Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
STRONG IN THEIR SPIRITS

WOMEN MANAGERS

IN THE SOCIAL SERVICES
It was the best of times, it was the worst of times,...it was the season of Light, it was the season of Darkness, it was the spring of hope, it was the winter of despair, we had everything before us, we had nothing before us (Dickens, 1859).
STRONG IN THEIR SPIRITS

WOMEN MANAGERS

IN THE SOCIAL SERVICES

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Social Work

Dianne Barbara Hawken
Department of Social Policy and Social Work
Massey University Albany Campus
1996
ABSTRACT

And where the words of women are crying to be heard, we must each of us recognise our responsibility to seek those words out, to read them and share them and examine them in their pertinence to our lives (Lorde, 1980: 15).

Social services world-wide is a predominantly female profession with mainly female clients, yet is primarily managed by men. Although internationally there is considerable literature on women in management the main focus has been on how women can adapt to fit in to the male world of management. In Aotearoa New Zealand there has been little research on women in social services management.

This qualitative study examined the experiences and practice of eight pakeha women, mainly middle managers, in a number of social service agencies in Aotearoa New Zealand. The thesis sought, by listening to their voices, to illuminate how they experienced organisational life and how they managed.

The women in management literature was analysed within a framework that combined management theory and feminist theory (Padgett, 1993), management in the social services was explored, and research studies on women in human service management were examined.

In this study the women managers' experiences fell into two distinct areas: their struggles and their strengths. The women felt "out of kilter" with the organisational culture and the current managerial climate. This was partly explained by feminist theory as being the result of the genderedness of organisations within our patriarchal society. The recent organisational changes through the implementation of managerialism in the social services was another significant factor. Juxtaposed to their struggles, were the strengths of the women, their skills, qualities and practices. They were competent managers with distinctive styles of operation.

Drawing from the literature and the findings, four key feminist management practice principles were identified that offered an inclusive, transformational, woman-centred and service-oriented way of managing.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My grateful thanks to:

- The women who took part in the study and gave so generously of themselves.
- My supervisors, Associate Professor Rajen Prasad who challenged me, and Dr. Marilyn Waring who gave me much-needed encouragement and guidance.
- The librarians, especially Ellice, at Massey University Albany, who accessed the resources.
- Jenny and Miriama, my colleagues at Manukau Institute of Technology, for their constant support.
- My family and friends, who supported me in countless ways and allowed me time and space to do this.
- My parents, Babs and Reg, who were encouraging and understanding.
- Jill, my study companion for the last five years, who kept me going.
- Marg, who read the manuscript and offered invaluable suggestions.
- Ruth, for her willingness and expertise in formatting this document.
- and especially Kevin, my support and helpmate whose patience is second to none.

Dianne Hawken
February 1996
CONTENTS

ABSTRACT  

v

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS  

vi

CONTENTS  

vii

LIST OF FIGURES  

ix

CHAPTER 1  A MANAGING WOMAN: AN INTRODUCTION  

1

CHAPTER 2  LIFE AS A WOMAN MANAGER: WOMEN IN MANAGEMENT LITERATURE  

7

- The Liberal Feminist Perspective  
  The Person-Centred Approach  
  The Organisation-Centred Approach  
  8  
  11

- The Radical Feminist Perspective  
  The Person-Centred Approach  
  Valuing Women's Differences  
  Rethinking Leadership  
  The Organisation-Centred Approach  
  Feminist Goals, Values and Practice  
  Reconceptualising Organisational Theory  
  15  
  22  
  28  
  28  
  35

CHAPTER 3  A MASCULINE CULTURE: MANAGEMENT IN SOCIAL SERVICE ORGANISATIONS  

49

- Management Theories  
  49

- Gendered Organisational Theory  
  The Nature of the Human Services  
  Social Services in Aotearoa New Zealand  
  The Impact of Managerialism  
  Gendered Social Service Organisations  
  54  
  56  
  58  
  61  
  67

CHAPTER 4  INEQUITY IN WOMEN'S WORK LIVES: STUDIES OF WOMEN MANAGERS IN THE HUMAN SERVICES  

73

- Women in Educational Management  
- Women in Public Service Management  
  73  
  79
CHAPTER 5  UNCOVERING THE FACTS: FEMINIST METHODOLOGY
- Feminist Research 91
- Feminist Methodology 94
- Ethics 96
  My Position 97
- Research Design 98
  Participants 98
  Method 99
  The Interview Process 100
  Validity and Reliability 102
  Data Analysis 103

CHAPTER 6  THE MANAGERS’ STRUGGLES
- Organisational Struggles - the Impact of Managerialism 108
  Accountability 109
  Contracting 110
  New Technology 111
  Conflict with Practice 112
  Down-sizing and Masculinisation 113
  Organisational Culture, Bureaucracy and Patriarchy 115
- Personal Struggles 118
  Invisibility 118
  Constraint, Compromise, Co-option 120
  Undervalued 122
  Isolation 125
  Put to the Test 126
  Difficulties in Relationships 128
    With Feminists 128
    With Men 133
    With People of Iwi descent and Peoples from the Pacific 134
  Demands of Work and Home "Out of kilter" 137
  Re-evaluating their Lives 140
### CHAPTER 7  
**THE MANAGERS' STRENGTHS**

- Management Style  
  - Service  
  - Participation  
  - Use of Power  
  - Empowerment  
  - Relationships  
  - Commitment to the Task and to Excellence

- Values and Qualities  
  - Commitment to Social Justice  
  - Care and Support  
  - Feminist Values  
  - Risk-Takers  
  - Self-Confidence tinged with Self-Doubt  
  - Emotionality, Authenticity and Rationality

### CHAPTER 8  
**AN INCLUSIVE AND TRANSFORMATIONAL STYLE OF MANAGEMENT**

- Feminist Management Practice Principles  
  - Inclusive Relationships  
    - Caring  
    - Cooperation  
    - Empowerment  
    - Encouragement of Diversity  
  - Social Transformation  
  - Women's Well-being  
  - Quality of Service

- Conclusion of the Study  
- Further Research

### APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>INFORMATION SHEET</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>CONSENT FORM</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>INTERVIEW SCHEDULE</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>LETTER REQUESTING PARTICIPATION</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>TRANSCRIBERS' DECLARATION OF CONFIDENTIALITY</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>LETTER TO PARTICIPANTS FOR COMMENTS ON DRAFT OF FINDINGS</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>LETTER TO PARTICIPANTS FOR COMMENTS ON DRAFT OF PART OF FINAL CHAPTER</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### BIBLIOGRAPHY  

- 205
LIST OF FIGURES

1 WOMEN IN MANAGEMENT LITERATURE 9
2 FEMINIST MANAGEMENT PRACTICE PRINCIPLES 173
3 FEMINIST MANAGEMENT PRACTICE 179