour mill in the face of his father's disapproval of his pacifist stance. Moved to Greymouth in 1944 to become a reporter for the Grey River Argus. Joined the FAU, arrived in China in July 1945. First worked as an anaesthetist and business manager in Hui Tian Hospital in Qujing, Yunnan, and then as a medical purchasing officer in Shanghai. He was seconded to the Shandan Bailie School as an administrator for six years and remained a life-long supporter. Returned to NZ in mid-1952 to organise delegates for a Peace Conference in Beijing. Left China in 1953 to manage the family flour milling business in Rangiora. The last New Zealand missionary to leave China.

Sister Nancy Astbury (later Mrs. McPheat), female, born in 1899, a Presbyterian, applied to the CVM from Wanganui, graduated from Technical College as a trained Stenographer. Studied in the PWTI (1922-1924), ordained as a Deaconess and sailed for China on 28th Aug 1924. Arrived in China on 24th Oct 1924, worked in Canton, resigned on 31st Aug 1925 to marry William McPheat (a fellow New Zealander who had worked as a home missioner, didn’t complete the missionary training for China but went to China for the wedding). The couple moved to Brisbane Australia. Their son Rev Dr. Scott McPheat (M.A.,B.D.,M.Th.,Ph.D., 8th Aug 1929 – 29th Sep 2010) worked in a ministerial role in Australia and NZ.

See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page147.htm
Rev. Reuben Bailey, male, a trained Baptist minister from Auckland, sailed as a married couple (Mrs. Bailey) to China with the CIM in 1920, both resigned in 1922.

Mrs. Bailey, female, sailed as a married couple (Rev. R. Bailey) to China with the CIM in 1920, see husband’s entry for movements.

Ethel Baker (later Mrs. McKenzie), female, born in 1881, an Anglican, her grandfather (Rev. Charles Baker, 1803-1875) and her father (Rev. Frederick Thomas Baker, 1839-1896) were CMS missionaries to the Maoris from 1827. A trained shorthand typist, applied to the NZCMS from New Plymouth in 1904 but had to withdraw her application due to mother’s health, reapplied in 1906 after her mother’s death. Graduate of St Hilda's Melbourne, sailed for Hong Kong in 1908, worked in the Educational department in Shiu Hing near Canton. Married in 1910 to an Australian CMS missionary Rev. C. Norman R. McKenzie, who sailed for China in 1900. Mrs. KcKenzie was transferred from NZCMS to CMS for its medical work at Lingshan near Wuchow. Returned to New Zealand in March 1926 due to husband's ill health. Based on his 26 years of experience in South China and his work among Chinese in Sydney, Norman McKenzie became the superintendent of the Chinese mission for the NZ Anglican Church from July 1927 but died 11 month later on Jun 15 1928. The McKenzies had three children.

Violet Bargrove, female, born in 1895, an Anglican, a trained nurse. Applied to the NZCMS from Christchurch, trained for missionary service at Marsden Training Home in Sydney, sailed for China in 1923. Worked in the women’s hospital in the Guangji Hospital (广济医院) in Hangchow, and became its matron in 1942. Took furlough in 1928 during which she took a course in baby care at the Karitane hospital. Re-organised a State Foundling Home. Took an early furlough in 1937-1939 due to spinal arthritis. Interned at Longhua POW camp from 1942. Retired in 1950, joined her sister Grace Bargrove (a trained kindergarten teacher, who joined the Polynesian Missionary Diocese as a missionary) to work at Ruatoki NZCMS Maori Mission.


Henry Bateman (巴), male, born in 1884, a Presbyterian from Hokitika, graduate of Angas College, Adelaide. Sailed to China with the CIM in September 1913, resigned in 1915.


Jane Blakeley (later Mrs. Brown) (贝娇鸾), female, born in 1866 in London, became a Christian at the age of 12 through a Methodist Sunday school, felt missionary call to the Chinese in her teens. Received business training in a London office. Migrated to New Zealand in 1887 with her parents, a brother and three sisters. Initially settled in
Drury, where she started a girl's bible class and a Band of Hope for the drunkards. Moved to Auckland upon father's death, and became a member of Pitt Street Methodist Church. Appointed as the very first deaconess in New Zealand in 1890, working in the Helping Hand Mission. Applied to the CIM during Rev. George Nicholl's visit and when its Auckland Council was barely formed, sailed to China in November 1894. Worked in Shih-chen-kiai of the Kwangsin (Guangxin) River (信仰河) valley. Narrowly escaped from the Boxers in the assistance of a boatman in 1900. Married Alfred Chadwick Brown while on furlough in November 1904, and resigned from field work. The couple was appointed to the honorary Home Staff of CIM. Jane continued working as the secretary of North Island Council from 1905 to 1942. Died in Auckland on 14 Jun 1956.


Isobel V. E. Brown, female, CORSO member worked in the Canadian Mission Hospital in Chungking, belonged to the United Church of Canada. He was also contracted for the IRC from 1947.

Dr. John Kirk Brown (?), male, grew up in Gore, Southland, then worked as a Doctor in Gisborne. Came to China as a member of CORSO, contracted for the IRC from 1947, and appointed to work in the CVM's mission hospital in 1947. He fell ill with encephalitis shortly after his arrival there at Christmas 1947. Despite expert care and medical attention from Doctors in Canton (including an internationally qualified visiting Doctor in tropical medicine), he tragically died on 12 January 1948. His parents in Gore paid for the building of a ‘godown’ or storage building on the Kong Chuen Compound in his memory together with a plaque which was apparently still in situ as late as the 1980’s. (The buildings were demolished in 1998). Dr Brown was buried in the new Christian Cemetery at Paak Shui Tong near Kong Chuen, South China. See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page151.htm

Beatrice Brunt (?), female, born in 1894, an Anglican, applied to the NZCMS from Christchurch, a trained nurse and midwife, trained for missionary service at Marsden Training Home in Sydney. Sailed to China in 1923. Worked as an educational missionary in Hangchow (杭州). Retired in 1928 due to typhoid fever.
Gladys Bunnell (?), female, a trained nurse. Sailed to China with the SPG at least in 1927. worked at the Mosse Memorial Hospital in North China.


Mary Campbell (?), a qualified librarian emigrated from Scotland to NZ in 1939, where she joined the Wellington meeting of the Society of Friends. Became the secretary of the NZ China Committee of the FAU, recruiting for the NZ relief team. She herself worked at Friends’ Centre in Shanghai (1947-1950), run by the British and American Friends’ Service Council, involved in relief work with refugees and orphaned children.


Maud Cannon (later Mrs. Dymond), female, Methodist, volunteer of the Dunedin Central Mission for the Chinese immigrants. Also a singing evangelist. Her rendering of “The Holy City” was immensely popular. Accepted by the Bible Christian Church Mission1 to West China. Married an English colleague Frank John Dymond (郝慕廉, arrived in China in 1893).


Captain Maude Carmichael (later Mrs. Sowton), female, a Salvation Army missionary to China, sailed to China in 1918. Married an English colleague Charles Sowton, Retired in 1951.


Kathleen Margaret Christie (later Mrs. Metcalfe) (李咏秋), female, born on 15 September 1909, member of the Auckland Baptist Tabernacle, a stenographer and bookkeeper by trade. Applied to CIM from Auckland. Graduate from the NZBTI (1932-1933) with honours. Sailed to China in September 1934. Assigned to work in Tuhshan and Anshun (安顺) of Kweichow (貴州). Married a NZ colleague Rodney Oswald Metcalfe by Rev. Hook (BCMS) at St. Andrews Anglican Church in Hong Kong on 26th Sep 1936. Returned to NZ in 1939/1940 due to severe abdominal pains. After a successful operation, they tried to return to China, but were interned in Hong Kong. Took furlough and resigned in 1946. See husband’s entry for more details.


Catherine Colley, female, born in 1884. A Presbyterian, a trained nurse and a teacher, sailed to China with the CSM in 1913.

Mrs. Frances Ruby Collishaw, female, born in 1885?, sailed for China with the Salvation Army, interned in Weihsien camp from Mar 1943 to Aug 1945.


Norah M. I. Conway (孔丽华), female, born in 1900 in China to a British CIM couple H. S. (孔好义) and Miriam (first wife) Conway. A Baptist, a trained nurse and midwife, applied to the CIM from Auckland. Sailed to China in November 1928. Worked successively in Yencheng, Shekichen, Siangcheng, Yehsien, Hwangchwan of Honan

Sister Alice Mary Cook (?), female, born on 14 April 1906 in Mosgiel. A Presbyterian, a trained teacher, graduated with a BA (Otago University) and a DipEd (Dunedin Teachers Training College) in 1934. Taught for seven months. Applied to the CVM and spent 6 months in PWTI. Ordained Deaconess for Missionary work on 26th Aug. 1935, sailed to China in the same year. “Own Missionary” of Bible Class Union. Worked in the evangelical capacity in Kong Chuen, Canton, worked amongst Sunday school and day school children. Other duties included Treasurer, translator and part-time Evangelist at a local orphanage. Also ran a Bible class for workers on the Mission compound and reading classes for illiterate women at night as well as preaching, teaching and distribution of relief to destitute women. Travelled in the Seventh District (Presbytery) with Chinese colleagues visiting out-stations at Kaii Hau, Chung Lok Taam, Yan Woh, and Shek T’seng. On furlough in NZ in 1940 and thereby avoided internment by the Japanese. During the war she worked as a Deaconess in Palmerston North (Jan to 30 Nov 1942) and among the Chinese in Wellington (1 Dec 1942 on). Also spent time in Punjab Mission India in 1945 and then returned to Canton after the war ended. Left China on 12th Apr.1951. Loaned to the PWMU as organising secretary in 1951. At the invitation of the Chinese Church she went to Hong Kong on 6th Dec 1952 to do congregational work under one of the Chinese Ministers at Tsuen Wan (荃湾) in the New Territories (新界). A year later she was asked to become Secretary for Youth Work while still serving at Tsuen Wan when time permitted. Appointed Dean of Studies for the Theological Institute at Hoh Fuk Tong (何福堂) Training Centre, Castle Peak, in 1959, Vice-Principal of Hoh Fuk Tong College (1963-68), and Principal (1968-71). Retired on 29th. Feb.1972 after 36 years in China. Returning to NZ, she taught 2 years in Turakina Maori Girls College, became 1st Assistant Invercargill - set up Bible in Schools project; when refugees came to Southland she was able to help, and interpret for them to local people. Died on 27th March 1988. See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page155.htm


George Lindsay Crozier (?), male, born in Galashiels, Scotland on 25 May 1914, came out to New Zealand in a family of four children in 1919. Grew up as a Baptist,
educated at St. George Primary School and Southland Boys’ High School, Invercargill.

Took work in a rabbit processing factory, later spent two years in a photographic studio in Gore. His appeal against war service in 1939 was one of a very small proportion of pacifist appeals which succeeded. He was then “manpowered” on military pay in Dunedin before entering the Dunedin Teachers’ Training College. Pressure from the RSA forced the College to enforce “leave of absence” on all conscientious objectors for the duration of the war. He was directed into essential factory work in the Green Island bacon factory. Joined the FAU, sailed first for India then flew from Dum Dum near Calcutta to Kunming in Western China. Worked as a “medical mechanic”, mostly involved hospital equipment repairs and servicing, including making and servicing artificial limbs made from aluminum obtained from crashed Japanese and American bombers (“Motto : “Bombers into Bedpans”). Once the war was over, their unit moved to take over hospitals formerly run by the Japanese military and assisted in getting them operating again. Spent some time working with 700 Japanese POW at a hospital at Hankow where his unit additionally acted as a “team of reconciliation”. He was asked to undertake some still phonographic work including cine filming, and in 1948 to film the PCNZ’s work at Kong Chuen in colour (Film entitled “Oi Wa”, 1948). Join the PCNZ and appointed Compound and Works Manager for five years at Kong Chuen on 15 Sep1948. Returned to New Zealand in 1948 via Tokyo where he was honoured as the “Benefactor of Hankow” due to his work with the Japanese POW there. Married a New Zealand Presbyterian Deaconess Mary Jacobs in Greymouth on 28 January 1949. He was set apart by SP on 28 Jan. 1949 and sailed for China on 11 Feb 1949. He also prepared photographs, slides and films to meet the demands of publicity. Before leaving China he filmed Rewi Alley’s work at the Shandan Industrial Co-Operative School, the film was returned to Rewi Alley for their archive in 1985. Left China on 29 Aug 1950. Appointed Manager of the newly created PCNZ Photographic Unit, Christchurch c.1951, which was set up to undertake film work and sound work for church publicity and mission promotion purposes. One of the assignments undertaken was with an Auckland firm called Reynolds Television, whose director was Don Whyte, filming in Nepal, India, Bangladesh, Singapore, Thailand and Hong Kong, highlighting the work of the Leprosy Mission, the Baptist Mission, CORSO, and the Ludhiana Fellowship. Became Field and Publicity Officer of the PCNZ Social Services Association, Wellington on 1 Jun 1970; Retired from 30 Jun 1977. Returned to China for a visit c.1977 where he was treated as a honoured guest of the Chinese Government. Retired to St Alban’s, Christchurch where the Croziers maintained a strong involvement in the church and its mission work. Died on 10.2.1992.


The Croziers had three children: twins: Merle and Jean (17 Oct 1950 at Hong Kong) and Ian (23rd Apr.1955 in New Zealand).

to marry to a CVM missionary **G. Lindsay Crozier**, sailed for Canton in the same year.
Assigned to the Evangelical department.
See husband's entry for more details.

**Evelyn P. Daniell** (段永泰), female, born in 1879, lived in Christchurch. Sailed to China in 1912 as a Brethren missionary, worked in Wei-hai-wei (威海卫) and Weng-teng-hsien, withdrew from China in 1949, continued to work in Hong Kong (1949-1971). Died in 1975.

**Rev. Herbert Davies** (戴蒙光), male, born on 13th Nov 1876, son of a headmaster, a Presbyterian, worked as a government life insurance officer in Wellington on a scholarship for 9 to 10 years, studied in the Theological Hall/Knox College (1905-1907), graduated with a MA in Philosophy from Victoria University in 1908. Applied to the CVM from Wellington, licensed by Auckland Presbytery 7 Jan (?) 1908, introduction to the Chinese community by Rev A. Don in Dunedin from 15th. Jun.1908. Ordained as Missionary for China on 7th. Nov. 1909. He was ‘Own Missionary’ of the Young Men’s Bible Class Union (YMBCU). Sailed for China in the same year. Worked in the evangelical capacity in Fong Chuen, Canton (1909-1941). Married a NZ colleague **Margaret T. Anderson** on 29th Sep 1911. When he was due to retire in 1941, his duties included acting as Mission Secretary and Auditor for the South China, Mission Council, General Secretary and Treasurer of the Canton Sub-Headquarters of the Kwantung Synod of the Church of Christ in China, Pastor of Yan Tsai Church, Pastor of Fong Tsuen Church (Canton), Paymaster and Advisor to the Bible Society of Canton, Secretary and Treasurer of the Canton Medical Missionary Society, “Committee” for Union Church services at Shameen (Canton), Member of Language School Committee, and Examiner for the Language School. Owing to the shortage of trained staff, he was asked to stay for another year. At the outbreak of WWII, Rev Davies was interned in the Mission House at Fong Tsuen while his wife was interned in Stanley Camp at Hong Kong. Both were transferred to Shanghai, and released at the end of war and given urgent priority for passages back to NZ, arrived NZ on 1st Dec.1945. Appointed Moderator of Assembly in 1947 and retired by the end of the year. Died on 1st Jul.1949.

His only child John Butler (Jock) Davies (9th Aug. 1912 – 2nd May 1976) offered for mission service in South China but was prevented by health and the international situation. He was ordained and worked as a Presbyterian minister.


**Venie Dawes** (?), female, an Anglican, applied to the SPG from Wellington, a trained nurse, previously worked in the Solomon Islands, sailed for China in 1934. In charge of the Datong Hospital for several years. Returned to NZ in 1938.

**Alice Maud Dalton Dinneen** (田尊荣), female, born in 1878, an Anglican, graduated with a BA, a trained teacher, taught less than two years in an Auckland Girls’ High
School. Applied to the NZCMS from Auckland, influenced by Elizabeth Leslie\(^1\) of the CEAMS who was home invalided. Sailed for China in 1906 as the first NZCMS missionary to China. Worked in Girl’s School in Fuzhou (福州) and re-posted to Xiangtan (湘潭), and Hengzhou (衢州) after taking furlough in 1913-1914. Elected the woman member of the Diocesan Board of Education at the triennial General Synod in Oct. Took furlough in 1930, retired from missionary service in 1931, became a member of the NZCMS Executive in 1934, and a Vice-President in 1949, continuing to sit on the Executive until 1961. Died in 1970. Author of *Not of Gennesareth: Romance and Adventure in China* (Dunedin: A. H. Reed, 1933).

**Muriel Dixon (狄克生?)**, female, an Anglican, a secretary, sailed from England to China in 1920, Dr. Duncan Main’s private secretary in the CMS Hospital in Hangchow (杭州), transferred to the NZCMS in 1926 on his retirement, worked as a hospital evangelist. Resigned in 1934 while on furlough to England due to health reason.

**Rita Iris Maggie Dobson (later Mrs. Rouse) (孙秀英)**, female, born in 1904, graduated in NZBTI (1925-1926), a Baptist, in domestic duties while applied to the CIM from Auckland, sailed for China in November 1928, worked in Siping of Honan (河南) and Shansi(?). Appointed as the Matron of the Girls’ School of the Chefoo Schools. Took furlough in 1936-1937. Married Albert L. Rouse (an office employee of McMullan Agencies, aged 60)\(^2\) in 1943 while interned in Weihsien camp. Resigned from mission work. Died in 1951.

**Francis Andrew Duncan (邓湛恩)**, male, born on 26\(^{th}\) September 1913, the son of a boot-maker (later a general store-owner and butcher), and the fourth of six children. Educated at Otago Boys’ High School for a year and a half, left early to help in the family’s store, applied to the CIM from Dunedin, graduated from NZBTI (1935-1936) with honours. Worked as an interim pastor at Cambridge Baptist Church from 7\(^{th}\) Mar 1937 for six months, the Caversham Church (Baptist) in Dunedin (1937), Georgetown Baptist Fellowship in Invercargill (1938-1939), North East Valley Church in Dunedin (1939) and other temporary ministries as well as shearing sheep in Pleasant Point during the Sino-Japan War and the European War. Sailed for China in October 1940, worked in Chowkiakow (周家口) of Honan and Linying of Shensi, married a NZ colleague **Marjorie G. Stewart** at Louhe on 13 Nov 1942 (or Chengtu on 28 Nov 1942). Took their first furlough in 1945-1946, served in Esk Street Baptist Church in Invercargill. Returned to China in Nov 1948. Worked in Yichun (宜春) of Kweichow (贵州) until evacuating from China in 1950. Ministered in Gore, Tawa and Nelson Baptist Churches. Retired to Tawa. Died on 29 Jan 1991.

The Duncans have five children: Shona (later Mrs. Murray, born in Hsuchang (许昌?) in 1943), Douglas (born in 1945, minister, preached in Singapore extensively), Gordon

---

\(^1\) Later deputation secretary of the NZCMA.

\(^2\) See Greg Leck, 2006, *Captives of Empire: the Japanese Internment of Allied Civilians in China 1941-1945*, p. 683. Other source implies that Mr. Rouse was a non NZ member of the CIM.

The Duthies had one surviving daughter, Joan. Their twins died in 1913 to cholera.

Jr. Samuel Dyer (台基尔), male, born on 8th Jan 1833 in Penang, the only surviving son of an English LMS missionary couple Samuel (1804-1843) and Maria Dyer (nee Tarn, ? - 1846), grew up among Malay Chinese, orphaned in 1846, after some education in England, he sailed to North East Valley, South Island, NZ, in 1860, moved to Riverton and married Louisa Joyce in 1863 and then moved to Invercargill and Dunedin. The Dyers left NZ for Australia around December 1875. He worked in some teaching jobs before sailing for China in 1877, succeeding Alexander Wylie as a BFBS agent there. Dyer is thus arguably the first Protestant missionary from NZ to China. Both of Samuel’s younger sisters, Burella and Maria, sailed for China in 1852 and worked in a girl’s school in Ningbo. Burella married a CMS missionary John Shaw Burdon as his second wife. Maria married the then independent missionary James Hudson Taylor, who later became the founder of the CIM. Maria wrote to Samuel to ask him to be Taylor’s secretary. Maria died in 1870 but Hudson Taylor still kept contact with his brother-in-law. Samuel worked closely with the CIM after he became the BFBS’s China agent. He worked in Shanghai until 1895. He died in 1898 and was buried in Shanghai.

For Dyer’s family history, see: Chang, Irene 张陈一萍, and James Hudson Taylor III 戴绍曾. Even to Death – The Life and Legacy of Samuel Dyer 《虽至于死 —— 台约尔传》, Hong Kong: OMF, 2009.

Dr. Owen Lamont Eaton (?), male, son of a Methodist minister (Rev Clarence Eaton)¹, born on the 23rd August 1909 in Johnsonville, Wellington. Dux at Arthur Street Primary School Dunedin in 1922 and at Wellington College in 1927. First in NZ in University Entrance Scholarship Examinations. Winner of the Scholarship for the highest all-round excellence in University work in 1931. Distinguished himself in hockey and won his blue for the years 1930 to 1933. Tutoring in Anatomy at Knox College while resident for 3 years; 1 year Demonstrator at Otago University Medical School; Graduated with M.B., Ch.B. in 1933; Passed the primary examination of the F.R.C.S. degree in England 1934. Applied to join the CVM from Dunedin as a fully qualified doctor. In Sep. 1936 appointed as medical missionary to China; ordained as elder, service of dedication as

¹ The Eatons is a family that can be traced back to the 11th Century, noted for three hundred years for their strong religious convictions. One representative family sailed on the “Mayflower”. Rev. Clarence Eaton was the President of the New Zealand Conference in 1934.
missionary at St. David’s Church Auckland on 6th Oct. 1936. Sailed for China two days later. “Own Missionary” of Knox Church, Dunedin. After 2 years language study was appointed Superintendent of the NZPC Po Wai Mission Hospital (博爱医院/“Hospital of Universal Love”) at Kong Chuen near Canton. Married a New Zealander Mary Horne Mandeno of Te Awamutu in the Union Church, HK, on 7th Dec. 1938. He was fatally shot in the Kong Chuen Mission Compound in the early hours of Easter Monday (10th Apr. 1939) when he went outside with others to investigate a robbery. Interred in the Shameen Municipal Council's cemetery on Honam Island, Canton. A scholarship was set up by the Church by public subscription in his memory and a memorial plaque being dedicated to him in the Chapel of Knox College, Dunedin. See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page160.htm

Mrs. Mary Horne Eaton (née Mandeno), female, born on 15th October 1913, a Presbyterian, graduated with a B.H.Sc. A post-graduate in Home Economics from Otago University. Married a CVM missionary Dr. Owen Lamont Eaton on 7th Dec. 1938 and was accepted by CVM. Resigned in 1939 due to husband’s death. Served as a Lieutenant in the United States 56th General Hospital during WWII. Remarried an American, Mr. Wendt, of the American 1st Army Headquarters in London on 16 February 1945. Later did her post-graduate work in Dietetics at John Hopkins Hospital, Baltimore, Maryland, USA. See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page160.htm, see husband’s entry for more details.


The Edgars had four children: Chalmers Huston (3 Mar 1909), Gordon Scott (19 Nov 1913 at Yangchow), Oscar Patrick (13 Apr 1920 at Chengtu). The only daughter Elsbeth (Elsie) Trudinger Edgar (1 Sep 1905 at Chengdu) was a trained nurse. She joined the Australian Inland Mission (Presbyterian) in 1929 to work in the Bush Nursing Hospital for the aborigines. She then joined the Australian Presbyterian Mission in 1931 to work in Korea, become the matron of the Paton Memorial Hospital in Chinju in 1934. She left Korea in 1941 and relieved briefly in the Paton Memorial Hospital in Port Vila, New Hebrides, and later became its matron from 1947. She was the first woman to be elected as an elder to the session of the Paton Memorial Church. Elsie Edgar was awarded the MBE (Member of the Most Excellent Order of the British Empire) in 1965 for her work. She retired from the field in 1973 and died on 10 Nov 1985 in Melbourne.


**Annie (Nancy) Roxborough Edmanson (?)**, female, born in 1898, a congregational, a trained nurse, joined the LMS and sailed for China in 1924, worked in Tientsin (天津) as the matron of MacKenzie Memorial Hospital (马大夫纪念医院), repatriated in 1942, resigned to marry in 1946. Died in 1987.


**Norah Mary Edwards (聞慧中)**, female, born on 22nd September 1907, a Baptist from Whangarei, a qualified music teacher with L.A.B., graduated from NZBTI, applied to the CIM, sailed for China in September 1934, treated for gallstones at Shanghai in 1935. Worked in Hwailu, Tsingsing of Hopei (河北) and taught at Chefoo, Shansi. Took furlough during Sep 1940 - Oct 1941. Interned in Stanley Camp, Hong Kong, as a POW from 1942 to 1945. Resigned from the CIM in 1946, taught in a girl’s school in Kowloon, Hong Kong.
Joyce Elingham (later Mrs. Grubb) (凌蕙芬), female, born on 14th May 1909, a member of Auckland Baptist Tabernacle, applied to the CIM from Auckland, graduated from the NZBTI (1930-1931), sailed for China in October 1932. Worked in Kweichow (貴州), married a NZ colleague Ronald W. Grubb in Chungking on 12 Dec 1933. Attended Mt. Albert, Whangaparaoa and Murrays Bay Baptist churches, served as a Sunday School teacher, missionary supporter and crusader leader. Died suddenly in North Shore Hospital on 12th Apr 1991. See husband’s entry for more details.

Margaret Ellen Evans (later Mrs. Gibbs) (叶文斯)¹, female, born on 1st August 1914, a Baptist, a dressmaker and tailor by trade, graduated from NZBTI, applied to the CIM from Auckland. Sailed for China in September 1938, worked in Kweichow (貴州). Married a NZ colleague Trevor Gibbs at Chungking on 22 Oct 1940. See husband’s entry for more details.


Mary M. (Mollie) Findlay (芬美礼), female, born on 25th Jul. 1892 in Warkworth, North Auckland, a Presbyterian, a qualified secretary through five years of night school commercial course from Thames Technical College, an active member of the Bible Class Movement, becoming a sought after speaker and organiser for District Committee and National Conferences. A skilled administrator and very capable with financial matters. Applied to the CVM from Auckland, appointed to the CVM as “Business Woman” on 7th. Sep.1923 to relieve other missionaries of financial and business related work. Sailed for China in the same year. Appointed as the Kwantung Synod Accountant. Ordained by Auckland Presbytery as missionary to China at Grey Lynn Church (while on furlough) 5th. Sep.1929. Appointed as the Acting Superintendent of the PCNZ mission hospital c.1931 as well as continuing her duties as the Kwantung Synod Accountant. Taught Sunday School at the Union Church in Fong Ts’uen, undertook Bible Studies with students at the Girl’s Union Normal School at Sai Chuen (Canton), and ran Bible study groups for Nurses at Kong Chuen. Resigned for family reasons in June 1935 and returned to NZ. Appointed as a Deaconess at St Peters, Grey Lynn-Richmond Auckland (8th. Aug.1935 – 31st.Jul.1937), acted as Secretary of the Board of Manager’s of St Peter’s (1935 – 1939), and Treasurer (1943 – 1946). Acted as Secretary and Treasurer of the Auckland Chinese Mission Church from (1935 – 1945). Reappointed to Kong Chuen and the Kwantung Synod as Administrator on 21st

¹ One CIM publication suggests that Frances Ogilvie (CVM) was a sister of Mrs. T. N. Gibbs, presumably referring to Margaret E. Evans, but since the two had different surnames, it cannot be ascertained (Bessie Webster, “On the Air”: A Twofold Testimony, CIM, Whitcombe & Tombs Ltd., undated).
Jun. 1946, duties included acting as Accountant for the Kwantung Synod of the Church of Christ in China and Treasurer of the PCNZ Mission. Temporarily assisted the United Church of Canada as Treasurer. In June 1949 the Synod sent her to be in charge of the mission holiday homes in Cheung Chau Island, Hong Kong. Returned to NZ on 24th Nov. 1951 via India where she visited PCNZ’s Punjab Indian Mission. Retired effective 30th Sep. 1952 (Rep 1952), worked as the Treasurer of Maori Mission from 12th Sep. 1952; later she again served as a valued member and an Elder of the Chinese Church in Auckland and for some years as Session Clerk. Died on 8th Oct. 1975 at Lady Allum Home, Auckland.


**Kate Fraser (Kate),** female, born to Hugh and Mary Austen Fraser (nee Graham) of Dunedin as one of their three daughters, a Presbyterian, a trained teacher, applied to the CSM from Dunedin. Sailed for China in 1897, resigned/retired in 1926. In 1903, her oldest sister Mary Isabel Fraser (1863-1942), Lady Principal of Wanganui Girl’s College (1894-1911), met her in Japan when both of them were on leave of absence. The two sisters left for Kate’s mission station in Ichang (西昌). Mary brought the local fruit *Yang-Tao* back home to a nursery man Alexander Allison. This fruit became known as Chinese gooseberry and eventually became kiwifruit. See [Mary E. Moore](http://zesprikiwi.com/about/history/isabel-fraser)’s entry for more details.

See: Kent Atkinson, “Fruit that started life in China but we call it Kiwi”, *New Zealand Press Association*, dated unknown (between 2006-2010);

See also link: [http://zesprikiwi.com/about/history/isabel-fraser](http://zesprikiwi.com/about/history/isabel-fraser)

**Miss Freeman,** female, a Baptist from Dunedin, sailed for China in 1903.

**Rev. Henry William Funnell (傅道明),** male, born on 12th Dec. 1881 at Akaroa to John and Louisa Funnell. Grew up as an only child brought up by his mother alone. An Anglican, had 11 years of working life (e.g. working as a clerk at Whiteombe and Tombs). Involved in YMCA’s open air meeting and bible classes for 7-8 years, and Sunday school work for about 10 years at St. John’s Church, Christchurch. Graduated from the Xenia Theological Seminary (1909-1912), Ohio, USA. Applied to the CIM from USA, Sailed for China in January 1912, worked in the Anglican-CIM diocese (Wanhhsien/万县, Shuting, Paoning/保宁) in East Szechwan. Married an English colleague Kathleen Louisa Polhill (傅杜氏, daughter of one of the Cambridge Seven, Cecil Polhill) possibly in 1920. Ordained by Bishop Mowll in 1929. Retired from the field in 1934. Took furlough in 1936. Continued to work with the CIM as the Deputy Secretary in England (1940), the Assistant Home Secretary for NZ and Australia (1945-1954). Worked as acting dean of Nelson, acting vicar of Lincoln, and from 1958 in St. Andrew, Hoon Hay, Christchurch. He collapsed in St. Andrew as he was beginning their 9th anniversary serve on 10th Jun. 1962. Died unexpectedly. His devotional writings were compiled in the booklet *In the Sanctuary* in 1963. The Funnells had two sons and one daughter.
Catherine Eleanor Galpin (later Mrs. Christianson) (葛尔品), female, born on 25th June 1909, dedicated by the parents as a result of Hudson Taylor’s visit to NZ in 1900. A Baptist from Whangarei, worked as a typist and in general office duties (1928-1931), graduated from the NZBTI (1931-1932). Sailed for China with the CIM in September 1933, in training home in Kiangtu in 1934, worked in Yongping, Tali (大理) and Lunglin of Yunnan (云南), married a non-NZ colleague V. J. Christianson on 30th Jan 1939. Took furlough in 1940 to US. The family flew to NZ shortly before she died on 26th January 1948. Funeral service held in the Whangarei Baptist Church. The Christiansons had two sons, Neil (1942 in Minneapolis) and Malcolm.

Trevor Gibbs (纪保慈, 计报慈), male, born on 12th July 1912, apprentice in the sheet metalwork trade, member of the Baptist Tabernacle. Pastored churches at North Invercargill, Mornington (Dunedin) and Gore Baptist between 1935 and 1938. Applied to the CIM from Auckland, graduated from NZBTI (1933-1934), sailed for China in August 1938, worked in Kweiting, Kweiyang, Tsunyi (遵义), Kopu of Kweichow (贵州), married a NZ colleague Margaret E. Evans at Chungking (重庆) on 22 Oct 1940. Took furlough in 1945-1946. Resigned/retired in 1949. Took an interim pastor at Mt. Eden Baptist (now Cityside Baptist) for a few months. Supporting church planting initiatives at Murrays Bay, Northcote, Birkdale and Belmont during a five year pastorate at Milford in early 1950s. Led the Whangarei Baptist for ten years, encouraging the growth of new churches in Kite Street (Tikipunga), Kaikohe, Dargaville, Kaitaia, and Marsden Point. Later served at Papakura, Marsden-Wellsford, and as associate pastor at Murrays Bay. Retired to Gisborne and died on 28th May 1996 at his home. The Gibbs had two sons: Bruce (1944 at Anshun/安顺, married Lyndsay, serving in Afghanistan with International Assistance Mission, later served the Baptist Church of New Zealand as a Transitions Facilitator), Graham (1949 at Chongqing/重庆, married Priscilla).

May (Mary) Gibson (?), female, born in 1887, an Anglican, a trained teacher, applied to the SPG from Dunedin, sailed for China in 1923, working at the SPG Girls’ Schools in Peking, Tientsin and Shantung from 1930. Introduced the Girl Guides movement to China. Died in 1937 after an operation.


old station in Kiangtsin after husband’s death. Died of illness on 31st Aug 1932 in Shanghai.

**Samuel Glanville** (甘兰卿), male, born in 1879, a Methodist, an architect by trade, applied to the CIM from Christchurch, sailed for China in 1904, worked in various office work in the Shanghai Headquarter, Chinkiang (镇江) of Kiangsu (江苏) and CIM home in Tientsin (天津). Married a NZ colleague **Janet L. Turner**. Took furlough in 1913, 1925, and 1935. Retired from the field in 1941. Continue to work with the CIM as its representative in Western Australia (1941-1949). Died in 1954.


**Martha E. Gordon** (later Mrs. Brock) (董惠文), female, born on 14th April 1889, a Presbyterian, a trained teacher, graduated from St. Hilda’s Training Home in Melbourne (1915-1916), applied to the CIM from Auckland, sailed for China in October 1916, married a non-NZ colleague J. Brock. Worked in Chowkiachow (周家口) and Fugow of Honan (河南). Took furlough to NZ via USA in 1936-1939. Resigned/retired in 1939. The Brocks had at least one daughter: Jean Gordon (1932).


**Dr. Georg Gräter** (English spelling Graetzer) (?), M.B., CH.B. (NZ), Dip. M. (China), M.D. (Vienna). Male, born in 1898 in Vienna, Jewish by birth but Austrian by nationality. Joined the Austrian Army in 1916 as a Lieutenant fighting against the Russians on the Eastern Front. After the Armistice, studied medicine in Vienna, graduating in 1924. Gained practical experience both in medical and surgical fields as an interne at the Wihelminen Hospital (1924 - 1929). Carried out original research in several fields and published articles in various medical journals both in Vienna and Berlin. Worked in private practice (1930 – 1938), and additionally held an appointment from the Vienna City Corporation as a community doctor in connection with the City’s Social Security Co-operative. Married **Margarete Helena (Grete) Reinold** in 1934. After Austria was annexed by Germany in 1938, they were forced to flee the country on racial grounds and eventually arrived in Shanghai. The IRC gave Dr Grätzer a temporary appointment in Canton but he was soon expelled by the mission in 1945 due
to having Jewish extraction. A few months later the IRC recommended him for the post at the PCNZ’s Mission Hospital to replace Dr. Owen Eaton. Commenced 1st. Oct.1939 for 3 months with the IRC paying half of his salary for this time. Appointed Chief of Medical Staff, from 1st. Jan. 1940. Served for over six difficult years during Japanese occupation of China and while NZ Missionaries were interned in Canton from 1942. Being considered “German”, he was allowed to remain at Kong Chuen during the war years where. The NZ Church had no word of the fate of Dr Grätzer or of the Hospital for over two years and were relieved to find that he had managed to keep it operating on very limited resources. When the Japanese occupied the hospital buildings towards the end of the war, he transferred what remained of the hospital staff and some equipment to temporary premises at the nearby market town of Ko Tong. At the end of the war in 1945 they were offered a paid furlough to NZ by the PCNZ, but declined. He then went into private practice on his own account in Canton where he qualified for a Chinese medical degree. After all westerners were asked to leave China in 1951, they sought and were granted asylum and residency in NZ. Despite the fact that they were of the Catholic faith, the PCNZ gave them every possible assistance in gaining residency in NZ due to their dedication to the PCNZ Mission during the WWII. They then settled in Dunedin where Dr Grätzer first studied for 3 years to gain his NZ medical degree before running his own private practice. He took a great interest in pathology and was a noted diagnostician as well as carrying out research work. Dr Grätzer was also subsequently invited to attend the PCNZ’s General Assembly. Died of cancer in Dunedin on 25 March 1962, aged 63 years, Interred at Anderson's Bay Cemetery, Dunedin.

See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page166.htm

Mrs. Margarete Helena (Grete) Grätzer (English spelling Graetzer) (née Reinold), female, born on 3rd Apr 1901, undertook a six year course of study at the Vienna School of Fine Arts, receiving the Honour of Special Prize woman in her graduating year. Married Dr G. Grätzer in 1934. Grete was a noted artist and portrait painter of some distinction and her work was exhibited in Dunedin on more than one occasion. Some of her paintings are documentary in character, depicting the Chinese life and character. Died of cancer on 22nd Oct 1968 in Dunedin.


Mabel Naomi Grey (later Mrs. Grant) (顾玉麟?), female, born on 19th Mar 1900 to John Grey and his second wife (nee Green) at Milburn, Otago. Niece of John Wilkinson\(^1\), a Presbyterian from Dunedin, baptised by immersion, a trained primary

\(^{1}\) Wilkinson was a well-known Dunedin Lawyer, prominent in a range of southern circles. As a member of the Brethren assembly in Farley Street, he took an interest in Dunedin’s Chinese and collected public money for famine relief in China. He was the

The Grants had four children: Paul Ainsworth (13 Sep. 1934 at Kaifeng), Maybeth Allison (14 Feb 1937/Kaifeng – 20 Oct. 1939 at Yencheng of diptheria), Elinor Ruth (5 Apr. 1940 at Yencheng, in charge of the physiotherapy department of South Australia in Adelaide), and Audrey Naomi (27 Aug 1942, a senior lecturer at La Trobe University in Melbourne).

Ronald Westbrooke Grubb (葛雷白), male, born on 14th September 1908, a Brethren from Christchurch, worked as a clerk, graduated from NZB'TI (1929-1931), sailed for China with the CIM in September 1931, worked in Tsunyi (遵义) of Kweichow (贵州), Hankou (汉口), Anyi (?), and Shanghai. Married a NZ colleague Joyce Elingham at Chungking (重庆) on 12 Dec 1933. Resigned/retired in 1934. The Grubbs have four children: Kristeen (Mrs. Ian Turner), Ruth (Mrs. Ron Keam), Ray (married Esther), Colleen (Mrs. Bruce McMillan).

Olegario Guardiola (郑国桢), male, born in 1869, a Presbyterian, a lithographer from Dunedin, graduated from Melbourne Training Home, sailed for China with the CIM in September 1895/1896. Died of fever in March 1899.

Arthur Graham Gunn (金应选), male, born on 7th Dec 1913, son of the Presbyterian minister Rev James Thomas Gunn (Snr, 14 Aug 1875 – 20 Jul 1919), and brother of Rev James Thomas Gunn (Jnr., 17 Nov 1919 – 20 Sep 2008). A Presbyterian from Wellington, worked as a clerk, applied to the CIM from Auckland, obtained two years of university education (economics, logic, ethics, English, Greek), Studied at the NZB'TI from 1936 where he gained the top marks ever recorded: an average of 97%. Thereafter followed an outstanding work in the Auckland YMCA. Began the Christian

CIM Southern Council’s honorary secretary and treasurer from 1894 to 1935, and was further involved as a committee member for at least four other missions: the PIVM, the ZBMM, the LMS, and the Ramabai Mukti Mission. He was one of John R. Mott’s early contacts in New Zealand, chairing the large public meeting in Dunedin in 1896, and in 1926 he was a delegate at the New Zealand Missionary Conference (Hugh D. Morrison, “It is Our Bounden Duty: the Emergence of the New Zealand Protestant Missionary Movement, 1868-1926,” 250 (Ph.D. Thesis, Massey University, 2004), http://mro.massey.ac.nz/handle/10179/1869.).
Men’s Business Association with Mr R A Laidlaw. Sailed for China with the CIM in September 1939, worked in Tali (大理) of Yunnan (云南), nearly lost his life several times. Resigned in 1942. Trained as a pilot in India under the Royal Air Force then served in Egypt for 5 months and then Britain for 10 months. This included flying Wellington Bombers in the latter part of the war with hair-raising experiences. Returned to NZ before went to Edinburgh for BD studies at New College, Edinburgh 1948?. Possibly undertook one year at Theological Hall Dunedin 1949?. Ordained in 1950, at North Berwick, Midlothian, Scotland, St David’s, Glasgow. Returned to New Zealand and was inducted at Manurewa SAP on 9th Feb 1961, retired on 31 Jan. 1978. A major contributor to Challenge Weekly since 1980, particularly the Daily Devotionals column. Played a prominent part in the life of the Westminster Fellowship during the 1960’s; taught Church History in the BCNZ; in retirement taught evening classes at Rangitoto College and conducted many tours to the Holy Land. First married an English woman, Alice Vera Green (2 Dec 1924 - 1975) on 21 Jul 1945. Remarried to Peggy Pike on 17th Mar 1979. Died on 16th Nov. 1998 at North Shore Hospital.

The Gunns children are: Heather (Mrs. David Oldershaw), Graham (married Liz), Mervyn (married Sheila), Rosemary?, Gerald?, Holden?.


1 Founder of the Farmers Trading Co.
Joseph Harry Haines (赫田史), male, born on 29th June 1917, a Baptist from Auckland, worked as an agricultural salesman and mechanic for NZ Fruitgrowers’ Federation Ltd., lay preacher, graduated from Sydney Bible College, sailed for China with the CIM in August 1941, assisted in outpatient department of American Baptist Hospital in Ipin, worked in Kwanhsien of Szechwan, worked among the students of an aviation school. Resigned in 1944 due to marriage and war service.

Kathleen Anne Baird Hall (何明清), female, born in Napier on Oct 4th 1896 to Thomas and Helen Hall, shortly after they moved from Auckland for Thomas’ promotion, who was to become the District Land Registrar, Registrar of Deeds, Examiner of Titles, Deputy Commissioner of Stamps and Assistant Registrar of Joint Stock Companies. As one of the seven children, Kathleen went to a private kindergarten and primary school and attended the Cathedral of St. John the Evangelist. The family moved back to Auckland as a result of the father’s promotion in 1909 and settled in Remuera. Kathleen finished her secondary education in the Ladies College and applied to Auckland Hospital to be trained as a nurse in 1917. She has been going to St. David’s Presbyterian Church in Khyber Pass Road, and set up a Nurses’ Guild at the Church of the Holy Sepulchre across the road from St. David’s. On completion of the four year course, she was accepted into St. Helen’s Hospital in Christchurch, where she learnt midwifery and maternity nursing. On hearing Rev. S. Crichton McDouall, she applied to the SPG and was accepted to be one of the four candidates from 19 applicants. She received the dismissal service in February 1923 at St. Mary’s Cathedral in Auckland by Archdeacon MacMurray, and sailed for Beijing en route Sydney and Hong Kong. On arrival, Kathleen started learning Chinese at the American Missions Language School in Beijing and nursing at Peking Union Medical College. After a year, Kathleen was transferred to Mosse Memorial Hospital in Datong. In 1925, she was asked to help setting up the St. Barnabas Hospital at Anguo (安国) as Matron which didn’t complete until 1927, the same year Kathleen had her first furlough. From Oct 1930, she started to extend medical work to outlying villages. After her second furlough in 1934, Kathleen visited Annie James of PCNZ for her experience in rural China. With the approval from Bishop Norris, the Bishop of North China, Kathleen chosen Niuyangou (牛眼沟) to set up the first village health clinic, and moved to Song-jia-zhuang (宋家庄) at the end of 1935, where she acquainted with General Nie Rong-Zhen (聂荣臻) who gave her a dog as a protection. Introduced preventive public health and contraceptives to villagers. Relieved in St. Barnabas Hospital when the Matron was on furlough in 1937, during which the Sino-Japanese war erupted in full scale in North China. Kathleen stayed on while some of the Chinese doctors fled with their families. After she returned to the Song-jia-zhuang, she started, in the year of 1939, to “smuggle” medical stocks from Beijing through Japanese line for a Canadian Communist doctor, Norman Bethune, for his surgical work among the 8th Route Army. Kathleen had made more than thirty trips, and helped about forty Chinese students and nurses to escape from the Japanese-occupied Beijing. On discovering and as revenge, the Japanese burned down the whole village and made a formal complaint to the British
Embassy to have her deported. She tried to return to inland China as a member of the Hong Kong Foreign Auxiliary of the Chinese Red Cross and got as far as Shanxi (陕西). She became very ill as a result of beri beri. General Zhu-De (朱德) sent soldiers to carry her to Xi’an (西安) and was eventually returned to NZ. Resign from the missionary service in 1941 to care for her aging mother. After placing her mother in a rest home, she enrolled for a nurse’s refresher course at Waikato Hospital in 1948. Her plan to return to China was disrupted by the political change-over in China, and her application for an ingress visa was declined after months of waiting in Hong Kong. In the meantime, worked with the Mission to Lepers Hong Kong Auxiliary (1950-1951). On returning home, she worked with Canon Wi Huata in the Maori mission in Te Kuiti and Waitara, Waikato, until 1956. When the first National Conference of the New Zealand China Friendship Association (NZCFA) was held in Wellington in 1958, Kathleen was the delegate for the Auckland branch and became part of its Executive in 1959. She also became a member of the World Peace Council and attended the World Peace Congress in Melbourne. Revisited China by the invitation to attend the celebration of the 11th Year of the People’s Republic of China in 1960 and again by the invitation of the Chinese Peoples Association for Cultural Relations with Foreign Countries in 1964, but wasn’t able to return to the villages. Represented New Zealand Peace Council in the Australia and New Zealand Congress for International Co-operation and Disarmament in 1959 and was on the Executive of both the Anglican Pacifist Fellowship and the NZCFA by 1962. Kathleen was placed in Bryant Village as her health deteriorated and died on April 3rd 1970. A marble statue was erected in Quyang County to commemorate the centennial of her birth. There is also a headstone in the cemetery commemorating Kathleen. Today, the primary school in Song-jia-zhuang is named after Kathleen’s Chinese name. From 1996 to 2005 the NZCFS in association with New Zealand Nurses Organisation Inc. provided the Kathleen Hall Centennial Memorial Scholarship, an award of $1,500 (later raised to $3,000), for a New Zealand Registered Nurse to undertake graduate study. From 2007, this scholarship has been replaced by the He Ming Qing Memorial Scholarship to provide three-year scholarships for rural Chinese women to complete nursing training in China in order to work for improvement in health standards in their own villages. The early versions of Kathleen biographies were written by Tom O. Newnham: Kathleen Hall, (Beijing: New World Press, 1992), Dr. Bethune's angel: The life of Kathleen Hall, (Auckland, N.Z., Graphic Publication, 2002), an abridged version can be found in his New Zealand Women in China (Auckland, N.Z., Graphic Publication, 1995). There is also a more modern narrative by Rae McGregor, Shrewd Sanctity – The Story of Kathleen Hall 1896-1970, Missionary Nurse in China, (Auckland: Polygraphia Ltd., 2006).

Robert Sinclair Hamilton (赫慕思), male, born in 1897, a Presbyterian from Waikato, a qualified land surveyor of Oamaru, graduated from NZBTI (1923-1924), applied to the CIM on 27th Jun 1924. Took home missionary work in the Presbytery at Dargaville, sailed for China on 21st Aug 1925, worked in Yingchow, Fowyang (阜阳) and Kuoyang (涡阳) of Anhwei (安徽). Married a NZ colleague Grace McGregor at


Sarah Hannah Hardisty (丁裕俭), female, born in 1884, a Methodist, a dressmaker by trade, influenced by an Australian CIM missionary Alice Henry, applied to the CIM from Napier on 6 Mar 1910, with “approval on principle” and the financial help of Mr. & Mrs. James Griffith, she went to St. Hilda’s Training Home in Melbourne. Sailed for China on 23rd September 1912 and arrived in China on 26th Oct. Worked in Fenghwa (奉化) of Chekiang (浙江). Married a NZ colleague Joseph Thompson in Dec 1914. Retired from the field in 1946. Started a Sunday School at Northcote (later became Northcote Baptist Church). Died in 1966. See husband’s entry for more details.

Annie Harrison (杭秀珍) , female, born on 9th April 1869, an Anglican from Christchurch, a trained teacher. Got to know the CIM through a Christian farmer whose

1 John Henry Hancock was much involved with the Dunedin civic and commercial community and held the position of Mayor 1893-1894.
wife was a relative of Mr. George Muller, and a Mr. Manerling of Fernside (Canterbury) who was a personal friend of Benjamin Broomhall (CIM’s England Home Director). Broomhall referred her name to the newly-formed Melbourne Council. A member of this Council came across to NZ to interview her, to fill application papers, and to invite her to Melbourne on probation. She sailed for China in August 1891 without further training, her first term was ten years without furlough, and her second term was 20 years without returning home. Worked in Sisiang (西乡) of Shensi. Retired to Christchurch. The first missionary to go out with an interdenominational society. Retired in 1919. Died in 1961.

Olive Harrison (later Mrs. Strange) (?), female, born in 1886 in England, accepted by the NZCMS to sailed for China in 1910, married to Dr. Charles Frederick Strange, worked in evangelical capacity in Hangchow. After husband’s death, sought to return to China from England in 1934 but was prevented by a lack of funds.

Arnolis Hayman (成邦庆), male, born on 22nd Apr 1890. His parents were the Salvation Army missionaries in Ceylon, so he was named after the first local convert. Mother died when he was a few month old. The father remarried and migrated to New Zealand in 1892, first in Christchurch for 8 years and then moved to Birkenhead, Auckland in 1902. Methodist, a draper assistant. Farewelled from the Zion Hill Methodist Church, Birkenhead. Graduated from Angus Missionary Training College, Adelaide. Sailed for China with the CIM in September 1913. Worked in Anping, Chenyuan, Kiuchow, of Kweichow(贵州). Married an Australian (NSW) colleague Ruth Margaret Matheson (?) in 1919, who died in 1926 of septicaemia at Anshun (安顺) leaving four children. Remarried an English colleague Rhoda Susan Johnson (周恩秀, 21st Jun 1893-1950) on 9 May 1928 at Chefoo and had two more children. Captured by the Red Army with Bosshardt and Emblen in 1934. After 413 days he was released on 18th Nov 1935. Then worked in Wuhu (芜湖) and the Business Department of the Shanghai Headquarter. Interned as POW first in Yangchow camp from Mar to Sep 1943, and then moved to Pootung Camp in Sep 1943. Took furlough in 1932 and 1945. Retired from the field in 1947, worked in Anglican ministry from 1948, at the same time took the role of secretary of the CIM Sydney office/NSW representative (1947) and the secretary of prayer groups (1950-1951). Invited by an ex-CIMer Archbishop Howell Mowll to serve in the Anglican Church. He was ordained in 1948 and served as an Anglican minister from 1953 to 1971. Retired from the CIM in 1951. Died of a stroke on 22 Jan. 1971.

Hayman’s brother Hedley was a Baptist minister in the United States; his sister Frances was a trained nurse and home missionary to rural Maori.

Two of the Hayman children joined OMF, Winifred Joyce (Joy) Hanselman (3 Jul 1922 at Anshun) engaged in tribal work in the Philippines, David Edward (10 May 1924 at Rockdale, Sydney) worked in Japan, and became the field superintendent in the 1960s. Other Hayman children include Theodore John (26 Nov. 1920 at Kweiyang, later an Anglican Minister in outback Australia), Andrew William (14 Feb. 1926 at Anshun, an Anglican Minister), Frances Emma (13 Nov 1929 at Hungkiang, Hunan) and Benjamin

**Reima Henderson**, female, a member of CORSO, worked in the Soochow Mission/Canadian Mission Hospital, founded by the United Church of Canada; also contracted for the IRC from 1947. Withdrawn from China in 1949.


The Hogarths had four children: Bryan, Bronwyn, Lynette (1949 at Anshun) and Graham.

**Joyce M. Horner (??)**, female, a congregational, R.N., R.M., a LMS missionary to China, a member of CORSO, also contracted for the IRC from 1947. Worked in Wuchang (武昌), Hupei (湖北). Withdrew from China in 1949.

**Pearl Hosking**, born on 22nd Jul 1921, female, a CIM missionary to China, sailed in September 1949, never proceeded to a mission station from the language school in Chongqing (重庆), withdrew from China in 1952.

**Arthur Hallam Howie (侯典??)**, male, born on 12 Aug. 1900, a Baptist, member of ACC??, a trained doctor (M.B., Ch.B.), graduated with a university degree. Applied to the CIM from Dunedin. Sailed for China in September 1935. Worked in Linfen Hospital and Kaolan of Kansu (甘粛). Worked as the school doctor in Chefoo School, also worked among rickshaw drivers and factory hands. Married an English colleague Mary Harman Preedy (伯思美, 1907-2000), a second generation CIM missionary (so was her brother A. Clarence Preedy), at Chefoo on 20th August 1937. Captured as a POW in the Weifang camp (1942-1945). Took furlough in 1946 – 1947, involved in deputation work in association with the Inter-Varsity Fellowship. Transferred to work

Both the Howie and Preedy families have had a number of members work in missionary capacities, among whom his brother Alfred Tennyson Howie was a medical missionary to China with the CVM. The Howies had five children: David (1938-1978), Ivan (1941 at Chefoo), Margaret Lloyd (1943 at Weihsien camp, served with husband with Christoffel Blindenmission/Christian Blind Mission International in Kenya and PNG), Kathryn (1946 at Wellington), Marion (1951, medical missionary of BMMF with her husband, 1980-1983).

Dr. Alfred Tennyson (Tennie) Howie (何), male, born on 18th November 1902 at Waikiwi Invercargill, a Presbyterian, a trained doctor, graduated from Otago University with a M.B. and Ch.B. in 1930. Applied to the CVM from Invercargill. Set apart as Missionary on 17th Dec.1931, married a New Zealander Edith Leila Seamer on 30th Dec 1931. Sailed for China as a Medical Missionary on 8th. Jan.1932. Spent 1st year in language study; owing to shortage of staff in the Kong Chuen Mission Hospital he commenced Hospital work in his 2nd year. Ill-health (tuberculosis) forced him to return to NZ in 1936. Recuperated for a few months in Pembroke (now Wanaka) before a sudden death on the 4th November 1936 at Cromwell Hospital, Central Otago.

His brother Arthur Hallam Howie was a medical missionary to China with the CIM. The Howies had two sons: Ross (1933) and Bryan (1935).


Maud Prudence Hullah (胡海珠), female, born on 18th January 1911, a member of Kingsland Methodist Church in Auckland, Christian Endeavour secretary, a trained nurse and stenographer, graduated from NZBTI (1932-1933), sailed for China with the CIM in September 1934, engaged in children and women’s village work in Linmingkwan (临洺关) and Hantan (邯郸) in South Hopei (河北) and Sihwa (西华) in Honan (河南) (1935-1939), later as a nurse in Kuling Chefoo School (1948-1951). Left China in 1951, rejoined the OMF to work in the Serdang clinic in Malaysia (1953-1960). Took furlough in 1939 – 1944 to recover from meningitis plus taking a nursing course, in 1951/52 during which she took a midwifery course, and in 1956/57. Retired in 1960. Worked as Charge sister at Middlemore Hospital for 12 years. Died on 30th Sep 1987.

Rev. Kate Hilda Louise Keen (later Mrs. Hutley), born at Maidenhead, England, in 1887. The family emigrated to NZ in 1908 and farmed at Ruawai and at Willowbrae,
near Kaikohe, Bay of Islands. Also associated with the Beresford St. Congregational Church in Auckland. A trained educationist and an ordained minister in Edinburgh. Sailed to China with the LMS in 1913. Worked in Pienchow in South China. Resigned to marry an artisan missionary, Mr. Walter Hutley, in 1922/1929 in Australia.\(^1\) Husband died in less than three years’ of time. Rejoined the LMS in 1932 and worked in Ting-chow until 1950. One of the last over the “Hump” to withdraw from China to India. Together worked 36 years in China. Died in May 1976 in Adelaide, survived by two sisters, E. L. Keen, Mrs. Dorothy Page, and a brother Mr. J. C. Keen.\(^2\)

**Dr. Joseph Ings (\(\)?)**, male, born in 1873, the fifth son of Rev William Ings (a Baptist Minister of St. Clair, Dunedin). As a youth in St Clair he took great interest in the Chinese near his own home and while still a youth he opened a class in his father's house to teach these men, and at the same time began to study their language. From 1897 he helped in the Chinese Church Dunedin for 3 years. A tour with the Rev Alexander Don among Chinese Missions in California, British Columbia, Honolulu, Japan, and then three months in Canton China intensified his desire to serve the Chinese. Upon his return to Dunedin in May 1898 he commenced study in the Technical School and passed the medical preliminary examination in two years. Left Dunedin for Edinburgh in March 1900 to study medicine and graduated with M.B. Ch.B. in July 1905. Without foregoing his Baptist principles, he offered his services to the PCNZ’s CVM. Prior to sailing for NZ married **Jessie M. Wilson** on 20th Jul. 1905. at St Stephen's Church, Edinburgh. After some time at St Clair and deputation work sailed for China as the pioneer medical Missionary of CVM and arrived in Canton on 29th Dec. 1905. While inspecting a Hospital near Canton, a fatal illness (dysentery) developed and he died on 16th. Aug. 1906 after 6 months service. Buried at the Canton Christian Cemetery (just outside the East Gate of Canton City). His brothers, Rev. James Ings (13th. Apr.1873 – 25th.Feb.1954) and Robert Ings, were both Ministers in Australia and NZ, a Sister had Missionary experience in India. See link: [http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page171.htm](http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page171.htm)

**Mrs. Ings (Jessie M. Wilson)**, female, born in 1875, daughter of John Wilson of Aberdeen, had had considerable experience in hospital work when married **Dr. Joseph Ings** on 20th. Jul. 1905 at St Stephen's Church, Edinburgh. Sailed to China with husband, assigned with evangelistic duties. After husband’s death, Mrs. Ings stayed on and served as Nursing Superintendent of the Medical Missionary Association in 1907, Canton. From 1st. Jan.1908 she was transferred to the staff of the Association and no longer a member of the CVM. Was noted as working in Canton Hospital in 1923. Died on 15th. Mar.1950.


\(^2\) Brash refers to her as Rev. Kate Hutley (**How Did the Church Get There?** 51) in 1948, and Norman Goodall refers to her as “an ordained minister” (**A History of the London Missionary Society, 188**) in 1954. See also Obituary, 31 May 1976, **New Zealand Herald**, Section 1: 8.
Owen Jackson (?), male, born in 1919, a boat-builder, a Quaker, lived in Auckland, joined the FAU in 1945 with his older brother Wilfred Jackson. Arrived in China in May 1945. Worked as a driver mechanic and later in Henan as a medical mechanic and a depot manager. Left China in 1947 to crew on a yacht sailing the Pacific. Worked for the engineering firm Gough, Gough and Hamer in Whangarei, then as a farmer in the Bay of Plenty. Retired to Waiomu, north of Thames.

Wilfred Jackson (?), male, born in 1915, a logging contractor, a Quaker, lived in Northland, joined the FAU in 1945 with his younger brother Owen Jackson. Worked as a driver mechanic, chief mechanic and garage foreman in Qujing (曲靖). After closure of the Qujing depot in Mar 1946, moved to Zhengzhou (郑州) and became the Depot manager, mechanic officer. Completed the closure of the Zhengzhou depot in Apr 1947, and moved to work in the mechanic department in Zhongmou (中牟). Married an American colleague Margaret Renner in Shanghai in Jul 1947. Left China in Jan 1948 for the USA to live in the wife's home state of Kansas for several years. Worked as foreman and manager with the engineering firm International Harvester in Auckland after returned to NZ. Retired to Warkworth, north of Auckland.

Sister Annie Isobella James (谢安、谢安)，female, born on 22nd. Apr.1884 in Herbert Otago, a Presbyterian, continued her education up to Std 6 (Form 2), responded to the call to mission service at age 19, a domestic and a student of PWTI (1910-1912), applied to the CVM from Dunedin. Ordained Deaconess as 3rd “Own Missionary” of St Andrews Church Dunedin on 8th. Sep. 1912, sailed in the same year. In order to work in medical capacity, she took course in midwifery during furlough in 1915, did 4 month Karitane course during furlough in 1922, and took course in child welfare at Melbourne on her way back to China during furlough in 1928. On return to China she took charge of the small cottage Hospital in Kaai Hau (街口), with particular responsibility for women and children, serving there for the next 20 years. Tended a large number of out-patients in the dispensary daily, including giving inoculations and vaccinations, took in maternity and occasionally general medical cases, helped with religious work in both hospital and chapel, and visited maternity cases around the Ts‘ung Fa (从化) district. The care of motherless children was an integral part of her home life. She was the only NZ Missionary of the CVM not interned during Pacific War. She worked on the border between Japanese held territory and Nationalist Free China. Suffered many hardships and only occasional messages could be sent to NZ. For a couple of years it was not known whether she was dead or alive. After the war, she returned to NZ, arriving on 16th. Aug. 1946, and went back to China on 17th. Jul. 1947. Imprisoned by the local communist authorities in 1951 on trumped up charges for 2½ months, suffered greatly from interrogation and malnutrition. Since the local population of the Tsung Fa area refused to lay or support charges against her, the charges had to be dropped in the end and she was released and returned to NZ to recuperate. Received MBE at Auckland on 28th. March 1952, 10 years after the award was made. After long rest she went to
Hong Kong, worked among refugees from South China (many from the Ts’ung Fa area where she had worked for so many years) and at the Fanling Children’s Home. Her old congregation of St Andrew’s in Dunedin bought her a cottage there for her ‘semi-retirement’. Re-united with Po Chue, one of her adopted Chinese orphans, who although only a child had managed to make her way to Hong Kong in search of her adopted Mother. Retired from Hong Kong Mission 30th Jun. 1953. Spent her last years in Dunedin with Po Chue, among her old congregation of St Andrew’s. Died on 6th Feb. 1965, after an operation in Auckland, aged 80. Author of the booklet: I Was in Prison (1952).

See links: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page172.htm;
Stuart Vogel. 'James, Annie Isabella - James, Annie Isabella', from the Dictionary of New Zealand Biography. Te Ara - the Encyclopedia of New Zealand, updated 30-Oct-2012,

Charles A. Jamieson (陈国粹), male, born on 17th February 1888, a Presbyterian, worked in Civil Service, applied to the CIM from Oamaru, sailed for China in November 1911, worked in I-Kia tribe at Hingi of Kweichow (贵州) province, and Kanchow of Kiangsi (江西) province. Married a non-NZ missionary Nellie Pearson (?). Retired/resigned in 1930.


TW Lau, Kwantung Synod Presbytery Superintendent, in supervising, encouraging and
guiding the Church work of the district. He also spent part of his time doing intensive
evangelistic work with groups of young Chinese farmers in the Kong Chuen area as
well as a heavy involvement with committee work under the Kwantung Synod in
Canton. Left China and arrived Hong Kong on 12 Apr. 1951. The LMS and the 6th
District Association of the Church of Christ in China (Hong Kong Presbytery)
requested Paddy to remain to help in the establishment of a centre for the training of lay
men and women for Christian service. Appointed in April 1952 to serve in Hoh Fuk
Tong (何福堂) Training Centre at Castle Peak, New Territories, duties included
lecturing in evangelistic work and general training for lay leaders of the Chinese
Church together with eight other Chinese and European staff. Also supervised six day
schools associated with the congregations of the Church of Christ in China in Hong
Kong, and took a leading part in the general administration of the Church Council. In
1958, the NZ Mission Committee was seeking a qualified man to head the Tangoa
Teachers Training Institute (TTTI), at Onesua, New Hebrides (Vanuatu). Accepted the
position for 12 years (Mar.1959 – 7th.Apr.1971), after that he stayed on as a ‘volunteer’
for three years to bring to fruition the ‘Navota Farm’ which he had conceived. Also
conceived and established the Maropa Bookshop in Vila to supply the people with
books now that they could read. Appointed Moderator of Assembly in 1967. Returned
to NZ in 1974 and retired to Waikanae, Wellington and died on 5th. Mar. 1979. The
Jansens had no children. Author of Jade Engraved: New Zealand Missionaries and
Their Chinese Colleagues in Japan’s China Incident (Christchurch, N.Z.: Presbyterian
Bookroom, 1947), and From Jungle to Farm: In the Land Where the Fenceposts Grow
(1978).

**Mrs. Nancy Jansen (nee Langford),** female, born as twin sister (Isabel) on 5th. Oct.
1922 to Ernie and Nella Langford, a railway worker family. M.A. Honours Graduate in
History and a trained Teacher. Married CVM missionary **Rev. Elwyn George Jansen**
capacity. Moved to work in Hong Kong and New Hebrides with husband. After
husband’s death, she served in Queen Salote Coll Tonga as a teacher in 1992. Died on
29 Dec. 2011. See husband’s entry for more details.

**Margaret A. Jennings (謝),** female, an Anglican from Dunedin, graduated with a M.A.,
studied in St. Hilda’s Training Home in Melbourne, joined the NZCMS and sailed for
China in 1923, worked in Hong Kong, first in St. Hilda’s College, and then in the
Victorian Home and Orphanage. Became supervisor of youth work in the diocese of
Kwangsi. Permitted by the Japanese to continue her orphanage work during the War.
Retired in 1946 after furlough. Became the Principal of the Fiji Primary School in Suva
from 1946-1956. Continue to live in Suva and teach English and Bible to the Chinese in
her 80s until 1970s.
Laura Jensen (Laura Jensen), female, born in 1870, a Brethren, in domestic duties, applied to the CIM from Dunedin. Sailed for China in September 1896, died in May 1903 of typhus.

John F. Johnson, male, born in 1922, a Quaker living in Christchurch, worked as an engineering apprentice in fitter and turner, dismissed for refusing to work on machine-gun mountings. Worked as fisherman and other temporary jobs until joining a Ministry of Work survey gang in North Canterbury. Joined the FAU and arrived in China in Jul 1945 with his older brother W. Neil Johnson. Worked in Henan (河南) as a driver mechanic, later involved in engineering projects in Zhengzhou (郑州). Joined Sandan convoy en route Hong Kong in Oct 1946. Returned to NZ in Apr 1947. Worked as a launch master and fisherman before joining the staff at the Ministry of Works Testing Laboratory where he became manager. Retired in Christchurch.

W. Neil Johnson, male, born in 1921, a Quaker living in Christchurch, studied in physics and maths at Canterbury University. After finding that the only available work in his field was war-related, he took accountancy at night while manpowered into a sheep station to do clerical work. Joined the FAU and arrived in China in July 1945 with his younger brother John F. Johnson. Worked as hospital business manager in Hui Tian Hospital in Qujing (曲靖) and Hua Mei Hospital in Zhengzhou (郑州), and as executive secretary and finance officer in Shanghai. Spent five months assisting with the closure of the FAU’s office in Calcutta. Returned to NZ in Dec. 1947. Worked briefly for CORSO before beginning a career in accountancy in Wellington and Christchurch. Died in 1975.


The Johnsons had three children: Paul Victor, Hilary Margaret (Mrs. Foged) and Timothy Howard.

Took language study in Cheung Chau (Apr. - Dec. 1941), worked in War Memorial and Queen Mary Hospitals, Hong Kong (Dec. 1941 - Jan. 1942). During Japanese occupation, he was sent to the Stanley Internment Camp in Hong Kong (Jan. 1942 - Sep. 1945), returned to NZ on release from internment, arrived on 24th. Oct. 1945. After furlough left for China via USA on 5th. Nov. 1946, arrived in China on 13th. May. 1947. He was stationed at Yan Woh where he specialised in open-air evangelism and in work among the children including the local boys school. Though had previously been engaged to Ruth Gilbert (daughter of Rev Henry George Gilbert), married an American Missionary (The Covenant Missionary Association) Gertrude Marshof on 19th. Sep. 1949 in Hong Kong, and left China on 15th. Oct. 1949. While on leave, he served at Edgecumbe, Pokono, Matamata and Ponsonby in NZ during 1949. He resigned from CVM as from 30th. Mar. 1950 when he began to feel that Communist rule was limiting his effectiveness to spread the Gospel. Served in St Stephens, Auckland in 1950, and resigned in 1952 to go to USA. Received by the Orthodox Presbyterian Church Presbytery of Philadelphia on 18th May 1953, and served in Taiwan under the OPC Committee on Foreign Missions (1954-1972). Adopted by Presbyterian Church of America (PCA) Vanguard Presbytery on 18 Sept 1974, and worked under PCA’s “Mission to the World” in Taiwan (1975-84), and taught as the Prof of Bible [Studies?] in Christ’s College, Taiwan (1974-84). Retired to USA in 1986, and died on 5th Sept 1989.


Miriam Jones (?), female, born in 1872, a Brethren, lived in Auckland, married an English colleague H. S. Conway (孔好义) in Shanghai in 1904 and accepted by the CIM as a member. Worked in Honan (河南). Retired from the field in 1924 due to husband’s home-base assignment.

Their daughter Norah Conway became a second generation CIMer.

Laura P. Kibblewhite (计博慧), female, Sailed for China with the CIM in Sep 1949, never proceeded to a mission station from the language school in Chongqing (重庆). Died in 1958.

Mr. E. A. Kimpton, male, a Baptist, lived in Wellington, graduated from Angas College in 1904. Sailed for China in 1904.

Einna King (?), female, commissioned from Lower Hutt, sailed for China as a Brethren missionary in June 1936. Worked in feng-ning-hsien, married a NZ colleague Herbert Robinson, left China in 1950. See husband’s entry for more details.

Maud King (金光耀), female, born on 15^{th} Aug 1902, a Brethren, a trained nurse, graduated from the NZBTI (1930-1931), applied to the CIM from Auckland, sailed for China in September 1931, worked in Anshun (安顺) of Kweichow (贵州) province, married a NZ colleague Harry Taylor at Shanghai on 10 Sep 1935. Died in 2002. See husband’s entry for more details.

Dr. Edward (Eddy) Wilfrid Kirk (?), (M.B., Ch.B.(Edin), F.R.C.S.(Edin); M.R.C.O.G.), male, born on 30^{th} Oct. 1886 at Edinburgh, Scotland. A son of the Rev. John Kirk of Edinburgh. Worshiped in the Evangelical Union Church. After going to George Watson's College he received his medical education at Edinburgh University, graduating in 1908. Held house appointments at the Royal Infirmary and the Deaconess Hospital, Edinburgh. One of the student Missionary volunteers, accepted at 1907 General Assembly. Came to NZ in 1909 and ordained as an Elder before leaving for Canton as a CVM missionary in Nov 1909. “Own Missionary” of St. Andrews Church, Dunedin. On outbreak of WWI he was set free for voluntary medical service. Arrived France on 10^{th} Feb. 1916. Served in France and Belgium with the rank of Lieutenant, rising to Captain, in the R.A.M.C.; attached in March as Medical Officer to the 9th Gordon Highlanders until seriously injured in an accident (fracture of his skull) on 13^{th} Nov. 1917. On his recovery acted as Surgeon in Bangour Hospital, West Lothian (then on a war footing), until the Armistice in November 1918. After becoming F.R.C.S. (Edinburgh) returned to China. Married in Toronto Canada to a NZ colleague Winifred M. Stubbs in 1917/1918. Returned to Canton on 31^{st} Dec. 1926, but political conditions made it impossible for work to resume in Canton, so left to take a position in a Chinese controlled Medical College at Changsha, where he was Associate Professor of Anatomy from 1st. Jan. 1927. One record indicates that he took a position in 1926 on the staff of St John’s University in Shanghai. In 1928 he was resident in Hong Kong holding an appointment under the Colony Government in connection with Chinese Hospitals. He withdrew from missions staff on entering Government service. One record states that he took up private practice in surgery and gynaecology in Hong Kong until he was interned. Noted as being Doctor in Stanley Internment Camp in Hong Kong during WWII. Left China in 1946, Obtained the M.R.C.O.G. in 1949 and took on hospital work in gynaecology in London (Buckhurst Hill) until retirement age. Retired to London. A keen golf player. Died on 28th Mar. 1963.
His brother Dr. John Kirk was also a CVM missionary. See link: [http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page175.htm](http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page175.htm); also his obituary in the British Medical Journal (Apr 27, 1963).

Dr. Professor John Kirk (?), (M.B.,Ch.B.(Edin), F.R.C.S.(Edin)), male, born on 29th. Nov. 1881 in Edinburgh, Scotland, a son of the Rev John Kirk of Edinburgh. Worshiped in the Evangelical Union Church. Educated at George Watson's College and at Edinburgh University, graduating with M.B., Ch.B. in July 1904. During the course of his student career he was twice awarded medals in practical anatomy and prizes in systematic and clinical surgery. After graduation he held the appointment of House Surgeon at the Mildmay Mission Hospital, Bethnal Green, London (Sep 1904 - May 1906). Dr Kirk had been a fellow student of Medical Missionary Dr Joseph Ings. On hearing of Dr Ings' death at Canton in Aug 1906 he applied to join the CVM. After visiting and touring NZ married Norah E. Hughes on 2nd Oct. 1908 (st? HK?), left for Canton on 10th. Oct. 1908. While on furlough in 1913-14 he was admitted as a Fellow of the Royal College of Surgeons of Edinburgh; also attending the University course on Diseases of Tropical Climates, gaining the class medal. Appointed Lecturer in Operative and Clinical Surgery at the Kung Yee Medical College, Canton 1914. “Own Missionary” of First Church, Dunedin. Served as a Doctor at Ko Tong Mission Hospital then at Kong Chuen Mission Hospital from 1916. On 1st. Dec. 1919 he was set free from Hospital worker and became a Lecturer in Human Anatomy at the Kung Yee Medical College, Canton, becoming heavily involved with the Union Medical Education Scheme. Appointed Convener of the Canton Missionary Conference Medical Committee in 1920, the Committee was set up to organize medical mission work in the Province and co-ordinate it. During furlough in 1921-22 he worked as a full-time Demonstrator in Anatomy in the University of Birmingham. Placed in charge of the new Dept of Anatomy at Kung Yee Medical College in 1924, the first of its kind in China, which eventually became the Medical Faculty of the National University of South China. A member of the Council on Medical Education of the Chinese Medical Association for 6 years and President for 3 years (1923 – 1925). Chairman of the Joint Conference on Medical Education arranged by the Chinese Medical Association and the Hong Kong and China Branch of the British Medical Association in 1925. Resigned on 31st.Oct.1929 for family reasons and returned to England. Appointed full-time demonstrator in anatomy at University College, London, becoming senior demonstrator in 1930. Later became sub-dean of the faculty of medical science at the college, and senior tutor in the faculties of medicine, science, and engineering, and lecturer in anatomy to the Slade School of Fine Art. Appointed to the S.A. Courtauld chair of Anatomy at Middlesex Hospital Medical School (1937 - 1949). The outbreak of war left him shouldering a heavy burden, the pre-clinical side of the Medical School having to be evacuated first to Bristol then later to Leeds. Appointed Secretary of the board of studies in human anatomy and morphology (1943 – 1945), and Chairman of the board (1945 - 1947). Retired in 1949 with the title of Professor Emeritus. In the service of medical education he was chairman of the committee of anatomical supply for the London area (1937 – 1947), and had been chairman of the committee of licensed

His brother Dr Edward W. Kirk was also a CVM missionary.


Howard Herbert Ellingham Knight (艾荣德), male, born on 5th October 1907 in Whangarei. A member of Auckland Baptist Tabernacle, graduated with a B.Sc. (University of NZ) and from NZBTI (1930-1931), a draughtsman by trade. Sailed for China with the CIM in September 1931. Worked in Xining (西宁) of Tsinghai (青海) province, Datong (大同), Tianshui (天水) and Lanchow(兰州) of Kansu (甘肃) Province (1931-1934, 1936-1939, 1936-1939, 1941-1948), and Hongtong (洪洞) of Shanxi (山西) province, became Assistant Superintendent and then Acting Superintendent of Kansu and Northern Regional Director in Shanghai (Apr 1949 – Jul 1951). Married a NZ colleague Nancy E. Tucker by Eric Liddle at Tientsin on 26th June 1934. Took furlough in 1939-1941 and 1948. Withdrew from China in 1951, ordained by Baptist Union of NZ in the same year and worked as a pastor. Continue serving on the OMF’s Australian Council and became the Home Director (Oct 1955 – Dec 1970), Secretary of Evangelical Association in Australia (Feb. 1971- Dec 1980), Director of TEAR Fund in Australia (1978-1980). Died on 15th Feb 1986 in Auckland.

The Knights had three children: Allan Howard (Yutaoho of Shanxi/内蒙古, 1935, OMF missionary to Japan), Margaret Joyce (Tianshui/天水, 1937, also OMF missionary to Japan), Wendolyn Anne (Chengtu/成都, 1942).

Edmund (Ted) Mervyn Leech (季定祺), male, born on 12th March 1909, a Presbyterian, studied in the NZBTI in 1931-32, worked in survey and in public health department. Applied to the CIM from Waitara. Sailed for China in September 1934. Worked in Nanhshien of Hunan (湖南) province and Tayu (大宇) of Kiangsi (江西) province, married an American colleague, Virginia L. E. Casper (?), at Hankow on 10
Feb 1938. Left China in 1943 via India. Took further study in College and Seminary for five years. Work among the “Orientals” in Hawaii for 12 years, planted a church and left in 1960. Posted a small church in California for three years. Became a part-time Minister of Visitation and Evangelism in a larger church. The Leeches had at least two sons: one was born at Kukong, Kwangtung in 1941 and another in USA in 1945. One of their children, Jonathan, M.A., taught in biblical studies at Dallas Seminary.

Elizabeth Leslie, female, an Anglican, applied to the CEZMS from Auckland, resigned/left China approximately in 1905.


in 1949 on a Lutheran Mission plane “St. Paul”. Died on 1st Nov 1995. Author of *This is My Story – Autobiographical Highlights*.
The Litherlands had two children: Harold, Julie.

**Dr. John Alistair Loan**, male, born on 30th. Apr. 1917 at Owaka, South Otago, son of Rev John Charles Loan (1876-1964), Originally accepted for Mission service in 1933.

**W. Roy Lucas**, male, born in 1911. Spent the war years in detention camp and prison on the account of his pacifist stance. Joined the FAU and arrived in China in Mar 1946. Started off working as a mechanics officer in Zhengzhou (郑洲), then seconded to the Institute of Hospital Technology in Hankou (汉口) as its first business manager from Oct 1946. Left China in Apr 1949 for the USA where he married an American colleague Maureen Huang. Joined UNRRA?? and UNDP??, working in a variety of senior positions in the Middle East and Asia. Retired to Auckland.

**Lois R. Lymburn (later Mrs. Strong)** (林佩恩), born on 11 Feb 1922, female, sailed for China with the CIM in September 1949. never proceeded to a mission station from the language school in Chongqing (重庆). Married a Clem Strong. Joined the home staff in Melbourne office from 1958 to 1969.

**Nellie MacDuff (杜恩光)**, female, born on 27th May 1886, a Baptist, studied in St. Hilda’s Training Home in Melbourne in 1914. Worked as a bookkeeper and entry clerk. Influenced by Rev. John Bissett, pastor of the Auckland Central Mission. Applied to the CIM from Auckland. Sailed for China in Feb 1915. Worked in Anjen of Kiangsi (江西), Antung (安东, now Lianshui/涟水) of Kiangsu (江苏), and Hiangcheng of Honan(河南) province. Took furlough at the end of 1922 to mid 1924. Died in 1927 at Shanghai due to pulmonary tuberculosis.

**Annie Harrison MacLean (马淑贞)**, female, born on 24th Nov 1890, a Presbyterian from Wanganui, a trained teacher, took theological training in Melbourne, worked as a

Rev. William Robertson Malcolm (马春山), male, born in 1867, graduated with a BA from University of NZ, Wellington. Trained in the Presbyterian Theological Hall Dunedin (1889-1892), Ordained in Gisborne Outfields (Ormond) on 2nd Jul 1893, resigned in 1895 to join the CIM. Sailed for China in March 1895. Married an Australian colleague, Anna Trudinger,¹ B.A. (1873-1951) at Shanghai on 8 Jan 1902. They were both teachers at Chefoo school and also worked in Anhwei (安徽). Took furlough in 1905 and 1916. Left China and received again into the PCNZ from 17th Nov. 1924. Worked as an Assistant Parish minister at Kensington Dunedin from 1925. Retired in 1931 and continued to live in Dunedin until death in 1959. The Malcolms had one son: August Ronald (Ron) Malcolm (4 Apr 1910 at Hwaiyuan/Taiho, Anhwei) was trained as a teacher, became a committed pacifist and a communist. Jailed in a Military Defaulters camp during WWII. Became strongly committed to the Howard League for Penal Reform, and other social justice causes, including those of juvenile offenders, the legal system, child welfare, fosterage etc., with a strong interest in issues of social equity.


Rev. William Mawson (?), M.A., male, born on 27th Sep.1874 in Purakanui, Dunedin, a Presbyterian. Began as a pupil teacher, then went to Dunedin Teachers College and Knox College (1889-1892); studied at Otago University, taking Zoology as a subject for his BA; the Prof of Biology, Prof Parker, was so impressed with his ability in the subject that he wanted Mawson to take up science as a career, preferably in the biological field. He was deeply interested in the Student Christian Movement, and planned to train for missionary work in China. When Prof Parker’s health began to fail he appointed Mawson his Assistant. On the death of the Professor later that year, Mawson continued the work of the Department until the end of that year, 1902. (Prof. Bentham arrived in the beginning of 1903.) After the close of the academic year Mawson spent much of his time with Rev A. Don learning the Cantonese language which he began studying from 12th. May 1902. He was ordained for Mission work on 11th. Apr. 1903. "Own Missionary" of St. Paul’s, Wanganui. Married Sara Margaretta Gordon of Marton Manse on 1st. Oct. 1903. Sailed for China on 10th. Oct. 1903. Worked in evangelical capacity. Returned to NZ after 20 years of service in China, arriving on 2nd. Aug. 1923. Served at Chinese Church Auckland for five years from Nov.1923. Appointed Secretary for Foreign Missions Committee by Assembly in Nov. 1928. Continued in this office until his sudden death. Died on 11th. Jun. 1935 at Wellington after having suffered a heart attack a few days previous after travelling

¹ Six of the twelve siblings of the Trudinger family were CIM missionaries. They were Anna, Augustus/August, Dora, Edith, Gertrude, and Lily.
down from Auckland to represent the Foreign Missions Committee at a Church Advisory Committee meeting which was sitting to set total Church expenditure for the following year. Interred at Karori Cemetery.

His sister Jean Mawson was also a CVM missionary to China.

See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page183.htm


Her brother Rev. William Mawson was also a CVM missionary to China.

See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page183.htm

Mrs. Sara Margaretta Mawson (nee Gordon), female, was born on 3rd.May 1878 to the Rev. and Mrs. David Gordon (1835-1915) of Marton. Accepted to Otago University on a junior scholarship, and graduated with a BA in 1900, one of the first women graduates of that University up until that year (a total of 58 between 1885 and 1900). Graduated from the PWTI in 1903. Married to Rev. William Mawson on 1st. Oct. 1903, sailed as CVM’s missionary couple on 10th Oct. Sara worked alongside her husband and founded the Tak Kei girl’s school (德基女校) in 1913. On their return to NZ for the education of their five children in 1924, Sara worked for the Chinese Church in Auckland. She was still called on to interpret for Chinese people in the law courts in the 1930s. Died on 9th. Feb. 1956.

See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page183.htm

Juanita Helen May, female, born in 1908?, BTI graduate 1932, joined the Shanghai Hebrew Mission, acted as treasurer for the Christian Literature Society. \(^1\) Interned in the Lunghwa Camp (nearly shanghai) from Mar 1943 to Aug 1945. \(^2\)

N. May, female, a woman, a Baptist from Hamilton, joined Papua UK mission and worked in Papua as a missionary. She then joined Shanghai Hebrew mission in 1937, presumably worked among the Jews in Shanghai. Left China in 1949.

---

\(^1\) BTI Reaper, Jan 1942, p.268.


\(^3\) The initial “N” may stand for the nickname of Juanita, Nita. Since Shanghai Hebrew Mission was a relatively small mission, it is unlikely for two New Zealand women who had the same surname to join it around the same timeframe. Juanita Helen May and N. May might be the same person.
Rev. Stuart Crichton McDouall (杜徳恒), male, born in Oamaru on Jul 26th 1881, Anglican. Graduated with a BA and with theological qualification. Ordained in the Christchurch Cathedral, and had served at St. Mathew’s and at St. Michael’s in Christchurch. Accepted by the SPG. Sailed for China in 1909. Worked in North China. Married a F. C. Cogan in Beijing in 1911, who died in 1925. Married again in 1935 to Jessie Kentish Cole (possibly an English woman). While he was on furlough in 1922, he gave 147 talks within 6 months across five dioceses, selected four candidates (all women) from the 19 applicants. Finally left China in 1947 and retired to England - still alive in 1963.

Mrs. F. C. McDouall (nee Cogan), female, an Anglican, married to Rev. S. Crichton McDouall in 1911. Died in 1925. See husband’s entry for more details.

Sister Annie Mabel McEwan, female, born on 14th Apr. 1884, a Presbyterian, studied in PWTI (1908-09), ordained as a Deaconess at Havelock North Presbyterian Church on Sunday 7 November 1909, sailed for China on the 12th with the CVM. Worked in evangelical capacity amongst the women and children of the villages. Continued working after having contracted tuberculosis until she was too ill to remain in China. Resigned on 31st. Dec. 1923. Spent some years in Central Otago recuperating. Undertook work in the Roxburgh Sunday School. When stronger, moved to Caversham, Dunedin, continuing work among children, the aged, sick and infirm. Died on 16th. Nov. 1939 at Dunedin.

See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page179.htm


The McIntoshes have five children: Linnet (1939 at Langchung), Averil (1940 at Sintsi), Alastair (1942 at Lanchow), Gavin (1944 at Auckland – 29 Mar 1996 of heart attack,), Iona (1946 in NZ) and Lesley. Both Linnet and Averil joined OMF. Gavin joined Interserve and later became its Wellington-based director.


Louisa Jessie McKenzie, female, a Salvation Army Brigadier, working in Tianjin (天津), interned at the Weihsien camp from Mar 1943, died in the Camp on 27 Oct 1944, age 55.1

Mary May McKenzie-Gibson (孙荟心), female, born in 1887, an Anglican, a trained teacher, applied to join the SPG from Dunedin. Sailed for China in 1923. Died in 1937 after an operation.


Rev. George Hunter McNeur (麦沾恩), male, born on 24th. Dec. 1871 in Inchelutha Clutha District, a Presbyterian, grew up at Wairuna, trained in newspaper printing, also had periods of training at Belair Mission Training Institute Adelaide (Angas? Training Home) (1897), Glasgow Bible Training Institute, and in Knox College Dunedin (1900-01). Had applied to the CIM. Accepted by Otago Synod in 1899 as the first missionary sent by the CVM to China in 1901. Ordained by Synod of Otago of Southland on 31st. Oct. 1901. Spent some time with the Rev Alexander Don, Missionary to the NZ Chinese, prior to his departure which included visiting the Chinese as well as some Cantonese language preparation and study. Arrived China on 19th. Dec. 1901 and began a work which was considered “truly apostolic”. Based in Kong Chuen, worked in evangelistic and educational capacity. Married Margaret Sinclair on 12 Nov. 1903 in Canton. From 1911 began teaching in Fatei Theological College Canton besides the usual preaching, pastoral and administrative work of the Mission. “Own Missionary” of “Two Endeavourers”, Otago, and St. John’s, Wellington. He also taught for 25 years at the Union Theological College, Canton. He has been a member and chairman of important Committees in connection with Chinese Mission work. In 1920 he was threatened with the loss of his eyesight. Appointed Moderator of General Assembly in 1926. Left China in 1939, and formally retired from overseas missions from 31st. Dec. 1940. After the death of Rev A.L. Miller, he was asked to accept an appointment with the Chinese Church in Dunedin, working together with Mrs. E.E. Miller. Retired from Dunedin Chinese Church after appointment of the Rev YT Fong on 31st. Jan. 1951. Degree of Doctorate of Divinity conferred on him by the University of Aberdeen in 1948. Died in Dunedin on 27th. Apr. 1953 after a period of ill health. Author of the following publications by the Presbyterian bookroom: Gospel Gleams in the Canton villages (1907), C.V.M. (1908), New Zealand and China: Addresses Delivered at the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, Wellington, November 9-17, 1926 (1926?), The Missionary in Changing China (1934), My Witness to

All of his brothers, Rev. Archibald McNeur (1878-1961), Rev. Alexander McNeur (1883-1972), Rev. David McNeur (1887-1956) and Rev. William McNeur (1881-1946) were Presbyterian ministers. His sister Mary McNeur was a Deaconess. The McNeurs’ only daughter Margaret Jean also became a CVM missionary. The full story of his life is recorded in George Hunter McNeur: A Pioneer Missionary in South China by Henry H. Barton in 1955.


Mrs. Margaret McNeur (nee Sinclair), female, born on 1st. Oct. 1869, a Presbyterian from Kaitangata (of Milton). A trained teacher, graduated from PWTI in 1903 as one of the first three students when it was taken over by the PCNZ. Married the CVM missionary Rev. George McNeur on 12th. Nov. 1903 and sailed for China. Worked in evangelical capacity. Retired from the field in 1939 with husband. Died on 25th. Mar. 1957. See husband’s entry for more details.


Margaret Jean McNeur (later Mrs. Moore, 麦珍?), female, born in Canton on 21st Jan. 1907 as the only child to her missionary parents, George and Margaret McNeur. After spasmodic schooling in NZ, she was sent to the Chefoo School from 1916 to 1920 before moving back to Milton, south of Dunedin. Passed matriculation and spent two years as a pupil teacher before went to Teachers’ Training College in Dunedin. Pursued an MA at Otago University and her thesis is entitled “The Chinese in New Zealand” (1930). Accepted by the PCNZ as a missionary to work in the same mission field as her parents. Left PWTI on 17th. Jul. 1931 after six months’ training. Ordained in First Church of Otago in Dunedin on 12th. Sep. 1931 and sailed for Canton in the same month. After two years of language studies, engaged in village evangelistic work on regular bicycle trips, working closely with Chinese women co-workers. Engaged to an Irish doctor of the English Methodist Missionary Society, Samuel (Mooi) Hollingsworth Moore (arrived in China in 1931), in January 1934, and resigned on 1st. May 1936 to marry on 27th May 1936 in Canton. As Mrs. Moore, Jean moved to the Methodist Mission Hospital at Kukong (now Shiuchow, 韶关) where her husband was the Medical Superintendent. The couple visited NZ and Britain isles in their first furlough in late 1937. When they returned to China in 1939, Samuel went back first by sea to Kukong. After she registered to be shipped to Australia for safety, Jean decided
to travel overland from Hong Kong. The family reunited in Kukong in July 1940. Jean
acted in a liaison capacity (handling mission news from occupied South China plus
financial funding) between PCNZ and the Church of Christ in China (temporarily
removed to Free China) during WWII. Also provided hospitality to many missionaries
traveling from and to other parts of China, as well as Chinese and British army officials
fleeing from and to Hong Kong. Awarded with a certificate in recognition of her work
by Louis Mountbatten, the Supreme Allied Commander of South East Asia after the
war was over. Relocated with the children to India en route Kweilin (桂林) and
Kunming (昆明) in middle of 1944. Since Samuel became a member of the British
Army Aid Group at Kweilin, the couple ceased their missionary career. Samuel later
worked with the Government Medical Department in Hong Kong until his retirement in
1962. After a couple of years of settled life in Invercargill, Samuel were asked by the
chairman of the Society for the Aid and Rehabilitation of Drug Addicts (SARDA) to
work as the Medical Superintendent of the small island of Shek Kwu Chau. The couple
returned to Hong Kong in January 1964. For her many acts of kindness to the patients,
Jean was gradually known as “the Mother of Shek Kwu Chau”. Jean and her daughter
made a visit to Canton in February 1974 with another 34 NZ residents in Hong Kong.
Samuel died suddenly on 31st Dec. 1969 in Hong Kong while Jean died on 20th. Sep.
1992 after a stroke in Auckland, both were buried in the island of Shek Kwu Chau.
Jean’s story is recorded in her autobiography, Daughter of China (1992), edited by her
daughter Margaret Moore.
The Moores had three children: Margaret (11 Dec 1938 in Ireland), John (1942 in
Kukong), Deirdre (1944 in Kukong).
See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page181.htm

Elizabeth McQuire (穆芳嘉), female, born in 1892, a Presbyterian from Waiuku, a
trained maternity nurse, graduated from the Melbourne Bible Institute in 1923. Sailed
for China with the CIM in January 1924. Assigned to Shekichen of Honan (汚

Hayden William Stuart Mellsop (米普生), male, born on 7th Nov. 1909 in Auckland,
the oldest son of a large poor family that accommodated welfare children, felt the
impulse to be a missionary to China through hearing a CIM missionary while 12 and
living near a Chinese garden, even before he became a Christian. Baptised in the
Waikato River during the Ngaruawahia Easter Convention in 1928. Worked in
fledgling panel beating industry, and clerical work in a law office, took a leading role in
the Green Bay Mission Hall when the missioner and leader left, superintendent of the
Sunday school, studied in NZBTI (1932-33), member of the Blockhouse Bay Baptist
Church, served as secretary treasurer for the Blockhouse Bay Mission. Applied to the
CIM from Auckland. Sailed in September 1935 and arrived on 10th Oct. assigned to
Ichun (宜春) of Kiangsi (江西). Worked in Kiang Kai Shek (蒋介石?) Medical
College in Nanchang (南昌), catered for the refugees as Chairman of IRC on UNRRA
and CNNRA as committee member and advisor. Then interned as POW. He was
repatriated to Lourenco Marques in exchange for a Japanese civilian in 1943. Furlough

**Rodney Oswald Metcalfe (孟德富)**, male, born on 30 Dec 1909 in Mahakohe, a member of Auckland Baptist Tabernacle, studied in the NZBTI (1932-33), applied to the CIM from Auckland. Sailed in September 1934. Assigned to work in Kweiting, Kweichow (贵州). Married a NZ colleague Kathleen M. Christie by Rev. Hook (BCMS) at St. Andrews Anglican Church in Hong Kong on 26th Sep 1936. Returned to NZ due to wife’s ill health in 1939/1940. On their way back to China and while stopping over in Hong Kong, they were interned at the Stanley internment camp from Jan to 24 Dec 1942, and later transferred to Chapei Camp, Shanghai from Mar 1943 to late 1945. Took furlough and resigned in 1946. Died on 21st Dec. 1993 in Dargaville. Survived by his wife.

The Metcalfes had three children, all were born during internment: Chrisopher Hugh (1942), Rodney Michael, Marjorie F. (Oct 1944).

**Rev. Andrew Lindsay Miller (伦安德)**, male, born on 7th. May 1883 in Green Island Dunedin, a Presbyterian. Graduated with a B.A. (Otago University), a trained teacher (Dunedin Teachers College), a trained minister (Theological Hall, Dunedin 1913-15). Ordained as Missionary for China on 5th. Sep. 1915. Sailed for China with the CVM in the same year. Worked in educational capacity. Married a NZ colleague Ellen (Nellie) Evelyn Wright on 16th. Oct 1919. “Own Missionary” of Milton Presbyterian Church. They laid the foundation of the work in the area north of Canton. The illness of their only remaining daughter brought them back to NZ in 1928. Resigned in 1930 on acceptance of a call to Oreti Presbyter, later became a full-time staff with the Chinese Church in Dunedin. Died on 20th Jul.1944 while in office, suddenly and unexpectedly at his home in Dunedin.

The Millers had one surviving daughter: Jean.


1945, dedicated for Mission service on 24th Apr. 1945 and left NZ by plane on 30th Apr. 1945. As the Kong Chuen Hospital was still in enemy hands as at March 1945, he was loaned to the FAU with his expenses paid by the PCNZ. Worked in the Hui Tian Hospital in Qujing (曲靖) from Jun 1945, and mobile medical team in Liuzhou. When the war ended, Dr Milne arrived at Kong Chuen Hospital on 7 Oct 1945 to commence duties. Resigned 31 Oct 1950 and left China in 1950, leaving the Hospital under Chinese control. Appointed Chief Medical Officer for Niue Island in 1952 for two years. Worked as a GP in Wellington and Masterton until retired to Takaka, Golden Bay, in early 1990s.


**Mrs. Areta Hazel Milne** (née McNeur), female, born on 22nd. May. 1919, graduated with a B.A. Applied for Foreign Mission Service as Christian worker in 1941. She strongly felt that courses at the (Women’s) Deaconess College did not adequately fulfill her needs. Special permission was granted for her to attend lectures at the Knox Theological Hall in 1942 as a private student. Married **Dr. Graham A. Milne** on 12th. May 1943, accepted by the CVM as a missionary wife. Due to war condition, she and their two children remained in NZ after husband left for China, finally leaving for China on 5th Dec 1946, arriving 3 May 1947. Worked in educational capacity. Resigned with husband and left China in 1950. Died on 21st April 1997. See husband’s entry for more details. See link: [http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page181.htm](http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page181.htm); [http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page184.htm](http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page184.htm);

**Rev. Dr. Peter Milne** (Jnr) (?), male, born on 5th Jan 1888 on Nguna in the New Hebrides, a son of Rev. Peter Milne (1834-1924), the first Missionary of the Presbyterian Synod of Otago and Southland to the New Hebrides (Vanuatu) (1869-1916?). Graduated with a BA, also studied in Theological Hall Dunedin (1909-11), ordained in Knox Church Dunedin by the Rt Rev G. Lindsay as a CVM missionary on 12th. Nov. 1911. Sailed for China in 1912. Worked in evangelical capacity, married a NZ colleague **Hazel Milne** (nee Currie) on 4th. Nov. 1913. “Own Missionary” of Stirling, Clutha Presbytery. Compelled to go on furlough on account of his health in Sep. 1915, and resigned from 31st. Dec. 1915. Feeling that a medical qualification would be of more benefit, he studied medicine at Otago University. Served with the British medical administration in Kenya about six years before his retirement. Upon their return to NZ, he was appointed as the medical superintendent at Seacliff Psychiatric Hospital near Dunedin for three years. Then moved to the Waitati Hospital between Seacliff and Dunedin. After retirement, moved to Roslyn in Dunedin. Died in Dunedin in 1964, being buried beside his mother in the Northern Cemetery. A significant bequest was given to the New Hebrides (Vanuatu) after Peter's death to be used for educational purposes in memory of the mission work carried out there by his parents. With Hazel's blessing this money was used to build a Girls’ Hostel at Onesua High School and named the Milne Memorial Hostel.
His brother Rev William Veitch Milne (1877-1937) was a missionary to New Hebrides; his sister Isobel (Mrs. T.E. Riddle) (1885-1964) was a missionary teacher to New Hebrides and later a missionary nurse to India.


**Mrs. Hazel Milne (nee Currie)**, female, born in 1888, daughter of the Rev. Dr. Samuel Wilson Currie (M.A., D.D., Queens College, Belfast, 1857-1939). A Presbyterian from Balclutha. A trained teacher. Married a CVM missionary **Dr. Peter Milne** on 4th. Nov. 1913, and sailed for China together in the same year. Worked in evangelical capacity, also contributed to the educational program. Resigned from the field in 1916 due to husband’s health. Worked as a teacher to support the family when her husband was taking medical training. Had a lifelong interest in adult literacy. Died at PSSA Iona Hospital, Oamaru on 17 Dec 1973. See husband’s entry for more details.


**Mary Milner (毛爱华)**, female, born on 20th Nov. 1919 in Te Awamutu, lived on family farm at Matapara, moved to Auckland, Taradale, Napier, Wellington due to family relocation. Took a commercial course at Bilby’s College (1935). A member of Island Bay Baptist Church in Wellington (now Wellington South Baptist Church) from 4th Mar 1934. Started work with Crusader Movement and Scripture Union as secretary to Dr. John Laird (1936-1945). Completed a junior nursing course (1945). Studied at NZBTI (1946), sailed for China with the CIM in Sep 1947 and arrived on 15th Oct, worked in Xining (西宁) and Kweiteh (贵德/归德) of Tsinghai (青海) and the Tibetan border (1948-1949), placed under “house arrest” for one year (Dec. 1950 – 1951). Arrived in HK on 7th Jan 1952 as one among the last 24 CIM missionaries to evacuate. Transferred to Japan in Nov 1953, became secretary to Missions’ Superintendent in Sapporo, followed by 17 years in literature work, eventually being responsible for the chain of five bookshops (“Light of the World”). Returned to church planting in Hakodate for seven years. Retired in Sep. 1987 and revisited Xining for the same year. Church membership transferred to Blockhouse Bay Baptist Church on 30th Apr 1989 and was involved in Asian diaspora ministry there. Took a short-term mission to Eniwa Japan to help with Bible Studies and English classes for six months in 1996. Died on 20th Apr. 2008 in Auckland.

**Edith Annie Missen (later Mrs. Meller)** (孙慧鸾), female, born on 5th May 1907 in Taihape, a Baptist, trained and worked as a Salvation Army Captain and maternity nurse in field and social work for five years, Auckland, studied in NZBTI in 1932, sailed to China with the CIM in Jan 1932, worked in Fuhinuan, Suyung, and Nanki of West Sichuan (四川), married a Canadian colleague Frank Herbert Meller (米荣立, 16 Jul. 1911) at Chengtu (成都) on 25 May 1937. Took furlough in NZ and North America in 1940, detained from returning to China so worked among the Cantonese-speaking Chinese in the West Indies. Died of plane clash in China on 1947 with her three sons (Paul, Peter and Phillip) on their way to rejoin her husband, who had been undertaking
a survey work in China from a year ago. Memorial service held in Onehunga Salvation Army Hall in Auckland. Survived by her parents and sisters.


**Agnes (Nessie) Moncrieff,** female, Head Prefect at Wellington Girls College in 1915-1916. Sailed for China with the YWCA in 1930. Worked first in Beijing and Shanghai, then in Hankou and Chengdu. Served as the YWCA’s Business Manager for Free China throughout the war years. The first woman speaker at the Dunedin University Club when on furlough. Returned home in 1945 in ill health. Taught on a correspondence school staff for about 15 years.


**Hilda Jean Moore (later Mrs. Johnson) (莫恩慈),** female, born on 10th Mar. 1920, a Baptist from Christchurch, a trained teacher, sailed for China with the CIM in July 1946. Worked in Wuwei (武威), Kansu (甘肃). Married a NZ colleague Victor W. Johnson at Lanchow (兰州) on 18th May 1948. Left China in 1949 for the first childbirth. See husband’s entry for more details.

**Mary Emelia Moore (穆秉谦),** female, born on 7 March 1869 at Dunedin, to Charles Moore, a saddler, and his wife, Mary Stewart, sister of the barrister and later MHR William Downie Stewart. The eldest of eight children. Free Church Presbyterians, attending Knox Church, Dunedin. Graduated with a BA from the University of Otago in 1893. A member of the Otago Sunday School Union, and a committee member of the Otago University Debating Society. Also belonged to the ladies' committee of the Otago University Christian Alliance. Greatly influenced by Mrs. Anderson, who was recruiting for the CSM in China, and the American John Mott of the World's Student Christian Federation (SCF) who visited the city. Although formal missionary training was not expected, the CSM looked for volunteers with a high level of education, leadership skills and religious training. Mary was chosen together with Emily D. Smith and Kate Fraser. On 24 November 1896 they were farewelled by a thousand people, and set sail for Sydney on 5 December, arriving in Ichang (宜昌) in 1897, a mission station established in 1878. Returned to NZ in 1900 due to Boxer rebellion. When Mary Moore and Kate Fraser returned to Ichang a year or so later, they opened a girls' boarding school with the funds they had raised from the sale of oriental goods while in NZ. They aimed to provide the girls with a trade in lacemaking and Chinese cross-stitch, and to ensure that the school was self-supporting. The scheme proved worthwhile and an industrial training school for young women was soon opened. In 1927 the mission
temporarily reduced staff. Mary moved to a safer area on the coast. She continued with the mission until 1932, when she retired at the age of 63. Freed from regular mission work she opened her own refuge at Ichang, where she worked among the poor, blind and disabled women and children. She also began work in the men's and women's prison and formed a prisoners' aid society. The Japanese invasion of 1938 brought Moore's work to an end and she left China for the second time. Returning to China she retired to a place known as Ching Tu. In 1940 few missionaries remained in Ichang to care for the thousand or more refugees under the mission's control, and Moore was called from retirement to give assistance. Mary served in China for 51 years in total. Eight years later she was evacuated to India, then to Scotland, and back to NZ in June 1950 aged 81. Died on 17 May 1951 at Dunedin. It is believed that the two girls she had cared for and financially supported for many years both emigrated to America. Her donation of more than 100 articles from China laid the foundation of a Chinese collection at the Otago Museum.


Agnes Morgan, female, with an unspecified physical disability, sailed for China with the Salvation Army in 1946, worked in North China, moved to Malaya and Borneo after 1951. Died in 1968.

John Stanley (Jack) Muir (穆友义), male, born on 20th Oct. 1907, a Baptist from Gisborne, took two year course in an agricultural college, and one year in Medical Missionary School of Medicine. Trained in NZBTI (1927-28), a farmer by trade, sailed to China with the CIM in Nov 1930, worked in Liangchow, Chenfan, Mintsin and Wuwei (武威) of Kansu (甘肅), left China in 1951, married a Canadian colleague Nettie Waldner (still alive in 1993) (万咸熙, 1910-?) by Eric Liddle at Tientsin on 26th Jun 1934. Took furlough in 1938. Served with the YMCA in NZ, ministered at the Free Methodist (later Valley Road Baptist Church) when detained at home during WWII. Returned to China in 1946, worked with the Pocket Testament League and traveled widely to distribute tracts. Also worked among the Nationalist army. Appointed Field Supervisor of Holy Light Rural Medical Service in 1948. Withdraw from China in 1951 and became Manager of the Crusader Bookroom, continued serving the CIM as honorary representative at Wellington. Died unexpectedly on 2nd Jul. 1964 due to a heart condition.

The Muirs had four children: Katherine, Jean Carter, Jim (at Kaolan/皋兰 of Kansu in 1935), Elizabeth Skeeles, ?. One of the daughters was born at Kaolan in 1937 and another at Vancouver in 1939.
Violet Margaret Naish (later Mrs. Bastin) (?), female, born on 22nd Sep 1891 in Springston, Canterbury. A Methodist. Attended Springston Primary School, South Bridge District High School, then trained as a nurse at Christchurch Hospital with a view to missionary work. Gained a Trained Nurses Certificate and a State Registration Medal. Referred to the PCNZ and was appointed missionary nurse for its China mission. Dedicated for Mission service at St Andrew’s Presbyterian Church, Lincoln Road, Christchurch 25th Sep. 1919. Left for China via Australia on the “Maheno” on 7th Oct. 1919. Arrived Canton on 11th Nov. 1919. Took two years language study at Canton Language School. From January 1921 assisted at PCNZ’s Hospital on weekends, full time from 1922. Appointed Superintendent of Nurses. Resigned on 31st. Dec 1923 to marry Rev. Ernest. A. Bastin, an educational missionary of the English Wesleyan Church Mission at Shuichow, South China on 5th Jan. 1924. Returned to New Zealand by the “Arafura” leaving China on 5th Jan. 1924. Stationed at Shin Tai with the English Methodist Mission from 1924. Left China late 1932 (or early 1933). Later assisted her husband in Circuit work in England and in further missionary work in Kenya. Died in England in August 1953.

See link: http://www.archives.presbyterian.org.nz/Page186.htm

Adjutant/Commandant Ellen (Nellie) Newton (牛耀), female, sailed for China with the Salvation Army in 1917, left China in 1949.

Juanita Elizabeth Nicol (?), female, born on 30th Nov. 1912 in Dargaville, a trained maternity nurse, employed by Auckland Hospital Boards, a member of the Auckland Baptist Tabernacle, involved in “Eady Hall Mission” and “Wayside Mission”, in charge of the “Nurses Bible Class” of the Public Hospital, sailed to China with the CIM in Oct. 1943. Married a non-NZ colleague J. E. Rayner (?). Resigned in 1944.

Dr. Charles (Dick) Everard North (那卓贤), male, born on 18th. Apr.1902 in Chandpur, Bengal, India, the son of Dr Charles North, a Baptist missionary doctor; educated at Dunedin. The family returned to Dunedin in 1910. Studied in Otago University, Worked for two years in his father's practice in Dunedin. Left in Dec 1926 to further his medical studies at Edinburgh, graduate with M.B.,Ch.B.. Volunteered for Mission service in 1927, and went as Locum Tenens to the Welsh Presbyterian Hospital at Shillong, Assam. Married Anges Edina North on 11th. Nov. 1927 in Colombo, Ceylon. Accepted an appointment to the CVM Hospital, appointed and was expected to leave Assam on 1st. Oct. 1928. “Own Missionary” of First Church, Dunedin. At Canton he suffered from tuberculosis, which necessitated his return to NZ in 1931; advised by his Doctors not to return to the tropics. Mrs. North was also unwell. Withdrew from overseas mission. Both noted as assisting Chinese Church in Dunedin in 1932. Then left for Australia and established a medical practice at Lawson, Blue Mountains, NSW, Australia. Moved to Wentworth (Falls?) in early 1950's.


Margaret A. North (later Mrs. Spur) (?), female, a granddaughter of J. Holloway, born on 2nd Feb 1906, a nurse from Nelson, sailed for China with the NZCMS in 1932. Worked in Hangzhou Hospital. Awarded the Royal Red Cross in 1946 for her work in the HK POW camp. Married Rev. Anthony Spurr in Jun 1949 in Chinese by Bishop Curtis. Left China in 1951. From 1953 worked in Kashmir, North India. As a missionary wife, she ran a medical clinic, and also chaplain at Anantnag. Retired to NZ in 1957, and moved to England in 1958.

Frances Gordon Ogilvie (O Kei-Lei, 奥基理), female, born in Adelaide on 2nd (another source says 3rd?) April 1895, the eldest of six siblings. Her father, Charles Ogilvie, was a son of the Rev. William Ogilvie, minister at Fintray, Aerdeenshire. Her mother, Edith McMillan, was a daughter of a Scottish doctor, Thomas McMilan of Wanlockhead, Lanarkshire. The family relocated as the father moved from Adelaide to Tasmania and to Christchurch (1914) as a bank branch manager. Educated at home until 12 years of age then Hobart Ladies’ College (5 years). Began at the University of Tasmania in 1913, continued her studies at Canterbury University College in Christchurch, completed a B.A. in 1917 with honours in English and studied for an MA in English and French. She taught in Craighead Diocesan Girls’ School in Timaru for a couple of years. Applied to the Foreign Missions Committee of the PCNZ on 1st Sep. 1919. On acceptance, she went to the PWTI for missionary training in 1920 to undertake some studies in theology and psychology at Knox College and Otago University in Dunedin. Ordained by Dr. Robert Erwin on 9th Aug. 1920 at Knox Church in Christchurch and became its “Own Missionary”. Sailed for China from Wellington in September. After two years of language studies, appointed as the

---

1 Could be Joseph Holloway, who was born at Longbush in 1867, a prominent athlete in Australasia, won many prizes, elected the Secretary of the Clifton, Woodend, and Bluff Athletic Society, and was the manager of the Milk Supply Department of the Invercargill Dairy Supply Company. Married a daughter of Mr. W. Couling of England. Had one son and one daughter. [http://nzetc.victoria.ac.nz/tm/scholarly/tei-Cyc04Cycl-t1-body1-d6-d2-d16.html#Cyc04Cycl-fig-Cyc04Cycl0825a](http://nzetc.victoria.ac.nz/tm/scholarly/tei-Cyc04Cycl-t1-body1-d6-d2-d16.html#Cyc04Cycl-fig-Cyc04Cycl0825a), accessed on 15 Oct 2012.

2 Arrived in China in 1938 to do pastoral work in Hangchow, a chaplain of the Mary Vaughan School & the CMS Hospital, invited by Bishop Tsu to be chaplain of Chekiang University and evacuated to the Kweichow. On return from furlough in 1947, was the only westerner at work in the University, which had by then returned to Hangchow. After moved to Kashmir, he served as vicar of All Saints Church, Srinagar, chaplain to the Tyndale-Biscoe Memorial High School and of the CMS Girls’ High School. Acting Principal of the boys’ during 1953-1956. On retirement, he became the vicar of a Lincolnshire parish in England.
Principal of the Tak Kei Girl’s Boarding School (德基女校)(1922 – 1931). Persuaded the mission authorities that it was ridiculous for a foreigner to occupy such a position when there were Chinese capable of the task. She was succeeded by Miss Wong Sau Kan. Then engaged in village evangelistic work, and were asked in 1938 by the Kwangtung Synod of the Church of China to become Principal of the Shung Kei Bible Training Institute (基督圣经学院) for women workers for the whole synod. After Canton fell into Japanese hands in October, Frances and other missionaries set up a refugee camp using the two premises of American Presbyterian high schools in Paak Hok Tung. After the camp was disbanded on Japanese demand, and on refusal of a free passage to Australia for safety and of a chance to re-establish the Shung Kei School at neutral Macau, Frances accompanied the students to re-establish the school in Shatin (沙田) and continued from Jul.1939 to Mar.1940. As the only resident staff member, Frances escorted a dozen students evacuating to the LMS house in Kowloon (九龙) shortly after Pearl Harbour. During her last term in the Shung Kei School, persistently argued against the idea of guarding the compound with arms amongst civil war even after villages were generally arming themselves for protection. Interned at the Stanley Camp from Christmas day of 1941. On release in 1945 returned to NZ, arrived on 21st. Feb. 1946. Returned to China on 14th. Feb. 1947. She was responsible for the overall planning and directing, lecturing in Old and New Testaments and Chinese Church history, and sharing in practical training at Shung Kei. Other duties included speaking and preaching in many churches and villages, Committee responsibilities both in the local church and in many spheres of the church’s activities, especially of its women’s work. Applied for exit permit with other missionaries in January 1951, arrived Hong Kong on 23 Mar 1951 and travelling via Australia, returned to NZ in Aug 1951. For her 30 years of service in China, Frances had four brief furloughs to NZ in 1925, 1931, 1937 and 1945. Appointed as a missionary teacher at the Chinese School in Suva, Fiji from Jan 1952 until the work ceased at the end of 1953. At the request of the 6th District Association of the Church of Christ in Hong Kong, she was appointed to relieve Rev E.G. Jansen at the Hoh Fuk Tong (何福堂) Training Centre at Castle Peak during his furlough in 1953. From 1954, she served as Principal of the Women's Training School in the Chinese Church, Castle Peak, New Territories, and also involved with refugee work until the end of 1959. Returned to NZ on 31st. Dec. 1960, Frances was appointed the first woman elder in St. Andrew’s on the Terrace in Wellington and became an Elder Emerita in 1978 due to declining auditory ability. She advocated the amalgamation of various church women’s groups into the Association of Presbyterian Women, volunteered in speaking in the Alexandra Girl’s Home in Wellington, helped with the Samaritan telephone service, twice relieved as principal of the Deaconess College in Dunedin, and assisted in the New Hebrides (now Vanuatu) mission for six months. Died peacefully in her sleep on 3rd May 1993 in a retirement home in Woburn, Lower Hutt. Her life-story is published by her nephew, Gordon Ogilvie, a local historian and biographer of Canterbury, in Little Feet in a Big Room (1994). The book title is taken from the title of a sermon Frances made at a children’s service at the Knox Church. Her sister Noel G. Ogilvie (1907-1992) was a deaconess.


See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page189.htm

**Edith Parkerson (?),** female, an Anglican, worked several years as a nurse for the Shanghai Muncipal Council. Joined the NZCMS as a missionary in 1947. Worked in its Hangchow Hospital. Transferred to “New Villages” in Malaya from 1952, in charge of a clinic at Salak South. Resigned in 1955 due to health reason.


See link: http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page189.htm

**Mrs. Catherine Paterson (nee ???),** female, born on 26th. Jun. 1878, married a CVM missionary doctor **Dr. R. J. E. Paterson** on 3rd. Jul. 1912. Sailed with husband in the same year and worked in evangelical capacity. Resigned with husband in 1920. See husband’s entry for more details.

**Robina Paul (?),** female, a Presbyterian, a trained nurse, formerly Matron of General Hospital, Singapore. Acting Matron of PCNZ Hospital in Kong Chuen for two full years (1924-1925).
Oscar Persson (?), male, a Brethren from Rongotea Assembly, sailed for China as the first NZ Brethren missionary in Apr 1904. Worked in Hu-Keo-Hsien, Kiang-si (江西). Died on 23rd Jul. 1905.

Jessie Haddow Pettit (later Mrs. Worley) (丁志贞). female, born on 25th Jun. 1886 to Thomas Pettit, a grocer, Baptist, temperance advocate and (later) city councillor, and his wife, Isabella Haddow. A trained teacher, member of Nelson Baptist, studied in St. Hilda’s Training Home Melbourne in 1911, sailed for China with the CIM in 1912, served in Wenzhou (温州) and Yungkia (永嘉). Married a NZ colleague Frank Worley, continued to serve after husband death in 1932. Took furlough in 1936 and 1945-1946. Left China in 1951. Her brother Dr. William Haddow Pettit (1885-1985) was a missionary to India (1910-1915), and later an examining physician for missionary candidates in Auckland and as a North Island CIM Council member.

Dr Kathleen (Kay) Anuei Pih (later Mrs. Chang) (毕振华), female, born on 10th Jun. 1902/1903 in Antong (安东, now Lianshui/涟水), China. Her Father taught Chinese to the CIM missionaries. Having suffered dysentery as a child, she was fostered by Margaret A. Reid of the CIM who wrote to the NZ Governor General Lord Plunket for permission to allow Kathleen to enter and stay in NZ. She was named “Kathleen” after Lord Plunket's daughter, and was brought to NZ in 1908. Christened at St Andrew's Dunedin in 1915 by the Rev Rutherford Waddell upon her confession of faith. Educated at Waimate Primary School, Otago Girls’ High School and Otago University. Graduated B.B., Ch. B. in 1929. The first Chinese graduate of the Otago Medical School with the financial support of St Andrews. Lived at PWTI in Dunedin during 1924. In 1928 the Governor General, Sir Charles Ferguson, gave special permission for her to become a naturalised New Zealander, one of only two Chinese nationals to be given this status between 1904 and 1951. Worked as House Surgeon at Oamaru Hospital for one year term in 1930. Ordained as missionary to China by Dr Rutherford Waddell at Knox Church Dunedin on 8th Sep. 1930. “Own Missionary” of the Presbyterian Young Women’s Bible Class Union. Sailed for China on 12th Sep. 1930. Appointed to work in PCNZ Hospital on a salary of £150 p.a. Spent one year in language study in Cantonese (her mother tongue being Mandarin). Contracted enteric fever in May 1932, and was able to resume work in Oct of the same year. Took post-graduate study in London University and Ophthalmology at Moorfields Eye Hospital (1935-37), gaining her Diploma in Ophthalmic Medicine and Surgery (DOMS) in Feb 1937. (This degree conferred jointly between the Royal College of Physicians and the Royal College of Surgeons of England). Resigned on 15 July 1938 to marry Dr. Francis Chang (张光朔)(M.Sc.,Ph.D.) of Shanghai at the Union Church, Hong Kong on 15th Aug 1938, the marriage service being conducted by the Rev George H. McNeur. Off CVM staff from 31st Jul. 1938 to accompany Francis lecturing Anatomy at St. Johns University in Shanghai. Both came to NZ in 1946,
Francis lectured in Anatomy at the Otago Medical School. Returned to China in 1947, only to be caught up in the final battle for Shanghai by Communist forces. Spent a year under Communist control before fleeing just one month before the border with Hong Kong was closed, leaving all their possessions behind. Joined the teaching staff of the University of Malaya in Singapore. In 1955 Francis was appointed Professor of Anatomy at Hong Kong University. Kay worked without payment with the Brethren Church as a medical missionary which ran the Kwun Tong Peace Clinic, administering to refugees from China, the homeless and the destitute. Both came back to NZ after Francis retired in 1969. Kathleen continued as an Honorary medical practitioner. They created a Chinese garden at their residence in Sherwood Street, Otumoetai. Died February 1991 at Tauranga.

The Changes didn’t have any children.


**Katie Popham (later Mrs. Webster) (韩庆恩)**, female, born in 1869, A Brethren from Dunedin, studied in Angas College, Kensington Adelaide (1901), a trained nurse, sailed for China with the CIM in Nov. 1901, worked in Szechwan (四川), married an Australian (NSW) colleague James William Webster on 19 Jan 1905 in Chengtu (成都), Szechwan. Took furlough in Australia in 1912, accompanying husband who worked as the secretary (pro temp) for the NSW office, remained on home staff until 1915. Returned to China as a couple to Kiungchow, Szechwan. Left China in 1924 due to husband’s sudden death on 10 Jan 1924 from a heart attack. Retired to Melbourne. Died on 17 Aug 1935.

The Websters had two children: Hilda Edith (11 Sep 1906 at Suifu – 25 Feb 1908 at Fushien of whooping cough), Constance (28 Aug 1911 at Leichardt, Sydney)

**Kathleen Martha Porter (?)**, female, born in 1905?, a nurse, sailed for China with the SPG in 1940. Worked in Qingdao (青岛). Interned at the Weihsien camp from Mar 1943 to Aug 1945.

Eunice Preece (李慎德?), female, born in 1885 in Coromandel. Her maternal grandmother was of Kautawhiti iwi Maori ancestry, and her paternal grandparents, James and Mary Ann Preece (1831-1856), were early CMS missionaries in the Thames and Coromandel areas. Influenced by a SPG missionary, Rev. Trevor Gilfillan, who had been in charge of the Coromandel district. Worked as a Sister on a surgical ward from about 1921. Member of Holy Sepulchre (Anglican), Khyber Pass, a trained nurse and midwife. A colleague at Auckland Hospital to Kathleen Hall. Sailed for China with the SPG in 1923, initially joined the staff of Peking Union Medical College, later worked in the country Hospitals of Hejian (河間) and Chichou of its North China Diocese, interned as a POW during WWII at Weihsien Camp, left China in 1951. Served with the Anglican Maori Mission on the East Coast. Died in 1969.


Stella M. Purchas (?), female, an Anglican from Christchurch, a trained teacher, studied in Melbourne Training Home, sailed for China with the NZCMS in 1932, worked in the Mary Vaughan School in Hangchow (杭州). Took furlough in 1938. Acted as CMS financial secretary for China in Shanghai on three occasions: from 1938 for 18 months, during 1941-1943, and Post-WWII. Moved to Ningpo (宁波) in Apr 1940, taught in the Boys’ Secondary School, Trinity College. From 1941 to 1942, she was the only CMS missionary living in Shanghai, and the official CMS representative on a number of intermission committees. Interned at Longhua POW camp from Apr 1943. Became secretary to the Headmaster of the camp school after a year in the kitchen, teaching religious knowledge and helping Sunday School. Became the CMS representative on the NCC of China, the Christian Literature Society and the BFBS in 1950. Retired in 1963.

Sister Eileen Mary Reid (李爱莲), female, born on 27th. Mar. 1901 at Otahuhu. After business training in Technical College and Auckland Commercial College, she went on to train as a nurse at Auckland Public Hospital with the aim of entering Mission work. Gained the silver medal in her class at graduation. Ordained as missionary to China by Auckland Presbytery on 5th. Sep. 1929. After 18 months delay in India, reached Kong Chuen Canton on 12th. Feb. 1931. Appointed Matron of Kong Chuen Hospital in 1931. Planning to return to China from furlough when war was declared with Japan, thus avoided internment. Spent some time in Australia, then left in 1944 to take up the position of Assistant Matron at the Methodist Mission Hospital at Kukong (韶关) in Free China. The deteriorating military situation meant that she was diverted to India for
18 months to assist at the PCNZ Mission Hospital at Jagadhri and at the Landour Community Hospital until the war was over. Returned to China in 1945. Acted as Assistant Superintendent of Nursing at Kong Chuen Hospital, which involved preparation of school curricula, giving lectures, supervision of other lectures, ward work, care of the health of nurses, and conduct of the school generally. Acted in an advisory capacity to the trained nurses on the staff, and gave many of the anaesthetics in the operating room. Was a member of the Ko Tong Church Board of Managers, and took a share in the evangelistic side of hospital activities. "Own Missionary" of First Church, Dunedin. Returned to NZ on 17th. Oct. 1950 due to ill-health. Medical advice recommended that she must not work in the tropics again. Resignation accepted from 30th. Sep. 1951. From c.1951, she served as a Ward Charge Nurse at Greenlane Hospital until 1961(?). Noted as being on staff of Woodchester Evenside Home, Christchurch, 1962. She also went to New Hebrides (Vanuatu) as the Matron of Ebuli Hostel and Onesua High School in 1962 to relieve Miss Rhoda Vickers who came on extended leave for study. Died in Sydney on 19th. Apr. 1982.


Her sister Lilias Reid was also a CIM missionary.

Lilias Reid (康爱), female, born in 1866 in Scotland, a member of St. Johns Presbyterian, Akaroa, Christchurch, a domestic help at home. Released by her elderly mother on hearing of Rev. George C. Grubb. Sailed for China with the CIM in Sep. 1895. Worked in Anhwei (安徽). Spent the last five months of her life in Anking. Died of cancer on 2nd May 1934 after an operation.

Her sister Hannah L. Reid was also a CIM missionary.

Margaret (Maggie) Adams Reid (later Mrs. Russell) (李), female, born in 1871 at Ballymena, County Antrim, Ireland. Came to New Zealand in 1881. Active in the work of St Andrew’s Presbyterian Church, Dunedin, a trained teacher, influenced by the Rev.

---

1 Rev. George C. Grubb, M.A. took a mission tour in Australia, Tasmania, and New Zealand from April 3rd, 1891, to July 7th, 1892. For further details of the tour, see The Same Lord by Edward Millard (Marlborough, 1893).
Rutherford Waddell’s Ministry and motivated by John R. Mott’s 1896 visit, Sunday School Teacher at the Walker Street Mission Hall 1894 to 1896. Her brother John Reid was headmaster of the Otago Boy's High School in Dunedin and a lay preacher. Sailed for China with the CIM in Oct. 1896, worked in Antong (now Lianshui), Jiangsu. Experienced one of China’s worst famines. £1,160 being forwarded from the Otago region alone for famine relief. Narrowly escaped from death at the hands of the Boxers. Established an orphanage to cater for the aftermath of the famine. Returned to NZ in 1909 to care for aging father. Brought her adopted daughter Kathleen Pih to NZ, who later became a CVM missionary. Margaret married widower Charles Russell, a farmer of Waimate, in 1910. Applied to the PCNZ’s China mission but had no outcome. When Kathleen was accepted into the CVM staff in 1930, Margaret traveled with her and taught English at the Sun Yat Sen University in Canton, probably after Mr. Russell died in 1932. At the outbreak of the Pacific War, Margaret escaped to Rangoon and up the Burma Road to Chungking, where the (Sun Yat Sen) University gradually gathered, the students having fled hundreds of miles overland. Margaret spent three years teaching in temples and in caves, until proper quarters could be erected. Feeling the strain of years, she retired from the University, but was persuaded to act as Secretary to the Governor of the Industrial Bank of China. Interned in the Yangchow Camp (May – Sep 1943) and the Chapei Camp (Sep.1943- Aug.1945). Returned to NZ when the war was over. Worked for the Presbyterian Maori Mission from 1 Nov. 1947, and appointed Head Teacher of Matahi Maori Mission School from 1 Sep. 1948. Died in 1 Dec 1956. Cremated and interred at Anderson's Bay Cemetery, Dunedin.


Alfred Reuben Richardson (李时光), male, born on 20th Feb. 1892 in Dunedin, a member of South Dunedin Baptist, studied in Angus College Adelaide (1914-1915), Married Sophia Forrest in Dec. 1915 and sailed for China with the CIM in the same month. Worked in Pengshan (彭山), Kiating (嘉定), Kiungchow and Ichang (宜昌) of Szechuan (四川). Took furlough from May 1924 to Nov 1925. Resigned in 1938. Died on 7th Dec. 1973 in Cambridge. Probably a brother of Mr. E. Richardson, a missionary to South and East Africa (1906- at least 1913).

The Richarsons had five children: Margaret (Mrs. S. G. Hamblett), Frank, Mary (Mrs. J. Rankin), Marjorie (Mrs. G. K. Webster), Iren (Mrs. F. E. Smith).

1 Rev. Rutherford Waddell (1852-1932), served for 40 years at St Andrews Dunedin from 1879 to 1919. During his term of service, St. Andrews was the first congregation to adopt the “own missionary” scheme (for a number of years this church had three “own” missionaries) and contributed generously to general missions. Since he was also the founder and first editor of The Outlook, a number of Margaret Reid’s China letters were extracted in this journal. See link: http://www.archives.presbyterian.org.nz/Page207.htm.

Maud Margaret Ridley (later Mrs. Brown), female, born in 1885, a member of the Moray Place Congregational, studied in the PWTI, sailed for China with the LMS in 1911, married a Rev. T. C. Brown of the Amoy Mission in China in 1914. Perhaps resigned from the LMS to work in the Amoy Mission due to the trans-mission marriage.


Herbert M. Robinson, male, living Hunterville, a children’s home worker, sailed for China as a Brethren missionary in Apr. 1932, worked in Feng-ning-hsien, left China in 1941. Continued working with Fiji Chinese and in Hong Kong until 1950. Married a NZ colleague Einna King. Died in Nov. 1951.

Mary A. Roulston (later Mrs. Liversidge) (邓传经), female, born in 27th Nov. 1885, a Brethren from Hillend, a dressmaker by trade, studied in Kensington Missionary College Adelaide, sailed for China with the CIM in 1913, worked in Suifu, Luchow and Ipin of Szechwan (四川) province, married an English colleague Mr. Horace Liversidge (雷海鸣, 19 Oct 1891-?). Served as teaching staff at the Chungking Theology Seminary.
The Liversidges had at least one daughter, Grace Mabel, who was interned during WWII at Weihsien camp as a Chefoo student.


Her brother Ernest Salisbury (1904-?) was a Brethren missionary to Congo (1930-1982).

John Oswald Sanders (孙德生), male, born in Invercargill on 17 October 1902, son of Alfred Sanders, an accountant, and his wife, Margaret Menzies Miller. The family belonged to the Brethren assembly in Invercargill and were also involved in the South Island committee of the CIM. Oswald experienced a childhood conversion in 1911, but
the turning point of his life came at a conference for spiritual awakening in Pounawea in 1921 when he dedicated himself to missionary service. Educated at Southland Boys' High School, and employed as a clerk by the law firm of Frederick Hall-Jones at the age of 15. While there studied extramurally towards a law degree. Declined a partnership in Hall-Jones's firm, deciding instead to prepare for missionary service in South America at the BTI in Auckland. His study ended abruptly in October 1924 when his father became ill. The family shifted to Dunedin, where Oswald was employed by John Wilkinson. Invited to serve as the field representative of the BTI in 1926, and then secretary and treasurer, moving his parents to Auckland. Succeeded C. J. Rolls as superintendent in 1931, the same year he married Edith Mary Dobson at the Baptist Tabernacle on 19 December 1931. After the death of the principal and founder, Joseph Kemp, in 1933, he took effective charge. Also founded a Christian bookshop, conducted weekly mission services, and supported and spoke regularly at the annual Easter convention at Ngaruawahia. Encouraged a wide variety of missionary organisations, and was instrumental in the formation of the United Maori Mission in 1936. Became the Australasian Home Director of the CIM from March 1946, working from Melbourne, and in 1954 was appointed General Director of the Mission, then renamed Overseas Missionary Fellowship, working from Singapore. After Edith’s death in 1966, he married Mary Christian Miller, a teacher, who was a widow and the daughter of Joseph Kemp, at the BTI in Henderson on 21 September 1968. Mary died in 1972. After his retirement to Auckland in 1969, he was constantly travelling and fulfilling speaking engagements. Became principal of the Christian Leaders’ Training College in Banz, New Guinea (1973-1974). He was made an OBE in 1980 and received an honorary doctorate of theology in 1992 at the 70th anniversary celebrations of his old institute (by then called the Bible College of New Zealand). Died, aged 90, in Auckland on 24 October that year, survived by the son of his first marriage. His funeral service was held at the Mount Albert Baptist Church.


1 See the footnote attached to the entry of Naomi Grey.

The Sanders has one son, Wilbur.

**Mrs. Edith M. Sanders**, female, married **J. O. Sanders** at the Baptist Tabernacle on 19 December 1931. Died in Melbourne in 1966. See husband’s entry for more details.

**William Arthur Saunders** (宋得时), male, born on 7th Nov. 1905 in Watford, England,

The Saunders had one son: David Arthur (6th Sep. 1940 at Chengtu).

Edith Ellen Searell (苏梅兰), female, born in 1860, came to New Zealand as a child, raised an Anglican, became a Methodist, applied from a Presbyterian church from Waipapa, Christchurch, a trained music teacher, her application to the CIM was initially turned down due to her age (35) and her condition of chronic asthma. Rev. George Nicholl arranged to send her to the Chefoo School on the basis of her teaching gifts. Sailed for China in Jun. 1895. Initially assigned to work in Chefoo school as music teacher. Relocated to Xiaoyi (孝义) of Shanxi from 14 Apr 1896. Quickly grasped the local dialect due to her trained ear as a musician. Killed in Boxer Rebellion on 30th June 1900 while kneeling in prayer with her colleague Emily Whitchurch (魏美例). The only martyred NZ missionary during Boxer Rebellion.

Olive Grace Searle (施滋莲), female, born on 23rd Sep. 1895, a Presbyterian from Christchurch, studied in technical college and Melbourne BTI, worked as a typist and bookkeeper, applied to the CIM from Melbourne, sailed for China in Nov. 1924, worked in Antung (安东，now Lianshui/涟水) of Kiangsu (江苏) and Kiang-tsing of Szechuan(四川). Took furlough in 1932. Had a thyroid operation at Shanghai in 1935. Transferred to Chefoo Secretarial Department in 1935. Left China in 1941. Possibly a sister of Bolivia Inland Mission missionary William Searle.

Melva Shortt (?), female, an Anglican from Auckland, sailed to China with the NZCMS/CEZMS in 1936, worked in educational capacity.

Dorothy May Smith (施崇贞), female, born on 2nd Apr. 1902 in Devonport, Plymouth, England, grew up in Christchurch, a member of Spreydon Baptist Church, worked as a draper’s assistant, graduated from NZBTI, sailed for China with the CIM in Nov. 1926. Resigned in 1928 due to ill health. Joined Bolivian Indian Mission in 1933 for five years to look after missionary children. Became matron of Children’s Home in Whangarei for seven years, and matron of Baptist teenage home in Auckland for four years. Lived for at least 81 years.

Emily Duthie Smith (later Mrs. Urquaht) (?), female, a Presbyterian from Port Chalmers, a trained nurse, sailed for China with the CSM in 1897. Married a Mr. Urquaht. See Mary E. Moore’s entry for more details.

Captain Louie Smith (史义?), female, born in England, a dressmaker by trade, sailed for China with the Salvation Army in 1916. Returned to NZ, pensioned in 1933 due to extreme deafness. Died in 1943.

Mary Ada Smith (later Mrs. Patchett) (夏佩兰), female, born on 14th Sep. 1904, grew up in Te Kopuru, Baptist Tabernacle, a tailoress by trade, took commercial course at technical college and NZBTI (1925-26), sailed for China with the CIM in Nov. 1928.

Rev. Thomas Howard Smith (?), male, based in Wellington, a member of Kent Terrace Congregational Church, sailed for China with the LMS in 1896. Worked in Beijing (北京), retired in 1923.

Marjorie Dewe Squires (later Mrs. Vines) (?), born in Bluff, Invercargill, on 24th Feb. 1911 as the second youngest of nine children of a family involved in meat export business. Female, Dux of Bluff Primary School, excelled in academic and sports (esp. basketball) at Southland Girls High School. Went nursing after leaving school. Sailed for China in Oct. 1935 as a Brethren missionary. Took language learning in Beijing, then worked in Weihaiwei (威海卫) of Shandong (山东). Married on 23rd Oct. 1940 to a Brisbane colleague Reginald A. Vines who had served in China from 1930. They reached Siushui (秀水), then in free China in 1941, after a few narrow escapes from the Japanese army. In 1944, they took the last plane to fly out of China from Guilin (桂林) to Calcutta before the city fell to the Japanese. After a furlough in Australia, returned to China at the end of the WWII. Ran a medical dispensary in a village. Under house arrest for two years. Left China via HK in 1950. Continued their missionary career in Malaya from 1951 and in Thailand (1953-1978). The couple were both shot and seriously injured by guerrillas in 1970 when driving in a Land Rover that looked like the one owned by a local official. Reginald died in Brisbane in Oct. 1991. Marjorie died in Brisbane on 15 Apr 2009.1

The Squires had three children: Geof and Dorralle (born between 1941 and 1944), Kevin (1948, Jiujiang/九江).

Beryl Stevens (范瑛琦), female, born in 1905?, a member of the St. Luke’s Anglican Church, Oamaru, initially enquired to the NZCMS in 1918 seeking information on training requirements, eventually sailed for China with the SPG in 1924. Appointed Adviser to the North China Diocesan Education Board in 1931. Interned at the Weihsien camp as POW during WWII.

Marjorie Gladestone Stewart (later Mrs. Duncan)(师瑞芬), female, born on 13th Nov. 1914/1917 in Duke Street, Invercargill, a daughter of a professional gardener and the seventh of eight children, a member of North Invercargill Baptist Church, a chemist assistant, graduated from BTI (1939-1940) sailed for China with the CIM in Sep 1940, worked in Shekichen and Kiangchang of Honan (河南), married a NZ colleague Francis A. Duncan at Loho on 13 Nov 1942 (or Chengtu on 28 Nov 1942). Died on 30th Sep. 2004. See husband’s entry for more details.

---

1 The same Obituary states two dates of Marjorie’s death: one on 15 Apr 2009, another 6 Apr 2009 (“Obituaries.” The Treasury III, no. 5 (June 2009), 30-31.)
Elizabeth Stinson (?), female, born in 1876, an Anglican from Christchurch, a trained nurse and midwife, sailed for China with the CEZMS in 1908, transferred to the NZCMS in 1914, worked in Sunki, Fujian (福建), and Erchaing (near Songxi). Took furlough in 1922-1923. Resigned in Jan 1925 in protest over theological modernism, further alienated herself from Anglicanism by being re-baptised in Aug 1925, and continued working in a Baptist field of the CIM.

Mrs. Dorothy Stocker (nee Bartrum), female, probably a widowed missionary wife, an Anglican living in Christchurch, worked in China with the SPG in the 1920s. Studied in NZBTI (1924-1925). Later worked in Bolivia.

Dr. Charles Frederick Strange, M.R.C.S., L.R.C.P., F.R.I.P.H (?), male, born in 1876 in England, an Anglican, went to India as a layman under the Poona Village Mission in 1899. Returned to England after three years to take medical training. He initially applied to the CMS for its China field, but transferred to the NZCMS due to lack of funds, came to NZ before sailing for China in 1910. Married Olive Harrison. Worked in the mission hospital (广济医院) in Hangchow (杭州). Became an army doctor of Royal Army Medical Corps (RAMC) during WWI, served in France for four years. His surgery skills had greatly improved through the war service. Returned to Hangchow in 1920, and resigned in 1923 to return to England for family reasons. Died unexpectedly in England in 1927. The Stranges had five children.


Reginald Sturt (司德), male, born on 27th Apr. 1881/1883? in Brighton, England, a third child in a family of seven sons and three daughters. Grew up as a nominal Christian and was converted at the age of 16, when he sensed a missionary call to China. Came to Australasia to recuperate from TB at the age of 20. Spent some weeks in Australia working with a road-making gang before moving to NZ. Worked in a farm (near Akaroa), and in office (Hamilton). Baptised himself in the Waikato River, left the

---

Anglican church and joined the Open Brethren. A foundation member of the first Open Brethren Assembly in Victoria Street, Hamilton. Applied to the CIM twice (to Australasian and London Councils) and turned down on both occasions due to health reason. Studied in Angas College and Livingstone Medical College, London in 1906. Finally sailed for China as a Brethren missionary on 11 Dec 1906 on the advice of CIM General Director Dixon Edward Hoste, with the support of Cholmondeley Hall, Archway Road, Highgate, London. Worked in Jehol etc.. Married an English colleague Gertrude Twite on 15th Apr. 1912, who died of child birth. Married her sister Margaret in August 1924, who died of postnatal problems. Married an English woman Marjory McCabe as his third wife on 31st. Oct. 1931. He himself died of pneumonia on 24th Dec. 1948. A Fellow of the Royal Geographical Society, recommended by Owen Lattimore, a well-known traveller and author. Complied a trilingual Grammar, Primer, and Dictionary in English, Chinese and Mongolian languages.

The Sturts had five surviving adult children: Mary (born in May 1913 in Inner Mongolia), Barbara (born in 1914 in Inner Mongolia, later Mrs. Claude Wavre, a missionary to India with Dohnavur Fellowship, one of her three children, Suzanne, had worked for World Vision for more than twenty years), Eleanor (born in 1916 in Nottingham, a Brethren missionary to China), Harry (born in 1921?), John (born in 1929, a missionary to Papua New Guinea). One of their sons, Charles, died at 19 month old of tonsillitis and pneumonia in 1920.


G. Eleanor Sturt (?), female, daughter of Reginald Sturt, born in 1916 in Nottingham, a Brethren from Auckland, a trained nurse at the Auckland Public Hospital, went to China in Jun. 1944. Studied language in Zhangjiakou (张家口), assisting a Swedish Mission. Then moved to Zhongwei (中卫), working as an itinerant medical and evangelistic worker. After left China in Feb. 1951, spent ten years as one of the matrons at Hebron High School and Lushington Boy’s School for missionary children. When settled in Sydney, she managed an Anglican retirement homes for many years. Killed in a car accident in 1984 on a highway in New South Wales.

Frederick William (Bill) Martin Taylor (戴乐天), L.L.B., male, born on 27th Jul. 1907, a member of Auckland Baptist Tabernacle, a qualified lawyer, worked for Jackson, Russell, Tunks & West Barristers & Solicitors for eight years, graduated from NZBTI (1931-32), sailed for China with the CIM in Sep 1932, worked in Tianshui (天水), Pinglo, Kinki, Lanzhou (兰州) in Kansu (甘肃) and Ningsia (宁夏)(1932-1940), married a NZ colleague Kathleen Maud Barry in Shanghai in 1934. Took furlough in 1940-1941. Later worked as Business Manager in Borden Memorial Hospital, Acting Assistant Superintendent in Kansu, and Assistant Secretary at Shanghai (1946-1951). Withdrew from China in 1951. Returned to law for 26 years. Remarried after Kathleen died in 1968. Retired in 1978. Died on 13th Jun 1995.
The Taylors had four children, Bryan (1936), Phyllis (1938 at Kaolan) (a Leprosy Mission doctor), Barry (1940 at Lanzhou), and Murray.

Harry Lees Taylor (戴乐安), L.L.B., male, born on 14th Apr. 1899, a Baptist from Auckland, a qualified lawyer, worked for Jackson, Russell, Tunks & West Barristers & Solicitors since 1915, studied in Melbourne BTI (1924), sailed for China with the CIM in Dec 1925, worked in Tsunyi (遵义), Kweiyang (贵阳) of Kweichow (贵州) and Tungchow, took furlough in 1933-1934 and 1941. Married a NZ colleague Maud King at Shanghai on 10th Sep 1935, left China on furlough in 1948. Died in 1973.
The Taylors had two children, David (1937 at Chaotung 昭通) and Eileen (1940 at Chaotung, missionary nurse to Pakistan with the BMMF).

S. G. Teakle, M.A., female, on the staff of the SPG’s North China mission, at least from 1923.


Dr. Bernice (Bunny) Alldred/Joyce1 Thompson (nee ?) (?), female, born in 1923, living in Dunedin, graduated as a physiotherapist in 1944, married a fellow New Zealander Heath Thompson in the same year, worked in Grey Hospital, Greymouth, joined the FAU and arrived in China in Mar 1946, worked in Guang Sheng Hospital in Changde (常德), Hunan (湖南). Designed and taught the first western-style physiotherapy course in the Institute of Hospital Technology (IHT) in Hankou (汉口). As late as late 1970s, one of her original students headed the physiotherapy school at the IHT. The Thompsons left China for Britain in 1948. Returned to NZ in 1954 and set up a private practice in thoracic physiotherapy in Christchurch. She pioneered on the treatment of respiratory illness. Author of two medical books: Asthma and Your Child and Better Breathing: Simple Exercises for the Relief of Asthma, Bronchitis and Emphysema (Christchurch, N.Z.: Pegasus, 1963); Better Breathing: Simple Exercises for the Relief of Asthma, Bronchitis and Emphysema (Christchurch, N.Z.: Pegasus, 1963);

---

1 Cameron records her middle name as Joyce (Go Any Where, Do Any Thing) while Tom Newnham records her middle name as Alldred (New Zealand Women in China, p.55).

Dr. Heath Thompson (?), male, born in 1920, son of Thurlo Thompson, the Anglican who founded the New Zealand Peace Pledge Union in 1938, a qualified doctor, graduated from Otago Medical School during WWII, worked as a house surgeon in Grey Hospital, Greymouth, married a fellow New Zealander Bearnice J. Thompson, joined the FAU and arrived in China in Mar 1946, worked in Guang Sheng Hospital in Changde (常徳), Hunan (湖南) before being seconded to the Union Hospital in Hankou (汉口) from Mar 1947. Left China for Britain in 1948 to take further training in surgery. Returned to NZ in 1954. Specialised in chest surgery, became Medical Superintendent of Princess Margaret Hospital.

Joseph (Joe) Thompson (唐震声), male, born on 9th Aug 1887, left school at the age of 12. Felt a call to work in China as a missionary at the age of 18 but didn’t take it seriously. Around the same year, started to teach the Chinese mission in Palmerston North. A Methodist by denomination and cycle motor mechanic by trade. Applied to the Auckland Council of the CIM in 1911. With “approval on principle” went to Adelaide to undertake training in Angas College. Engaged to another CIM candidate, Sarah Hardisty. Arrived in China on Nov 27th 1912. Assigned to the Ninghai (宁波) station of Zhejiang (浙江) in mid-1913 and married Sarah in Dec 1914. After their first furlough in 1922-1923, they were transferred to oversee the CIM congregations in the Tai-Zhou (台州) area, with the central stations being Huang-Yan (黄岩) and Wen-Ling (温岭). In the beginning of their ministry, there had been 35 chapels in the area, the number has increased over the 32 years of their residence to be over 70, with over 10000 baptised Christians and an average of 500 new believers each year. The Thomsons have also facilitated and witnessed the gradual process of devolution from the Mission to Chinese leadership. Their core responsibilities have shifted from itinerant evangelism to the training of Chinese church workers in single sex Bible Schools and chairing quarterly District Church Conference. Left China in 1944 for their third furlough en route India and Sydney, landing back in Wellington on February 14th 1945. Joe served short-term pastorates at Morrinsville Baptist Church and Merriland (now Onehunga-OneTree Hill) Baptist Church in Auckland, followed by several years’ of working as a Missioner of British Sailor Society in the Auckland branch. In 1947, the Thomsons bought a section in the then remote Northcote area and built a house there as the only means to have their own accommodation. There had been no church within walking distance back then so the couple started a Sunday School for the local children which eventually grew into a community fellowship, and became the Northcote Baptist Church. Joe died of coronary occlusion on June 24th 1959. In the 1990s, the Church started an English class for Chinese immigrants and this grew into one of the largest Chinese congregations in NZ. When members of the Northcote Chinese Church visited the area where the Thomsons had worked, they found the churches have had a phenomenal growth and much was attributed to the foundation they laid.
The Thompson’s first boy died in infancy but they had three sons subsequently: David (served with Egypt General Mission in Egypt Eritrea and Ethiopia), Gordon and Eric. David’s oldest son Paul served with New Zealand Bangladesh Mission Society and is now working for NZ Baptist missionary arm, Transzend; David’s younger son Stephen served with Sudan Interior Mission in Somalia.

Mary J. Thorp (?), female, born in 1888, grew up in Paeroa, member of St. Paul’s Anglican Church, graduated with a B.A., trained teacher, Grade II in theology, sailed for China with the NZCMS in Nov. 1917. Worked in Fuzhou (福州) and Chung-an (?), in educational capacity. Resigned for further university study in 1920.


James H. Todd (陶佐廷), male, born in 1864, member of Caversham Baptist, Dunedin, a bank clerk, took one year university course, studied in Moody BTI, sailed as a married couple with Amy Todd (nee Chambers) for China in March 1895 with the CIM, withdrew from the field due to ill health in 1899. Continued serving with the CIM as superintendent of the NZ Testing Home (1899) before held a position at the Moody Bible Institute (1901-), and then worked as CIM secretary in Australia (1906-1915). Died in 1947.

Mrs. Amy G. Todd (nee Chambers)(齐瑞珍), female, a Presbyterian, served as the YWCA secretary, sailed as a married couple with James H. Todd for China with the CIM in 1895. See husband’s entry for more details.

Nancy Ethelwyn Tucker (Mrs. Knight) (杜光华). female, born on 22nd Sept 1911. A member of Auckland Baptist Tabernacle, graduated from NZBTI (1930-1931), Sailed for China with the CIM in October 1932. Worked in Hwalung, Tsing, of Kansu (甘肃). Married a NZ colleague Howard Herbert Ellingham Knight by Eric Liddle at
Dr Harold Bertram Turbott (?) (M.B., Ch.B., D.P.H.), male, born on 5th. Aug. 1899 in Auckland, the son of Henry Turbott, a Pukekohe-born painter and carpenter and his wife, Alice Dilliscar, a native of Yorkshire. Dux of Hamilton High School and took a leading part in its sporting activities. Graduated MB, ChB from the University of Otago Medical School (1918-1923). Ordained as a medical missionary for Canton 28th. Aug.1923 shortly after married Eveline Lilian Arthur on 1st. Aug, half-way through a 10-month house surgery at Waikato Hospital. Sailed for Canton together on 7th. Sep. and arrived 11th. Oct. 1923. Became ill and was invalided home, leaving Hong Kong on 2nd. Sep. 1925. Medical advice was firm that he should not return to China. Resigned from foreign missions on 31st. Dec. 1925. Enrolled in the University of Otago’s Diploma in Public Health to prepare himself for a career with the Department of Health, combining his studies with a lectureship in bacteriology. Appointed the department’s assistant medical officer of health at Auckland in 1927, and the officer for Gisborne in 1928 with responsibility for the newly formed East Cape Health District. His study of tuberculosis in Maori brought him national and international acclaim. Awarded a Dorothy Temple Cross research travelling fellowship in 1933 by the Medical Research Council in Britain to further his work. His report, *Tuberculosis in the Maori, East Coast, New Zealand* (1935), was highly regarded by politicians and health professionals. Was given a three-year secondment as chief medical officer for Western Samoa in 1935. This posting, which coincided with Turbott’s separation from his wife, was cut short in 1936 when he was recalled to be medical officer of health at Hamilton for the South Auckland Health District (1936-1940). Staff shortages meant he also retained his East Cape responsibilities until 1938, the year he and his first wife divorced. On 19 December he married Robinetta Jamieson in Wellington. Regarded by many as the country’s leading expert on Maori health, Turbott was invited to contribute a chapter on health and social welfare to I. L. G. Sutherland’s *The Maori People Today* (1940). Appointed director of the Health Department’s Division of School Hygiene when Elizabeth Gunn retired in 1940, deputy director general of health in Wellington in 1947, and director general in 1959, the same year he was made an ISO, and his five-year tenure was marked by a major restructuring of the department. Throughout the early 1940s he contributed weekly “Advice on Health” columns to the *New Zealand Listener*, and was invited to give daily or weekly health talks on National Commercial Broadcasting Service from 1943, finished four decades later on 24th March 1984. This has gained him the fame of “The Radio Doctor” throughout NZ. Copies of these talks were sent to every public health nurse as background information for their own addresses to patients and community groups. Certain broadcasts were selected in print with the publication of *Radio Talks on Health* (1946), many were reprinted in the monthly Department of Health magazine, *Health*, from 1952. A reference guide to his talks was published in 1969 as *Guidelines to Health*. Received the Mobil Radio Award in 1987. The seeds of his interest in tropical medicine had been sown during his years in China, when he gained experience of malaria,
hookworm and leprosy. His 1930s work with Maori had also enhanced his reputation as an authority on Polynesian health. Appointed to the South Pacific Board of Health in 1949 and to the research council of the South Pacific Commission in 1956. Became a regular delegate to the World Health Assembly in the 1940s and 1950s after attending the inaugural World Health Organisation (WHO) meeting in 1946. Also elected president of WHO at its 13th Assembly in 1960 and was chairman of the organisation’s executive board in 1964–65. In 1960 A. W. Thompson, the Health Department’s director of clinical services, sued Turbott for libel over remarks made when Thompson applied for the position of director of public health. Although Thompson convinced a jury of the legitimacy of his case, Turbott escaped penalty by invoking the defence of absolute privilege. The repercussions were felt for many years, long after the protagonists had left the department. Turbott’s activities in retirement included being a member of the Wellington Hospital Board for 15 years, and of the Lower Hutt City Council for 12 years. Resigned both posts in 1983. Continued to enjoy gardening and horse-racing. Died in Lower Hutt on 16 March 1988.


**Janet L. Turner (later Mrs. Glanville),** female, born in 1873, a Methodist, Christchurch, sailed for China with the CIM in 1904, married a NZ colleague Samuel Glanville, retired from the field in 1941. See husband’s entry for more details.

**Arthur Wallbank (?),** male, born in 1921, a pacifist, an engineer, worked for New Zealand Forest Products. His appeal against military service was rejected in 1942 so had to spent war years in detention camp, joined the FSU for China from March 1947,
seconded to the Institute of Hospital Technology in Hankou (汉口) as a mechanical director from July. Returned to NZ in Dec. 1951. Worked in technical assistance projects in Southeast Asia with the United Nations. Retired to Auckland in 1980s.

**Bessie Webster** (闻保琦), female, born on 18th Oct. 1866. Her father was converted as a young adult in Scotland under the ministry of William Burns (missionary to China). A Presbyterian from Christchurch (Cust), a trained teacher, in charge of a government school in East Canterbury. A friend sent her an explanatory leaflet that was given to her by a member of the Rev. George C. Grubb’s mission in 1892. It was when she heard of the CIM for the first time. Sailed for China with the CIM in Oct. 1895, worked in Kienping and Chinkiang of Anhwei (安徽). Took furlough in 1936. Retired to NZ in 1941, continued to take deputation work in Auckland. Died on 14th Oct. 1955. Buried in the Cust Cemetery in Canterbury. Author of the following publications: “On the Air”: _A Twofold Testimony_ (Whitcombe & Tombs, undated), _Not by Might Nor by Power_ (London: CIM, 1928), _Consider the Lilies_ (Christchurch: CIM, undated). Her sister Kathleen Webster was the assistant matron of Ross Home in Dunedin. Her brother Rev. James Deans Webster (31st May 1871 at Riccarton, Christchurch – 15th Aug 1938) was a Presbyterian minister (1893-1931), who also had applied to the CIM in 1895 but was not accepted (http://www.presbyterian.org.nz/archives/Page208.htm).

**Betty White**, female, an Anglican, graduated with a M.P., Ph.C., accepted by the NZCMS, also a member of the CORSO, contracted for the IRC to work in China from 1947. Worked as a pharmacist at the Hangchow Hospital until 1949.

**Ruth H. Whitehead**, female, from Palmerston North, sailed for China as a Brethren missionary in Jan 1946, left in 1951, continued working in HK.

**Captain Eva Wilkinson (later Mrs. Ludbrook)** (?), female, served in China with the Salvation Army from 1917, married an English colleague Arthur Ludbrook in 1920 and served in North China. The couple was the last Territorial Commander in China. Left China in 1949. Possibly transferred to India.

**Rev Frank Howitt Wilkinson** (?), male, born on 5th. Dec. 1891 in Dunedin, graduated with a M.A. Spent a summer holiday touring Bible Classes in Taranaki; as a result he was appointed Young Men’s Bible Class Travelling Secretary in 1914. In 1915 he left for Egypt with the YMCA. Trained for active service later. War service with NZ Expeditionary Forces (1st. Feb. 1916 – 4th. Nov. 1919). After the Armistice he studied at New College Edinburgh (1919), then completed his Theology course in Dunedin (1919-20) on his return in order to prepare for missionary service in China. Ordained for missionary service with the CVM on 9th. Aug. 1920, married **Helen Margaret Cameron** on 11th. Aug. 1920, and sailed for China on 11th. Oct. 1920. After furlough (leave) in NZ during 1926, returned to China in Jan 1927. Due to political unrest in China and changes to the structure of the Mission effectively handing over control to the local Chinese Synod, he felt that he could not continue his work as before and returned to NZ in Aug 1927. Resigned from Mission work on 30th. Sep. 1927. Worked


Lillian May Williams (later Mrs. Conway) (?), female, born on 2nd May 1910, a Baptist, Auckland, NZBTI student, sailed for China with the CIM in Sep. 1934, assigned to Shekichen and Yehsien of Honan (河南). Took prison work at Chefoo. Married a NZ colleague H. Gordon Conway at Hankow on 23rd May 1936. See husband’s entry for more details.

Rev. Andrew Gordon Wilson (?), male, born in 1885 at Bendigo, Victoria, Australia, a Wesleyan Methodist. Entered missionary service as a qualified architect. Held the position of General Manager of the Medical Missionary Society’s Hospital in Canton from approx. 1908 until 1913 when the position ended. Married Mrs. Wilson (nee ?) in 1910 at Canton. After furlough in Australia (1913-14), he arrived back in Canton on 31st. Aug. 1914. Rev George H. McNeur recommended him to the CVM for the role of Architect and Building Supervisor to oversee the design, construction and maintenance of the new Mission Hospital, residences and School at Kong Chuen. His contract was extended twice and then he was put on the permanent staff in 1919 as Treasurer and Building Supervisor. Resigned on 31st. Dec. 1925 and returned to Australia with his wife and children. Assisted the PCNZ’s China Mission again in 1938 by drawing up plans for a Nurse’s Home at Kong Chuen. Trained for the Presbyterian Ministry in Australia (presumably at Ormond College, Melbourne), Ordained in Woomelang (Presb. Church of Victoria) in 1934. Died 2 January 1965 at Coburg. For further details of his life, see Keith D. Wilson, “Andrew Gordon Wilson in South China.” Unpublished manuscript, undated (copy held in PCNZ archive room, at Knox College).

Mrs. Wilson (?), female, married Rev. Andrew Gordon Wilson in 1910 at Canton, joined and resigned from the CVM with her husband. See husband’s entry for more details.


Myrie Wood (later Mrs. Beck) (吳惠慈), female, born on 8th Aug 1904, a Baptist, graduated from Technical college and NZBTI 1931, worked as stenographer and secretary for NZBTI for three years, sailed to China with the CIM in Sep 1931, successively worked in Chengku, Fohpingting, Shihchuan of Shensi, married a NZ colleague John W. Beck on 7th Oct 1936. Left China in 1949. Died on 20th Feb 1998. See husband’s entry for more details.

Her brother William Wood (1890?) was a missionary to South Africa with BIM (1928-1937).

Margaret Woods (吳慈), female, born in 1890 in England, grew up in Christchurch, an Anglican, a trained teacher, member of St. Savour’s Anglican Sydenham, studied in Marsden Missionary Training College Sydney, sailed to China in 1920 with NZCMS, worked at the Mary Vaughan High School in Hangchow. Took furlough in 1941. Interned at Longhua POW camp from Apr 1943. Taught religious knowledge and helped Sunday School in the camp. Withdrawn in 1951. Transferred to South India to do village evangelism from 1952. In charge of the station of Dummagudem in 1956. Built up the lace industry, working amongst Doyas (hill tribal people). Retired to NZ in 1963 due to health reason. Spent her last years working amongst the Maoris in the Putiki pastorate, Wanganui.

Frank (Francis) Worley (王廉), male, born in 1882 in Nelson, a trained teacher, worked as a primary teacher in Bainham School, member of Nelson Baptist, interested in becoming a professional electrical engineer, studied in Moody BTI in Chicago, sailed for China with the CIM in Feb 1911, served in Pingyang (平陽) and Wenzhou (溫州) of Chekiang (浙江). Had an operation for appendicitis in 1913. Married a NZ colleague Jessie Pettit. Took furlough in 1921 and 1928. 1st NZ member of the China Council. Died from bronchitis in Shanghai in 1932.


Married a NZ colleague Rev. Andrew Lindsay Miller. Lost their first daughter (Nancy) in July 1927. In Apr 1928 the serious condition of their only remaining daughter (Jean) constrained them to return to NZ urgently. Her husband accepted a call to Oreti in 1930. After the sudden death of her husband in 1944, she was employed by the Church Missions Committee as an Evangelist (working with Dr. George McNeur) to the local Dunedin Chinese. Retired and resigned as from 31 Jan 1951 after the arrival of the Rev Y. T. Fong who then took over all. Died on 10th May 1959.


Agnete Natalie (Netta) Yansen (殷信), female, born on 23rd Jul. 1892 in Tumulgum,


Florence Selina Harriet Young (永桂英), female, born on 10 Oct. 1856 in Motueka, the fifth child of Henry Young and his wife Catherine Anne Eccles, a Plymouth Brethren farmer family. Educated at her Southland home and spent two years in a boarding school in England, moved to Sydney Australia in 1878, and to her brothers’ (Arthur, Horace, Ernest) sugar plantation in Fairymead in 1882. Domestic and evangelist. She started holding prayer meetings for the families of the planters, which became the Young People’s Scripture Union, eventually attracted 4000 members. She founded the Queensland Kanaka Mission (QKM) and worked among the blackbirdsed Melanesians/Kanakas (1882-1891), Applied to the CIM on 29 Jan 1891, accepted on 30 Mar., sailed for China from Moreton Bay on 26 May, arrived in China on 3rd July. Stationed at Kao-yu, Kiangsu (江苏), Kwei-Ki (贵溪), Ho-keo (河口) of Kiangsi (江西). Left China for Australasia on 9 Nov 1894 on urgent private business as well as suffering from a nervous breakdown. Returned to China in Oct 1897, relocated to Anren (安仁), Kiangsi until 1900. Evacuated due to Boxer rebellion and arrived in Queensland on furlough in Oct 1900. Resigned from the CIM due to ill health, but the CIM held her on its books until 1921. In 1904-1905, the QKM had 19 paid missionaries, 118 unpaid native teachers and claimed 2150 conversions. She formed the Solomon Island branch of the QKM at the Katoomba Convention in 1904, beginning work in Malaita. This branch became the South Sea Evangelical Mission in 1907 to replace KQM as the Kanakas had been forced by the Australian Government to return to the Islands. She was related to the Deck family. Died on 28th May 1940 in Killara NSW, buried in Gore Hill cemetery with Presbyterian tradition. By then, the SSEM had recorded over 7900 conversions. Author of autobiography Pearls from the Pacific (1925). Her story is also recorded in: Janet and Geoff Benge, Florence Young: Mission Accomplished (YWAM Publishing, 2005).

Grace Young (杨恩临?), female, an Anglican from Auckland, a trained nurse, served in China with Australian Board of Missions (1929-?), worked in the Diocese of Shantung. Her sister Margaret Young was a missionary to India (1930-?).

Malcolm Henry Young (?), male, mission affiliation unknown, moved from Iltis Hydro in Tsingtao (青岛) to Weihsien Camp from Mar 1943 with his wife Mable J. Young. Released in Aug 1945 at the age of 71.

Mrs. Mabel Jessie Young (?), female, wife of M. H. Young, died on 26 Jan 1944 in the Camp, age 61.
Appendix II: List of New Zealand Missionaries and Their Children in POW Camps in mainland China and Hong Kong


- Elwyn G. Jansen (moved from LM compound to Canton Camp in May 1943)
- Anne Lilburne (moved from Kong Chuen to Canton Camp in Feb 1943)
- Dorothy Robertson (moved from Kong Chuen to Canton Camp in Feb 1943)
- Flora M. Wilson (moved from Kong Chuen to Canton Camp in Feb 1943)

- Rodney Oswald Metcalfe with wife Mrs. Kathleen Margaret Metcalfe
  - Christopher Hugh Metcalfe (son)
  - Rodney Michael Metcalfe (son)
  - Marjorie F. Metcalfe (daughter, born in camp in Oct 1944)
  - (in Stanley Camp Jan - 24 Dec 1942, moved to Chapei Camp in Mar 1943)

- Grace Mabel Liversidge (daughter of Horace and Mary Liversidge, moved from Temple Hill to Weihsien Camp in Aug 1943)

- Margaret Adams Russell (nee Reid) (moved to Yangchow B camp from Mar 1943, moved to Chapei Camp from Sep 1943)

- Eunice Laura Preece (in Great Western Road Camp from June 1943 to Apr 1945, moved to Yangtzeapo ? ? ?)

- Mrs. Gibb (Eleanor Grace Kendon) (in Lindoln Ave. Camp from Jun 1944 to Aug 1945)
  - Hannah L. Reid (in Lindoln Ave. Camp from Jun 1944 to Aug 1945)

- Herbert Davies (moved from Canton Camp to Lincoln Avenue Camp in Jun 1944) with wife Margaret Talbert Davies (in Stanley Camp Jan 1942- Jun 1944, then moved to Lincoln Avenue Camp)

- Violet T. Bargrove (from Hangchow to Lunghwa Camp in Apr 1943)
- Evelyn Placida Daniell (from St. Luke's Hospital to Lunghwa Camp in Apr 1943)
Dr. Phyllis Haddow (from Hangchow to Lunghwa Camp in Apr 1943)
Eva Ludbrook (nee Wilkinson) (in Lunghwa Camp from Apr 1943)
Juanita Helen May (in Lunghwa Camp from Mar 1943)
Stella Margaret Purchas (in Lunghwa Camp from Mar 1943)
Margaret Woods (from Hangchow to Lunghwa Camp in Apr 1943)

Arnolis Hayman with wife Rhoda Susan Hayman (moved to Yangchow camp from Mar-Sep 1943, moved to Pootung Camp in Sep 1943)
   Andrew Wilson Hayman (son)
   Frances Emma Hayman (daughter)
   Benjamin Arnolis Hayman (son)
(from Temple Hill to Weihsien from Aug 1943, moved to Pootung Camp in Feb 1944)

Nora Mary Edwards (in Stanley Camp from Jan 1942)
Dr. Edward Wilfrid Kirk (in Stanley Camp from Jan 1942)
Dr. John Alistair Loan (in Stanley Camp from Jan 1942)
Frances Gordon Ogilvie (in Stanley Camp from Jan 1942)

Clara Abbiss (moved from Hokien to Weihsien Camp in Nov 1943)
Rita E. Dobson (moved from Temple Hill to Weihsien Camp in Aug 1943, married Albert L. Rouse in camp in 1943)

Dr. Arthur Hallam Howie with wife Mary Haman Howie
   David T. Howie (son)
   Ivan P. Howie (son)
   Margaret R. Howie (daughter)
(moved from Temple Hill to Weihsien Camp in Aug 1943)

Rev. Sturt Crichton Willoughby McDouall with wife Jessie Kentish McDouall
   David Christopher McDouall (son)
(moved from Linsi to Weihsien camp in Mar 1943)

Marjorie Elizabeth Monaghan (moved from Peking to Weihsien camp in Mar 1943)

Kenneth John Patchett and Betty N. Patchett (children of Cyril J. Patchett, moved from Temple Hill to Weihsien Camp in Aug 1943)
   Kathleen Martha Porter (from Tsingtao to Weihsien Camp in Mar 1943)
   Beryl M. Steven (moved from Peking to Weihsien Camp from Mar 1943)

Malcolm Henry Young (moved from Iltis Hydro to Weihsien Camp from Mar 1943)
with wife Mrs. Mabel Jessie Young (moved from Iltis Hydro to Weihsien Camp from Mar 1943, died 26 Jan 1944)
Appendix III: Template of Interview Question

**Biographic information:**

Name: ____________________________________________________________
Gender: __________________________
Year of birth: __________________________ Place of birth: ______
Occupation: __________________________
Residence (City, State, Country): __________________________
Name of the China missionaries: __________________________
Relationship with the China missionary: __________________________
Date of interview (or electronic completion via e-mail): __________________________
Phone: __________________________ email: __________________________

**Question about your missionary parents:**

1. Why did your father/mother choose to go to China instead of any other countries?

2. What was your father/mother’s nationality? How did they meet and where did they get married?

3. How much do you think your parents knew about China before they went to China? And where did they get these impressions from? What were their information sources?

4. What do you think was your parents’ priority goal of their work in China? (please circle)
   a) To share the gospel with the Chinese and save the souls
   b) To save and improve Chinese people's life
   c) To facilitate the modernisation process of the Chinese society through education
   d) Other: please specify: __________________________

5. Do you have any other family members (including grandparents, uncles, aunts, cousins, nephews & nieces) who also worked as missionaries? If yes, please provide their names and their mission fields.

6. While in China, did your family as a whole wear Chinese dress? What about the foreign community in the region?
7. While in China, did your family as a whole eat Chinese food? What about the foreign community in the same region?

8. Do you think your parents both had a life-long interest in the China mission? If yes, how was the interest exhibited? (e.g. join a prayer group, be member of mission boards, reading regular China news)

9. What had they been doing after their China time?

10. Did your parents have anything to do with the home mission to the Chinese immigrants in NZ/Australia before or after you’ve been to China?

11. Any thought of joining other mission organisations after having left China?

Questions about Yourself:

12. Where were you born and raised?

13. Did you have a Chinese name? (would be ideal if you can write it in characters, if not, just the romanisation)

14. While you were in China, did the Chinese people around you know your national identity as New Zealanders? What do you think they thought you were?

15. How many domestic helpers did your household have?

16. How much do you remember your Chinese amah? Did your parents encourage you to play with Chinese kids?

17. Did you have any Chinese friends? Did you have any subsequent link with them?

18. How did you celebrate Christmas and birthday?

19. Did you feel safe among the Chinese? What was the style of the mission station you lived (e.g. compound styled, western, modern or Chinese)?

20. How do you think the father relate to the children? Did you feel free to talk about your feeling with your father?

21. Did you meet any westerners from other countries (English-speaking & non-English-speaking) (e.g. in Chefoo & in the Shanghai Headquarter)? How were they like to you? Have you kept contact with any of these
families?

22. What was the highlight of your time in China?

23. Can you recall any hardships (e.g. loneliness, death of people who were close to you, illness, finance)?

24. How would you describe yourself in terms of spirituality?
   a. Protestant (please specify denominational affiliation: ________________; if none, please specify: ________________)
   b. Other: please specify: ________________;

25. When and how did you receive the Christian faith? (answer only if it is relevant)

26. Have you engaged in any ministry or missionary work?

27. What were your parents’ aspirations for you as a child?

28. What was your own childhood aspiration?

29. Do you have any siblings? Please note down their names and dates of birth.

30. How would you describe your siblings’ spirituality (e.g. active/practicing Christian, unchurched Christian)? Has any of them engaged in missionary work?

31. Do you have any children? If yes, please provide their names and year of births. (if yes, go to the next question; if not, go to the one after)

32. How would you describe your children’s spirituality (e.g. active/practicing Christian, unchurched Christian)? Has any of them engaged in missionary work?

33. What impact did this China experience have on your life? Does it change the way you relate to the Chinese you meet?

34. If you had a choice, would you like to be born to and raised by missionary parents? Why?

35. What do you think the mission organisation could or should improve on (e.g. financial support, spiritual support)?
36. Have you visited the place where your parents worked and/or where you grow up? If yes, what do you think of it? What changes have you noticed? (year, places, duration, people etc.) If not, what would you be looking for if you could go?

37. What would you suggest me to look for or find out if I go there for field research?

38. How do you think of China today? What about Chinese church today?
Appendix IV: Short Biography of My Aunty (Yuan Xuefen 袁雪芬)

Note: This short biography note is a direct translation of an officially sanctioned Chinese version provided by the Shanghai Institute of Yue Opera (上海越剧院). Thanks to the Institute and my cousin Zheng Haiya for the permission to translate this biography. The act of translation is by no means implying that the researcher fully agrees with the tone and the opinion of this version. A reflective biography of my Aunt's life is beyond the scope of this thesis. The literary style of translation by the researcher is simply out of the respect of the original wording and her desire for the reader to have a taste of the official conclusion of her Aunt's life.

Yuan Xuefen (袁雪芬), female, honorary President of the Shanghai Yue Opera Academy. She was born on 26th Mar 1922 at the Dushan village (杜山) of Shengxian County (嵊县), Zhejiang Province (浙江). She began to take an apprenticeship in the opera trade with the “Four Season Spring” (Sijichun/四季春) Circus in July 1933, specialised in the role of gentlewoman (qingyi/青衣) and that of maiden (guimendan/闺门旦). She was also trained for the military roles styled in the Shaoxing Opera (绍班) and Hui Opera (徽剧). Her mentoring master was Bao Jinlong (鲍金龙), an actor in the male stream of the Yue Opera. On completion of her apprenticeship, she began her performing career with an earlier stage star, Wang Xinghua (王杏花), and was influenced by her style of singing and acting. She became the chief actress for the first time in 1936 on a performance trip to Hangzhou (杭州). In the autumn of the same year, she paid her first visit to Shanghai with the circus, and took a gramophone record, which was the very first record for the female stream of the Yue Opera. On her second trip to Shanghai in Feb 1938, she played with the actors of the Shaoxing Opera at “Spring-Sharing” Theatre (Tongchun Wutai/同春舞台). Since then, she took part in many theoretic activities in Shanghai. During the “Island Era” of Shanghai1, she worked in partnership for more than three years with Ma Zhanghua (马樟花), an actress who played the cross-gender role of young gentleman. Together they took initiative to modify the “A Grief Story of Liang and Zhu” (梁祝哀史). She put new opera stories such as “Lady Heng” (恒娘), became involved in singing through broadcasting channels, and thus extended the audience profile of the Yue Opera. The wide recognition of her performing art eventually brought her the honour of being called “the New Queen” of the

1 This era refers to the time between 12 Nov 1937 and 8 Dec 1941. It was the time when the international concessions and the French concession of Shanghai were encircled by the Japanese troops.
Yue Opera. In order to keep clear from the vicious social influences, she adopted a vegetarian’s lifestyle, refusing to perform in Tanghui (堂会)\(^1\), nor to bow to any Guofangniang (过房娘)\(^2\).

Under the influence of modern Spoken Drama, Yuan started a reform programme with the Yue Opera in Dalai Theatre (大来剧场) from Oct 1942. She employed professional playwrights, stage directors, stage design, stage overseer etc. out of her own salary, established an opera business department to manage stage performance. For the first time in the history, the Yue Opera began to have a standard script-writing and rehearsal system, complete scripts replaced the Live Performance system (mubiaozhi/幕表制)\(^3\), character-based costume design replaced the Chest system (yixiangzhi/衣箱制)\(^4\), three-dimensional scenery, the greasepaint makeup, lighting and sound effects replaced traditional forms of staging. She was first to establish a comprehensive institution of script-writing, directing, playing, sound and design in all Chinese Operas. In her art of acting, she integrated the realism of Spoken Drama and Movie in depicting characters and inner thoughts, with the romanticism of Kun Opera (昆曲) in its beautified singing and dancing. Such integration and creativity was original and influential. In Nov 1943, while performing the “The Imperial Concubine Xiangfei” (Xiangfei/香妃), she created the new Chidiao (尺调) tune with the help of her huqin (胡琴)-player colleague, Zhou Baocai (周宝财). This tune was subsequently adopted by other actresses and developed into the main tune of the Yue Opera, and was multiplied into many different styles of singing. Her tune of singing, known as the “Yuan style”, was unpretentious in melody, varied in pace, sincere in emotion, inherited and further developed by a generation of Yue actresses such as Qi Yaxian (戚雅仙), Zhang Yunxia (张云霞), Jin Caifeng (金采风), and Lu Ruiying (吕瑞英). She believed that operas should bring positive effects to society. During the Japanese occupation of Shanghai, she put the following patriotic and anti-feudalism shows in performance: “The Imperial Concubine Xiangfei”, “Red Powder and Metal Dagger-axe” (hongfenjinge/红粉金戈), “Mulan” (mulan congjun/木兰从军), “Dark Family” (hetian jiating/黑暗家庭), and “Wang Zhaojun” (王昭君). She also adopted Luxun (鲁迅)’s masterpiece, “Benediction” (Zhufu/祝福), into a Yue Opera, “Xianglin’s Widow” (祥林嫂) in May 1946. This show was positively reviewed as “the landmark of the New Yue Opera” by progressive personages in the circles of arts.

---

\(^1\) Tanghui refers to performing at private premises such as a mansion house or a guild hall, as contrary to a public premises such as a theatre house.

\(^2\) The idea of Guofangniang was similar to that of foster mothers. It was a custom for actresses of lower social status to find a foster mother of higher socio-economic status for protection and promotion.

\(^3\) Mubiaozhi was a prevalent staging method at the time. There was no set script, only a list of characters and a rough plot. The acting staff had to work out the details themselves on the stage, often without proper rehearsals.

\(^4\) Yixiangzhi refers to a traditional way of supplying costumes in which only one big set of clothing was needed to be rotated between all sorts of characters.
and journalism including Tianhan (田汉), Xu Guangping (许广平), Ouyang Shanzun (欧阳山尊), Baiyang (白杨), Hufeng (胡风), Meiduo (梅朵), and Tian Zhongluo (田钟洛). This show was filmed in 1948. With the support of the underground organisation of the Chinese Communist Party, she fought with the Nationalist authority and was under many persecutions from “reactionary evils” in the joint charity performance of “Loving Our Mountains and Rivers” (shanhelian/山河恋) in Aug 1947 and the incident of the death of a fellow actress, Xiao Dangui (筱丹桂) in Oct of the same year. In July 1949, she took part in the study of “first local opera study class” organised by the Military Administration Bureau of Art and Literature, and was appointed a team leader of the Acting Section. September of the same year, she participated the first People’s Political Negotiation Conference with Mei Lanfang (梅兰芳), Zhou Xinfang (周信芳), and Cheng Yanqiu (程砚秋) as the specially invited representatives from the Opera Troupe, and was subsequently present in the founding ceremony of the PRC on 1st Oct. In the beginning of 1950, while filmed in a 16mm coloured opera movie, “Tree of Lovesickness” (Xiangsishu/相思树), she created the new “Masculine Tune” (nandiao/男调). In April of the same year, she was appointed the leader of East China Yue Opera Experimental Troupe (华东越剧实验剧团), the first state-owned Troupe in Shanghai. She became the Vice President of the East China Institute of Opera Study (华东戏曲研究院) when it was founded in Mar 1951, and held simultaneous presidency of the Yue Opera Experimental Troupe (越剧实验剧团).

She won an honorary reward in the First National Music-drama Performance Festival (第一届全国戏曲观摩演出大会) in 1952. She and Fan Ruijuan (范瑞娟) filmed the large-scale coloured opera film, “The Butterfly Lovers” (梁山伯与祝英台) in 1953, the very first since the founding of the PRC. This film won the “music award” in an international film festival. In the same year, she successfully played the part of a gentlewoman Cui Yingying (崔莺莺) in “Romance of the West Bower” (西厢记), based on Wang Shipu (王实甫)'s original work. She became a member of the Communist Party in 1954. Appointed the President of the Shanghai Yue Opera Academy when it was founded in 1955. In the same year, she visited East Germany and the Soviet Union as part of the China Yue Opera Group led by Xu Guangping. Visited and performed in 1960 and 1961 in Hong Kong and North Korea. Created the Minus-B Tune (降 B 调) with the erhu (二胡)-player Zhou Bailing (周柏龄) in 1965 while performing “Village of Blazing Coconut Trees” (huoyecun/火椰村). She was cruelly persecuted during the Cultural Revolution. She visited West Germany with the Chinese Musician Group in Jan 1977. In 1978, “Xianglin’s Widow”, in which she was the chief actress, was filmed as wide-screen coloured movie.

---

1 This was after the liberation of Shanghai so she was participating in activities organised by the Communist regime.
2 All three were famous actors of the Peking Opera.
At the end of 1978, she was appointed as the President of the Shanghai Yue Opera Academy again, in charge and organised the writing and performing of a series of new plays as well as training younger generations of actors and actresses. She visited Japan as part of the National People’s Representative group in 1979. She retreated to the backline and become the Honorary President of the Academy in 1985. In 1986, she took part of the 15th Autumn Festival in Paris with the performing group of the Shanghai Yue Opera Academy as an “artistic director”, and was awarded the medal of honour and the honorary citizen in Isère, Lyon Villeurbanne, and Le Havre. She led a performing group to the USA in the Summer of 1989.

Comrade Yuan Xuefen was a representative of the 1st, 2nd, 3rd, 5th, 6th, 7th and 8th National People’s Congress (全国人大), a member of the standing committee of the 5th, 6th and 7th National People’s Congress (全国人大常委会), Vice-President of the China Theatre Association (中国戏剧家协会), Vice-President of the Shanghai Federation of Literary and Art Association (上海市文学艺术界联合会), honorary committee member of Chinese Literature Association (中国文联), Vice-President of the Shanghai People’s Association for Friendship with Foreign Countries (上海市人民对外友好协会). Since 1995 she had been the Judging Panel’s Director of the Shanghai White Magnolia Stage Performance Award (上海白玉兰戏剧表演艺术奖). She received a golden medal from the Prime Minister of Burma U Nu in 1955, awarded the “excellent film 1949-1955” by the Department of Culture in 1956, and the first “Gold gramophone record” by the Chinese Gramophone Record Head Office in 1989. In Dec 2003, she received “the Award of Performing Art Achievements”, the national-level Lifetime Achievement Award by the Department of Culture. She received Shanghai “Eighth March Red Flag Medal of Honour for Women” (三八红旗荣誉奖章) in Apr 2005, the first Shanghai White Magnolia Drama and Opera Performing Art Lifetime Achievement Award in Apr 2006, the first Chinese Opera and Drama Lifetime Achievement Award by the China Federation of Literary and Art Association and China Theatre Association in Oct 2009. Since Jul 1991, she had been receiving special government stipend for experts with outstanding contributions from the State Council. In Feb 2008, she was given the honour of “National Intangible Cultural Heritage-Representative Inheritor of the Yue Opera” by the Culture Department of China.
Bibliography

Primary Sources
Archives
PCNZ Archive, Knox College, Dunedin
NZCMS Archive, John Kinder Library, St. John’s Theological College, Auckland
OMF Archives:
  - IHQ, Singapore;
  - New Zealand National Office, Auckland;
  - Victoria State Office, Melbourne School of Theology.

Abbreviations for Archives
OMR: Overseas Missions Records,
FMC: Foreign Missions Committee
OMC: Overseas Missions Committee
MSIC: Mission Secretary's Inward Correspondence
MSP: Missionary Secretary’s Papers
MCI&OC: Missions Committee Inwards and Outwards Correspondence
CVM: Canton Village Mission
SCM: South China Mission
NZABM: New Zealand Anglican Board of Missions

Unpublished Correspondence and Manuscripts
Ella Anderson’s (nee Salisbury) (CIM) personal letter, 1930-1935. Held by the researcher.

Bournemouth Conference Report, CIM, 1951.


Contemporary Publications and Institutional Records:
China’s Millions (Australasian edition), 1893-1950, Melbourne: CIM.
Outlook, PCNZ, 1890-1950.
The Reaper (NZABM), 1923-1940.
The Reaper (NZBTI), 1923-1948.
Other sporadic editions: Evangelist, Church Gazette, News of Female Missions.
Constitution of the Canton Village Mission of the Presbyterian Church of New Zealand, 1910.

Secondary Sources

Unpublished Manuscripts and Theses


Lineham, Peter J. “Missionary Motivation in New Zealand,” a paper for the Currents in World Christianity Project given at the University of Cambridge, 18 May 2000 and to the Aotearoa New Zealand Association for Mission Studies, Auckland, 28 November 2000.


Wilson, Keith D. “Andrew Gordon Wilson in South China.” Unpublished manuscript,
undated.


**Publications**


Campbell, Flann. “Birth Control and the Christian Churches,” *Population Studies* 14,
no. 2 (1960): 131-147.


Census of New Zealand, 1851, 1871, 1921, 2006.


Gaitskell, Deborah. “Rethinking Gender Roles: The Field Experience of Women


—— “jishen shilin chuangxianqu” 跛身史林闯险区 [Braving the Journey in the


“Poll Tax on Chinese Immigrants Abolished,” URL:


Records of General Conference of the Protestant Missionaries in China held at Shanghai, May 7-20, 1890. Shanghai: American Presbyterian Mission Press, 1890.


Scott, George. In Whose Hands. CIM, 1946.


Williamson, Mable. “*Have We No Rights?” A Frank Discussion on the Rights of Missionaries*. Chicago: Moody Press, 1957.


