

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

**REALISING THEIR GOVERNANCE ROLE:
COMMUNITY BOARDS IN NEW ZEALAND**

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
Degree of Master of Philosophy (Social Policy)

by
Faye Storer

Department of Social Policy and Social Work
Massey University
March 1996

352.140993
570

DC21

Abstract

This thesis explores the governance role of community boards in New Zealand. There has been considerable debate on whether community boards have a meaningful role to play in local government. Critics of community boards argue that if the boards are not given additional functions they should be abolished. However this thesis will attempt to show that community boards already have an important role to play, that of governance.

This thesis focuses in particular on the concepts of 'public space', the 'public realm' and 'citizenship'. The mechanisms of participation and consultation are employed to reveal the governance role played by community boards. It is argued that through an appreciation of this governance role, the full potential of sub-local government can be realised.

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank the community board members who took part in the research - particularly those members of the Auckland Region Community Board Association Executive whom I regard as both my friends and political colleagues.

My supervisors Christine Cheyne and Dr. Mike O'Brien, through their academic support and encouragement, and Christine with her knowledge and insights of the research area, have both contributed to the production of this thesis.

I would also like to extend my thanks to the staff members of the councils within the Auckland region who assisted with the collection of the data, and especially those Auckland City Council staff who have provided both their professional assistance and a listening ear. Sincere thanks must go to the staff of the Auckland City Council Municipal Reference Library for their assistance on many occasions.

I am indebted to June Lee for her critical thinking and philosophical views.

Special thanks to Brian Shackleton for his computer expertise, for providing a 'good example' with his general conscientiousness and attention to detail, assistance with the various edits and preparation of the final document.

Finally, extra special thanks to my children, Rahsaan and Zena, who have watched their mother study and work for the 'common good' since their very early childhood. I hope they understand that this is in some way part of my contribution to their futures.

List of Abbreviations

A.C.C.	Auckland City Council
A.C.L.A.	Audit Commission for Local Authorities
A.R.C.B.A.	Auckland Region Community Boards' Association
C.E.O.	Chief Executive Officer
I.U.L.A.	International Union of Local Authorities
L.A.M.	<u>Local Authority Management</u>
L.G.B.G.	Local Government Business Group
L.G.C.	Local Government Commission
N.L.C.E.D.	Noble, Lowndes, Cullen, Egan, Dell
N.Z.L.G.	<u>New Zealand Local Government</u>
N.Z.L.G.A.	New Zealand Local Government Association
O.C.C.L.G.	Officials Co-ordinating Committee on Local Government

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	iii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS	v
CHAPTER ONE	
INTRODUCTION	1
The Aims of the Study	4
The Structure of the Thesis	5
CHAPTER TWO	
BACKGROUND	8
The Historical Role of Local Government in Britain	9
The Historical Role of Local Government in New Zealand	10
Sub-local Government	12
Community Councils	13
Community Committees in Auckland City	15
Community Boards	16
Public Sector Reforms	18
Devolution, Decentralisation and Delegation	21
The 1989 Local Government Reforms	22
The New Zealand Local Government Association Submission	25
The National Transition Committee	27
The Local Government Amendment Act (No. 2) 1989	29
Citizen Participation: Devonport's 'Public Involvement' Policy	31
The Rodney Example: The Abolition of Community Boards	33
Summary	34
CHAPTER THREE	
LITERATURE REVIEW	36
The Popular Debate on Community Boards	37
Department of Internal Affairs Review of Functions of Community Boards (1991)	45
Brown (1993)	46
Marjoribanks (1994)	48
Francis (1995)	51
Service Auditing Group (Auckland City Council)	53
Summary	55
CHAPTER FOUR	
CONCEPTS AND PERSPECTIVES OF DEMOCRACY	56
Principles of Local Government	57
Democratic Theory and Local Government	59
Defining Democracy	59
Modern Theories of Democracy	60
- Liberal Representative	60
- Participative Democracy (socialist and republican traditions)	61

- Radical Democratic Theory	63
Community	64
Community of Interest	66
The Public Realm	67
Roles of the Public	70
Citizenship	72
Governance	73
Governance and Management	75
Governance and Responsible Decision-making	77
Consultation and Participation	78
Summary	81

CHAPTER FIVE

METHODOLOGY AND RESEARCH DESIGN 84

An Outline of Waiheke Island and My Role as a Researcher and Elected Representative	85
Ethical Issues	87
Research Sample	88
Participant Observation as a Method	90
Sampling Methods - Generalisability or External Validity	94
Sampling Methods - Internal Validity	96
Relationship and Role Problems in Field Research	97
Data Collection Method 1: Time Budget Diaries	98
- Research Design	98
- Data Collection Logistics	98
- System of Categorisation	99
Data Collection Method 2: Participant Observation Cameo	101
Data Collection Method 3: Analysis of Minutes	102
- Research Design	102
- Data Collection Logistics	102
- System of Categorisation	103
Data Collection Method 4: Interviews with Community Board Chairpersons	105
Summary	106

CHAPTER SIX

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION 107

How the Data was Analysed	107
- Data Collection Method 1: Time Budget Diaries	107
- Data Collection Method 2: Participant Observation	108
- Data Collection Method 3: Analysis of Minutes	109
- Data Collection Method 4: Interviews with Board Chairpersons	110
Results of the Time Budget Diaries	111
Reflections on the Participant Observation Cameo	114
Results of the Community Board Minutes	116
Telephone Interviews with Community Board Chairpersons	120
The Key Themes	124
- Theme 1: The Proactive Nature of Community Boards	125

- Theme 2: Community Links and Networking	126
- Theme 3: The Use of Public Forum as a Political Space	127
- Theme 4: The Governance Role of Community Boards	128
Summary	129
CHAPTER SEVEN	
CONCLUSION: THE GOVERNANCE ROLE OF COMMUNITY BOARDS	132
The Governance Role	135
Criteria for Effective Governance	136
APPENDIX ONE	
Local Government Act 1974 (s163 & 164)	138
APPENDIX TWO	
Local Government Amendment Act (No. 2) 1989 (s101ZY & 101ZZ)	139
APPENDIX THREE	
Community Boards - Delegated Functions (Auckland City Council)	141
APPENDIX FOUR	
List of Community Boards in the Auckland Region	143
APPENDIX FIVE	
Blank Time Budget Form	145
APPENDIX SIX	
Introductory Letter to Prospective Participants	146
APPENDIX SEVEN	
Consent Form used for the Research Project	148
APPENDIX EIGHT	
First Covering Letter to Participants	149
APPENDIX NINE	
Second Covering Letter to Participants	150
APPENDIX TEN	
Letter to Participants with Details of the Preliminary Results	151
APPENDIX ELEVEN	
Pie Chart of Percentage of Time Community Board Members Spent on Activities (July 1995)	152

APPENDIX TWELVE	
Histogram of Hours Worked by Community Board Members During July 1995	153
APPENDIX THIRTEEN	
Pie Chart of Analysis of Public Submissions to Community Boards in the Auckland Region	154
APPENDIX FOURTEEN	
Histogram of Numbers of Public Making Submissions to Community Boards during Public Forum (July 1994 - June 1995)	155
APPENDIX FIFTEEN	
Table of Telephone Interviews with Community Board Chairpersons	156
APPENDIX SIXTEEN	
Cameo of July 1995 Waiheke Community Board Meeting	162
BIBLIOGRAPHY	169