Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Harmonisation of the self: Narratives of older Chinese about ageing, health and wellbeing

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
in
Health Psychology

at Massey University, Albany,
New Zealand

Siu-Chun Cannis Tse

2014
Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Abstract
The older population in New Zealand is increasingly culturally and ethnically diverse. While the New Zealand Government has acknowledged that these diverse groups of older people have their specific ageing processes, needs and expectations, there is a paucity of research conducted to understand their ageing lives and experiences. This research seeks to explore the experiences of ageing among older Chinese migrants through the lens of subjective wellbeing. Specifically, it looks into older Chinese migrants’ experiences of happiness, struggles and challenges while they are ageing in New Zealand. Particular consideration is given to the role the self plays in the creation, restoration and preservation of a sense of happiness in old age. In-depth narrative interviews were conducted with fourteen older Chinese migrants from diverse backgrounds. The analysis was informed by the dialogical self theory, Chinese philosophical perspectives of yin/yang and harmony, Chinese conceptions of happiness and the self and narrative methodology to focus on the dynamics of the self, through which a theoretical link between the self and human experience of happiness is developed. The results indicate several factors that could enhance or undermine the participants’ ability to live happy and satisfying lives. The enhancing factors included: the natural environment, social welfare, health, wellbeing of the offspring, and family, ethnic community and social supports. The potential hindering factors were: language barriers, transportation problems, crimes, and inadequate healthcare services. The central findings reveal that happiness is a function of the harmonious interplay and balance of different aspects (I-positions) of the self within a dynamic, complex and ongoing process of dialogical negotiation. Three prominent pairs of I-positions, including the “independent” and the “interdependent” positions, “xiao wo” (the private and individuated self) and “da wo” (the large self) positions, and the “devoted” and the “affirmed” positions, were identified. Examples from three cases show that happiness may be attained when these self-positions interact with each other in harmony. The research also illustrates that happiness is dependent upon the individual reaching a balance among mind, body and surrounding environments. Furthermore, happiness is dependent upon the balanced dynamic interplay between individual agency and the social structures of changing contexts and situations.
Acknowledgements

The successful completion of this thesis would not have been possible without the contributions of many others, in their different ways. I would like to extend my appreciation especially to the following.

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to Professor Christine Stephens, who was always considerate and attentive to my needs. She has unfailingly supported me throughout the entire research and writing process with her knowledge, enthusiasm and patience whilst allowing me the room to work in my own way. Her painstaking effort in reading my endless drafts is greatly appreciated. Without her invaluable advice, constructive feedback, skilful guidance and on-going encouragement, this thesis would not have materialised. I am especially appreciative of her presence and support at my oral defence. It provided a source of strength for me to answer the examiners’ questions with confidence.

I would also like express my greatest appreciation to Professor Kerry Chamberlain whose continuous faith in my ability to produce quality research has been unwavering. I was deeply touched by his reconfirmation that he and Chris loved my work when we were waiting outside for the announcement of the oral examination result. I am particularly grateful for his challenging questions, insightful comments, sensitive suggestions and openness to ideas, which deepened my thinking and expanded my horizons. He provided me with encouragement and emotional sustenance when I most needed them. His timely humour was a source of comfort and motivation when I felt frustrated.

Professor Stephens and Professor Chamberlain have been my respected mentors for my doctoral study, allowing me to grow as an academic researcher. Their great attitude in research and in teaching inspired me to continually pursue and develop my academic career. I could never adequately express my gratitude to them.

My sincere thanks go to all of the participants who willingly shared part of their lives with me. Without their trust in me and generosity of time, this thesis would not have been accomplished.
I took great pleasure in being part of the Albany Discourse and Narrative Group. I would like to express my special appreciation to each of the friendly and intelligent members of the group for every stimulating discussion, every thought-provoking argument, our co-working towards creative research and a publication, and every sharing of our lives and research journeys.

I am deeply grateful to my parents and parents-in-law for their love, understanding and patience, allowing me to spend a long period of time away from home to research and write. My special thanks are extended to my sisters, Siu-Ling Gloria Tse and Siu-Ming Ivy Tse, for their unequivocal support and constant encouragement throughout the entire process.

I would also like to take this opportunity to express my profound appreciation and deep regard to my friends, Mr. Rob Dowler and Mrs. Rosemary Dowler, for their sincere help in proofreading the thesis in a professional manner and their clear grammar explanations. Their generosity of precious time and energy is invaluable to the production of this thesis. I have greatly benefitted from the learning process of English grammar through which my writing skill has significantly improved.

Moreover, I would like to acknowledge the financial and academic support of Massey University and the Foundation for Research, Science and Technology through the award of a Massey Doctoral Scholarship and the three-year grant for Positive Ageing Research.

Last but not least, my heartfelt thanks go to my beloved husband, Dr. Kin-Lung Chan, who was always my greatest strength and immense source of support in all my struggles and frustrations during my doctoral study. He gave me the courage and confidence needed to begin this research and the love and encouragement required to complete it. He was always there taking good care of and spoiling me. My mere expression of thanks could not be sufficient for his willingness to understand my research, his attentive listening to my arguments, his honesty in sharing his viewpoints, his efforts to cheer me up when I was down and his energy to accompany me through myriad sleepless nights. I will be grateful forever for his unconditional and endless love.
# Table of Contents

Abstract

Acknowledgements

Table of contents

List of figures

Chapter 1

An exploratory project in the context of ageing and migration

A rapidly growing world population

Chinese migrants in New Zealand

Policy responses to and academic perspectives of population ageing

An exploratory project

Thesis overview: Orientation towards the self and happiness

Chapter 2

Philosophical underpinnings of the project

Ontology

The pertinence of critical realism

Social constructionism

Reconciling a critical realist ontology with a social constructionist epistemology for the project

Chapter 3

Theoretical orientation: Dialogical perspectives of the self

William James’ notion of the extended self

Mikhail Bakhtin’s notion of polyphony and the self

Hurbert Hermans’ theory of the dialogical self

The dialogical self as a multiplicity of I-positions

The dialogical self as embodied and social

The dialogical self as multiplicity within unity

The Chinese conception of a person

Situating the person in the social and moral contexts

An embodied being

The Chinese conception of the self

The social relational-oriented self

The embodied action-oriented self

The conceptualisations of a social self in the West

George Herbert Mead’s interacting social self

Erving Goffman’s socially situated self

Gathering the strands together to understanding the self

Chapter 4

Happiness and the self

Notions of happiness in the traditional Chinese culture

Confucian view on happiness

Daoist view on happiness

Buddhist view on happiness
Chapter 5
Narrative methodology: A dialogic analysis
The narrative approach to qualitative research 82
Defining a narrative 84
Participants 87
Narrative interview 89
Researcher reflexivity 94
Locating an approach for narrative analysis 97
Dialogic analysis 101
Voice-centred relational method 103
Analysing the stories 105

Chapter 6
Exploring participants’ stories
Overview of the primary findings 113
The natural environment 114
Social welfare 114
Health 115
Wellbeing of the offspring 117
Family, ethnic community and social supports 118
Language barriers 119
Transportation problems 121
Crimes 122
Healthcare services 123

Chapter 7
Three case studies
The narrative of Au and Yu 128
Seeking for security 128
A miserable life, a resilient self 130
Forgive others, release the self 137
Appreciation brings compromise 138
Basic resources for independence 141
Experiencing harmony within differences 143
The gain from the loss 143
Shifting between different perspectives 146
The embodied self within different environments 149
A historically dominant social position for women 151
The beauty of distance 153
Regret breeds reflection 155
Case summary 157

The narrative of Jiang 160
Immigration application as an act of filial care 160
Becoming independent as self-fulfilment 162
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Negotiating among multiple I-positions and balancing multiple needs</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning English as self-betterment: “One is never too old to learn”</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intercultural interaction, support and care</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflection of cultural identity in a foreign land</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case summary</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The narrative of Shan</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sacrifice within unequal relationships undermines experiencing happiness</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emancipating the self through migration</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The influence of tenacious cultural positions on self-(re)organisation</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The price of ai mian zi (愛面子, keeping up face)</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illusion of forgiveness and imagined positioning</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inexorable obligations bring compromised wellbeing</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A thread of happiness in unresolved bitterness: a balance</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>between giving and receiving</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case summary</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter summary</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion: Harmonisation of the self and subjective wellbeing</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Happiness as a balanced state of self-positions</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A harmonious balance between independence and interdependence</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A harmonious balance between xiao wo and da wo</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A harmonious balance between self-devotion and Other-recognition</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Happiness as a harmonious balance among mind, body and environment</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Happiness as the balanced interplay between enabling and constraining</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>structures and individual agency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations and future directions</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendices</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A: Information Sheet (English version)</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B: Information Sheet (Chinese complicated version)</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C: Information Sheet (Chinese simplified version)</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix D: Consent to be Contacted Form (English version)</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix E: Consent to be Contacted Form (Chinese complicated version)</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix F: Consent to be Contacted Form (Chinese simplified version)</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix G: Translator Confidentiality Agreement</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix H: Participant Consent Form (English version)</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix I: Participant Consent Form (Chinese complicated version) 268
Appendix J: Participant Consent Form (Chinese simplified version) 269
Appendix K: Interview prompts 270
Appendix L: Transcriber Confidentiality Agreement 272
List of Figures

Figure 1  Yin/yang mode of thinking  54
Figure 2  Actor-centered yin/yang thinking mode  56