Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Phases of Differentiated Schooling:
A Theoretical and Conceptual Framework of the Relationship between
Religion and Schooling in New Zealand and Norway

A dissertation presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
in
Education

at Massey University, Palmerston North
New Zealand.

Anna Marie Tsukigawa

2013
This thesis offers a conceptual and theoretical map of the trajectory of relationship between religion and schooling that explains why and how religion has changed within state education policy. The concepts and theories of phases of differentiated schooling are built by applying the theoretical insight from the sociology of religion to the field of education using the case studies of Norway and New Zealand. Phases of differentiated schooling elucidates a general pattern of religious change in schooling, identifying global political, cultural and philosophical variables that have changed the concept of religion within nation state education policy using the methodological insight of historical sociology. The concepts and theories of phases of differentiated schooling are organised by a multi-level structure that allows for the identification and synthesis of these global variables, while also providing flexibility to account for national context and interpretation.

Phases of differentiated schooling identifies three distinct theoretical and conceptual phases of relationship between religion and schooling. The first phase, undifferentiated schooling, has its origins in the Middle Ages where Christianity arose to form a monolithic sacred authority over western society. Because Christianity defined knowledge, beliefs and values, Churches held an almost uncontested authority and provision over schooling until the mid-19th century. The second phase, differentiated schooling arose from consolidations of the enlightenment, liberalism, the rise of the nation state and, the scientific revolution. These variables contributed to the progressive differentiation and secularisation of schooling. Finally, the third phase, post-differentiated schooling, reflects what sociologists have observed as the de-privatisation of religion and the desecularisation of society. Religion has changed in concept and increased in significance upon developments in multiculturalism, postmodernism, political ideology and religious education pedagogies. Consequently, from the late 20th century religion has increased in political and public significance, reconceptualising the role of religion within state education policy. This thesis provides a means to understand the variables that determine the conceptualisation of religion within nation state education policy, thereby enhancing the ability to critically evaluate the relationship between religion and schooling.
Acknowledgements

I am truly indebted and grateful for the encouragement, support, and knowledge from my primary supervisor Howard Lee who provided guidance, whilst allowing me the autonomy to pursue my own ideas. Without his assistance throughout my entire academic studies, this thesis would not have been possible. One could not want a better, knowledgeable, or friendlier supervisor.

I am also extremely grateful to my secondary supervisor, Roger Openshaw, whose thoughtful and indispensable advice, encouragement, and academic experience was invaluable in the research and writing of this thesis.

I would like to thank Massey University for providing me with a doctoral scholarship allowing me the time, opportunity, and ability to immerse myself within the researching and writing of this thesis.

To Mum, Dad, and Jermund, my sincerest thanks for having the faith in my abilities and the many ways you have supported this.
Table of Contents

Abstract ......................................................................................................................... iii
Acknowledgements ....................................................................................................... iv
Table of Contents ........................................................................................................... v
List of Figures ............................................................................................................. xiii
List of Tables ................................................................................................................ xv
Appendices .................................................................................................................. xvi

Chapter One : Introduction .......................................................................................... 17
1.1 The contemporary dilemma of religion and schooling ......................................... 19
1.2 Research problem: Religion and nation state primary education systems, a global, national, and historical problem ............................................................... 24
1.4 The conceptual context: Educational globalisation within an historical and sociological perspective ........................................................................................................ 27
1.5 The paradigmatic context: Critical realism .......................................................... 30
1.6 Definition of key terms ......................................................................................... 32
  1.6.1 Schooling ....................................................................................................... 32
  1.6.2 Religion ......................................................................................................... 34
  1.6.3 Spirituality ..................................................................................................... 35
  1.6.4 Terminology in concept and theory ............................................................ 36
1.7 Thesis structure ..................................................................................................... 37

Chapter Two : Theoretical and methodological framework ........................................... 44
2.1 Qualitative and quantitative perspectives ............................................................. 45
2.2 Sociological foundations: Theories of differentiation and secularisation .......... 46
  2.2.1 Terminology from sociology ....................................................................... 48
  2.2.2 The phase of undifferentiation .................................................................. 48
  2.2.3 The phase of differentiation ....................................................................... 49
  2.2.4 The sociological developments for the phase of post-differentiation ....... 50
2.2.5 Educational terminology of differentiation ................................................... 51

2.3 The case studies of New Zealand and Norway .................................................... 52

2.3.1 Particularistic case studies ................................................................................. 53

2.3.2 The grounds of comparability........................................................................ 53

2.4 Three-level concepts: The conceptual foundation and framework for phases of differentiated schooling ............................................................... 56

2.5 Two-level theory: The theoretical foundation and framework for phases of differentiated schooling ............................................................... 58

2.6 The critique of theory development................................................................. 61

2.7 Conclusions ....................................................................................................... 61

Chapter Three : The three-level concepts of un-differentiated, differentiated, and post-differentiated schooling ............................................................... 63

3.1 The conceptualisation of the relationship between religion and schooling........ 64

3.2 The concept of undifferentiated schooling ...................................................... 64

3.2.1 Religious authority and provision over schooling ......................................... 68

3.2.2 Strong Christian ontology .............................................................................. 69

3.2.3 A religious framework of knowledge ............................................................ 71

3.2.4 Religion is equated with Culture ................................................................... 72

3.3 The concept of differentiated schooling ........................................................... 74

3.3.1 Secular authority and provision over schooling ............................................ 76

3.3.2 A “neglect of the ontological dimension” ..................................................... 77

3.3.3 The dominance of secular knowledge ........................................................... 79

3.3.4 Religion distinguished from culture .............................................................. 81

3.4 The concept of post-differentiated schooling ................................................. 83

3.4.1 Shared secular, religious and cultural authority and provision over schooling............................................................... 87

3.4.2 New conceptualisations of religious knowledge ............................................. 89

3.4.3 Religion integral to culture ............................................................................. 91
3.4.4 Weak Ontology .............................................................................................. 93
3.5 Three-level concepts as ideal types and continuous concepts ......................... 95
3.6 Conclusions ........................................................................................................... 96

Chapter Four: The Theory of Undifferentiated Schooling: Political, Cultural, and Ontological Foundations for Religious Authority and Provision over Schooling .......... 98

4.1 The basic-level variables of undifferentiated schooling ....................................... 99
4.2 The rise of Christianity’s political and social authority ........................................ 102
4.2.1 The collapse of Rome and the rise of the Catholic Church............................... 103
4.2.2 The political alignments of the Reformation ..................................................... 104
4.3 Christianity’s authority on knowledge ................................................................. 106
4.4 The authority of Christian ontology .................................................................... 111
4.5 Conclusions ......................................................................................................... 115

Chapter Five: Undifferentiated Schooling in Norway and New Zealand ................. 116

5.1 The concept and theory of undifferentiated schooling in Norway ...................... 119
5.1.1 Catholic Norway: The rising cultural and political significance of religion 121
5.1.2 Lutheran Norway: Theological principles for religious authority and provision over schooling ............................................................................................ 122
5.1.3 State Pietistic Norway: Church schools for citizenship and social control ...... 124
5.1.4 The Sámi in undifferentiated Norway ............................................................... 126
5.1.5 Summary: Norway ....................................................................................... 127
5.2 Undifferentiated Schooling in New Zealand ...................................................... 129
5.2.1 The British legacy of Christianity, education and pluralism ......................... 131
5.2.2 The missionary period: Religion and schooling a means of cultural governance ................................................................................................................. 132
5.2.3 The colonial period: The growing institutionalisation of church schooling 135
5.2.4 The provincial period: From the ideal of undifferentiated schooling to the pragmatics of the New Zealand context ................................................................. 138
5.2.5 Summary: New Zealand .................................................................................. 142
5.3 Conclusions......................................................................................................... 143

Chapter Six: The Theory of Differentiated Schooling: The transition to secular authority and provision over schooling................................................................. 145
6.1 The two-level theory of differentiated schooling ................................................ 147
6.2 A secular perception and rationale of values, human nature, and human ability...................................................................................................................... 149
   6.2.1 The Enlightenment ...................................................................................... 150
   6.2.2 Liberalism .................................................................................................... 152
   6.2.3 Secular Monism ........................................................................................... 153
6.3 The predominance of secular knowledge .............................................................. 154
6.4 The rise of monolithic secular political authority ................................................. 157
   6.4.1 The Reformation .......................................................................................... 158
   6.4.2 The nation state and nation building............................................................ 159
   6.4.3 Democracy ................................................................................................... 160
   6.4.4 Political ideology and liberalism ................................................................. 161
6.5 Modernity............................................................................................................ 162
6.6 The growing recognition and significance of pluralism ....................................... 164
6.7 Conclusions......................................................................................................... 166

Chapter Seven: Differentiated Schooling in Norway and New Zealand .................. 167
7.1 The concept and theory of differentiated schooling in Norway ............................. 169
   7.1.1 The Enlightenment, liberalism and democracy: Changing the political and economic purpose of schooling ................................................................. 172
   7.1.2 The 1889 School Law: Establishing the educational authority of the nation state ........................................................................................................... 175
   7.1.3 The welfare state and social democracy: Prioritising the secular, economic, and social purposes of the school ................................................................. 177
   7.1.4 The War: Reinstating religion in defence of foreign occupation ................. 179
7.1.5 The return to, and growth of, secularism in society and schooling 180
7.1.6 Summary: Norway 182
7.2 The concept and theory of differentiated schooling in New Zealand 183
7.2.1 The secular school: a pragmatic negotiation for state neutrality 186
7.2.2 Psychological, sociological, and pedagogical influences and implications for the differentiation of schooling 189
7.2.3 The nation state and the welfare state: A political framework for the secular school 194
7.2.4 The development of secularism. Changing the nature of differentiation 197
7.2.5 Summary: New Zealand 199
7.3 Conclusions 200

Chapter Eight: The theory of post-differentiated schooling: Re-legitimising, re-institutionalising, and re-conceiving the role of religion in state schooling systems 202
8.1 The sociological foundations of post-differentiated schooling 204
8.2 The two-Level theory of post-differentiated schooling 206
8.3 Sacralisation: The changing concept and significance of the sacred 209
8.3.1 Secularisation 210
8.3.2 Spirituality 210
8.3.3 Postmodernism 211
8.4 Multiculturalism: Religion and spirituality through the gate of culture 213
8.4.1 The politics of recognition and group differentiated rights 216
8.4.2 Post-colonial Perspectives 217
8.4.3 Communitarianism 220
8.4.4 The increasing presence of religious minorities 222
8.4.5 Summary: Multiculturalism 224
8.5 Globalisation: the international significance and legislation of religion 224
8.5.1 Immigration and increased global communication and awareness 226
8.5.2 The growth and influence of transnational and international organisations 227
8.6 De-differentiation: Re-establishing traditional relationships between religion and schooling ............................................................................................................. 229

8.6.1 Religious Fundamentalism .......................................................................... 230
8.6.2 Cultural Fundamentalism ............................................................................ 231

8.7 New political structures and ideologies for religion and schooling ............. 232

8.7.1 Neo-liberalism ............................................................................................. 233
8.7.2 Modern developments of conservatism ....................................................... 236
8.7.3 New developments of social democracy ..................................................... 237

8.8 New religious education pedagogies: Reconceptualising religion within a secular academic framework ........................................................................................... 238

8.8.1 Phenomenology of religious education ....................................................... 240
8.8.2 Multifaith education .................................................................................... 241
8.8.3 Educating the whole child ........................................................................... 242
8.8.4 Pedagogy within religious and cultural worldviews.................................... 243

8.9 Conclusions ......................................................................................................... 243

Chapter Nine: Post-differentiated Schooling: A restructured, renewed, and revitalised role for religion in the state education systems of Norway and New Zealand .......... 245

9.1 The concept and theory of post-differentiated schooling in Norway ............ 249

9.1.1 Restructuring religion in the state education system: The inclusion of religious schools and a secular alternative to religious education .......... 251
9.1.2 The 1997 reforms: Religion and schooling reconceptualised as the means of defining and maintaining Norwegian culture ................................................. 252
9.1.3 Global influences on restraining nationalist conceptions of religion and schooling ................................................................................................................. 257
9.1.4 Neo-liberalism in Norwegian politics and schooling ................................. 265
9.1.5 The indigenous culture and religion of the Sámi within KRL ....................... 266
9.1.6 An increase in religious minorities, the new demographics of culture challenging the relationship between religion and schooling................. 269
9.1.7 Summary: Norway

9.2 The concept and theory of post-differentiated schooling in New Zealand

9.2.1 The secular clause becomes negotiable: New legislation and structure for Protestants and Catholics within the state education system

9.2.2 The state questions the secular clause

9.2.3 Spirituality: New dimensions and possibilities for the sacred within state schools

9.2.4 Religion inherent to culture, necessary to bicultural education: The growing recognition of the spiritual aspect of culture in state schools

9.2.5 An increase in religious minorities challenging the secular clause and the de-facto Christian population

9.2.6 The New Right, a new political role for religion

9.2.7 Summary: New Zealand

9.3 Conclusions

Chapter Ten: Conclusion

10.1 National similarities and differences within the phases of differentiated schooling

10.1.1 Undifferentiated schooling

10.1.2 Differentiated Schooling

10.1.3 Post-differentiated Schooling

10.2 The national contextual features of New Zealand and Norway

10.3 The evaluation of the theory phases of differentiated schooling

10.4 The contribution of theory to policy development

10.5 The contribution of the historical perspective to policy development

10.6 The contribution of the comparative perspective to policy development

10.7 Limitations and further research

10.8 Observations and suggestions for future research

10.9 Conclusion
List of references ................................................................. 375
Index ......................................................................................... 406
List of Figures

Figure 2-1: Goertz's (2006) three-level concept ................................................................. 58
Figure 2-2: Goertz's (2006) two-level theory and three-level concept ......................... 60
Figure 3-1: The three-level concept of undifferentiated schooling. .................... 67
Figure 3-2: The indicator-level properties of religious authority and provision over   
        schooling. ......................................................................................................... 68
Figure 3-3: The indicator-level properties of a strong Christian ontology ............ 70
Figure 3-4: The indicator-level properties of knowledge dominated by religion ...... 72
Figure 3-5: The indicator-level properties of religion is equated with culture .......... 73
Figure 3-6: The three-level concept of differentiated schooling ...................... 75
Figure 3-7: The indicator-level properties of secular authority and provision over   
        schooling. ......................................................................................................... 77
Figure 3-8: The indicator-level properties of a "neglect of the ontological dimension" 78
Figure 3-9: The indicator-level properties of secular knowledge ....................... 80
Figure 3-10: The indicator-level properties of religion distinguished from culture ... 82
Figure 3-11: The three-level concept of post-differentiated schooling ............... 85
Figure 3-12: The indicator-level properties of shared secular, religious, and cultural  
        authority over schooling ................................................................................ 87
Figure 3-13: The indicator-level properties of new conceptualisations of religious  
        knowledge. .......................................................................................................... 90
Figure 3-14: The indicator-level properties of religion integral to culture .......... 92
Figure 3-15: The indicator-level properties of weak ontology ............................. 95
Figure 4-1: The two-level theory of undifferentiated schooling ...................... 101
Figure 4-2: The secondary-level variables of the rise of Christianity's political  
        authority ............................................................................................................ 103
Figure 4-3: The secondary-level variables of the rise of Christianity's authority   
        on knowledge .................................................................................................. 107
Figure 4-4: The secondary-level variables of the rise of Christian ontology .......... 112
Figure 5-1: The concept and theory of undifferentiated schooling in Norway ....... 120
Figure 5-2: The concept and theory of undifferentiated schooling in New Zealand. 130
Figure 6-1: The two-level theory of differentiated schooling .............................. 148
Figure 6-2: The secondary-level variables and property of a secular perception and
rationale of values, human nature and human ability. ........................................ 150

Figure 6-3: The secondary-level variables of the predominance of secular knowledge... 154
Figure 6-4: The secondary-level variables of monolithic secular political authority ..... 158
Figure 6-5: The secondary-level properties of modernity........................................ 162
Figure 6-6: The secondary-level variables of pluralism.......................... 164
Figure 7-1: The concept and theory of differentiated schooling in Norway............... 171
Figure 7-2: The concept and theory of differentiated schooling in New Zealand........ 185
Figure 8-1: The two-level theory of post-differentiated schooling........................... 208
Figure 8-2: The secondary-level variables of sacralisation ........................................ 209
Figure 8-3: The secondary-level variables of multiculturalism.......................... 216
Figure 8-4: The secondary-level variables of globalisation.................................... 226
Figure 8-5: The secondary-level variables of de-differentiation.............................. 230
Figure 8-6: The secondary-level variables of contemporary political ideologies ....... 233
Figure 8-7: The secondary-level variables of new religious education pedagogies...... 240
Figure 9-1: The concept and theory of post-differentiated schooling in Norway........ 250
Figure 9-2: The concept and theory of post-differentiated schooling in New Zealand.... 274
List of Tables

Table 2.1 *The grounds for comparability: Similarities between Norway and New Zealand.* ................................................................. 54

Table 2.2 *The grounds for comparability: Similarities between Norway and New Zealand.* ........................................................................ 56

Table 10.1 *National differences within the concept of undifferentiated schooling.* ................................................................. 311

Table 10.2 *National differences within the concept of differentiated schooling.* ................................................................. 312

Table 10.3 *National differences within the concept of post-differentiated schooling.* ................................................................. 315
Appendices

A  Act relating to Primary and Secondary Education (Education Act) (Norway Education Act Amendment’s 2000: Sections1-1, 1-2, 2-4) .................. 333
B  Core curriculum for primary, secondary and adult education in Norway (pp. 1-14) ................................................................. 335
C  Act relating to Primary and Secondary Education (Education Act) (Norway Education Act Amendment’s 2005: Sections1-1, 1-2, 2-4) ........ 349
D  Act relating to Primary and Secondary Education (Education Act) (Norway Education Act Amendment’s 2010: Sections1-1, 1-2, 2-4) ........... 351
E  Religion, Livssyn og etikk (RLE) Religion, philosophies of life and ethics curriculum ................................................................. 353
F  Kristendoms, religions- og livssynkunnskap” (KRL) Christianity, religion and ethics education curriculum ........................................... 364