

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**Harmonisation of the self:
Narratives of older Chinese about
ageing, health and wellbeing**

**A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree of**

**Doctor of Philosophy
in
Health Psychology**

**at Massey University, Albany,
New Zealand**

Siu-Chun Cannis Tse

2014

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

Abstract

The older population in New Zealand is increasingly culturally and ethnically diverse. While the New Zealand Government has acknowledged that these diverse groups of older people have their specific ageing processes, needs and expectations, there is a paucity of research conducted to understand their ageing lives and experiences. This research seeks to explore the experiences of ageing among older Chinese migrants through the lens of subjective wellbeing. Specifically, it looks into older Chinese migrants' experiences of happiness, struggles and challenges while they are ageing in New Zealand. Particular consideration is given to the role the self plays in the creation, restoration and preservation of a sense of happiness in old age. In-depth narrative interviews were conducted with fourteen older Chinese migrants from diverse backgrounds. The analysis was informed by the dialogical self theory, Chinese philosophical perspectives of *yin/yang* and harmony, Chinese conceptions of happiness and the self and narrative methodology to focus on the dynamics of the self, through which a theoretical link between the self and human experience of happiness is developed. The results indicate several factors that could enhance or undermine the participants' ability to live happy and satisfying lives. The enhancing factors included: the natural environment, social welfare, health, wellbeing of the offspring, and family, ethnic community and social supports. The potential hindering factors were: language barriers, transportation problems, crimes, and inadequate healthcare services. The central findings reveal that happiness is a function of the harmonious interplay and balance of different aspects (*I*-positions) of the self within a dynamic, complex and ongoing process of dialogical negotiation. Three prominent pairs of *I*-positions, including the "independent" and the "interdependent" positions, "*xiao wo*" (the private and individuated self) and "*da wo*" (the large self) positions, and the "devoted" and the "affirmed" positions, were identified. Examples from three cases show that happiness may be attained when these self-positions interact with each other in harmony. The research also illustrates that happiness is dependent upon the individual reaching a balance among mind, body and surrounding environments. Furthermore, happiness is dependent upon the balanced dynamic interplay between individual agency and the social structures of changing contexts and situations.

Acknowledgements

The successful completion of this thesis would not have been possible without the contributions of many others, in their different ways. I would like to extend my appreciation especially to the following.

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to Professor Christine Stephens, who was always considerate and attentive to my needs. She has unfailingly supported me throughout the entire research and writing process with her knowledge, enthusiasm and patience whilst allowing me the room to work in my own way. Her painstaking effort in reading my endless drafts is greatly appreciated. Without her invaluable advice, constructive feedback, skilful guidance and on-going encouragement, this thesis would not have materialised. I am especially appreciative of her presence and support at my oral defence. It provided a source of strength for me to answer the examiners' questions with confidence.

I would also like express my greatest appreciation to Professor Kerry Chamberlain whose continuous faith in my ability to produce quality research has been unwavering. I was deeply touched by his reconfirmation that he and Chris loved my work when we were waiting outside for the announcement of the oral examination result. I am particularly grateful for his challenging questions, insightful comments, sensitive suggestions and openness to ideas, which deepened my thinking and expanded my horizons. He provided me with encouragement and emotional sustenance when I most needed them. His timely humour was a source of comfort and motivation when I felt frustrated.

Professor Stephens and Professor Chamberlain have been my respected mentors for my doctoral study, allowing me to grow as an academic researcher. Their great attitude in research and in teaching inspired me to continually pursue and develop my academic career. I could never adequately express my gratitude to them.

My sincere thanks go to all of the participants who willingly shared part of their lives with me. Without their trust in me and generosity of time, this thesis would not have been accomplished.

I took great pleasure in being part of the Albany Discourse and Narrative Group. I would like to express my special appreciation to each of the friendly and intelligent members of the group for every stimulating discussion, every thought-provoking argument, our co-working towards creative research and a publication, and every sharing of our lives and research journeys.

I am deeply grateful to my parents and parents-in-law for their love, understanding and patience, allowing me to spend a long period of time away from home to research and write. My special thanks are extended to my sisters, Siu-Ling Gloria Tse and Siu-Ming Ivy Tse, for their unequivocal support and constant encouragement throughout the entire process.

I would also like to take this opportunity to express my profound appreciation and deep regard to my friends, Mr. Rob Dowler and Mrs. Rosemary Dowler, for their sincere help in proofreading the thesis in a professional manner and their clear grammar explanations. Their generosity of precious time and energy is invaluable to the production of this thesis. I have greatly benefitted from the learning process of English grammar through which my writing skill has significantly improved.

Moreover, I would like to acknowledge the financial and academic support of Massey University and the Foundation for Research, Science and Technology through the award of a Massey Doctoral Scholarship and the three-year grant for Positive Ageing Research.

Last but not least, my heartfelt thanks go to my beloved husband, Dr. Kin-Lung Chan, who was always my greatest strength and immense source of support in all my struggles and frustrations during my doctoral study. He gave me the courage and confidence needed to begin this research and the love and encouragement required to complete it. He was always there taking good care of and spoiling me. My mere expression of thanks could not be sufficient for his willingness to understand my research, his attentive listening to my arguments, his honesty in sharing his viewpoints, his efforts to cheer me up when I was down and his energy to accompany me through myriad sleepless nights. I will be grateful forever for his unconditional and endless love.

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|------|
| Abstract | i |
| Acknowledgements | ii |
| Table of contents | iv |
| List of figures | viii |
| | |
| Chapter 1 | |
| An exploratory project in the context of ageing and migration | 1 |
| A rapidly growing world population | 1 |
| Chinese migrants in New Zealand | 3 |
| Policy responses to and academic perspectives of population ageing | 5 |
| An exploratory project | 9 |
| Thesis overview: Orientation towards the self and happiness | 15 |
| | |
| Chapter 2 | |
| Philosophical underpinnings of the project | 19 |
| Ontology | 19 |
| The pertinence of critical realism | 22 |
| Social constructionism | 25 |
| Reconciling a critical realist ontology with a social constructionist epistemology for the project | 27 |
| | |
| Chapter 3 | |
| Theoretical orientation: Dialogical perspectives of the self | 32 |
| William James' notion of the extended self | 32 |
| Mikhail Bakhtin's notion of polyphony and the self | 35 |
| Hurbert Hermans' theory of the dialogical self | 37 |
| <i>The dialogical self as a multiplicity of I-positions</i> | 38 |
| <i>The dialogical self as embodied and social</i> | 39 |
| <i>The dialogical self as multiplicity within unity</i> | 40 |
| The Chinese conception of a person | 41 |
| <i>Situating the person in the social and moral contexts</i> | 42 |
| <i>An embodied being</i> | 44 |
| The Chinese conception of the self | 45 |
| <i>The social relational-oriented self</i> | 45 |
| <i>The embodied action-oriented self</i> | 48 |
| The conceptualisations of a social self in the West | 50 |
| <i>George Herbert Mead's interacting social self</i> | 50 |
| <i>Erving Goffman's socially situated self</i> | 52 |
| Gathering the strands together to understanding the self | 53 |
| | |
| Chapter 4 | |
| Happiness and the self | 58 |
| Notions of happiness in the traditional Chinese culture | 59 |
| <i>Confucian view on happiness</i> | 60 |
| <i>Daoist view on happiness</i> | 67 |
| <i>Buddhist view on happiness</i> | 68 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Contemporary Chinese conception of happiness | 69 |
| The Chinese conception of harmony | 72 |
| Cultural models of happiness in relation to the self | 74 |
| An alternative view on happiness and the self | 78 |
| Chapter 5 | |
| Narrative methodology: A dialogic analysis | 82 |
| The narrative approach to qualitative research | 82 |
| Defining a narrative | 84 |
| Participants | 87 |
| Narrative interview | 89 |
| Researcher reflexivity | 94 |
| Locating an approach for narrative analysis | 97 |
| Dialogic analysis | 101 |
| Voice-centred relational method | 103 |
| Analysing the stories | 105 |
| Chapter 6 | |
| Exploring participants' stories | 113 |
| Overview of the primary findings | 113 |
| <i>The natural environment</i> | 114 |
| <i>Social welfare</i> | 114 |
| <i>Health</i> | 115 |
| <i>Wellbeing of the offspring</i> | 117 |
| <i>Family, ethnic community and social supports</i> | 118 |
| <i>Language barriers</i> | 119 |
| <i>Transportation problems</i> | 121 |
| <i>Crimes</i> | 122 |
| <i>Healthcare services</i> | 123 |
| Chapter 7 | |
| Three case studies | 125 |
| The narrative of Au and Yu | 128 |
| Seeking for security | 128 |
| A miserable life, a resilient self | 130 |
| Forgive others, release the self | 137 |
| Appreciation brings compromise | 138 |
| Basic resources for independence | 141 |
| Experiencing harmony within differences | 143 |
| <i>The gain from the loss</i> | 143 |
| <i>Shifting between different perspectives</i> | 146 |
| <i>The embodied self within different environments</i> | 149 |
| A historically dominant social position for women | 151 |
| The beauty of distance | 153 |
| Regret breeds reflection | 155 |
| Case summary | 157 |
| The narrative of Jiang | 160 |
| Immigration application as an act of filial care | 160 |
| Becoming independent as self-fulfilment | 162 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Negotiating among multiple <i>I</i> -positions and balancing multiple needs | 166 |
| Learning English as self-betterment: “ <i>One is never too old to learn</i> ” | 170 |
| Intercultural interaction, support and care | 174 |
| Reflection of cultural identity in a foreign land | 175 |
| Case summary | 180 |
| The narrative of Shan | 182 |
| Sacrifice within unequal relationships undermines experiencing happiness | 182 |
| Emancipating the self through migration | 186 |
| The influence of tenacious cultural positions on self-(re)organisation and self-movement | 187 |
| The price of <i>ai mian zi</i> (愛面子, keeping up face) | 191 |
| Illusion of forgiveness and imagined positioning | 195 |
| Inexorable obligations bring compromised wellbeing | 197 |
| A thread of happiness in unresolved bitterness: a balance between giving and receiving | 200 |
| Case summary | 203 |
| Chapter summary | 205 |
| Chapter 8 | |
| Discussion: Harmonisation of the self and subjective wellbeing | 207 |
| Happiness as a balanced state of self-positions | 208 |
| <i>A harmonious balance between independence and interdependence</i> | 208 |
| <i>A harmonious balance between xiao wo and da wo</i> | 210 |
| <i>A harmonious balance between self-devotion and Other-recognition</i> | 213 |
| Happiness as a harmonious balance among mind, body and environment | 215 |
| Happiness as the balanced interplay between enabling and constraining structures and individual agency | 217 |
| Limitations and future directions | 220 |
| References | 224 |
| Appendices | 257 |
| Appendix A: Information Sheet (English version) | 257 |
| Appendix B: Information Sheet (Chinese complicated version) | 259 |
| Appendix C: Information Sheet (Chinese simplified version) | 261 |
| Appendix D: Consent to be Contacted Form (English version) | 263 |
| Appendix E: Consent to be Contacted Form (Chinese complicated version) | 264 |
| Appendix F: Consent to be Contacted Form (Chinese simplified version) | 265 |
| Appendix G: Translator Confidentiality Agreement | 266 |
| Appendix H: Participant Consent Form (English version) | 267 |

| | | |
|-------------|--|-----|
| Appendix I: | Participant Consent Form (Chinese complicated version) | 268 |
| Appendix J: | Participant Consent Form (Chinese simplified version) | 269 |
| Appendix K: | Interview prompts | 270 |
| Appendix L: | Transcriber Confidentiality Agreement | 272 |

List of Figures

| | | |
|----------|--|----|
| Figure 1 | <i>Yin/yang</i> mode of thinking | 54 |
| Figure 2 | Actor-centered <i>yin/yang</i> thinking mode | 56 |