Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
A Mixed Methods Investigation of Ethnic Diversity and Productivity in Software Development Teams

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctorate of Philosophy in Information Systems at Massey University, Wellington, New Zealand.

Julian Congalton
2014
ABSTRACT

Software has become pervasive across all aspects of society in the developed world and as a result, society has become highly dependent on new software being created for any modern advancement. Much research has focused on reducing the cost to develop software, including understanding what makes software teams more productive. Software teams are increasingly ethnically diverse due to the growth in distributed software development and a globally mobile labour force. Team composition has been found to be a major influence of team performance and ethnic diversity in teams can improve innovation and problem solving. As software development relies on effective teams and often involves solving complex problems, this raises the question of how ethnic diversity within software development teams affects the performance, and therefore productivity of those teams. This research seeks to understand how ethnic diversity in software development teams influences the productivity that those teams achieve. This is important as software related costs represent a significant component of business costs. Furthermore, the cost effective development of new or changed software is critical to support advances in today’s technology-dependent society.

A mixed methods research approach has been used in this study with an emphasis on qualitative data. This is the first mixed methods study of productivity in New Zealand software development projects and represents a unique examination of the sociological effects of ethnic diversity in software projects. Using a conceptual model of software development as a socio-technical system, project documents and interviews with project managers were analysed. A detailed analysis reveals themes and patterns regarding the influence of ethnic diversity in software development productivity. The qualitative data has been complemented with quantitative analysis of the project data using the productivity model embodied in the software development cost estimation model COCOMO II combined with indices measuring ethnic diversity. Ethnic diversity improved team problem solving and
innovation on complex software projects but hindered some aspects of communications which negatively influenced productivity, particularly on large projects. Ethnic diversity could either enhance or impair team cohesion, depending on whether the project manager took steps to build relationships and trust within their team.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many people have contributed to this thesis including those who made it possible, those who encouraged me to start it, and those who have supported me during the process. I would first like to thank my supervisors, Keri Logan and Barbara Crump whose patience and guidance enabled me to complete this journey. Their tireless support and encouragement has made this thesis possible.

I wish to thank the project managers and organisational leaders who agreed to participate in this study and made it an enjoyable and insightful process. It is only through their generosity and trust that this thesis has been feasible.

My thanks goes out to all the managers and mentors I have worked with, and for, during my 20 years in the software development industry. Many of these people have encouraged me to continue studying while working. In particular I would like to thank Alan Murphy who, as my manager for the five years before I began this thesis, supported me in completing the study that led up to, and enabled me to undertake this PhD.

I am grateful to my father, my mother and my sister Jenna who were always interested in what I was researching and keen to read my thesis. I am also thankful to my grandfather, Professor Athol Congalton, who, at an early age encouraged me to ask questions about belief, truth and knowledge.

Finally, I am eternally indebted to my wife Donna who never wavered in her support of me undertaking this thesis. Without her support I could never have begun this journey and would never have completed it.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract ...................................................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgements ................................................................................................................... iv
Table of Contents ....................................................................................................................... v
List of Tables ........................................................................................................................... xii
List of Figures ......................................................................................................................... xiv
Chapter 1 – Introduction ............................................................................................................ 1
  Research Questions ................................................................................................................ 5
  Overview of the Research Design .......................................................................................... 6
  Significance ............................................................................................................................ 9
  Overview of Thesis .............................................................................................................. 10
Chapter 2 – Literature Review ................................................................................................. 13
  Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 13
  Literature Search and Review Strategy ................................................................................ 14
  The Demands for Improved Software Development Productivity ...................................... 16
    Rising Expectations of Software ...................................................................................... 16
    Drivers for Efficiency in Software Production ............................................................... 19
  Factors Affecting Software Development Productivity ....................................................... 23
    Process factors ................................................................................................................. 23
    Product factors ................................................................................................................. 26
    Personnel factors ............................................................................................................. 27
      The use of teams ............................................................................................................ 28
    Communication .............................................................................................................. 31
    Project management factors ............................................................................................. 32
    Team cohesion ................................................................................................................. 35

Ethnic Diversity in Software Development Teams
Team composition.................................................................................................37

Diversity and Team Performance .........................................................................38

Workplace Diversity .............................................................................................38

Team Diversity.........................................................................................................40

The Organisational Context of Diversity ...............................................................42

Public and Private Sector Differences ....................................................................44

Diversity in Software Development .........................................................................46

Ethnic Diversity ..........................................................................................................49

Definitions of ethnicity ............................................................................................49

Ethnicity in New Zealand ..........................................................................................50

Cultural values ............................................................................................................52

Innovation .....................................................................................................................54

Conflict .........................................................................................................................55

Communication ..........................................................................................................56

Measuring and Improving Software Development Productivity ....................................58

Previous Attempts to Improve Software Development Productivity .......................58

Measuring Software Development Productivity .......................................................59

Models for Analysing Software Development Productivity ......................................63

Constructive Cost Model (COCOMO) ......................................................................66

Summary ......................................................................................................................70

Chapter 3 – Method ..................................................................................................72

Introduction .................................................................................................................72

Research Questions ....................................................................................................72

Research Paradigm .....................................................................................................73

Mixed Methods Design ..............................................................................................75

Ethnic Diversity in Software Development Teams
Conclusion ......................................................................................................................... 111

Chapter 4 – Results and Analysis of Interviews ................................................................. 112

Introduction ........................................................................................................................ 112

Communication .................................................................................................................. 112

Within Team Communication ........................................................................................ 113

Language challenges .................................................................................................. 113

Communication barriers between groups .................................................................. 114

Communication barriers within groups ..................................................................... 115

Customer Communications ............................................................................................ 115

Communicating through documentation .................................................................... 115

Face-to-face communication ...................................................................................... 117

Customer perceptions ................................................................................................. 118

Vendor Communications ............................................................................................... 119

Communication with Project Sponsor ........................................................................... 119

Communication, Ethnic Diversity and Project Size ...................................................... 121

Communication and team size ................................................................................... 121

Communication and project length ............................................................................ 123

Communication and product complexity ................................................................... 124

Communication Differences between Government and Non-Government............... 125

Summary of Communication Aspects ........................................................................... 126

Team Cohesion .................................................................................................................. 127

Shared Goals ................................................................................................................. 127

Use of Feedback .......................................................................................................... 129

Strong Team Relationships ............................................................................................ 130
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Correlation Analysis</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic Diversity and Productivity</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correlations between Ethnic Diversity and Productivity</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correlations between Ethnic Diversity and Productivity Factors</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project size, ethnic diversity and productivity</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product complexity, ethnic diversity and productivity</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government projects, ethnic diversity and productivity</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic Diversity with Factors Previously Found to Affect Productivity</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requirements Volatility and Productivity</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factors That Altered the Influence of Ethnic Diversity</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Impact of Being a Government Organisation</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparison of the Influence of Ethnic Diversity in Different Sectors</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Results and Analysis of Project Data</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 6 – Synthesis and Conclusions</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview of the Thesis</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Synthesis of Results</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complexity</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication as a Mediating Factor</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requirements Quality and Volatility</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Synthesis</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Answers to Research Questions</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question 1. What factors influence productivity in ethnically diverse software teams?</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question 2. Does ethnic diversity influence the productivity of software teams?</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Question 3. What mediating factors alter the influence of ethnic diversity on the productivity of software teams?

Strengths of the Study ........................................................................................................ 202

Limitations of the Study ............................................................................................... 203

Contribution ....................................................................................................................... 206

Implications for Theory ................................................................................................. 206

Implications for Practice ................................................................................................ 207

Future Research ................................................................................................................. 209

Summary of the Conclusions ............................................................................................. 211

References .............................................................................................................................. 213

Appendices ............................................................................................................................. 272

Appendix A – Covering Email for Invitation to Participate .............................................. 272

Appendix B – Invitation to Participate .............................................................................. 273

Appendix C – Information Sheet ....................................................................................... 274

Appendix D – Consent Form ............................................................................................. 275

Appendix E – Request for Documentation ........................................................................ 276

Appendix F – List of Variables .......................................................................................... 277

Appendix G – List of Ethnic Groups ................................................................................. 281

Appendix H – Interview Guide .......................................................................................... 288

Appendix I – Data for All Variables for All Projects ........................................................ 302

Appendix J – Coding Frequency of Productivity Factors .................................................. 306

Appendix K – Use of “We” or “They” to Refer to Software Team ...................................... 307

Appendix L – Kendall Rank-Order Correlations ................................................................ 308

Appendix M – Concept Map of Interview Themes ............................................................ 311
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. Search terms and article databases ................................................................. 14
Table 2. Search terms and article databases for previous work .................................. 47
Table 3. Studies into the effect of diversity in software development teams .................. 48
Table 4. Algorithmic software development cost estimation models ............................. 65
Table 5. Articles that refer to COCOMO ....................................................................... 68
Table 6. Categorisation of why articles refer to COCOMO .......................................... 69
Table 7. Average breakdown of effort by phase (Jiang, Jiang, & Naudé, 2007) ............. 89
Table 8. Level 1 ethnic categories (Statistics New Zealand, 2005a) ............................. 90
Table 9. Summary of data collected ............................................................................. 99
Table 10. Types of documents received ....................................................................... 102
Table 11. Data frequencies for categorical variables of projects ................................. 156
Table 12. Data frequencies for Likert type variables .................................................... 157
Table 13. Descriptive statistics for interval data ......................................................... 159
Table 14. Values assigned to dichotomous variables ................................................... 161
Table 15. Ethnicity and productivity variables correlated with productivity factors ....... 165
Table 16. Ethnicity and productivity variables correlated with complexity .................... 167
Table 17. Ethnicity and productivity variables correlated with government ................... 168
Table 18. Ethnicity variables correlated with factors previously affecting productivity .. 169
Table 19. Significant correlations between variables and government ......................... 175
Table 20. Significant correlations for non-government projects .................................... 179
Table 21. Comparison of qualitative and quantitative findings ..................................... 185
Table 22. Definition of COCOMO II variables (Boehm, et al., 2000) ......................... 277
Table 23. Definition of variables not in COCOMO II .................................................. 279
Table 24. Ethnic groups .............................................................................................. 281
Table 25. Raw data for projects 1 – 6 .................................................................................... 302
Table 26. Raw data for projects 7 – 13 .................................................................................. 303
Table 27. Raw data for projects 13 – 19 ................................................................................ 304
Table 28. The number of interviews where each productivity factors is discussed .......... 306
Table 29. Use of “we” or “they” to refer to software team.................................................... 307
Table 30. The Kendall rank-order correlations...................................................................... 308
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Effects of diversity on group processes and outcomes (Kochan, et al., 2003)...........43
Figure 2. Conceptual model for ethnic diversity in software projects.................................82
Figure 3. Instruments selected for this study .........................................................................84
Figure 4. Data analysis and synthesis process, based on (Creswell & Clark, 2007)..............107
Figure 5. Variables correlated with the number of ethnicities in the team.........................163
Figure 6: Productivity for government and non-government projects.................................173
Figure 7. Model of the influence of ethnic diversity on team outcomes, adapted from Kochan, et al. (2003) ........................................................................................................206
Figure 8. Invitation email ......................................................................................................272
Figure 9. Invitation to participate .........................................................................................273
Figure 10. Information sheet .................................................................................................274
Figure 11. Consent form .......................................................................................................275
Figure 12. Request for documentation ..................................................................................276
Figure 13. Concept map of major productivity factors and the role of ethnic diversity .......311