Gender, Security, and Development: A Bougainville case study

A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Philosophy in Development Studies at Massey University, Palmerston North

Sharon Cuddy

2012
Abstract

Research on contemporary alignments of development and security agendas has paid limited attention to how gender relations, roles and issues of equality are constructed and experienced within post-conflict contexts. While practices like gender mainstreaming have been committed to in principle and in policy by organisations and countries heavily involved in development and security interventions, more research is required into actual practices and outcomes.

This thesis utilises a case study, the Bougainville Community Policing Project, to examine the efficacy of gender approaches practiced within a merged security-development intervention. The research highlights how increased participation of women within such interventions, while important for meeting practical gender needs, is not in itself enough to enable more strategic gender needs to be met. In seeking to understand more fully the gendered impacts of such interventions on communities the prioritising of particular development issues over others, including gender equality, becomes visible.
Acknowledgements

To the Peace and Education Disarmament Trust, for making my fieldwork in Bougainville possible through a generous project grant. To the New Zealand Police for supporting my research request and providing access to personnel and information. To the New Zealand Police in Bougainville for their assistance, hospitality and willingness to share their experiences. To The National Research Institute in Port Moresby, for supporting my application for a research visa for Papua New Guinea.

To everyone in Bougainville who participated in this research and shared their stories and experiences with me, a stranger from far away, with such openness and warmth – thank you.

To my supervisors, Regina Scheyvens and Beth Greener, thank you for the support and direction you have given me over the last year. Finally, to Guillaume, for your unwavering encouragement and support in this endeavour and others.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................ iii  
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................................... iv  
List of figures and tables ..................................................................................................... vii  
Abbreviations ........................................................................................................................ viii  

1. Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 1  
   1.1 Research questions ....................................................................................................... 5  
   1.2 Thesis structure .......................................................................................................... 6  
   1.3 Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 8  

2. The merging of development and security ................................................................. 10  
   2.1 Understandings of development ............................................................................... 10  
   2.2 Understandings of security ....................................................................................... 12  
      2.2.1 ‘Failing states’ and the ‘new wars’ .................................................................... 13  
      2.2.2 The ‘arc of instability’ ...................................................................................... 15  
   2.3 The merging of development and security ............................................................... 18  
   2.4 Security sector reform and international policing ................................................... 20  
      2.4.1 SSR in Melanesia ........................................................................................... 21  
   2.5 Anti-politics ............................................................................................................... 24  
   2.6 Conclusion ................................................................................................................ 26  

3. Gender, development and security: Theories and practices ........................................... 27  
   3.1 Introduction: Gender, development and security .................................................... 28  
   3.2 Feminist criticisms of International Relations ......................................................... 30  
   3.3 Gendered discourse ................................................................................................. 32  
   3.4 Security Council Resolution 1325 ........................................................................... 34  
   3.5 Gender mainstreaming: participation versus transformation .................................. 37  
   3.6 Practical and strategic gender needs ....................................................................... 45  
   3.7 Empowerment ......................................................................................................... 46  
   3.8 Conclusion .............................................................................................................. 48  

4. Methodology .................................................................................................................. 50  
   4.1 The fieldwork ............................................................................................................ 50  
      4.1.1 Ethical considerations ....................................................................................... 53  
      4.1.2 The participants .............................................................................................. 54  
   4.2 Theoretical influences ............................................................................................. 55  
   4.3 Making myself visible .............................................................................................. 57  
   4.3 Conclusion .............................................................................................................. 59  

5. Bougainville: Conflict, peace and justice ................................................................. 60  
   5.1 The conflict and the peace process ........................................................................... 60  
   5.2 The role of women in conflict and peace ................................................................. 62  
   5.3 Kastom and restorative justice ............................................................................... 66  
   5.4 The Bougainville Community Policing Project ...................................................... 68  
   5.5 Conclusion ............................................................................................................... 70
6. Key findings: The gendered effects of current strategies ................. 72
   6.1 Practical gender needs:
      Female CAPs addressing women’s practical security needs .................. 72
      6.1.1 Female CAPs primarily dealing with ‘women’s issues’ ................. 74
      6.1.2 Examining a specific security-development issue: Domestic violence .... 80
      6.1.3 Access and control ........................................................................ 84
   6.2 Empowerment and transformative change ........................................ 87
      6.2.1 Masculinities ................................................................................ 95
   6.3 Externally driven interventions and local law and order practices ......... 96
   6.4 Conclusion .......................................................................................... 107

7. Conclusion ............................................................................................ 109
   7.1 Research questions and answers.......................................................... 109
      7.1.1 Research Question One ................................................................. 109
      7.1.2 Research Question Two ............................................................... 112
      7.1.3 Research Question Three ............................................................. 113
   7.2 Practical applications for this research ............................................... 115
   7.3 Areas for further study ......................................................................... 116
   7.4 Concluding thoughts ......................................................................... 117

References ............................................................................................... 119
Appendices ............................................................................................... 135
Appendix 1: Participant Information Sheet .................................................. 135
Appendix 2: Responsibilities of CAPs ......................................................... 140
Appendix 3: The Bougainville Constitution ................................................. 142
List of figures and tables

Figure 1: Map of Bougainville ................................................................. 51
Table 1: Participant categories............................................................... 55
Abbreviations

ABG  Autonomous Bougainville Government
AROB  Autonomous Region of Bougainville
BCL  Bougainville Copper Limited
BCPP  Bougainville Community Policing Project
BPS  Bougainville Police Service
BRA  Bougainville Republican Army
BRF  Bougainville Resistance Forces
CAP  Community Auxiliary Police
CEDAW  The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CPE  Complex Political Emergency
DDR  Disarmament, Demobilisation and Reintegration
GBV  Gender Based Violence
MDGs  Millennium Development Goals
NGO  Non-Government Organisation
NZPOL  New Zealand Police
ODA  Official Development Assistance
PGK  Papua New Guinean Kina
PMG  Peace Monitoring Group
PNGDF  Papua New Guinea Defence Force
RAMSI  Regional Assistance Mission to Solomon Islands
RPNGC  Royal Papua New Guinea Constabulary
SCR1325  Security Council Resolution 1325
SSR  Security Sector Reform
TMG  Truce Monitoring Group
UN  United Nations
UNDP  United Nations Development Programme
UNOMB  United Nations Observer Mission Bougainville