Establishing a business in Aotearoa New Zealand: Cultural, human and social capital resources of intentional immigrant entrepreneurs

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
in
Sociology

at Massey University Albany
New Zealand

Prudence Anne Cruickshank
2013
Abstract

There is a well-established literature on immigrant entrepreneurs and this thesis seeks to add to this understanding by focussing on the strategies and pathways of a particular group of business immigrants. This thesis contends that intentional well-resourced (IWR) immigrants be understood as a distinct category within immigrant scholarship. Their distinctiveness is directly linked to their intentions to start a business immediately on arrival, and the adequacy and utilisation of their human, cultural and social capital which is critical to their success.

This thesis contributes to, and extends, the knowledge of the particular dimensions of human, cultural and social capital significant to IWR immigrant entrepreneurs’ success. IWR immigrant entrepreneurs are associated here with New Zealand’s conditional Long Term Business Visa (LTBV) which leads to residence as an entrepreneur. Semi-structured interviews captured the business establishment experiences and trajectories of a regionally scattered sample of LTBV holders. Notwithstanding the participants’ diverse cultural backgrounds, geographical locations or types of business, the iterative analytical process revealed distinct patterns of human, cultural and social capital usage at each stage of the LTBV. The time constrained requirements of the LTBV intensified the focused application of IWR immigrants’ resources, which in turn provided an opportunity to examine the functions and dimensions of human, cultural and social capital which proved essential for entrepreneurial success.
The development and effects of migration policies are complex and enduring. This thesis informs immigration policy makers of the effectiveness of the LTBV in achieving the government’s business recruitment and policy aspirations. The focus here is on a relatively small but distinctive group of skilled immigrants who provide a case study of immigrant entrepreneurship.
Acknowledgements

My thanks firstly go to the intentional immigrant entrepreneurs who participated in this study, generously sharing their fascinating experiences. Without entrepreneurs, this society and economy would be less rich and vibrant.

This thesis is mainly due to the leap of faith and supportive involvement of Distinguished Professor Paul Spoonley and Associate Professor Ann Dupuis who thoughtfully supervised the research and writing process in spite of extremely demanding workloads. The time and energy invested in providing constructive feedback has been much appreciated. I especially appreciate the time invested by Ann who provided detailed constructive feedback on multiple drafts when Paul’s work commitments took him off campus or overseas. The supervisory role is onerous and stretches over many years especially with part-time students. I salute their dedication and appreciated their encouragement.

I gratefully acknowledge the support and accommodation of Ferooz, family, friends and colleagues and apologise for my lack of attentiveness to their needs while I focused on completing this thesis. A particular thanks to my colleague Carol Storey for her formatting expertise. Significant moments scarcely celebrated during this project included the birth of Shima and Andrew’s daughters, Caitlyn in 2010 and Emma 2012; son Darius’ survival of acute myocarditis in the UK in 2012; the same year as our 40th wedding anniversary.
# Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................ iii

Acknowledgements .......................................................................................................................... v

Chapter 1  Introduction ................................................................................................................ 1

1.1 Overview ................................................................................................................................. 1

1.2 The research aims .................................................................................................................... 5

1.3 Terminology ............................................................................................................................. 6

1.4 Structure of the thesis .............................................................................................................. 8

Chapter 2  Forms of capital........................................................................................................... 13

2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................. 13

2.2 Forms of capital ...................................................................................................................... 14

2.2.1 Capital conversions and transferability .......................................................................... 16

2.3 Financial capital ..................................................................................................................... 18

2.4 Cultural Capital ...................................................................................................................... 19

2.4.1 Institutionalised cultural capital ..................................................................................... 20

2.4.2 Embodied cultural capital ............................................................................................... 21

2.5 Human capital ....................................................................................................................... 25

2.5.1 Language fluency .......................................................................................................... 28

2.6 Social capital ......................................................................................................................... 29

2.6.1 Embeddedness and social capital ................................................................................. 32

2.6.2 Network dimensions ...................................................................................................... 35

2.7 Mainstreaming entrepreneurial immigrants ......................................................................... 39
2.7.1 Settlement social capital .............................................................................................. 40

2.8 Conclusion.................................................................................................................... ....... 43

Chapter 3 Immigration theories ......................................................................................... 45

3.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. ....... 45

3.2 Migration theories............................................................................................................ .... 46

3.3 Migration policy development.............................................................................................. 49

3.4 Immigration research ........................................................................................................... 50

3.5 Immigrant entrepreneurship studies ...................................................................................... 52

3.5.1 Unintentional v IWR immigrant entrepreneurs ............................................................. 53

3.5.2 Ethnic and ethnic embeddedness implications .............................................................. 54

3.6 Immigrant entrepreneurship theoretical approaches............................................................... 57

3.7 New Zealand immigrant entrepreneurial literature................................................................. 63

3.8 Conclusion.................................................................................................................... ....... 67

Chapter 4 Business immigration policies ........................................................................... 69

4.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. ....... 69

4.2 Economic and social context 1980s - 1990s .......................................................................... 70

4.3 New Zealand immigration policies 1987-1998 ...................................................................... 72


4.3.2 Effects of changes....................................................................................................... . 75

4.3.3 Immigration public policy debates 1987-1998 .............................................................. 77

4.3.4 Settlement challenges .................................................................................................. 79

4.4 Alternative models ............................................................................................................ ... 81

4.4.1 Australian immigrant entrepreneurial policy ................................................................. 82

4.4.2 Canadian 1978 Business Immigration Programme (BIP) .............................................. 84
6.2.6 Networks and mentors ................................................................. 169
6.2.7 Interim decision making during visa processing ......................... 172
6.3 Role of human capital ................................................................. 177
6.4 Role of cultural capital ............................................................... 180
6.5 Role of social capital ............................................................... 185
6.6 Role of financial capital ............................................................ 186
6.7 Discussion of forms of capital used ............................................... 187
   6.7.1 Role of human capital ........................................................ 187
   6.7.2 Role of cultural capital: entrepreneurial and affiliate ............. 191
   6.7.3 Role of social capital ........................................................ 193
   6.7.4 Role of financial capital ................................................... 195
   6.7.5 Analytical frameworks ....................................................... 196
6.8 Conclusion .................................................................................... 199

Chapter 7  The first nine months ............................................................... 203
7.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 203
7.2 Role of human capital ............................................................... 205
   7.2.1 Implementing a business partnership .................................. 206
   7.2.2 Modifying business plans ................................................... 209
   7.2.3 Minimising costs ............................................................... 213
   7.2.4 Continuous product improvement ....................................... 216
7.3 Role of social capital ............................................................... 219
   7.3.1 Networks for marketing .................................................... 220
   7.3.2 Significant business relationships ...................................... 225
   7.3.3 Finding appropriate professionals ................................... 227
8.4.3 Affiliate cultural capital ................................................................. 296

8.5 Financial capital ................................................................................ 297

8.6 Business immigration policy aspirations ........................................... 298

8.7 Issues for consideration by policy-makers .......................................... 302
  8.7.1 Cost of failure ................................................................................ 306
  8.7.2 Adapting to New Zealand culture .................................................. 307

8.8 Discussion ......................................................................................... 311
  8.8.1 Role of human capital ................................................................. 311
  8.8.2 Role of social capital ................................................................. 317
  8.8.3 Role of embodied cultural capital: entrepreneurial and affiliate ..... 320
  8.8.4 New businesses ......................................................................... 321
  8.8.5 Role of financial capital ............................................................ 324
  8.8.6 Business immigration policy objectives ....................................... 324
  8.8.7 Structural considerations ......................................................... 325
  8.8.8 Intentional immigrant entrepreneurial process .......................... 328

8.9 Conclusion ....................................................................................... 330

Chapter 9 Conclusion ........................................................................... 335

9.1 Aims of the thesis ............................................................................. 335

9.2 Key findings ...................................................................................... 337

9.3 Possibilities for further research ..................................................... 342

Appendix A .......................................................................................... 345

  INFORMATION SHEET ........................................................................... 345

Appendix B .......................................................................................... 347

  PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM .......................................................... 347
Figures

Figure 1  Locating IWR immigrant entrepreneur research......................................................... 9
Figure 2  Location of LTBV holders within business immigrant studies................................. 51
Figure 3  Interactive theory of ethnic entrepreneurship (Waldinger, Aldrich & Ward, 1988)...... 60
Figure 4  Entrepreneurial process framework (Bolton & Thompson, 2004).............................. 129
Figure 5  Entrepreneurial marketing network evolution ...................................................... 131, 252
Figure 6  Enhanced interactive ethnic entrepreneurship (Volery, 2007)................................. 132
Figure 7  Intentional immigrant entrepreneurial process ................................................... 136, 197, 261, 330
Figure 8  Long Term Business Visa business plan requirements ....................................... 158
Figure 9  Human capital .................................................................................................. 189, 247
Figure 10 Cultural capital: entrepreneurial and affiliate ...................................................... 192, 255
Figure 11 Social capital ................................................................................................. 194, 241
Figure 12 Dimensions of human, cultural and social capital critical to intentional immigrant entrepreneurs ........................................................................................................ 311
Figure 13 Entrepreneurial cycle of business creation .......................................................... 322