

Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF AID DELIVERY
A COMPARATIVE STUDY

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Philosophy in Development Studies
at Massey University

by

Tim Thorpe

1995

DEDICATION

Dedicated to the memory of Aiden Jack Beveni

1953 - 1994

Principal Forest Officer

Forestry Division

Ministry of Natural Resources

Solomon Islands

ABSTRACT

This study sets up a process for the systematic evaluation of the effectiveness of aid agencies in aid delivery through evaluating the projects and programmes that they are implementing. It evaluates and compares five different aid agencies comprising of a bilateral aid donor, non-government organisation, community based organisation, development bank and multilateral aid donor. The common ground for comparison is that these agencies have all been providing assistance to, or working in, the forestry sector in the Solomon Islands over a relatively long period.

The study found that it is possible to apply a systematic comparative evaluation process to aid agencies, and the projects and programmes that they were implementing, despite seemingly large differences in aid philosophy and aid management among them. By applying systematic comparative evaluations such as the one set up in this study it is possible to learn from all agencies how to enhance the effectiveness of aid delivery for the ultimate benefit of donor and recipient alike.

The study found that none of the agencies reviewed in the study were necessarily more effective than any other agency in aid delivery. There was likewise no evidence that any one theoretical position on development, or any particular approach to aid delivery was necessarily any more effective when it came to implementing aid projects or programmes. There are too many variables affecting the implementation of projects and programmes for any one approach to aid delivery or theoretical position to be the most effective in all cases.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am greatly indebted to my family Malia, Benjamin, Isabel and Filipo for the tolerance, understanding, and support that they have shown over the amount of time that I have spent away from them working on this thesis.

I am also deeply grateful to my current employer the New Zealand Ministry of Forestry who have allowed me flexible working hours to finish the thesis, and provided back up and administrative support.

In the Solomon Islands and Australia there are numerous people whom I would like to thank individually, but am unable to do so because of the confidentiality that I promised them when writing this thesis. Needless to say I am extremely grateful for the support that I was given particularly my colleagues in the Forestry Division of Ministry of Natural Resources.

My thanks are also due to the Solomon Islands Government for permission to carry out this study and to Ian Frazer (Otago University), Brian Ponter (Massey University), and James Barton (Ministry of Forestry) for their encouragement and advice.

Tim Thorpe
Wellington

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ABSTRACT	
TABLE OF CONTENTS	
ABBREVIATIONS	
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
Background to the study	1
Definition of terms	2
Aid and aid delivery	4
The role of aid agencies in aid delivery	9
Forestry and development	12
Summary	15
CHAPTER 2 BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT	16
The Solomon Islands	16
Forestry	16
Aid to the Solomon Islands, particularly to forestry	17
Australian International Development Assistance Bureau	18
Commonwealth Development Corporation	20
European Community	21
Komuniboli Village	22
Solomon Islands Development Trust	23

CHAPTER 3 RESEARCH METHOD	25
Solomon Islands Government study regulations	25
Selecting the aid agencies for the study	26
Evaluation	29
Evaluation procedures used in the study	31
Summary	40
CHAPTER 4 RESULTS	41
AUSTRALIAN INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE BUREAU	41
Allardyce Reforestation Project	41
Criteria	43
National Forest Resource Inventory	48
Criteria	49
Timber Control Unit Project	61
Criteria	63
COMMONWEALTH DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION	71
Kolombangara Forest Products Ltd	71
Criteria	73
EUROPEAN COMMUNITY	80
Viru Reforestation Project	80
Criteria	82
The Solomon Islands Forestry Sector Study	90
Criteria	91
KOMUNIBOLI VILLAGE	97
Komuniboli Training Centre	97
Criteria	98

SOLOMON ISLANDS DEVELOPMENT TRUST	105
Logging Awareness Raising	105
Criteria	106
Social Reforestation Project	114
Criteria	116
CHAPTER 5 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	122
Summary	122
Australian International Development Assistance Bureau	124
Commonwealth Development Corporation	124
European Community	125
Komuniboli Village	126
Solomon Islands Development Trust	126
Conclusions	127
REFERENCES	133
APPENDICES	
Appendix 1 - Details of Aid Delivery to Forestry Division 1952 - 1989	i
Appendix 2 - Sources of Information For Each of the Agencies Involved in the Study	xxvii
Appendix 3 - Example of a Logframe	xxx
MAPS	
Map 1 - Location of Projects and Programmes Evaluated by this Study in the Solomon Islands	28
TABLES	
Table 1 - Inventory Budgets	57
Table 2 - TCUP Budget	68
Table 3 - Breakdown of Social Reforestation Project Budget	115
Table 4 - Summary of Project and Programme Evaluations	123

ABBREVIATIONS

ACP - African, Caribbean and Pacific

ADAB - Australian Development Assistance Bureau

AIDAB - Australian International Development Assistance Bureau (formerly ADAB)

CD&W - Commonwealth Development and Welfare Funds

CDC - Commonwealth Development Corporation

CFI - Commonwealth Forestry Institute

CIDA - Canadian International Development Agency

CSIRO - Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation

DSE - Development Services Exchange

EC - European Community (formerly the EEC)

EDF - European Development Fund

FAO - Food and Agriculture Organisation

FD - Forestry Division (of the Ministry of Natural Resources)

FRIS - Forest Resource Information System

ICVA - International Council of Voluntary Agencies

JICA - Japanese International Cooperation Agency

JOAA - Japanese Overseas Afforesting Agency

KFPL - Kolombangara Forest Products Ltd

KTC - Komuniboli Training Centre

MERT - Ministry of External Relations and Trade

MLENR - Ministry of Lands, Energy and Natural Resources

MMC - Monopolies and Mergers Commission

MNR - Ministry of Natural Resources

MOU - Memorandum of Understanding

MTM - Mobile Team Member

NFAP - National Forestry Action Plan

NFRI - National Forest Resource Inventory

NGO - Non-Government Organisation

ODA - Overseas Development Assistance, but British Overseas Development Administration

OECD - Organisation For Economic Cooperation and Development

OSB - Overseas Service Bureau
PCC - Project Coordinating Committee
SFO - Senior Forest Officer
SI - Solomon Islands
SIDT - Solomon Islands Development Trust
SIG - Solomon Islands Government
SIPL - Solomon Islands Plantation Ltd.
STABEX - Stabilisation of Export Earnings
TCUP - Timber Control Unit Project
TDRI - Tropical Development Research Institute
TOR - Terms of Reference
UK - United Kingdom
UN - United Nations
UNDP - United Nations Development Program
UNIDO - United Nations Industrial Development Organisation
US and USA - United States of America
USAID - United States Agency for International Development

Yes, development fashions have changed over the last three decades, and that is why gradually the files, the archives, the case-books of the development establishment - which consists of the multi - and bilateral development and financing agencies, with their supporting theorists in the universities and the foundations , never forgetting their protégés in the planning ministries of the underdeveloped world - have come to resemble the private cemetery of a fantastic zoo, a cemetery stuffed with the corpses of wild geese, lame ducks, red herrings, white elephants and dead horses.

(Jack Westoby, *The Purpose of Forests*)