Copyright is owned by the Author of the thesis. Permission is given for a copy to be downloaded by an individual for the purpose of research and private study only. The thesis may not be reproduced elsewhere without the permission of the Author.
Teachers of additional languages in New Zealand schools:
A national survey and case studies

A thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
in
Applied Linguistics

at Massey University, Manawatu Campus, New Zealand

Adèle Jeannette Scott

2014
Abstract

While languages additional to the language of instruction have long been an established, non-compulsory part of the New Zealand secondary school curriculum, it was only in 2007 that they were given an official place as a learning area in the national curriculum. They do, however, remain non-compulsory. This study aims to investigate the background and profile of teachers of additional languages in New Zealand schools, and perceptions of their role, place and identity.

In late 2008, teachers of additional languages at Years 1 to 13 were invited to complete a national online language teachers’ survey (NOLT08) (n=317). Two teachers of Spanish and one teacher of Japanese were invited to participate in individual case studies carried out across two school terms in 2010. Data were gathered through interviews and regular entries in a reflective e-log focusing on their situated experiences as teachers of additional languages together with their perceptions of their role and identity.

Results of the NOLT08 survey confirmed that teachers of additional languages in New Zealand schools had different levels of qualifications and experiences depending on the sector in which they were teaching. Teacher perceptions of their roles ranged from those who felt supported and considered the teaching of additional languages an integral part of their professional role, to those who were hindered by a lack of agency and confidence in their proficiency, frustrations with multi-level classes, or assessment demands. Important themes to emerge from the case studies include that being a teacher of additional languages requires a commitment of self and an ability to advocate for the learning area. With supportive schools, primary teachers are developing their own understandings of how to incorporate languages inside and outside of the classroom setting.

This study suggests that the place of teaching additional languages in New Zealand schools is far from established or secure. It highlights the challenges to the role and identity of teachers of additional languages, not least of which is the often-tenuous position of the languages learning area in schools.
Dedicated to my nephews, Alexander and Zac

along with my other ‘children’

Nicki, Matthew, Emma, Giorgia, Eliza, Sophia, Liam, Amy, Matthew, William, Ellie, James, Sophie, Sam, Zoe, Caitlin, Anna, Libby, Sean, Kino-chan

*May you all discover the joy of learning languages*
Acknowledgements

This study has been a part of my life for several years. Anyone who has had contact with me over that time will have had contact with my study. To the many people who have kept me going, I cannot thank you enough.

My heartfelt thanks go to the over 300 teachers who responded to my survey. I am particularly indebted to the three case study teachers who gave so generously of their time and shared so much of their language learning and teaching experiences. Whenever the doctoral journey seemed too difficult, I only had to listen to a few minutes of your interviews to be reminded that your stories were my reason for embarking on this task. Your passion for your craft shone through time and again. To NZALT members, past and present, I am inspired by your dedication to your students and your commitment to ensure their language learning experiences are the best they can be.

My gratitude goes to my supervisors Professor Cynthia White, Dr. Lone Jorgenson, Dr. France Genaudier-Klijn and Dr. Alison Kearney. Thank you all for your expertise and commitment to supporting me throughout my study. I was truly well-supervised!

Stew, you didn’t know what you were getting yourself into but you knew exactly when I needed to hear those three words “you’ll be ok”. Thank you for being you.

Thanks to my former colleague-friends, at the College of Education, Massey University who encouraged me from the start and kept me sane through the painful times to the end of the PhD tunnel. Friends and workmates in New Zealand, Australia, Japan and the USA who have cheered me on with timely walks, wine, wisdom and wit: Janet, Pete, Nan, Harry, Yevette, Dale, Gunhild, Jan, Margaret, Pete, Dawn, Allan, Philippa (you rock), Jeremy, Tracey-Lynne (my Waikawa wahine), Liam, Stephanie, David, Martin, Bev, Pete, Lynda, Anne, Ally, Aly, Karen, Jayne, Maggie, Carrol, Julie, Julie, Rose, Marti, Gabrielle, Naomi, Gillie, Robyn, Mark, Santi, Marc, Maree, Liz, Helen, Elin, Susan, Jocelyn, Mike, Bryce, Gaile, Jeremy, Jenny, Kay, Viv, Emiko, Junko, Hatsue, Yoshie, Yuka, Yuki, Makoto, Yukari.

To Mum, Kathy (QSM), and Dad, Alex Scott—thank you for your prayers and for instilling in me a love of language learning. Thanks also to big sis Joy, Julian, Alexander and Zac—love you all lots, and to wider family members Jeanette, Colin, Neville, Dot, Geoff, Fiona, Joanne—thanks for being part of my life.

I also acknowledge the management committee of the Sasakawa Fellowship Fund for Japanese Language Education for awarding me a most generous postgraduate scholarship, enabling me to find headspace out of a busy full-time workload to begin this research.
# Table of Contents

**Chapter One: Teaching and learning additional languages in Aotearoa New Zealand**

1.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 1

1.2 Learning languages: A personal journey ................................................................. 3

1.3 Research questions ..................................................................................................... 5
    Aim of the study ........................................................................................................... 5
    Research questions .................................................................................................... 5
    Rationale for the study ............................................................................................... 5

1.4 Languages of New Zealand ......................................................................................... 6
    The place of te reo Māori ......................................................................................... 6
    New Zealand Sign Language .................................................................................... 7
    New Zealand’s obligations towards languages of the Pacific ..................................... 9

1.5 The cultural and linguistic diversity of the New Zealand population .................. 10

1.6 Languages for travel and trade .................................................................................. 11

1.7 Languages in education ............................................................................................. 12

1.8 Languages in the New Zealand Curriculum ................................................................ 13

1.9 Languages in schools ............................................................................................... 16

1.10 Support for languages in the curriculum ................................................................. 18
    Te reo Māori in English-medium schools ................................................................. 18
    Pasifika languages .................................................................................................... 19
    Other additional languages ..................................................................................... 20

1.11 The languages policy environment .......................................................................... 21
    Call for national policy .............................................................................................. 21
    School-level policy .................................................................................................... 22
    Who is allowed to teach languages? .......................................................................... 23

1.12 Summary .................................................................................................................. 23

**Chapter Two: Literature review** ................................................................................. 25

2.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 25

2.2 Role and identity ....................................................................................................... 25

2.3 A framework for identity development ..................................................................... 28

2.4 Quality teaching as authored by the government and institutions ....................... 31
    Roles, functions, rights and responsibilities ............................................................ 32
    The nature of teaching and learning ....................................................................... 34
Professional learning opportunities in second language teaching and pedagogy ................................................................. 102

Teaching languages in other countries .......................................................................................................................... 103

4.7 **Choosing to be a teacher of additional languages** ................................................................. 104

Reasons for teaching languages ................................................................................................................................. 104

Future intentions ......................................................................................................................................................... 105

Stay in teaching (n=197) .............................................................................................................................................. 105
Leave teaching (n=41) ................................................................................................................................................ 105
Have a career break and then go back to teaching (n=26) ...................................................................................... 106
Intending to retire ....................................................................................................................................................... 106

Subjects taught—other than languages ...................................................................................................................... 106

4.8 **Language programmes** ........................................................................................................................................... 107

Configuration of classes ................................................................................................................................................ 107

Additional comments ................................................................................................................................................... 110

Multi-level classes ..................................................................................................................................................... 110
Timetable clashes ....................................................................................................................................................... 111
Several teachers taking the same class ....................................................................................................................... 111
Multiple qualifications .............................................................................................................................................. 112
Correspondence School ........................................................................................................................................... 112

4.9 **Perceptions of own knowledge and skills** ...................................................................................................... 112

4.10 **Discussion: Snapshot of the language-teaching context** ........................................................................ 113

Summary of NOLT08 survey results .......................................................................................................................... 113

Comparisons with the general teaching population ................................................................................................. 114
Choice to teach languages ........................................................................................................................................ 115
Multi-level .................................................................................................................................................................. 116

4.11 **Summary** .............................................................................................................................................................. 118

Chapter Five: **Julie: Secondary Japanese language specialist, beginning primary teacher** ................................. 119

5.1 **Introducing Julie** .................................................................................................................................................... 119

5.2 **Julie’s professional learning journey** ........................................................................................................... 120

Becoming a teacher of languages .......................................................................................................................... 120
Compulsory languages at Whero High School ........................................................................................................ 121
Languages offered .................................................................................................................................................... 121

5.3 **Challenges at school level** .......................................................................................................................... 122

The challenge of changing context ......................................................................................................................... 122
Religious education context ...................................................................................................................................... 123
Teacher’s aide does not support students in the Japanese classes .................................................................. 123
Chapter Seven: Eve: Learner-teacher of Spanish

7.1 Introducing Eve ................................................................. 155
7.2 Eve’s language learning journey ........................................... 156
    Studying by distance ............................................................. 156
    Lack of confidence ............................................................. 157
    Language learning strategies ................................................. 157
    Ups and downs ................................................................. 158
7.3 Eve the language teacher ..................................................... 158
    Tutoring ........................................................................... 159
    Itinerant teaching .............................................................. 160
    Lead teaching .................................................................... 161
7.4 Summary ........................................................................... 162

Chapter Eight: Helen and Eve: A synergetic relationship ................. 165

8.1 Overlapping roles ............................................................... 165
8.2 Sharing expertise: The beginning of the Spanish programme .......... 166
8.3 Feeding off each other ......................................................... 167
8.4 Comfortable in each other’s company .................................... 168
8.5 Shared beliefs about language teaching and learning .................. 169
    Not every teacher should have to teach languages .................. 169
    Principals play a key role in deciding who teaches languages .... 170
    Essential knowledge and skills for primary school teachers ....... 171
    Language programmes need to be purposeful ......................... 171
    On being in a female-dominated profession .......................... 172
    Being voted off the island .................................................... 173
8.6 Living and breathing Spanish: The school camp like no other ........ 173
    Integrating Spanish language into the camp .......................... 173
    Participant-observer ......................................................... 177
8.7 Networking with the wider language teaching community ............ 178
    Expectations for conference ................................................. 179
    Planning what to attend ..................................................... 180
8.8 Seizing the moments together .............................................. 181
    Flexibility of the primary school curriculum ........................... 182
Chapter Nine: What does it mean to be a teacher of additional languages in New Zealand schools? ................................................................. 187

9.1 Introduction .............................................................................. 187

9.2 What is the background and profile of teachers of additional languages in New Zealand schools? ................................................................. 188

9.2.1 Different teaching contexts call for different teaching approaches .................. 193

9.2.2 Primary teachers are generalist not specialist teachers ..................................... 194

9.2.2.1 Generally, primary teachers do not choose to teach languages ...................... 196

9.3 How do teachers perceive their role as teachers of additional languages, and how does this impact on their identity? .......................... 196

9.3.1 Teachers perceive their role differently depending on their context .................... 197

9.3.2 Teachers’ beliefs about how the languages curriculum should be enacted—using additional languages as a tool for communication .................................................. 199

9.3.3 Language teaching and learning beyond the classroom—an investment of self 202

9.4 What is the place of the teaching of additional languages in New Zealand schools? ................................................................. 203

9.4.1 The place of languages as determined at government and policy level .............. 203

9.4.1.1 The New Zealand Curriculum mandates seven out of eight learning areas for implementation in schools ......................................................................................... 203

9.4.1.2 Professional development for teachers of additional languages available for some teachers .................................................................................................................. 204

9.4.1.3 Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) and universities’ initial teacher education courses have little room for languages content and pedagogy courses .................................................. 204

9.4.1.4 The New Zealand Qualifications Authority (NZQA): Literacy in English is valued, contributions from additional languages are not .......................................................... 205

9.4.1.5 Education Review Office (ERO) rarely visits languages classrooms ................ 205

9.4.2 The place of languages as determined at school level ..................................... 205

9.4.2.1 Teachers as advocates for languages in schools ............................................ 205

9.4.2.2 Undervaluing of additional languages ....................................................... 206

9.4.2.3 Class sizes and the timetable ....................................................................... 206

9.4.3 The place of languages as determined at classroom level .............................. 207

9.4.3.1 Access to languages is not equitable .......................................................... 207

9.4.3.2 Not all teachers chose to teach an additional language, nor were they confident in their ability to do so .................................................................................................. 208
9.5 Conclusions: How understandings of role and place contribute to the
development of the language teacher identity ........................................ 208
A model for next steps and recommendations for future research .............. 209
Contributions to research and limitations of this study ............................ 213
Closing words—Take heart ........................................................................ 216
References ................................................................................................ 217
Appendices .................................................................................................. 233
Appendix A: Phase One: Information sheet: Key stakeholders .................... 233
Appendix B: Phase One: Interview schedule: Key stakeholders ................. 235
Appendix C: Phase One: Consent form: Key stakeholders .......................... 237
Appendix D: Phase Two: Advertisement: Invitation to participate in NOLT08
survey ........................................................................................................ 238
Appendix E: Phase Two: Information for respondents: From NOLT08 survey 240
Appendix F: National Online Language Teachers’ survey .......................... 243
Appendix G: Phase Three: Information sheet: Case study participants ......... 264
Appendix H: Phase Three: Interview schedule: Case study participants ...... 266
Appendix I: Phase Three: Consent form, interviews and audio recording: Case
study participants ..................................................................................... 268
Appendix J: Phase Three: Authority for release of transcripts: Case study
participants ............................................................................................. 269
Appendix K: Phase Three: Confidentiality agreement: Transcriber ............... 270
Appendix L: Phase Three: Case study data collection: Timeframe and codes 271
Appendix M: Massey University Human Ethics Committee: Approval letters 2008
and 2010 .................................................................................................... 272
Appendix N: Countries where respondents have taught English or other
languages .................................................................................................... 274
Appendix O: Respondents’ reported knowledge and skills ......................... 275
Appendix P: Achievement Objectives: Learning Languages ........................ 276
List of Tables

Table 1: Effective pedagogies for additional language classrooms in New Zealand. 38
Table 2: Research questions linked to data collection methods and types. 66
Table 3: Demographic data of the three cases. 72
Table 4: School type. 79
Table 5: School decile. 80
Table 6: School size. 80
Table 7: How the official languages of New Zealand are taught in schools. 82
Table 8: Proportion of teachers by gender and age. 83
Table 9: Mother tongue. 84
Table 10: Highest qualification in teaching. 87
Table 11: Highest tertiary qualification that is not a teaching qualification. 88
Table 12: Length of time teaching. 89
Table 13: Current position and gender. 90
Table 14: Teachers in each sector by main language taught. 94
Table 15: Languages taught in 2008. 96
Table 16: Reported proficiency in main language taught in 2008. 100
Table 17: How teachers learnt their main language. 101
Table 18: Professional learning opportunities. 102
Table 19: How teachers came to teach additional languages. 104
Table 20: Aspirations for the next five years. 105
Table 21: Subjects other than languages taught by teachers in the secondary sector. 107
Table 22: Year levels and number of classes taught. 108
Table 23: Number of weeks of instruction in a year. 108
Table 24: Number of teaching sessions per week. 109
Table 25: Length of teaching sessions. 109
Table 26: Number of students in a class. 110
Table 27: Whose class, type of class. 110
Table 28: Multi-level classes by language taught in the secondary school. 111
Table 29: Teacher perceptions of own knowledge and skill in teaching additional languages. 113
List of Figures

Figure 1: Language-related curriculum documents and policies 1992-2013 ...............15
Figure 2: Gee’s (2000) four ways to view identity ..................................................28
Figure 3: Teacher identity through the lens of Gee's Institutional-, Discourse- and Affinity-identities .................................................................30
Figure 4: Data collection phases in this study .............................................................53
Figure 5: Spread of participants by region ...................................................................81
Figure 6: Current position and gender ........................................................................91
Figure 7: Main language taught by sector ....................................................................95
Figure 8: Helen’s classroom whiteboard and students’ display of Spanish phrases ..147
Figure 9: The merging of Helen and Eve's professional lives ......................................165
Figure 10: Figure 2 revisited ......................................................................................209
Figure 11: Institutional-identity vs Affinity-identity ......................................................210