Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Trauma-Focused Cognitive Behavioural Therapy for Abused Children with Posttraumatic Stress Disorder: Development and Evaluation of a Manualised Treatment Programme

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
in Psychology
at Massey University, Albany
New Zealand

Jacqueline Susan Feather
2007
This thesis is dedicated to my parents, Reg and June Collins, who gave me a wonderful childhood full of fun and adventure, and a perfect base upon which to build this work.
ABSTRACT

A manualised trauma-focused cognitive behavioural therapy (TF-CBT) programme was developed for multiply-abused children diagnosed with posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD; Feather & Ronan, 2004) referred to the specialist clinic of the statutory child protection agency in New Zealand. The TF-CBT protocol was based on: (1) a review of the history of child abuse (CA) and child protection in New Zealand and internationally, with particular reference to professional developments and the role of psychologists in ameliorating CA; (2) a conceptualisation of the clinical presentation of CA in children; (3) a review of the field of psychotraumatology and theoretical models, including locally developed, relevant to the development of a treatment programme for traumatised abused children in a child protection setting in New Zealand; and (4) a review of evidence-based practice, treatment outcome models, and current empirical research related to developing an effective treatment model in this area. The locally developed TF-CBT programme built on efficacious treatments for child anxiety and PTSD as a result of sexual abuse. It encompasses psychosocial strengthening, coping skills training, gradual exposure using expressive modalities, and special issues relevant to trauma and abuse.

A “scientist-practitioner” approach to local clinical research was used to evaluate the programme. A single-case multiple-baseline design demonstrated the controlling effects of the treatment across four studies; each comprising four typically-referred multiply-abused children aged 9-15 years who met diagnostic criteria for PTSD. Parent/caregivers were involved in treatment sessions. Study 1 was a pilot with four Pakeha/New Zealand European children; Study 2 trialled the protocol with two Maori and two Samoan children; Study 3 was an evaluation of the developed protocol with a multicultural group of typically-referred children; and Study 4 was an evaluation with other therapists delivering the manualised programme.

Despite some methodological difficulties related to conducting research in a setting of this nature, the overall results indicate a good deal of promise. Across the four studies, for the majority of children treated, PTSD symptoms decreased and child coping
increased. Where follow-up data was available, gains generally maintained or improved over 3-, 6-, and 12-month intervals.

Recommendations are made about further applications of this TF-CBT programme, including the interweaving of cultural models with TF-CBT, and development and evaluation of the protocol in other settings. Implications of the current research are discussed in terms of recognition of the crucial importance of evidence-based practice in CA/child protection settings, and the contribution psychologists and therapists can make to ensure quality outcomes for this most vulnerable population of children and families.
Acknowledgements

To the children and families who participated, your willingness to be involved is greatly appreciated. This research is really all about your journey through therapy. Thank you for sharing this part of your lives with us, and in particular, those most difficult experiences that the therapy addresses. Thank you to the caregivers, teachers and social workers who participated in the research. All of you took on extra tasks over and above the treatment requirements for the sake of science. And thank you on behalf of the children, families, and professionals it is hoped this research will benefit in the future.

To Dr Kevin Ronan, my supervisor, you inspired this project with your passion for therapeutic work with children and young people. Your professional knowledge and experience, and enthusiastic expressive approach to both therapy and supervision have underpinned this project. When you left Massey University for Central Queensland University part way through, you said you would “row with me to the finish line” and you have been well and truly true to your word. I thank you for your unfailing support, inspiration, wisdom, and your professional and personal commitment to seeing this project to fruition.

To Dr Paul Merrick, my second supervisor who became my first supervisor, you have been the rock behind this project. You always seemed to say the right thing at the right time to keep me on track, or bring me back on track. I have appreciated your recognition of the difficulties and rewards of clinical research with a real-world population. I also wish to thank you for your encouragement and support of my professional development related to this research.

To my Managers at Specialist Services, Puawaitahi, your support has been extraordinary. At the outset, Dr Mary Dawson, not only whole-heartedly backed the research, but also provided clinical supervision for the research cases, and contributed to the development of the manualised programme. More recently, Sue Hutchinson has been so gracious and understanding of the leeway required in the last stages of the writing up the thesis.

To my colleagues at Specialist Services, past and present, the extent of the contribution of so many of you to this project has been immense, such that it has been a true
partnership. I wish to acknowledge in particular those directly involved in the development of the manual and the research: Tina Berking, Paora Murupaenga, Louise Woolf, Jonathan Tolcher and Fran Miller; and those closely involved by way of feedback and support: Ngaire Eruera, Maureen Woodcock, Sunila Wilson, Caroline Witten-Hannah, Letecia Barnes, Morgan Libeau and Caryn Trent. To all my colleagues who have provided support and encouragement, I thank you. Your dedication and professionalism in your work with abused children and their families does not go unnoticed.

For professional assistance, I would like to thank Caryl Huzziff, Robyn Girling-Butcher, and Heather McDowell. For peer support and sharing the PhD journey, Nici Curtis and Virginia Tamanui. Thank you to Sarah Merrick for analysing the measures and Barry McDonald for statistical advice. I am most grateful to Bev Haarhoff for checking the treatment integrity. For cultural consultation and generous sharing of your time and knowledge, extra special thanks to Paora, Tina, Ngaire, and Ginia.

To my friends outside of work, I owe a debt of gratitude to you for encouraging me to keep at it, and providing the opportunity for rest and recreation when needed. As well as those already mentioned, I would like to thank in particular: Jenny, Sally, Allan, Fran and Max.

To my family, this has been a journey you have shared with me for many years, and you have been unwavering in your support. To my children, thank you for your quiet encouragement and willingness to get on with your lives so successfully and effortlessly. In particular, thank you Nicola, for your sensible, insightful words of wisdom, which always came just when needed; Ben, for your patience and help with all things technological, and especially for formatting the graphs; Gabrielle, for your help with data entry and computer trouble-shooting, and your shared interest in the field of psychology. And, to my darling husband Tim, you have been at my side, my biggest supporter, you have believed in the project, joined with me in “PhD meetings”, cooked many meals, and sacrificed many hours of together time. Heartfelt thanks for your partnership and love.

Without the support of all of you, this research could not have happened.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. i
Acknowledgements ................................................................................................................ iii
Table of Contents .................................................................................................................. v
List of Tables ......................................................................................................................... xvi
List of Figures ......................................................................................................................... xvii

**Chapter 1: Introduction** .................................................................................................... 1

**Chapter 2: Child Abuse** .................................................................................................. 5

Outline and Aims .................................................................................................................. 5

History of Child Abuse ....................................................................................................... 6

History of Child Abuse and Child Welfare in New Zealand ............................................. 8

- Child Welfare Embraces Psychology .............................................................................. 9
- Child Welfare in the Post-War Period ............................................................................ 10
- Maori and Child Welfare ................................................................................................. 11
- The Rediscovery of Child Abuse .................................................................................... 12
- Civil Rights Movements ................................................................................................. 12
- Child Abuse on the Social Agenda ................................................................................. 13
- Legislative and Child Welfare Service Developments .................................................... 14
- Professional Developments ............................................................................................. 15

Current Status of Child Abuse and the Way Forward ............................................. 17

- Moving Best Practice to Evidence Based Practice .......................................................... 18
- Recognition of the Mental Health Needs of Abused Children ......................................... 19
- Current Status of Specialist Child Abuse Research and Practice in New Zealand .......... 20
- Puawaitahi Multi Agency Service ...................................................................................... 21

Summary ............................................................................................................................... 22
Chapter 3: Prevalence and Sequelae .................................................. 23

Outline and Aims .................................................................................. 23

Prevalence .............................................................................................. 23

Survey and Longitudinal Data ................................................................. 24
New Zealand Official Statistics ............................................................... 27
Age, Ethnicity, Gender, and Placement Statistics ................................. 29

Sequelae of Abuse .................................................................................. 29

Physical Abuse Sequelae ................................................................. 31
Sexual Abuse Sequelae ........................................................................ 32
Witnessing Domestic Violence Sequelae .............................................. 33
Emotional Abuse Sequelae ................................................................. 34
Neglect .................................................................................................... 35
Biological and Neuropsychological Correlates of Abuse ...................... 35
PTSD Sequelae in Abused Children ...................................................... 36
Risk and Protective/Resilient Factors for PTSD in Abused Children ...... 37
Social and Economic Sequelae .............................................................. 38

Summary .............................................................................................. 38

Chapter 4: Guiding Theories ................................................................. 40

Outline and Aims .................................................................................. 40

History of Psychotraumatology ............................................................. 41
Psychoanalytic and Psychodynamic Theories of Trauma ..................... 43

Outline and Aims .................................................................................. 40

History of Psychotraumatology ............................................................. 41
Psychoanalytic and Psychodynamic Theories of Trauma ..................... 43

Psychoanalytic Models ........................................................................ 43
Psychodynamic Models ...................................................................... 44
Expressive Therapy Models ............................................................... 44
Contribution of Psychoanalytic/Psychodynamic Models ................. 45
Systems-Based Approaches ................................................................. 66
Dominant Ideologies, Political, and Cultural Perspectives .............. 67
New Zealand Models ........................................................................ 67
  Early SSU Model ........................................................................ 68
  The Leslie Centre Model .............................................................. 69
Contribution of New Zealand Models .............................................. 70
Summary ........................................................................................... 70

Chapter 5: Treatment Outcome Research ................................. 72
  Outline and Aims ....................................................................... 72
  Evidence-Based Practice in Child Protection ............................ 73
    Three Levels of Intervention ......................................................... 73
    Challenges to Research in CA/Child Protection ..................... 74
    Research with Children ............................................................... 75
  State of the Art of Treatment Outcome Research in CA/Child Protection ................................................................. 76
  History and Models of Treatment Outcome Research .............. 78
    Efficacy and Effectiveness Research ........................................ 79
    Efficacy Model ....................................................................... 79
    Challenges to the Efficacy Model .............................................. 79
    Effectiveness Models ............................................................... 80
    Lack of Interaction between Researchers and Clinicians .......... 81
  State of the Art of Treatment Outcome Research .................... 81
    Alternating between Efficacy and Effectiveness Approaches ..... 81
    Combined Efficacy/Effectiveness Models ................................. 82
    A New Model for Child and Adolescent Psychotherapy Research ...... 82
    Implications for the Current Clinical Research ........................ 84
  Factors that may influence Treatment Outcome ....................... 84
    Treatment Characteristics ....................................................... 84
    Therapist Factors ................................................................... 85
Child Characteristics.............................................................................. 86

Context Variables................................................................................... 86

Implications for Treatment Outcome Research with Children and Families .................................................................................................................... 87

Child and Adolescent Psychotherapy Outcome Research........... 88

Meta-Analyses of Child Psychotherapy............................................... 88

Empirically Supported Treatments in Child Psychotherapy........... 88

Unsupported Treatments........................................................................ 89

Psychopharmacology ............................................................................. 89

Practice Guidelines ......................................................................... 90

Guidelines for the Treatment of Childhood PTSD......................... 90

Guidelines for the Treatment of CA in Children............................... 91

Child Abuse Treatment Outcome Research .............................. 91

Narrative Reviews of CA Interventions.............................................. 91

Meta-Analyses of CA Treatment Outcomes...................................... 92

Child Trauma Treatment Outcome Research ............................ 93

Anxiety Management Training.......................................................... 94

Exposure Techniques........................................................................... 94

Combined Anxiety Management and Exposure ......................... 94

Clinical Adaptations for Complex PTSD ......................................... 95

Developmental and Ethical Considerations...................................... 95

Limitations of Current Child Trauma Research............................ 96

Empirically Supported Treatments for Child Abuse Trauma... 96

TF-CBT for Sexual Abuse Trauma...................................................... 96

TF-CBT for Multiple-Abuse and Trauma ......................................... 97

ESTs for Physical Abuse...................................................................... 97

Emotional Abuse and Neglect ............................................................ 98

Limitations to Current CA Trauma Treatment Outcome Research.... 98

Need for Further Research................................................................. 99
Chapter 6: The Current Research

Outline and Aims
Rationale for Clinical Problem of Interest
Theoretical Rationale
Treatment Rationale
Manualised Treatment Protocol
Outcome Testing
Purpose of the Current Research

Study 1
Study 2
Study 3
Study 4

Summary

Chapter 7: Method

Outline and Aims
Participants
Measures

Structured Diagnostic Interview
Child Self-Report Measures
Parent/Caregiver and Teacher Measures

Research Design

The Four Studies
Procedure

Recruitment
Chapter 8: Study 1 ................................................................. 137
  Outline and Aims ................................................................. 137
  Study 1 Participants .............................................................. 137
  Method Pertinent to Study 1 and Results ............................... 137
    Variations to Research Design .............................................. 137
  Child Report: Continuous Measures ..................................... 139
    Overall Mean Results ....................................................... 139
    Individual Results ............................................................. 141
  Child Report: Repeated Measures ......................................... 147
  Child Subjective Data ........................................................... 152
  Parent/Caregiver and Teacher Results .................................. 153
  Study 1 Discussion ............................................................... 157

Chapter 9: Study 2 ................................................................. 162
  Outline and Aims ................................................................. 162
  Study 2 Participants .............................................................. 163
  Cultural Context ................................................................. 165
    Working with Indigenous Cultures ...................................... 167
  Maori World View ............................................................... 168
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maori Models of Health</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maori World View and CBT</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What Can a Pakeha Clinician Do?</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samoan World View</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samoan Perspective of Health and Healing</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faasamoa, Aiga (family) and Child Rearing</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working Therapeutically with Samoan Children and Families</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engaging in Any Cross-Cultural Situation</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Method Pertinent to Study 2 and Results</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variations from Research Design</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of Treatment, Booster Sessions, and Follow-up Data</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Report: Continuous Measures</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Mean Results</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Results</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Report: Repeated Measures</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Subjective Data</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent/Caregiver and Teacher Results</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study 2 Discussion</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 10: Study 3</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outline and Aims</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study 3 Participants</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Method Pertinent to Study 3 and Results</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treatment Fidelity</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variations from Research Design</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of Treatment, Booster Sessions, and Follow-up Data</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caregiver Involvement</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Self-Report: Continuous Measures</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Mean Results</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Results</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Report: Repeated Measures</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Subjective Data</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent/Caregiver and Teacher Results</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study 3 Discussion</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 11: Study 4</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outline and Aims</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study 4 Participants</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Method Pertaining to Study 4 and Results</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treatment Fidelity</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variations from Research Design</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of Treatment and Assessment Data</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caregiver Involvement</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Factors</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Report: Continuous Measures</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Mean Results</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Results</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Report: Repeated Measures</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Subjective Data</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent/Caregiver and Teacher Results</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study 4 Discussion</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 12: Discussion</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outline and Aims</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Major Findings</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretation and Implications</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treatment Fidelity</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treatment Response Patterns</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

Table 3.1: Studies Reporting Prevalence of Child Abuse in Children and Adolescents ..................................................................................................................... 25

Table 8.1. Study 1: Participant Characteristics, History and Current Circumstances ....................................................................................................................... 138

Table 8.2. Study 1: Child Report Scores on Repeated Measures of Target and Comorbid Symptoms ........................................................................................................... 148

Table 8.3. Study 1: Child Report Scores on Repeated Measure of Child Trauma ........................................................................................................................................ 150

Table 8.4. Study 1: Parent/Caregiver and Teacher Scores on Child Behaviour Measures ....................................................................................................................... 154

Table 9.1. Study 2: Participant Characteristics, History, and Current Circumstances ....................................................................................................................... 164

Table 9.2. Study 2: Child Report Scores on Repeated Measures of Target and Comorbid Symptoms ...................................................................................................... 189

Table 9.4. Study 2: Parent/Caregiver and Teacher Scores on Child Behaviour Measures ....................................................................................................................... 194

Table 10.1. Study 3: Participant Characteristics, History, and Current Circumstances ....................................................................................................................... 209

Table 10.2. Study 3: Child Report Scores on Repeated Measures of Target and Comorbid Symptoms ...................................................................................................... 221

Table 10.3. Study 3: Parent/Caregiver and Teacher Scores on Child Behaviour Measures ....................................................................................................................... 225

Table 11.1. Study 4: Participant Characteristics, History, and Current Circumstances ....................................................................................................................... 233

Table 11.2. Study 4: Child Report Scores on Repeated Measures of Target and Comorbid Symptoms ...................................................................................................... 245

Table 1.1. Child Self-Identified Target Concerns on the Coping Questionnaire (CQ) .............................................................................................................................. 341

Table 1.2. Study 3: Child Report Scores on Repeated Measure of Child Trauma ................................................................................................................................... 347

Table 1.3. Study 4: Child Report Scores on Repeated Measure of Child Trauma ................................................................................................................................... 348
List of Figures

Figure 8.1. Changes in mean level of posttraumatic stress symptoms (average of CPTS-RI scores for all four participants) across baseline, treatment, and follow-up phases .......................... 140

Figure 8.2. Changes in mean level of child reported coping (average of CQ scores for all four participants) across baseline, treatment, and follow-up phases ...... 140

Figure 8.3. Study 1: Changes in posttraumatic stress symptoms (CPTS-RI scores) across assessment, treatment and follow-up sessions ........................................ 142

Figure 8.4. Study 1: Changes in child reported coping skills (average of scores for three target concerns) across assessment, treatment and follow-up sessions ........ 145

Figure 9.1. Study 2: Changes in mean level of PTSD (average of CPTS-RI scores for all four participants) across baseline, treatment, and follow-up phases ......... 181

Figure 9.2. Study 2: Changes in mean level of child reported coping (average of CQ scores for all four participants) across baseline, treatment, and follow-up phases ................................................................. 181

Figure 9.3. Study 2: Changes in posttraumatic stress symptoms (CPTS-RI scores) across assessment, treatment, and follow-up sessions ........................................ 183

Figure 9.4. Study 2: Changes in child reported coping skills (average of scores for three target concerns) across assessment, treatment, and follow-up sessions ........ 186

Figure 9.5. Transition in thinking regarding CBT and Culture ........................................ 207

Figure 10.1. Study 3: Changes in mean level of PTSD (average of CPTS-RI scores for all four participants) across baseline, treatment, and follow-up phases ............... 213

Figure 10.2. Study 3: Changes in mean level of child reported coping (average of CQ scores for all four participants) across baseline, treatment, and follow-up phases ................................................................. 213

Figure 10.3. Study 3: Changes in posttraumatic stress symptoms (CPTS-RI scores) across assessment, treatment and follow-up sessions ........................................ 215

Figure 10.4. Study 3: Changes in child reported coping skills (average of scores for three target concerns) across assessment, treatment and follow-up sessions ...... 218

Figure 11.1. Study 4: Changes in mean level of PTSD symptoms (average of CPTS-RI scores for all four participants) across baseline, treatment, and follow-up phases ................................................................................................. 237

Figure 11.2. Study 4: Changes in mean level of child reported coping (average of CQ scores for all four participants) across baseline, treatment, and follow-up phases ................................................................................................. 237
Figure 11.3. Study 4: Changes in posttraumatic stress symptoms (CPTS-RI scores) across assessment, treatment and follow-up sessions ................................................... 239

Figure 11.4. Study 4: Changes in child reported coping skills (average of scores for three target concerns) across assessment, treatment and follow-up sessions ........... 242

Figure 1.1. Examples of worksheets from the TF-CBT manual ........................................ 333

Figure 1.2. Examples of trauma processing with expressive modalities ........................ 339

Figure 1.3. Mean level of participants’ perceived helpfulness of the programme across baseline, assessment and treatment for each of the four studies ......................... 343

Figure 1.4. Study 1 participants’ perceived helpfulness of the programme across baseline, assessment and treatment .............................................................................. 344

Figure 1.5. Study 2 participants’ perceived helpfulness of the programme across baseline, assessment and treatment .............................................................................. 344

Figure 1.6. Study 3 participants’ perceived helpfulness of the programme across baseline, assessment and treatment .............................................................................. 345

Figure 1.7. Study 4 participants’ perceived helpfulness of the programme across baseline, assessment and treatment .............................................................................. 345