Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
The Effects of Teaching Analogy-based Reading and Spelling Strategies to Children in Years Three and Four

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Educational Psychology

Massey University

Palmerston North, New Zealand

Angela Evans

2013
Abstract

The dominant approach to teaching reading and spelling in New Zealand schools is grounded in whole-language theory. This approach to literacy instruction disadvantages children with weak alphabet knowledge and phonological skills. Deficits in these crucial skills are the most commonly implicated causes of persistent reading difficulties. Left unremediated, problems with initial mastery of the essential skills underpinning reading and spelling are likely to result in long term difficulties. In fact, research indicates that interventions for children who are still struggling to attain fundamental reading skills in year five are more time-consuming, more expensive, and less likely to be successful than those implemented at an earlier stage.

The current study was a non-randomised, pretest-intervention-posttest design with one control group. The aim of the study was to implement and evaluate the effects of an analogy strategy-based intervention programme, based on the Benchmark Word Detectives Programme, which taught phonological skills and analogy strategies for reading and spelling. The intervention involved a group of year three and four children (n = 15) with reading and spelling difficulties. Children were assessed in a range of literacy related measures before and after the intervention programme. Lessons were 30-45 minutes in duration, four times a week, for eight weeks (a total of 32 lessons). The efficacy of the programme in accelerating children’s progress in reading and spelling related skills, relative to a non-intervention control group, was evaluated.

The key findings from the present study were that an eight-week small-group intervention focusing on analogy strategies significantly improved children’s letter-sound knowledge, phonemic awareness, decoding, and spelling skills compared to that of a control group. These findings suggest that a modified version of the Benchmark Word Detectives Programme can be effective in improving the skills of New Zealand children who struggle with reading and spelling.
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisors Keith Greaney and Alison Arrow for their ever-patient guidance and advice throughout this journey. Conducting this research has taught me more than I could have imagined, and I am grateful for the contribution of their time and expertise.

I wish to express my gratitude to the Principal and teachers at the school that participated in this study for their warm welcome and support of my research project. I would also like to extend a special thanks to the children who participated for their enthusiasm, and their parents for giving consent for me to work with their children.

Finally, I would like to thank my family for their unwavering support.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ...................................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgements .............................................................................................................. iv
Table of Contents ............................................................................................................. v
List of Tables ................................................................................................................ ............ vii
List of Figures ............................................................................................................... ................... viii
Chapter 1: Introduction ....................................................................................................... .............. 1
Chapter 2. Literature Review .................................................................................................. ........... 5
  Theories of reading and spelling .............................................................................................. ...... 6
    Reading ....................................................................................................................... .............. 6
      Logographic phase (visual cue reading or pre-alphabetic) ...................................................... 8
      Phonetic cue phase (partial alphabetic) .................................................................................. 8
    Full alphabetic phase ......................................................................................................... .... 9
  Spelling...................................................................................................................... .............. 10
  Causes of literacy difficulties............................................................................................... ......... 12
  The importance of phonemic awareness ..................................................................................... 13
  The Role of Explicit Word-Level Instruction .................................................................................. 15
  Onset-rime units, Rhymes, and Analogies .................................................................................... 17
  Orthographic Analogies in Reading and Spelling .......................................................................... 20
  Intervention Programmes ............................................................................................................ 22
    Summary of Intervention Research .......................................................................................... 32
  Benchmark Programme ........................................................................................................... .... 32
  Learning to read in New Zealand ............................................................................................... .. 34
    A Balanced Approach? .......................................................................................................... ... 37
  The current study ............................................................................................................. ........... 38
  Research Aims ..................................................................................................................... ............. 40
  Hypotheses..................................................................................................................... ............. 40
Chapter 3: Methodology......................................................................................................... ......... 41
  Research Design ............................................................................................................... ........... 41
  Setting and Participants ....................................................................................................... ...... 42
    Setting ....................................................................................................................... .............. 42
    Participants .................................................................................................................. ........... 42
  Materials and Procedure ....................................................................................................... ...... 43
    Pre and Post Testing .......................................................................................................... ...... 43
List of Tables

Table 1. Mean age and year of school as a function of group

Table 2. Instructional activities as a function of intervention week

Table 3. Means and standard deviations for measures of letter sound knowledge reading as a function of group and time of testing

Table 4. Mean number of words read correctly in the Test of Analogies (Greaney, 1992) as a function of group, word order, and position of spelling pattern

Table 5. Means and standard deviations for measures of phonemic awareness as a function of group and time of testing

Table 6. Means and standard deviations for measures of isolated word reading as a function of group and time of testing

Table 7. Means and standard deviations for measures of spelling as a function of group and time of testing

Table 8. Analysis of percentage of each error type and of correctly spelled words for the intervention and control groups as a function of time of testing

Table 9. Means and standard deviations for accuracy, comprehension, and rate from the Neale Analysis of Reading Ability (NARA) as a function of group and time of testing
List of Figures

Figure 1. The phase theory of spelling development. Adapted from “Learning to read and learning to spell: Two sides of a coin,” by L. C. Ehri, 2000, Topics in Language Disorders, 20, 19-36

Figure 2. The 37 Dependable rimes (Wylie & Durrell, 1970)

Figure 3. The Talk to Yourself Word Analysis Chart (Gaskins, 1998b)

Figure 4. Spelling with Elkonin boxes (Elkonin, 1973)

Figure 5. Looking through words

Figure 6. Examples of clues provided for What’s In My Head activity

Figure 7. Mean total number of non-words decoded correctly for the control and intervention groups as a function of time of testing

Figure 8. Mean number of words spelled correctly for the control and intervention groups as a function of time of testing

Figure 9. Number of correctly spelled words for each child in the intervention group as a function of week of intervention programme