E-Learning – Effective, Engaging, Entertaining
(and Earthquake proof)

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of

Master of Education
(Adult Education)

At Massey University, Extramural,
New Zealand
Alice Cruickshank
2013
Abstract

This study is concerned with what makes e-learning effective and engaging as a workplace professional development tool. Using the example of a workplace e-learning programme in Christchurch City Libraries, the study considers the whole process from development of the programme to delivery and evaluation and asks what factors impact upon effectiveness and engagement in a workplace e-learning programme. A number of factors including the organisational culture and workplace environment, the development process, the learning environment, learner support, the e-learning environment and specific e-learning activities were examined.

The study itself took place over a unique period of time as Christchurch recovered from several devastating earthquakes. The impact of the disaster and recovery process on the programme and the effectiveness of e-learning in a post-disaster environment is also explored.

This study uses a Participatory Action Research approach with data collected and analysed from a variety of sources including interviews with programme developers, pre- and post-course questionnaires, online activity tracking tools, forum posts, trainee learning logs, the researcher's reflective journal, and a participant focus group.

The findings from the study suggest a number of elements that contribute to effective and engaging e-learning programmes in the workplace: a) workplace support of the programme by team leaders is essential but the trainee also needs to be in a position to negotiate for the actual time and resources required. b) Developing an online programme requires a different approach and skill set than designing and delivering face-to-face training and may best be managed as a product development project. c) The attractiveness and ease of navigation are important factors for trainees' engagement with e-learning. d) Short, locally made videos of real-life workplace scenarios proved to both effective and engaging with
trainees able to transfer skills to the workplace. e) A wide variety of e-learning activities promoted interest and engagement among learners. f) Consideration needs to be given to how workplace e-learning is evaluated to ensure skill transfer to the workplace is taking place.
Acknowledgements

This thesis would not have been possible without the support, guidance and assistance of several key people.

I am grateful to Gloria Slater and Gordon Suddaby, my initial supervisors, for helping me plan and organise my thoughts and ideas into a viable research project. I am also grateful to Dr. Spencer Lilley for becoming my new supervisor at the last minute and guiding me through the writing up process.

I am thankful to my colleagues at Christchurch City Libraries, many of whom appear under pseudonyms in this thesis, for their support, inspiration and willingness to try new ideas. I am especially thankful to my manager, Pat Street, and library manager, Carolyn Robertson who supported and encouraged this research.

Above all, I would like to thank my husband, Rob, and daughters Rosie and Daisy, who have supported me throughout this journey. They have selflessly provided encouragement, patience and understanding without which this thesis would not be complete.
# Table of Contents

ABSTRACT II  
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS IV  
TABLE OF CONTENTS V  
TABLE OF FIGURES VIII  
TABLE OF TABLES VIII  

1 INTRODUCTION 1  
1.1 RATIONALE FOR THE STUDY 1  
1.2 DEFINITION OF TERMS 1  
  1.2.1 Defining Learning, Training and Education 2  
  1.2.2 Defining Learner, Participant, Student and Trainee 2  
  1.2.3 Defining E-Learning 3  
  1.2.4 Defining Effectiveness, Transference and Success 3  
1.3 BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY 4  
1.4 CHOOSING THE TOPIC 5  
1.5 RESEARCH AIM 6  
1.6 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY 7  
1.7 OVERVIEW OF THE THESIS 8  

2 LITERATURE REVIEW 10  
2.1 E-LEARNING FOR PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT VERSUS E-LEARNING FOR EDUCATION 10  
2.2 RESEARCHING E-LEARNING 18  
2.3 LEARNING THEORIES AND E-LEARNING 21  
2.4 INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN FOR E-LEARNING 23  
2.5 E-LEARNING AND ENGAGEMENT 24  
2.6 E-LEARNING AND LIBRARIES 27  
2.7 LEARNING FROM THE LITERATURE 33  

3 METHODOLOGY AND METHODS 34  
3.1 RESEARCH SETTING 34  
  3.1.1 Changes to the organisation as a result of the 2010/2011 earthquakes 39  
  3.1.2 Continuous Change 42  
  3.1.3 Professional Development at Christchurch City Libraries 43  
  3.1.4 Rationale for developing a new e-learning programme 45  
  3.1.5 New Directions – New Learning 49
3.2 METHODOLOGY

3.3 OUTLINE OF THE METHOD

3.4 DESCRIPTION OF THE SOURCES OF DATA

3.5 CONSIDERATION OF THE LEVELS OF ANALYSIS

3.6 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

4 DEVELOPING THE PROGRAMME

4.1 INVESTIGATE THE ISSUE

4.1.1 Self Lens

4.1.2 The Learner Lens

4.1.3 The Collegial Lens

4.2 ANALYSING THE BACKGROUND DATA

4.2.1 Organisational commitment

4.2.2 Programme Structure and Support

4.2.3 Programme Content and Design

4.2.4 Conclusions of the analysis of the background data

4.3 PLANNING THE ACTION

4.3.1 Getting Together

4.3.2 Creating a Structure

4.3.3 Working together

4.3.4 Creating the course

4.3.5 Trialling the Action

4.4 CONCLUSION OF DEVELOPING THE PROGRAMME

5 RESULTS

5.1 MAIN THEMES OF THE EVALUATION

5.1.1 The Effect of the Environment on learning

5.1.2 Is E-learning Effective?

5.1.3 Transference to the workplace (Helping Customers)

5.1.4 Is E-learning Engaging?

5.2 INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN FOR E-LEARNING

5.2.1 The Forum

5.2.2 Videos

5.2.3 Quizzes and Lessons

5.2.4 Check boxes

5.3 SUPPORTING E-LEARNERS

5.3.1 Tutor Support

5.3.2 Buddies
5.4 The Future of E-Learning in Christchurch City Libraries | 165
5.5 Summary of the Results | 169

6 Analysis and Conclusions | 171

6.1 Programme Development Using the Participatory Action Research Process | 172
6.2 Creating a Supportive Workplace Environment | 175
6.3 An Effective and Engaging E-Learning Environment
   6.3.1 Selecting effective and engaging e-learning activities (objects) | 177
   6.3.2 Learner Discussion Groups (Forums) | 179
   6.3.3 Transferring Online Learning into Workplace Practices – How is Success Measured? | 180
6.4 Earthquake-Proof | 183
6.5 Relating the Research to Previous Studies and the Wider Context
   6.5.1 Workplace Support | 189
   6.5.2 Activities for E-learning | 190
   6.5.3 Content for E-learning | 191
   6.5.4 Evaluating E-learning in the Workplace | 192
6.6 Limitations | 193
6.7 Personal Reflections | 193
6.8 Future | 196

References | 199

Appendices | 206

Appendix A - Letter Requesting Access to Christchurch City Library for Education Research Project | 207
Appendix B - Information Sheet for Participants Taking Part in Interviews | 209
Appendix C - Information Sheet for Participants Taking Part in a Focus Group | 212
Appendix D - Email Invitation for Participants to Take Part in the Study | 215
Appendix E - Participant Consent Form | 217
Appendix F - Transcriber’s Confidentiality Agreement | 218
Appendix G - Interview Schedule for Members of the Participatory Action Research Group | 219
Appendix H - Online Pre Course Survey | 220
Appendix I - Online Post Course Survey | 222
Appendix J - Focus Group Schedule for Participants | 227
Appendix K - Sample Learning Log Page | 228

Page vii
Table of Figures

FIGURE 3-1 MATRIX STRUCTURE AT CHRISTCHURCH CITY LIBRARIES ................................................................. 36
FIGURE 3-2 CHART SHOWING LIBRARY SPACE AVAILABLE FOR USE AS A RESULT OF LIBRARY CLOSURES ...................... 40
FIGURE 3-3 THE CRITICAL REFLECTION PROCESS ADAPTED FROM BROOKFIELD (1995) P. 30 ............................... 54
FIGURE 3-4 DIFFERENT LEVELS OF CONSIDERATION THAT IMPACT ON THE OUTCOME OF AN E-LEARNING PROGRAMME ...... 60
FIGURE 4-1: HISTOGRAM TO SHOW THE SUPPORT FOR DIFFERENT ALTERNATIVE TRAINING METHODS .................... 77
FIGURE 4-2 WORKPLACE LEARNING - THE OVERLAP BETWEEN EDUCATION AND TRAINING .......................... 100
FIGURE 4-3 VISUALLY ORGANISING THE PROGRAMME STRUCTURE ..................................................................... 114

Table of Tables

TABLE 4-1 OVERVIEW OF INTERVIEW PARTICIPANTS .......................................................................................... 83
TABLE 4-2 OVERVIEW OF TRAINEES ............................................................................................................. 120
TABLE 5-1 SUMMARY OF TRACKING LOG DATA SHOWING TIME SPENT ON THE PROGRAMME ............................. 126
TABLE 5-2 SUMMARY OF WHEN TRAINEES DID E-LEARNING ........................................................................ 127
TABLE 5-3 SUMMARY OF WHERE TRAINEES DID E-LEARNING ........................................................................ 127
TABLE 5-4 SUMMARY OF TRAINEES OWN LEARNING OBJECTIVES ................................................................. 134
TABLE 5-5 COMPARISON OF CONFIDENCE LEVELS BEFORE AND AFTER TRAINING .................................................. 140
TABLE 5-6 SUMMARY OF HOW TRAINEES THOUGHT E-LEARNING COULD BE MADE INTERESTING PRIOR TO THE COURSE ...... 144
TABLE 5-7 FACTORS THAT TRAINEES THOUGHT WOULD IMPROVE ENGAGEMENT WITH THE PROGRAMME ............. 148
TABLE 5-8 TRAINEES RATING OF THE EFFECTIVENESS OF DIFFERENT ACTIVITIES ................................................. 149
TABLE 5-9 TRAINEES RATING OF THE ENGAGEMENT OF DIFFERENT ACTIVITIES ................................................... 150
TABLE 5-10 SUMMARY OF TRAINEES RESPONSES TO HOW HAPPY THEY WOULD BE TO TAKE AN ONLINE COURSE IN THE FUTURE .............................................................................................................. 166